

---

JOHANNESBURG – At-Large AFRALO ALS Capacity Building Session 1

Monday, June 26, 2017 – 12:15 to 13:15 JNB

ICANN59 | Johannesburg, South Africa

ALAN GREENBERG: This is the ICANN59 At-Large AFRALO ALS Capacity Building Session 1 on 26<sup>th</sup> June, 2017 from 12:15 to 1:15 in Ballroom 4.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay, please we will start. Welcome to this 59<sup>th</sup> meeting and welcome to all the ALSes. I hope they will come. It is our first capacity building session and we are really happy to meet again altogether during this fourth general meeting with 45 ALSes, and that is really a good number, the first time we are so many. In London we were 12, so you can imagine.

We have a very short time. We are late and we need to leave this room in 45-50 minutes, so I'm going to ask you because it is the first time I see some of you, so I'm going to ask you to give your name, your ALS, and your country very quickly so we can give the floor to Alan Greenberg, ALAC Chair, and to Ariel from the staff.

Ariel is going to work with us in this Capacity Building session we have prepared for you. Ariel, you have the floor, please. Present your name and your fellowship.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

ARIEL LIANG: Hi, everyone. My name is Ariel Liang. I am a policy analyst at ICANN and supporting the At-Large community. I'm based in Washington D.C. and—

AZIZ HILALI: That's all.

ALAN GREENBERG: Alan Greenberg, Montreal, Canada. ALAC Chair.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Heidi Ullrich, Vice President for At-Large Relations.

EVIN ERDOGDU: Evin Erdogan on At-Large Policy Development Support.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, At-Large, RALO Manager.

PHILIP [INAUDIBLE]: Philip [inaudible], Côte d'Ivoire.

---

ALI HUSSEIN: Ali Hussein, Kenya ICT Action Network, and At-Large organization.

LEAH SYMEKHER: Leah Symekher with NARALO ALS.

MICHEL TCHONANG LINZE: Michel Tchonang, CAPDA, Cameroon.

[MUSA MICHEL]: [Musa Michel] here, University of Cape Town.

OTUNTE OTUENEH: Otunte Otueneh, ISOC, Nigeria.

CHRISTELLE N'CHO: Christelle, ALS [inaudible], Cote d'Ivoire.

GABRIEL BOMBAMBO: Gabriel. I come from Tchad. I'm [inaudible] Tchad.

ADAM AHMAT DOUNGOUS: Adam Ahmat Doungous from Chad, ALS [inaudible]. The Association of Malawi.

---

[RAY USMAN MUSTAFA]: [Ray Usman Mustafa], the ISOC, Chad.

BAKARY KOUYATE: Bakary Kouyate, ISOC, Mali.

[NKEM NWEKE]: [Nkem Nweke], ISOC, DigitalSENSE Africa, Nigeria.

[MOME AZAN]: [Mome Azan], ITEC Center from Nigeria, NGO.

NOMSA MWAYENGA: Nomsa Mwayenga, ISOC Zimbabwe Chapter and ZimNOG.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Pastor Peters Omoragbon, Nurses Across the Borders International.

VERNATIUS OKWU EZEAMA: Vernatius Okwu Ezeama, Our Rights, Nigeria.

[THUKUMO ABILA]: [Thukumo Abila], Nigeria International Coalition, Nigeria.

---

[ZARJEN WULAI]: [Zarjen Wulai], Internet Society, Cameroon Chapter.

SARAH KIDEN: Sarah Kiden, ISOC, Uganda.

ISAAC MAPOSA: Isaac Maposa, ISOC, Zimbabwe.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Judith Hellerstein, NARALO.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Tijani Ben Jemaa, FMIA, Tunisia.

JACQUES HOUNGBO: Jacques Hougbo, IGF, Benin.

DAVID CHILENGA: David Chilenga, South Africa.

[REMY WEKE]: [Remy Weke], Digital, South Africa.

CEDRIC KINANGA: Cédric Kinanga, ISOC [inaudible].

---

[SAID SHENGOMA]: [Said Shengoma], ALAC, Sycamore.

[HALI SOTO]: [Hali Soto], Host of Africa.

[VICTOR BAGMAN]: [Victor Bagman], Progress of Blacks in ICT, South Africa.

KAILI KAN: Kaili Kan, ALAC.

CHRIS: Chris, ISOC, Mauritius.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Hi, Glenn McKnight, NARALO. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much. Now I'm going to give you the rules. For those participating for the first time with us, when you take the floor, please give your name because the interpreters will give your name when they will be translating.

---

To take the floor you have two possibilities: You ask for the floor with your card, or you can raise your hand on Adobe Connect and the moderator will give you the floor. Now I'm going to give the floor to Heidi.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

I just wanted to welcome everyone. This is going to be a fantastic series of sessions, capacity development sessions for all of you. Again, as Aziz said, very interactive. As for my support team, you've met most of them, Gisella Gruber as well over here. She is the lead for the ASL Support Team who do the call management and all the support, Gisella, and she has fantastic language skills – Afrikaans, English, and French among her other languages. And then Aziz would you like me to introduce the presenters here?

AZIS HILALI:

I forgot to tell you that when you put on your microphone, the camera is going to record you so it's important to give your name because you will be recorded. And you need to keep this card during all the week. Take it with you. When you come, you put it in front of you and if you don't have your card, Gisella is going to give it to you. If you lose it, Gisella is going to give you another one, but please keep it with you during all the week.

---

And the last thing, it is very important that all the ALSes will attend all those sessions. You have your schedules. Tijani prepared all these schedules. There are seven groups. You have mentors. If you have something to ask them, you can. You have your schedules.

If you can't attend the meeting, please tell Gisella by sending her an e-mail or telling her that you're not going to be able to come to the session. Now, Heidi, you have the floor.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Thank you. Very quickly if you do have a question please raise your tent card. We will be noting who's raised them in order. And just also in terms of what you should be getting in terms of items, you should be getting a polo shirt. If you have not received yours, at the end of the session please see Gisella at the back of the room. You should be getting a lapel pin that is by your seat, as well as an orange folder. Please let staff know if you have not received those items and we will get those for you. Thank you. And a USB drive. Okay.

And then we also have ribbons that we're going to be giving you to point out that you are AFRALO. They are on their way and I believe we have a USB drive as well on their way that has some important items about this meeting as well as ICANN and At-Large, and some pens that are on their way. We will do our best



---

to get those to you during the session and if not it will be during tomorrow's session. Thank you very much.

Aziz, should we begin the presentations with Alan and Ariel?

AZIZ HILALI: Absolutely, so I'm going to give the floor to Alan, who's the ALAC Chair, and would like to thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Could we have the presentation on the slides? Thank you very much. What we're going to be talking about today is: why do we have At-Large in ICANN? And that's a rather important question because we bring you all here to this meeting as part of AFRALO which is part of At-Large but why do we have At-Large at all?

The presentation is not very long but if anyone has questions as we go along, please put your card up or raise your hand and we'll try to make sure that as we're going, that everyone understands what we're talking about. We're trying not to use too many words that are unusual but it's inevitable. Next slide, please.

At-Large is here representing the interests of Internet users. Now what does that mean? Next slide.

---

If you look at the ICANN Bylaws, and the Bylaws are essentially the rules under which ICANN operates, it says the role of ALAC shall be to consider and provide advice on activities of ICANN in so far as they relate to the interests of individual Internet users.

This can include policies that are created by other parts of ICANN and any other issues which community input and advice is appropriate. That's a pretty wide open definition so essentially it says if we think input is warranted, we need to give it. Next slide.

We'll use the terms "advice" carefully. In general we only give advice to the Board. We don't do it very often and I'll explain why as we're going ahead. On the other hand, we provide input into various processes almost continually. There are different ways of doing that and I'll talk about the various different ways as we go forward.

Right now we're going to talk about one of the very specific ways that we either formulate advice or formulate specific statements which might be sent to other parts of ICANN. There are groups within ICANN, and you'll be hearing about a lot of them this week, for instance, that are looking at establishing a new round or new ways of having more TLDs, more generic top-level domains.

---

There's a complex process going on to decide what the rules will be and At-Large provides input into that process in many different ways, but one of them is every once in a while they may ask us a question or set of questions or may publish a report and say, "What do you think about this?" And once that happens, we trigger a process that Ariel will talk about to try to make sure that what we say does not just represent the people on ALAC but represents the needs of users, all users.

Ariel, if you can talk a little bit about the actual steps we go through to make that happen.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks, Alan. I'm going to share my screen so I can give you some pointers to explain this process so just bear with me for a second.

First I have the question to the audience in the room. How many of you have heard of ICANN public comment, and if you do, please raise your hand. Okay, great, thank you. It seems not everybody have heard of ICANN public comment so I'll just explain for a quick moment about this.

What I'm showing on the screen is this ICANN website page that displays all the public comment proceedings, and what it means is that when ICANN publish certain kinds of documents, it can be

---

related to its own operations like finance and budget plan, and it can also be the deliverables from working groups in a GNSO, or it could be any kind of policy-related documents related to the generic names or Domain Name System. They will publish these documents for input from the wider public and I will put this link in the chat and then you can check it out later.

What you see on the first section for public comment, that's the ones that are ongoing and then you can see there's open date and close date there and that means this period anyone can provide input there. And the At-Large community is very active in providing very specific input or statements to this public comment process.

ALAN GREENBERG:

We do have a question from Randolph. Is there a Randolph in the room? Okay, I guess Randolph put his hand up by mistake on Adobe Connect. Go ahead.

[TIJANI BEN JEMAA]:

Just for those who don't know how to connect online, [inaudible] into chat, I want the staff to show the Newcomers how they can connect on Adobe Connect. It's very important for us. As Ariel said, we can follow up directly through Adobe

---

Connect but people don't know how to do that so please explain to them.

[AZIZ HILALI]:

Alan, I sent the link to the programs to all the ALSes and every day you just have to click on each day and this is exactly what you have on the right, and when you go up you have the program of each day. When you click on it, you're going to have your Adobe Connect link. If you don't have a PC or if you don't have the Adobe Connect application, you need to download it. It's a little bit more technical. Ariel can give us more explanation.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Top of the screen, the top of the text, it shows the URL you need, [participate.icann.org/jnb59-ballroom4](https://participate.icann.org/jnb59-ballroom4), in this case. Back to you, Ariel.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks, Alan. Thank you for explaining. That's a crucial step to get connected on Adobe Connect. Back to what we discussed earlier about ICANN public comment, because At-Large is very active in participating in this process, we have a dedicated page on the community wiki which is the collaborative platform for the community to develop a statement and I will put the link in the chat as well and you can check it out.

---

Just to give you a quick tour of this space, if you look at the part called Open Public Comment Proceedings, these are the ones that are still open to solicit comment from the wider public, and then you will see a table that shows what are the topics.

The first one you see here is called At-Large Workspace: Revised ICANN Procedure for Handling WHOIS Conflicts with Privacy Law: Process and Next Steps. So basically that's the specific space for At-Large community to develop a potential statement on this topic, and then if you look at the columns next to this title, you will see there is a deadline when the public comment will finish. It's July 7<sup>th</sup>.

The status – comment means that we have an ongoing statement. It's already being developed and then it's soliciting internal comments from the community, and the next column you see assignees and that's the drafters who are developing an ALAC statement.

And then the other states that are showcasing what's the procedure for At-Large community to provide comments, what are the deadlines, and when the ALAC will ratify the statement just indicating its support to the statement. That's a very quick overview of this table. If you see anything that's open for public comment, this will be reflected in this table and then you can participate in the process.

---

I just want to show you one specific example in this workspace. The one I'm putting on the screen is about the proposed renewal of .net Registry Agreement. That's related to a particular gTLD. It's called the .net. ICANN has published this Draft Registry Agreement for us seeing whether the community have comment on that.

And then you will see in the table we have these particular deadlines and then also who the signees are. Then in this blue part of the section, it shows the background of this particular topic and then also what are the crucial resources and documents you need to read in order to provide input.

If you scroll down here you will see the draft versions on the At-Large community where ALAC have developed. Then from the bottom you can see the first draft and then if you scroll up a little bit, you will see the final draft. And then the one that's right below this blue section is the final one that's submitted to public comment.

There's a specific section providing the internal At-Large comments and you see there's a lot of community members have contributed to this draft statement, and if you scroll down you will see Alan has commented and Seun has commented and also you can do that as well. The way to do it is make sure to

---

obtain the credentials to the wiki and then submit your comment here. So that's one quick example.

I know Aziz is reminding me of the time but I just quickly want to show you AFRALO has done a lot of the input on statements before and there is a specific wiki page that shows AFRALO's perspective on a lot of public comment topics, and I will put this link in the chat as well.

You can see AFRALO has contributed to the discussions about enhancing ICANN accountability and also the transition of IANA functions. You will see all these on draft documents here. I will stop here for a moment.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Ariel. Before giving the floor to you, we have 15 minutes left. I'm going to ask Tijani who's one of the pioneer of AFRALO and has worked quite a lot with me to put together those ideas. I would like to have Tijani say a few words.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

I'm not going to say much. I just want to ask a question to Ariel. I am a representative from an ALS and I want to contribute to the drafting of a statement, an ALAC statement drafting, how can I do that? Who do I talk to? Who can help me with that? Thank you.



---

ARIEL LIANG: Thank you very much, Tijani, for that question. First, you can contact staff. It's [staff@at-large.icann.org](mailto:staff@at-large.icann.org). That's the e-mail to staff and then if you see a public comment that you want to contribute and draft something on behalf of the ALAC, just contact us and I will put you in touch with our subject matter expert, including Alan and others in the ALAC, and then we will help you to participate in the process. So the best way is to contact staff first.

ALAN GREENBERG: Ariel started off her talk by asking how many of you knew what public comments were and only a few people put up your hands. How many of you get e-mail from us and it's just hit delete without looking at it? I suspect a few because we send out many messages talking about public comments and what we're saying is there is a public comment about something, if you have any input, if you have any thoughts, please contribute.

So the first part of the answer is read the e-mails. But I'll be honest, if the e-mails we send you are not understandable to you, tell us. We send them out thinking they're actually going to be read and people will understand them and if we're not doing a good job, let us know. It's the only way we can do it.

---

Can you answer or ask a question? Sure.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Just a quick question. For those who are not reading those messages about public comment, is it an issue of language? I'm aware that we only send them out in English so if I can see some hands if that is an issue, if it would be useful if we did those in French as well? Aha, so that would help, perhaps. Okay, thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

I'm told Tijani wants to speak.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Alan. What I want to say is, is that an issue only with e-mailing? Because every time we do a teleconference, Aziz reads all the public comments that are open in French and in English. He does it in French and in English and we have interpreters and simultaneous interpretation.

So first step, know that we have an open public comment. Second step, if you want to contribute, work with AFRALO, with your RALO. Say you want to contribute and we're going to show you exactly how you can do it and you have several ways of doing it.

---

Please, we need you to contribute more. It's very important to contribute to those public comments so that AFRALO really exists and you are AFRALO.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Tijani. I'm going to give you the floor. After this week, what I hope is that you'll be able to be more motivated to have a strong presence during the monthly meeting.

We are a little bit disappointed that we only have 10 ALSs participating every month in our monthly teleconferences. I would love to have 40 or 45 ALS participants because that's where we debate, just like Tijani said. We debate those topics, those hot topics in ALAC. That's where we talk about issues that are important for Africa and we need to hear your voice.

Even with so many years at ICANN, I sometimes do receive e-mails that are not clear so you have to make an effort. It's not only a linguistic issue, the technical jargon you use sometimes is not very clear. I'm going to give you the floor and I see that Ali Hussein would like to take the floor. Ali Hussein, you've got the floor.

ALI HUSSEIN:

So for the new members, I'm supposing we will get into the mailing list now. For the new members, I'm supposing we'll get

---

into the mailing list at some point. How do we get into the mailing list?

ALAN GREENBERG: If you're not on the mailing list and you're at this meeting, we have a real problem. Come see staff.

ALI HUSSEIN: I'm not on the mailing list.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: You are an ALS representative and you're not on the list? Are you the first contact, the second contact of the ALS?

ALI HUSSEIN: This is my first meeting here so—

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I know but you are ALS?

ALI HUSSEIN: Yes.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Are you the first contact?

---

ALI HUSSEIN: Yes.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: And you are not on the mailing list?

ALI HUSSEIN: No, I'm not.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Please, please get in touch with our staff here. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Heidi, please, can you ask [her] to present your staff please.

HEIDI ULLRICH: It's already done.

ALAN GREENBERG: If I may have a few minutes to finish because I really think some of the questions will be answered if I can finish the presentation. It's not very long.

If we can go back to my presentation slide 7, please? Slide 7?  
Thank you.

---

What we call involvement is the participatory process that is we want people to participate. As we've said, we do this in various ways. We give advice, we write statements, we actually participate in the processes. Next slide.

There are lots of ways in which one can participate. If you get really involved in a subject and there are AFRALO people who do this, you can actually join the various working groups. They tend to have weekly or biweekly calls and this is actually the place where decisions are made, where recommendations are made.

At-Large has working groups where we bring the information to At-Large and present it for people to comment. We give webinars on a regular basis. When there's an important subject either through one of the capacity building webinars that Tijani runs or we have special purpose webinars on a certain subject, we try to make sure they're understandable to people who don't have a heavy background. We do them in multiple languages. That's the best way to get your feet wet, to get started in these kinds of things.

There's lots of sessions at ICANN meetings that you'll be able to have a chance of seeing today or this week. But for meetings that you're not physically present at, everything is available on the web and you can either watch them in real time when

---

they're happening or you can watch them after the fact at a time that's convenient to you.

So the way to get up just to learn to participate, the way to learn what's going on, is you actually have to invest some of your time and watch the sessions and you'll get to a point where you'll find one of the subjects is actually of interest to you and then you may choose to participate more heavily in the actual design process or in At-Large commenting. Next slide.

AZIZ HILALI:

You have just two minutes to finish up.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Next slide? Thank you. It's only with wide contributions from everybody that we can make sure that we're representing your needs. We call this a multistakeholder process. Why do we need more than one stakeholder? Why can't I represent all of you? I'm smart, I do my homework, so all of you can go home. I'll do everything for you.

The reality is we all have different backgrounds and different perspectives and if we want to make sure that the results are going to meet your needs, people from your community have to be involved. Thank you.

---

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Alan. We have a question from [Abdullah].

[ABDULLAH]: Actually about this issue of making comments, [in my own two cents], I receive mails. A few years ago, I noticed that when I make comments, it does not come out on the list so I made the complaint and it was rectified. A few months ago, I noticed that any time I make comments it does not go out at all, so it raises—it dampens my enthusiasm to actually make an attempt to make comments.

ALAN GREENBERG: All of us make comments sometimes which other people don't listen to so don't feel we're picking on you. What we're trying to do is create statements which represent a very large number of people.

I can't tell you why a particular comment of yours was not listened to. In some cases, we know that people make them in the wrong place and they simply don't get to the people who are writing the documents.

But often we will get comments from one person that doesn't match what a dozen other people are saying and what we're



---

trying to do is average things out. It's not always possible to make sure that everyone's comments are adhered to but the first part is make sure that they're being made in a place where they get to the right place.

Sometimes people respond to an e-mail but if you respond to an e-mail on the AFRALO list, the person who's actually writing the document may never see that so we need to make sure... So if that kind of thing happens, follow up on it with Tijani, with Aziz, and try to at least find out what's going on.

We can't always guarantee that everyone's going to be listened to but we want to make sure you're heard.

AZIZ HILALI:

Alan, I've been told that some ALSes people have trouble with Adobe Connect. Sebastien Bachollet is EURALO and can help out. [inaudible] as well. You do know him. If you have trouble connecting, you can do that during the break. Who wanted the floor? [Ayesha Abad] from Morocco.

[AYESHA ABAD]:

I'm from Morocco. My name is Ayesha and I tried to take the floor but I'm never able to do so. I didn't know technically how to do it, how to be able to communicate and speak on those

---

teleconferences and Tijani and Aziz did help me out and I would like to thank them. That's it.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you for this example. When you're connected during the monthly meeting, when you're on Adobe Connect, it's much easier. We can see you, you can take the floor, you can raise your hand, you can applaud, it's a very interesting platform so please do download Adobe Connect and try to connect right now today.

And it doesn't work with a phone. You can only follow the audio with the telephone and you have to yell on the phone so that the interpreter hears you and transfers your request to the moderator so if you're muted, we cannot hear you. It's a little bit harder on the telephone and when we started it was not easy, but with time you're going to get used to it.

Last question before we close this meeting?

ALAN GREENBERG:

From the comments that have just been made, it's obvious we have some basic problems and it doesn't help to say, "Join the webinar so that we can teach you how to do it," if you can't get into the webinar. I think you've identified a problem that we need to do some thinking about and try to figure out how to

---

make sure that we don't have barriers that stop people from participating like this so that's valuable input, thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Alan. Heidi?

HEIDI ULLRICH: I think that I don't see these as problems. I see these as opportunities for all of you to learn about how to engage. My team, including Gisella who's the lead to ensure that you're all able to understand how to get onto the Adobe Connect and onto the webinars, she's said that if we did a webinar, just a back to basics sort of webinar, her team would be able to reach out to all of you in English, French, to make sure that you are able to get onto the webinar that would then just be able to go through some of the basics on how to engage.

We could do a simple process as well so maybe that's something we should consider going forward.

ALAN GREENBERG: We're not going to solve the problem this very moment but clearly you've identified one and we will work with you on it.

---

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Heidi. Before the end of this meeting, I would like to say that we have an ALAC meeting. You're welcome to stay but we're going to have the ALAC members sit at the table. I'm part of that group so I'm going to stay at the table but you're going to go in the back of the room.

When you have an AFRALO session, we have room for the ALSes. We have to have the ALSes come first and for the next AFRALO tomorrow at 8:00, I'm going to ask you to be there on time. It's very important to respect our presenters tomorrow, to come and listen to them tomorrow at 8:00 but please stay for the next meeting. In the next [five] meetings we're going to start our next meeting. Thank you very much.

GISELLA GRUBER:

Just for those of you, who are here, the AFRALO ALSes who have not yet got their t-shirts, please do come and see me in the back of the room. We're now handing out USB sticks and AFRALO ribbons. Please for the AFRALO little orange ribbons, please only put them on if you are an AFRALO ALS. It's allowing us to identify you throughout this meeting.

So if you haven't had the t-shirt, come and see me at the back of the room and I'll be able to give you those t-shirts. And we have some ribbons to wear only if you are an AFRALO ALS so that

---

you're identified in a crowd, and we'll give you an USB key as well.

And I don't' know if professor Hilali said so but we meet in this room tomorrow morning at 8:00 a.m. This is in this room at 8:00 a.m.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

That's it. I'll say it in English as well. Tomorrow morning, 8:00 sharp, please, chap, chap in this room, please, so that we can do our 8:00 to 9:00 session. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**