

---

BUENOS AIRES – ccNSO Council Meeting  
Wednesday, June 24, 2015 – 16:00 to 18:30  
ICANN – Buenos Aires, Argentina

BYRON HOLLAND: Welcome, everybody, to the ICANN 53 ccNSO Council meeting, June 24<sup>th</sup>. We have a relatively full agenda with one really substantive issue and a considerable number of logistical and administrative ones to get through. So I just want to welcome everybody, our councillors as well as everybody else in the room. The agenda is on the screen, so we will move to agenda item #2, minutes and actions.

All councillors have had an opportunity to review the minutes. Are there any revisions or corrections for the minutes?

Seeing or hearing none, we'll take those as approved. All actions at this time are also completed, which is good. And we'll move on to agenda item #3, which is clearly a substantive matter and a very important one for this community that, certainly at this meeting and at previous ones, we've had extensive discussion on.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Point of order. Just to move this along a little, can I propose we waive the reading of the entire resolution?

BYRON HOLLAND: I was just going to suggest that, but thank you. So, no, you won't have to listen to me read the whole thing.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

The resolution on the final proposal of the Cross-Community Working Group on Naming-Related Functions, more commonly known as the CWG Stewardship, was circulated to the Council earlier today. It was reviewed by myself and the vice chairs yesterday to get it into the shape that it is. So I am going to assume that everybody has taken the opportunity to read it, because it is a fairly substantial resolution. I will draw everybody's attention to one item number on the resolution that is the most substantive, and that is #4 in the draft resolution. I will read it out loud.

"Taking into account" – and this is based on what we saw today – "the unanimous support by the ccTLDs present for the CWG-Stewardship proposal, the ccNSO Council supports that the CWG-Stewardship submits its final proposal to the IANA Stewardship Transition Coordination Group, more commonly known as the ICG."

That is the particular substantive clause in the overall resolution. Could I have somebody make a motion on that? And then we'll have discussion.

BECKY BURR: [inaudible].

BYRON HOLLAND: Becky. Second? Katrina. Thank you. Is there any discussion on this motion? Demi, then Nigel.

---

DEMI GETSCHKO: Just a very short observation. I'm totally in favor, and I congratulate the members of the working group for this extensive work [inaudible] good work on that. The only point I want to raise is that in my view there is quite a little bit of discrimination.

I know we are talking about ccNSO members and non-ccNSO members. I prefer to refer to them as a ccTLD community, and not members or non-members. Just to [raise] that I think this is a kind of outdated discrimination we don't have to keep in the document. But anyway I'm [totally in favor]. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Demi. Nigel?

NIGEL ROBERTS: Two things. We don't need much discussion. We had a lot earlier today. I [intimated] a couple of days ago that I thought it was my – and perhaps our – responsibility to vote in favor of the mood of the room rather than one's personal view. I'm happy to say that both of those coincide in my case today, so I shall be voting in favor.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Nigel. Any other discussion on this resolution?

KEITH DAVIDSON: I think there is a typo in #4: "By the ccTLD present" probably should be "ccTLDs present".

---

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, duly noted. Any other discussion on this? Okay, then we will put it to a vote. Any against? Any abstentions? One abstention. Would you care to comment?

KEITH DAVIDSON: I'd just like to record that I am abstaining because I feel conflicted, because I sit on the ICG. This is not in any way a message concerning the proposal itself. It's just merely that I feel the dual role of being on the Council and the ICG. I don't want to pre-judge what the ICG will receive in a day or so's time. So I'll abstain.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay. Thank you, Keith. All in favor? Lesley, are you online?

LESLEY COWLEY: I am. I'm not sure it's working.

BYRON HOLLAND: We can hear you now.

LESLEY COWLEY: I agree, most certainly.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you.

---

KEITH DAVIDSON: That was 14 votes [inaudible] from the floor and one from online.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you very much. Resolution carried. Thank you again to Lisa and the rest of the team, members and participants.

Okay, moving along to agenda item #4, and that is the approval of .BN application. Nigel, did you want to speak to this at all?

NIGEL ROBERTS: [inaudible] it's Jordi.

BYRON HOLLAND: Jordi. My mistake. Did you want to speak to this?

JORDI IPARRAGUIRRE: Well, very briefly. As you know, we test-follow the process and .BN applied to become a member of the ccNSO, and staff made all the checks to ensure that everything was fine. So following the process. The idea was to take advantage of that, simply to propose the approval of the application of .BN.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Jordi. And we have a draft resolution on that. Can I get somebody to make a motion on a resolution? Keith. Katrina. Second?

---

Thank you. Any discussion on this motion? Young Eum, please go ahead.

YOUNG EUM LEE: I would just like to welcome .BN on behalf of the ccNSO.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay, thank you. I will read the draft resolution for the record. "The ccNSO Council approves the application of the ccTLD manager of .BN and welcomes Brunei Dar es Salaam Network Information Center, the ccTLD manager for .BN or Brunei, as the 156<sup>th</sup> member of the ccNSO. Welcome, .BN.

We're excusing Becky, because as you know, she's part of the CCWG, which is actually meeting right now and discussing the models, so significant substance. Thank you, Becky, for coming here during that meeting, and participating in the previous historic resolution and carry on with the heavy lifting.

Back to item#4. Since there was no seeming discussion, we'll take it to a vote. Any against? Any abstentions? All in favor, and online? Lesley?

LESLEY COWLEY: Yes, in favor. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Lesley. Approved. Thank you. Unanimously carried. On to agenda item #5, and that is the appointment of an FOI advisory team.

---

This has been discussed on previous council meetings, and this is where ICANN has reached out to have a small group set up that would be IANA staffers and a couple of ccTLD managers putting together a small team to help in the implementation of the recommendations of the FOI.

We have had, like I say, a couple of conversations about this on previous council meetings, and we do have a draft resolution here. It's relatively lengthy. I will read it for the record, though, since it's such a critical item.

"Taking into account and under the assumption that the ICANN Board will task ICANN staff to start the implementation of the Framework of Interpretation (the FOI), and anticipating the ccNSO Council will be requested to appoint a small advisory team of experts to assist ICANN staff, the ccNSO Council appoints the former Chair and Vice Chair of the FOI Working Group, Keith Davidson and Becky Burr, as the ccNSO FOI Implementation Advisory Team. In this capacity, they are requested to regularly update the Council and the broader community on progress made with respect to the implementation of the FOI. The Secretariat is requested to inform relevant ICANN staff of this appointment."

Could I get somebody to make a motion on that?

NIGEL ROBERTS: I will.

---

BYRON HOLLAND: Nigel? Thank you. First? Second? Katrina. Thank you. Any discussion on this resolution? Seeing none, hearing none online, we'll take it to a vote. Any against? Any abstentions?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Because I'm a named party, I'll abstain.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, sir. All in favor?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Thirteen for.

BYRON HOLLAND: And online? Lesley?

LESLEY COWLEY: In favor.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Resolution approved unanimously. Thank you. On to agenda item #6, the Guideline Review Committee.

This is where the Guideline Review Committee has reviewed some of the guidelines and is making a recommendation that one in particular has become effectively obsolete and therefore should be archived and removed. There's a resolution associated with that, which I'll read for the record.



---

"At the suggestion of the Guideline Review Committee or the GRC, and taking into account that during an update by GRC to the community present, there were no objections. The ccNSO Council retires the ccNSO guideline Interaction, Strategic, and Operating Plan, 5<sup>th</sup> November, 2008, and requests the Secretariat to archive the guideline as retired on the ccNSO website."

Can I get somebody to make a motion on that? Young Eum. Second? Hiro. Thank you. Any discussion on this item? Seeing or hearing none, we'll put it to a vote.

Any against? Any abstentions? All in favor?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Fourteen for.

BYRON HOLLAND: Lesley?

LESLEY COWLEY: In favor, Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Resolution unanimously approved. Thank you. Sticking with the GRC, we have another draft resolution where the GRC is requesting additional volunteers. I will read this very short resolution. The draft resolution reads as follows.

---

"The ccNSO Secretariat is requested to send out a call for volunteers to the community as soon as possible to seek additional volunteers."  
Can I get a motion for this?

DOTTY SPARKS DE BLANC: So moved.

BYRON HOLLAND: Dotty, first. Vika, second. Thank you. Any discussion on this one? Put it to a vote. Any against? Abstain? Support? And online?

LESLEY COWLEY: As a GRC member, I support.

BYRON HOLLAND: Strongly support, I'm sure. Okay, thank you. Resolution passed unanimously. Thank you all.

On to item #7, and that is the appointment of ccNSO members to the ccWG on the Use of Names of Country and Territory Names. I think there's a typo in there, so we'll need to get that working group name correctly used there. But we know who they are, Use of Country and Territory Names. We have a draft resolution regarding a call for volunteers and people who have kindly put their hand up. The draft resolution reads as follows.

"The ccNSO Council appoints the following persons as ccNSO members of the Cross-Community Working Group on the Use of

---

Country and Territory Names as TLDs: Sanna Sahlman from .FI; Monica Capparelli from .AR; and Lucila Abate from .AR. The Secretariat is requested to take the necessary steps to include the newly appointed members of the working group."

That's the resolution before us. Can I get somebody to make a motion for that? Katrina, seconded by Vika. Thank you. Any discussion on this?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: That's of [inaudible] interest from .AR on this one [inaudible] people.

BYRON HOLLAND: I see that. That's an astute observation, [inaudible]. Welcome, .AR. Thank you for participating on this.

We'll put it to a vote. Any against? Any abstentions? All in favor?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Fourteen for.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Lesley, online?

LESLEY COWLEY: Fifteen.

---

BYRON HOLLAND:

Thank you. The resolution is unanimously carried. On to agenda item #8. This is with regards to the SECIR Working Group, which we heard from over the course of the last two days.

The Working Group is effectively advising the Council to set up an oversight committee as it effectively winds down, and to continue to advise and ensure the continuity of guidance and oversight for this work, the list in particular. I have a draft resolution, which I'll read into the record.

"Taking into account the advice of the SECIR Working Group to ensure continuation of oversight and guidance of the Secretariat in maintaining and enhancing the SECIR e-mail list of contact details, the ccNSO Council requests the SECIR Working Group to draft a charter for such an oversight and guidance committee. The SECIR WG is also requested to submit the draft charter at the same time it submits its final report and perform the oversight and guidance role until the envisioned SECIR Oversight and Guidance Committee has been appointed."

Can I get somebody to make a motion for that? Thank you, Keith. Second? Second? Katrina. Jordi, were you first out of the gate? Sorry. As usual, the straight line tables are a challenge. Thank you, Jordi, for seconding that. Any discussion on this resolution? No? Okay, we'll take it to a vote.

Any against? Any abstentions? Voting in support?

---

KEITH DAVIDSON: Fourteen for.

BYRON HOLLAND: Fourteen? Thank you. And Lesley, online?

LESLEY COWLEY: Plus one.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Unanimously carried. Agenda item #9. That's a call for additional volunteers for the SOP Working Group, one of our most well-known and hardest-working working groups. I'd like to say the entire community, not just our community, but effectively it has become a cornerstone of the entire ICANN community that waits with the bated breath for the output of the SOP. If you look at other people's submissions, you'll often see some distinct similarities. Now, we do have a draft resolution on this, which I'll read for the record. Two parts.

"(1) The ccNSO Council thanks Peter von Roste from CENTR and Dina Beer, formerly with the .IL registry, for their hard work and contribution to the success of the SOP WG. (2) The ccNSO requests the Secretariat to send out a call for volunteers who have developed an expertise in strategy and operating plans as well as budgetary matters, and can commit to work at least six days on a yearly basis."

---

Can I have a motion for that? Keith, thank you. Second? Celia I think was first out of the gate there. She can second that one. Thank you. Any discussion on this? No? Then we'll put it to a vote.

Any against? Any abstain? In support?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Fourteen.

BYRON HOLLAND: Lesley, online?

LESLEY COWLEY: Support.

BYRON HOLLAND: Unanimously carried. And I would just like to say to [Dina], who I don't think is here, and to Peter, thank you very much for that work. That's a lot of work. Okay, moving on to agenda item #10, Council updates. I think you've probably heard my voice more than enough. As you can imagine, my focus has been on CWG. Now I can cast my attention to the ccWG. And thus concludes my report.

Item #9.2, Vice Chairs.

KATRINA SATAKI: I'll start here. Thank you. This morning Bart and I went to a GNSO ICANN Strategy Drafting Team meeting. They have already started

---

working on their strategy for meetings, how they're going to carry out meetings A, B, and C, starting from March of next year – which is going to be meeting A, obviously.

As we explained to them, for us it's still not clear. We informed them that for us there's no decision prior to our meeting in Dublin. But still it is relatively clear what we're going to do in meetings A and probably even C, so we decided that we can start working on shaping these meetings together with other communities. And that's about meeting strategy.

As [I'm] Chair of Program Working Group, I'd like to thank the Program Working Group for shaping this meeting. Especially I'd like to thank Gabi and of course Alan and Bart, who worked tirelessly on shaping our discussions on CWG and ccWG, because that was really tremendous work. Thank you very much.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Katrina.

KEITH DAVIDSON: I've got just a couple of things to report. My focus is on two pretty straightforward and simple tasks. One's the FOI implementation, and the other is the evaluation of the names proposal on the ICG, which I'm sure won't cause us too much grief, but will certainly consume some time.

---

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you, Keith. Are there any updates from individual councillors? No? Okay. Any updates from regional organizations? Carolina? Do we have a microphone?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Just wanted to mention that LAC TLD had a general assembly on Sunday, and there were board elections. We have a new board composition. Eduardo Santoyo was ratified as Chair again for a period of three years, Luis Arancibia from .CL as secretary, and we have a new board member from .AR, Gabriel Brenta. Those were the three positions that were [inaudible]. That is my news. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you for the update. Congratulations to them and to Eduardo for being reelected. Any staff updates? No? Okay.

Agenda item #11. Usually we have this on the agenda, but since any of the working groups have had the opportunity to report already, I think we'll dispense with this item.

Agenda item #12 is liaison updates, which both have provided written updates. Any discussion or comment on them? Okay.

Agenda item #13 is the work plan, which will be sent to Council in the first week of July. In part, that's to take account of what has happened here at this ICANN meeting. Any discussion or comment on that? No?

Agenda item #14 is our next council meetings, which are conference call meetings, on Augustus 20<sup>th</sup>. It has more gravitas, doesn't it?



---

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:           Actually, I was too tired. It's the Dutch way of doing it.

BYRON HOLLAND:           Yes, this is typing late into the night, right? I think I'm just going to refer to it as Augustus from here on in. September 24<sup>th</sup>, and of course the Dublin meeting on October 21<sup>st</sup>. I assume there are no issues or discussion on that one.

Agenda item #15 is any other business. Is there any other business that any councillors would like to bring to our attention? No? Okay.

We do have a couple of thank-yous. First and foremost, of course, we'd like to thank our local hosts, NIC Argentina, for their hospitality and sponsorship, enabling us to come to Buenos Aires, which is one of my favorite cities. Like all of you, we see a few cities in our travels, and certainly BA is definitely one of my favorite. So thank you, NIC Argentina, for enabling this to happen for us. Thank you, NIC.

We'd also like to thank the sponsors of the ccNSO cocktail party, which was a very good one last night. A lot of people stayed seemingly relatively late, which of course is always a good sign. Our sponsors were .AR, .AU, .IT, .AS, VeriSign, .NA, .CL, .KR, and .UK. So thank you to our sponsors for making that happen.

And finally — and I want to say this is going to be a relatively brief thank-you, because the notice that we've had hasn't allowed us to fully develop the thank-you that we're going to, I'm sure. But with that

---

proviso, I would like to say on behalf of the whole ccTLD community and most especially the ccNSO Council thank you, Gabi, for the years of hard work I think for the entire time, basically, right? I just wanted to express the gratitude of the Council, of the ccNSO membership, and of the broader community for all that you've done in the background on the working groups in making these events go and always doing it with a smile and good humor in spite of having to deal with us all the time. So thank you, Gabi. We look forward to taking you for a cocktail in Dublin and maybe more formally recognizing this. Because it depends a bit on your timing, right? Might you still be with us in Dublin?

GABRIELLA SCHITTEK:

I'm going to work 50% for both throughout July and August. But I promise that I will still be around to do some things like Council elections, etc. So I think that by Dublin that should be the full hand-over.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Okay, great. Well, thank you very much on behalf of the whole community.

And with that, I will bring this Council meeting to a close. Can I have a motion for that, please? Keith. Demi. All in favor? Thank you for a great two days, and I look forward to seeing you over the course of the next couple of days in the work of the CCWG next on the [inaudible] for us. Thank you all.

---

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**