

---

MARRAKECH – Joint AFRALO AfrICANN Meeting  
Tuesday, June 25, 2019 – 10:30 to 12:00 WET  
ICANN65 | Marrakech, Morocco

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: ...in every ICANN meeting and it's a venue where the African Internet community and participants within ICANN get together. And it's an opportunity for all of us to know the new faces, the newcomers as well as meeting old friends and debating and discussing a hot issue. We usually prepare a [draft] statement on that issue, and you will have the chance to debate the substance of that statement. I think there are copies of that statement in English and French already circulated.

I would like just to say a few words about AFRALO, then introduce our guests, and then we go straight to the discussion about the statement and the issue that currently we're going to debate.

AFRALO, for some of you that are new to ICANN, is the African regional Internet organization that represents the voice of the Internet users in Africa within the ICANN At-Large structure. So within ICANN, there's an At-Large constituency which basically represents the global Internet users or end users voices within ICANN community and provides the policy feedback that's coming from the users.

---

**Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.**

---

AFRALO has ALSes, what we call At-Large structures as organizations. Those are Internet organizations in the different African countries. Those are Internet Society chapters, Internet groups, digital rights groups. So we have a wide, diverse array of organization membership that's a part of AFRALO.

We also have individual members who are AFRALO members, and we're happy to have [any] new members here who are not associated with any organization to join us. We have the students from the Rabat telecom institute here with us as part of the activities that we do.

I would like to highlight one major document that you might see in your tables or seats. It's the AFRALO hot topics document. It's basically the policy topics that have been selected by the community to be of interest to the African users community within ICANN. You will see issues like the Domain Name System Security Extensions (DNSSEC). Diversity and participation within ICANN is also a topic that is of interest for us, how we can ensure more Africans are participating actively in the policy development within ICANN. So we thank the staff for their help in producing this document. You have the document in three languages, and I encourage you to go through the document, see the policy issues, and contribute later on in actively engaging in our working groups.

---

With that being said, I would like to give the opening remarks to Maureen Hilyard. Maureen is the current At-Large Advisory Committee chair. Maureen, you have the floor.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you very much, Mohamed. I'm very pleased to be here this morning with you and just very briefly want to welcome you all here to ICANN 65 and also to At-Large. A warm welcome to the students who are working with our AFRALO leadership. And I'm sure that you will get great value and support from the leaders who are actually guiding you through how ICANN works. I hope you will take special notice of what we do in At-Large and come and join us sometime.

I just wanted to say how much I appreciate the support of our AFRALO leaders on the ALAC. For example, we have Tijani, Hadia, and Seun, and also Daniel who has been a really great support and lead not only in working groups but also in his leadership of the outreach and engagement subcommittee. A very important one. It's one of the mandated activities of At-Large, and it's really great to have someone from AFRALO leading that.

There are two things that have been really important for us in the first few months of this year, and that has been the At-Large Review Implementation Plan. I really appreciated the support that's been given by our AFRALO members in helping us to

---

prepare our first interim report which has just gone to the operational effectiveness committee of the board and actually lets people know how much we're actually working within At-Large to improve the way in which we work and to make it a more welcoming place to be part of.

Just finishing off, the other important activity for us has been ATLAS III which is our training activity that we actually are going to be holding in Montreal later on in the year, our third ICANN meeting of the year. I'm hoping that AFRALO is going to be happy with the fact that they have got quite a considerable number. Of the 60 travelers who have been selected, I think I can tell you that 19 of them are from AFRALO. So I know that some people have missed out, but I think I'm confident that the members who come from AFRALO and from the other regions as well are going to be a great support to AFRALO in developing a policy at the grassroots level which is our objective for ATLAS this year.

Again, welcome, and it's great to see you here. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Maureen. I would like to welcome and introduce Cherine Chalaby who is the chair of the ICANN board. Cherine has always been committed to attending this meeting. He has a busy schedule, but he always makes sure that he is

---

coming here to talk to us. And also he is bringing and I think Göran as well, the CEO, is here. So, Cherine, you have the floor, please.

CHERINE CHALABY:

Good morning, bonjour, and salaam alaikum [inaudible]. Thank you, Mohamed. I really appreciate these kind words. I will say thank you to Fatimata. Thank you very much. And thank you also to the rest of the AFRALO board members for inviting me to speak today. I am Egyptian. I am from the African continent, and therefore I feel very much at home here as I've always said and always welcome the opportunity to come back and speak and exchange ideas.

I think this meeting is important. It is important for the African community to express its voice in the ICANN world, and I think you're doing it very well and you're doing it more often. And the statements you produce are very, very important. And particularly this one because the topic you are focusing on which is the effectiveness of our multistakeholder model is crucial. This model has served us well for the last 20 years, but I think we have to have the courage to review some aspects of it to make it more effective, more efficient, more inclusive, easier to follow, easier to participate. And therefore, what you're doing here is truly important, and I sincerely hope all other communities within ICANN are taking a very serious look at that.

---

I hope you will participate this afternoon. There's a public meeting at 5:00 – from 5:00-6:30 – which Brian Cote will facilitate. I'm going to be there, and I look forward to seeing many of you.

I don't want to say more than that because I look forward to having a dialogue with you and answering questions. So I'm going to hand over to Göran. Thank you.

GÖRAN MARBY:

Thank you, my friends. And thank you very much for inviting me. As some of you might know, Marrakech is a little bit of a special place for me because this venue was the first time I ever came to an ICANN meeting a little bit more than three years ago. I was ingrained in ICANN quite fast over the three days I was here. I met a lot of you, and I was very grateful for the support and help.

When I came into the room, my staff came up to me and said that I had to give you a compliment over this. So instead of listening to Cherine, I read it. And I think my staff were right to give it to me. This is a very impressive document, and I'm really grateful for it. Especially, your emphasis on privacy and DNSSEC. That is very close to my own heart, especially the DNSSEC where we need to work.

I would like [to just in my brief notes] take a step back and talk a little bit about something that we sometimes forget. ICANN as an

---

institution is responsible for coordinating all identifiers. That is something that we don't always talk about. ICANN is in the basis a technical organization. ICANN as an institution provides the Internet to the world. Every time any Internet user ever goes online, they hit something that originates from ICANN.

That provides an obligation to us. We often talk about the essential policies. We often talk about the importance of the policies in a multistakeholder model. The balance of that responsibility we have is the multistakeholder model because you have to be active in the system to create the accountability, to create the transparency of the system to be able to provide the service to the world.

ICANN is a unique organization. The world has never seen anything like it before. Over the last 21 years, we all made mistakes, we all progressed in strange ways, but we're learning every day. This setting here is one of the new challenges for us. I think Africa now in the last couple of years has more than tripled its amount of Internet users. That is positive, but it's also a lot of things to do.

I have, together with my team, an increased awareness of how we have so much to learn to help to work with other partners in the ecosystem, other partners [other ones] to be able to contribute to the fantastic development that has happened here in Africa. In

---

that, you are very important. We don't come with a preset formula how to solve things. My team and myself are here to support and help, but more above anything to learn from you who have the experience.

So thank you for inviting me. And more than that, I thank you for your engagement in ICANN and in the Internet overall. Thank you very much.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Göran. I would like to introduce Leon Sanchez. Leon is the [At-Large] board member that will present At-Large within the board. He's always interactive and engaged with his community. Leon, please?

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much, Mohamed. It's always good to come back to an AFRALO-AfrICANN joint meeting. It is one of my favorite moments in each meeting because I feel proud that I belong to a community like AFRALO. It is a very positive sign to see that AFRALO is one of the regional At-Large organizations that has consistently and improvingly contributed to the ICANN policy development processes and to the multistakeholder model.

As Cherine was saying, the quality of the statements that you produce have become increasingly good. And I think that the



---

statement that we have here to discuss and to comment upon is proof of how engaged and how well informed and how representative of the [users] interests and importance of that AFRALO has on this table.

As Cherine also said, the evolution of the ICANN multistakeholder model will shape the future of this organization through the years to come. As I had the opportunity to comment on some of the meetings that I had the pleasure to attend remotely in this intersessional fashion, I encouraged you to participate in this effort. This will define who we will be and how we will do things in the years to come.

I've read the statement, and I think that you touched fundamental issues. Trust is one of the issues that you touched, and I think that trust is essential for the Internet to function and it's essential for groups of people like us to be able to discuss ideas, to reach agreements, to reach consensus. I think that, as I said, this is a fundamental issue in your statement.

Cultural consideration, the different cultures and diverse communities that form ICANN. I've always been a believer and true supporter of a statement that says that in ICANN's diversity lies its richness. I think and I truly believe that having a diverse and inclusive community is what actually will allow ICANN to continue its mission and to serve the public interest.

---

The regional challenges and realities. Those of many challenges that sometimes I share with you coming from a developing country like Mexico. I empathize with your points, and I really hope that these challenges that, as you state, greatly hinder our ability to effectively participate are taken into account into the evolution of the ICANN multistakeholder governance model.

Identifying the real representative of the community is another challenge. I think that AFRALO has done a very good job in identifying the representatives and providing them with the tools and the trust for representing your community.

Inadequate representation. That touches upon a very important subject as the visa denial. We are aware we have been many times aware of this problem, and I am sure and I can assure you that ICANN organization does whatever they can and they have at hand to try to solve all the visa issues that the participants face. But we also need to understand that governments have the sovereignty to actually tell us who can go in and who can't go out. This is something that we continue to work with the community and with the organization to try to solve these problems as many times as possible.

The complexity of policy development processes and the demographics are also two fundamental issues that you touch upon in your statement. I really much appreciate the

---

contributions in the way that you frame them here because it will ultimately lead us to successfully evolve the multistakeholder model of governance that we use to work in ICANN.

So with no further ado, I would like to thank you again for having me here, for allowing me to share my views, my ideas, and to commend you and congratulate you for the high quality statement that you have produced. And as Cherine said, this is a very important input for the work that the board and the organization do. And I also encourage you and invite you to participate in the session that will be held later today led by Brian Cute in which we will be participating as well. Your input is paramount to achieve a successful evolution of the ICANN multistakeholder model. Thank you very much, Mohamed.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR:

Thank you very much, Leon. And really work closely with ICANN staff either in the engagement team in Africa or the government affairs as well. So we'll give the chance now to Laurent Feralli, the director of government and international governmental organization engagement. Laurent, you have the floor, please.

LAURENT FERRALI:

Thank you, Mohamed. First I would like to convey Tarek Kamel's thanks for the invitation. Unfortunately, Tarek was not able to travel this time to Marrakech. So thanks again for the invitation.

I read your statement. As ICANN staff, I cannot provide any comments on this. But I can tell you that you are sharing some concerns with the African GAC reps, many concerns. You know that we are facing some challenges regarding the participation of African GAC rep in the GAC discussion. This is why the GAC decided to set up a GAC working group for [inaudible]. As [inaudible] team, our role is to coordinate ICANN's efforts in a capacity building workshop for the GAC. We had [original] GAC capacity building workshop last Sunday here in Marrakech, and it was quite successful. A lot of GAC members from the African region attended this meeting.

Yesterday, you and the GAC had a joint session on capacity building. I think it's a very good opportunity for GAC to learn about your activities related to capacity building and try to find some synergies between capacity building activities and your capacity building activities. It's crucial for ICANN to have more participation from the African region within the GAC. I'm talking about the GAC because [inaudible] is mostly [linked] with GAC. So I hope that this cooperation will help to help GAC members from the African region to have a more active participation within the GAC and within ICANN discussion.

---

Again, thank you very much for the invitation. If you have any questions during the week, please let me know. Thank you.

**MOHAMED EL BASHIR:** Thank you very much, Laurent. Our last guest speaking slot is for Yaovi Atohou. Yaovi is representing the Africa engagement team, and we work closely with Yaovi and Pierre. Pierre is a VP of engagement in Africa. I also encourage you tomorrow to attend the Africa strategy session that is going to be held at 3:15. Yaovi, please, you have the floor.

**YAOVI ATOHOUN:** Thank you very much, Mohamed. And thank you also for making the introduction. We have also our colleague Bob Ochieng who is in the room here. Pierre who is leading the team unfortunately could not make it for a personal unavoidable matter. So I just want briefly to mention that the Africa strategy is a document strategy developed by the community which the idea started in 2012 during one of the ICANN meetings. This document was completed by the contribution from the whole community. So now you have the report after five years of implementation of this strategy, and it's available on ICANN website.

So the key activities of the project we have been able to do are, for example, capacity building. We can consider, for example, the

---

DNS entrepreneurship project initiative. We can mention, for example, the DNSSEC workshop. As you know, DNSSEC is a key component [still] in the new ICANN strategic plan. So through that DNSSEC workshop, we have been able to help some ccTLDs in Africa. Not only the technical people. The decision makers also. There have been trained and they understand now what is DNSSEC, very important. So that was a key project from which we have been able to have some zone files signed from some ccTLDs in Africa.

We are also doing some activity, a project we call the YouthCom initiative. Because of the fact that not everyone can come to an ICANN workshop or be a fellow, we have the opportunity to work with local partners in countries to organize a [inaudible] event. So recently we had the YouthCom workshop in Uganda prior to the AIS meeting in Kampala. It was a collaboration with ISOC chapter and AFRALO in general.

So we hope that we can continue the collaboration and do more in this plan of the African strategy because two main objectives we want to achieve is to increase participation from the community. And one [also] key component [of that work that] has been achieved is to have an engagement center in Nairobi. So it's something also very important we have completed in this strategy document.

---

So again, this collaboration is something we need to keep doing [during] the key event in Africa. Tomorrow we have a session from 3:15-4:45 in Diamond room. We'll have the opportunity again to discuss about how we can improve participation from the community and how better we as staff can support the work for the global ICANN ecosystem.

So we thank you again for the invitation, and thank you, AFRALO [leaders]. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Yaovi. I think we can start the discussion of the statements. I will leave it now to Tijani Ben Jemaa so he can introduce the topic. And then we'll have the discussion about the statements and get your feedback. Tijani, please?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed. First of all, I would like to speak French here because we have our students who are more comfortable with French and we have a lot of our community who are French speakers. So please put your headset if you want to understand what I am saying. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Can we take a picture?

---

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Ah, yes. We will take a picture.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Abdulkarim, if you can continue with the statement, please.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Okay, thank you. Before I read the statement, I want to indulge everybody to please give me 30 seconds because this is going to be the last face-to-face meeting that is going to be chaired by Mohamed and Fatimata. If we can please give them a round of applause for being a wonderful chair, Mohamed and Fatimata.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: We're back. Sorry for the photo.

GÖRAN MARBY: Can I just say that I'm really sorry that I'm late. I'm already 15 minutes late for my next meeting. No disrespect whatsoever. I leave you in safe you in the safe hand of Cherine and Leon. They know stuff much better than I do anyway, so make sure that you grill them.



---

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Very well. So let's start. First of all, I would like to let you know that I'm proud of our RALO. Our RALO is the only one that discusses important ICANN topics and gives points of view to the board and to the interested parties. Every ICANN meeting we are the only RALO doing those types of statements and working that way. We're talking about the hot topics of ICANN. And we now have in three languages: French, English, and Arabic.

Let's talk about our statement. How to have the multistakeholder model evolve at the ICANN level for the different stakeholders at ICANN and the diversity of interests that we see at ICANN. It's a governance model that is going to have all the parties interested in the Internet so that they discuss those topics altogether.

When we started this topic at ICANN, some people were happy because they thought that it would bring more regulation to this governance model. I'm not going to teach you a lot. If you start to regulate this governance model, it's going to be dead on arrival. They thought that because they were concerned and bothered by the fact that some parties according to them were not very keen to supporting their positions. So they had their own ways of revising the multistakeholder model.

But us as Africans with that declaration and statement we believe that we should have no regulation. We should define the model. We do not have a definition of that model, and we believe that

---

this is a governance model that is going to enable us to put together around a table all the stakeholders and entities with all their different legitimate interests because you now that each party has their own interests, and it can be in contradiction with others. They are legitimate interests. Business is legitimate. Making money is legitimate. Policies and political interests are the same. They are legitimate.

We are about the common interest of the end users of the Internet and we need to have all the stakeholders with all of their different interests, and we have to make decisions as a consensus in general. And if we cannot reach a consensus, well, we have to vote. That's our multistakeholder model as we see it as Africans.

Yes, representativity, to be represented. Some people do not feel they are represented in the multistakeholder model. So that's a real issue for many. According to us what we need is to have the stakeholders representing their community.

So consensus. It's not about people. If you go in a working group, you have let's say 50 people working together. This working group is going to represent all the stakeholders. And if the stakeholders are represented fairly, that's the thing. But those working groups are very open. So they can bring some people representing a particular interest and the consensus by people is not going to be fair. We need to have a stakeholder consensus,

---

not a people consensus. Of course, conflict of interest must be well-known if that exists.

For each and every decision we take in that model we need to be aware of the global public interest which is in our ICANN bylaws. Even if we have our own interests at heart, we need to work into global public interests.

And fourth, there is also a governance issue about the mandate of the people in charge. We talked about it earlier and we discussed it in that statement. We do believe as African community that we need to limit the terms and once the term is over, the person should stop influencing. The person can be here and keep working, of course, but a person who already served his or her term shouldn't try to influence decisions later on once his or her term is over. And that's sometimes the case now.

So that's what this statement is all about. And we think it's important to have a statement regarding that because we really believe in that model. It's going to be a model that's going to serve the community if it works well. But if someone or some regulations are coming and we exclude some people, some countries, some areas of the world, it will not work and it will not be appropriate to manage ICANN. Thank you very much.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: [Thank you very much], Tijani. We already had the statement. I think it has been distributed. So maybe, Abdulkarim, quickly can you just go through and after that we just open the discussion. So please, Abdulkarim.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much.

“We, the African ICANN Community members participating in the ICANN65 Policy Meeting and attending the Joint AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting on Tuesday, 25th June 2019, discussed the topic “Evolving the ICANN Multi-stakeholder Model (MSM)” and would like to make the following comments:

“One of the strategic objectives of the ICANN Strategic Plan for 2021-2025 is to improve the effectiveness of ICANN’s MSM of governance. The MSM aims at allowing stakeholders to reach an agreement in which all stakeholders can effectively live with. Hence, inclusivity is essential as it allows different stakeholders to participate in the decision-making process, regardless of race or geographic location.

“We believe that in a multistakeholder environment, all avenues must be explored to reach a consensus, and the following are very important in achieving a truly inclusive ICANN MSM:

---

“1. Trust: Trust is an important element to achieve consensus. A situation where a segment of the community or region feels that it is not always carried along or taken into adequate consideration would lack the element of trust and hence it would be difficult to establish consensus.

“2. Cultural consideration: The world is a global community made of different cultures and diverse communities. It is of utmost importance that the peculiar cultural differences be taken into consideration in the participation in the working groups and when seeking to reach consensus. The fact that some cultures have different festive periods during which participation would be low scale should be taken into due consideration.

“3. Regional challenges and realities: The high cost and low quality of Internet connectivity is also a reality in many developing regions, many of which are African countries, that are a part of the ICANN community. This greatly hinders our ability to effectively participate in this multistakeholder model. Also, some African countries have had their Internet censored or blocked outright by governments, therefore when the process takes too long we often miss some of the calls.

“Sometimes we get cut off during calls and before we get connected back a critical decision has been taken. We are left with no choice but to just be a listener. This has a long-term effect

---

as fellowships such as ATLAS III, where participants are required to show active participation over the last year seems like a double jeopardy for our community.

“4. Identifying the real representative of the community: For a multistakeholder model to be fully effective, the relevant stakeholders must be represented by someone who is appointed by the stakeholder group. At the moment anyone can claim to represent any group.

“5. Inadequate representation: Apart from the connectivity problem, a lot of participants from African countries cannot attend the face-to-face meeting because of visa denial.

“6. Complexity of Policy Development Processes: Policy Development Processes especially on public interest issues should be simplified.

“7. Demographics: There is a need to ensure that leadership is balanced, youths, women and people with disabilities must be taken into consideration.

“The ICANN MSM is far from being effective in our opinion for several reasons:

“a) There is not a common understanding of the MSM such as whether the stakeholders are equal or not.

---

“b) The decision-making process take sometimes too long causing a burnout of the volunteers. Only stakeholders for which the final decision impacts their incomes will remain and decide.

“c) The system is too complex for participants. This discourages newcomers to engage.

“d) Lack of culture of public interest. Each stakeholder sticks to its narrow interest and forgets that in the ICANN bylaws, ICANN is bound by respecting the global public interest.

“e) Lack of compromise culture. Each stakeholder clings to his or her position.

“f) Lack of trust between stakeholders. There is a trend to neglect parts of the community such as end users, some regions from the global south, etc. Sometimes, it is an attempt to dominate these community parts. This leads to the destruction of any kind of trust.

“g) Individual representation does not reflect the MSM spirit. Giving a voice to each and every person speaking on his/her own behalf would not put all stakeholders’ interests on the same footing.

“h) Few people continue to lead their stakeholder groups by jumping from a position to another, chairing several things at the same time. They are dominating the community.

---

“To improve the ICANN MSM, we think that several things should change:

“a) The MSM should be clearly defined as a governance system where all stakeholders, on equal footing, with their different legitimate interests debate issues and take decisions thereupon preferably by consensus among the stakeholders or by vote in the extreme cases where consensus is impossible to reach.

“b) In all the working groups, all stakeholders should be allowed to be represented if they so desire.

“c) In the working groups where several stakeholders are represented, the consensus should be among the stakeholders, not the persons participating in the working group.

“d) Conflict of Interest should be clearly declared in working groups and should be taken seriously.

“e) Any decision coming out from any ICANN structure (SO, AC, Board, Working Group, etc.) should take into careful consideration the global public interest.

“f) Chairs of SO/AC should be rotational among all regions for a fixed term of two years for inclusiveness.



---

“g) There should be clear and sharp term limit for all positions at ICANN (2 times, 2 years, for example) after which the person should not take any leading or representation role for at least 2 years to permit to the new management to exercise their role without any influence or domination.

“We make these recommendations because we believe that structural issues should be given priority to make the model more effective while taking other issues into consideration. We also acknowledge that some of the issues raised in this statement might be regarded as beyond the current MSM consultation; however, we believe that this can be a trigger for a more comprehensive review.

“Thank you!”

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: This is really an outstanding statement. In terms of language, in terms of the depth of the issues that have been covered. I’d like to thank the drafting team: Abdulkarim, Tijani, Sarah, Barak. Everyone really participated in this.

We open the floor now for discussions. I’m sorry if there is no roving mic. There is? Okay. That’s good. So we have a roving mic now. Please, we need to hear from you. Just tell us your name and your affiliation and proceed. Please?

---

MATOGORO JABHERA: Yes, my name is Mr. Matogoro Jabhera from Tanzania. I really appreciate for the statement. However, I still have a few observations. The first observation that I think it's better for the team to discuss and agree is how we can improve ICANN engagement in Africa. We are all aware that the conference is currently being held in Africa, but we see Africa still underrepresented. That means there are still a number of issues that we need to sort, although we have mentioned them within the statement.

The second observation or recommendation that I'm trying to give is that through the Africa engagement team, we can try to see if we can adopt the ISOC model where we can have ICANN chapters to different countries. I tried that in Tanzania and I discussed it with the [inaudible], but I think with the current bylaw and the governing structure the room does not favor that kind of model. But to me, I still believe that through the ICANN or local chapters offices or engagement within each country, it will offer room to bring more stakeholders within the ICANN ecosystem.

For example, in Tanzania we only have around [23] million users with access to Internet and we still have around 27 million users with no Internet access. And most of ICANN meetings depend on

---

the Internet. That means we are going to leave more than half of the population without even knowing what ICANN is and how they can engage and participation in the ICANN ecosystem.

[Personally], I represent Africa to ICANN Security, Stability, and Resiliency Review Team. I have been struggling very much to have my effective participation because of the Internet issues as you have raised in the statement. But if our representation is going through the local representations, then it gives room for us to make our voice heard.

The third observation I need to make clear with this: it has happened very recently you find a group of two or three people from the same country branding an initiative, a kind of an Africa initiative while it's a group of two or three people from the same country. So this kind of initiative, it makes Africa keep underrepresented. And without coming up with a very strong way to have an engagement, then it becomes difficult. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much. [inaudible] Thank you. So I think we get a couple of comments and questions, and then we ask as well for feedback either from Cherine and others. Yes, please?

---

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you so much. [inaudible], NCUC Africa. Thank you for the job done on this report. I have a couple of observations. To support what my colleague just said now about increasing and improving African engagement, I think where we're lacking behind in ICANN environment because ICANN environment is technical oriented and policy engagement and we could see that Africa sometimes we are lacking behind in those areas maybe because we don't really have the technical background and capacity to engage in those areas. I want us to pay much attention in those areas, technical and policy capacity for us to engage in those areas.

Another one is while we're setting clear objective or strategy on how to improve African participation in ICANN meetings, we need to be able to evaluate what we want to do. We need to have a clear strategy on these things. We just set strategy without having a metric to evaluate the objective that we're setting, and we need to be very clear on this one for us to know where we're going and where we're going to [inaudible].

Another observation I notice is that most of Africa [inaudible] participating in an ICANN meeting, they're just going there and there is this lack of continual participation in ICANN meetings. They just go there. We need [a couple of hands] to participate in policy development in ICANN. Because we at NCUC struggle with this also because a lot of people just come, they enjoy ICANN

---

meetings from Africa, and there is no continual engagement which we are struggling with. And we need to find a way to do that. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Please.

WISDOM DONKOR: Thank you very much. Pardon me for my voice. My name is Wisdom Donkor. I am from Ghana. I just want to make a few observations with the statement that was read. I think the section that talks about trust, I think we should look at the issues of transparency very well because it's always transparency that brings about trust. If there is no transparency in our processes, [then know that] trust will be difficult to achieve.

And then the other one is accountability. We all need to be accountable to ourselves in a process.

And then the other thing is a governance issue. Okay, I think I just talked about that.

And then the section that talks about the – f – can I look at this? The f: “Chairs of SO/AC should be rotational among all regions for a fixed term of two years for inclusiveness.” I kind of disagree with this, yes, because I am looking at promoting democracy. We need

---

to open it up so that that inclusiveness should be there. So if you are trying to do it rotational, I think it's going to be a problem to the process.

So these are my few observations.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much. I think we'll give a chance now for response, and we'd like to hear as well from Cherine if he has some remarks.

CHERINE CHALABY: Thank you. First of all, the statement is quite detailed, in my view. I think you have thought of many of the issues and you've made suggestions for improvement. I was talking to Mohamed now and we forwarded that statement to Brian Cote who is facilitating the session this afternoon so that he already has that input. So that's quite important.

There are two or three points. I don't want to particularly go into the solution because anything I say about solution would be taken as the chairman has said this and this is a top-down answer. So I'm not going to comment.

But I think the issue that was mentioned earlier from our colleague from Tanzania regarding the number of Internet users

---

there. You have I think you said 25 million or something and it could be much more than that. There are two things that are important in my view. One is for people in countries to have access to the Internet. So the penetration of number of users needs to increase. That's very important. I don't think that ICANN can help a lot with that because that's a government infrastructure in the countries and so on and so forth.

But what is more important or equally important is not the increase in the number of users. It's the increase of the digital economy in that country and its contribution to the GDP of that country. At the moment in most of the African countries the digital economy is young, it's growing, but it's nowhere near what it is in the Western world.

By that I mean you can have access to the Internet, but you're not transacting on the Internet. You're not doing business on the Internet. You're just looking at search engine. You're sending e-mails. You're doing things of that kind. The way you help your local economy is to be able to set up businesses. But to set up businesses, there are four or five things that need to happen in each country. One of them I think ICANN can help.

Let me explain that. First, you have to have a stable regulatory environment because businesses in an environment where regulation changes every day is not a good thing. Second, you

---

need a very strong capacity and reliability in the network you have. That is also down to the local operators and the government to provide that.

Third, you need training. You need capacity building. This is something that, for example, we collectively from ICANN can do. And we've created, for example, an entrepreneurial center in Egypt. I think there's another center open in Nairobi where people who want to be registries or registrars can come in and get training on that. Because without that training, it's very difficult to do.

Fourth, you need financing. All entrepreneurs need money to start up businesses. If you look, for example, in the United States and why most of the big successful businesses globally a lot of them come from the United States is if you go to Silicon Valley and Palo Alto, in one street you have the university and the opposite street – literally the extension of the street – you have all the venture capitalists. And if you're a young university graduate with some good ideas, you get out there, you walk down the street, you go to a venture capitalist. You can say, "I have this idea; I need some money." And if it's a good idea, they'll finance you. I don't think you have that facility in Africa. And therefore, even if you're an entrepreneur and even if you have a good idea, it's very hard for you to get capital and money to [inaudible].



---

Finally, you need a credible, reliable, trusted payment system. That again is the government. So these are the ingredients for a more thriving digital economy. Where ICANN can help is setting together – I don't know how we can do that – but you need an Africa strategy to go beyond, for example, Egypt and Nairobi to go somewhere else and set up these centers where you can help young people, help people who want to set up businesses either to be a registry or a registrar or something else. So this to me is an important thing to focus on. Not just increase the number of Internet users but increase the digital economy's participation.

I've been to several DNS forums, one in Egypt and I went to another one in Dubai recently. And I could see the hunger in the participants there on learning and capacity building, not just for themselves but to create a better future for the next generation of people. And I think this is very important.

The participation in ICANN, right? It is important that we from Africa participate in ICANN. I know it's sometimes difficult because we don't get visas, we don't have sponsorship and money to send us, right? We don't necessarily have also the time to do it. And when we arrive here, a lot of people are not necessarily prepared. So that is a serious issue. But it's something that we need to focus on.

---

And we can try, as Leon said, we can try and help as much as possible with visas, but it is an issue and I feel something close to my heart. I used to have an Egyptian passport. I still have it. And every time I traveled, I needed a visa, and it's too complicated. I've been living in England for 40 years. I have a British passport and it's so much easier. You become much more effective. So I can see the difficulty and I sympathize with you.

One word you mentioned about transparency, you said trust is more transparency and more accountability, right? I was speaking to a professor from university who is doing a study on ICANN legitimacy. This is just an aside comment. He said don't focus on the word transparency alone. Why? Because if you throw a lot of information, people will not get what you want to say. You have to focus on the word effective transparency. Sometimes if you have a lot of transparency, the real information that you want is masked and is not there. So I think the responsibility on us is to have effective transparency.

I want to just in closing say something else. I was invited at the London university, the London School of Economics, a year or so ago to give a presentation on the multistakeholder model. The students asked me can I define what it is. They couldn't touch it. Is it a set of policies? What is it? What is that thing you talk about, multistakeholder?

---

I thought about it and did a quite a bit of research to try and come up with a definition. So I have in front of me the couple of slides I gave them there. So I'm going to just read from there so that you get a feel of what I said to them.

I said the ICANN multistakeholder environment is like a virtual shared space with no borders. It enables communication between people and organizations around the globe that is almost entirely beyond the direct control of any stakeholder. So it's a free environment beyond the direct control of any stakeholder.

The next one, I'm just moving to the next slide, it said in this environment, the multistakeholder environment, is analogous to a system where there isn't a single actor that has control. There is no centralized power. There is no single kill switch. And there is no single point of failure.

This is how I wanted to describe to them that this is the power of that model if it works means no one has control over it. No one can kill the system. There isn't a single point of failure. It's resilient. It stops here. It works here.

I also said, and I have one more slide to go after this, that all stakeholders are right in the middle of developing policies and making decisions jointly by consensus with the involvement of all other stakeholder groups. It is truly a bottom-up process.

---

And then I said policies may take longer to develop, decisions may take longer to be made, but a very high degree – this is your word – of trust and effective transparency between the participant is essential for the model to work. You have to have a high degree of trust and effective transparency between the participants for this model to work. But if it works, the end result is a more sustainable solution.

So I think they actually appreciated the description of it without necessarily going to how the consensus policy works. It was a simple description for people who are not aware of our model. So I hope it just brings a little bit more clarity. That’s all. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Cherine, for the thoughtful comments. I think we have a remote participant comment, and then we can have another round of feedback from the group here.

YESIM NAZLAR: Thank you, Mohamed. We have a comment from one of our remote participants, Ejikeme Egbuogu. Ejikeme says, “Nigeria is the best place to set up. Nigeria has the infrastructure, technical know-how, and manpower. Thank you.”

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: I can't dispute and argue about that. But I think, Yaovi, that you have a side discussion to make with some friends about the Nigerian proposal. I'll let it go to Tijani. You have a comment. And then Alan.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, Mohamed. Everything you said, every comment you made I share it. But the problem is that we are focusing our issue here is the ICANN multistakeholder model. It is not about the participation of Africa in this model. In any model, your remarks are valid. So we want you to comment on our view about the multistakeholder model, not about our participation. Not about our problems, if you want. Yes, we are part of this community, so we need a model where we can work. So it is about the model that we need to have comments. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Tijani. Alan Barrett?

ALAN BARRETT: Hello. My name is Alan Barrett. I've got a few comments on the recommendations. Recommendation c, I think that consensus among individuals is also important. So I would not neglect that. I would suggest phrasing Recommendation c in a way that

---

recommends consensus among the persons as well as the stakeholders. I think they're both important.

And then on Recommendations f and g, I think that rotation and term limits are important, but perhaps these recommendations could be phrased in a way that does not give specific numbers. Maybe the numbers could be worked out later. Thanks.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Alan. I think we have Seun.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Mohamed?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Oh, yes, Yaovi, and then we can have Seun from the remote participation. Yes, Yaovi, please?

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Thank you, Mohamed. It's just [a note on the content], but if you see g, "There should be clear and sharp term limit for all positions at ICANN." Maybe [community is missing]. I think it's important for all of us, I'm not talking about staff, to keep this in mind. Today we have the community, we have the ICANN board, and then we have the ICANN organization. So I'm wondering if the word

---

community is not missing or SO/AC. Something like that. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Yaovi. Definitely, we're not talking about ICANN as an org or staff, for sure. So we have Seun in the remote participation. Seun, you can go ahead.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Hello?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes, we hear you.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Ah, good. Thank you, Tijani. Thank you for the [participants] for all the comments so far. A couple of things I wanted to say have been mentioned, but just to also refer to what Matogoro earlier mentioned in terms of his inability to participate. I think, Matogoro, you can actually reach out to staff. They can explore how they can help you to participate if your Internet connection is an issue. They can do dial outs to you. They can perhaps also even look at how they can improve your connectivity if that may be an issue. [inaudible] your participation is critical, and I believe that they would be able to help out. So I don't think we should

---

think that there are no options. There are options, and so please know this and then try to reach out to staff and they will be able to help you.

As to the statement, as one of the members of the team, even though I think [inaudible] recognize that I didn't make significant comment to this team statement, I think it's a good one. It's a good statement and the [inaudible] which has been mentioned by Alan is also we should put it into [inaudible]. And I think I suggest that maybe we give the statement a few more days for comments and we will submit the final document as we used to do in the past. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much. Yes?

ARSENE TUNGALI: Hi, everyone. This is Arsene Tungali and I will speak in French. I would like to thank the entire team that worked on that excellent statement. It was a very good, interesting content. We do have a quick comment regarding the last part, point f on that document where we says "chairs of SO/AC should be rotational among all regions." This is a good proposal that we offer, but it's difficult for certain groups at ICANN to make it possible, that rotation.



---

For instance, I'm a member of NCUC. We can have a representative for each region at the executive committee level, but it's difficult for the GNSO Council – I am a member as well. It is just not possible for the GNSO Council to do so due to internal regulations. It's a vote that is between different structures, so it's not going to work at the regional level.

That is why I think we should rework a little bit the point f. In order to be inclusive, the SO/AC members should make the effort to have a rotation of leadership among all regions. I would like to concentrate on making a substantial effort, not make it mandatory. It's nearly impossible for certain, so we should say make an effort.

For point g, the next point in fact, it's true we can encourage a two-year term. That happens in many ICANN entities and groups. But even after two years that person cannot come back, it's not going to take care of the domination of certain groups at ICANN. If you serve for two years, you have to give the chance for others to serve as well. And I think it's great that it comes from AFRALO, and we should really work on that quite a lot and even in AFRALO.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: [inaudible] I have a queue now. It's Fatimata, Daniel, and the gentleman here. Fatimata, please?

---

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Yeah, thank you, Mohamed. I'm going to be speaking in French because of the students present here. Yes, my name is Fatimata Seye Sylla. I'm the vice president of AFRALO. First of all, thank you for this project. Thank you for this statement. My comment will be on the two last points.

We talked about realities, daily realities for us. Regarding f and g, I already heard some comments about it. I would like to reformulate that and add the fact that it's not because we have a rotation. We need the resources when we do the selection. That's where the problem is. It's difficult to select some volunteers that are highly qualified and have time. Let's think about that when we do reformulate f and g. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you, Fatimata. Daniel, please?

[DANIEL]: Thank you very much. It's Daniel for the record. I've clearly read the statement, but I think certain accounts are not being taken into consideration. Speaking on behalf is the diversity of the multistakeholder model. Diversity cuts across, and in some working groups we find that there is very little or negligible

---

participation in these working groups, especially coming from the Africa region.

And on top of that, if you look at still the issue of rotation among chairs of SOs, I think it doesn't affect only the chairs of SOs but it also [tackles] the leadership of SOs or regional distribution [just to add on]. And also, I appreciate that there is good work that has been done to understand ICANN and the various evolution of the multistakeholder model.

I think we should also add in a section of grooming young leaders. Young I don't mean by only age but also young in experience adopt and understand the whole ICANN ecosystem such that they can have an effective participation in policy development processes, in outreach, and are able to sustain engagement in different respective policies since the core mandate of ICANN is to come up with appropriate representation cutting across all the respective regions.

And also to be more realistic. I don't think we have adequate competency to take up certain leadership roles because of the experience or expertise. I think let's be [loyal] to ourselves that we still need to understand more what it takes in the involvement of the multistakeholder model.

Apart from that, term limits. I think this is a very big issue that should be discussed not only within AFRALO but also within the

---

whole ICANN ecosystem. Which would mean from [either] AFRALO or whatever region or anything that would be able to [come from]. So those are my few remarks. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Daniel. I think we have a last comment from the gentleman here, and then we can have a closing remark from Tijani. And definitely, we already captured all the comments, so we'll update the statements and then we're going to reissue it as we always do. So please go ahead.

BENJAMIN AKINMOYEJE: Hello. Good afternoon. My name is Benjamin Akinmoyeje. I'm from NCUC. A big thank you to those who drafted this. I think it's an amazing work. My contribution in it has to do with how do you measure participation in this model. I think if there's some kind of metrics that can be incorporated, it can let people know to which extent I have to participate. Because you can see that for some engagement in ICANN is professional. For others, it's voluntary. But do you weigh them the same way? And if you are going to say it's by time we measure, then I have to do 24 hours that shows for good participation. Or is it by amount of contribution?

---

So giving some idea of what meaningful contribution is could help drive engagement. [inaudible] for metrics so that we can measure. I think this way, people can start getting involved more actively and over time it becomes a second nature. So I think if we can look at that and define some form of measurement or metrics around participation in ICANN, it could help give people direction. Thank you.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you. That's very useful. I think tomorrow in the strategy session from staff, there might be definite statistics about African participation in the different working groups or how many participants we have there.

I will give the final comments to Leon and then Tijani, and then we can wrap up.

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much, Mohamed. I just want to close my participation by thanking AFRALO for having me here again. Thank you, Tijani. Thank you, Mohamed. Thank you, Fatimata. And thank you for the work that you are doing. This will be, as I said, paramount for the discussions of the evolution of the ICANN multistakeholder model. Thank you again. As I said, I feel proud of belonging to this community. Thank you very much.

---

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Leon. We appreciate that. Tijani, please?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you for your comments. All your comments are taken. The statement will be updated accordingly. Of course, perhaps some comments are not in the model, so perhaps they will not be included in this statement. We can work on them on other statements. But the most important thing is that we are all aware of the benefit of having this model, I would not say reviewed, but reconsidered according to the points we are all raising together.

This afternoon at 5:00 there will be a session about this very subject, and I invite you all to participate and to participate really in this discussion. We need to have our voice heard, so please go there. Please come. I will go there also. And please speak up. We need to have our voice heard. And we have also to take some tasks so that we participate in the processes. Thank you very much, all.

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, everyone. Just a last announcement. There is a Middle Eastern African networking reception that will be between 6:30-8:00 at [Le Grande Bleu], the poolside restaurant at the Palmeraie. So we would like to see you there. ICANN staff will

---

be there. And everyone from Africa, this could be a chance to reconnect. Thank you very much for coming. Appreciate it. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**