
HELSINKI – Joint AFRALO-AfrICANN Meeting
Wednesday, June 29, 2016 – 13:30 to 15:00 EEST
ICANN56 | Helsinki, Finland

GISELLA GRUBER-WHITE: If you're not trilingual, I'd suggest you have a headset. I'll quickly go and get one.

AZIZ HILALI: [inaudible] can start. Hello, everyone. We will start, please. Please, I will speak in French, so take your headphone, please. We have translation in Arabic, in French, and English.

Welcome. Welcome to this new meeting, AFRALO-AfrICANN, which groups the entire African community. We meet once again about the IANA transition and the responsibility of ICANN regarding Africa. This is the fourth meeting we do have on that topic. I would like to first of all, before giving the floor to our guests, to give the floor to Gisella.

GISELLA GRUBER-WHITE: Thank you very much. Please give your name every time you take the floor. We have interpreters in French and Arabic, and it's important for the interpreters to identify you in each and every [channel]. Thank you very much.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

On March 14th, 2014, you know that the NTIA asked ICANN to talk to the entire Internet community for the transition of the IANA functions. After the very important and large work that was done in the last two years by the world community, which was an incredible and wonderful work, which was presented in Marrakesh and which was adopted by ICANN during the Marrakesh meeting, which was transmitted to the NTIA, those proposals were analyzed by the NTIA, which concluded that this proposal was valid and strong. The community has been recognized for its work and for this project.

This evaluation gives the green light to keep on with the process and the approval by the US government. What we need to do today is to implement this transition. That is why we decided to talk about it in Helsinki, to work on this topic for the African community. Every time, we ask our community in Africa for each and every important topic and for the next ICANN meeting, so you're going to read about it. We have a declaration statement, which was distributed to you. This is the first time we have it in eight languages. I would like to thank the staff for the translation done of this statement in eight languages.

Before giving the floor to the guest, I would like thank Rinalia and Cherine and Pierre. Pierre and Cherine are Board member, and Pierre Dandjinou has always been with us during those meetings. I would like to thank the people that worked at the

statement that you have in front of you. Thank you, Tijani, Seun, and Mohamed. I would like to also say that Göran Marby, the ICANN CEO, will be present very soon, and we'll give him the floor as soon as he arrives. He's of course very busy in Helsinki.

Without further ado, I would like to give the floor to our present, Alan Greenberg. He has to leave pretty soon, and he's the ALAC Chair. Mr. Alan Greenberg.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you very much. It's always a delight to be invited to these meetings, and more so this time than normal because earlier in the month, I spent a week or a week in a half in Botswana at the African Internet Summit, and I had the opportunity to reunite with old friends that I hadn't seen some in 15 to 16 years. It was a real delight. A few of them are around this table again. It was an interesting experience for me because I have worked in Africa and with Africans for 20-odd years, but it's the first time I've gone to that kind of meeting. It was a real experience, and I wouldn't have given it up for anything. It was worth the 40 hours I sat on an airplane to go and come.

Unfortunately, in parallel with this, there's a North American meeting going on just next door, which I'm going to have to leave to go to, but I'm delighted to see you all here. As usual, your declaration is an interesting document which you can be

proud of. I think it's marvelous that the whole African community can come together in a single meeting here, ignoring which part of ICANN you normally belong to, crossing the boundaries and doing the work you do. I encourage you to keep on doing it. I'm delighted to be a part of it, and enjoy the rest of the meeting. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Alan. I would like to now give the floor to Rinalia. You know her, Rinalia Abdul Rahim. She's a Board member from At-Large. Three minutes, please.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM:

[inaudible] Jambo. I was taught to say "Jambo" by Pierre at the last meeting. I appreciate that very much, and if you can teach me how to say hello in your native language, I would appreciate that when we bump into the corridors.

It is always a pleasure to be at the AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting. I have a few messages for you. As I understand it, the AFRALO-AfrICANN meetings have been happening since the year 2010, since Brussels if I'm not mistaken. At every meeting, you tend to generate statements on a number of topics, including New gTLD program, joint applicant support for the New gTLD program, ICANN accountability, and the IANA stewardship transition. I

would like to really commend AFRALO-AfrICANN community for coming up with these statements. Out of all the RALO community in ICANN, AFRALO is the only one that does this. I want to tell you that it actually makes a difference, including in terms of Board deliberations. This happened last year around June when the Board members were seeking a sense of community support for the RIR and IETF positions related to IANA stewardship transition. At that time, there was none in the ICANN community. But I was aware that you were working on your statement that actually carried some of that support. I informed the Board that this was happening, and I told them that a formal statement is coming. I think that informed Board deliberation, and that was quite valuable. I commend you for that.

Also, when I received a draft of your statement mid-year last year, I sent a note to Tijani and Aziz. The note is very short, and I will just read it. I said, “I just saw the AFRALO comment on the CCWG proposal on enhancing ICANN accountability. A very strong, independent, and principled statement with clear rationale. I am so proud of the African community. You are inspiring to me, in terms of how regional communities get together and influence the ICANN decision-making process.”

Your viewpoints matter, and I would like to encourage you to continue to do that, especially as we move towards

[interworking] on items in Work Stream 2. Your inputs are particularly valuable for discussions on subsequent rounds on New gTLD program. Also, I would like to hear your voice in the discussions on auction proceeds because there may be some things that we can do to provide support to underserved regions. Participation is actually important to make that happen. I have one request for you. When you proceed on this process of developing statements, you actually formalize it during the ICANN week. The Board actually meets before the ICANN meeting, and that's where we deliberate, so if you want to influence or inform decision-making, actually we need to have your statement formalized before. I don't know if you can actually have a mechanism for doing that, but I leave the problem to the leadership, Aziz and Tijani. I'm sure that you can come up with a good solution to that.

I would like to end by acknowledging those who contribute in the IANA stewardship transition process. I actually have a list of 20 people from the African community that have participated in that. I don't know if the Chair will allow me a chance to read out the name. You tell me. Is it okay? Okay.

These are the people that are recognized for participating: Adebunmi Akinbo, GNSO from Nigeria; Barrack Otieno, ccNSO, Kenya; Beran Gillen, At-Large, Gambia; Kris Seeburn, At-Large, Mauritius; Peters Omoragbon, At-Large, UK; Sarah Kiden, At-

Large, Uganda; Seun Ojedeji, At-Large, Nigeria; Vika Mpisane, ccNSO, South Africa; Mary Uduma, ccNSO, Nigeria; Sonigitu Ekpe, GNSO, Nigeria; Wisdom Kwasi Donkor, GNSO, Ghana; Dave Kissoondoyal, At-Large, Mauritius; Khaled Koubaa, Tunisia; Laurence Olawale-Roberts, GNSO, Nigeria; Jabhera Matogoro, GNSO, Tanzania; Manal Ismail, GAC, Egypt; Tijani Ben Jemaa, At-Large, Tunisia; Eberhard Lisse, ccNSO, Namibia; Alice Munyua, GAC, Kenya; Fiona Asonga, ASO, ccNSO, Kenya; and Mohamed El Bashir, from Sudan.

Out of all these people, ICANN staff have flagged to me the outstanding contributions in particular of five individuals. They are Mohamed El Bashir, who was Vice Chair of the IANA Coordination Group; Tijani Ben Jemaa, in terms of his contribution in the CCWG on enhancing accountability; and Seun Ojedeji, who was everywhere and participating in CWG on stewardship and CCWG accountability. Congratulations, Seun, for being selected to be on the Board of AFRINIC. In addition to that, a few other individuals, Mary, Manal, Eberhard, and Fiona have been recognized for high levels of engagement.

In a volunteer community where there is little rewards coming back, I think it's important to acknowledge volunteer contribution, and I think it's important to hear the names. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Rinalia, for those kind words. We have people that work day and night for the last two years and that really did great work. We are the only RALO which gave our opinion on this transition in public comments, for instance. We have the honor, as well, to have Mr. Tarek Kamel, who is going to say a few words. You know Mr. Kamel is Vice Chair of Engagement. I would like to give you the floor.

TAREK KAMEL:

Thank you very much, Aziz, and thank you, Tijani, for having me here. I'm glad to be here with Pierre Dandjinou, our Vice President for Global Stakeholder Engagement for Africa, and as well distinguished Board member Rinalia [inaudible] speaking, as well as Cherine Chalaby, the Deputy Chair of the ICANN Board, who happens to be coming also from Egypt, as myself.

I'm here on behalf of the management to say a couple of words. The last six months have been, in my opinion, very happy six months for ICANN in Africa in general. Maybe there is one small exception, but we'll talk about it. We had a wonderful and historic meeting in Marrakesh that we definitely owe to Aziz Hilali as such. Our joy doesn't go only to having successful meetings in Africa, but that the leadership this time was coming actually from outside the government. This is what is new about

the whole thing. The government had supported, definitely, but the real vision and driver was Aziz and was coming out of the government. This is something that reemphasizes how the multistakeholder model is maturing in Africa and our part of the world and makes it all very proud about what happened.

The second thing that I have participated was my colleague, Sally Costerton, in Nairobi in opening the first African ICANN engagement center. This was another wonderful event that we had. It was 150 participants, and together organized by Pierre Dandjinou and his team. Kenya and the Kenyan government has provided us with a lot of support. We were very welcome, and the African community also have participated very successfully. Many African community leaders were there and have participated in that wonderful event. We look forward together with Pierre and his team that we empower it for further engagement on a wider scale.

I know that there are other issues that are still overshadowing the African agenda, like [North] Africa, for example, so I am not only drawing a rosy picture. I am talking about how things are. Since Rinalia has mentioned also the excellent contribution of African community within the IANA stewardship process, we were extremely more happy that we have seen younger generations coming in. You mentioned them partially by name, Fiona and others contributing to this process that we are very

proud of. It's not the same name as we used to see over the years. We have a younger generation that is coming in.

With these messages, I wish you the best of luck, and we look forward to working together more and more in the next five months until our meeting in Hyderabad. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Tarek. Thank you very much, Tarek. I would like to give the floor to Pierre Dandjinou, the Vice Chair for African Engagement in Africa.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you very much. I see that Tarek said a lot about what's going on in Africa. In 2016, is ICANN year in Africa. Thank you very much for inviting me. It's always a pleasure to come to this meeting and to see you. I was At-Large, and I know that At-Large plays an important role and does a lot and is a very important part of ICANN.

What I noted is that we really should thank those 20 people we heard about. They did so much. When African ministers used to ask ICANN to make sure that Africa was present in ICANN, we didn't know we would go that far. Africa is well represented in the working group. This is very positive. This is very satisfying, and I would like to go farther. We need to go farther. We have an

office in Africa. We are present in Africa. This is a good first step, but what should be we do with this office, with all that we did already in Africa? How can we go farther? We worked on the transition, but we still have a lot of work to do in Africa and for Africa. We have to be better organized for following up on what we did. We have working group. We have Work Stream 2. We have to set up new structures. We have to make sure that Africa is well represented and efficient.

I do travel a lot in Africa. I do visit many countries, and there is an African strategy. We talk about the African ICANN strategy. We have small projects [for] DNS, entrepreneurship, the promotion of many things in Africa. This is great, but we need for Africa to have a stronger strategy. I have to make sure that there is a nuance there that you have to understand. The strategy for Africa for ICANN is, what do African are looking for with ICANN at the national level? How do we talk about ICANN? We have some volunteers. What is done at the national level so that the national authorities know about ICANN? I talk to ministers, and in many countries, they say, “Yes, there is someone from At-Large.” They don’t understand what exactly you do and how ICANN works. At the national level, there is a lot of information and communication work to be done so that the work of ICANN is well understood. In academia as well, you could work with academia. What’s at stake has to be understood.

I talked to a lady. It's a second ICANN meeting. She told me, "I'm lost. I don't know what's going on. It's very complex." You need to help out those people. You need to explain exactly what ICANN is all about at the national level in your countries, with your governments, with your national authorities. At the internal level, that's what we need to do. We have to explain the IANA transition, as well, and tell the governmental authorities what ICANN is all about. You need the strategy to be set up in each African country. Individual contributions are extremely important, but I need stronger strategy for ICANN in Africa. We are very satisfied with what happened in Africa so far. We still have a long way to go. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Pierre. You are absolutely right. After the Marrakesh meeting, several people from governments were telling me, "You're talking to me about ICANN, but what exactly is it?" They were pleasantly pleased, yet they didn't quite know what ICANN was all about. That is something that we need to work on, I believe, at the national level.

Let us move to the second point, which is the presentation of the different points. Let us use the presence of Mr. Chalaby. He actually speaks very good French, so if you would like to speak in French, that would be wonderful, or I could speak Arabic.

CHERINE CHALABY:

I feel there is not enough people here. That's why I'm trying to speak in different languages: Arabic, French, and English. I wanted to say that I have been in Egypt and I went to the engagement center up there and have been in touch with so many business representatives to know what is going on there and what can be done for that and how can we help the country.

Now I will turn into English to explore what I have done so far.

I'm Egyptian. I grew up in Egypt and worked in the Middle East since the early '70s until recently, and I've also been more recently a chairman of an investment bank in Dubai and also of a brokerage house in Cairo. I've been on the Board for six years.

Egypt is very close to my heart, and Africa, of course. As you know, this is my continent. Recently, I visited Egypt because of the issues that Pierre were mentioning. A lot of people don't know what ICANN is doing. There isn't enough awareness to help the community in terms of setting up businesses. Give you an example. We have in Egypt 40 million ICANN users, and yet the contribution of digital services to the GDP and the local economy is zero, literally zero, whereas in some developing countries, the GDP contribution can be between 5% and 9%. I'd like, if there's an opportunity later on, to see in the various

countries in Africa how is digital service contributing to the economy.

The problem I found out in Egypt are four things why digital economy is not picking up despite 40 million Internet users. The first problem is there isn't enough capital to fund entrepreneurs and startups. That's number one.

Number two, the government is not creating an environment, particularly from law and tax environment [inaudible] to help people and encourage people. People are afraid to set up a business, and then a law comes out tomorrow and then they can't do anything and they get setbacks.

The next two things are the most telling. The infrastructure is not great, so they don't have the bandwidths and the wireless environment that exists and other countries. Then there's no consumer trust. People go to websites and look at it, and they don't have the trust that we have in many cases in developed countries.

Finally, there are no payment systems that are reliable, so people are afraid to buy locally online from businesses. That, in a way, was an eye opener and it broke my heart a little bit because you see that there's a lot of poverty, a lot of poor people, and there's a way out of it through the Internet, through the digital services. Yet, all they're doing is just browsing the 'net

to websites and businesses outside the continent, and that is not correct.

Talking to various business and community leaders, this is something that we need to improve a lot. ICANN is helping there because we created something called the entrepreneurial center. It might be a big name, but it has an aim. The aim is to teach a lot of people who want to become registries or registrar. Teach them how to become registry, how to set up businesses, how to conduct businesses, how to be successful and create the awareness that we were talking about earlier on.

I would love at one stage to hear what's happening in the other countries in Africa because I think the digital divide between the countries that have a lot of bandwidth and have a lot of money and the countries that don't is going to get bigger and bigger. We don't want this to happen, and there has to be a role to narrow this gap at all possible.

Thank you, Aziz, and thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Cherine. We have one other point before we move to reading the preliminary declaration or statement. I would like to ask Tijani and Mohamed, my two friends, to briefly

address the audience. Let's talk to Tijani first. He worked very hard at the CCWG level and did a lot of work over the past two years on that topic, so go ahead, Tijani. You have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Aziz. I also would have liked to use Arabic, but the acronyms are a problem because I don't know them in Arabic, so I can only use French or English.

As far as the topic, in general, when you choose the topic of a meeting, it is such that I give my opinion. This time, I did not give my opinion to choose the topic. It is the community that decided that we talk about that, most likely because it is the most important topic right now within ICANN. This topic will have a great impact on the future of the organization. As you will see in the statement, we gave our opinion in such a way that we based things on facts, as well as on the future because we are looking towards Stream 2, the second phase.

What we did is that we gave our perspective on what might happen. For example, we talked about the fact that in Work Stream 1, things went very fast and that was an issue. People need to be able to follow the pace. During Work Stream 1, only people who are very involved, only people who spend all their time working on it were able to actually bring something to the process. The others were left behind.

That was the idea when we wrote this statement. I think the statement is good. I hope that you are able to read it. What I expect is for all of you to give your opinion on the statement. I do believe that we need to send it to the Board as soon as possible.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Tijani. Thank you for being brief, as well. Now let's give the floor to the other busy bee, Mohamed, who is the President of AFRALO, as well as Chair of the ICG. Go ahead, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Very brief. Thanks, Rinalia, for really recognizing the colleagues who have actively participated in this process. I will be brief and talk about the transition and why the transition could be important for us in Africa.

I think it's important for us in Africa for three reasons. Because the transition, if completed, it will support and empower the global multistakeholder model, which will help us at the national level to empower the multistakeholder model in our countries. We can showcase, and we can say that at the global level, this is the model that's currently adopted. At the national level, we can try to empower the multistakeholder model.

The next billions of Internet users will be coming from Africa and developing countries, so the stability and the security of the Internet and the global DNS is important for all of us because all of us are representing organizations who are working to empower Internet users in Africa and connected users in our countries. That's critical for us.

The third reason is hopefully if the transition is completed, it will ease up the geopolitical tensions related to Internet governance and the myth about IANA functions. IANA functions is a pure technical coordination function, and it's time now that this could come back to the global Internet community represented by ICANN.

Without going further, I hope that – we all hope that the transition could be completed successfully. Hopefully, we can celebrate in Hyderabad. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Mohamed. We also do hope [inaudible].

CHERINE CHALABY:

I would like to ask something. Tijani, I would like to ask you something. You talked about how fast the process was at the CCWG, and you mentioned the fact that this might have been a negative thing for African countries, as well as other countries

because they were not able to give their opinion or to participate. What you are recommending is that Work Stream 2 might go a little bit slower. Is that right?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes. What I was saying is that for Work Stream 1, the work went so fast that many volunteers were not able to keep pace and were not able to contribute. What we would like to recommend for Work Stream 2 is for the work to go a little bit slower so that people who don't do this full time might be able to contribute.

All of this work was done thanks to three people, basically. Three persons: Seun, Mohamed, and myself. Seun was also one of the pillars and the main people involved in this work. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Did you also mention all of this to the CCWG co-Chairs? Do they actually agree with you?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: You know how that works. Timelines could not be changed because we had a deadline. That's why things went so fast. However, for Work Stream 2, we might be able to communicate that to them.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's not always possible because the end has already been set up. We know when the end is, when it was planned for. What we need to do is we need to work on the nine topics, and we only have such little time, so we are actually faced with the same problem.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. I was just told that Mr. Marby will be here at 2:30, so we have time to present the draft version of the statement. As Rinalia mentioned, it would be great to validate this statement, to approve the statement so that it might be sent to the different groups, CWG, CCWG, as well as the Board in a timely manner. Let's give Seun the floor, and then we will ask Sarah, who already accepted and she was elected as the new Secretary of AFRALO. Welcome, Sarah, and I know that she will be successful in her new position.

Sarah will write down all of your comments and correct anything that needs to be corrected before we have a final version, as validated during this meeting, either today or tomorrow. Seun, go ahead. You can go ahead and read the declaration.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much. Aziz, I have been privileged to be the one reading this in the last few meetings, so I'm going to go in English because it's the English version that is in front of me.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

SEUN OJEDEJI: The French.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I have the Arabic version [inaudible]

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you. AFRALO-AfrICANN joint meeting, Helsinki, Wednesday, 29th June, 2016. The statements goes, "We, African ICANN community members participating in the ICANN 56 international public meeting in Helsinki and attending the joint AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting on Wednesday, 29th June, 2016, discussed the implementation of the final proposal of the IANA Stewardship Transition Coordination Group, ICG, and the Cross-Community Working Group on [inaudible] ICANN accountability, CCWG.

"We first want to salute the entire Internet community for the huge amount of work completed in such short time towards

developing the various proposals. We also commend the ICANN Board by performing its role by endorsing and forwarding the proposals to the NTIA. We are pleased with the NTIA's positive assessment of those proposals, which gives the process the green light to proceed with the rest of the US government approvals.

“Nevertheless, we have some remarks to make about the implementation of the proposals and beyond. Point number one: The African Internet community within ICANN and the African Regional At-Large Organization, AFRALO, would like to encourage the US government to not relent in performing its role in this process, which will result in the removal of the historic stewardship role of the NTIA. We believe any attempt to block or further delay the transition process should be discouraged, as its completion will strengthen the multistakeholder model of Internet governance and will hopefully prevent future proposals for governmental-led management of the Internet's IANA critical functions. When accomplished properly and in a timely manner, the transition will present the USA in good light.

Point number two: We commend the work of the Implementation Oversight Taskforce, IOTF, that has been overseeing the implementation of the CCWG ICG proposals. We have been following the work of that group and would like to

reiterate that the group should remain focused on ensuring that implementation is in line with the various proposals.

We would like to emphasize that the CWG proposal requires [legacy appreciation] of PTI from ICANN, which should be reflected in its setup and composition. We believe that PTI should be empowered to independently manage staff, including [recruiting] new staff members, as may be required. We understand that a new subsidiary will require some staff of ICANN for initial kickoff. Nevertheless, we believe that this should just be a startup measure and not necessarily become the de facto source of staffing.

“As the CCWG kicks off plans for Work Stream 2, we’d like to reiterate our previous comment. Work Stream 1 was developed at the pace beyond average. This has made it difficult for some volunteers to follow up with the process, and it may have reduced the level of diversity of views in development of the proposal. In view of this, we recommend that adequate and flexible time be provided for the development of Work Stream 2.

“Finally, we’d like to reiterate our support of all the work done towards the transition of the US government stewardship role with regards to the IANA function [and related zone] management to improve our community and the progress made so far. We also encourage everyone to continue to perform their

part in a manner that does not stall the transition process. Let's all work together to keep one Internet as we know it for the future generation. Thank you very much.”

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Seun. We will now move to the next step, which is to debate on this or to listen to your comments. Let's open up the queue. We have 40 minutes ahead of us, so go ahead, anyone who would like to take the floor.

JIMSON OLUFUYE: Aziz, pardon me. I'd like to begin by making quick reference to [inaudible] statement.

AZIZ HILALI: Please give your name and your [inaudible].

JIMSON OLUFUYE: Yes. My name is Jimson Olufuye. I'm the Chair of the Africa ICT Alliance, member of the Business Constituency, and the Vice Chair for the Business Constituency. Of course, I'm an African. I was saying that I would like to make a quick comment on what Rinalia read and the recommendation before I come to the statement.

I want to appreciate Rinalia for the recognition. In fact, these Africans did a lot of work. In fact, we need to really publish it and celebrate it, but also to put it on record that there are others that did some work on the ground, like in the Business Constituency. We have some like [Waudu] that made a lot of contributions to that framework, just to note that.

I'll agree with Pierre that we need to do a lot more outreaches. It is very important. He is doing a lot of work with [inaudible]. He is commendable. The last six months have been fantastic for Africa, but like Oliver Twist, we want more, like entrepreneur center like [inaudible] talked about, we [inaudible] to have another subregion in Africa to dip in the engagement.

On the statement, it's really commendable that we set the pace, as we recognized. The comment of Rinalia about [community] is very important. I believe we can actually achieve that milestone, targeting the Board meetings and other things.

The statement is good. I agree with it in total, and I believe that this could also help a long way to support the administration focus. That is, US organization focus to transition this process. I think we need to push it beyond ICANN and as much as possible, maybe encourage [EU] to do that, and even other African countries can also put out statements like this to support the momentum for the transition. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Jim. Oui, Barrack?

BARRACK OTIENO: Thank you. I will not refer to the statement, since it is on point, but I have some subsidiary questions that I would just like to get the opinion of the Board members that we have. One of them is the issue of volunteer fatigue. We are moving into a critical phase of the transition where we are actually putting in place the flesh, the people who will be running the activities or the institutional frameworks. I can see energies going down because the transition has really taken a toll on a lot of the members. So I don't know what measures we are taking just to crank up people once again to make sure that we don't lose the ball at the right time.

The second question I want to pose is in the event that it doesn't happen, if we run into political turbulence, it equally poses an interesting challenge to our community as ICANN. What contingencies do we have in place or scenarios?

CHERINE CHALABY: You want to take the first question, I'll take the second?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Okay.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Yes, thank you, Cherine. He’s Vice Chair of the Board, so he can tell people what to do.

CHERINE CHALABY: You’re inspired by all of us.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Of course. I’m inspired by you too, Cherine. The question about volunteer fatigue is very much on point, to use your own word, Barrack. It’s on the mind of, I think, every part of the community. The Board has been having discussions with management about how to handle it. I think what we have been discussing is how to pace the work. One of the mechanisms could be on certain areas of work like reviews, perhaps we could space them further if the Bylaws allow us to do it. If the Bylaws does not allow us to do it, then the community has to request for better pacing.

At the same time, I think it’s quite impossible really to stop work because it’s critical. We know we have many issues to address. Work Stream 2 items, I think there are nine topics, and then there’s the New gTLD program discussions that are happening

and there are I think about ten items of reviews related just to that program. I think there are other things we are dealing with.

I think we don't have any other option but to work very hard at expanding our volunteer pool. It means that we cannot be constrained by just the number of bodies that we have. We need to encourage more people to come in and take on active volunteer roles, and we need to have capacity building workshops and measures in place to do rapid acceleration so that they can come in with a better understanding and they can start engaging immediately. I don't see any other option beyond that because we cannot say, "Stop the work." We can pace it a little bit better, but we really need more people to come in to cover up the areas. Cherine?

CHERINE CHALABY:

Thank you. Just on the volunteer, I'm 100% supportive of what Rinalia said. Another thing that goes with volunteer fatigue is the silos that exist sometime between the various SOs and ACs. Example of that, I was at a GNSO meeting, and the discussion there was about IGO protections. It seemed that the GNSO have worked for a number of months and years on a PDP with a lot of effort and a lot of volunteers, but unfortunately, right at the end, the GAC got engaged, and the GAC gave communication and advice to the Board which is not consistent with the PDP of the

GNSO. The same thing happened recently on proxy and private [servers].

There's frustration among the volunteers also who have spent a number of months and years working hard to find that at the end of the road, what they've done is not accepted. That also has to change. Therefore, you probably have seen there's a lot of bilaterals happening between the various SOs and ACs to break those silos and make sure that people get engaged at the very early stage so that the end result is fruitful and the volunteers feel rewarded at least that the work they've done has been recognized.

Barrack, your second question was about what would happen if the US government doesn't agree with the transition? Our expectation is cautiously optimistic. All the indication and signs is that it's going in the right direction and it hopefully is going to take place.

Let me assure you, and I can say this with comfortable, if the stewardship transition itself doesn't happen, the change on us here is not going to be substantial at all. In fact, from an accountability and all of the measurements we are taking, the train has left the station. We are going to do pretty much everything that was in the proposal that we approved, and pretty much all the Bylaws are going to be implemented. There

may be a tweak or two, but nothing more substantial. We feel that this organization has changed. It's changed for the good, and changed forever, so rest assured. We are not going to take a backwards step. We are moving forward, and I suspect if the transition happened, it would be fantastic. If it doesn't happen, it will be sad, but the impact on us as an organization will not be substantial from that regard because we are going to do everything we said we were going to do.

Did that answer your question?

BARRACK OTIENO: [Yes it did].

CHERINE CHALABY: Thank you.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you. I also wanted to address your question, Barrack. You asked for scenarios. I agree with Cherine that the train has pretty much left the station. We had committed to changes on accountability, and that's already happening because the Board agreed on adoption of the Bylaws, so that's happening. If the transition does not happen, we also need a strategy for dealing with governments who will use that as an excuse to say that

aspects of Internet governance need to come under governmental control. ICANN will need to come up with a strategy to go out and engage and to reinforce support and belief in a multistakeholder model. Since Göran is here, he can talk about that.

BARRACK OTIENO:

Just one last scenario that I didn't get clearly before you move to the next, my concern is also on the people have put in a lot of effort and a lot of work. I think we need to picture the possible backlash in the event it happens, although we are all optimistic that it will happen. When people are heartbroken after putting in a lot, then we have to deal with another issue altogether.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Barrack. Thank you, [inaudible]. Thank you, Mr. Chalaby. Mr. Marby has just joined us. Thank you for accepting to participate with us in the African community meeting. I would like before giving the floor, give you an idea about this meeting that we have during each ICANN meeting which gathers the African community, AFRALO and AfrICANN, to discuss ICANN hot topic related to the region of Africa. The outcome of this meeting is always a statement addressed to the group concerned or the Board of ICANN. Thank you again, and we appreciate that you are with us. You have the floor.

GÖRAN MARBY: First of all, thank you very much for inviting me. It's an honor to be here. It's interesting for me personally because since I joined ICANN, a lot of the things that I've been involved in has been around Africa. The first meeting I ever attended was the last meeting, which was in Africa, and then the first thing that happened was that we opened an engagement office in Nairobi. We seem to be doing a lot of things in Africa.

I'd rather take the opportunity to have this as a dialogue. You know that my speech is usually quite short anyway because this is a training thing for me. I've read the material and I've seen it, but I would like to hear some of your reflections on me and how we should [proceed to be], by the way, to support you, good or bad. I'd rather open it. Is that okay, to have an interactive instead? Ask me questions. I have some questions as well, but please, I open the floor for questions.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: I think, Barrack, you should repeat your question for him.

GÖRAN MARBY: I didn't hear that question. Sorry.

BARRACK OTIENO: Thank you, Rinalia, and welcome, Göran. I hope I got it right. Still trying to learn how to pronounce it. Basically, I had asked two questions, and at least the Board members present have given some interventions on the same. One was on volunteer fatigue, considering the IANA transition that we've been going through in the last almost two years or so. The second question was future scenarios in the event that the IANA transition is not approved or doesn't go through. I'm just looking at what is happening in the US political environment, and I want to be cautiously optimistic. I was asking what next in the event that it happens.

Just to add to the question that I'm asking, knowing the effort that the community has put into this process, if it doesn't go through, not everyone looks at it from two perspective, or rather doesn't look at the coin from both sides. There are those who will feel really disenfranchised. As an organization or an institution, what plans are in place just to forestall any backlash that may result from this?

GÖRAN MARBY: Thank you for the simple questions. On the fatigue, coming into Marrakesh and meeting a lot of you and meeting a lot of the volunteer works, it immediately hit me that the amount of work that you've been doing, not only for the transition but for anything else, is amazing work. I don't really know how you do

this because most of you seem to have a life as well. The traveling and the time and the paperwork and all the e-mails. The fatigue thing is something that I'm cautious about because we are built upon a voluntary system. The multistakeholder model is about having people coming into it. If we drain this too much, we will hit a wall.

There's two things. If I ever would forget this, Rinalia would remind me again, but it's an important thing. One of them is how do we get new people into the system? [inaudible] we had an initial Board discussion on that, hosted by Rinalia over the weekend, where we discussed it. It is an important thing.

The other thing we have to think about: how do we make processes more effective so we're actually delivering things in such a way that we don't, by the process, kill its people off? I don't have the answer to all of them, and some of those answers lies within you, with the community. And me, as the head of the ICANN organization, will not and should not interfere in how you do things within the community.

I talked to my team and I also talked to the members of the Board, to go back to myself and see what can we do to enhance, for instance, review? Not that we're going into what reviews are about, but what can I do to look in to see if we can do things more streamlined to support you better.

Everybody agrees on the problem. Everybody sees the consequences, and we have to find some practical solutions to some of them and take any [idea] that it is to streamline it. I don't think we can just say that we have now one grand [idea], but it has to be process after process.

Reviews are one of the things that I think going forward is something that we have to look into. I say it again, not about the content of reviews because that is done by the community, but how we as a support organization can support you in doing that. I happen to think that's something we can do.

On the second question, that's a very good question. I've said this so many times it's not even a joke anymore. I'm from a country where this is where we are positive. We are always cautious coming into transition. The political process, which I'm very respectful of – we're [talking of] an elected parliament with elected people, asking questions because they think that they represent the people who elected them. We should always recognize that process, regardless if we share the opinions or not. In that process, my job is to answer questions. I get a lot of questions from the Congress about [what's] happening. I think it's very fair to ask those questions. They have a political process, and they will continue that over the next couple of weeks and even months.

One of the interesting things with this is I think that what happened during this process, thanks to your work, is that some of those things that has been discussed over many years has now been clearer. For instance, I see my role and my organization's role much clearer now thanks to the new Bylaws. The new Bylaws are there. When it comes to accountability, when it comes to discussions about transparency, and whatever happens with the transition, that will be there. The [part of] job, we already changed the future for ourselves, regardless of the change of transition with a higher accountability, processes, clarifications, and going forward. I think that's very, very positive. You can say in the solution you came up with, we in a way also made plan B.

What many people outside ICANN don't understand or talk about is ICANN is a voluntary system. Internet is a voluntary system with no center of gravity, and it's built upon trust. It's built upon that we work together in this community with equal partners. Numbering community, everybody else who comes into this goes in because this is a practical system to do.

I'm positive, of course, for the transition. Part of that positivity comes from the fact that the work you did coming up to the transition, it's a spectacular work. That trust we built, I hope will be able to survive, for instance, an extension of what they do because it's a small [clerical] think that the US government is

looking. It's not a major thing in what we do, but we have an internal saying within the ICANN organization. "We have to deserve the right to serve." We have to show that [inaudible], as well.

I know that's not the most specific answers to your questions. Many of the answers, we're going to solve together. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Marby. Just one word to Barrack. You mentioned the word being disenfranchised. I think we need to take this out of our dictionary. The reason is all the work that we have done has created, in my view, a success. We're going to implement all of it, so none of it is going to be wasted. Your relationship is really with ICANN, not with the US government. That relationship with ICANN has changed forever to the better because of all the work you have done. If there's going to be a backlash, possibly it's a political issue rather than a relationship issue between ICANN and its community because ICANN and the community has decided we're going to go forward irrespective of whether the stewardship transition [inaudible]. You should never feel down or worried about this from all the effort that we've done. You should be proud of it, and none of it is going to be wasted. None of it. I can assure you of that.

GÖRAN MARBY: More questions?

AZIZ HILALI: Yes, [inaudible]? You want to [inaudible]? Four people would like to take the floor: Seun, Sebastien, Tijani. Seun is first. He has the floor.

SEUN OJEDEJI: I just want to use this opportunity to thank the Board for the approach with which they are taking this WS2, especially in terms of how they are distributing themselves into the various groups so that hopefully, when we engage this way from the beginning, we won't have to spend so much time like we did and we won't have to come back and forth on topics. That could even help us to achieve the WS2 goals, our objective in a timely manner without necessarily exhausting the time of the volunteers.

The other point I wanted to make is in relation to the fact that a lot of working groups are coming up right now. We have four of them right now which are very critical. We have little volunteers who are actually working in these areas. I'd like to encourage the Board as well to try and see how we can space these so that we don't have several of these activities ongoing. Otherwise, I won't be able to contribute significantly in them all. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Seun. Ariel.

ARIEL LIANG: We have a question from a remote participant, Bukola Fawole. How can one join up for volunteer in the Work Stream 2 process? Also, what are the strategies put in place to increase African representation in ICANN, especially during this transition process? Her comment is, “Kudos to the organizers of the meeting and for the opportunity to follow remotely.”

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. Tijani, you want to answer this question?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: No.

AZIZ HILALI: No? Okay. Sebastien.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you. I will speak in French. I apologize and maybe I will shock some among you. It is not something that I stated myself. I would like to talk about the statement. You can send me tomatoes at my face if you would like, but I would like to

mention one point. You would like that we separate the PTI from ICANN. I would like things to be very clear. One of the dangers if we do that is that the multistakeholder model might disappear and that we might not be there anymore. The voice of users right now only exists because within ICANN, it is present, and also because to go farther, it is financed within ICANN. If you mention that we are all volunteers, that is true, but there are different kinds of volunteers. There are those that are paid to do this by their business, and those volunteers because they willingly come to do the job.

There are others, and most of them around this table are of the second type, users who do this without being paid. Right now, I am spending my day working on ICANN issues. That's true, ICANN funded my traveling. I was funded for my dinner and my hotel and so forth. However, I don't have a salary. I can't really provide for my family right now, so I think we need to be very careful. I know I'm mixing two topics, but if the PTI goes away, you don't have the multistakeholder model and you don't have any more funding for volunteers. It is a very important decision whether registry ccTLD ask for that. I do understand why, but we need to be careful that the whole community agrees on that is an issue in terms of understanding what is the future. What do we envision?

I will stop here. Thank you very much for your invitation. Thank you for letting me take the floor right now.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Sebastien. I agree, it is a point that we need to talk about. Jim.

JIMSON OLUFUYE: [inaudible] questions for the CEO and to thank you for coming. Before the question, just to quickly say that in Africa, we appreciate the momentum ICANN is bringing to bear in Africa, but we need more. More entrepreneur centers and more outreach in Africa. Number one question: ICANN has evolved from the early days of 1998, and there are many presidents before you. Are you in touch with those presidents to be able to capture the evolution so far in terms of lessons from the past and moving forward?

Number two: We would like to share your vision as the sixth CEO, president of ICANN, and how you see the road ahead for ICANN, considering all these key challenges. Thank you.

GÖRAN MARBY: Very easy questions. I'm highly respectful of my predecessors. Very fantastic work. Fadi in many ways has been a role model. I

also have an excellent team of people who brings history and perspective to the things I do. You don't come into this job and think that you can redo everything. There's no systematically broken thing. You can just continue what your predecessor has done.

Within the new Bylaws, which becomes the answer to the second question, as well, hopefully after the transition, you will also see that the role of what I do changes. That's why I deliberately call myself the president and CEO of ICANN organization. I don't see myself as a spokesperson for the whole of ICANN. As I described it many times now, I'm one-third of ICANN, together with the Board and together with the largest one, which is the community. You are the ones who actually should write the policies and write the future story of ICANN, and to some extent, the future story of the Internet. My job is to make sure to support you in that.

We have different roles in this process, but with 3.2 billion Internet users and growing in Africa, we have to evolve ourselves with clearer roles. Many people in the US always ask me, "What are you going to do the first 100 days?" It seems like they like to ask that question. I've been spending most of my time over the last months since I really started working to look into where can I do my job to serve the community better, very much process by process.

This meeting is really interesting for me, as well, because this meeting is a meeting about working policies. It's going to attest that for me and my organization how we provide that service. Will I be able to fix everything in the first three months, six years? That's why I'm the first CEO who accepted to sign on for five years. I will stay for at least five years, hopefully, if you like me.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We like you.

GÖRAN MARBY: Thank you. After one month, I'm liked.

The answers to the questions we do today will not be the same as we do in two years or three years because we have to do this together. I genuinely mean that. It is a new era, regardless if the transition goes through or not. Things are changing in a positive way, I think.

Just one more thing I would say. This is not a job that someone likes me comes in and has this idea that this is the way we should do it. The basis of what I say comes from the work during the transition with the new Bylaws and the clarifications. The second part is that the Board and myself have spent a lot of time talking about how we should set this up going forward. Also my

team, the staff has been involved in this discussion as well, so it's not something that you just dream up overnight. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Merci, Aziz. Thank you, Mr. President and CEO. Aziz, I would like to mention two points. First of all, I would like to answer Sebastien, and secondly, I have a question or rather a request that I would like to ask of our CEO. Sebastien, do you remember that there were some people who moved towards [contract co] and we were the ones who were most opposed to that notion because it meant separation? What was done in the proposal was the ability to separate. Separability, it is a concept, the concept of an affiliate of ICANN and the thought about separation. It is only something that was thought about.

What we thought was that we needed to have separate staff and so forth. We have a great worry as far as the work of the PTI. We would like for the Internet to function normally, continues to work with the staff, the budget. That is all separate and that supports its work. Because we have a legal separation, we need for the staff of the PTI to be its own, not shared with the ICANN staff. That's what we meant by that.

As for my question or rather my request from Göran, one of the CCWG Work Stream 2 subgroups has to do with diversity. As you know very well, for us Africans, diversity is extremely important. It is essential. We believe that geographical diversity is crucial because what it means in fact is economic diversity, social diversity, and so forth. Of course, we also believe in gender diversity, but diversity is extremely important. That's what I mean.

The reason I mention this is that during your term as ICANN CEO, I would like for you to really focus on improving diversity at all levels within ICANN, whether it is staff or in whatever aspect of ICANN's work. Diversity needs to be there. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Before we hear your answer, Göran, we only have three minutes left, so I will give one minute to Sebastien and then one minute to talk about the statement. We also do need to do that.

GÖRAN MARBY:

[inaudible] my answer. I will let you know something. The first question I asked to my staff when coming in, I wanted to have a list on nationalities, language, and equality. I got that, and we now actually are submitting that. [It already] got submitted for that. The reason for that is I think it's important.

I'm not going to say that I know about this from experience, but I do know how to come from a community which has a language that nobody speaks. For some reason, people don't speak Swedish. Most people cannot put Sweden on a map. Basically, no one wants to travel to us. In my country and where I come from, equality is one of the most important things, and we are taught very early on that if you don't utilize everybody's brain, you will never succeed.

That is the kind of statements you can always do, but we have to be practical. I don't think that I can fix this alone, but I would like to work with you to support you to be able to do it because in the end, it's the community's outreach. It's the community who has a responsibility to do this. I would like to work with you to be able to do that. How do I support you to do the work you need to do? I don't think it's going to help if me, as a middle-aged man from a Nordic country, comes out and talks about this because I'm not a good spokesman for it. My job is to support you in your outreach in the best way I can. That's something that I really would like to do.

I had a discussion for a couple of days ago, Fiona, which I said that there's a single reason for doing it. Decisions are better when you have different backgrounds coming into it. If the world was run by middle-aged men from Sweden, it would be functioning, but quite boring. There is a single reason to get

better results in any discussion, and that's you bring in all different views into that discussion. Then you have to have diversity.

We're talking about a system that supports the whole world with how many languages and how many different cultures. That is the obligation we have. It's coming back to the outreach of getting more people into this one. That's why ICANN, over the last couple of years, also globalized itself, even if I don't really know what the word means. It is an important part of us. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Marby. Thank you very much for that answer. I would like for all speakers to only use up one minute. Sebastien, are you okay? Seun, would you like to go ahead? Okay, you have one minute, Cherine.

CHERINE CHALABY:

Tijani, you mentioned at all levels of ICANN, including the community. Is that right? Isn't that certain? Especially for community leadership, you can't focus on one little group. You need diversity at all levels of ICANN. I just wanted to clarify. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. Let's use two minutes to approve the statement. Besides Sebastien's comment, we do a question online. Ariel, would you like to go ahead and read it? If you could please repeat the question that we received from a remote participant, that would be great.

ARIEL LIANG: The question is from Bukola Fawole. "How can one [drawing] up for volunteers in the Work Stream 2 process? Also, what are the strategies put in place to increase African representation in ICANN, especially during this transition process?"

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Bukola. She's a French speaker, so I will speak in French to respond. One of the things that might make it possible to get better participation of Africans would be diversity precisely. Work Stream 2 means for her participation of African countries. There is not a direct link necessarily between the two because we're talking about oversight transition, but she's also addressing engagement in general. However, if we had something set up in terms of diversity, if we do diversity well, there will be more space for Africans to be involved more actively. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani. We will now close the meeting unless there are any other comments on the statement. We can actually go ahead and approve the statement as long as everybody agrees. We will ask Tijani or the staff to send the statement if you all agree as soon as tomorrow. No comment? Very good. Thank you, and we will meet again at the next meeting.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: [Three pods] of AFRALO. Please, if you want to know more about AFRALO, you have here those [three pods].

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]