
MARRAKECH – At-Large NARALO Meeting
Tuesday, March 08, 2016 – 11:00 to 12:00 WET
ICANN55 | Marrakech, Morocco

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Good morning. I'm Glenn McKnight, Chair of NARALO, and I want to deviate from the agenda a slight bit. I'd like to make two announcements and I've asked a guest to join us today.

First of all, I'd like to acknowledge the sad death of Ray Tomlinson. He's the e-mail pioneer that – many of us actually still use e-mail, but his contribution is phenomenal. I was talking to Garth last night and I'm sure his dad who is himself a pioneer within his community in Boston probably knew Ray, probably exchanged bits and bytes. It's sad that he passed away. He had a heart attack at 76.

The other thing that's very close to our heart is, one of our own ALSs or LACRALO ALS, an ISOC chapter, a very strong participant in the Technical Task Force, a person who is a seminal person in Venezuela, [Hrathma Katera], and I've asked Harold to talk about this incredible event that happened at the ICANN Hub. So I'd like to pass over to Harold to give us an update.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

HAROLD ARCOS: Thank you so much. I wish [to spread inaudible] and I wish to spread our solidarity. I wish the [inaudible] Group who started the remote hub in Venezuela. This group maintain their active participation during the meet of Technology Task Force yesterday, despite act of violence on other groups of students in the same university where they was. As an ALAC member from LACRALO I wish express our solidarity on this group. Thank you, Glenn, for this opportunity.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you so much, Harold. I'd like to turn to the other members of the team if they have any comment.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. Also, yesterday during the Forum, we also had a remote participant from Nigeria. The first time, we were unable to hear him. The second time he was reconnected, he began talking about consumers, and that was the only word that came through, "consumers." Everything else he said was completely choppy. ICANN has made a lot of noise about the importance of these remote hubs, but obviously there are problems here. I think that there's one technical problem in Nigeria. The problem experienced in Venezuela is a lot more serious.

But, in doing this, we actually see the world as it really is and we see the Internet users as they really are, which, I think, is actually educational.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Great. Thank you so much. I'd like to turn to Eduardo. Do you have a comment? Okay.

EDUARDO DIAZ: No comment.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you so much. I don't have the Adigo open, and I just want to see if there's anyone from the floor. Does anyone from the Adigo or Adobe have a comment?

No? Okay. We're going to move back to our normal agenda. So I'd like to welcome you all. I'd like to turn to the slide show that we have put together. This is a great location for us to have our NARALO meeting, except for the room. I think a lot of people are having difficulty reaching it. But I want to give you an update from the Chair's position and the Secretary's position since taking over the position at the end of October to the current position. So the first part of this discussion is going to be an

update on what we've been doing. I'd like to turn to the next slide.

Much of what we've been doing is outreach and engagement. I'd like to give you an update on our ALSs. I'd like to give you an update on how our CROPP funding applications have been done and what the current state of new memberships are. Okay, so next slide.

So currently we have 33 ALSs and what we did is: we called, e-mailed, called again, e-mailed again. We tried to reach out to every single ALS to see how we can get them more engaged, to encourage their participation, and I think it bore some fruit. We ended up having pretty good attendance. I think 14 people on our monthly calls I think was the average. Sylvia, is that about right? About 14? Which I think is pretty impressive. I have to note that there was a lot of people that said they could not make the 3:00 call and, in fact, we made a special effort with a Doodle poll Sylvia set up where we asked people, "Can we do another time? Perhaps the evening like what NACRALO does." Harold could address that. They have a good attendance because it's after work hours. But the general response back was, "No, we want to keep it as it is." So currently we have the 3:00 slot, but what I might be doing is a short, informal call with those who could not make it during the day to keep them in the loop.

So in our efforts – and we finally tracked down some of these people – a number of them decided that, after doing an attendance record for the last two years, some of these people, including the seven that I’ll mention, were not in attendance and not voting and not participating in working groups. They were not participatory. We didn’t kick them out, contrary to what some people were saying in the At-Large list. We made a lot of effort to engage them. We asked them to participate, and when they said, “No, we do not want to participate,” we asked them for an e-mail, we tracked this process through, and we documented it on a wiki page.

Seven people have opted out, so we’re down to 26. It’s sad some of the organizations – and I have to contribute Garth to a lot of this work over the three years as Chair – were organizations that we really wanted to be involved, but as Garth articulated earlier in the week, after they got in they found out they don’t want to be here. We have a real [optics] problem in terms of the relevance of ICANN, the relevance of NARALO, and really explaining what we do and why we do what we do.

So we have 26 ALSs. I’m assuming we’re one of the smaller RALOs now? I guess with 26?

SYLVIA VIVANCO: Yes.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. So we will start building that number up and it starts with the first one. The next slide please.

Okay. We have a new-minted, Washington DC ISOC chapter, run by David Vorst and Paul Brigner. Some of you may know Paul, I think. You know, Paul, right? Paul was the Regional Director with ISOC. Very solid organization. It's so seminal for us. They took about two years for me to get them to become an ALS, but now they're on board. They're the ones that do the IGF-USA. I'm a volunteer with the IGF-USA and so is Judith. We hope to be on a panel. We hope to be spreading the good news.

I think it's one of our strongest bases in the US. We've lacked that sort of seminal organization in our repertoire, so that's a good one. We're going to be looking back at our strategic plan and looking at our areas, and I'll talk about that in the next slide, on which areas we need to reach out to in order to start building the numbers up, but building the numbers up with people who are – based on our taxonomy of interest – actually feel welcome and they have a place to go.

Joining us as an ALS without joining a Working Group and other things or being active in policy is sort of redundant. Next slide please.

Okay, so here's the trips. I'm going to San Jose this month, and that's four days at the NTEN. NTEN is the premium conference for not-for-profits. It's the tech heads of not-for-profits in the United States. They do some incredible stuff. In fact, staff is going. I think Adam is going. I think two of the people that are involved with the web development are going as well. But I'm usually a speaker at that event which I don't know if I am. But I usually do a 'Birds of a Feather.' I do an interview with Chronicle of Philanthropy, and I'm always on the local radio. It's a good show. Particularly I'm interested in reaching out to First Nations and Indigenous People. And the second group is the people with special needs or disabilities.

Second is Le-Marie Thompson. She's going to the Global Summit in Vancouver. That'll be, I think, this week.

Next one: Alfredo Calderon from ISOC PR will be at the Southern School of Internet Governance In Washington. I'll be joining him, which is not a CROPP trip. But I hope he doesn't snore because we have to share the room. So I guess I'll find out. I'll have to bring earplugs or something. But I'm helping Olga who's the organizer of that event, and that's going to be in Washington later this month to April 1st.

Then I'll be going to the M-Enabling Economy. That's particularly technology and Internet of Things for people with disabilities.

Hopefully I can meet additional organizations that will be involved with us.

And last, Dt. John Laprise of the University of Chicago will be going to Personal Democracy in June in New York City.

So that rounds up our five trips. I believe we've been one of the RALOs that have been active in using our CROPP trips and, as you notice, these all terminate at the end of June. They really start in September onwards, so the whole issue – June and July becomes an issue because we can't get funding because the program budget program there's no overlap, which is really weird. So it's not a 12-month cycle.

For example the IGF-USA is not included as a CROPP trip, so I'm going to that of my own expense, as an example. I don't know how we're going to deal with that, but I think we are just flagging that as an issue.

Okay, "Special Projects" please. Oh, sorry. Go ahead.

EDUARDO DIAZ: If that's an issue, how can we fix that? Any ideas?

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes. Thank you. I think we need to meet with Dev. I don't know how he sleeps. That guy does so much work. I think, Eduardo,

you [making] good as an action [I'm] please, Sylvia, that we arrange a meeting and talk about that.

The second issue on that is we have to meet with Chris Mondini of out of region idea. I did an application for one to go to ARIN in Jamaica, which is in April, and it was denied because it was out of region. You can envision a map. We have our jurisdictions includes those 15 islands way out in the South Pacific which will never be part of our territory, time-zone wise and geographic reasons and stuff. Meanwhile, we don't include Jamaica in our jurisdiction, but we include Puerto Rico. We tried to trade Puerto Rico for Jamaica but you guys wouldn't go for it.

So as it turns out, ARIN's jurisdiction also includes the Bahamas, blah blah blah, and Jamaica and so it's there again. We worked very hard on this MOU, very hard to have a relationship with NARALO. We didn't ask for money. We asked for support, which is the key. You ask for money later. Not to say we're moochers, but eventually we'd like to have some money for conferences and what-not, or support for showcases or whatever. But by not being there? That is such a major issue for me because you're losing that relationship. The next ARIN trip will be October.

The second thing we tried to do with ARIN is we tried to get a liaison, which Leah [Smyekher] of ISOC San Francisco with me

and – sorry, your friend from Puerto Rico, who’s another ISOC chap...

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Not Alfredo. He was in Montreal with me for ARIN. Yes. Jose Cruz. So the three of us were there, which is really good representation, and Ognian Miltev showed up as well. So we had a really strong NARALO contingent there in Montreal. But it’s going to be zero in Jamaica. Out of sight, out of mind.

[EDUARDO DIAZ?]: I was going to say that this [inaudible] thing, the whole reason for the CROPPs is to engage people into NARALO, right? So if you engage somebody from Jamaica, it’s goes to LACRALO.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I’m going to respond to that – 99.9% of the people that are at the ARIN meeting are North American.

Okay. Any other questions on that? I was babbling a little bit. I’m sorry.

Okay, I’ll proceed. I’ll turn to Judith to talk about the captioning. Okay, Judith, would you like to speak about it? Sorry.

Okay. I'll have to speak on behalf of Judith.

In FY16, we had a special request for ICANN budget – and this is ALAC as a whole – for real-time captioning up to three Adobe Connect Working Groups, whether they're RALOs, ALAC, or webinars, a month, and the money came from the ICANN's core budget. This isn't a NORALO submission but it came from NARALO.

The goal is to gather necessary metrics to illustrate the needs of the captioning, so what Sylvia and I did, we worked on the survey. The survey originally, when we did the first pilot, was the large survey which was designed for say the capacity-building webinars, so some of the questions you may have seen probably were a little odd because it was asking quality of the webinar. But besides that – do we have a link to the survey for everyone to see that?

SYLVIA VIVANCO: We should have it on the wiki page.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. So yes, I'm sorry. If you look at the wiki page on the captioning project, we're trying to capture was – we asked the communities and we were one of the first that did it. If you look at the quality of the comments, it was astounding; things that

we didn't expect, which was great. So I think the first captioning project, and I think it's the only one, right Sylvia?

SYLVIA VIVANCO: It's the only one so far.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: So far it's the only one, but I think it's proven its merit. Any questions on the captioning project? Sorry, I can't see any from online.

SYLVIA VIVANCO: [inaudible]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Please.

SYLVIA VIVANCO: I just wanted to congratulate this effort. It's been really a highlight. Our next caption call will be the APRALO webinar on March 22nd. The feedback we received was excellent, was very useful, especially not only for non-native English speakers, but also for all people that have some problems, and also for people that are from different countries and different accents. So we received really a lot of good feedback and we will continue. We

will have nine calls throughout April and May, and possibly June.
Thank you.

[EDUARDO DIAZ]: So the purpose here is that, if this has very good feedback and so forth, will that happen only during the webinars, or will it happen through the regular calls or how? it's just for webinars?

SYLVIA VIVANCO: Yes. This is a pilot and we are already anticipating that it may become a permanent feature, not only for the webinars, for calls as well. But as a pilot, we aren't working with a vendor so we also need to look at the financials. It's expensive but I think it's worthwhile. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thanks, Sylvia. The vendor is 'Captions First'. You can look at their website. Fantastic people, but about \$160 an hour it's costing for Captions First to do the captioning in the Adobe.

There is other tools, like "Readytalk," that we experimented with a TTF, which does instantaneous translation to different languages. We are trying to keep the door open for the application of the captioning tool and other conversing

platforms. But from just the initial call the response back was really quite good. And the cost is really quite minor.

As one of the things I didn't realize, some of the people were monitoring obviously on their [adrenal] phones or different things and some of the people did not hear me. Other people had no problem hearing me, which is really unexpected.

And the quality of the captioning was absolutely astounding in hearing and watching. For example, if somebody has a very strong accent, or say it's Cheryl who's talking. It's not just her Australian English. It's just she goes up and down in her volume, I find, and that's hard to follow for my ear. I think I have a bit of a hearing problem, so I really have a hard time understanding. It takes a long time for her to get to the point, so that style in reading – and then by watching it, you can actually zoom in on what the issue was. So I think it's not just English as people do not have it as a first language, but other people who speak different accents and the volume differences.

And the other thing is that – unfortunately our expert on this is not here – she said, for countries that have slower bandwidth, which is another huge benefit – so this whole concept of captioning, whether captioning of videos, captioning of meetings, really came from the inspiration of people like Garth and myself, and I believe Darlene to a degree, as well. I think

NARALO really should take pride of it and I believe Judith really took this on as a really core idea. One thing about Judith is she's really purposeful in what she does and she's taken on this task with real good diligence. So I really give her a lot of credit. So, Garth.

GARTH BRUEN:

A lot of this really came out of a simple curiosity when we met in Toronto several years ago and we were trying to figure out who wasn't at the table. We realized that the disabled community was not part of the discussion. I was very curious about how blind people experience the Internet. How do they use it? How does it serve them?

In actually conducting research, one of the things that came up was that the Internet actually owes a lot to a deaf developer named Ken Harenstein, who was instrumental in creating this text based communications system, because he could not use a telephone. This kind of history is completely lost, and we need to bring it back. We need to put it in the spotlight.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Thank you so much, Garth. Back to you on a question on that. You mentioned this gentleman once before as a main speaker, and I think the whole idea is to elevate this idea within the

ICANN ecospace. I think you mentioned him as a speaker to be at one of the ICANN – I wonder if this is something we should bring back up again as a speaker within the next ICANN meeting in North America.

GARTH BRUEN:

Yes. Absolutely. I'm still in contact with him regularly, and he has a relationship with Google. So I think I could probably get his attention because he's looking for interesting projects. So I think there's a chance there.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Sylvia, would you mind putting that as an action item, please, that follow-up with Garth on Ken Harenstein? We'll get the spelling corrected in a minute. Thank you. Back to the next slide, please.

The next project is the e-book project. Myself and Maureen really took this on, and we looked at where we can convert some of the existing material. As you know, if you look at any of the material that's done in slide shows and stuff, none of it's hyperlinked. There's no audio files. There's no video files. We researched a lot of different platforms. The At-Large Working Group Part 1 and Part 2 which were webinars that were done by the – in the capacity building webinar sessions, very few people

attend those meetings, and the idea of the e-book of the actual sessions was to give it sort of a life after the webinar. So we've converted to these and you can read them on any tablet.

But one of the things in addition of the nine e-books that we produced: we also did a book on how to create an e-book. So that is every tool that you would need to create it.

Now, I purchased the software. We're still trying to get the unlimited software license from the budget in and there's been back and forth on that. So as an action item we still need to get this resolved in terms of purchasing and providing to the wider community on how they can actually convert any of their material into an e-book. Heidi and I have been chatting back and forth on that. But you can talk to Maureen or myself. It's a phenomenal platform, really nice layout.

So what we did is took the notes, the slide show, and actually produced the book, based on the entire presentation. As you know, the slides are only about 30% of what the presentations are. It's the dialog, the questions, the back and forth. So it includes not only the e-book, but it also did the Q and A at the end. I'll make sure all of you have a link to each of the links to the thing.

We have just been joined by my esteemed colleague, who got lost. So if we can turn back to the last slide please. We're going

to turn back to the captioning slide show. Yeah, just one before.
Okay. Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. Judith Hellerstein from ICANN. Sorry. This complex is extremely difficult. They have rooms in all these corners, so I apologize for being late. I had gotten lost for a while.

As you recall in the FY16 special budget request, we did approve for a pilot for real-time captioning. What our goal is is to increase engagement within At-Large of people who have accessibility challenges or special needs or any specific needs.

We're looking also to get people in our region who come from either rural areas or come from areas where bandwidth is extremely limited, and youth, places in schools or others trying to get increased engagement. Also for people whose native language is not English – we have a lot of Hispanics, Puerto Ricans, others who are or who are learning about it who are coming in from other countries and now living in the US – and we want to increase their engagement within ICANN. So our goal was to work on different ways that we can increase engagement.

This year we have the pilot and we put it in for Fiscal Year 2017 to continue the pilot in English, but also to expand it to cover

French and Spanish, since we've had a couple requests from there for that. So we're looking at doing that.

We discussed/started late, so we had in February one meeting. There was a meeting that was supposed to be a webinar that was supposed to be in February. It got moved to the end of March since the APRALO group who is doing it all went to their RIR meeting with APRICOT and so they couldn't hold it in the February time slot, so they're holding it in March so that we have two more months for this pilot. It's going to be in April or May.

And so what we would like is, if you have some meetings that you would like to be on the pilot, is for you to send a note to us or to staff and we could add it to the list and then on the captioning page – which I don't have it right now, but we could put that in the chat – where the criteria are and how you can apply to be in the pilot for your meetings to get covered.

Right now, it's specifically At-Large, but we're hoping that with the necessary metrics we'll get, we can show a need for this for the entire ICANN community. We've gotten metrics already from one meeting which were very helpful because there were a lot of audio challenges during that meeting, but we were able to keep people being engaged because of the caption that was running.

So this is what I think is going to be very helpful to get everyone engaged and keep everyone making sure that they can participate within ICANN.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

I've put some links in the Adobe chat on some of the books. That's a screen capture of the At-Large Working Group. So I'm not sure if it's possible if we can click on any of those links I gave you. I just want to show you a couple of pages. Not this link, but if you go to the Adobe you'll see some links I boardred on the chat.

Some of the books I took , like "Learn About At-Large: A Beginner's Guide," I converted that into an e-book. There's other books, other ALS guides, and for the IANA functions, the IANA Beginner's Guide, the At-Large TTF e-book. Then I have Alfredo's slide show. I believe it's the very first one. That's on the Internet Day that Eduardo and the very first link I gave you –

EDUARDO DIAZ:

This is not for the Internet Day. Most of that are the presentations we had for an event that we had in February and more of the Internet, which, you know –

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Yes. This will be fine. So thank you.

Okay, so if you just click on the arrows on the right you can download the file, but I just want to show you – or on the upper right hand side. Yes. So you see it keeps the pdf format and you can scroll through the – you can just go through quickly. Visually it's very appealing. You can set the languages on it. Any of the blue is links that you can go right from the page directly. So this was a very simple process, taking the PowerPoint presentation and converting it over. Okay. Thank you.

Okay, so if anyone's really interested in how to create an e-book, the other link I gave you is "Convert Your Content to an e-Book." That's one of the links that I've provided. But feel free to contact me.

Moving along. It's 11:34, and welcome, Alan. Alan has joined our group as well. Can we go back to the slide please?

Okay. So next: "Planning for FY17." Okay, so we have a few things on the agenda. We asked for some funding, and perhaps staff can give us an update on where that stands. A General Assembly. I'll go back to Judith on the sequel on Captioning: Version 2 that she'll talk about that. "Tribal Ambassadorship." And then the other things for which is not a financial issue is the election. Based on history, the nominations open on April 11th.

Perhaps if anyone could give us an update on the finances, that'd be great.

Are we financed for the General Assembly and Captioning and Tribal Ambassadorship? I know they went through the Finance Committee and I guess I assume now it goes to ICANN Finance to see if it's approved?

SYLVIA VIVANCO: Correct. Yes. The request have been submitted to the Finance ICANN Controller.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Sylvia, could you also find out if, for some reason it gets moved out of region – or maybe what we may want to emphasize if it's possible is to keep the ICANN meeting in October in the region. This is very important, one, for General Assembly, and also, two, because the NextGen Program is very tied to the region. This is our only ability to get fellows to work with us and grow NARALO, and we've been working – I know Eduardo and Alfredo have been doing a lot of work in universities, Puerto Rico and other groups have been doing work with outreach to universities. So it's really important that we keep the meeting in the region and we can understand that maybe things that have to be moved out of Puerto Rico. But if we can keep it in region, one, we could

have our General Assembly, and, two, we can get our Fellowships.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, Alan. Go ahead.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. First of all, apologies for being late. I was asked to speak at the AFRALO/AFRICANN meeting and I had to do that first before coming here.

I'm not privy to any secret information on what's happening with meeting schedules, but we are talking about a C meeting, which is a large meeting, and there are clearly strong limitations as to where it can be held and where you can schedule a meeting on short notice of that size and magnitude, including hotel rooms.

I know there is awareness in meeting staff of the desire to keep it within region, not just for these reasons but for the whole cycle of reasons. Of course, then we also have to worry how do we go back to Puerto Rico if, indeed we move it from there, within a reasonable amount of time.

So there's arguments for and against staying in the region. If we go out of the region we can then come back to Puerto Rico a

year later or something, like we did with Marrakech. On the other hand, the disadvantages certainly are well-known both to us and to the meeting staff. So cross your fingers and hope that some solution is found.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Alan, what will happen to our General Assembly if we do get it approved in the FY 17 budget? What will happen if they move it out of region?

ALAN GREENBERG: My crystal ball is very hazy. We will be meeting with Finance staff and that's a dandy question to ask. But I will point out that in parallel we are asking for multi-year budgeting to make sure that we can have the five General Assemblies we need between Summits within the three-year period.

So I'm assuming if it moves out of region we will be doing everything possible to try to have another meeting in region in the same time. But do remember that the GA we didn't hold last year was not scheduled to be at an ICANN meeting. So although there are strong advantages to being at an ICANN meeting, there may be other options also as well that we can look at should the meeting disappear. And at this point, it hasn't been cancelled.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Exactly.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I'm chairing the meeting.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: One point. Exactly, but I just wanted to make our things known and that we gave it up last year for EURALO.

ALAN GREENBERG: We have a very strong argument for not being ignored this year. Let's put it that way.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, Judith, if you it because since I'm Chair of the meeting, you're more than welcome to Chair it if you want to. But just for the sake of the listeners offline, they may think we have a conflict and we never have a conflict.

I'd like to turn to Eduardo because this General Assembly thing in San Jose is so important and they've done so much work leading up to this in terms of outreach for the NextGen and new fellows. It is so important that all of us should realize the work they've done. Thank you, Judith, for alluding to it, but I want to turn to Eduardo to give a little detail on how much work actually has been done.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

Last year we did plan for this year, so one of the things that we had planned to do, or we are planning to do during this year, and we started in February, was we started talking about Internet and the ecosystem, so people start to understand all these organizations and so so so so, and then we end up with ICANN. In this meeting that we had in February we were able to get add in somebody from ARIN to come down and somebody from ISOC to come down. We couldn't get ICANN to come down to talk so I did my talk.

But basically it was like a starting point. We have another event going on in May. We're going to gather our membership and it's going to be [another] working event and we're going to talk about, again, about ecosystem a little bit more.

The whole thing that we're doing throughout the year is so if we get ICANN at the end of the year, people can get to the ICANN meeting knowing more than getting there and saying, "So what?" So I'm reaching in the meantime organizations that – like there's some organizations called the –IT Cluster. They have like 700 members of all different type of companies that develop software in Puerto Rico. So I asked them to go to the Board of Directors meeting to talk about ICANN. In fact, I wanted to talk to them to become an ALS eventually. They're a non-profit

organization. And [also] there are other organizations – women organizations that develop and help women in Puerto Rico to become entrepreneurs, so they do that type of thing. I’m reaching to them just, again, to go there and talk to them and invite them to come to ICANN. And that’s what we are doing in the meantime when we have this event.

There’s another event happening in August. I don’t remember where it is, but that is one in June that’s to do with education and we’re planning to be there talking about this again. And then in Puerto Rico last year we did the first Internet Day, which was October 29th which is the same day that the ICANN meeting starts. So this year we want to do something at the same time, probably in the ICANN meeting or outside the ICANN meeting. Really, this is an event that the government of Puerto Rico recognizes the Internet Day, so we have an official day of the Internet Day. And there are many organizations that participates in this event virtually. They don’t actually have to do it there. We have a competition for videos, kids sending us videos of why they like the Internet, and things like that. It’s fun. It’s going to be fun.

So we already started planning for that event. If ICANN doesn’t come, then we’re going to continue doing it, but with a probably different focus. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Yeah. Thank you so much. I think we can't underestimate the incredible work that ISOC Puerto Rico has done, and it shows that our long-term planning, that our RALO is doing in order to reach out – and this is done without any money. We're not bussing people in across the country. We're working with our local people, with local contacts, and keeping this cost-effective. I do express concern that it's going to be going to another location, but I do understand that mosquitos do fly across the Caribbean. So I'm assuming that Puerto Rico would probably be cancelled as well, despite what Garth has mentioned. We have West Nile disease and encephalitis and you can think of the disease of the week to cancel one.

Okay, so we got roughly 20 minutes left. We're on schedule. Going on, I just want to mention that the Tribal Ambassadorship, if it goes on, has been something we've been championing for a long time on indigenous participation. It's been a really, really hard slug trying to get ICANN realizing that the First Nations should be treated the same way as the 900 Fellows that have been treated from developing countries. We finally have one location that will be actually sponsored, and Loris Taylor will be working on that.

Elections. I just want to mention a couple of things. We just opened up the pages this morning, thanks to Sylvia helping me with the proper link. So we'll be adding that page. The nominations will be open on April 11th, but the page will be fixed today for the 16th on who is available. We had one question on the election and perhaps Alan, you could help us on this one is. Is the NomCom position a two-year period? Because I know it was an idea before. Is it a two-year stint now? That Eduardo would have it or he has to go for election again?"

ALAN GREENBERG:

The NomCom delegate? Those are done annually. So although there is a two year limit – a two contiguous year limit – he doesn't need to do it, and we obviously don't need to select him. But it is potentially a two-year consecutive.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Great. Thank you. Okay, we'll put that in the minutes for the document.

Okay, so I want to move to the next one – “CROPP Trips FY17.” As you can see there, September 1st to June 31st. We're pretty good on getting our applications in. They really want eight weeks. I'll tell you, everyone comes back to me with problems with constituency travel on this. Whether it's a hotel, whether it's the

flights, whether it's the stipend, we have problems. It's an issue and I know the next slide is the issues, but I'm just pointing out that an issue is we can't do anything in July and August because if we want to do something it doesn't work. And I'm sure other constituencies have this issue as well. But Tom has expressed interest already, and I think Tom told me which event that is in Pittsburgh.

SYLVIA VIVANCO: [inaudible] the City Networks [inaudible]

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes. City Networks – National League of Cities in Pittsburgh in November. I'm corrected. That's the only one that we would have in the process. I'm a little concerned about the timing stuff, so it was suggested by, I believe Eduardo, that we meet with Robert and Dev to talk about some of the issues on CROPP. Okay.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. We also signed a MOU of our end and we wanted to use one of the CROPP – ARIN has scholarships. The idea originally was that we would have a [inaudible] liaison from NARALO to ARIN. Unfortunately, after talking to ARIN, they're very concerned about perceptions and how it would be perceived if they were

favoring NARALO, even though we have a signed a MOU with them.

So what they did is they expanded the Fellowships from three to five, but we have no preference in the fellowships. So we wanted to use one of our CROPP slots for that, and we reserved it. But the problem we found is that ARIN covers two regions. It covers some of LACRALO and some of NARALO, and our request to go to ARIN was denied in CROPP because it's out of region. So we also want to take that up with Chris Mondini from Global Stakeholder on how we go about getting exceptions, because in our research we found other regions have the same issue and were able to get exceptions to go to those events. So we are looking at that as well.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. That was half of what I [inaudible]. You said the funding starts for September. Why is July and August ruled out in your mind? I'll tell you, this is a leading question, but please answer.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

I can't answer that. All I can say is, when I brought up issues in July and August, it's out of scope. They don't get things kicked

into. It's not clear, it's not written, I don't see that, but I'm just told that anecdotally.

ALAN GREENBERG: I would suggest on both issues that we need to escalate. I think you want to do it through the ALAC with the power of the ALAC, for whatever that might be worth, and not just NARALO. These are both really relevant issues and we need some clarity. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. Sylvia, would you action item that, that we take it up one more notch?

Okay folks, let's move on. We have five minutes each now on issues and other business. Okay. I just want to mention if – regardless where it is, whether it's in San Jose or Vancouver, or wherever this General Assembly is, if it's in region in October, I actually want to have a discussion on our theme. Any good conference, any General – this is the time to start thinking about what our theme is, what we want to accomplish at the General Assembly, and looking back, what did we accomplish on last ones?

So I want to open up the floor to what our theme is and what do we want to accomplish, because it's going to hopefully bring

those 26 ALSs to our event. And one of the very minor things is a straw vote on the social event.

Last night – I don't know where the money came from – but, my gosh, that was an incredible event. I was very envious, but I can only imagine the time to do it and the money to do it. Maybe the King is a nice guy, but I'll tell you that was just an amazing, amazing, amazing, event. I don't think we could even come close to it. So a small, intimate cocktail party like EURALO did, is my personal view. But I want to open up the floor.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

The [inaudible] night, that was like a gala. But the presentation that was happening in the front, only people in the front were watching it. The rest of the people were networking. I would have done something different.

ALAN GREENBERG:

In terms of the spread and both the availability of liquor and the food and the quality of the food and the volume of the food, it surpassed most galas that I've been at. I have no clue where the money came from. My candid answer is: don't count on it being replicated real soon. I think the farewell to Fadi provided access to something outside of our normal range, and I don't know to what extent it was sponsored or if ICANN provided the money.

Perhaps I should as Chair, but I don't. And I wouldn't put the odds really high on seeing it at every meeting.

GARTH BRUEN: It's interesting to see the progression of events. Whereas the Showcase used to be just very important at At-Large, it seems to be increasingly more and more important to ICANN in general. I think that's a positive step. What Steve Crocker said about us, and also in the public forum, was really nice.

I am concerned, however – and Fadi has to have his moment – but now we had the CEO was number one and then the regional celebration was number two on an agenda, and the whole point, I thought, of a Showcase was to showcase a region.

ALAN GREENBERG: In fairness, I do believe that was a decision of AFRALO, for whatever reason and for better or worse.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Alan and I were at the original Leaders' meeting on Friday night. and I had to acknowledge Aziz. But also Alberto's speech in English was amazing as well. I don't think Aziz sleeps. I don't know. Maybe he has a doppelganger. I just don't understand how this guy did it, and he's put the watermark so high that,

whatever we do, we can't reach it. It is just astounding; the effort. And they are also doing these NGO meetings every morning at 8:00. My God, they are doing incredible stuff. Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. And I also wanted to compliment Aziz, too, because I also heard that he's also helped arrange some little visits by different RALOs to different sites. I know APRALO said that Aziz was extremely helpful in organizing some activities for them as well that were off-site. So he's sort of gone above and beyond.

ALAN GREENBERG: We've had At-Large people involved in the organizing of meetings before. We have never had someone be the organizer like this. So he deserves a lot of credit and, certainly, he alone in doing this has increased the visibility of At-Large, and therefore all of the RALOs to an extent that probably wouldn't have been possible without it. But you're right. I don't know where he gets his energy and I've known him long enough that I know he's not a kid.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. We talked about, I assume based on straw vote, that we're all sort of inclined to look towards a cocktail party vs. a Showcase? Is that the gist of this conversation then? Because it's

going to be impossible to replicate that Showcase based on energy and time and money.

London, as Judith is saying to me, was good. But I'll tell you, because I organized that, that that was an incredible amount of work. So I'm hesitant unless somebody wants to stand up and say, "Yes, I want to volunteer on that," the concept right now is: we have a General Assembly coming up. What is the theme? What do you want to accomplish? What's the goal? So I want to have a few minutes' discussion on the General Assembly.

EDUARDO DIAZ: You want us to think about that now, or can we submit ideas for later?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I think if you have any ideas right now, then talk about them. But if you want to think about it, just think about how we can find a theme that would work well. I think one of the problems here is that we don't know exactly where it is. That also usually impacts on the theme. So maybe we have to try to think of a theme that can be done in different places.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, so I have no idea on what was accomplished in the other General Assemblies, and I'm going to lean on you guys who were at the last NARALO General Assembly. What was accomplished? Was it similar to the EURALO General Assembly? Is there any guidance you can give to us so we can start thinking through the process in organizing the –

SYLVIA VIVANCO: [inaudible] similar to London.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: No. Sorry, my opinion is I don't want to replicate ATLAS II. That was sort of artificial questions and it ended up creating a whole bunch of resolutions that everybody disappeared.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: No, but I wanted to comment on what Glenn was saying, is that we're not – staff looks at the ATLAS II as being five General Assemblies, and what we want to focus on is not that, what happened at the last NARALO General Assembly alone. Not ones that are combined with ATLAS.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I think, sorry, the three of you were at the last General Assembly, right? The one in Toronto was the General Assembly? Correct me if I'm wrong.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, so maybe, Garth, I'll lean on you to talk about what did you achieve? How did you organize it? Is there things you learned from the experience? I haven't read a report on that so ...

GARTH BRUEN: You're asking me about the Toronto one? How I organized it. There was a gentleman named Glenn McKnight who did about 99% of the work. He lives in the area of Toronto and he was extremely resourceful and useful in terms of organizing. But that was also the anniversary of the RALO – no, it was the anniversary of NARALO in particular, I believe, and so it was kind of a double celebration. We cut a cake with Olivier, who was the Chair at that point, and we were celebrating something.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I think it's 10 years, right? Coming up? The 10 years is coming up in October? I saw a picture of the original people who signed the agreement and I was hoping that's one of the things we want to do: try as many people – in fact, Eduardo, you were in that

picture, right? The original signing? And Evan was there. Darlene was there. So we'd like to get as many people again to recreate that picture. Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG:

Nine years, because 2007, I believe, in the Puerto Rico meeting.

The world is changing. Certainly the world of At-Large is changing, and how we're looking at both the Summits and Gas is changing. I'm not sure we want to try to replicate what happened in Toronto. I think we really want to think about how can we use the gathering of the people to do something effective and, moreover, to try to make sure that it's something which can be contained in the next few years when they're not seeing each other face to face. We really have to use those gatherings as more than just, forgive me, a party and meeting old friends, and using it as a way to kick start the work we're doing offline. I have no real ideas on how to do that, but I think that has to be part of our motivation.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Exactly my point, Ala. Not to be negative on ATLAS II, but we had these high lofty goals and coming up with some abstract recommendations that we had to come up with, implementation strategies. This needs to be more tangible.

What are the issues in our community? How do we move forward? How do we motivate our ALSs to be giving policy, getting involved with Working Groups, getting active, and reaching out? So we need to think this through, so we need to see maybe work in small groups, and then each of the groups come back with some ideas and we capture those ideas.

But I'm hoping that we all are on the same page on the theme. We'll just have to – it gets back to finance. So, Alan, any idea when we'll get the green light and we can start planning this event?

ALAN GREENBERG:

We can start planning it now. We just don't know for absolute sure – I feel very awkward talking about Puerto Rico and whether we're going to be there with Eduardo here as if it was a completely dispassionate issue. It's not at all. I'm assuming that if a decision is made to move, we're going to have to make that decision moderately soon, and I would presume that it would either be at this meeting, or the Board has a retreat in Amsterdam some time or other – I don't remember exactly when – and that it will have to be done by then.

So I'm hoping we'll hear an announcement moderately soon. It's a difficult decision to make, but some time we have to make a decision. I suspect it's contingent on being sure they have an

alternate place. Now, it's not unheard of to cancel one meeting and then try to figure out where we're going, but it would be nice to not do it in that order.

So I'm hoping within weeks, maybe days. But I don't have a real clue.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

I was talking to some of the people in the meetings staff and they said that once they finish with Morocco – they're very busy – then they will look into that. My feeling is that it will be in less than four weeks. Because they said that we were supposed to be here last year, and because of the Ebola thing they got cancelled. So moving a meeting of this size is not simple, because there are contracts in place and things that happen. So it's not only that but it's where to put it because it's a big meeting. It's not that. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Sorry, it looks like it's 12:02. We started a couple minutes late and no one's knocking down the doors, but –

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

[inaudible] can't figure out where it is.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: People are coming in. Okay. I just wanted to circle back to an item that started this meeting. We deviated from the agenda. Harold I asked to join us. He gave a report on the raid of the ICANN Hub. It was not an attack on ICANN, but it was an attack on our liberties .I really am upset about it. I'm upset about that we have to have a strong statement, that we protest that. So I don't know, Alan, if you can escalate it to an ALAC statement on this issue. Do you have any comments on that?

ALAN GREENBERG: I just read about it today, and my impression from the very brief reading I did was that it was a raid on the university and the Hub was just essentially peripheral damage because they happened to be there. I don't think it was at all connected with that, but if I'm wrong, please enlighten me.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: It's not directly connected to ICANN. What I think what we're trying to say is that it's a freedom of speech issue, and that we can understand that it may have closed down, but it should not be closed down for – it should be reopened as soon as possible. Or that maybe we can move the Hub to a different location so they continue engagement.

But I also want to say that I also mentioned it to Daniel Fink of the GSC saying I would like the GSC to send a letter of support, that his is a freedom of speech issue and that they're listening to these discussions and that it does not have anything to do with the political issues, and just to raise. I'm saying this is a freedom of speech issue and that we stand behind our group in there.

ALAN GREENBERG: My instinct is to say ICANN is not going to get involved in political issues in individual countries. That's my instinct. I have no control and no knowledge of this particular one. Was this a Hub we funded?

JUDITH HELLERSTEINL Yes.

ALAN GREENBERG: So certainly it would be reasonable to say: is there any chance of relocating it somewhere else and getting it re-invigorated in the limited time left? More than that, I would be surprised if ICANN will get into the political realm and freedom of speech issues. But, again, it's not my call.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Point taken. Any other business, since nobody's knocking down the doors, unless people have to get to another meeting? Anyone else?

Okay, last call. Thank you so much. Thank you, the people who were attending it remotely, and our meeting is now in conclusion. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]