

---

MARRAKECH – ICANN Cross-Community Committee on Accessibility  
Wednesday, March 09, 2016 – 10:45 to 12:00 WET  
ICANN55 | Marrakech, Morocco

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: This is ICANN Cross-Community Committee on Accessibility, 10:45 start, March 9<sup>th</sup>.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Welcome, ladies and gentlemen. My name is Cheryl Langdon-Orr, and I have the honor and the privilege of convening our Cross-Community Committee on ICANN Accessibility. I as ever want to pay particular homage to the staff that have worked so incredibly hard even between now and our Dublin meeting. Laura and Chris have, with their teams, really taken us to the next level on a number of things and they're going to tell us about it, and that's very exciting.

I also particularly want to welcome and give my apologies for not having met yet but I also am not aware of the name of a very welcome member of the ICANN community and I believe newcomer and that is a gentleman with visual impairment who I would like to welcome and ask very early on to give a small introduction about himself. So you may speak in Arabic, French,

---

***Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.***

---

Spanish, or Australian – not Australian, no one speaks in Australian. Let me get that right. Oh, yes, the word is English.

I have a very loose agenda today. The reason the agenda is very loose is we have very little time and a lot of possible things to cover, but our primary objective is to continue the wonderful work of ensuring that the matters of both accessibility and indeed usability when we get to that definition of what ICANN does is just built in to its DNA. Have we got everything right yet? Oh no, no, no. Are we working hard to try and improve? Absolutely.

So my talking stick is now fully functional, and I feel much better once my talking stick is fully functional.

If I had had an agenda which was in fact the one for this meeting in front of me as opposed to the one for the meeting that is just completed – thank you, staff – I would be saying that what we would like to do right now is have a round robin of conversation. Check the Adobe room pod. Look at the Adobe room pod and you will not see – unless my Adobe room refreshes the problem – that we have moved to the new meeting, staff. That was my less than subtle – thank you.

We will now be looking at a roundtable of introductions – very brief please. If you're like me and you've been here since the institution was carved out of the rocks then just say "Google

---

me,” which is what I will be doing. If you want to know more about me, Google me, my name is Cheryl Langdon-Orr. But I would like to start at this end of the table over there and ask you to name yourselves and perhaps just briefly let us know what brings you to this table. If it’s to access the Wi-Fi, be honest. Over to you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you very much. My name is [inaudible], and I am coming from Benin from the Regulation Authority of Benin. We have a new law, and now we are in charge of ccTLD. I need to know more about the ICANN, and I want to know the best practices in order to manage our website. It’s .bg. My presence here is to gather information and to learn more. Thank you very much.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: I can assure you we have members in our community of interest here that have the skillsets and the enthusiasm to assist you in a number of your objectives of joining us. So, please, we are here to help and facilitate and the more ccTLD operators that get accessibility right, the further the word goes. To you, sir.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you. My name is [Matthews] from Madagascar in several group. I have the [.nic.mg] and I’m part of a community called

---

HABAKA, the Madagascar Innovation Hub. We work it out for the development of Internet in Africa. I am in charge of a department, the TAC department in Madagascar. I do research and I do teach at the university level. For all those activities, I work on several projects regarding the Internet, regarding training, research.

We did present some projects. We have some studies on networks in Madagascar. We are trying to have startups. In Madagascar, the Internet is not yet well structured. We still have some issues with our regulation authorities, with the operators, with the telecoms authorities and therefore there's a lot being asked of me. Therefore, I need to know more about how I can improve the Internet in Madagascar. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Welcome from all of us from the rest of the world. I can assure you, if what you also want to do is get good grounding in how to make the work you do in an online sense as accessible as possible, this is the group you'll find that information from, so more than welcome. To you, sir.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: My name is [inaudible]. I work for the World Wide Web Consortium. I can relate to the accessibility world because we

---

are the publisher of the Accessibility Guideline that everybody uses to make their website accessible. So I can – if you're interested – give you some update on our work. But I'm mostly interested in following the work that is going on in ICANN, and maybe I'm not sure if we'll have some time to comment on some of the accessibility problem of this meeting.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Oh, indeed, we will. Merci beaucoup. I'm not sure we'll get it all done in today's meeting agenda but, yes, there will be debrief required for some of the accessibility issues. And now over to you, sir.

MUHAMMAD SHABBIR: Thank you very much. This is Muhammad Shabbir. I am from Pakistan. Yes, you are very much right that I am a newcomer ICANN Fellow. I work in Pakistan basically as research field in international relations. For last three days in every morning session, I've been listening about ICANN and its activities. And the very first day when we were being briefed about what – rather we were being pushed about the knowledge and its ICANN and its workings, it was really a flow of knowledge and I was trying to sort out, yes, where I can fit in.

---

So second day or third day, I came to know of this meeting. I thought that, “Yes, this is an area which I can contribute and I can work on to some extent.” Although I am a guy who takes interest in international affairs and in international relations, but some of the work that I do other than my job is working on accessibility.

In Pakistan, I am affiliated with ISOC and from the [inaudible] of ISOC I am working with making environment accessible for persons with different abilities or different level of accessibilities. I would not like to impose on your time right now, but I would like to give some input on the accessibility issues that I have had with ICANN. One point that the name itself ICANN Cross Constituency Community on Accessibility, it’s really a tongue twister, so thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you and you’re more than welcome and you do realize we’ve already mentally put you into at least four different committees and support roles. So if you thought you were busy before you came to this room, wow!

This name which you brought up – and then I’m going to Garth and move backwards this way – is a construct which was limited by the use of words from other parts of ICANN. A lot of other words we would’ve preferred have a specific attributed

---

meaning, and that's how we ended up with this rather convoluted. I just like to think of it is as the CCCW. Garth?

GARTH BRUEN:

Thank you, Cheryl. Welcome to our colleague from Pakistan. It's good to have you here. I have been stressing since the beginning of this that if we're going to truly represent all communities at ICANN, all communities must actually be here at the table and this is progress.

I'm on the At-Large Advisory Council, ALAC, from North America. In this discussion, I always like to remind people that we owe the foundation of this text-based communication system to a deaf man, a deaf man who could not use the phone, which is why he started developing this system and the Internet grew out of that. And unfortunately, Ken Harrenstien's input has been lost on many people, and so I always bring it up. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:

Thank you, Garth. Isaac?

ISAAC MAPOSA:

Isaac Maposa from Zimbabwe. I'm an ISOC member. Accessibility matters, as it helps to disseminate information to people from all walks of life. In a bid to reach out to the people,

---

you need to be accessible. So it's a matter of significance to the Internet community and to all people. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you, Isaac. Over to you Glenn.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Good morning, everyone. Glenn McKnight, I'm the Chair of NARALO. We strongly support the idea of a change in attitude to an idea that ICANN take on a concept of acceptance with the people with disabilities. As Garth just mentioned a minute ago, we brought up Ken's name at our NARALO meeting. We hope to have him at our general assembly wherever it's going to be in October.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you very much. Ali?

ALI ALMESHAL: Are we introducing ourselves here?

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: I sincerely hope so. Otherwise, you're just here for Wi-Fi.



---

ALI ALMESHAL: Ali AlMeshal, APRALO Vice-Chair, and I represent the Bahrain ISOC chapter as well.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you. You know I'm going to pick on you if you're going to slip up like that. Siranush?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you, Madam Chair. Siranush Vardanyan from Armenia and Chair for Asia Pacific Regional At-Large Organization, and I represent Armenian Union for Disabled. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you. And I'm going to do your name no justice at all, so please.

CHENAI CHAIR: That's fine. My name is Chenai Chair. I am from Zimbabwe, but I work in South Africa with Research ICT Africa. I am NextGen, and I am interested in the work of what At-Large communities do and this whole issue around accessibility, making ICANN accessible to the rest of us. Now I think I'm part of the club, but it's a big issue. Before I came here, I really thought ICANN was just a playground for techies. So to actually see that there's [dreams] that focus on making it more accessible and relevant

---

to the Internet end user is something that I would like to be part of. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you and you are more than welcome. One of the things we are trying to do is reduce any barriers to entry for anybody who wants to be engaged in the work of ICANN. You didn't think that you sitting in the back row would escape, did you?

IVAN DONADELLO: Hi. My name is Ivan Donadello. I work for ICANN within [product management].

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Welcome. You might learn a few things. I don't know this person at all. These people are unfamiliar to me, so I want them to quickly introduce themselves.

LAUREN ALLISON: Hi, everyone. My name is Lauren Allison. I work with the Development and Public Responsibility department that sort of oversees Fellows, NextGen, ICANN Learn, etc. And yeah, I'm very interested in this topic, so thanks for having us.

---

**BETSY ANDREWS:** Hello I'm Betsy Andrews. I also work for the Development and Public Responsibility department. I am in charge of the online learning platform, ICANN Learn, and I also perform research.

**CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:** And you are more than welcome, ladies, because it's the type of parts of ICANN that if we get it right from the get-go makes all the difference. Retrofitting this stuff is never as effective or never as good.

I'm going to ask the staff that are speaking to introduce themselves when they speak. I mention to you that in this corner of the room is the A team who kind of beat it when I started. But, anyway, they make it all happen. They make it all work and we do appreciate them. We especially appreciate Heidi who acts as a nexus from our bleating and moaning and groaning about why can't it be done and why isn't it better and why isn't it faster and why isn't it the right font, through to the rest of ICANN to the people who do it.

Welcome, one and all. You are going to make a difference. Ah, you can't sneak in. No, no, no, no, no, please introduce yourself very briefly. Yes, you. Yes, you. Otherwise, I'll come down and leer over your shoulder.

---

[SELENA GATWANDA]: Good morning everyone. I am [Selena Gatwanda] from Malawi. I'm a librarian by profession, but I want to learn more about ICANN and I'm also interested in this topic. I'm looking forward to learning more from you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: You are more than welcome. Okay. Look to your left, look to your right, think of what two people you can bring into this important work. We've had rooms that are fuller, but I doubt we've had rooms that have got more important people in it than this one today. The local input, the continent group input, we have people from countries which really understand accessibility issues and we have people from countries who are yet to start looking at these matters seriously. We have subject matter experts and that's pretty much what we are trying to be, a resource for ICANN to get it right. And part of getting it right is what's been happening recently. So, Laura, over to you.

LAURA BENGFORD: Thank you, Cheryl, and welcome here, everybody. It is truly great to have your participation and some new folks here, as well. I'm just going to load and provide a very quick update.

Oh, I'm sorry. I'm Laura Bengford. I work in Digital Engagement and Product Management at ICANN. So I'm going to be providing

---

an update on the efforts that we've been undergoing for web accessibility. Next slide.

As you know, this group worked very hard to issue a request for proposal to improve our web accessibility on ICANN.org, At-Large, and our other websites, as well. So we issued that in late 2014 as just of a brief history.

We started this last year on an engagement with Simply Accessible. I believe they have joined us here today. If they are online, I will ask some to say hello and introduce themselves in a few minutes. They're going to be presenting today some of the results and findings that we had over the last several months.

And then this year we're going to be finalizing the testing and training (we just finished that in January) and starting to do some of the remediation on ICANN.org and also the new At-Large website.

Just a reminder, one of the very important parts of this engagement was making sure that not only we were measuring progress towards the web accessibility standards Level AA, but we wanted to also make sure that we were building sustainable practices and training within ICANN using open source testing and tools that left a minimum footprint. We didn't want to be in a position where we had very expensive tools and untrained resources following this engagement. That is something that's

---

Simply Accessible helped us achieve, particularly as we finished up the training these past couple of months. Next slide.

Just a quick summary of the engagement results before we go into some statistics for you. The first thing that we have really focused on, as I mentioned, was training all of our development staff, our testing staff and QA as well as our designers that are helping us design our websites. We started out with the core staff of about 14, and we're hoping to expand this over time to more and included IT in part of our on-boarding process.

We have a set of recommended tools now that our web developers will have as part of their toolkit as well. We've some open source API that will allow us to do automated scanning. That will again allow us to measure progress time after time and provide updates to this group on how we're doing.

We also have a whole set of best practices and guidelines on web development as well as procurement and how to purchase tools, including third parties, to make sure that we're not introducing any tools into our digital toolset that introduce issues that have barriers for persons that have web accessibility issues.

And then we're very much in the process of putting together our web accessibility roadmap that actually feeds into our other

---

roadmaps and just making sure again we're remediating but we're also not introducing new things.

Just a quick shout out: Arielle has helped me recently in getting the information up on the wiki. We still have some training videos that are up there and available. In the interest of time I won't click on that link, but we have up there all of the results from the testing as well as the guidelines, training videos, and our roadmap.

I'm going to go into the next slide, and I'd like to ask if Elle Waters or Derek Featherstone are on the call right now to maybe go through and introduce some of these results.

Actually, before I go into that, just a couple quick examples of some of the testing metrics. You can see up here that we have now integrated into all of our development and testing tools all the WCAG testing guidelines. You'll see up there on the screen the various fields that we had to add into all of our testing efforts. You can see we can quickly identify and report out to you the affected population by the issues that we have, what contents they have, and what principles. It also will allow us to help identify and prioritize based on the affected communities and put that into our roadmap. Lastly and most importantly, it'll just help us to bake into our regression testing that our testers will let us know if we've introduced any new issues.

---

The next slide is just a list of the testing tools. You can see them there. I'm going to have you roll quickly to the next slide and ask Elle Waters and Derek Featherstone – if you're able to get audio – to introduce themselves and say hello and provide a brief background of the results from the engagement.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Are you there?

LAURA BENGFORD: Are you there?

DEREK FEATHERSTONE: Hi, everybody.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: We can hear you. Go ahead.

DEREK FEATHERSTONE: This is Derek Featherstone from Simply Accessible. I'm very happy to be here. Thank you so much for having us. If we could move to the next slide.

Some very brief introduction of myself. I'm Derek Featherstone, I'm the founder and team lead here at Simply Accessible. I've been doing work in the accessibility field for about 15 years, and



---

we were very pleased to be selected to work with ICANN on the accessibility initiatives.

The work that we did, we scanned about 500 pages and did quite a bit of work going through both on automated scan and doing manual assessment ensuring that we found as many different accessibility issues as we could.

If you take a look on this one, when we find accessibility issues we find that they belong to one of three different levels. I'm looking right now on the top left corner of the slide where you can see the "Findings by WCAG Level." All different accessibility issues belong at one of the three levels: either A, AA, or AAA. Our goal for ICANN is to meet AA level. If we can find AAA issues that can easily be fixed, we'd like to do that too.

If you take a look at the breakdown of the issues, you'll see that of all the issues that we found, the large majority (probably close to 75%) are level A issues and all the remaining issues are level AA. The way that these things are organized is that level A is considered to be the baseline level for inclusion and level AA affects a larger population. So while we're looking at these three different levels of accessibility, what we found is that within the ICANN properties and what we were assessing, the level A issues represent kind of a more fundamental barrier to using this to more people.

---

What that means is that – excuse me, I’m hearing quite an echo so it’s difficult to hear myself talk and talk at the same time, my apologies.

Both the level A and AA issues are issues that need to be addressed in order to ensure that we can provide that access to people with different disabilities all over the world. If you take a look in the top right, you’ll see the findings and how they were mapped out. As Laura mentioned earlier, we categorize each issue that we find and give our assessment of which particular community of people with disabilities will be affected most by that particular issue.

Many of these issues actually pose a barrier to more than one community of people with disabilities. You’ll notice on that chart in the top right that if you total up the numbers, it’s actually greater than the number of total issues that we found. There are 302 total issues, but you can see that well over 200 of them were going to be something that would have quite an impact on people that were blind. But then there’s another 80 or so that have an impact on people with low vision, another 60 or so that have an impact on people with mobility or dexterity issues, and almost 100 that would have some impact on people with cognitive difficulties. So the total number is greater than the number of issues that we found simply because some of the issues impact more than one in the population.

---

The final chart at the bottom shows the severity level. We rank the severity level for each issue based on the impact on the person that is trying to complete a particular task. So a stop would be considered something that there's a barrier there to the point where we can't even continue testing it until that barrier is fixed. Something that is rated as high is something that is a barrier that would stop a person from actually completing a task. Medium is something where someone with a disability would have great difficulty or significant difficulty completing a task. And things that are rated as low severity tend to be things that don't get in the way of completing a task but still pose some type of a barrier that may be confusing or difficult to understand or not as streamlined as we might like them to be. You could move to the next slide.

I won't go into all the details here, but we do break things down and you can see in our reports the different principles that are involved. We categorize each issue based on its principle. Key concepts for accessibility include that all content must be perceivable, operable, understandable, and robust.

Perceivability involves our senses of perception, so seeing and hearing. Operability means that we can use the content or the functionality with any type of input device regardless of somebody's ability. So it might be that the content, these barriers in the operability area are something where someone

---

that’s using a keyboard may not be able to use the content of the application correctly.

On the understandability side of things, these tend to be things that we associate with cognitive difficulties, and robustness is really about ensuring that the things that we create in the digital world are both compatible with current technologies, future technologies, and even in many cases, older technologies.

In the top right on the slide you’ll see our “Findings by Content Type.” We won’t go through all the details, but these are the different types of problems that we find or our best identification of what the issue is most closely related to.

You’ll see most significant is the first item at the top of the chart, the CSS category. There are nearly 60 found issues that were given this content type. These are things where there’s some issue with the way that the cascading style sheets are being applied to the site. That may mean that there’s something specified where there are two colors that are specified in the style sheet that determines how text might look on a page and those two colors don’t have enough contrast in them or have enough contrast between them, and so that makes it very difficult for someone with low vision or someone that has perfect vision, if the contrast is low enough, there maybe difficulties reading.

---

Each one of these content types means something very specific, and I think we can likely share that with you in a different form rather than me speaking to all of them. But I'll choose a couple of select ones here just to give you some idea of what each one entails.

Document Structure, for example, the second one from the top, that refers to the way that documents are structured. HTML is a structured format, and we need to use those structures to communicate meaning to people that can't see the page. So we make sure that when we're creating HTML documents, we're doing that in such a way that we use headings, we use lists, we use paragraphs, we use block quotes. We use the meaning of HTML the way that it was intended to be used.

The fourth one from the top, Forms, tends to be things like each form fields on a page needs to have a label and needs to have that label and that programmatic association conveyed to somebody that can't see the screen. That means that we need to have visible labels, and they need to be present everywhere. They're used by people who are using a screen reader. They're also used by people that might be using voice recognition technology to activate controls via voice. They might also be used by somebody with mobility or dexterity challenges to create larger clickable areas for form fields that are small like check boxes and radio buttons.

---

The fifth one down, Keyboard Accessibility, is all about ensuring that everything in our content and functionality can be done via the keyboard.

Images is usually an issue of perceivability in that we've all heard the saying, "A picture is worth a thousand words." I like to think that some people actually need the thousand words because they require that description because they can't actually see the image itself. So issues related to images tend to be things about ensuring that there's a descriptive and appropriate text alternative.

I'll just jump down to the final one there, the second to the last, Dynamic Content. In this day and age, we're doing many more dynamically updating things in the web world. And so this is issues where ....

LAURA BENGFORD: Derek, I'm sorry to interrupt but I'm getting the signal that we're running a little long on time, so if we could just wrap up. Thank you.

DEREK FEATHERSTONE: Okay. Yup. This is the last one. The Dynamic Content tends to be things where we show and hide information on a page or we click on something and a new window pops up as a dialogue box

---

over the page and that sort of thing, so issues related to that. That's a very brief overview of the things that found while we were doing assessment.

LAURA BENGFORD: Okay. Thank you very much, Derek, that was very helpful. I know we're a little bit long on time, so I'm just going to sum it up right here. We are very actively working on our next steps as, Cheryl, you mentioned we still have a lot of work to do in terms of getting our roadmap together, integrating it with our procurement, testing, and reporting back to you on progress. So thank you again for the time to update you on this important initiative.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you, Laura, and thank you, Derek and your team out there in Simply Accessible. I am not going to rush too quickly. I am simply going to cut my agenda in half, and that's fine because it's my agenda and I can do what I like with it. I think this is important work, so let's open for any questions or comments from anyone, including of course those in the remote participation room. Gunela, for example, if you have audio I would think you would like to say something about this work.

---

GUNELA ASTBRINK: I'm wondering if you can hear me.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: We can hear you.

GUNELA ASTBRINK: Excellent. Okay. I've put in the chat room a little bit background about me. Again, I'd like to congratulate Laura and her team and also the work being done by Simply Accessible to achieve, improve the accessibility for the ICANN website. It's a big job. The training for ICANN staff is really important for developers and so forth, which means that there will be best sustainability of accessibility for website development into the future. I know that there's still some work to be done and I look forward to seeing how those goes, and I'll just keep being involved in this. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you, Gunela. I think it's important for me to say to the record – and I'm sure Laura would if I didn't get to it first, I've just got the microphone so I'll beat you to it – that Gunela has been an absolute integral part in so many of the key stages right from the get-go on this project. So she has more than a [watching bee]. She's got a vested interest, she's going to make this work, and it's very much to her work that I think ICANN staff



---

has been as comfortable in getting as far as they have in as short a time as they've had to do it in. So thank you, Gunela. It really is all about having you and people like you as a subject matter expert that makes – I hope – Laura and her team's life easier and not harder.

However, if there are no other questions on the matters or comments on the matters of web – over to you, sir, please.

DANIEL DARDAILLER: Yes. The tool that you showed on the page was the form where you can enter the description of the problem that you see, is that going to be publicly accessible to anyone visiting the ICANN.org site or is that reserved for the people trying to improve the site?

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Just before you answer, could you just insert your name so that the transcript in three languages...

DANIEL DARDAILLER: Daniel Dardailier from W3C.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you.

---

LAURA BENGFORD: Yes. Thank you for that question. Just real briefly, that is a tool called JIRA which is our internal Agile development tool. So it's pretty much used internally by the team, but it does allow us to use those fields to provide outwardly reports that we can provide on the wiki or website transparently.

DANIEL DARDAILLER: So as a Landa user, I cannot use the tool to report a problem? That's not in the scope of the tool, right? If I'm a visitor to the ICANN site and I can see that there is a problem with accessibility, there's not like a button on all the page that would tell me report the – there would be maybe an improvement.

LAURA BENGFORD: Yes. We do have a feedback mechanism on the tool as well as an e-mail that anyone can provide us feedback on the website. We probably – and it's a good suggestion, I'm glad you're bringing it up – is we probably could actually add to that form a check box or some kind of category to get that specific feedback to go into our JIRA system. That's a great idea. Thank you very much for that.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Very helpful. I'll go to you next – after the next person – Chris. Over to you please, [inaudible]. Please, yes.

---

[MUHAMMAD SHABBIR]: Yes. Actually that brings me to my point which is that a feedback option of the website – actually you have a feedback on your website. First of all, let me acknowledge the efforts that your team has put into all these and made your website accessible. But the accessibility and usability both go together. On accessibility part, I have not have had any issues but usability part I have a point to make.

Actually, when I was applying for ICANN Fellowship – we all know that there is an online application that every applicant has to fill in. To fill in that application, first we have to create an account, and to create an account there is a very accessible form which is open in front of me. But a very little problem, without that you cannot create form, you cannot fill in your application and ultimately you cannot apply for the fellowship.

What that problem is that human verification that it is actually a human which is creating a form. There is a CAPTCHA code which is being displayed on the screen, but its alternate audio or mathematics option is not supplied. So it would be great if you could provide, your team could add in an audio option, some numbers, words, or some simple mathematical problem which a human can solve and then supply their answer to verify that, yes, it is human and not a machine which is filling this form.

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Here, here, here from many people around many countries in many situations are supporting you in that complaint. So, Laura?

LAURA BENGFORD: All right. Thank you for that and you're absolutely right. We had quite a big discussion with Simply Accessible about CAPTCHA. One of the guidelines that we have on the wiki are CAPTCHA guidelines and our best advice we've been giving is on all of the forms that use CAPTCHA is to include two different methods which you could select which of the two would offer you the ability to get through that form and submit it. So you're absolutely right. Thank you so much for that.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you indeed. Now, Chris, you popped your card up. I assumed that was actually for an intervention, not for me to throw to you for the next speaker, but I'm going to do both. Have your intervention and be the next speaker including an introduction of yourself. Thank you, kind sir.

---

CHRIS GIFT: Thank you, Cheryl. This is Chris Gift with ICANN staff. I'm responsible for our digital services at ICANN.

Just a quick intervention, which I think Laura already solved and I was going to follow on whether we viewed that as a requirement for feedback to have additional fields so people can highlight the error or the issue that they had found and so on. But I think Laura followed through on that and captured that, so that is an interesting requirement.

The only thing I would add at this point for myself and for my team is echo with a lot of you had said in your introductions in that accessibility is – well, let me take a step back. For us, my view – certainly our team and within ICANN staff – we support a multi-stakeholder organization. If our services and our facilities and our meetings are not accessible, then in many ways we're not multi-stakeholder, we are missing a large stakeholder group. So we think it's paramount and important for us to continue these activities and to continue to invest in this work to make our efforts as accessible as possible. We will continue to participate in this group, and we will continue to try to improve our work.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thanks, Chris. Is there any point you want to make about publications, etc.? Thank you.

CHRIS GIFT:

Thank you. It's an excellent point. There was a follow on I did want to say, which I had some notes. There are a couple of things I would like to do. We are working not only on our web work, we are looking at other additional platforms to improve our publication processes and to ensure that documents, whether they're PDFs or other documents, are moved to other documents forms that are more accessible. That is a long-term project which we will probably not see for – well, we will see fruition in probably in about a year. We'll be able to give more feedback I think in subsequent calls about what we're doing. Ivan who introduced himself earlier is an important part of that process in terms of improving our publications processes.

The other thing I'd like to say is within the next few months once we're a little bit sure about our training, I want to see if we can take our engagement that we have had with your group and export that to other staff groups within ICANN. I do know that Diana has come and presented about the work that he has done about accessibility within staff. But nonetheless, I think there is a model here for us to – I'd like to think as a model for us here to follow internally so we can continue to raise awareness about accessibility issues and make sure that it is in people's minds when they do their work but also make sure that it's baked in at a low level throughout the organization.

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you very much. Is there anybody who wishes to ask any questions or make any comments about this? Please, over to you, sir.

DANIEL DARDAILLER: I was wondering about the scope of this group responsibility, whether or not it includes, for instance, the mobile app that we've download for this week, whether it's in the remit of this group or things that are not related directly to the ICANN document but are in the ICANN ecosystem. For instance, everybody has to buy or rent or whatever it's called a Domain Name System from a registrar site, and I'm sure that there are common accessibility problem to the specific market and selling of domain site. So maybe at a later point I can think about guidelines that are specific to their particular, market which is the market of selling domain name.

CHRIS GIFT: I can answer some of that, and then the rest I will punt over to Cheryl. The mobile app or anything that is in terms of implementation, it is absolutely within the remit, I think, of this group and certainly the remit of the staff present. So please bring anything to our attention.

---

We do have a roadmap, which we're trying to rework a lot of our services because I think accessibility in previous times was not paramount within ICANN, at least certainly in the digital services realm and that's changed. So we are moving through them bit by bit, and that's the roadmap Laura was alluding to. So I think that's within remit. When it comes to guidelines and whatnot to registrars, I would [think] and I'll move it over to Cheryl, but that would be a policy question that would have to be moved through and come from the community.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you, Chris, and I'm perfectly happy to have you punt it to me because I know exactly where I'm going to punt it, and that's to Gunela. I decided that even before a hand came up in the room because this is something that she is particularly passionate about and indeed has done significant work in. You're right it is policy, but we as the community of interest in these accessibility matters can assist in finding champions, for example, helping ccTLD operators or gTLD operators get towards some best practice examples. So I'm sure Gunela's going to pick up on that. Over to you, Gunela.

GUNELA ASTBRINK: Thanks, Cheryl. Yes, this is an underlying issue that has been with the Accessibility Working Group, and certainly it's



---

something that I have raised many times because ICANN can raise awareness about accessibility by also showing how it can be done within ICANN. It is an excellent opportunity to increase awareness amongst new gTLDs, registries, registrars to offer guidelines on web accessibility. That is such an excellent opportunity to spread the word about accessibility across the world and across very many industries. So it's something that should be really, while it is in the background, it's actually in our objectives and suggested actions, so let's not forget it. We can raise this and find the best time to actually put the framework together to assist registries and registrars. Thank you.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Gunela, I'm going to suggest that of course you as an internationally recognized subject matter expert in this field would be more than happy I suspect to assist any of the ccTLD operators or gTLD registries or groups thereof that might want to explore this further. I assume I'm not over stepping my mark there, am I, my dear?

GUNELA ASTBRINK: No, you're not. I have already raised this at some ICANN meetings, working groups, and to the ccNSO, for example. There are many opportunities to raise this, and I look forward to opportunities of continuing to [do so].

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Excellent. I would've been very surprised if you would've told me otherwise. Thank you very much. Are there any other comments or questions? Yes, Chris, you've got a question yourself? I always thought that was a worry when one starts questioning oneself. Go ahead.

CHRIS GIFT: I'm just following up on the same comment from Daniel. Actually, there are some interesting ideas there. I was just making some notes. I do think there are probably some things we can do as staff. For instance, as Gunela was suggesting, I think we can certainly maybe codify some of the steps we've taken. Maybe we can work with Simply Accessible to make some of these services available to them, to registries and registrars. I think we can also, as Gunela was suggesting, look at awareness. We can probably work with our global stakeholder engagement team and our registry and registrar teams to perhaps have webinars with those people.

So I think those are all steps that we can certainly take, and we'll look into those. We'll certainly see about what we can do.

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you. I get excited to points like that. This is why this gathering around tables, virtually or real, from time to time is important because it allows exploitation of opportunity when someone in staff can go, “Oh wow, of course, I can do that,” or “I know who can do that.” And that really does help, I think, make everybody’s job easier and the end game more accessible.

We’re going to move to – and I suspect this is all we will get done for the rest of our agenda – the matter of meetings. I am going to reverse the order on the agenda, and I’m going to read what that order will now be.

We are going to, first of all, hear about the very important work from the Captioning Pilot Program. Following, a discussion on any questions that might be raised from the update from Judith and Glenn, I believe, will be presenting that on her behalf, I would like then for us to look at very briefly any other matters that you would like to raise about meetings that are occurring online. In other words, those that are being offered to us via probably always but not necessarily only the Adobe Connect room system. That tends to be the tool of choice. It’s certainly not the only tool that is used and it’s certainly not the only tool that perhaps should be used, but we are currently seeing a fairly extensive use of Adobe Connect. If there are any accessibility issues that you want to bring forward then on that topic for general meetings online, we will deal with that then.

---

I'm leaving the rest of the session for face-to-face, and if you can hear the tone in my voice, I suspect you'll know why I think we might need to have a little bit of time to capture some conversation. So let's first go to Judith and, Glenn, I think you are acting in her proxy. Over to you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

I don't have any slides up there from Judith, so I'll just go back to my memory and my notes on the project. Back in the last fiscal budget, we requested to do a pilot on the captioning. We've only done one meeting, which was the NARALO meeting roughly a month or so ago, and we've done a survey. I don't think a copy of the survey is here either.

Fundamentally, what we did is Sylvia and I, we created an extensive survey which was really designed for the capacity building sessions. Many of the questions were qualifying questions on the quality of the session, but we also asked a number of questions how did you like the captioning? Was it effective? Did you find value to it? And so because of this session right here it's on delay, but we will be doing additional sessions shortly after this meeting.

In addition to the last year's budget, I believe it was well received within the community, and we're looking at expanding

---

the captioning to include French and Spanish in the pilot for next year and we're hoping that it'll continue.

We don't have enough to tell you on the success of it because we haven't done a full evaluation of the pilot yet. But when it's actually completed, we'll be able to do quantitative information. But just anecdotally from the first session, we didn't expect a few things which was really surprising and very positive that captioning actually enhanced communication. We found it a very successful enterprise.

I'm just going to look at the note to see if Judith is actually able to add to that. She says she has put some notes here, but I don't see them. Judith, if you are putting notes, I don't see any. But yeah, in terms of the community, I see Siranush was there. But Ali and Cheryl are both from APRALO, so I do encourage you both from APRALO to schedule a session. Harold, I hope your LACRALO will do one as well. Okay. Any questions?

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: I'm seeing none in the room, and I would just check back in the Adobe Connect tool. But scrolling back, Judith did make the point in the notes, Glenn, that I assume she would like to be recorded, that in the recent ICANN Learn meeting they were quite open on the nexus for the platform of ICANN Learn to

---

utilize captioning and captioning input. So this is quite a useful thing.

Let me remind you that I've been in meetings since Wednesday last week, and clearly my mind just vacated its hotel room and went back to Sydney. I shall try that sentence again. Let me remind you that the chat is a transcript and part of the formal record so if you put something in chat, it will be part of this meeting record. However, if there is something we particularly want to focus on, we're always more than happy to read it to the audio record and therefore the language transcriptions from this meeting, as well. So you have multiple ways of getting your input in.

Going back and I'm not seeing anybody with their hand up in the room. We'll move from captioning and take hopefully just a couple of minutes because I'm hoping there are not too many new problems and sadly probably not too many solutions to the old ones yet, for the online general meetings. Is there anything anybody wishes to bring forward now other than my usual collection of grrs and arghs about using Linux and OpenSource and Android and of course half of what Adobe Connect should be doing for me therefore still not working. Chris is crying, and I love making men cry. Thank you. My ticked objective today, done. Anyone else want to bring anything for it – I will eventually

---

get my way, Chris; I'm just saying – about our online tool? Excellent.

So let's now go to face-to-face meetings. In previous meetings, one of the things I had credited and was very excited to see happening in the registration process for an ICANN meeting was the opportunity to put a “do you have an issue” be it dietary or accessible and therefore give us some details. I've never actually loaded my full medical information there. I am sorely tempted to do so next time and I just might.

And then it says, “Thank you for that information. Someone from meetings will get back to you.” I'm waiting now patiently for them to get back to see how I can be better facilitated in both London and the Dublin meeting, and I look forward to someone contacting me for the meeting that is being held here at the moment. Oops, maybe I'm not the only person who has filled in this information. I'm fairly confident I'm not. The thing is, it's only kind of funny, right. I'm a noisy wheel. What about the unnoisy wheels, right?

The other thing is those of us who regularly and routinely fill out the registration form, now that form is very much being populated by our past history. We need clear and demonstrable opportunity to update. Between one meeting and the next, my accessible needs may very well change. I, for example, may need

---

to travel with a companion. I prefer to choose who I sleep with. Therefore, things like getting me a twin room so I don't actually have to sleep with the person who then [hits] me and gets me in and out of my shower in the morning or, heaven forbid, in and out of the bathtubs that they sometimes, which is just murder as far as I'm concerned.

You see what I mean? We need to be able to then not only re-register but make an update. Just make it easy for people to say, "I now need this," and new issues come up all the time. You also should be able to retract it. "My fractured leg is now out of the cast, and I don't need these sorts of considerations anymore." So it's just a little bit of database management, and I'm hoping that we can get it better.

I know where most of you live so I'm not going to talk at all about the joy I have had here at this venue. If it had been and I'm delighted to be in the kingdom of Morocco, do not get me wrong. And I would love to be on vacation here and I would love to be on vacation here at any of the venues, including the Marble Palace. But I'm sure someone else, Shabbir, would like to say something a little bit about what the meeting is. Okay over to you, sir.

MUHAMMAD SHABBIR: I said later.



---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: No, no, now is the time. Seriously, you want to bring it up. Now is the time.

MUHAMMAD SHABBIR: Yes. Accessibility and the forms you are talking about is very essential, and I would like to say it on record that sometimes it's a really big headache to remove your previous information from the forms and add in new. So it's better to have a clean form, clean sheet to fill in and just go whatever you want to go.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Shabbir, if may I ask you, you have a person who assists you around the venues here. I know that that's a system you're very used to, and I'm assuming that that has meant however you have to be very careful about which venue room you can get to in time for meetings to start. So we have meetings at one end of this facility followed by meetings at the other end of this facility. How have you found that?

MUHAMMAD SHABBIR: For me, there is another question, but even the newcomer Fellows and even some old Fellows, they are, "Where is Cristal room? Cristal, Cristal, Cristal?" We just chat about Cristal, and at

---

the end we found that the meeting we wanted to attend is over and just now we have found the Cristal hall. So it's a problem, but I also understand that if there are a large number of people and we have to accommodate each and every meeting at running at parallel, so it is a bit difficult.

I would definitely love to have same venue in the same building, meeting rooms accessible nearby so that I can just grab a coffee and stay there, stand or sit and have it rather than getting my coffee or sandwich or whatever and running to the other place. So it would make life very much easier.

Another thing that I wanted to add probably at the end but since you have given me the mic and I won't let this opportunity go, it's that wonderful application that was created for ICANN 55. I am using this app on my iPhone. In the beginning, it was pretty accessible, but somehow I don't know whether lots of information coming in or some improvements were made. But when I came and when I landed here in Morocco and I said, "Let's use this app," it was inaccessible. I thought that it's better to go old tried-and-tested route of helping and getting assistance from someone. And for the record, the guy is my friend who is also an ICANN Fellow who assists me around from meeting places. So sometimes, yes, he is a technical guy and I am more into policy and discussions human rights, so our

---

schedules clash so that makes a bit things bit difficult. So I would love to have some alternate options.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you very much. And the experiences of each and every one of us are important. We will always – unless we’re really, really nasty and not most of us are that – recognize the limitations that ICANN as an entity putting on huge meetings is going to have. But, for example, I was delighted to know that I would be able to have ready access to the golf carts because I actually tried to hire one for myself. ICANN had already hired them all, so it was impossible. I had to start getting very large envelopes to try and bribe people. No, no, that’s not true. That is a joke for the record.

I certainly have wonderful staff, and I do not understand how I would do without the staff to help me get around at various times, and particularly for times when there are vast distances to be covered in very short amounts of time. And I think, Shabbir, this is going to be one of those issues that as sight impaired you have also found difficult.

The signage really can be improved for all of us – and that means sighted, sight-impaired or otherwise – we really did need to do a little bit better on the signage. I’d love somebody to have

---

followed the signs to the Cristal room yesterday because they ended up pointing at each other, and I had a giggle about that.

But it's inappropriate, and I simply will not pull out valuable staff from a meeting to drive me around in a golf buggy. So there are meetings I have chosen to miss, not the ones I've chaired, luckily. But there are meetings I have chosen to miss simply because the logistics for all the best intentions are still somewhat impractical. Unfortunately, finding someone – you don't break into someone else's meeting to say, "Come and drive me somewhere."

Ladies and gentlemen, we have had enormous leaps forward with the communications and the web work. We will get huge steps forward in all aspects, and Heidi is busting to say something while I'm trying to get this meeting finished on time. You know I hate running late, Heidi. Go ahead.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Hi, Cheryl. Hi, everyone. I know we are running late, but we do have some staff from the meeting staff here, Nancy and Tanzanica. And I know that we're running late, but I think that it would be really valuable if we could just take a minute or just to have Nancy say a few words.

---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Okay. Look, it's top of the hour, should you need to be elsewhere, we respect the fact that you need to be elsewhere, but this is important and we thank for you for all the efforts you make, Nancy, over to you.

NANCY LUPIANO: So if you have any direct questions, I'd be happy to answer them. But just as an overview very quickly, I personally sent an e-mail to every single person that registered under handicapped. I will tell you there was only one that registered under handicapped that truly had a reason to request it. Jean-Christophe from Paris, who as we all know has cerebral palsy. He was planning on coming. If you go in the medical room, we have paid for and rented two mobile wheelchairs for people that might be coming for it.

Number two, as far as the handicapped portion, if you noticed there are ramps into the Diamant, [up hills], Opale, we had them built. They did not exist here at the hotel. The hotel was not handicapped accessible. All of the ramps in Palmeraie, Palace Hotel, to Cristal they are all new at our definitions and request.

I think what we need to do and one of the problems I found in the form when you register, a lot of people, 99% of the people that clicked handicapped, were actually looking for monetary support to come to the meeting, were looking for business

---

opportunity from other groups within the meeting. So I think we need to term it differently to make it much more “this is for physical handicapped purposes,” that type of thing.

As far as where this building is located, I think you all know and support us, the Meetings team, when we are requested to go to regions. Some of the regions just don’t have space. When we finally find space, it can be as spread out as it is here in Marrakech. We certainly hope we don’t have to do that again because it is an issue for our bandwidth as well as our people to get around, but we try very hard. And as I say, there’s not always the opportunity for space that is of the ultimate for our needs.

Any other specific questions, I’d really be happy.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:

Thanks, Nancy. Just to let you know, one of the issues seems to be with the forms when one registers. So fresh registration to getting the opportunity to click and to refresh, but moldy oldies are not getting that. So we will fix that. That’s fine.

Some of the timing issues, it would be luxurious and wonderful, but this is ICANN and it’s never going to run the way Tanzi would like to have it. I’m sure you could do a perfect model. We would just break it. Over to you, Tanzi.

---

**TANZANICA KING:** I heard when we walked in a little bit that you're talking about signage, and so I just wanted to speak to that. As you know, I'm the little designer on our team. Very difficult to do directional signage here, so practically our entire team was involved in trying to get them up. Today, we have learned that the hotel started taking them down for another event, so bear with us. It's sort of we're putting one down and someone else's behind us taking – you know. It's not a good situation.

Also, we come here. We do our site visit. We focus obviously on the meeting rooms so we can get them setup properly for you, and then we're all the way across the world trying to remember whether you make a left or a right and where you need the sign. So I'd like to think we do a really good job most of the time. This was exceptionally difficult.

**CHERYL LANGDON-ORR:** Oh, it's been tough and I think you and I have said we recognize that this one has been tough, but we do have to continue to strive. This is not actually bitching and moaning, this is trying to help everybody get it better. And for distributed spaces like this, it might be one of those times when you get your way and you do have a gap between start and stop time of meeting because it's that lack of gap, which I know if you had your druthers you would be doing. Because as somebody was saying, he can't be in

---

the one in Golf Hotel and then in the Cristal room at minus one minute because the first meeting's run over. And with sight impairment, of course, even more than with my more active accessibility issues. I can still wander around, but you are reliant on someone to come take your arm and get you to the next point, and so we're beholden to other people.

It's great that you had the facilities to put together, and it would be really useful if in future we don't build an expectation that ICANN is going to provide this amazing five-star service but that we do establish in quiet knowledge for those who need what may or may not be useful even in some venues that wouldn't be useful. So it's got to be tailored to the time. We will get it better. We will get it right.

I want to thank you in particular for all of your contributions. I certainly want to thank the staff who have done an amazing amount of support of all of these ventures. Laura, you know I would get on bended knee, but then you'd have to come and help me up and that would be embarrassing. You and your team have been wonderful along with Chris. Interpreters, you literally are our voice. Thank you so much. Tech guys, as long as you give me a mic, I'm happy but you've made me happy every day. And of course, there will be another meeting in here. It is inappropriate to leave your technology behind. Harold, I forgot you. Forgive me. Go, Harold.



---

HAROLD ARCOS: Don't worry. I'm seeing a comment from [inaudible] in the chat. I'll read it quickly. "Can you remind people to put in their request for captioning for April?"

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Okay. Yup. I think Glenn did actually mention that to the record, but thank you for bringing it back to the formal record. Putting in requests for captioning during April makes the pilot work. Thank you very much, and that closes the meeting. Bye for now.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**