

---

TORONTO – Latin America and the Caribbean Stakeholders Engagement and Outreach

Wednesday, October 17, 2012 – 09:00 to 10:30

ICANN - Toronto, Canada

RODRIGO de la PARRA: Good morning, everyone. This is Rodrigo de la Parra.

GONZALO NAVARRO: Good morning for being present here at this meeting. For the benefit of those who do not speak Spanish, we have interpretation if you -- you're invited to use the headsets and that would be very useful.

RODRIGO de la PARRA: Are we ready to start?

I would like to describe how this session will be carried forward. We will have an introduction section where our President and CEO, Fadi Chehade, will address a message to the audience regarding the strategy for Latin America and Caribbean.

Afterwards, we will have the comments of the members of our board, Gonzalo Navarro and Olga, and we will have panels with three participants each regarding the participation of players in Latin America and the Caribbean in the different groups of ICANN, within its ICANN representation groups.

And at the end, we will have a session to open the debate and discussion regarding the steps ahead.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

So ladies and gentlemen, our President and CEO, Fadi Chehade, is invited to address the audience.

FADI CHEHADE:

Good morning. Rodrigo is very, very frustrated that he's not here.

[ Laughter ]

Very frustrated. And I'm sorry he's not here. I know this is his baby, his effort, but thank you, Rodrigo, for being positive and joining us.

[ Chime sounding ]

I think all of you heard from me on Monday. I don't have a lot to add on the substance of what we're going to do moving forward. All I can say is that what I said is not just from the heart, as it should be, because believe me, if this job does not move us from the heart, on most days I question why I'm doing it.

It's a very tough job. I've done -- I've had much bigger jobs, but this is, by far, the biggest job in terms of the scope and the effort that needs to be put and the -- the calmness and the wisdom that need to come, and the patience with this.

So I just feel very humbled by the responsibility and the support you've given me, so on a personal note, I want to thank you all for standing by as we try to get this thing right.

But let's talk about Latin America and the Caribbean a little bit.



I, since Prague, have been briefed about what's going on in your region a lot more than I knew in Prague. So when I met some of you in Prague, it was truly, for me, just -- I knew where you were but that's about it. Now I know a lot more. And the more I meet with you and the more I learn about what you've done -- and Rodrigo has been very good at briefing me -- frankly, I'm deeply impressed by what you already have going on in that region.

I also happen to -- in my last company, to have had offices in Latin America, and the work that was done for my company in Latin America was remarkable.

So for those of us who sometimes sit in our little L.A. bunker and fortress and think that the rest of the world is catching up, believe me, having had a team of people in Latin America working on very innovative things, we're not catching up. In fact -- they're not catching up. In fact, we may be catching up.

The level of innovation, of thoughtfulness, of integrity, of openness -- openness! -- that is in the vibrant Latin American countries now is remarkable.

So we're not here and I'm not here to tell you what to do. I don't have a strategy for you. You need to tell us what we can do for you.

So I'm going to be very clear about that.

And I also deeply appreciate the place you're at, and the knowledge you have about the space we're in is different from other developing regions. I don't view you in that same light. You have the capability, the



capacity, and the proof right now in your work that you can leapfrog a lot of these things and move into a leadership role. A leadership role! This is the opportunity. This is the opportunity.

I was -- I told you I took -- part of my preparation for this job, they sent me to a class, so it was the first time I go back to school in 25 years. It was humbling. It was good for me. So I sat in a classroom for two weeks, and my team, by complete, you know, randomness, was assigned Latin America and specifically to work on Brazil, but Latin America in general, and it was the first time I had to spend many days and many long nights reading and learning about your region, and it's impressive. It's very impressive.

If you look at the world indices and what's happening in Latin America, you are definitely breaking a lot of things into the future now and you will -- you are leading already in many areas.

So I want to tell you that at a personal level and a professional level, I am very intimate and familiar with the depth and the understanding you have of this enterprise we're in, number one; number two, that on an ICANN level, I'm now briefed and aware of the incredible things that are happening as we speak; thirdly, that having said all of that, it doesn't mean that I'm just not going to pay attention to you and let's go elsewhere now because these guys have everything they need from us. I don't believe that's the case either.

I think we as ICANN have not done enough to support and embrace the needs of your region and to give you everything you need to grow at a country level, at a political level, at an economic level, at a technical level.



At every level, we need to engage. We need to deeply engage with you. And we will have no excuse if, a year from now, any of you are still standing up and saying, "We don't get help enough from ICANN. We don't -- we have no way to engage with ICANN."

So my commitment to you is that on the basis and in -- on the background of all the great successes you have and the great progress you've made, on the background of that, you also now have my full support, my team's support, to engage fully at every level and make you successful.

And we will be building presence in Latin America. We have to. Less Los Angeles, more the world.

This is my plan.

So even my team approached me and said, "The office is ready. The new office in L.A. is full."

I said, "Perfect. I want people to move out of here and go close to the stakeholders," right? That's the right thing to do. And so we will get closer to you. We need your help to understand why and how and what, and Rodrigo, of course, is our conduit to that, and I'm encouraging him to pack up his bags and head south, and I hope he can. I know there are family issues that he has to deal with, but I think the right place for him to be is right near you, and he knows that, so I'm not -- I'm putting pressure on him publicly here, too, but -- but all of us need to be nearer to you.



I'm doing everything to cancel some plans I had next week because I'd like my first trip after this meeting to be to Latin America, so this is a secret I'm letting out here.

[ Laughter ]

So I'm trying to cancel a couple of things, and I may surprise some of you, but I just really would like to head south and to meet with as many of you as I can. I'm working on it. I hope I can steal just at least 24 or 48 hours and come down and visit, so -- and maybe -- Brazil was very kind also to extend to me an invitation to learn about the multistakeholder thing they did, and any of you, please, let me know. I -- every country in Latin America, I need to get closer to you and listen to you and be part of your success.

So that's my message, and I leave you now to my much more experienced colleagues. You know that you have very good friends on the board of ICANN, and now with the addition of Olga, who is a remarkable addition, someone with experience as well, and a real -- a real -- real heart for Latin America, real love for Latin America, and she brings it. She adds to the great voices we already have on the board and hopefully more. Hopefully more of you on the board, right? You know, we'll hold one board meeting in Spanish someday, as we should, or in Portuguese. We should. And the support we are getting with the languages here is just the beginning. Just the beginning. And I'm very proud of that -- the language services that we are offering you.

Anyway, I give it to you. Thank you.

[ Applause ]



---

RODRIGO de la PARRA: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Fadi, for these kind words.

Personally, I will take your words as a commitment, and as you mentioned, I will be the link in between, to assure that the internationalization strategy of ICANN within Latin America is fulfilled, and also in keeping with the strategy we planned. Thank you very much, Fadi.

And without further ado, I will pass on the floor to Olga, who is a new director of the board for ICANN.

Olga, you have the floor.

OLGA MADRUGA-FORTI: Good morning. Thank you very much, Rodrigo.

First of all, I would like to thank Tarek, Fadi, Rodrigo, Gonzalo, and all my colleagues here for organizing this new initiative, for being present here to work all together and embark on new objectives. Thank you all of you.

I would like to start off by sharing who I am, where I come from, how I landed here, and not to get you bored and speak about myself, but I would like to tell you why it is relevant and why ICANN is relevant and what we are trying to attain in our work.

I was born in Havana, Cuba. I was born in the year of the revolution. I grew up in Havana, and after some years, my family moved to the United States. My first experience with barriers and with the division of



a family artificially divided due to social -- social, economical, political reasons, from very early on, my first experience is I will not address him or her. Do we have to wait for three days to get a telephone connection to Havana? Do we have to call the operator to tell us that our family member can speak with us?

These were my first experiences with communications.

I arrived in the United States. I started studying the language and the cultural differences, and in the end, to become a lawyer.

Of course! How? By breaking barriers. By bridging -- by creating bridges where bridges did not exist, and to that end and in the city of Washington, I met some people from Argentina. Many of them were exiles -- exiling from the right-wing dictatorship, barriers, divisions in the families, letters that did not arrive, letters that did arrive, waiting for a letter, sending letters by air mail through a third country, et cetera.

And of course out of these experiences, my two children, Argentinian children, were born and the end of the dictatorship arrived in Argentina and are return to Argentina as of today.

And I tell you that to share with you that my person and my career were dedicated to eliminating the barriers of communication between families, between peoples, and in that way, from a corporate lawyer point of view, to promote social and economical health from the point of view of communication.

So why Internet and why our work is -- in ICANN is so important?



Internet and the multistakeholder model do not acknowledge those barriers. It is a unique thing in the history of communications. A perfect example is what we have today with the involvement of our colleague and leader of objectives, Rodrigo. The administrative barriers, the world will live in today, realities, doesn't let him come on time to our meetings sometimes, but he is still here through the Internet and all of us working together.

The relevance is to make the best of what you can do technologically today, and translate that into our personal commitment to the work, and not to set up barriers ourselves, technological barriers that are not there anymore, to work together in our countries acknowledging that there are at some point differences. Social, economical differences. And a very special hello to the Caribbean region languages as well within our -- our region. So all those differences in our work in ICANN and our region should be left aside when we build this new initiative for Latin America, taking into account the multistakeholder model value and promoting our efforts in all our countries and organizations on an international basis disseminating all this knowledge.

And let me wrap up by saying that a lot is going on in the region, such as Fadi says.

It is an effort well founded and developed, so we need to come hand in hand with that effort. Not to duplicate successful efforts already in place, but understanding new government projects already in place in our countries.

In Argentina, I hope I can share our experience in Argentina, the Argentina connected experience through which the lady president has



the acknowledgment of our sister organizations, the ITU on a worldwide basis, as the woman of the year in telecommunications.

These type of projects are very important. We are not making things up from scratch as to what's going on within the region, but to come hand in hand with what is going on there in a very special manner.

With that, thank you for the opportunity of being with you on this mission.

[ Applause ]

RODRIGO de la PARRA:

Thank you very much, Olga. Thank you for your words. I would like to give the floor to Gonzalo Navarro, who has been elected for another period in our board.

Gonzalo, please.

GONZALO NAVARRO:

Thank you, Rodrigo. I have three minutes so I'll try to be as brief as possible.

As every time I have spoken in Spanish, I will start by apologizing to the translators because I speak too quickly, and to my Latin American colleagues, I also apologize. If you don't understand me, you can look at the screen.

I'm so happy to be here, not just because we are together here but also because we're making progress from a breakfast we had four meetings



ago till today, and I'm sure that there will be more opportunities to do this more on an institutional basis.

Rodrigo, your work has been super relevant.

Fadi, Olga, members of the board, you know some people in the Latin America/Caribbean region.

Carlton, our friend from the Caribbean, welcome.

This is a tremendous region. The potential is acknowledged. But the commitment of ICANN and to ICANN cannot be challenged. They have been there since the very beginning. Santiago de Chile was there since 1999. Everything started there and many of the faces I see here have been there from the very beginning.

We have the background of ICANN's morality and expertise in many senses.

So it's good that we agree as a region, as you will see at the end of this meeting, that the agenda, I believe, has for 10 minutes to talk about the regional strategy submitted by Rodrigo. But it was required.

If you saw throughout the week the presentations by Fadi, the interesting approach that we have all cooperation now, our idea is that these things are aiming at the internationalization of ICANN. That is a word that is not properly used. We should say that ICANN is a really international organization. We should say globalization.

It does not have the choice perhaps to be international itself, to get to all the regions, to satisfy all the regions, according to their needs, so as



we do have the tool now to make the best of ICANN, it is a time that we agree to see what we need from ICANN.

Many of us who have been in eternal discussions in WSIS, regional fora, CITELE meetings and so on, start thinking what the region needs, what the region should make use of, where the region should be, why don't we have gTLDs, we should have a regional gTLD, nonproprietary software, things get mixed, and we discuss so much about so many things that we never agree on the essentials.

What we're doing with a regional strategy is to agree what we need, where we want to go in a constructive discussion, and produce results for the region.

Thank you very much again. It's so good to talk Spanish and see happy friends' faces are all around.

[ Applause ]

RODRIGO de la PARRA:

Gonzalo, thank you very much. This is the end of the first introductory session, and we will start with the first panel coordinated by our friend, Alejandro Pisanty, but we would like to give the floor to Fadi, who will say a few words to us.

FADI CHEHADE:

-- and that I don't speak Spanish or Portuguese, but I understand, and I appreciate your time.

I want to say a couple of things before I leave.



How many people here -- raise your hand if you believe we should stop using the term "internationalization" and start using the term "globalization." How many people believe this nuance is...

(Speaker is off microphone.)

Or (non-English word or phrase) which -- from our French contributors here. So some people think we should switch to "globalization." Okay. Let me think about that a little bit. I heard this twice this week and I take it to heart. Let me think about this one a little bit and I'll get back to you on that.

I'm sorry that I won't be here to hear this, but I know Rodrigo will walk me through this in a lot of detail, and I'll learn it –

(Speaker is off microphone.)

FADI CHEHADE: Sorry?

(Speaker is off microphone.)

FADI CHEHADE: Okay. I can understand Spanish.

(Speaker is off microphone.)



FADI CHEHADE:                      Okay.

(Speaker is off microphone.)

FADI CHEHADE:                      (Speaking in a non-English language.)

(Speaker is off microphone.)

FADI CHEHADE:                      Okay. Okay. All right. I appreciate that very much. Thank you.

Okay. And there is no (non-English word or phrase) in English, is there?  
Is there? Maybe we should start using French or Spanish. We should  
do that.

[ Laughter ]

(non-English word or phrase), that would be good.

GONZALO NAVARRO:                      I guess you are doing that.



FADI CHEHADE:

I am doing it. Okay. Many thanks again. All the best to you at this conference and I hope when we meet again, we'll be -- we'll be in South America somewhere, or in the Caribbean.

And, by the way, MyICANN, our new tool, which I hope you're all using, is developed -- the software is developed -- in the Caribbean, okay? So...

[ Applause ]

RODRIGO de la PARRA:

Thank you, Fadi, for being with us in this first introductory session. We will now start the next panel.

Without further delay, let's try to be as brief as possible. We are a bit delayed with the agenda. We have the panel to be introduced by Dr. Pisanty.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

Thank you, Rodrigo. Thank you, interpreters, for the differences of lingo and the speed.

Rodrigo, then please formally include my thanks. I think that I also represent everybody by saying that I would need to thank Fadi, his openness to the region, to the sectors, the users of the Internet.

Rodrigo has asked me to coordinate this session of brief introduction so as to make room for the discussion.



I believe that our region has serious problems, where the intervention of ICANN -- the core of ICANN, the corporate part of ICANN may have a role.

There are things that are requested to fund the expert opinions sought, there are speakers sought, people with the capability and capacity to change decisions such as the Director-General, the members of the board, but there are many things already running in the region. If we compare the regional strategy announced for Africa, what we can see is that there are many things in the agenda for Africa and the action planned already is closed for Africa that we have already sorted out.

If we use a maturity model, we would certainly be in a maturity level above. If we use, for instance, a software industry maturity model, or organization analysis models, it would be good if we could ask for a strategy similar to Africa's for many things. Internet penetration is higher in the population, the production methods for Internet, which is more important than consumption, are better than those in Africa.

We have quite a better scenario human resources, availability of educated resources, the possibility of talking to three powers in government, not just the executive power, is also much higher. But there are interesting conflicts as well, more interesting than those found in the Africa, because of the maturity of the region itself.

So I believe that in this region, it will be interesting to see how we're going to face actual problems we have identified to curb what we call the letters to the -- to Santa asking for resources is what I mean, but to bring on the table actual problems we are having trouble to sort out and



the capability to have contributions to solve our own problems and the general problems of the system.

I would add that we have some organizations. Some of them are mature. Some of them have growth issues, in all areas, the ccTLDs, civil society organizations, technical community organizations, the involvement of governments. In all that, we have to find strengths and departure points to get solutions.

We have specific problems, and it is in our hands to solve. We cannot rely on ICANN and we cannot hide them before getting support. Something like an ALAC general meeting cannot end one year after it started. Organizational problems, structural problems, we have capacity-building problems in our region because of the capacity we have to provide to the training of the community.

In these type of issues, I think we shouldn't be petitioners to ICANN but to speak about how we can solve them among ourselves and how we can provide to the solution of ICANN's problems. And from that, our solution will be petitions and to provide resources in ICANN. And I hope we can have this better than a wish list or a complaint list.

These are maturity indicators, and I open the debate to others that want to participate.

RAUL ECHEBERRIA:

So we have to go to the moderation. We can continue with the debate.



---

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Raul, are you there? Can we test whether we can hear you correctly?

RAUL ECHEBERRIA: How long do I have, Alejandro?

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: We are pressing on time. Is five minutes enough?

RAUL ECHEBERRIA: I do not have a presentation prepared, first of all. Good morning to everyone. I see them -- I see you over the Web, and I see familiar faces, some others that are not so familiar. And it seems to be a very well-attended meeting, which is positive.

I would like to make some comments regarding some things that were said.

At the end of his intervention, Fadi make a question regarding the terms "internationalization" or "globalization." I prefer "globalization" because "internationalization" gives the idea that there is an organization that stands from a non-internationalistic stand and would like to internationalize. It would strengthen the vision of an organization that is U.S. centric. And this is a wrong focus. This is paternalistic.

Speaking about globalization, on the other hand, is saying this should be a globalization. That's what we are working for. And we should strengthen this component of ICANN's profile. So I would prefer the second expression due to stronger meaning.



One other thing about the letters to Santa, I do not have any letter to Santa or a wish list. And this goes in line with what Alejandro said, that we shouldn't be a petitioner. I think in the region we have an Internet ecosystem that is very strong. We have organizations. We relate very well amongst each other. We have a good relationship between the stakeholders that goes beyond the work within ICANN's community. We are inside regional intergovernmental relationships and international organizations in multistakeholder platforms far beyond ICANN's scope and far beyond what ICANN has achieved so far.

So we have this system which is strong and, I would say that when I get the question: What does -- what do we need from ICANN? We need from ICANN that ICANN does not fail because as a component of this ecosystem, one of the components of the ecosystem, this creates damage to the rest of the ecosystem. And this is what we need to work on legitimacy, participation, plurality of ICANN.

And I had opportunity to tell this to Fadi in some previous meetings. I think there is a great challenge, a huge challenge to enter into a phase where ICANN seems to focus much of its energies and efforts on domain name issues and business issues or other interests coming from the developed world. And if ICANN is perceived as a regulator of businesses, this may contribute to a loss of legitimacy. So welcome this vision -- we welcome this vision of these pluralities within the regions and amongst the different stakeholders.

And to conclude, I would mention something that I said to Fadi and Rodrigo and Ray, which are the things that I think are important that



ICANN should do. One should be to show and invest more what is done in other issues, not necessarily generic domain names.

ICANN has very important functions in terms of Security and Stability Advisory Committee, IANA functions, root server operations. These are tasks that ICANN does which makes it a central element. And this is not shown.

In addition, we should invest more in terms of Security and Stability Advisory Committee community. The committee should work with regional offices in each region to have regional diagnosis to see what the problems are in each region, to make suggestions, action plans, to work with the actors and players of the region to improve stability -- Internet stability and security in the regions of the world.

Also, the relationship with the governments, ICANN can contribute. We could have more governments of the regions participating in ICANN. This would be helpful to all of us. We could have a regional GAC or something where we could have an opportunity to relate more closely at a regional basis with the different regions beyond the 20 minutes as we have when we speak about GAC.

It would be better not to have 20 minutes but to have three hours to work with the GAC representatives within one region and the governments could follow on this agenda and also to participate and to engage more in issues related to the development, participating and having a liaison with the players that already exist, those that are consolidated and participate more within one of these ideas. These are some of the ideas I would like to propose. Thank you very much.



---

ALEJANDRO PISANTY: Thank you very much, Raul. Would you like to add anything else? Otherwise, we will give the floor to Franklin or to Eduardo.

Franklin?

FRANKLIN SILVA NETTO: Good morning. I am Franklin Netto. I'm a representative of Brazil in the GAC, so I know I should do it very briefly, so I would like to concentrate my words.

It is very positive that we have this space of articulation of Latin America and Caribbean within one ICANN meeting. I think this is a token that works both ways in terms of the new direction of ICANN to promote debates with a regional focus, with aim of internationalized ICANN and also one that shows our presence in the region of this system. That is so important for the stability of Internet.

Obviously, the challenge we face and we will face and taking into consideration the strategy is the diversity because the Latin America and the Caribbean is a region that speaks Spanish but also French, English, Dutch and also Portuguese and some other languages that I do not -- did not mention. So from the diversity perspective would come the great challenge and also the great value we can provide to the ICANN system.

Specifically in terms of GAC, Brazil has always sought to reinforce the need that the GAC be more effective. And to that end, we have two levels of consideration. Not only the effectiveness of GAC together with

the ICANN board within the ICANN system but also that within GAC, there is effectiveness in the participation of countries. That's why I -- or we are concerned about the fact that in GAC meetings, there is a subrepresentation of Latin America/Caribbean. Some countries are not represented, not very well represented. Some of them may be issues of finance and others issues of training. That's why within the GAC, we have the banner of this participation to allow and to permit the participation of all countries in GAC deliberations and debates.

Also, I would like to go to Rodrigo's idea of a regional GAC. I think this would be positive to discuss within our own perspective and to discuss some issues that are within the realm of GAC. Thank you very much. And this is what I had to say.

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

Thank you very much, Franklin. And now Eduardo Santoyo.

EDUARDO SANTOYO:

Good morning, everyone. And, again, as in ICANN meetings, I lose my voice. But I would like to thank Rodrigo -- Fadi and Rodrigo for organizing this meeting, and I would like to thank you all for being present to help that this space that was proposed to address common interests of Latin America/Caribbean within ICANN grows and helps to have a better presence of ICANN within the mind and in the discussions of us in Latin America and to help us trigger a political maturity in our ICANN fora.



I would like to address some ccTLDs of the region and our relationship with the communities.

Also, some communities within our countries are a very important asset within our countries to generate programs to enrich management of activities led by ICANN as the rest of the governance areas of Internet.

Given the fact that the responsibility we assume and that we have in our countries by analyzing the territorial code creates a possibility of having a participation space, which is very important, in each one of the countries, that this should be made most of to get the community closer to the issues of governance in Internet, to see the use of Internet in our countries and to see how Internet provides for the human development in our areas.

Within the framework of ICANN, it is important to highlight that there has been a very important commitment of the region's ccTLDs to help build this collective organization that helps in the coordination of Domain Name System and I.P. names from the very beginning of ICANN, as Rodrigo said in his speech, and also has by hosting and organizing regional regions -- there have been eight of them -- but also by working actively within the organs of ICANN's institutionality. Out of the 33 members of Latin America/Caribbean, there are 26 that ccNSO. We work from the very beginning of the institution in the year 2003. We were the first group that was consolidated for the organization of the ccNSO.

We worked in different working groups of the association and, in general, we contributed and we have a permanent spirit of contribution towards the collective work of building within this space that is ICANN



and to build the coordination and management mechanism for the administration of these resources that are under our care; that is, the domain names and I.P. numbers.

So we try to coordinate and manage all the efforts from the cooperation environment where interests can be internationally represented at ICANN.

The region has developed its country codes and major institutionality. We had a regional organization of ccTLDs, LacTLDS that has consolidated a closing approach to be closer in the region. A major number of members, 26, representing more than 80% of the ccTLDs in the region.

There are some that are not part of the association. Some registries in the Caribbean, perhaps more for geopolitical than geographical reasons or affinity reasons have not part of the region.

But the association has grown and somehow met the commitment of representing common interests of the different ccTLDs in the global Internet environment. And that is the bridge of ccTLDs. Many of us with not a chance to travel to go permanently to meetings, but we are represented by the LacTLD.

That is the path, the bridge, we have built to have presence at fora such as the OAS, CITEC organization, the global Internet Governance Forum and ICANN itself and in many other places where individually we can all -- we couldn't get there.



It also helps bring back member countries that were not able to come to us now. And we can take the different subjects discussed with an impact on the environment in which we're working.

Linking this to the proposal of what we can do, we want to still be an active, strong, motivated and interested actor, which is trying to build this common interest called ICANN in this governance space.

I agree with Raul, that it is not where we're going to ask for but what we are going to provide.

I'm over my time scheduled, so let me wrap up. So what we are going to give in the association is a clear channel. LacTLD can provide the contributions of the region so that we build the Internet institutionality and governance we want. Thank you.

[ Applause ]

ALEJANDRO PISANTY:

Eduardo, thank you very much.

With the time management program, we are 20 minutes late. And we want to consider the speakers scheduled and the Q&A. Hartmut Glaser will coordinate the next part of the session.

HARTMUT GLASER:

When Franklin talked about the language in Latin America, he forgot the combination of Portuguese and Spanish, and now we will give evidence of this new language.



I'm Hartmut Glaser. I'm the executive secretary of the Brazilian committee. And I would like to invite Carlton Samuels, Vanda Scartezini from NomCom -- and I don't know whether someone from the SSAC, Frederico is around. There should be a representative here. We wanted to have a quick presentation of the participation of the Latin America and the Caribbean and the different activities that we have at ICANN.

So we heard from ASO, from Raul, SCO, Franklin. And now without wasting too much time, we give some input about the activities at At-Large.

CARLTON SAMUELS:

Good morning, everyone. My name is Carlton Samuels. I am vice chair for the ALAC. And I'm from Jamaica. And I belong to an At-Large organization centered at the University of the West Indies.

I'm going to make some general remarks about the Caribbean in the ICANN context and to give you some background as to what our interest is. First of all, the Internet is a development imperative for the Caribbean. It is very important to the sense that we think we are going to develop economically and socially. And so it is at the heart of all of our planning and structures here forward.

The challenge in the Caribbean is twofold. The first one is access. The second one is the infrastructure. And so Caribbean governments, most of the policies are centered around issues of access and infrastructure. That is why organizations that tend to focus on access and infrastructure gets noticed.



Let me give you some examples. Around the Caribbean, there has been concerted effort to look at broadband penetration in countries because of the possibilities that provides for improving access.

There's been concerted activities to provide physical points of access which we call community access points so that those who are on the other side, the wrong side of the digital divide, have an opportunity to become netizens. There has been concerted effort to harmonize the telecommunications regulatory framework across the region, and those are -- that initiative has been supported strongly by the International Telecommunications Union.

So with all of that going on, and with the emphasis on access and infrastructure, ICANN in the Caribbean is not top of mind. So what do we do?

There have been a few of us, small bunch of us, that have been working assiduously, very hard, to get ICANN in play in the Caribbean. There was a time when I got involved in ICANN, there was a Caribbean representative from ICANN to the Caribbean. A young fellow named Jacob Malthouse came into my office at the University and actually invited me to come and participate, and he came from ICANN. He was sent to me by someone in the Caribbean. That's true. Jacqueline Morris sent him to me, but he came to see me.

And we had Jacob left and we had a successor, but then the successor left and we were sort of left hanging. That is not good.

The other issue is how you engage in the Caribbean. Here's the thing. If you want people to know about you, you have to make active measures



to do something to message to them. And we have been saying for the longest time, Whatever you are doing in the Caribbean in terms of public participation, in terms of public messaging isn't working. Maybe what you need to do is to come to us.

And Sebastien Bachollet is right there. He will know, for example, how many times we have made approaches about communications plan from the At-Large to aid ICANN in sending the message to the end users. They have never accepted us.

The problem is the way you message in the Caribbean is not going to fit into the usual messaging formats that you send. You have to use traditional messaging formats and pathways: Radio, newspaper advertising. That's important and it's cheap.

We're not getting the message out for ICANN. And we believe that ICANN can engage more closely with the community and help that.

Let me give you another example. The RIRs, regional Internet registries, seem to do a better job of it. The Caribbean is a little bit different because we are divided between two RIRs. Some of us are with the LACNIC area. Others of us are in the ARIN area. Some of us are in the RIPE area, and that's because of the geopolitical considerations. As my friend Eduardo mentioned, that is a fact.

The Cayman Islands, as the crow flies from where I live, is probably 45 minutes. But it's a RIPE area.

So there are these infrastructural issues, these baseline issues that need to be sorted out. The messaging has to change, the cooperation and



the coordination with other Internet players have to change. You have to start doing some things in collaboration to address the issues that are top of mind to the people in the Caribbean surrounding access and infrastructure. Then you might have some traction to attract more of us into the ICANN names and numbering system. Thank you.

HARTMUT GLASER:

Thank you, Carlton. I have asked Tony Harris to join the table because he was there in the first part and I would like Tony to talk in five minutes about GNSO.

TONY HARRIS:

Good morning. I will speak in Spanish because I always need to talk in English at ICANN and I wanted to tell you -- this is Tony Harris -- I am part of ICANN before it was set up. I represent the Argentinian Internet Chamber and the Latin American -- Federation of the Latin American, the Caribbean for E-commerce. In the first place I would like to tell you that in relation to Latin American involvement, together with many colleagues today present here, we have always been from the very first moment trying to have this voice heard, the involvement, the voice of all Latin America. I had to organize in 2005 the Mar del Plata meeting where, for the first time, we had a soccer game. I think it was a landmark. There was even someone who got hurt.

It is not a secret that as a region we are one of the groups that is more integrated and more friendly. At least what I feel is that we work in sync. We work toward building. That was a joke if somebody would like to laugh. That is what I feel.



I'll go into practical things now. This is a milestone. New gTLDs with Lac I have applied for the dot lat and we can proudly say that it is the only regional initiative as to applications because our main partner here is Mexico that will be the back office registry in this proposal, and I think that dot lat is a symbol of something achieved in ICANN by the Latin American community. So what I hope is that they do allocate it. And I cannot say that for sure.

It is not a secret and this happens in our daily activities in Argentina and Latin America in general, and it is pretty hard to tell people what ICANN is and why it is important to be there. It has a certain aura of mysticism. People cannot focus and find an anchoring point, why I should care about it. That requires a lot of effort. I don't know whether you share my opinion, but it happens.

I think one participant is missing at the table, that is the new constituency of NPOC. I think this is the constituency that has the most potential that is not yet developed to increase Latin American participation, since they are integrating and gathering with NGOs. We should not forget the amount of NGOs in Latin America. I had my -- an experience in Latin America to promote the dot ong -- or ngo, and only in Argentina there are a couple hundreds of NGOs. And if we multiply that in the region, it should be like mind-staggering, as they say in English. And I think we -- there we have an important field. It is very important what we do with fellowships, we bring people that will become ambassadors eventually, but we should have a fellowship for entities and bodies and chambers, not the technological chambers that are closer here, professional associations, Chamber of Commerce, that do not have a budget and do not have the willingness to come to



ICANN. But they are -- they spread out the message. A person in the association may reach out to hundreds or to thousands of small- and medium-sized companies or professionals. And I do not see them at ICANN. I do not know how to bring them in. I do not have enough money. But I think we should consider that. And to conclude, so as not to bore you and to go over the allocated time, I would like to tell you that we started an effort in Argentina that is very important with small- and medium-sized companies that have to do with Internet service providers that needs to expand broadband. And we are including communication centers and apps in Argentina to have telephony at small- and medium-sized companies, wireless ISPs, cable companies to - - for them to reduce costs and to provide a better service to -- to areas in difficulty in Argentina. And we realize that all these new services have to do with a program of new gTLDs. Why? Because when these TLDs appear, their users, sooner or later, will see an e-mail or a web page with -- that are not dot com or dot com/dot ar. And these same operators will face difficult technical problems because e-mail that one of users send them does not reach. This happened to some cooperatives in Argentina when dot coop, it was a serious problem. It had to be solved, and us from Latin America, from com LAC with our service providers in different places, we detected the place. The problem were the software platforms that blocks anything that was in excess of three digits. We took some time to solve this problem, and I will not go beyond that. They are telling me to shut up. And with -- with further -- without further comments, these are my comments and my ideas. Thank you very much.



>>

Thank you, Tony. And another activity is at work that is not so public or so visible and this is the activity of the NomCom, the nomination committee. This is -- has to do with a director. We have Vanda Scartezini who is the chair for 2012, and she's invited to intervene. And since we have issues -- problems with times, it is only five minutes.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

We cannot say that the NomCom has gone unnoticed. But we are always working under confidentiality rules. However, this year we published all the recommendations, processes, requests, so we started our work with the obligation of ATRT, that is an obligation that started last year that we have in front of us. However, I would like to provide some statistics regarding the candidates we had this year because Latin America played a very relevant role this year. So we had 73 candidates. Out of this we had 59 men, 14 women. Broken down into region, we have LAC participated with 33% of the candidates and these account for the fact that there was a vacancy that was the end of Gonzalo's term.

So since our bylaws state that we should have always one person of the region minimum, then this was necessary. A very special effort was made. I went to some places and I went outside Brazil to some other regions. I spoke with the media and the other colleagues in the region, and we attained these 33% of Latin American candidates. And we did achieve one and we got one person in addition to Gonzalo that was reelected. And we have Olga with us. So I think these results are very good.

Some other regions did not have so much participation. However, Latin America was very well-represented. This year -- or in 2013 we will have



again the opportunity of having applications for ALAC. And for ALAC within Latin American Caribbean. So this is a very important opportunity for many people, because many groups have strong requests to be a CEO. It's trouble. This does not hold truth for ALAC. Therefore, it is a good opportunity for the members of our group and our countries. They are participating in this. So by the end of the year, we will remember that in 2013 we will have a meeting in our region which will be important, and it is important to have candidates in meeting in our region.

The rest, the only -- another issue that I would like to address is to speak with women here. We had a very good effectiveness because we have only 14 women and out of these 14 women, 3 were elected and they are taking office and they are taking a leadership role in their positions. In fact, we have very well-qualified women. Most of them were very well-qualified, so it was easy. Now we have a woman for North America for the GNSO, one woman from Asia-Pacific for ccNSO. In Europe and in North America we did not find women as qualified as the two candidates that reached for ALAC positions. But Olga is representing what we achieved, bringing this fresh air to the Board and representing our region which makes us very happy and makes me very happy. If you have questions, they will be addressed at the end.

&gt;&gt;

Thank you, Vanda.

[ Applause ]



There is a women breakfast and women want to quote -- men want a quota. Generally it is the other way about. So we would like 30% participation of men in women's breakfast.

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Yes, we had some women -- some men. One was serving coffee. The other one was taking pictures. So the participation of men is there.

>>

This was the provocation for Vanda to have the opportunity.

RODRIGO de la PARRA:

The idea was to have a picture of the participation of Latin people in the different activities within ICANN. And I think we are concluding with this issue. That's why you have the floor.

>>

Thank you. Thank you for the excellent moderation. Now we will pass on to the last section of presentation with the strategic plan and discussion that Oscar Robles will moderate. Oscar, if you can help us with this section, I would try to share the presentation very fast and very briefly so as to provide more time to you and Oscar for the discussions of this step ahead. Advance the presentation to slide number 5. The first slides -- well, I skipped them because it is describing how we reached this document. All of you are included on the list. And you were witness as to how we wrote this first strategy draft document. It covers the queries of all the stakeholders of ICANN. We had a new



---

round of public comment, and we captured some queries that can give us an idea of the diagnosis in the region that I summarized here on this slide. Here we can see the low budget that was repeated on different occasions. Language barriers, lack of capacity building or training in different areas, low representation of the region in leadership positions within ICANN's structure and a call to include some issues on the ICANN agenda that are more relevant to the interests of the region. If we can pass on to the next slide.

We have found out of these issues, these are the objectives as a summary. Perhaps the objective is to have better infrastructure of DNS in the region. This is what we would like to attain. Another objective is to increase the participation of more players that found an important area and place to participate in ICANN. One of the issues that covered -- that the agenda covered over the last years is to have an agenda of the security and stability with the SSAC and ICANN Security and Stability Advisory Committee and mentioning that any action in this strategy should consider having a strategic alliance with the initiatives that are already present in the region and to see how ICANN can -- can create value. And we pass on to the next slide.

And finally, we have a series of action lines. We have ones in the document. It is a living document and as such, it can be updated, things may be added or changed. But there's some examples of concrete actions that may be instrumental in obtaining the goals. For instance, deploying copies of the L-Root. Raul has been talking about the LACNIC agreement, possibly a regional subcommittee for SSAC. There was also -- there were also thoughts about regional GAC meetings talking -- Tony was talking about an idea of creating a focus fellowship program aiming



at certain players and also improve our communications. You will know this document. I don't want to take any more time in describing its contents. It's there out for you and I would like to give room to Oscar and thank him for his coordination.

OSCAR ROBLES:

Thank you, Rodrigo. We have some minutes to listen to you. And if you come to the mics, please, so that everybody can listen to you and you have translation.

As any planning process, this involves analysis where we tend to have a brainstorming effort and then there comes a summary process which needs to be more efficient. We would not be able to do it if we are 40 or 50 people such as we are now. That exercise has to include the scoping, has to be in line with ICANN's strategy, what ICANN can actually do in relation to what we're -- what we want to be done. And to prevent any unnecessary expansions on the mission of ICANN. I would like to ask you to be brief. Who came first? Olga.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Well, one and one.

OLGA CAVELLI:

Thank you very much, Rodrigo. You are so far away, but still thank you for calling in to this meeting and such a good job. I am very happy with Olga being at the Board. I am very happy to have an ICANN member in Buenos Aires with whom I can get together and plan things for the region. And I am so happy to listen to her. I get real emotional.



I cannot fail to take advantage of the opportunity to talk about things that Argentina and Chile are concerned about. I like what Raul Echeberria said, that ICANN has some things to do and I think it has the opportunity of doing something big to work toward public good. Such as Fadi said, there's a brand that is Patagonia and it represents our country. It has asked for a brand TLD. In the presentation they know that it is not a geographical name, which is not the case. We have explicit support of many countries, the Argentinian Ministry of Foreign Affairs has worked go into all the embassies and consular offices in Argentina and the world and asked for support. We have explicit support in many countries in the region and others. Argentina will take all steps from its representation at GAC to ask this not to take place. What Argentina expects is for ICANN to work toward the well-being of people and not to leave the geographical name to be captured by a brand which is relevant to Argentina and Chile.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET:

Out of -- apart from CEO and Chair Fadi, I'm the first one out of the region to talk to you. It's important to say that in the meeting we have participants from other regions interested in this, in the Latin American and the Caribbean (switching from Interpreter to person speaking) ... of the language diversity to take care of the fact that you have all your friend also participating here, and I would like to urge you to do your work as well as possible as our friends from Africa have started to do, too, because I think you will pave the way for the other region to work on the strategic program and it may be a new way to set up a global strategic program for ICANN, doing it at the level of it's region and then go either global, world, international level, whatever is the word you



---

want to use for that, but it could be a good way to set up the next three-year program, strategic program for ICANN. And I would like to thank you all for this magnificent meeting.

>> (Speaking in non-English language.)

>> Thank you, Sebastien. Eduardo, please.

EDUARDO SANTOYO: Thank you for making yourself available and showing this document draft that helps support this -- the discussion project in the region to put together a scenario between the ICANN and the community players in Latin America. We undertake to work and create proposals and documents, and perhaps a first proposal could be put together finding a discussion venue with all the associations and organizations in the region in different interest groups so that we can all consolidate some joint comment before -- or to add some comment before the first quarter of the next year. So we're happy to get this document, and in principle, if we want to create -- well, there is this pain that I have that I did not include before when I made my remarks but I say it's not there. A higher expression of the regional communities and their involvement in the production and execution of the strategy. We want to be stronger, we want to work and put together comments and create a community discussion venue for this. Thank you. Sergio.



---

**SERGIO SALINAS PORTO:** Thank you, Rodrigo, for organizing this meeting. I was concerned at the beginning because I saw that there were many speakers and perhaps we would not have the chance to talk, but I thank you for this possibility. I have some concerns and some could be contributions.

I would like to follow Olga Cavalli's comment about the dot Patagonia. The Latin American people are worried about picking regional names as a commercial subject. Same thing with the CBA, the Commonwealth Bank Australia. It is also an acronym for the cities of Cordoba, Argentina, Colombia, and Spain and as Spanish-speaking people, the acronym's typically used by our regions to talk about important geographical areas. In the case of Argentina, it is a province. I think that this venue should keep on in time. We need to discuss domain names and numbers and governance. We need to see how we start discussing these things about new technologies applied to communications. And we need to start working in outreach and how we position ICANN in our region. It needs to be more present and also enriched.

**ALEJANDRO PISANTY:** We should not make any claims, but typically when someone is not working or is not producing what you expect, typically it's because they don't understand what they need to do. So we need to start thinking how we do to get the more capacities and capabilities in the region.

>> (Speaking off microphone) -- of Trinidad and Tobago Computer Society and upcoming ALAC member from LAC RALO. Thanks to Rodrigo.



Thanks to everyone for their comments and presentations, and I'm sure everybody will be studying this and thinking about it in the months to come.

Just three points really, and I know we're short on time. But one, we need to strengthen our Internet communities. By that I mean that we -- I'm surprised to see so many people from Latin America and Caribbean here. Actually, I didn't realize it was so many people in the ICANN region, and it just shows that there are gaps and a lack of communication between the different stakeholders, between -- in the region. So I think we need -- ICANN needs to work together to strengthen those -- strengthen the communication between the different stakeholders.

Two, accessibility of ICANN. A lot has been mentioned about the diversity of the Latin American and Caribbean region, and one of the biggest problems is the accessibility of ICANN. By that I mean that the information produced by ICANN and all of its work -- and there's a lot of meetings being done, but yet there's only like audio recordings and really what ICANN should be doing more is getting transcripts provided which is much more accessible, easily discoverable, and then those documents can be translated into a variety of languages upon request. So that's two.

And finally, very quickly, what Carlton said, you know, that not everybody has Internet access, not everybody has broadband access, and I think that, you know, trying to reach -- to do outreach over there, that alone isn't enough. You need to -- ICANN really does need to look at bringing ICANN closer to the communities in the Latin American and



Caribbean region. You know, we need to -- ICANN needs to really look at putting an ad in the newspapers, putting a small audio clip to say hey, this is what ICANN -- you know, something -- a marketing message to say this is what ICANN is. Go to this Web site, and see what the results are. Again, it's a very small cost. Thank you.

>>

Thank you. Nii.

[ Applause ]

NII QUAYNOR:

Thank you very much. I'm Nii Quaynor. I've come to lend a hand of support and encouragement for the effort you are making. I'm from the African region, of course. And I also want to mention that your region helped us a lot when we're trying to build AfriNIC. We also expect that collaborating this other effort in developing regional strategies, there's a lot we can continue to learn from your region, so we are very encouraged that you are also making the same similar effort and we look forward to sharing ideas and helping us grow together. So we thank you very much.

>>

Thank you. Thank you, Nii.

[ Applause ]



OSCAR ROBLES: Something very important on the African region and its strategic plan was to align its expectations with ICANN's pillars which provides an easier job in understanding and arranging the objectives and that is within the powers of ICANN. We need to get support from that experience to adjust our efforts.

RICARDO PEDRAZA: Thank you, Oscar. Ricardo Pedraza from VeriSign. I'm talking as a member of this community that was a founding member of TLD and has been in the community since before ICANN was born.

First, I would like to welcome the initiative of ICANN of getting us together as never before in history. Around that initiative of having a regional strategy where we combine the different constituencies and groups, all the sectors interested in our region to go forward and see the social benefit, the economic benefit of all our citizens.

Perhaps -- and I want to be concrete about this -- I would like to suggest something more in the lines of action associated to Internet governance which is probably implicit in some of the words, in some of the initiatives listed. But I believe that it would be valid to go deeper in its explanation because that subject has quite a relevance in our region, especially in governance, what Fadi called the multi-equal stakeholder. And I think that the emphasis on the equal is great because our region is quite diverse. We have religions, languages, cultures, different levels of development. We are unfortunately recognized worldwide as we have the largest inequality in our society. As societies, we need to make an effort in acknowledging the diversity and the unicity of all of us. So this multi-equal stakeholder model highlights the value of all these parts. So



I would like to suggest to include, among the lines of action, and also to acknowledge, such as Fadi said in his speech yesterday, we are here because we believe in the multistakeholder model and we are representing this model in the sense that it would be welcome to have our more explicit representation of our values and interests in that line of action.

OSCAR ROBLES:

We have one minute before we have to wrap up because the room is needed for something else.

VICTOR MARTINEZ:

Thank you, Oscar. Victor Martinez. I represent the government of Mexico and GAC. But I would like to say personally my perception about this great initiative in ICANN. Mostly thank you for all your effort, and my friend Rodrigo de la Parra who is bringing this to the table. But I would like to focus on the last slide, what's next. There are good objectives and lines of action, but what would come next? How could we get together better so as to implement this action plan available from now to make contributions to the extent possible and to point out that in GAC we have a VP from the Latin American and Caribbean region, from Trinidad Tobago, Tracy who is around here somewhere, and we have a major presence now and we need to focus on what Oscar was saying, how do we link this with ICANN's strategic plan. Thank you very much. Rodrigo will fill us back on that afterwards.



ROSA DELGADO:

I'm Rosa Delgado from Peru, and I have been following Latin American issues. And I think it is very good to have this group set up. As you know I don't live in Latin American, and I think this should expand to people who live abroad and also friends from Latin America like Sebastien who has left. People who love Latin America and want to help. I believe it should be expanded to all these groups.

The reason I'm here is that I now represent the World Health Organization and I support Olga's position about Patagonia, and I know there will be a movement to try to defend the dot Amazons, but apart from that, their applications, there are 4 for dot health and 17 applications for names associated to health that are not considering public interest. And I would like to call to all of you, public interest is something we should be involved with, especially developing countries. Public interest should be an important position for ICANN.

OSCAR ROBLES:

Thank you very much. Before Rodrigo takes the floor, I would like to just tell you that in the next few days the matrix of how we want to measure this development, we are all thinking of how we're going to identify success when it gets there. So in this alignment process, in this specification process, we should take into account matrix. And as a region we have done very interesting things. Big things that have gone beyond the boundaries. In two weeks is the tenth anniversary of LACNIC, and that reminds you and me that we can build things that are relevant for the region and can last in time. Rodrigo de la Parra has the floor.



---

RODRIGO de la PARRA: Thank you, Oscar, for your great coordination. Thank you all for your involvement and your comments. This has been quite an enriching experience. I have been taking notes that will help -- may improve this document, and I think the idea and the suggestion of creating a work group in the region to help us all take this initiative to a safe harbor. Unfortunately, people -- groups with many people don't let us look in detail all these specifications on a well-thought strategy with strategic planning methodology. This will not anyhow mean that no one can join us. The call I will make to be part of this group will be opened and inclusive, and I hope I can have your support. And the others for questions of time cannot join us will be advised of the steps taken. And we will discuss this online, and I will ask all those who have not received or been part in this paper and initiative to please send me an e-mail with their data. Mine is [rodrigo.delaparra@icann.org](mailto:rodrigo.delaparra@icann.org). O-R-G. I will be waiting for your data to continue discussing this online. Thank you very much for your participation. And I'm sure this will bear fruit, success in the region and any organizations you are part of.

[ Applause ]

OSCAR ROBLES: In the name of the Board, Rodrigo, I would like to thank you and thank the community. Thank you very much. We are walking the right track. Thank you very much.

>> Thank you, Gonzalo.



>> END OF SESSION



