MONTREAL – ATLAS III Wrap Up Session Part 2 and At-Large Leadership Wrap up Thursday, November 7, 2019 – 13:30 to 15:30 EDT ICANN66 | Montréal, Canada

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay, everyone. Can we have everyone back into their workspaces? We're going to be starting now on what is the last Atlas session. Could I have all that little huddle at the back there to return back to their seats, please? Yes, thank you.

> Okay. What we're going to do is we're going to have a final wrap-up activity related to next steps. Dave is going to be taking that session. Again, we're going to be wanting everybody's contribution to this because it's going to be really important for me as part of my report to the board on this activity. I've got a lot to say, of course, all good, in relation to what we're going to be doing as a result of this week's activities. I'm going to leave it up to David. Then, of course, we'll move on to the other formalities later on. Yes, it's you already.

[DAVID KOLB:] Oh, my goodness. How much time to do I have? 20 minutes?

MAUREEN HILYARD: 20 minutes and then you hand it over to Eduardo.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

[DAVID KOLB:]Okay, I've got 20 minutes with you. You thought I was done with youyesterday but I am not. He says, "We already got the certificate so we'reall good." Got the pen, got the t-shirt, got the hat, got the certificate. It'sall good.

We started out ... Was it just on Monday? What was our general theme? What were those two pieces of leadership we were talking about? Nice. "Thought and change leadership." That was the general theme that we were looking at. We went from "thought and change leadership." Then, we started to break that into skills. The skills were effective communication. If we're effectively communicating hopefully we won't have conflict.

Then, if we have conflict how do we deal with conflict and resistance? How do we start to move through that? Then, how do we get to more of a positive interaction and influence each other? From there, we moved into what's our presence? How do we show up in a place? What's our confidence level? Then, how do we structure our thinking, our presentations? Finally, we looked at how do we ... Not structure our time, but how do we get things done? How do we delegate to get things done?

That was the skillset that we decided were under that "thought and change leadership." Obviously, we could take any one of those and go much deeper on all of those. Here's what I'd like to do. Instead of me talking about what we did I think you should talk about what you should be doing. You'll notice that I have strategically moved the RALO signs around the room. We've got LACRALO here. We've got APRALO



there. AFRALO, EURALO. Do you say NA-RALO or NARALO? NARALO. That sounds like a good word. NARALO. Maybe not.

What I'd like you to do is get into your RALO groups with this exercise in mind. Now, you're ambassadors. Ambassadors, by definition ... The first definition is someone that represents their country in a foreign country. We're going to ignore that definition. You do that sometimes. The second definition of it says someone that speaks for an organization or "advertises the organization." You're a representative of that organization. That's the kind of ambassadors that we have in mind.

What's interesting is just like ALAC you really define what that is. There isn't a set checklist of, "This is what it means to be an ambassador for At-Large, or from Atlas III. You need to decide what that is. Probably culturally it's best if you decide that within your RALOs. You know what's going to work, what's not going to work. You don't want to impose something in a region that's not going to be acceptable.

What I'd like you to do, for about 15 minutes, is to get into your groups where the signs are. Group up. Think about what are our next ... What you have is, if you're ambassadors, this is your group of ambassadors that you're going to be working with within your RALOs when you communicate with each other. I want to give you some time to be together. Think about, "What does being an ambassador mean?"

What I'd like as a deliverable is for each RALO to say, "Here are three things that we're going to do." Three. Not four. "Here's three things that



we're going to do." I have a flexible view on math. Three things. You may have more than that but, "Here's the top three." I'd say the top three would be easy to implement and have a high level of impact. Thinking about actions that you may be taking. Okay? In your RALOs discussing, "What do we do as ambassadors? What are our next steps? What are three things that we can do going forward?" Then, we'll get that from everybody and continue from there. Ready? Go! You know who you are. You know where you're going.

Two-minute warning. Two-minute warning. Three things each. Three things each. Okay. Figure out who is going to tell us your three things. Someone in the group, tell us your three things.

APRALO did an excellent job of getting back to their seats on time. Just saying. Looks like NARALO is doing a good job of moving back towards their seats too. AFRALO is looking very intent, still. Not in their seats, I might add. LACRALO, of course, is still arguing over who's going to be presenting. Come back. Come back! Come back, LACRALO! Come back! Come back! Break it up. Stop arguing. So much passion. Come on. Come on.

Okay. Let's hear from ... Let's start with ... Let's see here. How about APRALO? Who's our speaker? Okay. Listen up, everybody. APRALO is going to go. What are your three things? Concise, clear, compelling. Go.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Essentially, we have decided five things and not three things. I'm going to take [inaudible] all of those five things because the more the merrier



in that case. The five things that we as APRALO have decided is first we are going to create a document of shared experiences during this Atlas III seminar. That document will have our experience. Second, we are planning to hold joint APRALO outreach and events. We will have joint events across ALSes and individual members of APRALO. Third, we are also going to increase local community outreach and engagement. Fourth, we are planning to have joint webinars within our community. The final point is we are going to increase the participation and presence of our members in our CPWG and monthly calls. These are the five things that we are planning to do.

[DAVID KOLB:]And then the next assignment for all of you will be, "Who is going to do
it and by when will it happen?" Just a thought. Let's go to AFRALO.
Who's our speaker. Alright. Here you go.

SARAH KIDEN: Hi, everyone. From AFRALO we've basically discussed about engagement and participating in working groups. We promise to encourage our members to participate in working groups, but most importantly to feed back into their RALO. If people are participating in working groups, they should give feedback to their RALOs about their participation, what they are doing, and how other new members can actually join. Then, the final one is we are going to review our rules of procedure to see if there's anything hindering participation or just to improve them. That's it. Thank you.





UNIDENTIFIED MALE:Which RALO?[DAVID KOLB:]EURALO. Not my RALO, but EURALO.UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:Thank you very much. [inaudible] We discussed some approaches to be

more visible and more effective in our countries. The first one is to have liaisons in each ALS which will be responsible for communication between ICANN and the national Internet community. It's extremely difficult to combine our regular work and our activity in ICANN. Another approach is to create a club or interest, for example those members of our ALSes who are interested in cybersecurity issues, data protection or intellectual property rights and to organize a discussion between them.

How about EURALO? Who's our speaker?

The third approach is to more actively use national ... And especially use AGFs. First of all to promote our ALSes, to promote ICANN's multistakeholder approach. This way, we urgently need support from ICANN. Unfortunately, it's my own comment just now, we had a tense AGF UA and second huge AGF in September in Kiev. Unfortunately, at huge AGF UA we did not have any agenda presentation at all. Thank you.



[DAVID KOLB:]

[DAVID KOLB:]

LACRALO. Español? Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: The LACRALO community has made the following decisions. Everything we have defined will be included in a written document which will be one page long. That document will reaffirm our commitments. It will be shared with the community at large. We will do this really soon. We will draft it soon. We will have it ready this evening. This document will include a summary of what has happened at Atlas and the commitments which I will now list. Number one, each ALS must take direct actions so as to communicate information about what ICANN does to their communities.

> Number two, we have to make sure there is engagement and inclusion from the agenda and indigenous community's point of view. Number three, we must communicate what ICANN does or ICANN's work within the ALSes. Each organization has several members. Sometimes one or two members are aware of what this is about. Some others have no clue. It's an internal communication issue. Next item. We ambassadors should commit ourselves to become mentors for two, three, or four ALSes in our region.

[DAVID KOLB:] Last but not least, NARALO. Are you going to do this in English or American?



DAVID MACKEY: I'll be speaking Canadian, eh? We have agreed to the following three items. We are committing each Atlas III member from the RALOs committing to regularly participate in one or more active monthly meeting or working group session. We are each going to be picking a specific area of interest that we will be working on that is within the At-Large issues that are at hand. Then, within the specific issue that we have chosen, we are going to be actively engaging and taking on work in that specific area so that we can move the ICANN mission forward.

[DAVID KOLB:] Thank you. My last words would be, don't lose this. You've had a good discussion. You've brainstormed this. You've come up with these actions. Don't let them get lost somewhere. We've got it on transcript. There is accountability here. The other piece is to help your leaders lead. Leadership happens on two levels. One is I'm leading a group of people or I'm leading an organization.

The other level is I'm leading myself. Lead yourself well. Then, if you've got a leader that's having a hard time delegating, or whatever their challenges are, help them lead better. Don't sit back and say, "I know we have these three things that we were committed to and I sure wish that he or she would get around to it. I'll be patient. I've got a day job. It is what it is." Jump in there. Help them lead. Help them to help you. I'm going to turn this over to Eduardo. He looks surprised. He always looks surprised, right? He's anxious. He's excited. He's ready. Here you go.



EDUARDO DIAZ:	Well, I'm going to be David's Hi. How many people know what an Atlas III ambassador is and what the journey is?
[DAVID KOLB:]	Me.
EDUARDO DIAZ:	You know. Okay. That's what I'm going to be talking about. This is like a journey. We want to get into this path. Suppose these stepping stones that you're going to step on. You don't want to step off. You want to stay in them. First thing that we're going to be doing as ambassadors of Atlas III is that there will be a survey that will be sent to all of you that you need to fill out to give feedback to the At-Large as part of your experiences here. Then, there will be another stepping stone for all the Atlas III participants and ambassadors. You are to write a report about your experience here. These are things that we're expecting you to do. It's not like "if you want to do it."
	Now, once you are there there are many places that you can move around this path. Let's say that you are interested in outreach and communications. Some of the people in NARALO say, "I want to get into the communications." There are people that are moving to doing newsletters. You can move into this step-stone. Or, there will be capacity-building training that will be online. You want to develop more and learn more about what ICANN does and the issues at hand. You move into this step-stone. Again, these are moving. You're moving



across this depending on your experience, the time, and the things that you want to do.

Or, there's this stepping stone called "caution, team is under construction." You step on it, it might be jumping around. It will be there. The idea behind the "caution" is ... Let's say you need help. You want somebody to mentor you to help you to learn something. You will move into this step-stone. Or if you want to become a mentor and help other people in At-Large you can step into this.

The policy participation. We have a working group in the CCWG. There are many other policies and things that are discussed there. There are many issues. Some of you here are interested in the new multistakeholder effort that is being done. This is the place to move in. That's where you can participate.

The last stepping stone you will not step off. You stay there. You can keep stepping on in the step-stones. You can move around or you can stay stepping up and become a leader, a working group leader, a chair of a RALO. There are many places that you can be in ICANN. It depends on what you want to do.

That is the Atlas III journey. That's what, ambassadors, we expect you to do. If you have any questions, Maureen is here. That's it. Are there any questions? Okay. That means I did a good job. Thank you. Maureen? Okay.



MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much. I think what we've actually set now is established next steps. I'll be telling you a little bit more about my next steps as well later on. It's really good to have gotten that feedback. I can see there are some really exciting things going to happen in your RALOs. I think you'll be pleased to hear that, too, David, aren't you? He's the boss. He has really been taking note I'm sure.

What we'll be having next ... I think we'll continue on with the program because we're running a little bit late. We have first of all got David Olive to speak to us. David is in charge of the whole policy area. He's very interested in what we're doing. I think that this has been a very good introduction into a little bit more about what we're aiming to do, David, and how we aim to do it. I think that your being here to get that feedback has probably been very valuable for you as well as for us. I'll leave you to it.

DAVID OLIVE: Thank you, Maureen. Thank you, everyone. It's an honor and a pleasure to be with all the ambassadors here. This is a very important rank. I see some familiar faces. We have a former vice-chairman of the board with Roberto sitting there, some other people who are well-experienced and others who are just relatively new to the ICANN world. That's important, too. The global Internet as you know is the network of networks. It is a distributed network around the world. The "language" is digital one's and two's with IP addressing. There is a component which links a lot of this to the domain names system, the management of which occurs in many ways here at ICANN for the practices, procedures, and policies for



the security, stability, and reliability of the domain names system and therefore the Internet.

We have roughly 3.5 billion people online. Your jobs as ambassadors will be to extend that to the next billion users of the Internet. In terms of the languages, we may not understand the one's and two's of the digital languages. You speak all those languages in the world and in your region to help communicate as ambassadors what it means to you to have this wonderful technology called the Internet that has advanced communications, education, cooperation, commerce, and general development in our world.

It's a big responsibility you have, one I think you are now well prepared to do. Helping everyone in this room and helping us at ICANN as we look to connect the next billion users and make sure that the system, policies, and procedures work smoothly so that no one knows the difference when they connect. That there is fair and good policies in place.

I have a team of 35 people. Maybe you should know that they help all the three supporting organizations who form policies for the generic names space, the GNSO, the country code at the global level, the ccNSO, and the numbers at the global level, the address supporting organization. We facilitate and help their work. Then, we have the advisory committees of which the ALAC, the At-Large Advisory Committee is one, the Government Advisory Committee, the Security and Stability as you've heard, and then the Root Server Operators and their groups.



We have across the board some more technical, some less technical, to facilitate the smooth running of this Internet . Your role is to be that regional and grassroots support for us so that when we need advice, when we need inputs, when we need your views, they are channeled through our networks and channeled through our working groups and structures here at ICANN to make sure that your voices are heard. More importantly, that you understand and can go back in a dialog/two-way communication to explain to people how that is important and why that is important.

You are a very crucial asset to our ICANN structures and processes. You reach down to the local levels. I'll give an example. Sometimes it's somewhat confusing. The policies that are developed or the advice that is developed, what does that mean for me as an end-user? What does that mean for me and my region? What is the contribution of the At-Large community over time? There is something that's current policy that was approved by the Generic Names Supporting Organization called the transfer policy.

If I could make the example, in cellular phones you have number portability. If you have your number 123 on your telephone but you don't like that provider of service, you can move it to another service provider by keeping that number. In our Internet space, of course, some people had a domain name. Maybe they weren't getting the right service from their operator but they needed to have david.com that everyone knew. They come to my shop to buy things electronically or to my website for information. I want to move it from service provider A to service provider B.



This was raised by ... Guess what group? The governments? The technical people? It was raised as an issue by the end-users, you. The At-Large community raised this issue as a policy issue. This should be addressed. We should have that type of portability, transferability, that you find in different areas. That helps the user. We don't lose our sight, we don't lose our reputation or our businesses. We move from one to another.

The At-Large community pressed this, convinced the Generic Names Supporting Organization that that should be an issue, proceeded to go through all that. Policy was developed. The board approved it. It currently is policy at ICANN. For whose benefit? For the individual user's benefit by and large. People then said, "Well, that could be a burden." It turned out to be a great idea and something that all benefited from. Ideas coming from you.

It's very humbling to hear you come to this Atlas Summit – I heard you exchanging ideas – to be a part of the two-way communications that we need between ICANN and our regions. You are doing it as the front leaders speaking those languages. We're very happy that you're here to do that. We're here to work with you. You had coaches helping you who've been in the ICANN community and we want to make sure that the distributed network continues to work in a safe, secure, and reliable way. Thanks to you ambassadors, I'm sure it will. I think I want to stop there and see if there might be questions or comments.





MAUREEN HILYARD:	Are there any questions for David?
UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	Alberto, you have the microphone.
MAUREEN HILYARD:	Did you want to say something, Alberto, or did you just? No questions? You must have been inspiring.
DAVID OLIVE:	Questions, I understand, will be coming as you go back to your homes and in your regions. When questions do come up you have channels to let us know. We will let you know and provide information and exchange information. More importantly, we want to hear from you what you think the end-users are saying, what your people in the regions are saying, and hopefully enrich our policy and advisory development work. The legitimacy of ICANN depends upon everyone being involved in the system and depends upon you making sure that our legitimacy is there
	around the world with one global interoperable Internet as we know it today. Thank you very much for your help and service. I need your help so please help us.
MAUREEN HILYARD:	We've actually got some housekeeping to do, ALAC housekeeping. I do note that Sandra is here to talk about the Academy. Sandra, I just



wondered if you would like to come and do your session now so that we can just talk ALAC stuff afterwards? If you'd like to come and talk about the Academy? Only because it's in my schedule for some reason. I thought it was unusual that we're going to talk about our things and then we'll go back to her.

SANDRA HOFERICHTER: Hello? Yes. Thank you, Maureen. I'm a little bit unprepared now because we had the working group meeting already yesterday. Of course, I can give you a short update on what has been discussed. Basically, there are three programs that the Academy Working Group developed together. The first is the Leadership Program which is in place since 2013. We are now just about to organize the 13th edition. As far as I know, the leaders for this year that will participate in the meeting are, from the At-Large community, more or less confirmed.

I think we got confirmation from all the RALO Chairs except APRALO. Is that possible? Did you? AFRALO ... LACRALO. I think LACRALO is missing still. This is a time-sensitive issue because the registration must be done until 15th November. That's really a hard deadline. I would ask our friends from LACRALO to decide who's going to participate until this date.

Just for those who don't know, the leadership program is something that is, as the name says, for ICANN leaders. It's not a capacity-building program that everyone can apply for. A pre-condition for this program is that you have secured travel support and, when you have secured



travel support, you are basically in any leadership position as a RALO Chair or as an ALAC representative. This is considered to be a leader. Then, you are eligible to participate in this program. I think that might be something that is of interest for you in the room for the future when you make your way through ICANN. Eduardo just described what the possibilities are. When you make your way this program might be of interest on a later stage for you.

Then, as a subsequence of the Leadership Program, we have the Chairing Skills Program. This was developed two years ago. We had two programs, a pilot which was kind of successful and a second one which showed some weaknesses of the program. Here, we are going to revise the program a little bit. It is basically a program that is designed to help existing or seated chairs to evolve their skills to chair a meeting. As we know, the success of ICANN meetings depends to a large extent on the skills a chair has or does not have.

Then, we have a very good program which is at the moment on ice. It's the Intercultural Awareness Program. Some of those matters have also been a part, and what you did here for the last couple of days. You have cultural differences that need to be taken into account. We are just about to try to get this program back on the ICANN agenda. We tried to find ways that are not so cost-effective. We might have, if we are lucky, a second edition in Kuala Lumpur in June next week. That's still in the air. I wouldn't promise too much.

Anyway, if any one of you is interested in helping developing those programs then our ICANN staff could send you the link where you can



subscribe to the ICANN Academy mailing list. This is where most of the information is channeled through. If you are on that one you will be always informed when meetings are taking place, when new programs are developed, when we are calling for community facilitators, work team members, and so on and so forth. If you have any questions, of course, you can also reach out to me. That's it.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Sandra. We have a question here from LACRALO.

SERGIO SALINAS: Sandra, very well said. There is an excellent effort by ICANN's Academy.
She very well said that LACRALO was missing. It is because there is no interpretation. It's excellent work for the English-speaking world. That leaves us in a very difficult situation. We have no leaders in our region.
However, there is no one who can interpret into Spanish. What we are going to do in Cancún is to have our own academy for our leaders. It will be given in Spanish. Thank you very much.

SANDRA HOFERICHTER: The program is a cross-community program. Across the community, there is a broad consensus that ICANN leaders should be able to communicate in English. Since we have break-out sessions where you have open areas, like five people sit together and discuss, there is no way of doing the way we are doing the program and how it is very much appreciated by the community. The interactivity among participants



really gives you some good colleagues for your leadership term. There is no way of doing this including interpretation. This is just simply impossible.

- MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Sandra, for explaining that. I think that that's really important to note. This is the ICANN Leadership Working Group. The Academy is an ICANN-wide thing. I think that what you're actually looking at is a leadership program within your region, which is awesome. I think we've got to acknowledge that the program, the Academy that Sandra is running, is high-level. It's one that is across ICANN. It's in English, unfortunately. Hang on.
- JONATHAN ZUCK: If you can give me one second. There we go. I have three people in the queue right now. Sergio, Ricardo, and Javier. One note since we're in a different seating formation. When you want to speak you'll need to hold your cards up a little bit because it's very hard to see them when they're sitting on the table. Sergio, please.
- SERGIO SALINAS: Alright. I remember this discussion when we first started with ICANN's Academy. 2010, 2011, 2012, more or less. I do remember what Sandra said back then. She was an ALAC member. She didn't care if somebody didn't speak any other language except for English. I understand the language issue. That is why I'm saying what I'm saying. If there is no one



to look for ICANN's language minorities, each one of us will need to start looking at what to do. Maybe ICANN's Academy loses presence and reaches that don't have people who can speak the language that is required. We have to do something else. Ricardo.

- RICARDO HOLMQUIST: Hello, team. I will gladly ask Sandra to answer Sergio in Dutch. Dutch has no translation. [inaudible] My point is different. The way you can be selected to be in the Leadership Program is through your RALO. Among ALAC there are five members that came in from NomCom. We have no real attachment to the RALO. The RALOs prefer to send the chairs, secretariat, these people instead of us. We came through NomCom. I kindly ask the program that ALAC by itself can select someone to the program instead of only the RALO. We feel as NomComs that we are not totally attached to that. The ALAC members are not getting these opportunities to be in the program. Thank you.
- JONATHAN ZUCK: Okay, I'm going to let Sandra respond. Then, we have Javier, Alberto, and Pastor Peters in the queue.
- SANDRA HOFERICHTER: Thank you very much, Ricardo, for bringing this up. This brings us back to a very original idea from when I was still sitting in the ALAC, how we organize as At-Large or as ALAC which leaders we are going to send. One of the ideas of the program is to combine incoming and existing leaders.



The newcomers or the veterans. It makes no sense when you have a lot of newcomers there. It only makes sense if you have some veterans there that also tell you a little bit more about the dirty secrets of the community.

There was a tradition, or at least it was the procedure in the past, that RALO Chairs suggest their nominees. The 15 people of the ALAC take the final decision whom they want to send. They can guarantee that there's a good balance between experienced leaders and newcomers coming from our community, from the At-Large community. This might be taken into consideration from this committee to have a look at the final slate of candidates that are selected from across all the RALOS.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Javier.

JAVIER RÚA-JOVET: I just want to add that I was lucky enough to participate in the program, specifically the Leadership Program. More specifically, the Chairing Skills Program. It was truly an invaluable experience. That experience allowed me in many ways to co-chair in Work Track 5. I think on the language issue I understand both sides of the equation. At some level chairing meetings at ICANN, and meetings on work tracks, there's an understanding that a GNSO PDP is going to be in English in some way.

> It makes some sense. Maybe not the Leadership Program, but the Chairing Skills Program is really almost necessarily an English-based



program. That's what I took from it. The skills you learn there ... Even some magical or timely phrases that you learn, skills to unlock standoffs, and deal with situations in calls. There are equities on both sides but there's also some logic in the structures in place.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Alberto.

ALBERTO SOTO: I believe that this issue was not dealt with in LACRALO. I'd like to ask our chair that before announcing it we should deal with it in LACRALO. We should vote on it. After that, it should be communicated. I believe there is an incoming ALAC member who has already been part of the NomCom. I believe he or she speaks English already. Thank you.

PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: I have no specific bias for any of the languages whether it is English or Spanish. I am not English. I am not Spanish. If we must be very objective with what we want to do I would want to say this is not a time to express regional sentiments in any activities we want to carry out within ICANN. The Academy is just an arm of ICANN. It is not a [general brought here] by ... If we're having an AGM, of course, we have translators in the six major UA languages. If we are asking that translators be provided in training in every ICANN program that would be asking for too much.

That is not to say that the request is not legitimate. In view of the present realities I wouldn't want people to say, "Okay, because there



was no translator we choose to stay away from it." It is taking a very hardline position. If we want to begin to express sentiments in terms of languages I could also as that my language in Africa should be included if I must take part in the ICANN training program. I won't say that. I wouldn't want us to waste much time.

It's a request that looks into the future when opportunities provide for it, and it is what ICANN can afford it should be done. Then, we must take notice that the danger would be if we choose to lean towards the demand of a particular region because of their languages. Then, there could be demands from other languages that are minorities. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Humberto.

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: Thank you very much. I'm going to speak Spanish. I want to be brief. I was lucky enough to be part of the Leadership Program. I was lucky because I speak some English. It's very useful. I realized that Alberto Soto wasn't able to participate because he wasn't fluent in English. I guess that Sergio has a similar issue. I understand that they feel frustrated. I believe there are other people who feel frustrated, too. They were not as lucky as we, the ones who speak English. I don't know who is to be blamed for this. He should use our intuition, our imagination.



I will give an example. Some days ago we were invited to be the cofacilitators of a panel on LAC PDP. There was no interpretation available. There were people who were coming from Latin America. We made the decision that the presenter was going to speak in English and I was going to summarize everything into Spanish. It was quite a success. I believe that if we are ingenious enough we may find a way with resources that are not as expensive to become more inclusive. This applies not only to Spanish but also to French and other languages. Where there is a will there is a way. Thank you very much.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Is there anyone else in the queue besides Sergio at this time? I see no cards. We'll let Sergio have the session and then I will return the session to Maureen.

SERGIO SALINAS: Thank you, Jon. I would like to clarify the following. We were lucky enough to have Harold in one of these meetings. This was quite successful. Harold speaks English. The future president and secretary of the region don't speak English. One of them speaks French. The other one speaks Spanish. I do speak English. Alberto, who was the chair, doesn't speak English either. In that process, we cannot keep on moving like this because some regions will not be included.

> If we run a survey of those who speak English in my region very few people in my region speak English. We understand everything the Academy may say but I also have to understand that my region will get



excluded. I have to be concerned because I want my region to be up on the same level as the leaders of the other regions. If ICANN doesn't give this to me LACRALO will have to organize something for ourselves. This makes sense. That's it.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, some great discussion. Oh, Roberto.

ROBERTO GAETANO:I could have spoken later. I will speak in English. I've just discussed with
some people exactly [this day] about this issue of translation and so on.
It seems that there is some software that is making a lot of progress in
terms of automatic translation. It cannot be as good as the interpreters
obviously. That could be some tool that could help in certain situations.
What Humberto has said. We need to be inventive to find something. I
think that we could start experimenting with these things in specific
situations.

Then, I would like also to tell to my good friends sat here it's not just Latin America that has this problem. Rest assured that the large part of the world has the same problem. The moment that we are doing a lot of effort for instance with Universal Acceptance to accept different scripts is in some way a little bit strange that we don't do some equivalent effort for progressing in accepting different languages. Thank you.



MAUREEN HILYARD:Excellent, thank you, Roberto. Now we're going to move into ... I hope
that's set the scene a bit for you, Sandra, anyway. I guess they'll get the
names to you shortly if you still need them.

If we could now move on to the ALAC activities that we've got to get done? The very first thing that I want to look at is our organogram. I'd like to do some confirmation of our ALAC liaisons and also confirmation of the organogram to show you how things are organized within At-Large. Can I have it? Okay. This shouldn't take too long. Then, we'll be moving on to a session with Jonathan.

At this particular point in time, Jonathan, I'd like to apologize that we didn't get around to the DNS abuse discussion that we hoped to have with the board yesterday. I understand that León thought it had already been included. The first thing, I was wondering why it was being extended and I couldn't say anything, unfortunately. Yes, it's coming. Oh, no, that's the wrong one. No, this is the RALO one. I wanted the organogram with everybody in it and the different ...

JONATHAN ZUCK: I'll just take the opportunity to say that Olivier and I were able to have a meeting with Martin and León to talk about DNS abuse after our joint meeting with the board. We were able to express many of the concerns around DNS abuse directly to the incoming chair and vice-chair. It was a very good meeting. There was a commitment to act on things that the board was capable of acting on and also to interact regularly with ALAC



leadership and to keep those lines of communication open directly with the board. That happened yesterday as well.

Yes, unfortunately, Martin's introduction to me was me hammering him about DNS abuse. It's better that he get used to it now, I suppose. Olivier was the diplomatic one in that meeting. Our voice was heard. Even though it didn't come up in that particular meeting we were able to get a meeting with the chair and the vice-chair and express our concerns and our plans for the future on that issue.

I didn't even introduce myself. Zdravstvuytye. Myenya zovut Jonathan. [inaudible] Guten tag. Ni Hao! Ohayou gozaimasu. Was kann ich für Sie tun? Language will continue to be a challenge for us and a particular for us because of the diversity that we enjoy. Our greatest strength is also our greatest challenge. We're going to continue to find interesting ways to get our briefing materials translated and out to people, making videos, presentations, and finding ways for things to persist.

We're already in discussions with ICANN Learn about how to create an At-Large-only channel, if you will. An ICANN Learn that's specifically for bringing up multi-lingual educational information that's specific to the At-Large. I just want you to know as your policy champion that this is something that I take very, very seriously.

One of the things that we started this year and will continue to do is if you're not a native speaker of English and are concerned about what your writing looks like or something like that, we have commitment from staff to edit things written in English or translated into English by



Google Translate, or something like that, so that by the time that it is presented by the group it has been made more fluent. I don't want language to be a barrier to anyone's participation.

I welcome any additional suggestions for how best to facilitate a multilingual discussion on these things. The only way to have a multigeographical discussion is to have a multi-lingual discussion. We're committed to it in our policy development. I welcome all of your suggestions and help. We'll keep experimenting with what the best and most effective ways are to accomplish that.

I think that I'll continue in English if that's alright. The primary job of the At-Large for this coming year could probably be summarized as trust. The end-user trust in the DNS. The end-user trust in ICANN. There's going to be a number of different aspects to that. I think on the one [cent] it's about trustworthiness. How do we make the DNS and the ICANN Organization trustworthy? That's how we engage in policy discussions on such issues as DNS abuse and on the multistakeholder development and evolution of ICANN.

It was very exciting to me that when we had our breakout in NARALO and people were identifying the areas of interest we had people interested in each of those areas that we're going to need to focus on so that we have new voices able to participate and work on those issues.

On the side of trust, we have our outreach efforts. In order for people to better trust the DNS and ICANN's Policy Development Process, they



need to be made more aware of it. The folks in NARALO and, I'm sure, all of the different RALOs that are committed to being part of our communications, have that other side of the responsibility. When we work inside the organization to make it trustworthy then we need to let people know we've done that so that we can increase trust. Areas like Universal Acceptance are going to be of incredible importance.

Some of the biggest websites in the world, the multi-national airlines, hotel chains, and things like that, are still among those that have not fixed their websites to incorporate the new TLDs from seven years ago. This is not just a developing world problem or an under-served regions problem. It is literally the largest websites on the planet that still have these problems with Universal Acceptance. That's a problem that's unique for us to participate in because of our numbers and our geographic distribution.

We want to make that, again, an ongoing goal to tell those people that it's critical that they do the work. This is like Y2K. They need to do the work to update those websites so that people can use the new domains, .photography and .gallery, as well as using the IDNs so that people can communicate and interact with those businesses in their own language. We're going to continue to find ways to pound on that as well.

In my mind our theme for 2020 is trust. On the one hand, it's trustworthiness. On the other, it's education and building trust in the outside world. No one is better prepared to do that going forward than the At-Large community. We have created a draft statement on DNS abuse. There will be a workspace for it. One of the things that we've



discussed with the board, with Martin and León, is actually going back and forth with them before we submit it officially.

There won't be any more surprises about how people react or a way for them to shuffle it down the path because of a missing comma. Instead, we'll negotiate with them what our advice will be so that they're wellprepared to receive it and well-prepared to act on it.

You'll see in your inbox a link to the draft statement that has not been released. We'll go through a number of iterations both internally and with León to make sure that it's the ideal statement to give to the board on DNS abuse. I really welcome your feedback and your participation in that. Let's get on top of this DNS abuse issue. I believe that it's one that we're well prepared to own. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Sandra, too, for accommodating that. Yes, we finally found the correct version of the organogram. The organogram is the organizational chart that contains the new ALAC members, the new RALO chairs for 2020, the people who will take their chairs as of the end of this meeting. Actually, now. I'm sure after the board has its meeting the new people take over. This is the new ALAC lineup and the new RALO chair lineup. It's really to introduce the positions to you all. For those who did not see last year's version, the top line is, of course, the 15 members of the ALAC.

> You will note that in the left-hand box you've got 10 members who are the two people from each of the different regions. Then, on the right-



hand side of my photograph section are the four representatives of the other four regions who constitute what is the leadership team of the ALAC. The leadership team has been constituted by, final report example, Tijani, Humberto, Jonathan, and Joanna. Those who have not already will have a leadership role within At-Large. You'll see that a little bit in the next level. There are three members from each of the regions. They're all represented there.

One of the things that you'll note underneath, and read, is that there are certain responsibilities that people have. I will list those as people indicate what responsibilities they might be able to engage in during the coming year. I'd like to see that the ALAC members are actually involved in the CPWG.

The role of At-Large constitutes three areas. They're represented down at the bottom. You have policy, outreach and engagement, and organizational management. Policy is central to the work that we do here, which is why we incorporated that very much into the Altas, to indicate to you how important it is. Also, the fact that you will have been a part of the public forum, any other activities that are going on within the ICANN meeting, how important it is that people have their say, that you actually contribute an opinion/a view. You have your voice within the work that is part of ICANN. We do this within our own At-Large level, as well. You have your 15 members.

In the next level, we have what I formed as the At-Large leadership team, the ALT Plus. It used to be the ALT members. The five leaders from the ALAC used to constitute a leadership team who would discuss



issues and take recommendations to the ALAC. The ALAC is the group that actually votes on and makes the decision.

What I felt was really important was that we needed to include the RALO voices into this discussion and that the RALO leaders themselves brought the voice of their members to the discussions that we had, where we could all get an overall view of At-Large opinion and discussion, to take the recommendations to the ALAC. This is why my At-Large leadership team is larger than what it used to be.

Also included in that At-Large group are the liaisons. The liaisons are our At-Large-led representatives to other sections of the ICANN community. Not only do we have towards the ALAC leadership with the RALOs bringing the members' views, we also have contributions and input from other communities via our liaisons. We have Julio, who you will have seen yesterday. He has an integral role. He has a very close relationship with the GAC community. He works in well with them. He's an ideal person for our GAC liaison.

Cheryl, of course, spends half of her life in with the GNSO. She brings a lot of input about what is actually happening within the GNSO community into our discussions. Andrei, of course, is in that specialist area of SSAC. You actually have to be a member of SSAC to also be a liaison for us. We have Vera, who is also a member of the ccNSO. Then, of course, we have the odds and sods like Alan and Olivier who happen to be former chairs. They're a part of that advisory group.



What I have to do today is to get from the ALAC members a confirmation/an affirmation of the people who actually have liaisons. We need to get the new ALAC getting involved in their first vote of affirmation for the positions of the liaisons.

Before we do that, one of the things that I have actually asked the liaisons to do this year is to try and shoulder-tap or get some volunteers to be mentees. A couple of people. If there are more than two, we might have to have a little look at the applicants. We need to look at changing some of those liaison roles down the track. The thing is when you're working with liaisons the liaisons have to be accepted by the other group, for a start.

Therefore, they need to have had some contact. They need to have some real engagement with the group that they want to be a liaison for. It's something that I want you all to be thinking about. It may be something that you have an interest in. You may not necessarily be able to become a liaison within a year. You might need to be two years in a mentor/mentee role before you are considered eligible as a liaison. That's something down the track to advise you that we are looking at changing leaders within the whole system.

For those ALAC members ... You're spread all around the place. Normally I would have you in a nice little huddle so that I could see you all together and we'd be able to ... Pardon? Yes, there we go. We've got someone who wants a ...



JONATHAN ZUCK:	Incoming ALAC members and ALAC members for 2020. If you can please hold your cards up in the air so we can count and check for quorum, please? That would be Dave Kissoondoyal, Abdulkarim, Justine, Holly, Bastian. I can't read that. Carlos, Silvia.
UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	I don't have a card but I can hold my hand.
JONATHAN ZUCK:	Okay, we'll get you a card. Xavier, Marita, Tijani, Humberto, Jonathan, and Joanna. We're going to get you a card. This will be consensus. Oh, and we have Sebastien back there. This is a consensus call.
UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	I have a white card.
JONATHAN ZUCK:	It's all good. Then just ask for our consensus call. We do have quorum. At this point, I am just asking for a consensus among the 2020 ALAC members for the liaisons. Signify your agreement. Beg pardon. Sebastien?
SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET:	Did we receive the mail asking for a candidate on that specific issue?



JONATHAN ZUCK: I believe I saw something but I don't know. He's asked ...

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay, what happened was ... First of all, I sought whether they were going to be available because we haven't got any replacements yet. A notice did go out to everyone that they had all agreed to remain in the position.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: I am sorry, Madame Chair, I am not anymore an ALAC member and I will shut my mouth immediately. I think that all the ex-ALAC members need to quit their position now. We didn't receive a mail asking for candidates. Therefore, you don't have an open and transparent process to find a liaison. If you want to decide that the same are returned it's your choice, and the choice of ALAC. I want just to stress that if we are working to try to find evolution we need to open, at least, the candidate chair. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you for that, former ALAC member. There was an inquiry made out to all the liaisons. There was a notification that an appointment was to be made and that they were to look at mentors/mentees. We hadn't done that before. I'm not prepared to make an appointment to a position when we haven't actually had a discussion about any replacement. What we're doing is confirming those positions for one year.



PASTOR PETERS OMORAGBON: Thank you, Chair. I think what the last speaker is trying to say is that he will not be opposed to whoever is appointed as liaison. As a community, it would have been neater if communications were sent out for those who would be interested so that the process would be seen as transparent. I think that is his point, not that he's opposed to do that [appointed]. It's a new invention to promote the [inaudible] of ALAC. I will say that we could just have a look for now. Going forward it will be nicer, should positions be created, the competition be informed and they let everybody indicate interest. The person will be transparent and more democratic. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: It's not a process that has been done before. This is a new process. It has not been established yet but will be.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I will be speaking in Spanish. As I'm just coming, I didn't know whether I was able to vote or not. I didn't have a chance to look at all the efforts of the liaison persons. I've been told their efforts were very good but I would have liked to have time. I didn't know that I had to vote now.

MAUREEN HILYARD: I think that one of the things that we have hoped that a lot of our ALAC members ... Knowing that they have had a role for several months and also having been involved before, it's really important that you actually



are engaged and understand the way ... This is one of the reasons why the chart has been constructed, so that everyone is aware of all the positions. We should all learn. If you're going to aspire to leadership within the At-Large community, it's important that you understand what those roles are.

One of the things that probably we're going to be talking about later on when we talk about the 2020 vision is how we will actually gain more understanding about what it is that we do within At-Large and how we learn to do it through our RALOs. The RALO role is going to be really important in this so that we get to understand not only what ALAC has involved but what the RALOs are supposed to do and what the liaisons and everyone else is supposed to do. Please bring that up later on. Yes?

[JON:] Thank you. I don't know whether to say outgoing ALAC member, or AFRALO chair, or incoming AFRALO chair. The reason is clear. I don't think there has been any clarification of what we are doing here. Is this the ALAC meeting? If this is the ALAC meeting it needs to be clear so that we know whether ... I'm hearing [how ALAC] votes now. It needs to be clear as well whether as soon as the ICANN Board meeting that's held in the main room is finished, does that signify that all the past ALAC members, the outgoing ones, are no longer ALAC members? I think that needs to be clear because that is [inaudible]. If this is an ALAC meeting I would like to know because I don't need to be in this room anyway. Thank you.



- MAUREEN HILYARD: When it comes to the ALAC vote ... It is an ALAC meeting. ALAC meetings are always open, you know that, which is why we wanted to make sure that we had the quorum, that people were aware that they were now ALAC members. I think that that's really important. Now they are. You guys are now the RALO chairs, still part and parcel of our ALT Plus. This is part of the learning process. We now have a new ALT Plus. We now have a new ALAC. Also, impressing on people when we have ALAC meetings everyone is invited. If you want to have a say you can have a say. Gone are the days when if we had an ALAC meeting it was only ALAC members who did most of the talking. It's an open forum. Tijani has his card up.
- TIJANI BEN JAMAA: Thank you very much, Maureen. I love our liaison. Unfortunately, I didn't receive any mail, or any notification that there is a call for candidates for these liaison positions. I didn't receive anything saying that we will reappoint the current liaison. This is another time that we don't follow our rules. I don't like that. I prefer that perhaps you follow the rules. We can do that next week, please, for example. Thank you.
- MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you for that, Tijani. I have to disagree. It is in the rules of procedure that ICANN make a call at our AGM, which is what this is. There was a notification that did go out. It was in our last ALAC call. There was something mentioned of our liaisons, anyway. It's really just



getting confirmation. There is going to be some development of liaisons during the year. I don't think that there's any real need for further discussion on it. If anyone's got any complaints about any of the liaisons, please do raise it with us. I'm sure that we can have some further discussion on that later. I'm just informing you the consensus call is ... Unless there is any disagreement with any of those liaisons who are currently listed. Then, please let me know now.

- UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Madam President. I don't think there is anyone in this room that is opposed to any liaison that has been appointed or selected. What we are talking about is the process of this election or appointment. That is what I want to take on board. We, the committee, were not informed of the need for ... Even if contact was made, it may have been made to a selective few. That is exactly what we are saying.
- MAUREEN HILYARD: For those who are new, perhaps not aware ... But it is in our rules of procedure. Please read them. Okay. Are you going to fight about which one's going to go first? Carlos.
- CARLOS GUTIERREZ: Thank you. Since we have a meeting of ALAC later today can we postpone the vote to later today when all the ALAC is seated? Maybe we can prepare a short agenda for that session tonight? We can have the votes then. That's only a suggestion. Thank you very much.



MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you. We'll see what we can do later on. Yes, thank you. We're actually over time. The interpreters need to have a break. Therefore, we will close this particular session and resume at whatever time ... What time is it? Okay. We'll give them 15 minutes. Meeting.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

