

---

TORONTO – Enhancing ICANN's Global Engagement with Stakeholders

Thursday, October 18, 2012 – 08:00 to 09:00

ICANN - Toronto, Canada

SALLY COSTERTON:

I think we're going to start. This is the death slot, clearly, after the gala evening, so thank you all for the people that are here. I'm very grateful.

Good morning. So I think we have Fadi joining us, but I haven't seen him yet, so we'll start, I think, and we might do this in a slightly different order.

I'm not going to ask any of my panelists to sit on the stage because I think we should make this a little more intimate this morning. Does that work for everybody? That doesn't work. We need to sit on the stage?

(Speaker is off microphone.)

SALLY COSTERTON:

Okay. It's too -- I'm told it's too difficult to see people if we sit on the floor, so maybe we should come up on the stage.

(Speaker is off microphone.)

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

SALLY COSTERTON: Okay. Let's do that. Yeah.

(Speaker is off microphone.)

SALLY COSTERTON: Yes.

[ Laughter ]

That's a good idea, Chris. Let's put some chairs on stage. A very informal meeting.

(Speaker is off microphone.)

SALLY COSTERTON: Right. This is very good. This is very hands-on.

Okay. Do not fall off the stage.

(Speaker is off microphone.)

SALLY COSTERTON: Good morning -- well, that's a good question.

Ah, Fadi is here. Excellent. Fadi?



(Speaker is off microphone.)

SALLY COSTERTON: Come and join me on the stage.

FADI CHEHADE: All right.

(Speaker is off microphone.)

SALLY COSTERTON: -- staff so (audio problem) about how we are globalizing (audio problem) any aspect of that, whether it's a specific company, whether it's how the matrix is going to work.

So this is designed -- really this is your meeting, so we will literally briefly outline, Tarek and myself -- after Fadi has given us some introductory remarks -- what we see as our roles.

I have the regional vice presidents here, so I have Jamie Hedlund -- do you want to just wave your hand, Jamie? Xiaodong, Asia-Pacific.

Rodrigo is on the line. He is -- unfortunately could not get a visa, as those of you who were in the Latin American meeting would know. Good morning, Rodrigo.



I know that he can hear us, so if we have questions on Latin America or for Rodrigo, he is here. He can take them.

And finally, but not -- last, but not least, where's Nigel? (audio problem) okay. So that's that. So I'll hand it (audio problem) introductory comments and then we'll get going.

FADI CHEHADE:

I think, frankly, we should --

Good morning, first of all. Thank you for getting up this early to be here.

We should talk less and just -- since it's a nice small group, we can engage with all of you and have you help us with any ideas or thoughts to assist us in this plan.

But I will tell you one thing that has crystallized during this week that I did not, let's say, talk about specifically in my opening regarding internationalization, globalization (audio problem) whichever term you wish to use. Doesn't matter. We all understand what we're doing. (audio problem) is that instead of coming up with a global internationalization plan, we're actually truly doing this (audio problem) from the bottom up.

We are developing an Africa plan. We're going to develop a European plan, a North American plan, a Pacific islands plan. Australia's people came and said, "We are willing to help work" (audio problem). So we're working on all (audio problem), quote-unquote, local, regional plans (audio problem). One of the most remarkable progress points is an India plan (audio problem) with India right now and we're moving



forward. I mean, we already had meetings this week and we -- all of these folks would like, by the time we get (audio problem) ministers presenting a joint (audio problem) this is how it should be. (audio problem) together, and then they become part of our global strategic plan (audio problem) doing now (audio problem) enormous amount of (audio problem) Tarek, satisfactorily (audio problem) but I'm counting on them (audio problem) you should know just in the last (audio problem) deeply engaged with Brazil, with India (audio problem) very important (audio problem) this morning we committed also with other regions so things are moving on a (audio problem) coming together of Africa but we (audio problem) go fast as possible (audio problem) budget we have (audio problem) we're going to live (audio problem). And then the -- just to clarify, a lot of people came and asked me about the matrix that we put up on (audio problem) goal (audio problem) but we will do the matrix but I won't do it a day ahead of being clear. For example, if you have these rows, what are these columns, first of all? What (audio problem) regions? What are the countries (audio problem) Pacific islands, you know, and (audio problem) first we need to define the columns in order of (audio problem) also can't attack the whole thing in the first year (audio problem) all of that is being worked (audio problem) measured way (audio problem) feedback (audio problem).

(Speaker is off microphone.)



---

SALLY COSTERTON: (audio problem) because it would be good to get your views and also perhaps some of your (audio problem) globalization strategy (audio problem) tying it to your work at the BGRC.

STEVE CROCKER: (audio problem) time to prepare to throw you this question (audio problem) challenging a bit to add anything to Fadi's very comprehensive statement (audio problem) here. We're not here for ourselves and not here to be imposed on the community. So the -- the most important dynamic is to understand what the community's needs are and to be effective at delivering services and be responsive to the community's needs.

(audio problem) that's what's led to the creation of ICANN in the first place and what is the touchstone for the continued existence (audio problem) sort of (audio problem) comes then the (audio problem) implementing that within the huge diversities that exist around the globe (audio problem) just from an academic point of view (audio problem) and where are the distinctions and where are those differences and how they'll fashion an organization that has the proper mix of commonality of operation and eligibility of (audio problem).

Yeah. All right. So what I'm saying isn't all that important anyway.

[ Laughter ]

So but just to finish this unimportant thought, so echoing what Fadi has said, and very strongly, the -- the engagement is to, with insight and as much delicacy and even-handedness as we can, to fashion the



organization, grow and evolve the organization, and it's -- and even those verbs have the sense that we're doing it from the inside. But it's really the other way around: To be reflective and engaging with each area of the globe to understand and provide the right methods of communication and the right avenues within the resources that are available and with proper balance for everything else.

So that's a non-trivial challenge.

FADI CHEHADE:

Yeah. I'm going to tell you a little story that my dad used to tell me when we -- when our community first moved to Los Angeles. And we're a very proud community and all of the people in our community were trying to figure out how to deal with the Los Angeles scene and the people of America, and everybody was in turmoil.

And my dad, who was a -- didn't speak English very well but, you know, was very wise old man -- he's now passed away, but he told the community members one night -- I'll never forget this -- he said, "In order to understand Americans, we have to stand under Americans." So he took the word "understand" and flipped it.

So -- and what he was trying to say is, if you want to go to a region and try to understand what you need to do, the first position you should take is to stand under them, to be humble first, and to listen, truly listen. Not to come with a vision of, you know, "I'm coming now, let me see what I can do in Africa," versus, "Let's stand under the Africans and listen to them and be humble about them and the wisdom they have and the knowledge they have of their land."



So we will guide our actions with this spirit of not going to India or Russia or any country saying, "Hey, we're ICANN, let's tell you how we're going to make it work for you." That's not right, and that's not the way we will behave. And I think we're all in sync on that.

SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you. Chris, could I ask you to say a few words, please?

CHRIS DISSPAIN:

Sure. Thanks.

Good morning. I'll be very quick. Just from the BGRC side of things, just -- I just want to say three things.

Our view on the globalization or internationalization is going out and serving in the way that the regional liaisons, like Save and Baher do in a particular region is incredibly important. Having government relations is a slightly separate line from serving the local community and is incredibly important. Having staff that speak multiple languages is incredibly important. But it's naive to think that any one of those things is actually globalizing or internationalizing ICANN. They are three of many strands of things that will achieve that, and in effect, it's a matrix within -- within the matrix, or as you've said, it's the DNA, the strands of the matrix. So that's what I have to say about it. I think it's great, but we can hear from everyone else, I hope. Thanks.





---

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, Chris. Is Gonzalo here? I can't see him. Okay. Bertrand? A few words from you? Did you have anything to add?

BERTRAND DE LA CHAPELLE: Thank you. No, nothing particular. That's okay.

SALLY COSTERTON: Finally, George.

GEORGE SADOWSKY: Yeah. Three things very quickly.

First of all, ICANN is an international organization. It's also -- but it's not a development organization. Nevertheless, what we do and how we do it has an impact on development in countries and we should be conscious of that.

Second, I think we've -- the breakthrough in our thinking regarding internationalization is what Steve mentioned: Responding to the needs of people who are in the countries or in the regions, a bottom-up development as opposed to a top-down imposed idea of what's good for people whom we don't really understand.

And third and finally, one of the principles I like is that form follows function. We need to understand what we want to do, how we want to do it. We want to get that set and then have the form of ICANN reflect that -- that set of needs and that set of services that we're going to deliver. Thank you.



SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, George. That's a very good segue.

So for those of you, form follows function. I didn't know that was one of your favorite expressions. It's one of my favorite expressions. I completely agree with you.

Just briefly, in terms of the nongovernmental stakeholder engagement, which is what I will be looking after, which will include my good friends in communications, Mr. Trengrove here, and his very good team, we are working very closely at the moment, Tarek and I, in building our team inside the ICANN staff and we've been doing that this week. We've done a lot of listening about what we think people are telling us that you want to see from us in order to implement this strategy.

And in summary, the words that I've heard are -- the three words I've heard this week the most are "multistakeholder model" -- okay? -- "outreach" and "engagement." "Outreach" and "engagement."

So outreach, "We need lots of good content that's tailored to suit our country or our sector or our audience. Please don't forget that we are not all the same. And it needs to be available in a reasonable selection of languages." So this would also incorporate some channels like the Web site, how we use social media, these kinds of -- these kinds of issues.

So that's on the content side.

And on the outreach -- engagement side, we have to remember -- and I've heard this all week and it's very important that everyone in our



team remembers this -- engagement is two-way. Engagement is not just about push. If somebody doesn't engage literally, they give you a response, how do we know that we have heard you. This is the process of engagement.

So making sure that we remember all the time that we are -- it is a cyclical process. It is not push, exactly as Fadi says. This means we're taking things up from the bottom, we're synthesizing, distilling them, creating hopefully good content and tools that everybody in the community can use, and doing it again, and doing it again, and doing it again.

And hopefully, the experience that I've had and Tarek has had in other parts of our lives will bring to bear some -- just some shortcuts, some useful ideas that we can work with the team on that will help to speed this through.

But fundamentally, you know, we're here for you. We're here to help you. So the more you tell us about what you need -- I said to the business council yesterday, "Keep me honest. As I go inevitably native inside ICANN, which is great, keep me objective."

So that's what you can count on me for.

Tarek, would you like to say a few words, and then love to take your questions.

TAREK KAMEL:

Thank you, Sally, and I will be brief, reflecting actually on what Fadi has said.



We are preparing an overall engagement plan but we are giving priorities to some very specific regions and countries because we are convinced that they are swing countries, as such, and India definitely, maybe Russia, and Brazil, as well as some other players definitely are priorities.

So we're giving priority to these regions with clear engagement plans that are coming bottom-up from the community. We are not doing it from -- only from ICANN's side, but in an interactive way. Africa has been a good model within the last three months for our engagement plans. As such, we are also opening up a dialogue with the Arab states. Very specifically, last week I have been at the Arab IGF in Kuwait and we were also addressing their concerns when it comes to Internet governance issues. Some of them have been taking a very hard line concerning Internet governance issues, so we started a dialogue what are the concerns and how we need to address the needs of the region and to make sure we include them. But we are bringing this internationalization plan in order to make sure that they are participating in a wider scale in the ICANN process.

So this is the target we are doing. I mean, development, as George has said, and internationalization to ensure inclusion in our process.

So the target is clear, as such. It's not development for the sake of development, but it's development for the sake of inclusion in the ICANN process, being part of the process, being part of the constituencies, and really reflecting on a wider participation in our process, so that the objective is clear.

So by that, I want to give back to Sally and we are here to listen.



SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you.

FADI CHEHADE: I must leave, unfortunately, so this is not a reflection on the fact that you're about to ask me questions --

[ Laughter ]

-- but you really are asking the right people the questions.

This -- by the way, this couple there sitting is a reflection of our plan, right?

So a lot of people asked "Why do we need a separate engagement leader for governments," right? Because when we don't, we have our engagement guys completely, quote-unquote, siphoned by the governments.

So by doing this, if anything, we're giving life to the engagement with everybody else.

And notice that the teams that will be doing all the engagement report to both of them, so I made them equals, working together as a team, and it's working marvelously between Tarek and Sally, and they will reflect the multistakeholder engagement, including governments but not excluding everybody else. That's what they'll be doing.

I also, before I leave, want to really recognize, in front of all of you, the incredible learning and support -- and frankly, the future success we are



all planning on relies on four people who have risen to support us three and to make us look so smart this morning and every morning, and that's really Jamie, Xiaodong, Nigel, and Rodrigo on the phone, the Fantastic Four, that since we arrived have been educating us, guiding us, and making us look successful.

So we're successful with India because Nigel did incredible work to prepare me there.

We're successful now on the engagement with China and some of the planning for Beijing which will be a huge big meeting for us because of Xiaodong, and I thank you for that.

The things that are happening in Washington and the movement towards a more evolutionary relationship is all being laid out for me by Jamie, and I thank you for that. It was great to work with you in Washington. Really, the knowledge you have and the incredible help you gave me, I appreciate, and I'm sure Tarek and Sally will too.

And then certainly Rodrigo, who is the most frustrated man in ICANN today for not being able to be with us for visa issues, but I thank him for that and for launching the Latin America work now.

So anyway, I just wanted to recognize the four of you for the great work you've done.

I apologize, but I leave you in good hands.



SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you, Fadi. So I'm not sure how we do this logistically in terms of questions. Do we have -- well, we have a mic here on the floor, don't we. Would anybody -- or you can have a roving mic. I'm entirely open to what anybody -- we'll use the stand mics. Okay. Off we go. Okay. Do you think you could just give us your name and we'll take it from there.

WERNER STAUB:

My name is Werner Staub. I work for CORE.

And of course we're very happy that we're doing something about internationalization, but I think we should all be deeply offended at what we're doing here. I mean, we should be ashamed.

We are doing everything -- we're punching the neighbors in the face and then we're hiring nurses to care for them and then we punch again.

This is not a good way of internationalization.

Let me take -- give you an example.

ICANN announces that it wants to use a lottery to set -- to set priority between TLDs, unleashing essentially rich country speculators on the rest of the world. Let's just compete. Not only do they have more money than you, but let's just compete. Even they have to have a lottery. And take the example of dot rio, applied for by the city of Rio de Janeiro. They have the 2014 world championships and the 2016 Olympics and ICANN will miss them, most likely, if you go like that.



This is a TLD that would be the best kind of internationalization for ICANN. Real actions, touching people in their daily lives, as opposed to holding conferences and translating documents nobody wants to read. That is the real internationalization. We've got cities all over the world who have applied for TLDs. Some of them actually have trouble because they're in competition with similar things.

Then we've got places who have names that have been applied for, like Patagonia or cba for Cordoba. Their places, they have to object to the TLDs that are being applied for, some of them in bad faith, some of them not particularly new -- in good faith but still seem a problem.

If they want to object, they have to object now, but they're only going to be heard in nine months, and then all the objections take place at the same times. Three panelists at 300, \$450 per hour. So, you know, they will probably spend \$100,000, if they just want to be heard for objection.

Those who have community evaluation are going to be told, "First object, and then whenever something else, maybe in a year from now, we're going to do the committee evaluation."

So this is a way of punching people in the face and then trying to cover it. It doesn't work.

It's just like engineering. If you have a real bad problem, then you add something to it to improve the product. Try to improve the product from the beginning.





CHRIS DISSPAIN:

Werner, I think that we're -- you've had plenty of opportunity throughout every session to talk about this. We're here to talk about -- you can turn any session you like around to talk about the problem -- the issue with geographic names. We've heard. Continuing to say it time after time after time isn't going to make any difference.

So please let other people speak and we'll -- and I have no doubt you'll get up again in the public forum and say it again, so...

(Speaker is off microphone.)

CHRIS DISSPAIN:

I understand, and -- and you want to engage on that, and all I'm asking you to do is to allow space for other people and we will engage on it.

MARILYN CADE:

Thank you. My name is Marilyn Cade. So this was, perhaps, an interesting opportunity to understand that people see communications messaging differently, and sometimes we see it from our own -- our own window.

So let me do something now that, perhaps, we have started to forget to do. I chair the business constituency. I am not involved as an applicant. But many from business have strong concerns about the new gTLD program. That is not the purpose of my being here, but it is important to I declare that.



Here's why I'm here: We have -- we're going to be 15 years old next year. That's a milestone. We almost have the keys to the car, if we're a teenager in the United States and maybe around the world. But I think we need to think about this as a real development opportunity. You are working to help us do something that ICANN has long wanted to do and that is to have a face that is recognizable to the people who are affected by what we do broadly. The users. Whether they're business users or individual users or NGOs.

As chair of the business constituency, I need some capacity building in my constituency so that I can ensure -- and I have business constituency members here -- so that I can ensure we can welcome and embrace and treat fairly and understand the increased interest we are going to have in ICANN.

We're going to practice taking ICANN into the region, trying to take ICANNers, whether they're from business or they're from the staff or they're from the board, to e-commerce events in Latin America. We're going to do something in Africa. We're going to work with the strategy teams, because we don't think we can bring everybody to ICANN. And we believe that understanding, being aware of, recognizing the brand of ICANN and understanding ICANN is critically important to far more people than will ever be able to devote time to policy development. But they contribute to Internet governance and the Internet governance landscape that affects our success and helps us fulfill our responsibility for leading and creating the right environment for expanding the Internet and from our perspective, from our window.



---

So we're going to be asking for more capacity building, which will put more demands on the budget of ICANN. We'll be reasonable. We already are -- and I want to thank Sally for the commitment that communications materials will be fit for the audience that needs to consume them.

So please count on us as not only cheerleaders but partners.

SALLY COSTERTON: Ray.

PAY PLZAK: Thanks, Marilyn. What the expression -- the sentiment that you just expressed was a large part of the conversation we had with the working group that met in Mauritius to devise -- so it's not only access to ICANN services, as Steve mentioned. It's actually broader access to ICANN. So the kind of thing you discussed here was discussed in earnest in the development of the strategic plan for Africa. So that's already in motion.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, Ray. And, Marilyn, thank you for your comments. I think they're very constructive and very collaborative. And I do want to reinforce -- we've talked about this separately -- but this point about helping you as the community and the community leaders to raise awareness of ICANN to help you to engage more of your members, to understand that there is this great place they can come where they can have a say on these very important issues that, as you say, especially in



the business community, will become much higher profile over the next 12 months or so. So I think that's -- in every country around the world as well. This is not just in the major business capitals. And I know that my colleagues and my board colleagues and staff will become very engaged in going out into your communities. So it's not just about bringing people in here to our community, about taking ICANN into different sectors, different countries. And this will need good organization to make sure that we do it and everybody can see what we're doing. But it would be a very big part, particularly of what I'm involved with in my part of the team. Thank you.

TONY HARRIS:

Yes, good morning. My name is Tony Harris. I'm not here to talk about new TLDs, which I have done in other forums. So, Chris, be at ease. Basically, we had a very interesting session yesterday, Latin American community. I work in Argentina for the Argentine Internet Association.

And some points that we made -- specifically, I made, for example, was that, in doing some outreach work for PIR, for the dot NGO OIG TLD in Argentina, specifically, I was amazed to see -- to find so many ONGs. I mean, there were like 2,000 just in Argentina. And, if you spread this over a region, that's an awful lot of organizations.

And I think it's -- it would be incumbent upon us to bring these people to ICANN. There is a huge effort going on by the NPOC, our colleagues who are here. I'm proud to have helped a little bit in getting that constituency together.



And I think that that is a very useful constituency or, let's say, interest group in Latin America that we should pay attention to. When any of them come to ICANN, they go back and talk to an awful lot of people and constituents of their own. So, if we have a fellowship program in place which brings individuals to ICANN, I have no complaint with that. Perhaps we should look at a fellowship program that would bring organizations. It could be federations, professional associations, chambers of commerce who are completely alien to what goes on in ICANN and need to know and don't have a budget to come.

I think we need to -- when we're looking at regions, to try to focus a little bit more on entities or institutions that can scale when you bring them into the ICANN process. They can become good ambassadors or -- I'm looking for the word -- or propagators of what they learn here, perhaps much more than an individual. That's just a point I'd like to make.

Just one final thing -- and here I'm probably going -- stepping on other people's turf.

I've been in the NomCom last year, and also I will be in the NomCom this year. I don't see the NPOC seated in the NomCom. And I'm just wondering why. Thank you very much.

SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you. Wendy, do we have Rodrigo? Can he communicate from there? Or is it one way? So I just want to --



---

RODRIGO de la PARRA: Can you hear me?

SALLY COSTERTON: Have you got any observations about –

>> Hello? Hello?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Hello? Hello?

SALLY COSTERTON: I think I can hear you now.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Yes, I can hear you. Can you hear me?

SALLY COSTERTON: Did you have any observations to that last request to extend fellowships?

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Hello?

NANCY LUPIANO: There is a delay on the Skype call.



SALLY COSTERTON:

I think, in the interest of time, I'm going to get him to come back to you directly. But this is a great point for the development of our Latin America strategy, which is a very well-timed comment because Rodrigo is putting his working group together now. And this makes complete sense. Rodrigo, I'm going to move on, if that's okay, to the point about the NomCom. Did you want to say anything, Steve.

STEVE CROCKER:

Am I on? Yes. Ray was here. He just left, okay.

Well, Ray Plzak is chair of the board's structural improvements committee, which I mention because the specific issue of NPOC representation on the NomCom is tied in to the bylaws and the structure of the selection process for the NomCom. We have -- we've had some discussion of this. We think that the right place to take this up is in doing the re-examination, as we do periodically, of each of the sections, each of the components of ICANN and regular bylaws mandated review. And there is a requirement to review NomCom. The rules are it has to be done every so often, but it can be speeded up. I don't want to make an announcement. But at least the avenue of discussion is that perhaps we should schedule that sooner rather than later and that this would be one of the issues -- obviously, the specific question on the table is about NPOC. But it raises the more general question about representation on the NomCom and the whole -- that whole set of processes. And so, rather than just looking at this specific issue at this moment, is to take a slightly broader look and to try to do that in a sensible way.



SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, Steve.

We have another question. I'm doing a time check. Is it 8:45? Just after 8:45. So just 15 minutes left. Can I ask you to keep your questions short.

PAUL FOODY: Yeah. My name is Paul Foody. The topic of this morning's gathering is enhancing ICANN's global engagement with stakeholders. Okay? Everything that is wrong with ICANN has been demonstrated here this morning.

We had Mr. Chehade, who I appreciate is a very, very busy guy, who comes along, says yes, we want to listen to you. Buh-bye. We then had Mr. Crocker, who is an incredibly brilliant guy, discussing just now issues that I've been coming here for four years and I, quite honestly, didn't understand most of what you just said.

When you talk about enhancing ICANN's contact with its global stakeholders, you've got to identify who those stakeholders are. First off, who are you thinking about when you think of an ICANN global stakeholder?

SALLY COSTERTON: Okay. I'll answer that.

Briefly, in terms of -- there's not a single global stakeholder, clearly.



We are trying to simply find a way of explaining and encompassing a relevant local approach to all stakeholders in the ICANN community around the world.

PAUL FOODY:

But you've got to identify who you see as the stakeholder before you can engage with them. So, first off, who do you see as the stakeholders that you are wanting to communicate with?

TAREK KAMEL:

I think the answer is very clear. It's there also in the constitution of the board. At the end of the day, we have the at-large community; we have the president's constituency; we have the noncommercial user constituency; we have the GAC. And so these are the constituencies that we have. And we need to engage with them, according to their needs. The only thing that we are saying that we'll do this more intense in order to make sure that the inclusion within these constituencies are more international and more wide. This is what we're doing. We want to see more GAC members that are more involved. We want to see more players in GNSO coming from the developing world, from India, from Africa, and the rest of the part of the world. We want to see a stronger AFRALO, for example. This is what we're talking about. We're not changing the structure of ICANN. We're only empowering the constituencies that are there via engagement. And that's what I have said several times. We're not doing internationalization for the sake of development but for the sake of inclusion within ICANN.



---

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you. Thank you for your comments.

PAUL FOODY: Thank you very much.

SALLY COSTERTON: Could we go to the next question, please.

AKINORI MAEMURA: Akinori Maemura. I'm the chair of the executive council of the APNIC, regional Internet registry covering the Asia Pacific region. And also I am for the JPNIC, Japan. And they are like APNIC but are doing the national range within Japan.

I'm really impressed from the very beginning of this week with the opening ceremony, I noticed much that Fadi is quite keen to increase the engagement to the global multistakeholders. And, especially, the recent development with the Indian government is quite -- I -- I almost touched to see that.

And I -- my comment here is that, you know, that ICANN is doing the -- setting the rule for the generic top-level domain and some other domain names thing and that global range. And the regional Internet registries are your colleagues doing that in a number of resources policies. And that -- and also, you know, number of resources policies mainly compared by the Internet ISPs, which is delivering the cable to the residents or users. Then, naturally, we have quite strong conduct to the local peoples.



---

And I'd like to have more very good collaboration between RIRs and ICANN for the extent your engagement globally. That's my comment. Thank you very much.

SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you. As Tarek said, this is a key part to the global community. The more you can tell us and your community can tell us they need from us, especially at a local level, we're listening and we want to help.

DAVID CAKE:

Hi, David Cake. I'm the chair on the non-commercial users constituency. As ICANN observers will know, whenever Marilyn Cade gets up to say something and the non-commercial users get up to agree with her, that's notable. But I do pretty much agree with everything Marilyn said, which is that we need constituencies. We really want to increase global engagement. It is really hard for us. We need some capacity building. Especially, I want to say very specifically we need help with translation and internationalization. Is something that's hard work we don't have the resources to do ourselves.

So I just wanted to say that. But I also wanted to say, look, what else -- what else can we do to help? And what can you do to help us do it? We're really -- we are -- this has been a topic we've been talking inside the constituency a long time. We're really keen. We are absolutely, you know, 100% behind international outreach, and we're absolutely keen to help.



SALLY COSTERTON:

Well, thank you for that. I really appreciate it. And I know my team will.

We need to be careful that we are joined up, I think, is the expression, about how we provide capacity building, in particular, actually. So there's a balance to be struck. And we're working on this, Tarek and I and our team, a lot this week. And we'll do much more work on it.

What do we need to build and work with to help to give you, collectively, all our community groups in ICANN. There's a lot of crossover in some of the content that we need.

So we're starting the process of having, by the end of Toronto and on into the future of mapping, if you will, the requests that are coming in saying we need this kind of content. We need this kind of content. We need this sort of translation. But there's -- and there is some differences.

So, as we come back to you, what we will hope to do, if this works for you, is to say here's where we think we're going with this. How much of this works for you? What else do you need? So that we don't double up, triple up, quadruple up. This is crazy. it's impossible to organize. And you also will dilute the messages that we're trying to put across, if we are going to build effective communication with our global audiences. We need to be one ICANN. We need to have a consistent perspective and show that we listen in the same way.

So be ready for us to come to you to have that kind of dialogue and to hear more about how do we get it just right. That's how we're going to approach it. But I really appreciate your comments. And we'll have a lot more conversations, I know.



ALAIN BERRANGER:

Thanks. Good morning.. I'm Alain Berranger. I'm the chair-elect of the not-for-profit operational concern, NPOC. And I want to say that you will find in our constituency that, although we are very young, that we are highly internationalized already. And, therefore, I -- I'm so pleased to see the two of you there. Because we will be able to collaborate, and you can count on our support.

There are two small points I want to clarify on the NomCom. This is not -- I hear about the balance, but this is not a big issue. There is a process. And the reason why -- why NPOC is not on NomCom is because the bylaws have to be changed. And that takes a little while. Because, when the bylaw -- so I'm totally satisfied that we will take our place in the NomCom in the time to come.

And, finally, please solve -- please look at the resources that are available to your constituencies.

And you will realize that we have very little. And so -- and Fadi was, seemed to be quite aware of that.

The reason I mention that is that I think there are reputational risks. As we outreach, we have a fantastic plan and we have all of it. But we also have to do simple things like processing membership applications very quickly.

And right now the executive committee of non-commercial is the executive committee. It's the policy. It's the secretary. It's the driver. It's the printer. It's everything.



So we desperately need some help. ICANN needs to go to the next level in resourcing constituencies, if you want us to be able to play our role.

SALLY COSTERTON:

I hear you. We have to help you to help your community. And we have to strike the right balance. Shall I go over here? Yes. Can we -- sorry. Can we take -- because we're really running out of time. Can we just take this last question from this lady here. And, if we have time, a couple observations from our directors.

>>

Yeah, I'll be really short, actually. This is (saying name) the general manager of AP TLD. We're the regional organization for ccTLDs in AP -- Asia Pacific region. I, actually -- this morning I see really something really, you know, good things going on from here. You know, you know, all the board here. And Fadi's here. And there was two senior advisors here. So I think, you know, we really appreciate the tremendous effort, you know, ICANN is making on global engagement. You know, and also, I heard, you know, there will be strategic plan globalized and also regionalized to be in place.

So I -- actually, I would like to make some comments on those strategic plans. Even within the region, actually, like our region, AP region, we're so diverse. So even, you know -- Chris knows, you know, how different our region is, you know. Especially, you know, Asia has different needs and specific. And also not mention the Middle East. According to ICANN definition, Middle East also included in AP region. So probably for the strategic plan, even for the subregion, probably, we should look



at those. And also, you know, the AP region is not only about Australia, not only about China. Don't forget about those developing countries. Those are really somebody really needs some help probably. You know, that's the first comment I would like to make.

And, secondly, is -- you want to -- sorry.

SALLY COSTERTON:

I was just going to say. We hear you. We had a long meeting yesterday, in fact, in our group here with Xiadong. And, particularly, Xiadong's view Asia Pacific is lots of different issues we need to engage on. It's not just one area. He's very experienced and knowledgeable on this. And ditto. We need to have a look at -- Fadi said earlier is it 5? It's probably not 5. And we're just work in progress trying to level that out. So I just wanted to reassure you we hear.

>>

Thank you. Because also, you know, AP region is not only about Australia. It's only about, you know, New Zealand, not about -- sorry, not about China, you know. I'm from China. But it's also about, you know, don't forget about the -- all those developing countries, you know, they're -- I heard, you know, there will be some priority on the -- you know, Latin American, Africa and also in our countries very, very mixed. Our region is very, very mixed. So, you know, that's my first point.

And second one is, actually, there has been really good collaboration between us, between our organization and ICANN. John Crain from



ICANN has been helping our training for years. You know, it's just as Sally said, I think it's really, you know, engagement is really a two-way thing. By providing the trainings, our members really, you know, benefit from those trainings. But, meanwhile, you know, ICANN really, you know, could have, you know, more engagement with, you know, the regional stakeholders, you know, to know what they really need, you know, to get -- you know, to help on those -- as our regional organization, we really only have very limited resource. But we have to have, you know, good engagement with those stakeholders. But ICANN, you know, do have the resource. So definitely could help on that, you know?

SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you.

>>

Actually, I'm really looking forward for more collaboration on those perspectives.

SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you very much. That's very encouraging.

Could I ask for my colleagues, our board colleagues here to just summarize very briefly? And then we must -- we must finish our session. It would be lovely to stay here all morning, but I think we will be kicked out.





SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: No, you will not be kicked out. Because the next session will be running by us, and we will not kick you out. I'm going to speak in French because you don't have your headset, but you can follow on the screen.

I think it's very important to use the tools that are given to us. I am also always astonished to see that there is nobody using those tools. If you don't use those tools, then why do we put them in place? The interpretation, the translation, in the six languages of the United Nations. Use those tools.

I just wanted to say a few words. The presence of ICANN is not the presence of the staff. It's our present. It's the presence of each one of the constituencies that is ICANN.

What can the staff -- what can staff do is to use to help you? The board members we can use -- we can help you. But don't let's not dream of staff in each one of our countries. We are the footprint. We are the ICANN in the world.

The second thing we talked about constituencies and we're going to have the stakeholders that are existent. But, if they are new that are coming, that those open -- ICANN is an open house. Like Fadi said, it's an oasis. In an oasis people must come. It will be more complicated to organize, but we will have -- do we have to have 50 people at NomCom? Do we have to -- do we have to change the composition of the board?

We have to look at all this -- the new arrival of the gTLD will change organization, participation of all kinds of parts in the world, not only of the existing stakeholders but new stakeholders. It will be new problems. And we have to take that in account when we talk about



(non-English word) because that's the word in French. And I do not want to translate it in English, but it would be "worldlization," but it would be too complicated. Thank you.

**BERTRAND DE LA CHAPELLE:** A few key words because, as Fadi used the word "balance" -- and everybody understands that it has a lot of ramification. We like to share a few key words. One is ownership. I understand that the way you're doing the internationalization strategy is making sure that there's ownership by the actors. Another key word is "tools." All constituencies and all stakeholders must feel that ICANN is a tool for them to address issues that they have and to work together to address those issues.

Another word is "coherence." And here I would like to echo Werner was saying or try to interpret in a less passionate manner what he was trying to say that we need to be coherent in every single step and everything we do, which means that the question of how is -- how are actions perceived in the global world is also part of nationalization. And so every decision we make on things that do not seem to be an internationalization progress –

(Scribes receiving language other than English)

(Scribes receiving a different language other than English)



(Scribes receiving yet another language other than English)

BERTRAND DE LA CHAPELLE: -- that we have all those animals. And the final element is consumers and users. It's a dirty word, but consumer protection is a beautiful word. And I think we're looking at a lot of things that are procedural. We make trademark protection. We make a lot of things. But the ultimate goal is to make sure that the system that is in place is usable, is safe, and is correctly managed. And getting the user perspective on the DNS is a very important one.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, Bertrand. Wendy, do we have any questions from the remote group?

No. Thank you all very much. This was an excellent session, I think, for us. And enjoy the rest of your day. Thank you. If there's any more you want to share with us, find us in the meeting or find us on e-mail. We look forward to hearing from you. Thank you.

>> END OF SESSION

