BUENOS AIRES – At-Large APRALO Monthly Meeting
Wednesday, June 24, 2015 – 07:30 to 08:30
ICANN – Buenos Aires, Argentina

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible] from [inaudible] and also ISOC Korea.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Maureen Hilyard from Cook Islands Internet Action Group and ALAC.

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche from ALAC and the Internet Society of Australia.

ALI AL MESHAL: Ali Al Meshal, Bahrain ALS.

SATISH BABU: Satish Babu, ISOC Trivandrum, India.

YU-CHUANG KUEK: My name is Kuek; ICANN staff; APAC.

PATRIK FALSTROM: Patrik Falstrom, chair of SSAC and person that just launched something called a global chapter of internet society called The Internet of Food.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Siranush Vardanyan, Armenia.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, At-Large staff.

ARIEL LIANG: Ariel Liang, ICANN staff.

JULIE HAMMER: Julie Hammer from Australia; SSAC liaison and [inaudible].au.

BAHER ESMAT: Baher Esmat, ICANN staff.

CHAITANYA RAMACHANDRAN: Chaitanya Ramanchandran, ISOC Delhi and ICANN Fellowship.

KRISHNA KUMAR: Krishna Kumar, second-time fellow and ISOC Chennai.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible] from [inaudible] Korea.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you, and welcome again. We will have a little bit switching now agenda because we have an honorable guest today, Patrik, who agreed to come and talk a little bit with our community on DNSSEC.

Patrik needs to leave at 8:00 sharp, so without further ado I would like to give the floor to Patrik.

PATRIK FALTSTROM:

Thank you very much. Unfortunately, I have a meeting starting at 8:00, so I need to leave, like, five till. But anyway I'll take care of that. I have my running shoes on, so this will work out fine.

Regarding DNSSEC, we in SSAC (Security and Stability Advisory Committee) of course take functions that help with the stability and security of the Internet address, parameters, names, and otherwise very, very seriously. DNSSEC is one important component, and we have been looking at that for quite some time.

At the moment, what we are looking at is the rotation of the key for the root zone of DNS. That is something that we wrote to report about a couple of years ago. We recommended ICANN to start the project that rotates the key, because we envision that it will take some time to come up with and study how to do this. That project has been going on for a while and unfortunately didn't seriously start until about seven or eight months ago. But luckily it did start, and the project itself, we in SSAC, we got the report yesterday afternoon on the project, and it seems to be the case that they will release the report on how to roll the key now in June. So any day now over the next couple of weeks we will see a report finally on how to do the root key rollover in as secure and stable a fashion as possible.

The plan still includes quite a lot of risk, and we will most certainly see some operational issues, but because of that, it's pretty important to do this rollover in time. So the whole implementation will probably take a year then, starting in September/October this year. We talk about the long project; that we will see moving on.

And this is also one of the reasons why — let me just emphasize that — that we in SSAC do like having good connections with all different groups in ICANN that, for example, want to meet with me, want to meet with SSAC. And also that we do have liaisons for some groups — for example, Julie — that probably for ALAC will be a key link regarding information on what's going on with this root key rollover and DNSSEC, of course, so you don't have to rely on just us meeting you.

I'm happy to answer questions. I think it's better if we just move directly to question/answer section, so please…

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Patrik. Questions to Patrik? Anyone?

PATRIK FALTSTROM: There must be some questions. Come on.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Holly, I know you want to ask a question. I know.

HOLLY RAICHE: Not right now.

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

PATRIK FALSTROM: Good, it's done.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Okay, we have a question from [inaudible], please.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: My name is [inaudible] from Japan. I'm sorry to ask such a generic question, but when I talked to some engineers, it's very hard to implement the DNSSEC [key] [inaudible] because of the level of complicated configuration of some of those things. The DNSSEC is popular at this moment, so the that is that if the end user should think of installing the DNSSEC-ready application where still they still can stand [inaudible] without DNSSEC or not?

PATRIK FALTSTROM: Can you turn off your microphone, please, Holly? Thank you.

First of all, the end users don't have to do anything. This is something that ISPs are doing (the Internet Service Provider), the DNS hosting provider, the registrars. They are the ones that primarily should deal with DNSSEC.

Regarding configuration deployment, it is not hard at all. That's not true. DNSSEC features are included in all DNS software that exists today. And I claim that today you must actively turn off DNSSEC if you don't want to use it. Some people [and] ISPs still think that it will

require more memory and more CPU on your DNS servers specific to the resource to validate DNSSEC-signed signatures. Sweden being the country that signed is zone first. We also have 95% of all ISPs validating DNSSEC queries in Sweden.

We did a study that demonstrated that the memory and CPU needed for DNSSEC validation is not higher than without DNSSEC. And then we deployed validation at all ISPs in Sweden maybe eight years and it has not been a problem whatsoever, which means that the study did show the right things.

So there is absolutely no technical reason for not deploying DNSSEC except in one case, and that is if it is the case that you do run a content network which synthesizes the DNS responses and, because of that, on the fly want to sign the responses that you're giving back. That requires more complicated implementation. That's why it would probably take a little while more before people see dynamic DNS responses from [ACAMAI] and similar content networks be signed. But they are also working on that.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you, Patrik. Any other questions? Holly, please.

HOLLY RAICHE: Couldn't let you go without a question. How far are we in terms of on the path to getting complete DNSSEC, and what does ICANN and everybody else have to do to get there? Thanks.

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

PATRIK FALTSTROM: We are in many parts of the world quite far away from having DNSSEC all over the place, and that is because people are lazy. I start to become a little bit tired as you hear and understand on ISPs, DNS hosting providers, and registrars that they don't use DNSSEC.

I think end users, instead of trying to deploy it themselves, which they cannot do, I think end users have a responsibility to start to ask why DNSSEC is not in use. I think all of you should ask, for example, your local regulator, your local city government, your government. Ask them why they are not signing the domain name that they're using for their webpage, for example.

One of the reasons why DNSSEC is needed is not the DNS itself, but that we need to have an increased number of encrypted, for example, web transactions. So we need to use HTTPS, which you see on the right-hand screen. You see "community.icann.org." You see HTTPS in front of it.

The certificate system that we use today is that whoever has the domain name "community.icann.org" needs to go to a so-called certificate authority and buy a certificate that they install on their web server. That system is seriously broken, as we have pointed out in many SSAC reports, and the only replacement we have is to place the certificates in the DNS. But that in turn only works for domain names that are signed with DNSSEC. That is why DNSSEC is needed, to get a secure web.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Holly, you want to follow up on this?

HOLLY RAICHE: Of course. When you say that's what we have to do, I'm assuming that this is really speaking to ALAC and then through us all the Internet Societies and everybody else to, say, to start putting pressure on. Where would you go? You'd presumably go (in Australia to auDA. Would you, or the regulator? Maybe a how-to kit for ALAC members.

PATRIK FALTSTROM: All of the above. I'm not going to be between you and Julie at auDA. But let me ask you a question. What email address do you use yourself for your private email?

HOLLY RAICHE: Internode.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: ISP.

PATRIK FALTSTROM: No, I want to know your email address, so read that out.

HOLLY RAICHE: H.Raiche@internode.on.net.

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

PATRIK FALTSTROM: Is that domain name signed with DNSSEC?

HOLLY RAICHE: I don't know.

PATRIK FALTSTROM: Then you should figure that out. If you buy your domain name from some registrar or something that does not sign the domain name, you should move your domain name to a different registrar. That's what I mean. We need to start at home.

HOLLY RAICHE: How can I find out? I'm not asking just for me.

PATRIK FALTSTROM: To start with, you can ask whoever you are buying the domain name from. Just ask them. That's the easy part. Then there are various webpages on the net, and I can send you some links that [inaudible], where you can validate whether the domain name is correct and signed.

But the easy way is just that you as the buyer should not only ask about the price, whether you can get email, and whether you can get web. You should also ask, "Can I get my domain name signed with DNSSEC?" And you yourself don't even have to know what that means. Just ask the question. That's a good start.

So, Julie, I think there was implicitly a question on the status of DNSSEC in Australia. Maybe you can answer that part and not have me second-guessing.

JULIE HAMMER: Yeah, certainly. First of all, auDA is the regulator, so they're not two separate entities. DNSSEC was rolled out some months ago. AuDA was probably one of the later countries to roll DNSSEC out, but because it was planned incredibly well and in great detail, it went without a hitch. So it is signed, and you can perhaps look on [Aus] registry's website to see which of the registrars are providing DNSSEC-signed domain names. And you might also want to consider putting an AU lockdown on your domain name, which prevents anyone but you authorizing its transfer.

HOLLY RAICHE: I was also asking because that's the sort of question that all of us should be asking and having an answer to to be able to go where to find out what, and maybe that's something that ALAC should do.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you. Any last questions to Patrik? Do we have any remote participants who would like to ask questions? No? Then if there are no questions, I just want to thank Patrik and Julie.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible].

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Yes, please.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Quick question from NARALO and ISOC Canada. When I'm explaining this security story to people, I've tried to find out what would happen if we didn't have DNSSEC in various circumstances in a non-technical perspective. That would be useful to have that pitch so we could move this message forward. Thank you.

PATRIK FALTSTROM: The simple answer is that the certificate mechanism we use to secure connections to websites today is falling apart. Without DNSSEC, we will not be able to stop the increase of spoofed websites. SSL, which is the underlying technology, is not only used for the web; it's also used for email and all other communication.

So without DNSSEC, I think it will be very, very hard to secure communication on the Internet on that layer in the value chain. Security needs to be built by other means, by using more [inaudible] encryption and much more complicated measures. DNSSEC is key to be able to have secure communication over the Internet. It is not only to secure the DNS itself.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Thank you.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Murray. Yes, please? Can you identify yourself?

NADIRA ALARAJ: Nadira Alaraj from ISOC Palestine chapter. Is the DNSSEC, is there a similar replacement to it? Is there a parallel application that secure this?

PATRIK FALTSTROM: No. If DNSSEC doesn't work, we have to start all over. We started work on DNSSEC in I think 1994. So it has taken 20 years to come where we are now. I guess that we have learned a lot with DNSSEC. So it will probably not take 20 years to start with something else if we don't do DNSSEC, but it might take ten years.

NADIRA ALARAJ: But what if somebody else introduce that and they have their own security?

PATRIK FALTSTROM: No, it will not work. We need to have security that everyone uses. Open standards. That's the only way of getting global deployment.

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you. I don't see any hands here, and no remote questions. Okay. Patrik, thank you very much, and thanks for coming and joining APRALO. Julie, thank you also for being here.

And I would like to welcome those who joined. Can I please ask you to identify yourselves? Just name and where you are from.

NADIRA ALARAJ: I already introduced myself. Nadira Alaraj from the Internet Society of Palestine chapter. I think we are new and have been admitted to At-Large. I'm the vice chair of the Palestine chapter, and I'm replacing the chair on this meeting.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Great. Welcome.

YANNIS LI: Hi. Morning, everyone. This is Yannis from Net Mission.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: I suppose I should admit I snuck in a little late. Sorry. Cheryl Langdon-Orr, ISOC AU and various other things.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: As usual, lovely to see you with us, Cheryl.

FARZANEH BADIEI: I'm Farzaneh Badiei. I'm from Iran, and I'm here as an individual member. I don't know if that exists yet, but yeah.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Yes. We have already our first individual member in APRALO joining us, so welcome, Farzaneh. And I also would like to thank you as you as an example bring us to the challenge of how to deal with individual users. Thank you for joining us. Edmon?

EDMON CHUNG: Edmon Chung from ISOC Hong Kong.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you. And I also welcome our remote participants. I see a lot of people joined us today.

Okay, based on our agenda, we are going to talk about the ALS participation, about the metrics, and about the server results. And as you may all know, recently we conducted a survey related to one of the ATLAS II recommendations to the board. Together with this, APRALO did a couple of questions to identify the expertise we have among ourselves and how we can be involved in ICANN activities in policy issues and development issues. We have a really good analysis of this made by Maureen, and I would like to thank Maureen for doing that great job, for the thorough analysis.

The main and important part of this is ALS participation. This is a challenge for many of us in the APRALO region related to the timing.

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

Sometimes it's really difficult to join to the webinars or to our monthly calls, but we are trying to find out the time which is relevant to our region. I think that from now the 6:00-7:00 UTC is quite good timing for all of the region to join. This will be the third Thursday of the month from 6:00-7:00 UTC, and I hope that many of you from now on will be able to join.

We recently also conducted the NomCom selection in APRALO, and we really had a hard time getting people to vote. I would like to stress and bring the point here that participation of ALSes in the voting process is one of the major responsibilities of ALSes who are joining to this family, to this community. And it's very difficult also for the staff sending thousands of reminders. Believe me, thousands of reminders had been sent.

Sometimes the reason, the issue, is that the contact numbers and names are changing so frequently and so often, and we are not aware of this. But every single ALS has its own wiki page, and what we encourage you to do is whenever there is a change of contact, please visit this wiki space and update or send just a small, brief email to myself or the staff that, "Listen, here's what date we have the change of primary and secondary contacts. This is the new email contact for you to update the database." We are using this constantly.

Those who joined recently to APRALO, I would also encourage you to subscribe to the APRALO mailing list and notify staff. Give them your email address, and they will subscribe you to that list, and you will be automatically receiving all those emails which are coming through the

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

mailing list, because we are sending a lot of announcements through the mailing list.

And even though those are not primary contacts and know that something important is going on can push their primary contact by receiving the email and saying, "Okay, this is what's going on there." Because usually primary contacts are very busy people, and those who are secondary contacts are much more involved in the activities and can be information carriers to the primary contacts. So please subscribe to the mailing list and be active.

We are using our mailing list very actively. On a monthly basis I'm sending you the updates from our APRALO monthly meeting, and those who are not able to join the meeting at that time can go and visit the space and hear the recording. It's all available for you. This is here. It's the only point to come and participate or later just to be involved in the discussion.

I know this is volunteer work. We all know that sometimes it's voluntary work, and sometimes it takes too much time. But this is how our community be like. This is how we should move forward.

We also asked ALSes what kind of topics you would like us to introduce to you as newcomers or the older ones, and what topics are of interest to you. Based on those topics, we also in partnership with APAC Hub, who is doing a really great job, are organizing – and there is a plan and a time frame – for a series of webinars. We have already conducted two webinars. One is on Internet governance and one is on IDNs. There is a lot of interesting information there, presentations,

PowerPoints. And the records and transcripts of all those webinars are available online.

If you cannot find any information, just send an email. Ask, and we can help you very quickly. Staff is always there to support, to provided direct links and information to whatever we have. We really have a huge database of information of resources available for us.

With that, I would like to give the floor to Kuek to introduce what else we are planning to do within the framework of our APAC Hub and APRALO cooperation. Kuek?

YU-CHUANG KUEK: Thank you, Siranush. Before I begin, a very good afternoon or evening to people dialing in from the Asia-Pacific region and a very good morning to everyone. I think it is a good effort on our part to make sure that even though we are 11, or 13, 14, or 10 time time zones away we are having this monthly meeting.

I think that even before I begin I want to mention how the region can make a difference. If you look at the opening ceremony, for example, we had the globalization of the key sign ICANN language localization tool kit. Something that started in the region that has now become a global initiative.

You might also notice from the agenda that NextGen@ICANN has become a permanent fixture in the ICANN global calendar. I think we should remember that this really was an initiative that started with Net Mission. In the end we partnered at ICANN 49, and it has become a

global program at ICANN meetings. A bit of the irony is now that it has become global, the region has seemed to lose a little bit of control over the way the program is run, but it's okay. The meetings will come back to our region, and we will be able to look at it a little better at how the program can better suit the region.

All I'm trying to say here really is that ideas coming from the region, as long as they are well-thought through, as long as we put our heads together to execute them together, they can make a global impact.

And I think what we have here from the collaboration between APRALO and the ICANN APAC Hub was always, in my mind, a model. If we are able to articulate what our joint needs are, and we execute through them, I think it's going to make a real impact. I think if we do it well, it becomes a showcase for what other regions do. So I'll run very quickly through the slides, because you know most of these things. But I just wanted to give you an update. If I can go onto the next slide, please.

This really is the two of us coming together. You shared what your focus areas were, we shared what our focus areas were, and we identified three things that we can work together. One was on language localization. We have so much language diversity in the region. This is the first step to really get people into the ICANN world. The second bit was really on the capacity and capability-building, and I'm very happy to hear about what is coming to be the third of a series of webinars. And the last part was about region awareness-building.

Just following from our earlier conversation, Siranush, I think when we have very robust content that we develop together and we execute on to together, the participation and the engagement from the various ALSes will come. The onus is really on us to make sure that when they come to our shared space, there's robust content waiting for them. If I can go to the next slide, I'll go into a little bit more detail.

These are the action items that have emerged. I know I only have ten minutes, so I'll jump to the next slide so I can go specifically into the individual items.

On the language localization bit, we right now have the basic materials out in Hindi, Korean, and Bahasa amongst other languages. I really want to thank Babu. Despite the very difficult situation we have in Nepal, he has still told us as recently as two weeks ago that he is still working on the materials, and he hopes that we will have it in the July time frame. This in my mind is really commitment to the program.

I also wanted to share with you that when we shared this program on Monday at the language services session there was a lot of interest in the program. For example, there were people from the Caribbean, and within the region there are communities that speak Creole or use the Creole language. I felt very confident to say that there is something that is tried and tested and proven that can be used for the Creole language.

I also wanted to share that on Monday ICANN signed an MOU with JPNIC and JPRS on a joint translation program, where for important materials there is coordination; where ICANN will say that even though

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

Japan is not one of the UN languages, these are the things that we're going to translate, beyond which JPRS and JPNIC looks at what we have, and if they still think there are gaps, they use personal resources to come in and fill that translation gap.

I think this is a plug-and-play model that we can have when we go across the region or if any of you go to Europe, and somebody wants something in Polish or they want something that's outside of the UN languages, it's something that can be done. So I'm really happy that we have progressed so far.

ICANN right now has maybe around 25 staff in the Asia-Pacific region, but your reach within the region is much wider than us, and within your groups and your communities you'll be able to find more resources to help us. So if I can move onto the next slide as well. Did we miss the capacity/capability-building? Okay, so the order is different.

This one is about outreach and awareness-building. I'm very happy that at [APRIGF\ we will also feature the community as well. Specifically, there is a session on the language localization program and what we have done in the past, where we have friends like Jahangir. I don't know if he's on the call that has joined us who will share experiences.

HOLLY RAICHE: He sends his apologies.

YU-CHUANG KUEK:	We also have [inaudible], who represents CICT. I know they are not an ALS yet, but I think [inaudible] has been a regular attendee when she's part of the fellowship program to join ALAC events. We couldn't fit on the panel, but Net Mission will also be talking about their experiences. So again, this is something we can think about.

I think in the past we've had discussions about how we can best use the CROPP program to fund events. I have a certain point of view that there's still so much untapped events in the region that we might not want to use the CROPP program for events that ICANN is already represented at.

We should use the CROPP program to go to events where ICANN staff has no access to and no reach. I know that there are varying views within the group. I'm happy to further discuss this, but I'm also to share that within CROPP we've also had Maureen and Satish and [inaudible]. Anything to help you guys help us or help us help you, because actually the community and staff is one and the same. We have exactly the same objectives. I think this is a good development. Maybe I can move onto the next slide.

The next slide is on capacity-building. I think the webinars are a good way for us to profile issues that the community should be aware about or part of the discussion. Moving forward, we will have the next webinar on DNS basics after looking at issues that were not specific, but very high interest in the region, such as internationalized domain names. I think this is a great thing that we have. Maybe this is a basis for further conversation. I know that we are trying to think about how

we bring up the numbers for the webinars, and also this goes back to the point of contents that we can give to the ALSes as we try to energize the community. This is something I hope we can work more on.

If I can test an idea on all of you, I would actually maybe urge the APRALO leadership to reach out to the other SOs, maybe specifically the GNSO, so that after ICANN meetings, through a webinar format they can share new developments in the PDP and also hear directly if there are any comments or inputs in the PDP.

Given the resource issues and varying reasons, we don't really have a high representation from the region in the various working groups. If you walk into the SOs, you don't see that many Asian participants. I don't think this is something that we can reverse overnight or change overnight, but I think the webinars are a good way to bring this content to the regions if the regions are not coming to the meetings.

I really hope that you will extend an invitation to the SO and the AC leadership – they could be the ones chairing the webinars – so that they hear for themselves, especially if they're able to energize the audiences, that the region is interested, the region has a point of view, and that the SOs and the ACs really should be taking these points of view. I think as we think further on the topics for the webinar this is something I hope to think about, and I'm open to discussion. I don't know if you agree and if you have other thoughts.

So I'll leave it there. We have a couple of other slides, but I'm aware that we have other things to cover within the session. Maybe I'll just stop here. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Kuek. This is really very helpful, and this is really a step we would like to follow up. I also would like to thank once again for your support every time we are coming to you with the request. But the suggestion is really good, and we are going to follow up on that, so thank you.

YU-CHUANG KUEK: On that note, I really shouldn't be taking the thanks. I want to thank Kelvin, who is based in Singapore, as well as Silvia — I don't know what time it is for her whenever she's on the webinars — Ariel, and others on Heidi's fantastic team. They really deserve the credit.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: I agree completely. They are doing a really great job. Kelvin, [inaudible], staff. They are always there to help us, so thank you very much for joining us. I also thank Baher for being with us today. I know that the whole region, though being very diverse, is being very cooperative, and we are sharing all the successes and trying to put the best practices in our own communities.

We have a really lovely guest today. I would like to introduce to you the new director of APTLD, Leonid Todorov. I'm very happy that he

accepted my invitation to come for a couple of minutes just to introduce himself and let all of you know him in person.

As you all know, we have an MOU with APTLD, and I would also as an Armenian like to say good news, that we recently joined the APTLD team as well. So we are also a part of APTLD now. Thank you, Leonid, for joining us. If you can say a couple of words to the APRALO community, we'll highly appreciate it.

LEONID TODOROV: Sure. Good morning. For greater simplicity, indeed I am the reincarnation of Don Hollander in a sense. Yeah. I share his passion for the region. I believe that quite long I was fascinated with some Oriental cultures, especially the Chinese one, to the extent that I sent my son to major in Chinese studies. I sacrificed my own son.

Anyway, I'm new to this job still, although it's five months since I accepted the job. I think it's a very interesting adventure in my life. I'm still to come to know all of you, hopefully, but let me just briefly tell you a couple of things I think I found particularly important. You should also understand and appreciate a couple of things.

Personally, I'm not the typical Russian. I usually crack this joke, but this is a new audience, so let me just try it once again. I'm not the typical Russian. I don't drink vodka, I believe in small government and low taxes, and I'm no big fan of Mr. Putin. Yet I take an enormous advantage of being Russian these days, especially when they annexed and occupied Crimea.

I can just for this lecture not abide by any rules of political and social correctness and Oriental, let's say, patience and delicacy. In this way, I can be very bold – all Russians are bold – and I'm very straightforward in saying certain things.

I did have some experience with the government and the civil society. I must say that the civil society is, in the eyes of many, that inevitable evil. Still, I believe that it's very important to preserve what we have in the region. I do understand, though, the region is very diverse.

There are numerous examples of when civil society is suppressed, and oppressed, and underestimated, and sometimes even put to use by some very cynical governments. I believe that the role of civil society is to play in the process when it comes to the Internet governance, let alone the IANA transition, is still very important.

Within APTLD community, I must say representatives of civil society are very few, because you do understand that, given the peculiarity of the region, many ccTLD operators are still technical arms of local governments.

But I believe that those very few make a real difference and their voices head, including, by the way, Russia's because Russia is also part of APTL).

So you have my word on trying to keep the civil society engaged very much; and to have those very few registries present at our events; which is not obviously an easy task for some of them because they might be small; and to take that meaningful input they are always

eager to offer; to make sure that that input is transformed into some policies within APTLD and even beyond.

I believe that as we have these Memorandum of Understanding, I believe that we should think of some innovative ways to engage the civil society, not just on that semi-annual basis when we have our APTLD meetings; rather, in our everyday work.

And I can tell you that I'm very responsive, and I reply to all the emails regardless of time difference. I can assure you that I'm open to whatever initiatives you would suggest. Of course, I'm limited by my mandate, and I'm a slave to my board, some members of which are still the government representatives sitting right now in that room.

So you've got my limitations. You've got my keenness to be helpful and supportive. And with that, thank you.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Leonid, very much. I would like to also mention that within the framework of MOU we went far also in the sense that we were receiving updates from APTLD from time to time. I know you have monthly newsletters or quarterly newsletters, and in two of them APRALO activities found a place to [be the news]. We were in your newsletter.

We also may come to you with your expertise to participate in the webinars, which we are organizing together with [APRICOT]. We may need your experts to do presentations for our community, and would highly appreciate if you can support us also. I think that there are

steps where we can cooperate. And of course APTLD was a constant supporter of APRALO showcases. We are looking forward also for further cooperation of our civil society members, our end users, to participate in APTLD activities.

If we can also get updates from APTLD about upcoming events, what we usually were getting, that would be really great and appreciated. You can send it to me, and I will share with our community so it's as if through a mailing list to work out, and people will be aware of upcoming events.

Many ALSes are also ISOC chapters. Many of them are also ccTLDs, so they are also members of APTLD. I think that there is a lot of space for cooperation between two organizations. I also once again would like to thank you for finding time to come in here. We just met in the corridors, and I asked, "Can you come for five minutes just to introduce to our community?" Thank you for accepting this invitation.

LEONID TODOROV: And I generously accepted that invitation as if I had something to do at 8:00 in the morning.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Leonid. Are there are questions to Mr. Todorov? If no, then we'll not keep you any more here.

LEONID TODOROV: Oh, you mean you're kicking me out?

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: No, you can stay with us.

LEONID TODOROV: Yes, if I may.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Okay. Yes, Farzaneh?

FARZANEH BADIEI: Sorry, Leonid, I didn't quite understand how you want to engage civil
                        society with APTLD.

LEONID TODOROV: Well, that's a question rather to you, because my understanding is that
                        – well, as a general manager I first of all keep the business running,
                        take care first of all of my members , who are sometimes in very
                        difficult situations. But that said, I believe while there are numerous
                        ways that information exchange is already there, it's not as sufficient.

                        I believe, for example, what I'm doing for members might be sort of
                        useful for the community, because you're still a part of the bigger
                        ICANN framework, right?

                        On the other hand, policy-wise, I believe that, for example, if we have
                        some people in the community who represents their ccTLDs, you
                        perceive that we are working right now on a new policy that would

ICANN | 53
Buenos Aires

enable small registries — underfinanced, let's say — to run for the board to make sure that they can participate in the board in a meaningful way. I mean by funding their activities, like going to the meetings and stuff like that.

Apart from that, I believe it's very important for us to have that input from you with regard to certain policy developments you may find particularly important and falling within our realm. I cannot even go farther to elaborate what kind of [breaking news] those should be, but I will be eager and happy to share them with the members.

Finally, I must say as we are by our mandate the pool and platform for members to share best practices, I believe that many of you who still have expertise beyond civil society or within the civil society equally can also contribute to this.

Again, we will be happy to absorb whatever knowledge and expertise — and I can see familiar faces here — would share with us.

Apart from that, again, I'm sure that there should be some new, creative approach. We should just think of these together and separately, and we should just change these ideas. Again, I'm very open. I'm very happy to do this. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Leonid. First, I think the positive point is that you are open and accepting of the new ideas. I think if there will be any suggestions come up we can apply to you with the suggestion and see how we can cooperate. That's the good start of cooperation, I think.

Any other questions? We may take one more, and that's it. If there are no questions from remote participants, thank you once again, Leonid, for joining us.

We have one discussion on our agenda related to individual members, which actually is not on our agenda, but I would like to touch upon this. We already have experience of having individual members in APRALO. For now, in our rules of procedure the person can ask for joining APRALO, subscribe to our mailing list, and be part of discussions, be actively involved in policy development, to provide their comments, and that's it. The limitation for individual member is that they cannot participate in the voting process officially run by APRALO.

We also discussed with the leadership team how other RALOs are doing in that aspect, and we have an example of EURALO, who established an ALS, actually, an official ALS that is run by individual members who became the part of EURALO as one separate ALS.

I think that the steps which we are planning to do from now until the Dublin meeting will be to find out what all other RALOs are doing and what example can be used for APRALO, because APRALO is diverse and huge, and the establishment of one ALS may not work for our region, because there will be 4,000 or 5,000 members in one ALS, which can be a challenge for members.

But we would also appreciate if our individual member who already started active participation in APRALO gives us what challenges or

what we might envisage for individual members not to feel isolated if they are not ALS.

So we are going to find out what other RALOs are doing in that sense, and start discussion on the APRALO mailing list. What are your thoughts how we can engage more individual members, and how to make this procedure a workable process?

I think we can put this as an action item that we are planning to do this by Dublin, I think. We may come up with the final solution or final decision how we are going to deal with individual members in APRALO.

It's open for individual members, again, just for everyone to know that everybody can become a member of APRALO. But there is a limitation of these people participating in the voting process, which we are usually holding maybe once a year or twice a year, depending on what is there on our table.

We still don't know how to deal with individual members. Maybe I can open the floor and brainstorm a little bit. What are your ideas we can start with? Any suggestions? Any brainstorming on this topic how you think we can work this out at this moment?

If there are no suggestions, because I know this is on-the-spot discussion – Farzaneh, please.

FARZANEH BADIEI: I'm not a microphone fan. Don't think that I just want to talk.

When I wanted to become a member, the only reason that I was able to was because I knew Siranush, because your webpage doesn't say anything, or it is very difficult to find it. I did not find that information, so I think that we need more information about how to individually participate.

But also I'm quite new to this, so I don't really understand why there might be challenges. Individual members become members, and then they vote just like the others do. So what would constrain them because of the nature of their membership? Can you, Siranush, tell me a little more?

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Farzaneh. Actually, the voting will not be a challenge if there is only one person or two people. We have ALS, where there is one primary contact and one secondary contact, and the primary contact is voting. If the primary contact is not there, he can authorize the secondary contact to do that. The concern is coming for the future, if there will be many individual members. But I think Satish also wants to say something on this topic. Satish?

SATISH BABU: Thanks very much. I completely agree with Siranush, but also there is another point, which is that there is a process for admission of ALSes, but it's very strict. For individual members, we don't have any such process as of now.

So I think for the individual members we have to think this through, and see what are the entry conditions that we have to apply, and then only think of [voting at par] with the ALSes.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, Satish. But I completely agree with you, Farzaneh, that our website for the newcomer is completely a mess. You can find yourself nowhere in the ocean. We are working on the establishment of a new At-Large website, which just was presented yesterday. I think that staff is doing a really great job of making the information available and actually there, and APRALO will have its own page, which will also take us to the wiki space, to the webinars' information, to the current APRALO information.

So I think that we'll manage to work out the better introduction of ourselves for the newcomers and for the people to come and learn more, and not to feel even more frustration when visiting the websites. But thank you for the suggestion. This is really a good point, a weak point. We understand that, and we are working on that, I think. Any other thoughts?

If not, I would like officially to also announce that the Dublin meeting will be the last for our NomCom appointee, Satish Babu, who during the last two years did an amazing job for also letting us know what NomCom is doing, and to show the transparency of that community and this community. We were really very honored that Satish was representing us in NomCom.

I received a lot of really good feedback on his participation and professionalism being part of this team. So I would like to officially thank you, Satish, for being a part of NomCom and representing APRALO there. His term ends at the end of the Dublin meeting.

We also have the new incoming NomCom member from APRALO. This is Professor [Ameer Karim], who will join us probably in person at the Dublin meeting. I would also like to congratulate him on stepping into APRALO life and community leadership team and representing us in NomCom.

Being in NomCom for two years, I personally can tell you this is really a hard and [responsive] work. It's not just going there and talking, talking, talking. This is the community who has strict purpose, has strict timeframes. At the beginning they have monthly calls.

This is the third meeting of ICANN, actually, if we count in that way. This last meeting is the most difficult. Starting from April until the end of June, this committee meets, if not biweekly, on a weekly basis, and their calls can run for three, four hours. Their discussions on every candidate are very deep, is very open among the committee members themselves, and this is really hard work.

When we announce the open position for this, we give the clear criteria for people to nominate or self-nominate themselves to be aware of that timing devotion that they should devote to the position. But I think that we have great people on the board. We had, and we are going to have, new great people on the board.

Once again, thank you, Satish. I would like all of us to applaud Satish for his hard work.

Any other topics we want to discuss? Because we are already at the end of our call. Yes, Satish, please.

SATISH BABU: [inaudible] to take a second chance at the mic. I'd like to place on record my thanks to the excellent support provided by staff — Ariel, Gisela, Silvia, and others — for many things, but for me personally, in the last webinar, without their help it would have been impossible for me to make a presentation. Thank you very much.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN: Thank you, yes. Great applause to our staff for the huge amount of time devoted to Asia-Pacific – and not only, I know.

I would like to thank also our remote participants for joining us today, and thank you, everyone here, who came to APRALO monthly meeting. Please keep in touch through the mailing list, and we'll be coming to you for the next APRALO APAC webinar, organized already in July. So please follow us online, and be an active participant as well. Thank you.

Yes, Yannis? You would like to say something?

YANNIS LI:

Yeah, sorry. I just want to have some advertisement on the issue of the Asia-Pacific regional IGF, which probably Kuek has mentioned a little bit earlier. It will be from the first to third of July. We will have remote participation available, which is actually supported by ICANN. Thanks, Kuek, to have the Adobe Connect ready. If you couldn't be there physically, please do stay online, and I will share the information on the mailing list as well. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VIRDANYAN:

Thank you, Yannis. Unfortunately, this meeting was right after the ICANN meeting, so many of us were not able to join, but we will join remotely for sure.

Thank you again. This meeting is adjourned.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]