

---

HELSINKI – At-Large NARALO Monthly Meeting  
Wednesday, June 29, 2016 – 13:30 to 15:00 EEST  
ICANN56 | Helsinki, Finland

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Hello, everyone. We'll be starting in a few minutes the NARALO second call in the month of June. So we'll be deviating from our normal agenda. We're just setting up. The other meeting has just completed and we'll be a few minutes. Thank you.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Good morning. It's Murray speaking. Just testing the audio [inaudible]. Yes. Thank you. I'll then [inaudible].

GORDON CHILLCOTT: I don't know for you, Murray, but I don't hear the [audio] well, the conference. If it's running I can hardly hear that.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: I think the audio is muted on the conference until they get started on the chats I'm getting from online.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Hi, Murray and Gordon. Yeah, we're just getting a couple minutes. We're just getting the slide show set up. I guess you can hear me. Just verify.

---

**Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.**

---

GORDON CHILLCOTT: I can hear you [five on five], Glenn.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: It's Murray. I hear you perfectly. Thanks, Glenn.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Perfect. Thank you, guys. Just give us a second. We'll do rollcall and you should be able to see in the Adobe room pretty soon the agenda and the slideshow that we're doing. So just give us one more second. We'll do the roll call and get right into the meeting.

GORDON CHILLCOTT: Perfect.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thanks for waiting.

Thanks for waiting. We'll do the roll –

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible]

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Sure. Okay. We shall start with the names that are at our table. If you're seeing – you know what? We don't have a camera in this room. I just thought of it.

One the left, we have, as a guest, Jason Hynds from ISOC –

JASON HYNDS: Barbados.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Barbados. Next to him is our illustrious ALAC member, Tim Denton, a man around time. Next is Garth Bruen, also an ALAC representative. Beside me is Judith Hellerstein, and there's myself, Glenn McKnight as Chair. On my right is Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff, and sorry, sir, I don't know your name.

OZAN SAHIN: Ozan Sahin, ICANN staff.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. And then we have –

YESIM NAZLAR: Yesim Nazlar, ICANN staff.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: And we have a guest, also, which is a gentleman from Washington, D.C. If you want to just introduce yourself.

ENDRIAS ZEWEDE: Endrias Zewde.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Thank you all for coming. Our agenda today is, as you'll see in the slideshow in a minute – this is our second meeting that we've had in the month of June. We will not have a meeting in July. Correct? Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Mm-hmm.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: This is to level set what we've done in the last six months. We are asking for community feedback on what we're doing right and what we're doing wrong. So, through the slideshow, we're going to be asking everyone's opinion and get a barometer from people online as well.

Before I start, is there anyone on Adigo? Because I'm not going to be able to see your hand? Anyone from Adigo? Anybody dialed in for the call? Or strictly by Adobe?

---

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible] Gordon, Narine –

MURRAY MCKERCHER: I'm on both, Glenn. This is Murray speaking.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Guys, if you're just on the phone or in transit, you'll just have to interrupt. I won't be able to see you waving your phone in your car. But we'll make sure that we give you ample time for this call as well.

Okay. Welcome to the call. If we can go through the slides. Actually, before I start, Judith, did you have anything to say?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: No. Welcome, all. Sorry about the time zone issues for people in the U.S., but we welcome you and you can review the call later on.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Great. Thank you, Judith. Okay. We've covered the welcome and our purpose of this call. As I stated, it's to give you some sense of what we've accomplished in the last six months. We're looking to your guidance on moving forward for the balance of the year.

---

We want to talk about our in-reach and engagement strategies, our outreach overview, what we've done with our CROPP program – in particular, the changes with the CROPP FY17 strategic plan – what trips have been already scheduled, what is still remaining, and, lastly, the outreach gap analysis. In addition to the agenda today, we have a special presentation by Garth Bruen.

Okay. So we can move to the first one. Okay. As I stated, the purpose of the face-to-face – our big orange blob there, and there's a tiny little dot there for Puerto Rico – is midterm analysis. What did we do right? What did we do wrong? What is the membership? All of you are members of NARLO.

So [we want] to get your feedback because this is critical because we're going to leading up to our General Assembly. Our General Assembly is going to be at ARIN the first week of April 2017. It's going to be an exciting meeting, and Tim is actually is a Board member – right? – with ARIN. If you're not aware of ARIN or you've never been to an ARIN session before, Tim's your man to talk about ARIN.

TIM DENTON:

It's exceedingly dull and focuses on number policy. For that reason, it's focused and works. But exciting it is not.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Sounds like the meeting we had at 8:00 this morning. Okay. ARIN does not have a monopoly on boring stuff, let me tell you.

Okay, onto the next slide, please. Okay. Let's talk about our in-reach strategy. Okay. Engagement. We've analyzed our NARALO monthly attendance, starting off with when we took over the reins as Secretariat and Chair. We only had 54% of our ALSes attending calls, and that was a real issue for us because how do you engage your community if people don't come to the calls?

We requested, throughout the last six months, to have French and Spanish translation, asking the –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Are you attending another meeting as well?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: No, no. I was trying to open up to see the chatroom and I got the other meeting.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Oh, I see. Thank you. So we requested French and Spanish translation, and we managed to get enough members of the Francophones that were requested. We do not have Spanish translation on our monthly calls.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Interpretation.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Interpretation.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Right. That's what I was going to say.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes, sorry. Interpretation. So starting in May, we started our French translation –

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Interpretation.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Interpretation. I'm sure that's one of the things you've fixed on the slide when you got the slides ready.



---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:        Yeah.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:        Thank you. We made a deliberate effort – and I know this is not the style of other RALOs – and actually went out of our way to phone, e-mail, and repeat phone calls to the inactive organizations. We found a number of them that were not active. In fact, we had to move towards the process of decertification.

Did you want to talk about that, Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:        Sure. But, also, before we go into the decertification, one of the problems we’ve been noticing with a lot of our ALSes is that they are very confused about how to get involved in the RALO. So a lot of them haven’t been participating because they weren’t really sure how to get involved.

We worked with them, and then also to figured out: “Okay. If you cannot come to a meeting, who else in your ALS can attend on your behalf?” That way, they could all then communicate back between other people and see – some of the ones that we contacted got more engaged and have started coming to the meetings.

---

So they have now reengaged, while we've found that some of the organizations did not exist anymore, or the goals of the organization had shifted and they're no longer covering ICANN issues anymore, or that the person who had been doing it has moved onto other places. So we worked hard to figure out, with the organization, whether ALS, whether they were still interested in it, if they could assign someone, if they could assign someone else, and if they're not interested, to tell us that they were not interested.

With several of them we went through the decertification process, where we documented what they told us, and they we went through to decertify the organizations, since our goal here is: how do we increase engagement from the ALSes that we have? How do we get them more active? How do we get them to be on committees? How do we get them to attend calls? How do we get them to just get involvement?

Glenn and I are going to be doing some more series. We've been talking to each of them individually and figuring out what works for them. We're going to be doing some more calls and also orientation sessions because, oftentimes, people change and the person who had gotten the orientation has left, so the new person doesn't have the orientation and has trouble reporting back to the ALS. And they haven't been doing that.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Right. Okay. Right. Thank you. For the record, Alan Greenberg, our Chair of ALAC, has arrived as well and joined us.

The other point on the slideshow is that we went from that inactive participation on the calls to 20.6% attendance. So somebody was there partly in spirit and not in mind, but rather than just 21.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: That's [inaudible] too.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: One of the other engagement strategies is a communications strategy, and Eduardo has done a super job. I'm not sure if you're able to pull up the newsletter, but if you haven't seen the newsletter, he's doing it in Constant Contact. He's always asking for people to send their pictures, what you're doing. He's doing a fantastic job, and I think it's a good model for the other RALOs to copy. I know we've been helping other people, particularly Daniel, who wants to do a newsletter, and we're encouraging him to follow the template that's been created.

Jason, you have a question?

---

JASON HYNDS: Thanks. More of a comment. I like what Judith was explaining about orienting the inactive participants. I think that maybe other RALOs need to follow a similar strategy after not doing it.

I struggle to find ways to keep some of the Barbadian ALSes engaged and communicating back to them what At-Large is in ICANN. So I hope that I can get some tips from you all. Thanks.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Judith, did you want to respond to Jason on what he was saying?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Sure. Yeah, that is what we've been hearing from a lot of our RALOs – the same thing – they would like to get more involved. They just didn't know how. It's the same thing as we'll talk about with the CROPP is a lot of them had not known what the CROPP is or were confused about how the program is and what the timelines were. A lot of the information is that – one, they don't know how to get involved. We tell them about working groups, but a lot of them need more spoon-feeding about how we do it.

Also, plainly: "How do I get a confluence account? How do I learn how to use the confluence? How do I go on the wiki?" Some of the basic stuff is what they were lacking, as well.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Great. The Chair would like to recognize Alan Greenberg. He's got a section.

ALAN GREENBERG: Yeah. Thank you. One of the concerns that I've become aware of – I admit it's a new one that wasn't raised – if you recall a little while ago, we did a survey to try to find out what skills our ALSes had, and we in fact sent the survey to our representatives and found out what skills and professions the representatives had. But it didn't really tell us much about the ALS itself.

It dawned on me at that point that we tend to equate the ALS, which in theory has 10, 20, 200, 400, or 1,000 members, with the representative. We talk about: do the ALSes participate in our mailing lists? And I realized – because we don't know who your members are, and it's not clear we have the right to ask – I'm not even sure we'd recognize if one of your members was actively participating and whether we would know who they are, what ALS they're from, or anything else.

Again, it's not clear that we're ever going to have a database of all the members of all of the ALSes. I'm not sure we want it. I'm not sure, legally, there are some issues associated with it.

---

But somehow we have to start thinking about the ALS as a group and not the representative. I guess I'm looking for input from ALSes as to what we need to do to get some of your members involved, not just the formal representatives.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes.

ALAN GREENBERG: I think that's our challenge.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Alan, thanks so much. The whole thing is that we're trying to now encourage more people within each ALS to apply for a confluence account. If we open up and get a lot of different ALSes and members within ALSes to apply for a confluence account, we'll have a better idea – or staff, I assume, will have a better idea – for granting them access, who these people are, because the more people in an ALS that apply – because I'm assuming when you fill out and send in the request and they say which ALSes they're from and their name, then we can assign that and we can have a better idea of how we're pushing increased engagement within each ALS.

Oh, and Jason has a question as well.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I know. I know. Before Jason – and Alan, I know you’re going to respond – Murray has been waiting longer. So I’m going to turn to Murray, and then I’ll go back to Alan, then to Jason. Thank you.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Just a comment. Alan came – I coldheartedly agree with comments on engaging not necessarily representative of people within there.

I’m just wondering if the At-Large website is a really good entry point, more than the confluence wiki. It’s a good stepping stone before you get into more challenging user interfaces. So I just wanted to make that point. Thanks.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I’m sorry, Murray. It was a little hard to understand you. Would you just summarize that again?

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Okay. I was just mentioning that Alan’s point was very good, and I’m suggesting that maybe an entry point for members of ALSes would be through our new website, rather than jumping directly into the confluence section.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. I'm going to let Alan respond. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: It's more of a question than a response. I'm not sure why people need a confluence ID to get involved. At one point, I know we shut down commenting because of spam and things like that. I thought we opened it back up. So, nope, we haven't. Then we need to consider that.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible].

ALAN GREENBERG: All right. We need to think about that because clearly, if we were successful, we're never going to be able to gear for that any confluence accounts. So we need to think about the process and find a better way of doing it, I think, if we can't open it up.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. No one else online, but Jason has another comment.

JASON HYNDS: Sorry to be such a chatty guest, but going on what you said about the ALSes and more people from the ALSes beyond the



---

representative having an account, I've been constantly thinking about how we have more resources for the ALS – I don't have a solution – so that not just the representative alone is kept abreast of the communication, and how we make it easier for that ALS representative to communicate that to multiple people in his constituency, because I've observed in my local situation the loss of representatives, either due to elections, or unfortunately due to death. It breaks the continuity of participation from that ALS, and I feel that, if there were more resources for others to be oriented and kept abreast of what's happening within the RALOs and At-Large, it would help with that session.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Thank you. I believe Andrew came a little later than the introductions, but, everyone, Andrew Mack is Washington-based. We also have the VP for North America. Chris Mondini has joined us as well.

Okay. I'd like to just go through the next couple of slides on the same topic of in-reach and engagement strategy. So if we can go to the next slide, please. Okay. That shows you graphically what the attendance has been like. December was a little lower, which is normal, but we've had pretty consistent attendance. I think probably higher than the average RALO in terms of the calls. I

---

think we never have enough time to do the calls because there's so much to be covered, but a couple of the changes on the calls, we've really pushed up. One element is to ask the community what they're doing. That really should segue into our newsletter, as well. The whole purpose of people [from] our ALSes telling everyone what they're doing is for people to get to know each other more and more leading up to our General Assembly, which will be in April.

Next slide. This is an incredible stat. The last election we had. It had a 97% success rate in terms of reaching out to our ALSes to vote. We had a remarkable turnout. I think that's way above your average. If the [Brexit] had that kind of stats, they probably would have stayed in the EU.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes, indeed. Any comments? Judith, no? Next slide.

Let's talk about our outreach strategy. Unfortunately, because of this mosquito, we're going to be in Hyderabad, but we're working very hard, particularly Alfredo Calderon and Eduardo Diaz, in outreach to the universities. Very similar to what they successfully did in Marrakech with Aziz and others to get as

---

many students involved which are outside of the Fellows and outside of the NextGen, but as particularly newcomers to get to the Puerto Rico meeting. Eduardo and myself met with Tom yesterday, and he promised that there would be two meetings in our region, one in Panama and one in Puerto Rico, fairly soon. Not tomorrow, but we hopefully will catch up on and continue the momentum that we did.

We used all our FY16 CROPP trips, and they were all utilized. They were part of our strategic plan, which we reached out. I attended the NTEN, which is 1.2 million not-for-profits in the U.S. and 160,000 in Canada. This was attended by 3,300 not-for-profit technology experts, and this year was in San Jose. Next year, it's going to be in Washington in your backyard. For two groups to reach out to, particularly because there was indigenous groups that were speaking at the event the previous years. Unfortunately, they were not there this year. Also, the disabled community, so people with disabilities.

The SSIG was attended by Alfredo Calderon. He did a fantastic job on reporting on that. That's the Southern School of Internet Governance. It's the eighth year it's been done. Jason had a hub from Barbados. I remember his questions during –

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Le-Marie did. [inaudible].

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes, it's probably there but it's probably underneath. Do you want to talk about [inaudible]?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. Le-Marie Thompson, one of our [other] reps from Capital Area Globetrotters, attended a GLOBE conference in Vancouver. It focused a lot on entrepreneurs. She wrote a blog post about it, as well as some pictures. What we're trying to do and what Glenn is going to be also talking about is trying to encourage most of our ALSes to take one of these trips and not necessarily have duplications.

It's going to be our big focus for next year, is that we wanted to get new people to do this stuff. We don't want the same people going back to the same events. We want to look at new events, and GLOBE was a new one we haven't looked at in engagement, as well as all these. We're not going to go back to NTEN next year.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Actually, we talk about that in a few minutes. It's in the [inaudible].

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Right. We're looking and reaching out. What we'll see in the slides in the future coming up is about our fiscal 17 plan and our strategy and what our focus is going to be.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. Wrapping up, the last two other trips were FY16 eDemocracy. Dr. John Laprise attended that. The M-Enabling special needs group was again back in Washington, and that was focused on people with special needs, as well.

Let's go onto the next slide. Any comments on the CROPP? Do you think we're missing the boat on the CROPP trips, or do you have any suggestions how to make it going forward? You'll see it. We have two other spots that are open for FY17. Anything from the floor or from Adobe? Any comments, anyone?

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Hi, Glenn. Sorry, I didn't [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you, Murray. Go ahead.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: I was just curious. I've been a little bit out of the loop. Were there reports back from the people who went on the CROPP meetings

---

and some measurement of the effectiveness of those in the past? Thanks.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. It's an obligation within 30 days for someone to do a report, so all the reports, it's in the agenda, the links to each of the CROPP. I don't have the agenda right in front of me, but on the agenda, you'll see the links to each of the CROPP trips. In it is the reports provided by each of the travelers.

MURRAY MCKERCHER: Great. Thank you, Glenn.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you. Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG: One of the things Murray asked was the effectiveness. We are in a curious position here. The reports are due very soon after the trip. If you're doing outreach, you're not likely to see the results of outreach within a month after the trip or a week after the trip if you file your report quickly. What kind of work do we do or does anyone do to try to actually look at the effectiveness of the trip? Are these really helping or not? They're neat things to do,

---

and usually they're good conferences for the person to go to, but that's not why we're doing it.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Excellent point, Alan. Let's put that as an action item, Silvia, please, is that we do a three and a six month follow up with the traveler and actually find out who they actually have been following up with. If they have dropped the ball, we'll find out why.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We also may want to ask Rob Hoggarth and the CROPP team in figuring out other groups who are doing this. Are they following up? Do they have a method of checking back with three months and six months? Have they designed a form? What mechanisms are they having in following up? Maybe instead of trying to recreate the boat, maybe see what other ones other groups are doing. We can put that as an action item for Rob to find out what other groups are doing. Maybe someone already have something.

ANDREW MACK: Judith, this is Andrew. I lead the outreach part of the B.C., and we've gone through this, so I could get some information we could share with you about that. I think we'd probably both

---

benefit from comparing notes. That is most assuredly an issue. It is difficult to do the check backs on a three- and six-month basis [or] the things that [inaudible] people lose their focus on it.

What we've done is we've created a small outreach committee which meets every month or two, partly to determine what to do with CROPP funds, but also partly to make sure that we're on the right track in terms of are we being successful, does the thing have its energy, and to get new ideas in. Happy to share that.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Great. Thank you, Andrew and Alan. Those are both excellent comments. I think we have to be aware of the generosity of ICANN to the program, but we are accountable. Thank you. I want to move to the next slide, please.

We had another question. Jason, did you have something?

JASON HYNDS:

Yes. I was thinking that it sounded like that whole follow up over that long a period screamed the need for resources to allow it. I liked the idea he mentioned of the committee. I was wondering if that needs to be a RALO-specific committee, or it should be like an ALAC-level committee looking at the follow up.



---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I'm the representative on the Engagement Committee, so that could be a task that I can actually stream from here back to that major committee. That's a good idea.

We're on to the next part. This is not what the slide should look like. This is typical open-source software being converted to PowerPoint, so the first slide should say – which is obvious now – ICANN 57 has been moved from PR to India, resulting in a major loss – I've alluded to this – in the NARALO outreach that was done in San Juan, spearheaded by Eduardo Diaz and Alfredo.

We're looking at a major outreach strategy that we'll discuss with all of you, is the NARALO GA, which will be at the ARIN meeting. Originally, this would have been done during the ICANN meeting, but keeping it within region, that's what we'll be doing. That's the ARIN 33 in New Orleans in the first week in April. The original idea when we did a submission to the Finance Committee, we wanted to do it corresponding to the ARIN 31 in Montreal. That didn't work very well because about a week after, I think we all had to go to the ICANN meeting in Dublin.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We gave it to EURALO.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yeah, we were generous beyond fault in allowing EURALO to do it instead. We're now at the stage where we've met with Susan Hamlin. She's here with ARIN. We've discussed this with Tim about the relationship with ARIN. We have a MoU, and I think all of this is a great opportunity for our ALSes to learn more about ARIN, but also to do a major outreach at the ARIN event. Yes.

ALAN GREENBERG: Earlier this month, I had the privilege of attending the African Internet Summit in Gaborone in Botswana. Part of that, of course, was a day set aside for AFRINIC. I must admit I learned more that day about the addressing issues and the problems and the things that I should know about since the second N in ICANN is numbers than I have before. Although I thought meeting at an ARIN meeting was a good thing before, I'm now an unbelievable convert.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: You know what? Why don't you call Heidi and we'll go back to the General Assembly. If she can join us, that would be fantastic. We have some outstanding issues that we don't know answers on the General Assembly, so if you let her come in, we will circle around on that issue.

---

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I might know the answers if you [ask] [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Silvia?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: You know the answers?

ALAN GREENBERG: I don't know what your questions are, so I don't know if I know the answers, but I might.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: What the side discussion is going on here is how many days our travelers will be funded: three days, two nights or three nights and four days. We're looking at going in on Sunday. There's a social at ARIN, a newcomer session in the afternoon on Sunday, and then we will do two morning sessions and then a full day on the Wednesday. Here's Heidi right now. Perfect timing, Heidi. We were just talking about you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Heidi has just walked in, so she's going to give us some more clarity on General Assembly, but we're planning on, as you said, doing it [collocated] with ARIN. As Glenn says, there's a

---

newcomer orientation on Sunday. Then on Monday, we would have a session before ARIN meeting starts, so orientation. Then on Monday evening, ARIN has a newcomer social, and we would be going to that. On Tuesday, again we will have an orientation for an hour in the morning, and then doing a sponsored dinner on Tuesday. On Wednesday, we're going to have the whole day focused on the General Assembly with then flights going out that day.

It was our plan, but it's all based on the question. Because we're [collocating] with ARIN, we have a lot less funding needs than we had before because ARIN is paying for breakfast and lunch for all days of the meeting. We don't have to pay for that, and we also only need a room for one day. Since we'll have our pre-orientation meetings on site in ARIN, ARIN will give us one of their rooms because their sessions don't start until later.

We have a lot less cost, and so we are trying to figure out what is our funding that we got from the General Assemblies. Is it three nights: Sunday night, Monday night, Tuesday night? Is it four nights: Sunday night, Monday night, Tuesday night, Wednesday night? Sorry. Three nights and four days. Maybe we could figure out, since we're saving money on that one end, if we could stretch things on the other so we could have a full introduction to ARIN for that two-day meeting and then leave Wednesday for our GA so we don't have to cut in and have only a one day

---

session on ARIN. I think those are our major questions that we don't have the information on.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Thank you. Just a couple of points if we can back up a little bit, just for those who may not have heard that the fiscal requests for the Fiscal Year 17 special requests, there were requests from three RALOs for assemblies. Those came from NARALO, AFRALO, and LACRALO. Currently, where we are is that the Board has approved two assemblies. We need to first agree which RALOs are going to have General Assemblies, if not all. That's really the first step on that.

In terms of the funding and the schedule here, I'm looking and we've been working with staff on what you have proposed that you would like. It looks like it's something that we can definitely do. Where you would be arriving on the Sunday, you would be going to ARIN the Monday and Tuesday in the mornings. You would have the GAs early in the morning there and then continue with the ARIN activities in the afternoon. Then Wednesday would be a General Assembly, perhaps 8:00 to noon or so – we're still looking into that one particular aspect – and then departing later that day. We've calculated 27 At-Large Structure reps and one unaffiliated, the leader of the unaffiliated right now.

---

The request that you submitted was for a lot of capacity building activities, so we would need to work on that, on who you would like to give that capacity. Is it going to be yourselves to the At-Large Structures? Do you want experts to come in remotely, etc.? That's something we'd like to work with you, as well.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Heidi –

HEIDI ULLRICH: Just one last point on the funding. Keep in mind, when you're saying that there should be additional funding, not necessarily because normally General Assemblies are at ICANN meetings where those rooms are provided anyway. Those are not counted in the funding for a General Assembly. It's pretty much on par with what you've had in the past, just to clarify that. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much, Heidi. On the capacity building, I think what we're going to do is we're going to survey our members and see what they would like in terms of capacity building, what would be most helpful to them. Would it be most helpful to have orientation sessions, to have team building? What is it there that they want? Since we want to focus and really build up team building within there, that's what I think we would like to look at

---

from there. That can go back to them on that. That's our thoughts on that.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Any questions for anyone? Anyone online asking anything? Okay, thank you. Anything else, Heidi?

HEIDI ULLRICH: I think that is it at the moment. Again, thank you. Many thanks to Glenn and Judith for having it at the April. I know there was another ARIN in October that would have been very close to the ICANN 57 meeting, but the issue of the stress on both the community as well as staff was taken into account. That's why that's going to be in April. Thank you very much for that. Again, it allows us to have a sufficient time to plan a really useful General Assembly for everyone within the RALO.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Heidi, thanks so much. I also want to stress that I know you mentioned only two can get it, but if you recall, last year when we submitted one, we [generous] – and they offered only two – we gave up our slot for EURALO. And then the idea was that we would give it up last year and we would get it this year. So I don't really understand why does any discussions of whether we would get the GA or not since we already were going to get the

---

GA [since] gave the impression we were given last year when we gave it up was that we would get it the next year.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

We're just putting the Special Request page up onto the screen and into the chat, and I just wanted to scroll down to the – well, we're trying – scrolling down to – let's see if we can put that into the AC Room here, actually not into this one. Silvia, if you're in, could you put it in please to the chat or [inaudible] –

ALAN GREENBERG:

I'm taking off my NARALO hat and putting on my ALAC Chair hat. You are correct. There was budget for one GA last time and it was either NARALO or EURALO. You can look at it a number of ways. NARALO gave it up very generously to EURALO. On the other hand, the concept of actually getting that meeting run in Montreal was tough. So there was a lot of reasons that we wanted to be generous. It helped us a lot at that one level.

In parallel with that, there was an AFRALO request which was refused and said, "But we're going to look very favorably at it next year. No promises, but very favorably." In the interim, we are also having as most of you know, some significant problems with LACRALO which need some funds put into it one way or



---

another. So the question is, can we juggle things to somehow make them all work? And we're trying real hard.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Okay, thank you very much. I just wanted to point out that in the request from NARALO there were three points of what this General Assembly would focus on. And the first one – and you can just read, I won't read it all – but basically “How to better engage our ALSes” was theme one. The second theme was “Policy briefings on critical ICANN issues intended to ensure that NARALO ALS representatives are adequately informed.” And thirdly, “Leadership training intended to educate NARALO ALSes about the complex workings inside ICANN.”

So again, that might be the three topics that you really choose to focus on, and the details can be worked out in the next several months. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Thank you, Heidi. So let me get this correct. Don't book our tickets yet. Right? Okay.

---

HEIDI ULLRICH: Well, this is June. We're in June, 2016 and this is not taking place through April, 2017. So in the world of ICANN travel, it will not be until Spring of 2017 that they're even likely to turn to this.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Garth, you had a comment?

GARTH BRUEN: I'm just confused, because we're always told that these things have to be done way in advance. It requires planning, budgeting, etc.

HEIDI ULLRICH: So again, what I was focusing on was the travel itself, the booking the tickets. So that's just the way constituency travel works. They can't move this far in advance. But in terms of the planning, there's already a NARALO General Assembly page. I think that you're going call for membership for an organizational committee. That's all fantastic and again, we really staff appreciates that we're able to have that luxury of considerable planning time. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: But, at the same time, we can't ask for our ALSes to work and spend a lot of time and effort into planning if they're not going

---

to guarantee that we can get a General Assembly. We don't want to have the whole thing planned and say, "Oh, sorry. We don't have money." That is the wrong impression to send.

ALAN GREENBERG: The budget year starts next week. The budget has – I don't even know if the budget has formally been approved by the Board or not. Maybe it was last week. So we're just at the nexus point and certainly from my point of view we would like to come to closure on this really quickly. Don't ask me what day that is.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Yes, and just to add to that again, the ALAC has to choose which of the three. So we're going to be working together –

ALAN GREENBERG: If we have to choose.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. I think we all appreciate what Judith is trying to get at. And we're putting effort in this, and we as recognizing Alan's comments about that, it worked out well for us too last year that EURALO took it, but we would definitely be disappointed if we didn't have it in April. I'll be extremely disappointed, and I'm sharing everyone's views.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: Well put.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Any other final comments, anyone from the online community or anyone else in the room on this topic? Okay. Anyone else? Okay.

Let's move on to the next slide please. And again, that is Open Office being converted to PowerPoint.

So the CROPP Strategic Plan – what is very interesting is that we slightly changed things and we got applications in fairly early in the FY17 cycle so that we were able to get some applications and through the process for the IGF U.S.A. despite the fact that Judith and I will be there, we're both swamped there. We're not going to be doing any outreach. I'm doing all the social media and filming a lot of stuff, and Judith is one of the organizers for the panels. So despite that we're there, it's not on the dime of ICANN but we do have two dedicated people for the event. And then Tom is doing an event later in November.

Go ahead.

---

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN; I also want to recognize Chris Mondini’s staff for helping us pre-approve our strategic plan so before the budget was in so that we could do a CROPP trip in July even though the budget is only starting this week or next week. They were nice enough to work with us along with our [inaudible] team to push the CROPP applications through so we could meet the deadline set by the CROPP program for eight weeks and thanks to Chris’s staff for reviewing our plan and approving it before the money was allocated.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you, Judith. The focus on the Strategic Plan – and I think we’re one of the first RALOs to actually get the FY17 Plan in and revised and critical feedback from Chris and Joe – and again, ongoing with our outreach, particularly to people with special needs and the First Nations are two areas that we are really quite concerned about that we don’t have enough representation. And I personally met with the National Association of the Blind in Washington and I’m following up with them. Very, very, interesting people at the enabling community.

The other thing – and I think you alluded to it earlier in one of the changes – we really want to encourage members of our community that have not been on a trip before. We slipped in and had to fill in for other people because of religious holidays

---

or they couldn't get away from work. So it wasn't first choice that myself or Judith did any trips, it was definitely there in FY16 that they did the trips. So in FY17 I am not going on any trips and I can't really speak for Judith, but –

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

I didn't go on any trips last year because I thought it was more important for others to go on trips. And in our line in trying to engage our members to do work and do volunteer work, is try to find something that will interest them so that they will then become more engaged. So one of the things is we're trying to figure out is there something that will help you get engaged? So maybe they've always wanted to do something, a trip in their region, and that will get them to be more engaged within the ALS or within ICANN and do more outreach and do something that they really want to do because we find that if people take an ownership in something, if it's really something that fits a need that they have, they're more apt to put in the volunteer time to do that, to keep going. It's, "Oh, yes. I see I get some benefits from them. I see I now realize what the benefits of outreach or what am I getting back from ICANN? Why am I doing other things?" So I think that is something that will help.

The next slide up that Glenn has put up is about our proof [inaudible] for IGF U.S.A. Seth Reiss and Louis Houle – Seth is

---

from Hawaii. Louis is from Montreal – are going to the IGF U.S.A. They're very excited. The IGF U.S.A. is on July 14<sup>th</sup>. And then we have Tom Lowenhaupt going to a National League of Cities Conference.

And we also worked hard with our people with the ALSes in trying to get them to fill out applications and figuring out – help them create their outreach goals. So what are their goals for the trip? How are they going to meet their outreach? What is their mission? What are they looking to accomplish? So we work with them to help them fill out the application so that they can figure out what are the metrics they can do? Because we don't want to create metrics for them because we don't know what would be helpful. But if they create their own metrics, then they'll be more apt to follow up on them.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Again, what's not showing on the slide is Tom's trip in November. And there's still two outstanding trips. As long as they're in this fiscal period to before the end of June.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Right. And we've been reaching out to our ALSes, having private meetings with different ALSes to explain the CROPP trips to them. What do the CROPP means? And I understand also I think

---

Rob was telling us that there's an additional day, night – an additional day added on in FY17 because of comments and feedback that they had. So now instead of being two nights and three days, it's three nights and four days. And we'll be communicating that to the members.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: And the registration is covered.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: That was last year. So we are working with each individual ALS to help them get more engaged.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Any questions from the Adobe? Okay. So okay, we have two outstanding trips. So please put that in your calendar if there's something that you think has merit and bring it up to the next NARALO meeting. And again, before you submit it do look at the strategic plan and you're committed to doing the outreach.

Okay, I want to move on quickly because I want to give time for Chris Mondini if he has –

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We also want to talk about some of the new committees that we talked about in today's ALAC session.



---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: That's right. Thank you, Judith.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: With the NARALO.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes. Thank you, Judith. Okay, so I want to go to the gap analysis and quite simply it's not complicated. We have 12 Canadian ALSes. We have 14 U.S. ALSes. We have seven unaffiliated. We've brought in some new people and – right over there is one of the new people and unaffiliated – so he's based in Washington and thank you for coming.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: [inaudible]. And we also want to congratulate ISOC North Carolina, our newest ALS, just got approved yesterday or today.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yesterday.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: so we're growing and we have another one coming up in the pipeline, too.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Yes, we do. Yes, Andrew.

ANDREW MACK: Just a quick question as someone who's not as familiar with the ALS part of the structure is – sorry about my voice – what constitutes an ALS in NARALO and what are the general sizes of them? Are they small? Are they larger?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: An ALS can be – right now we're working for new ALS criteria, but until we change the criteria, the ALS can be pretty much anything three or more people. Some are very large. Some are small. It doesn't matter. We also have a distal characteristic. A [inaudible] thing is that we also have individual members for people who are unaffiliated. But you also besides that what we have found out is that some people who sign up as unaffiliated really are affiliated, they just don't know what ALS is out there. So scan the list of the ALSes for instance in ISOC D.C. is an ALS. If you're a member of ISOC D.C. then you can't be unaffiliated because you're already affiliated.

So scan the list of groups that are out there and then what area – each ALS is focused on a specific area. So if you want to focus on like academia or skills or our newest one, John Laprise is

---

focusing on some more academia connected to Internet Governance. So each ALS usually picks a different theme and focuses on that.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Given our time, so all I'm saying in this gap analysis, there's some areas based on geography that are missing or underrepresented so our goal is to increase our numbers in areas that are not represented. So any feedback on areas that especially community of interest that you can think of that we should approach. We'd appreciate any suggestions to us that we should be reaching out to and getting them involved.

Okay, next slide. Okay, next slide.

Okay, so just very quickly, we looked at our Rules of Procedures. We put a hold on that. It was sort of all over the map in terms of not well-organized, no subsections. So we're waiting for more feedback. We're looking at what ALAC's doing. Sorry?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: APRALO.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: APRALO has done. We have incorporated a number of the ideas that APRALO has done. We want to clarify our ALS obligations,

---

our normal communication, our decertification process. So all of that stuff, one of the things we'll be doing in the next few months. So if anyone wants to be involved with that process, please do.

Okay, so I want to use the remaining of the time to give you a chance, Chris, to address the group and talk for a few minutes and then we've added also into the agenda and then you have a topic as well.

Chris, you're not obligated. If you don't want to talk, that's okay.

CHRIS MONDINI:

Thanks very much. I'm delighted to participate and delighted to observe a couple of the things that I've heard which I think are really encouraging. I'm getting – like many of us – we're getting to know our new CEO and we're also getting our head around the Bylaws which are in place or coming into effect for ICANN. And so the first thing that you mentioned that I'm very encouraged by is your plans for the future agenda of a General Assembly, that a component of that would be a policy matter briefing and training on the policies under discussion at ICANN. Because as I've commented in the past, there's a lot of admin and organization and self-organization and the rules of the CROPP and the rules of the election and so forth. And then I hope that it doesn't detract from every opportunity you have

---

when you're together to talk through also the very important policy contributions and the comments you make to the public comments and working groups that you participate in.

So again, I think you're going to see that the focus of the work of all of the stakeholders in ICANN is going to be more narrowly focused on the issue areas, some of which are very dry, some of which are very complex, but all of which have people in regions of the world that care about them. So joining up and imparting that knowledge to make you all even enhance your role is bringing that expertise to the table I think would be one vector to pursue.

And then the other thing that you just mentioned was clarifying the responsibilities of the ALSes, too. And I made a comment in the other session about really challenging ourselves to think about building ICANN communities in situ, and looking to do things like have more remote communities of people who are really just following from where they live, know what lists or working groups or newsletters to sign up for, know how to connect with the people that can help them clarify some of the policy issues, and be active. And so that being part of the ICANN community or participating in policy making, even in some very connectivity challenged areas, could still be done through the very important channel of the ALSes.

---

So even encouraging some – challenge yourselves to grow the size of ALSes that exist already in addition to adding more ALSes in a very targeted way of people that might have expertise in things like consumer rights or – you already do this, but I think that that’s going to be a really rich vein of talent that you’ll be able to bring into the organization, and so seeing how well all of the sort of the structures and the way things work, the way we work together as a team is falling into place, I’m very encouraged that you can – that’s sort of my view of how you can continue to be successful, especially in sort of the next ICANN that’s coming. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Chris, thanks so much for all those thoughts and for all your help to us. I also want to – before we turn to Garth for a minute – wanted to give an update on the work, what we've been doing on the tribal. As you know, one of our other goals that we've been – and we are working with [inaudible] Keller and her group, Native Public Media who submitted a budget request and a special budget for a tribal ambassador fellowship, and so we've been working – while here we've been talking to Chris's office as well as Janice who runs the Fellowship office, and figuring out what are the best models to use for creating an application to judge how we're going to pick the two Fellows in an open and transparent and competitive manner, so that we can then get

---

them engaged and also figure out who's going to be on the select – how they do the Selection Committee, how they do the grant applications, what goals they're looking at.

So we're looking to have a closer relationship with them, so that we can pass it on to [inaudible] group or other groups who want to be on the Selection Committee to review these, and then we hope – we also want to [encourage] in the same vein, Glenn sent out to the ALSes the opportunity to comment on the public comment for the Fellowship application. They're looking to change the Fellowship application so that they could also give Fellowships to underrepresented communities even in developed countries. So if there are groups who are for special needs or disabilities, even if they live in a developed country, they can say they're in underrepresented groups, they can apply for a fellowship.

If they're people in very remote areas, they can apply for Fellowships, and maybe also a continuation of a larger indigenous Fellowship, not just for the U.S., but for the indigenous Fellowship, including people in the Asia Pacific area who are from the indigenous communities. So we encourage everyone to make public comments on the Fellowship.

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you, Judith. On the Adobe, if you went back to that, I've given you the link to the feedback. The feedback on the revisions on the fellowship program is by the end of the month of July, so 29th of July. We have an opportunity to get feedback. And if you read the documents, the recommendations all over the documents is work that we did for the last number of years, and I remember sitting down with Chris, Garth, and Darlene years ago, where we said indigenous people, very important, and treat them not in the same category as the rest of America and Canada. And I think that is all over the document, and I'm so pleased that this group has championed that cause, and I think it's a step in the right direction. And people like Loris Taylor, very credible organization, Native Public Media.

If you were at the L.A. event, we had a Hopi dancer. I don't know if you remember the hoop dancer and the performance. They paid for that entire performance, and they brought in a person from the Indian Association and they paid for her to come in. So they've really put their money where their mouth is in terms of helping our community and championing the cause. It's been a great relationship. Andrew.

ANDREW MACK: Glenn, thank you. I remember that, that was me, and I think that's really great. I know that there are many other



---

communities that are underrepresented in developed countries like the United States and Canada, where communities of color, intercity communities that you wouldn't ever find someone from one of those groups traditionally in an ICANN meeting. You won't find a lot of people who are Hispanic traditionally at an ICANN meeting – from the United States, from Latin America, for sure. I'm wondering whether NARALO has any plans to reach out to those kinds of communities, and yes, I'm just learning.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Andrew, we do, and we encourage any of our ALSes to reach out to these different groups and get them to bring them in and do outreach to them, because we want – our focus, as Glenn has said, is to look at the underrepresented, to look at those people of low income populations, to look at indigenous populations, to look at remote rural and [inaudible].

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, thank you so much. Please take the time, and Andrew, if you had that link that I put on there, if there are any groups you feel – I know it is something that I've had lots of discussion with Judith on getting those other groups definitely into the Fellowship Program. Okay, I'm going to turn to Garth, and he's got a special presentation.

GARTH BRUEN:

Thank you. I don't really have a presentation as much as just discussion about some research that I did with my students. So at Fisher College, where I teach – I teach cybercrime and criminal law and a few other related subjects – I worked with my students on a research project this last semester to document how easy it is to buy narcotics or opioids online, and to see what the various pathways were, see what the various structures were on the Internet that supported the illegal sales.

We looked at various avenues in order to get to these sites: we used Google, Bing, Yahoo, Twitter, YouTube and 12 different shopping platforms. And regardless of the point of entry, where somebody starts to look to buy an illegal opioid, the final destination is almost uniformly a gTLD domain name, and mostly in a jurisdiction where this particular type of activity is completely illegal. So regardless of how somebody starts, where on the Internet they browse and search or get their information, they pretty much ended up in the same place.

So this puts this in the arena of ICANN, because we're not necessarily talking about social media, because you couldn't buy any of these things on social media, it was just a redirect to a domain name. These were not on ccTLDs, these were on mostly legacy gTLD domains. And not only were these sites

---

violating the law in the jurisdictions where they were sponsored, many of the conditions around these domains were violating registrant agreements and potentially violating registrar contracts with ICANN.

We talked about this yesterday in our joint meeting with the ICP, and there was sort of a joint agreement that the compliance function within ICANN is not adequate for addressing many of these problems. I looked at one particular area, but this particular area, you would think by its nature would be extremely difficult to run an illegal business on the open Internet, but it's actually fantastically easy. There are very few barriers to doing so.

The consensus was in the room yesterday between the IPC and ALAC that a new approach towards ICANN Compliance might be required, and one of the things that we talked about is some sort of independence with community oversight. And there was general agreement between the IPC and ALAC that this is a good idea to explore. I think in order to both protect our end users, protect consumers, protect brand names and businesses, and protect the stability of the Internet in general, we need to have a robust compliance function.

ICANN's answer to many of these problems has typically been "Go to the police, we don't deal with content," and there are two

---

problems with this. One problem is that we're not really talking about content, we're actually talking about transactions, which is a completely different situation. We're not talking about people who are talking about narcotics, we're talking about people who are selling narcotics, and through its nature, ICANN is facilitating this type of transaction from end to end, by providing the internal structure and by ignoring certain conditions by which these sites are violating the registrant agreements, they're passively providing the structure that makes the transaction possible.

The second problem is that this "Go to the police" answer is going to – if people actually do consistently go to the police, if ICANN doesn't address these issues on its own, people will rely more and more on their local governments to address these Internet issues, and what you're going to end up with is a much more fragmented approach to Internet compliance, and you're going to see lots of different jurisdictions in different countries doing things in different ways, and in many cases, maybe heavy handed, sloppy ways.

So what we need to do is to really have a compliance function that is the first line of defense in protecting the Internet itself and protecting consumers by adhering to its own policies, and right now we don't have that.

---

So this is one of the things that I was pushing for in the meeting yesterday, and people seemed to like the idea. I see Alan has his hand up.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Thank you so much, Garth. Alan, I'll go to you in one second. Just looking on the Adobe. Anyone interested in giving a comment or a question to Garth, please get into the queue, put your hand up, and the people from Adigo, you'll need to just yell, because I can't see your hands. So I'm going to turn to Alan for a response.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Not a response. There's another effort that went on this week in ICANN. I forwarded a letter to the open ALAC list, so many of you have it, but we perhaps want to forward it to the NARALO list. This was an initiative from the IPC about a variety of improper things, from the movie industry complaining about people posting copies of movies, to illegal use of trademarks in a variety of ways, and this is certainly a good example of that kind of thing.

The IPC wrote a letter to the Board. The reaction of the Board was "We don't do content," standard sort of answer. The IPC came back with a rather detailed letter explaining – pointing out

---

that there are clauses in the gTLD registry agreements that prohibit the use of things that are blatantly illegal and demonstrably so, gave a number of examples of cases where – I'll back up for a second. Compliance often says "Yes, but we get a lot of spurious requests and they're not well documented," and the IPC said "Yes, you do. That's true. On the other hand, you also get some that are exceedingly well documented, and they're not acted on."

So there's going to be action on that side too, and they're very comparable to the kind of things you're talking about, the type of illegality is different. And some of us may not be as sympathetic as others about illegal posting of music and movies on the web, but the movie industry has been rather stringent on how they enforce some of their rules, and therefore are not held in favor by a lot of people. But nevertheless, there are very similar types of things, and I suspect we're going to see some action because of that activity, and it fits very well with the kind of thing Garth was talking about.

So there's pressure on Compliance in a whole bunch of areas. We have a new CEO who has a history from the regulatory side and is very sympathetic to consumer issues. I think he's a little bit bewildered right now and he's entered into this new field, and is suddenly barraged by everyone, is trying to oversee the transition, should it be approved. So I'm not expecting to see

---

things overnight, but I think all the things are coming together. We use a wiki called confluence, but I think things are all feeding together that we may actually see some real action. Thank you.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Garth will probably respond to that, but let me just interject with comments from Evan as well. He doesn't have audio, so I have to read his comments. He says "Unfortunately, compliance seems to be totally about compliance with monetary issues, it can't act on the illegal things until they're proven illegal." He says, "Unfortunately we'll have to wait until someone dies from a .doctor website for this all to blow up and demand action," and he goes on to say that is dies form bad advice on product dispensed from .doctor. So that's from Evan. Thank you, Evan, for the comment. Garth, do you have any further comments?

GARTH BRUEN:

Yes. Alan was referring to what are some of these pirate site takedowns of music, movies and other media, and everybody sort of has their pet peeves about what is maybe illicit or illegal on the Internet, and there are disputes over the illegality of different things now. In some jurisdictions, the type of sites that I'm talking about, these narcotic sites are completely legal. And there are certainly people throughout the world who think there

---

shouldn't be sort of restrictions on these extremely potent drugs.

But what we're really talking about, regardless of the type of activity – whether it be botnets, malware, spam, any one of these abuse issues, if we can lump them all in as abuse issues, what is at the core of them is an abuse of registrant policy, or an abuse of the contract. And that's what's at the root of all these.

Now, if you have some sort of media sharing site and you have dotted every I and crossed every T, then nobody really has a complaint. It is possible to have a completely legal pharmacy online that sells opioids within certain constraints, but you have to adhere to these constraints. And I think that what we're saying regardless of your point of view, whether it is the recording industry or a consumer issue or a pharmacy regulation issue, what we're really saying is that the lack of enforcement of basic policy enables illicit activity of all kinds. That's what we're talking about, and that's why it's relevant to ICANN.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Thank you. I see your finger. I'm assuming you want to say something, or no?



---

ALAN GREENBERG: I could add something. I wasn't actually pointing, but since you gave me the microphone, I will add something.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay, very short.

ALAN GREENBERG: Very short. One of the common things – and Garth just essentially said it – is a lot of the things that are illegal are liked by some people. Whether it's illegal drugs, whether it's a real Canadian pharmacy selling real, legitimate drugs to poor old people in the U.S., it's illegal on U.S. terms, other people think it's a great thing. Free music and free videos, lots of people think are great things. We really can't get involved with the content issue, we really need to look at what do the contracts say, and is it legitimate under the rules that we're [wording].

Now, if something is being run out of a U.S. domain on a U.S. registrar on a U.S. registry that is illegal in the U.S., it's demonstrably so, it shouldn't be all that hard to take it down, and that's –

GLENN MCKNIGHT: I'm sorry. I'm cutting off this discussion.

---

ALAN GREENBERG:            Okay, I'm done.

GLENN MCKNIGHT:        Thank you, and sorry Garth, maybe you can take it offline, the two of you can have a drink together. I'm sorry. I just got told that we're wrapped up on time.

There's just one last thing that I need to say: there is a pilot project that is Dan O'Neill and Robert [Hogwarth] are responsible for, which is the pilot project on policy development, so we're looking for volunteers to actually participate in that, so we will bring it up again, we'll have details. I did send it to the list for people – background info, and we'll be putting it in a newsletter.

So given the time – and I know staff has to run off – thank you so much, and again, we'll see you again in August. Thanks again.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**