

---

BARCELONA – GAC: High Level Government Meeting Lessons Learned  
Tuesday, October 23, 2018 – 10:45 to 11:15 CEST  
ICANN63 | Barcelona, Spain

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: -- to hear any reflections on the High Level Governmental Meeting, review its implementation and the context of both ATRT recommendations and the Barcelona meeting itself, explore any enhancements or lessons learned, and hear from our host maybe if there are any reflections or recommendations for the next meeting, and maybe also start thinking about next meetings. I would also like to remind ourselves that there is a document where we add host country experience, and guidance and recommendations if any after every meeting for the benefit of the following host as well. So, with this, maybe I can hand first over to you, Rob, and then we can hand then to our host. So, Rob, please.

ROBERT HOGGARTH: Thank you very much, Manal. Robert Hoggarth, for the record. The preparations for the HLGGM were something I came into the middle to, when I started working with you all, and what I learned very quickly is that is an ongoing virtuous cycle of preparation. And so, immediately after one meeting ends, the thoughts begin to turn to the next one. And what better time and place to hear from all of you about perceptions, expectations, how did things go; what did we learn; what was good; what was not so good, is to very shortly after the meeting,

---

***Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.***

---

consult with you. And so, there are really two phases for that conversation. One is substance, the other is logistics. And if we can take those in order or if a number of you just have specific insights or perspectives just generally about any aspect of the meeting, I think it would be very useful. I will review my laundry list of brainstorming items.

Julia, I have a slide that sort of has those that tweaks maybe somebody's thought process, but I'd like to just generally run through them for you and then I'll invite Jose or Raf to make a couple of points about what we might want to think about. But the short list that I put together was first the under substance, the discussions about agenda planning.

Another expect about just the sessions and what you thought about the topics, the subject matter. You all participated in both the agenda planning, as well as some of the tweaks for that. The speakers, in terms of how many and the levels of expertise. The participation, in terms of not only how many, which I seem to think was the highest number so far for an HLG, but maybe the level of participation and contributions. And then just generally, the value. You all learned over the last year, the HLG was the brainchild of accountability and transparency review process of ICANN, that thought that this outreach and interaction with members of your community, in many respects members of your own offices, ministries or governments, needed to have a closer connection with ICANN, to help you all do your work.

---

And so, just in general, it would be very helpful from a substantive perspective for you to let the leadership know: Is it working? Do you think that it did work? How may you use the High Level Governmental Meeting as a way for you to get additional support or whether it helped you in terms of your efforts within you own job. So, that's an overview in terms of substance. And then, interest, of course, on the logistical front. Feedback that you have with respect to the venue. Not only the convention center itself, but the room. These are obviously considerations for when you may have another HLG, as well as the timing. Certainly the recommendation is for every two years. This is the end of 2018 so we'd be looking at perhaps the end of 2020. And so, that type of feedback, of course, would be useful, as well.

I've been beginning to see some of the demographics and many of you do stay as members of the committee for longer two years, so many of you in the room may be involved in the next one as well. And then, of course, finally, we'll be interested in any perspectives or ideas that you have about the next one. Some of you may have interest or inclination in finding about how you may want to be involved in the planning or participation in the next one.

And with that, I will relinquish the microphone to Rafael or Jose, if they have any comments or observations that they would like to share. Because they took advantage of previous hosts as well as I hope the next host will take advantage of them, in terms of, you know, being able to share perspectives. And so, I will stop there and see if they have anything they would like to contribute. Thank you.

---

RAFAEL PEREZ GALINDO: Thank you, Rob, and good morning, everybody. Thank you again for joining us yesterday in the High Level Governmental Meeting and for your help in reaching out to your High Level officials and minister, that were present here yesterday. I have to say, it's been quite a challenge to organize this High Level meeting. When we first started this and [inaudible] quite a few months ago, we really didn't understand the challenges at all, so we were sort of thinking it was going to sort of get most of our time but actually, being the first time that we did that, it was something that in the last couple of months has really taken a lot from us.

And I think it's good that the host country really emphasizes this in terms of whatever it going to organize the next one really can learn from our experiences as we did, with our previous hosts. For example, maybe you remember that in London, in 2014, there was a comment by Mark Carvell explaining his experience with organizing this High Level meeting and (inaudible – 06:51) So we'll have to sort of try to learn from previous experiences, and in our case, we will do that as well.

So, going into detail, we believe the agenda setting is one of the most important things. We really didn't want it to be a sort of a High Level GAC meeting, so we sort of tried to avoid details and tried to really tackle the overarching issues that are most important for High Level officials and ministers. So that's the first, sort of, suggestion on our part. So we identified, as you remember in certain GAC meetings what

---

these overarching principles could be, and we, sort of, did several versions of the agenda until we got a final one that was satisfying to everybody and that (inaudible 07:46) with you guys.

So, one of the things that has been more, sort of helping within this process is that many meetings we had between ourselves and GAC staff and Manal, that has been an absolute priority for us, and I can't tell how much Manal has been in on this process. Without her this would have been very, very much more difficult. So we held these meetings sort of once a month in the first stages of the process but in this latest months we had sort of one meeting per week something like that because we really wanted to make sure that everything was under control and all the details that we had to go through were complete and under control so that we didn't leave loose ends whatsoever.

We had a lot of pressure. I mean, our team had a lot of pressure in terms of, of course, doing it the best way. So we wanted it to be really working out and to running smoothly and of course all the High Level officials are here, our bosses were here so we really had to put the best of ourselves in it, and I believe it went quite fine, so that's the feedback we've got. Of course everything is -- nothing is perfect and we can always learn from experience so that's why we're here to tell you about it.

Another issue that's very pressing and takes a lot of time is the handling invitations to ministers and High Level officials and the managing of that information, of their answers and gos and forths, for

---

that is really -- takes a lot of management time, as well as looking at host letters for the regular ICANN meeting is the thing that takes a lot of time. We contacted some previous GAC members like, for example, Denmark, who had held the Copenhagen meeting a couple of years ago or one year ago so that we could learn from them how they had managed to do that because you can learn a lot from people who have gone through the process before, but that, as well, takes a couple of people time a lot. So what else should I say?

In the end we will of course, in the following days, we will issue a terminal report of the meeting, taking into account all interventions and conclusions that we sort of can draw from this experience and from this meeting. Of course, it's not an agreed document, it's not something that has whatsoever binding value, but we believe that we should follow this tradition and let you go through that in terms of reviewing and for your information. And we, Jose and I, are open to whatever questions you may have. And thank you for everything again.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you very much, Rafa, and indeed, it was a teamwork and we had excellent organization from the host, we had tireless efforts from GAC support staff, as well as global government engagement led by Tarek Kamel and his team. So it was really teamwork. And thank you for the generous hosting and thank you for sharing your experience with future hosts. So, any reflections or comments from the floor?

---

Okay. I can see Iran, Indonesia, Canada and Argentina. Iran, go ahead.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH:

Thank you, Manal. We fully support what you said, in addition, we would like to say that we have not heard anything but full satisfaction of the way the meeting was organized, really was fantastic establishment of everything from the security, from the receptions, from the, I would say the arrangement of meetings and the lunch and so on, so forth and a lot of effort has been taken by our distinguished Spanish colleagues, since several months sending messages, reminders and so on, so forth. Very good. And also very complete and satisfactory support from the ICANN staff involved in the matter and from yourself, the chair of the GAC.

So, we don't see anything but satisfactions, nevertheless, everything is under the improvement. I hope that we can take advantage of the four meetings that we had in Canada, in United Kingdom, Marrakesh, and then Spain, and perhaps in the fifth meeting, if there is anything we take, but for the time being, and I don't think that we have anything.

The only thing perhaps, we should think limiting the number of the speakers, not the ministers or deputy ministers, so on, so forth, but the number of the speakers to the subject and that is relate to [inaudible] to the agenda that we will establish. A little bit limited in order to provide more time. That has nothing to do with the

---

arrangement made by our distinguished Spanish colleagues, but it's a GAC issue. Maybe we consider limiting that. Nothing else. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Kavouss, for the excellent feedback. I will defer to you but I also would like to help the host organize better. Early confirmations would have also helped to assess how things would go. So, Rafael, would you like to comment on this?

RAFAEL PEREZ GALINDO: Yeah. Thank you, Iran for these generous words. We, of course, it's a challenge to handle the time and when we first sent the invitations, we didn't really know how many people would be asking for a slot, so some people have answered very, sort of, promptly but some of the guys who maybe didn't know it earlier have sent the allocation requests later. So it is really a challenge, you are pretty right that it's something that the next person, next team who will handle will have to really take into account the timing issue, because it's one of the most challenging things. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Rafael, I have Indonesia next.

BAMBANG HERU TJAHJONO: Yeah. Thank you, Manal. What I would like to share is that every country has problems internally, you see. And some (inaudible 15:10) half of a time schedule, while some other countries are not so well



---

managed and so -- in the case of Indonesia, for example, it happened that at the same time we have IMF and [inaudible] meeting in Bali, where many have [inaudible] and the minister coming. And all of a sudden, the minister cannot come, and the director general has to go there and so on, and so on, you see.

As a result, then you have to appoint someone else, another officer to come here but by the time it happens, the schedule is already very short. And another problem is of the visa, you see. Because the minister will have for diplomatic visa, for example – but then the standard [inaudible] will not have a diplomatic visa and have to use the service visa or even the private passport. Then you need the visa for doing that and it may happen that the window of time will not be enough to get the visa to [inaudible], and I think that's one of the problems that ICANN can look after. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you very much, Indonesia. I have Canada next.

PAMELA MILLER: Thank you, I just wanted to add our congratulations as well. I thought that it was an excellent event, and it was very well managed, well organized. And just to reinforce again, I think it's important following the IRT, I think it was a very good idea to try to have more visibility and to raise the level of awareness of the GAC. And I think even if our own minister was not able to come, certainly in the preparation for the meeting the visibility was there and the fact that we had such great

---

turnout, I think it was 122 delegations or there is a large number that were present. I think that was significant progress since the first meeting in Toronto. So, again, just wanted to offer congratulations.

And in terms of the format, I think having panels, was very, very useful, having experts that set the stage for the discussion was very, very helpful. And I guess the only possibility could be perhaps to have, perhaps, as was mentioned, the interventions perhaps to have some visibility as to the topics that people were going to address. But that's very hard to do. I know we all know that's difficult. People are going to want to speak on what they've chosen to speak so it's difficult to manage that aspect of it. But in general, I thought it was very well done. So, I think in terms of lessons learned, the panel part of it, I think could be carried on to the next session. I think that was very helpful. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Canada. So, I have a quick reaction from Rafael, then I have Argentina, Portugal, and Trinidad, and Tobago. Rafael, go ahead, please.

RAFAEL PEREZ GALINDO: Thank you, Canada, for your kind words. There was something I forgot to mention before, we tried to make decisions more dynamic by adding moderators and experts and discussions. That goes against the timing issue again, because even though we tried to talk them into speaking for just 6-8 minutes, the experience shows us that actually

---

people have this tendency to talk longer for them to sort of double the time, so that wasn't really against us when we tried afterwards to make up for that. So maybe sort of instead of having discussions or experts [inaudible] half of them and really being very persistent and people trying to not take longer than expected. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Rafael. Argentina, please.

ARGENTINA: Thank you, Manal, and thank you to our Spanish host. For Argentina, being in Spain it's like being at home. You always make us feel like that, so that's remarkable. I think that the organization was fantastic. I know how difficult it must be to organize a meeting with more than 100 delegations and delegates and all that.

So my comments apart from my congratulations would like to be constructive. Many delegations spoke about the need for gender balance; I didn't see the gender balance in the panels. I know that's extremely difficult, especially when you have delegates that are mainly men. I think that in the future that balance could be handled by inviting experts that are women. There are several in the environments that could be -- you may be inviting women that are experts and then you have the delegates that are men, that could be compensated. The lack of diversity was also in the open ceremony, but it's not related to our work here. I know it's extremely challenging but maybe in the future we can think about that.

---

Also, in the panels I counted 21 participants among delegates and experts. There was only one from Latin America and Caribbean, and we are like 30 + countries, so maybe a more diverse view in the panels in the future could be good but in general I think it was a very very good meeting, the logistics were great, the organization was fantastic, and I know that's extremely complex and my congratulations to all of you. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you very much, Argentina, and yeah, definitely the diversity is something that we should keep in mind, gender, geographic. Might be challenging, as you said, but definitely it's important. Portugal, please.

PORTUGAL: Thank you. In terms of the meeting, we have nothing but congratulations to express, it has been wonderfully organized with very interesting panels, with very good speakers. In my view, discussions could have run a bit longer. However, I believe that the topics addressed were very interesting.

My question is related to the substance. When I was getting ready for this meeting together with my minister, I was surprised to see that these issues are not discussed within the GAC and in fact I explained to my minister that the GAC reacts to ICANN's agenda. Therefore, this is what the GAC does, it operates reactively to topics such as the GDPR. In that case, I do not have that expertise. My colleague from the data

---

publishing national commission works on that area and we abide by the European Union. There is nothing I can say in that regard and I cannot force myself to hold that debate or discussion where it is not appropriate for me.

So the four panels were very interesting but we could address those topics within the GAC. They could part of our agenda and the GAC could meet a purpose apart from reacting to events and have our own committee agenda. That would encourage further government engagement. It is difficult to explain to a minister what the GAC does when he poses these questions. So we should have some kind of follow up, politically speaking.

I am not here to take the floor for just three minutes. We need a little bit more structure and time, and we need to focus on whether we are accomplishing our objectives. We might think about some kind of presentation we could make to the GAC, and we could think about having our own agenda and follow up on that agenda on a High Level governmental meeting.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: I can see Rob already taking notes of everything. So I have Trinidad and Tobago, Japan, Jamaica, and Cook Islands, and then maybe we need to -- and Turkey and then we need to move on. So Trinidad and Tobago, please. Go ahead.

---

TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO: Thank you, Manal. I just wanted to compliment the team who as far as I could see, put on an excellent job. Congratulations, so I'll join with my colleagues in saying 'a job well done'. As soon as I walked into the room, I recognized the expertise in the planning and the logistics. And throughout the day it was an excellently orchestrated event.

I would say one thing, which is the time, I know that there was a challenge in respect to time frames that persons were meant to abide by and I did notice that difficulty, but having said that, I would say it was an excellent event and well done. Thank you very much.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Trinidad and Tobago. Japan.

JAPAN: Thank you, Chair. We really thank you for the tireless effort of the Spanish Government and the GAC Secretariat for this excellent meeting. As you know, the next meeting in March will be held in Kobe, Japan. We will not have the HLGGM meeting in March, but I think the government will have their own role to welcome ICANN meetings. For the Spanish Government, we would appreciate it if you could share your experiences or lessons learned as the host country for us. We are very happy to welcome all of you to Kobe. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Japan. Jamaica.

---

JAMAICA:

Thank you very much, Chair. We join with our colleagues who spoke previously to say that from our perspective, we felt the meeting was excellently organized, we want to thank the hardworking team for all of the efforts that went into the meeting yesterday and certainly the presentations and the interventions were useful.

We want however to just make two quick comments; one will perhaps not affect the next meeting but perhaps the meeting after that, and it's that we had shared at some point earlier, I think at the Puerto Rico meeting, that when we're planning this type of meeting and it's close to international events, my colleague from Indonesia mentioned that we may have some challenges getting ministers to participate, so this time the Caribbean didn't feel as many -- well, any ministers really because we have [indiscernible] essentially happening in the next three or four days and the challenge would have been to have ministers in Barcelona on Monday and then to go back home and then to leave for Abu Dhabi on the weekend. So that is something that we can look at when we're planning the timing for the next meeting.

And then the other aspect, I completely agree, Chair, that we were given the opportunity to indicate whether or not we wanted as countries and as ministers to make interventions. However, I would humbly suggest that we leave a space on the agenda, very deliberately so, for as we call it open interventions because there are delegations who because of challenges, may not be able to indicate that they could make interventions during the time frame that was indicated, and if there's a very short window for open interventions, perhaps 15 minutes to half an hour at most, then it would allow other delegations

---

who have gotten the approval afterwards to intervene to do so. But other than those two comments, we want to say congratulations to the team and we look forward to the next meeting.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Jamaica. I have two more requests for the floor; Cook Islands and Turkey. Please keep it brief because I can already see NomCom leadership in the room. So, Cook Islands, please.

COOK ISLANDS: Thank you, Chair. I just want to register our congratulations, Cook Islands, and full satisfaction both with the logistics and substanceorganizing. Rafael and Jose, thank you very much for your continuous communications. Rob and team, thank you very much, Tarek and team, and also to you, Manal.

I want to speak specifically on behalf of newcomers to ICANN, especially from my region in the Pacific. I want to make a suggestion for your consideration, perhaps to include the representative from the global shareholder engagement team because in our region [inaudible] is well known and perhaps including him in the communications will allow responses both from the GAC representative and from the ministerial offices to both the organizers and also to the GAC support team.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you very much, Pua. Turkey, please.



---

TURKEY: Thank you, Chair. I congratulate the GAC Secretariat and the GAC Leadership for organizing such a wonderful event yesterday. I strongly believe that High Level meetings like the one we had yesterday really helps understand the key decision makers to understand the multistakeholder model, how it works and what are the benefits of such organizations can help in the governance of Internet, and by that I mean with other issues as well.

So just a small comment, suggestion maybe; I think it could help to keep the key decision makers' interest on this issue if the GAC Secretariat and the leadership sent them on a regular basis a smaller part on what's going on, and besides, I'm sure the representatives are here doing an excellent job by explaining what's going on here in the ICANN meetings, but just a small summary could just keep their interest going, it would be very helpful. Thank you.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Turkey. Is it really brief? Go ahead, please. Introduce yourself.

COMORO ISLANDS: I am the representative of Comoros. I would like to thank the government of Spain for the excellent organization of this meeting. It is my first participation here within the GAC and at an ICANN meeting. I represent the Comoro Islands. My ICT minister wasn't able to be here because of other commitments. He would have liked to be here but

---

anyway, I want to thank the Spanish government for this excellent meeting.

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: -- acknowledge the tireless efforts by GAC support staff. So if you can please stand up and we can give them a round of applause and then we move on.

[applause]

And Rob, of course --

[applause]

And I have to admit also, the government engagement team, I can't see anyone of them here in the room now but we can do this later during the day, so with this -- and here is Laurent as well, so maybe we can --.

[applause]

So Rafael, please before we conclude the session, go ahead.

RAFAEL PEREZ GALINDO: Thank you, Manal. Just 10 seconds to say thank you again to all of you, to say thank you to all the ICANN staff, Julia, Gulden, Laurent, Tarek, [indiscernible], Erhan; my team at the ministry, Jose, Laura [inaudible] including Rosa, Maria, Silvia, Jesus. Thank you.

---

MANAL ISMAIL, GAC CHAIR: Thank you, Rafa. So NomCom leadership is here. Please, and very very sorry to keep you waiting.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**