

---

ICANN75 | AGM – ccNSO and Universal Acceptance  
Wednesday, September 21, 2022 – 13:15 to 14:30 KUL

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Hello and welcome to the ccNSO and Universal Acceptance session. My name is Claudia Ruiz and I along with Kimberly Carlson am the remote participation manager for this session.

Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN expected standards of behavior. During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will only be read aloud if put in the proper form as noted in the chat.

If you would like to speak during this session, please raise your hand in Zoom. When called upon, virtual participants will unmute their microphone in Zoom. Onsite participants will use a microphone to speak and should leave their Zoom microphones disconnected.

For the benefit of other participants please state your name for the record and speak at a reasonable pace. Onsite participants may pick up a receiver or use their own headphones to listen to interpretation. Virtual participants may access the interpretation icon via the Zoom toolbar.

With that, I will now hand the floor over to Dejan. Thank you very much.

---

***Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.***

DEJAN DJUKIC:

Thank you. Good afternoon. Welcome to ccNSO session on universal acceptance. My name is Dejan Djukic. I am CEO of Serbian ccTLD. We are running two domains: .rs and .srb in Cyrillic. Which was initially an IDN domain and .rs later became because we had some additional characters and we accept IDN letters in .rs.

In many sessions before, universal acceptance was discussed several times. Rather, it was on technical or policy level. Also, registries shared their experiences on universal acceptance in many sessions and in previous ICANN meetings and regional meetings. But today, we will speak about what is the role of ccNSO when it comes to universal acceptance. Should the ccNSO play a more active role in discussion? And would it be helpful for ccTLDs around the world if the ccNSO takes active part in coordination in leading that discussion?

The goal of the session is to understand what the community expects from ccNSO to do regarding universal acceptance. Based on that ccNSO Council will consider how ccNSO should get more involved in universal acceptance discussion and related activities that could help ccTLDs and assist them.

We have great speakers today who will share their point of view on this issue. So we have Pensri Arunwatanamongkol from .th;

---

Edmon Chung, DotAsia; Anil Kumar Jain, .in; Dusan Stojicevic, Gransy. And our moderator for this session will be Biyi Odadipo, .ng.

The audience could ask questions after the last presentation, but quick questions regarding clarification only are available after every presentation. So I'll give the floor now for our first presenter Pensri.

PENSRI ARUNWATANAMONGKOL: Good afternoon, all participants. Let me start sharing my screen. Can you see my screen now?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Pensri, yes, we can.

PENSRI ARUNWATANAMONGKOL: Okay. Again, good afternoon, everybody. First of all, thank you ccNSO for hosting this session. I'm very glad that I can join this session. Next. We have limited time, so let's begin with the three main challenges from .th perspective as a ccTLD that has been working on the IDN, EAI, and UA since the early days.

Starting with the first challenge to implement new [inaudible] system, develop those or implement those [inaudible]. [Understanding these too] and having enough knowledge and

solution to handle them with success [inaudible]. Examples [inaudible].

Limited resources on UA for supporting local stakeholders who understand [inaudible] application and system is then become the first challenge for ccTLD organizations that want to start on their support.

The next one, [supportive] policy from the local government demanding for the UA ready products and services to help guide the direction of local community on the UA. The technology and the [inaudible] supporting UA activities as they work on developing [inaudible] system requires time and budget allocation from [inaudible]. Therefore, a lack of policy to support UA readiness is our second challenge.

To cope with the first two challenges [inaudible] activities [inaudible] know that the Internet is an ecosystem. We need to work with stakeholders via [inaudible] both local and international [inaudible] started working with other ccTLDs and email service providers to make the EAI service more [inaudible] local community.

During the implementation interoperability testing with [others] as needed as email is two-way communication, sender and receiver need to understand each other. Working with other ccTLDs helps us a lot building the [inaudible] of this.

[We started a] Universal Acceptance Steering Group. Since it has been founded, working with UASG helped us [inaudible] with stand-up implementation, deployment practice, and tools. Technical information guidelines and best practices [from the group] are compiled and [adjusted] for the local technical community in Thai language.

Through the UA local initiative program we organize events to raise awareness of the local government agencies, service providers, developers, as well as academia in Thailand, promoting and encouraging them to implement UA readiness systems and services by providing hands-on training materials and tools.

We also join hands with the Thai influencers to promote the IDN and EAI and UA to the community through social media channels in local language. But Facebook chose a [label] URL which looks [weird and scary] for others to click the link which is a very [bad] user experience. This is a chicken and egg [issue] as bad user experience on IDN and EAI [inaudible] will affect the number of IDN and EAI users. And less users will impact the implementation of UA ready systems by the service providers.

So let's [inaudible] statement for each challenge for the ccNSO and ccTLD within the [inaudible] [ccNSO]. For the first challenge, the ccNSO should organize sessions on UA readiness and

---

practices for and by ccTLDs at Tech Day or ccNSO meetings as sessions UA readiness and deployment practices will be a good starting point for other ccTLD registries to [catch up] with the current tools, technology, implementation, and the [inaudible].

For the second challenge, the ccNSO should encourage ccTLDs to raise awareness about the importance and need for UA readiness among newcomers. ccTLDs through ccNSO can take part to share tips for UA readiness implementation [and thoughts] to newcomers including the government policymakers of their [economies] so they can be aware of and motivated by the important [inaudible] adoption. Then newcomers can work with their local communities to deploy UA readiness.

For the last one, the ccNSO in collaboration with UASG should encourage ccTLDs to reach out to social media sites and platforms like Facebook and Line ensuring support URLs and emails in local languages. By [inaudible] EAI and especially this [inaudible] local language you make a huge impact for the user. If each country does it alone, the platform providers might not listen. But as a group of ccTLDs, I think our voice will be loud enough for them to [turn] to us.

So that is all from me. Thank you and I'm looking forward to the rest of the session.

---

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you, Pensri. Good afternoon everyone. Good morning, good evening, wherever you are on the globe. Are there clarification questions for Pensri? We'd like to take clarification questions after every presentation. So if there are clarification questions, please raise your hand in the room or raise your hand in the Zoom room. Okay, it doesn't look like there are any. And when a presentation goes on and there are no clarification questions, it means the person has done a good job. Okay, so we'll take the next. We're going to next presenter, Edmon Chung, DotAsia.

EDMON CHUNG: Thank you. Thank you for having me here. You can see that I'm wearing this green t-shirt, and I see a number of people here wearing this green t-shirt which is very important to part of the topic we're discussing. Later today, I hope you join us in one of the celebration sessions at 4:30 which is going to be in the main opening session hall. We're celebrating that a lot of what is called the root zone label generation rules for IDNs are now in place and supporting I think over 300 languages around the world. So you see the back of my t-shirt, those are some of the scripts that are now supported by the root zone.

But we're here to talk about universal acceptance, and just because we put all the policies and the processes in place to have

---

IDN ccTLDs and IDNs in the DNS if it doesn't work in the systems, then it's not very useful. And that's where universal acceptance comes in. People talk about this and one of my main jobs in the next few minutes is to try to convince you that the ccNSO has a role to play and maybe make a few suggestions.

First of all, besides the language, the heritage, and also the importance of diversity, I want to bring this message to you that it is a matter of consumer trust. People trust the DNS when it works. And for internationalized domain names if a general user uses it and it doesn't work for whatever application or email or other services that they're using, the level of trust for the DNS is being compromised.

This is something that is related, I think, to the earlier session today on the fragmentation of the Internet. Just like when we talk about alternate routes, the point is that they are not...they don't work properly. But if in the case if you look at...

Even if you are an English majority jurisdiction or ccTLD that doesn't provide IDNs, I think universal acceptance is still relevant. Think about the name servers. Are you accepting IDNs as name servers? Someone who's running a name server with internationalized domain names, can your system support it? If someone registered a domain name, even an English domain name, but they used an internationalized email address, is your



---

system able to hold that registrant contact information? The billing contact, the technical contact, are those aspects in place?

All of this adds to, again, the trust to the entire system. So I will go into the...there are three particular suggestions I have for— actually, that was the homework that I was asked to do, is to come up with a few suggestions. So I'll quickly point out the three things I want to leave you with.

One is, forming a standing committee on IDN and UA in the ccNSO should be a good idea. Secondly, I think developing some best and current practices would be useful. Third, I encourage ccNSO and its members to join us to contribute to some of the measurement of the universal acceptance or UA readiness.

So back to number one. I understand that recently the ccNSO has formed a standing committee on DNS abuse. I think this is a topic, IDNs and universal acceptance, is not going to be solved in the next year or two. It's going to take time because we're talking about the entire infrastructure of the Internet and multiple applications.

So I encourage you to consider forming a standing committee on IDN and universal acceptance. Especially then it will allow it to connect with the other committees. Like the ALAC does have an IDN working group. The GAC is also forming an IDN working group. The Board, where I'm currently honored to be serving as

---

the chair for the IDN and universal acceptance working group on the Board, these are touchpoints that with the standing committee we can work together on.

Second part is to develop best and current practices. As ccTLDs implement or the systems become universal acceptance ready, there are multiple parts that you need to deal with. Like I mentioned the name servers. I mentioned the contact information. There could be much more. That information, that sharing of how to go through the process and create a roadmap to become universal acceptance ready, that should be valuable. And perhaps coming from the committee or at least creating certain resources that would allow other ccTLDs to look at, that should be useful.

The third and final item is to join some of the measures. Currently, the Universal Acceptance Steering Group (UASG) actually has certain measures. For example, we can take your one file and run through the domains to see if they have MX records, mail server records, and see if those mail servers support IDNs and internationalized email addresses. That can give you a very good sense of how much of the zone or the local Internet infrastructure is universal acceptance at least aware. And also give you a sense of how far awareness and also implementation and UA readiness there might be and could be able to contribute that information back into the global community and the UASG.

So with that, I guess that comes to the end. So I just repeat the three particular things that I think the ccNSO should think about. Having a standing committee on IDN and UA so that it connects with other parts of the ICANN community and beyond. Secondly, I think best and current practices for other ccTLDs as we go through the journey of universal acceptance for the ccTLD systems would be useful. And thirdly, there are some tools and measures that are already being taken in the UASG. Take those tools and apply them to your zone and tell us the results and tell us how it is.

So finally, again, 4:30 come to the main room for the session. But also one last advertisement is the universal acceptance day. This is something that the UASG is working on which will happen next year in February. I hope the ccNSO would form the committee and participate in the UA day next year. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC:

Thank you, Edmon. All right, thank you, Edmon. Are there clarification questions? None in the room. But I'm going to ask you one. You mentioned creating best and current practices and all of that. Are you talking in terms of—I'd like you to make a little clarification on that—are you talking in terms of creating a library of terms, creating what exactly?

---

EDMON CHUNG: Yeah. So I would encourage you to look at the UASG document. There are already some case studies. So I would love for ccTLD case studies to be included as the ccTLD registry systems [how] from non-universal acceptance ready toward universal acceptance ready. So that would be a kind of format.

The other one is ICANN Org has been working very hard with the gTLDs for registrars and registries in what is called, the document I think it's called—Sarmad, please help me if I got it wrong—a roadmap document that maps...please? It's called the...?

SARMAD HUSSAIN: UA Roadmap for [Domain Name] Registry and Registrar Systems.

EDMON CHUNG: Yes. So there's a UA roadmap for registrars and registries. I think if we turn that into a ccTLD version, that would be very useful for the community.

DEJAN DJUKIC: That roadmap is in the chat, so everyone can take a look there. We are moving...are there any? No. No other clarification questions. Okay, so we are moving to third presentation now, Anil Kumar Jain, .in. The floor is yours, Anil.

---

ANIL KUMAR JAIN:

Thank you. Good morning, good afternoon, good evening as per the online participants' place of location from where they have joined. Good evening to all who are present in-person here.

Universal acceptance is a very important subject for the Internet community today because we expect that next billion Internet users are going to come from using Internet in the local languages. Right now, the awareness is picking up, and UASG is doing a great job in that. The efforts which UASG has brought is going to be much more popularized with the new concept of UA day which is going to be celebrated on 16 [February] every year.

As Edmon had said that you had asked about three/four suggestions to be given to ccNSO together or the community how we can work on universal acceptance. Next slide, please.

The first which we are suggesting is that ccNSO should raise awareness about the benefits of IDN ccTLDs delegation to ccTLDs. Right now, hardly 50 countries the IDN ccTLDs have been taken. Although the number of IDN ccTLDs are slightly more, but it is close to 100. Which is a concern because all ccTLDs should have their IDN ccTLD also.

Now when a ccTLD country is adopting, they're asking why. Why we should take IDN ccTLD? Because this is a general question which is going to be there. So the fact is that more than 65% of global population is non-English speaking. So actually, Internet

---

has not gone into their heart. They are only using it either to watch movies or to listen to the song or even to go to the YouTube. That's all.

Another major concern which we have is that the languages through which we live and we live with the culture, this is a UN study which says that one language or dialect we are losing every 15 days. This is a serious issue. I think it is a requirement from the community to ensure that we continue to have our culture and language intact for the next generations also.

Looking for the community which are commercial in nature, there was a study conducted by ICANN in 2017 which says around five years back there is a business case of more than \$8-9 billion for the IDN and UA ready Internet [available with that]. So I think it is very, very important that all this awareness to adopt IDN ccTLDs is very important. Next slide, please.

The next is that work is already done over the last several years on UA. So time has come when ccNSO should start sharing those success stories with other ccTLDs. Why I am saying success story means that if a particular company has gone as a UA ready, then the entire story of that company, how they have gone to UA ready and how the benefits they are driving out of it should be there.

And the second part of this is that there are several business models technical community which have gone UA ready. For

---

example, say a particular version of Python has gone UA ready. A particular version of browser has gone UA ready. I think we should collect those in [combination] and start sharing with the ccTLDs through ccNSO. So sharing is very important because we learn about how the experience has gone and what benefit we can get as a ccTLD in particular [region].

Third, I think it's very, very important that UASG and ICANN are doing a job. Next slide, please. UASG is doing a great job so ccNSO should connect and take the benefits of UASG, whatever they have done to the ccTLD community. This can be done with a liaison officer. I am understanding that liaison is already there. I think we have to more activate that liaison officer more.

So what we are saying, why a liaison officer? A liaison officer will help track the progress and address the issues of ccTLDs which are informed in UA/EAI implementation through UASG. So whatever we feel as a ccTLD requires we can pass on to UASG to get it implemented.

Second is the problem statement whatever the ccTLDs are facing. We can share with UASG, and UASG has a group who are working technically commercially to ensure that UA implementation is there.

---

And the final, the priorities of ccNSO can be inbuilt on yearly plans of UASG. That will give the emphasis of ccNSO community in the working of UASG. Next slide, please.

And this is my final slide which I am saying that ccNSO should create a dedicated group to assist ccTLDs. Assist ccTLDs means suppose I am a ccTLD and I am working on UA. Suppose I got motivated that let me get [IDN] and let me start my system to be UA ready. I may face problems, and those problems are supposed to resolved by some experts. Who are those experts? Those experts are the people who are working on UASG. So we want that any time of the day if any problem comes to anybody who are working on UA, should be resolved. So developers, implementers, academicians can find it useful during difficult times.

But more important thing is that suppose the problems are coming and we are resolving. This procrastinate group has a ready reckoner database for UASG for the future plan. Because you come to know what difficulties have come and how we are able to resolve them and what are the expectations of the people.

So these are the four recommendations which I suggest for ccNSO. Thank you very much.

DEJAN DJUKIC:

Thank you, Anil. Are there clarification questions from the room or online? Okay, doesn't look like there are clarification



---

questions, but the room is open for the discussions. The whole idea is for us to be able to come out with a decision on whether there's a role and what that role specifically is for the ccNSO as far as universal acceptance is concerned. So this discussion is open to everyone, and then we can have conversations around it. Now we're moving to final presentation before we start the discussion. Dusan Stojicevic, Gransy.

DUSAN STOJICEVIC:

Hello, everybody. I am the only one who doesn't have the dot. So every one of those guys here are having some dots, like .rs, .something. I am from Gransy. How many of you can read my name on the screen? I see two hands. This is a script which should be universally accepted.

Many of you know me from let's say ten years of working IDNs, etc., but right now I'm asked by organizers to present different view on universal acceptance from a registrar's perspective. So Gransy is an ICANN accredited registrar. I'm working for them for several years, I think seven or eight. And, yes, I'm now evil registrar and I will present my view from the registrar perspective on universal acceptance. Next slide, please.

First, what is the definition of universal acceptance? Anyone? I presume that Dr. Ajay will literally stand up in the middle of the night and say all domains and all emails should be treated equally

---

by all systems, programs, etc. So, yes, and this is the bubble. This is the bubble that we are living in ICANN. You think that universal acceptance outside of ICANN just domain names and email addresses.

No, it's not. Look at your keyboards. Do you have Latin keyboard? Yes, mostly you have Latin keyboard. Why don't you use Cyrillic, Chinese, or I don't know, your native keyboards?

Let me try from the other side. Let's say you are all in the hotel somewhere. So probably because most of the hotels are giving you the form which you will fill and you are asked to fill in email address. Okay, I have Cyrillic EAI email address. I can fill on that form. Is it usable for them? Can they type on their computers and send information to me? No, they don't have keyboards. They cannot support Cyrillic even if they can install in those or whatever else is there, they cannot send me, they cannot type. They don't understand my Cyrillic.

So the way of the definition that I'm using right now of universal acceptance is totally different. Create user interface which will include your native script. So my colleague was saying about one billion of users. Okay, next one billion of users let's use my mother like example. So my mother is using only Cyrillic script. So with mostly Latin keyboards that you have, she cannot type. So what are we missing?

Okay, maybe she knows a little bit of Latin, and then she can send me email. So how many years Cyrillic is having a problem of @ sign in code page in Windows? Is it solved? [There is a need] before I think six years. Microsoft didn't move a thing. The @ sign is not in Windows code page. I cannot type email address because there is no @ sign.

Armenian language is having a problem with the dot also in code page. When they type IDN domain name and use dot, they need to switch to Latin to use Latin dot. Okay, there is a way to type with [left out] and code, but this is not for my mother. My mother cannot type like that.

So what are those next million users, what they want? We are in the bubble of domain names and email addresses missing the whole wide world of universal acceptance which is not covered, which no one has covered. So no one has covered whether the programs are designed in your native language, whether the programs are using this or that which my mother can understand. Next slide, please.

You wanted to hear what registrars think about what ccNSO can do for universal acceptance. Nothing. My opinion is nothing. Don't do anything. Registries can do a lot. When we are talking about our bubble, registries can do a lot, but ccNSO, no.

---

ccNSO can form another body, another working group, another structure which are already in universal acceptance steering group. Just join them. Don't practice to develop bodies after bodies just for the sake of the body or whatever. So there is tech group, there is measurement group, there are a lot of groups. There are local initiatives. You join locally in your script, etc. ccNSO doesn't need to do anything as ccNSO.

For the registries, I have a suggestion. Clean your backyard. So you want others to be UA compliant. Okay, do you accept my Cyrillic email as a registrant of your domain name? Think about that. Half of the registries, maybe more, don't accept EAI as a valid email address. So what are we talking about? We are talking about registries, ccTLDs who can clean their backyard, clean their software, and start to be UA ready.

Okay, I'm turning back into the bubble. Next slide, please. So registrars, those guys same as me are your sales network. So we are not evil, and we are not only for the money like everybody of you are thinking. How many promotions did you organize with us about IDNs? Mostly none. If you take .xyz or any other new gTLD who is very active in promoting, so just one-tenth of that activity will do much with registrars and IDNs regarding that. Next slide, please.

---

I was talking about user interface. This is something that I was already mentioning that we need to think about users, what users need. My message for you is Internet is working very simply. If some technology is good, it will be adopted. So Facebook, etc., it is social networking is adopted by the users. If some technology is not that good, not useful, then it is abandoned by users.

So think about your numbers of IDN domain names. Think how much you have domain names registered in your IDN ccTLDs, and think what is the future of that. Next slide, please.

Do you work with your governments? Do you need to work with your governments or your part of the government? If you want to do something, you need to create also with the government the usage of your native script widely. So in your country you should have physical [builds] and other things on your native language. If you are using Latin and you are, for example, a Cyrillic country, there is no success for your IDN.

And secondly, does your country use Latin domain names or are they using your native script domain names? So what is first? What is forwarding to what? Where is the content? So close connection with the government, build the environment, and then we can talk about universal acceptance and the rest of the things.

---

Sorry for me being a little bit [bitter] than expected, but as I said at the beginning I'm the evil registrar. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you, Dusan.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: We have one question and a comment in the chat. The question is from Nai-Wen. The question is: "Email is the foundation for many systems. If the major mail service provider like Gmail, Hotmail do not fully support EAI, the other service providers like Facebook and LinkedIn will not support UA. So is there a solution to push the mail service provider to fully support EAI?"

DEJAN DJUKIC: Okay, I think Edmon, will you take that?

EDMON CHUNG: Sure. Thank you, Nai-Wen for the question and comment. I think you make a very good observation, and that's very important. I do note that actually Gmail and Outlook actually have been supporting EAI, the internationalized email addresses in we sort of call it Phase 1. But basically what it means is that currently it does accept email addresses in different languages and domain

names in different languages and also can reply and send out to these addresses.

What is going to really make a difference which I agree with, Nai-Wen, is that if it allows the username part to actually use your own native language. So, yeah, I think these providers, the day that they allow people to use their own native language in the username part, it is going to create the awareness.

So I actually did expect Dusan to be a bit more bitter, and I enjoyed that approach. But I also think right now we have a market failure. What Dusan said is if the market is working, then of course the demand could surface and supply would support the demand. Right now I think the problem is the demand is latent. People don't even know they can do it. But the day that Gmail opens it up and says you can do it, many more people will know.

And I want to highlight a recent survey that the At-Large did which showed a very interesting statistic. When they asked people...they did a survey for general people and they asked them, would you want to use an IDN or email address in your own language? For people who do not know that was possible, only one out of three said, okay, that's useful. One out of three. So a minority. But if you segment it to people who do know that is

---

possible, that statistic transfers into two out of three think it's very useful for them.

So once you know, then you would demand it. So right now that's the problem. Just by market forces alone it's probably not going to be enough.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you. We have other comments. Claudia?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Yes. The first comment is from Jiankang Yao. It is, "I suggest ICANN ccNSO and UASG to do more outreach work with EAI to big mail service providers."

The next comment is from Nitin. It is, "If something is universally believed or accepted, it should be believed or accepted by everyone with no disagreement. Universal acceptance is the concept of removing all technical barriers that might hinder a user from accessing the Internet."

The next comment we have from Anna is, "Thanks to Dusan for remembering our dot and that Microsoft doesn't move in directions to improve this problem. Why macOS and iOS change this dot to the right dot invisible for me when I work using Armenian font?"



---

That was the last question. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC: The last one was a question, so does anyone want to...?

CLAUDIA RUIZ: I'm sorry, I mean that was the last comment. But, yeah, maybe it was a question.

DEJAN DJUKIC: There was a part of it that was a question.

DUSAN STOJICEVIC: This was the comment, and this was the proof that I started this journey a long time ago and deal with the matter. And Armenian dot is still there, not changed.

DEJAN DJUKIC: I thought I saw a couple of participants raise hands. Abdullah, that was the first person I saw. You want to, yes, go ahead?

ABDULLAH CEMIL AKCAM: Thank you very much. This is Abdullah Cemil Akcam from .tr ccTLD for the record. My question is to Anil Kumar, but actually I want all of your [views]. You said that to connect next billion we

---

need UA for that. But I also think that we need local content to increase the Internet users. I mean the content in their own languages on Internet. Do you think that this is beyond the scope of ccTLD remit, or do you think ccTLDs should also promote the local content?

ANIL KUMAR JAIN:

Thank you, Abdullah, for this. No, it is not definitely beyond the ccTLDs because the first step to go for UA readiness is adopting an IDN ccTLD. And then definitely we'll go for EAI readiness. So there are five pillars of UA readiness which are required, and this is very, very important and part of ccTLD. We are working on this.

I just want to inform you that as a ccTLD we have taken up projects. One project is to promote UA readiness in universities because we feel that universities are creating the future citizens of the globe. And if we are able to inculcate this particular habit and requirement in them, then automatically the whole progress will go. So we have already started converting the complete website of the university. We have given email in local languages to all students and faculty, and they've started talking and working with the local language and transmitting. Believe me, this is one of the best universities in India.

Then the second thing which we have done is that we have started this process in villages because we have 650,000 villages

---

in India. So there we have started building up a website in local language where the people are illiterate giving about the background of what villages have done. What is the demographic of those villages. How the village is progressing. What kind of culture they have, what kind of songs, what kind of language they speak. And believe me, the kind of adoption which we are getting from these villages is tremendous.

So this is ccTLD which has done it. I think it is important. The ccNSO can do it. And we have planned that we should be able to do this for all 650,000 villages in next one year. So I have a full belief that next one billion Internet users have to come from UA readiness things, and ccNSO and we ccTLDs have a big role to play. Thank you, Abdullah.

DEJAN DJUKIC:

Okay, before we continue with this productive discussion we have to ask the audience are there any questions for Edmon because he has to leave in a couple of minutes. And I will ask Edmon for some final quick conclusion before he leaves.

EDMON CHUNG:

Thank you. And apologies that I have to leave early. But I wanted to actually add on top of the question. It's a very interesting question, is local content related to promoting IDNs and universal

---

acceptance? My short answer would be yes, however they are two separate things.

That being said, there is actually a very interesting reinforcement of local content and usage of IDNs. Why I say that is because we actually have seen a lot of IDN usage in what is called search engine optimization. Search engine optimization works basically if your domain name is close to what people search, your ranking rises up.

And one thing to really note is that whereas today not a lot of people type in domain names in their local language, most people if not all people search in their local language. People searching in Japan will use Japanese. They wouldn't be using English to search, right? Everyone is searching in their local language, actually will be searching in their local language, and IDNs actually help in that way. So maybe that's an area that ccTLDs can let people know as well, and that creates a linkage.

Also, that being said, and I'm just adding as my closing remark, is that localization is one part of IDN and UA. Ultimately, it is really internationalization that we really need to talk about. It is your registry systems and applications supporting not only local language but all languages. And that's how the Internet infrastructure needs to evolve and needs to be upgraded. The standards are there. The policies are being put in place. Now is

---

the time to actually implement and make sure that it's not just implementing for the local but implementing for the internationalized system and that standard that allows your system to support all TLDs, all IDNs, and all email addresses.

So I think that's something to think about, and that's where I think I slightly disagree with Dusan in the sense that there is something that the global community as ccNSO or at ICANN can have a role to play on top of—not on top of—but alongside the local initiatives. So I think they reinforce each other. They don't have to be mutually exclusive. But the internationalization part is equally as important.

So with that, apologies. I think Dusan wanted to respond. But I will definitely listen to the recording, but I will need to move to another room now. Sorry. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you very much. Okay, so Dusan wants to respond. Go ahead.

DUSAN STOJICEVIC: I will respond to the question and a little bit to Edmon. Let me start first with Edmon. You said all languages on your platform. How many? 250 languages to support on any single platform or ccTLD or imagine a registrar who is transliterating and

---

transforming and everything. It's impossible. So usable languages, okay, yeah. But not all languages. This was the comment for you.

The content. There is the whole wide world outside of ICANN. Meaning there are a lot of content creators, a lot of different agencies who are cultural agencies, cultural things that are creating in your country and in every country creating content. There is no need for ccTLD to spend the money on creating something that should be in your country. So content is there. If a ccTLD wants to spend the money on content, it's okay. But I don't see, especially you said you're from Turkey, very rich with digital content in Turkish language.

DEJAN DJUKIC:

All right, thank you, Dusan. There are a few hands that are raised. There are two hands in the Zoom room. I have one in the room, the lady at the back. And then I saw Ajay has his hand up. Are there any other persons? So let me start with the two who had raised their hands in the Zoom room, and then we will take the people in the room. Patricio Poblete?

PATRICIO POBLETE:

Hello. My name is Patricio Poblete from .cl. There is a school of thought that says in the next round of gTLDs the new big thing will be the IDN TLDs and that they will be the key to get the next billion

---

users on board. That may or may not be true, but as the community prepares for that the more information we can have the better. And I believe there is a treasure of information that is mostly being ignored, and that is what has to do with IDN ccTLDs.

It's well over ten years since the first IDN ccTLDs started being delegated. There are over 60 of them in existence, and I think we know very little about how they have done. How many of them have been successful? A few of them certainly have. How many seems to be almost nonexistent. What lessons have their administrators learned from operating those IDN ccTLDs?

So I believe that the contribution our community could make would be to perform or perhaps commission a study that could be called lessons learned from IDN ccTLDs. And I believe that if we can reach all 60+ operators and see what they have learned during all this time that, as I say, could be a very useful contribution to the whole DNS community.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Okay, thank you. Harsha.

HARSHA WIJAYAWARDHANA: I'm Harsha Wijayawardhana from Sri Lanka and from Sinhala generation panel and the universal acceptance group. A couple of comments. I think in Sri Lanka and in Sinhala I've seen the

---

same keyboards that you have talked about. And a lot of people are now using speech-to-text. [So a lot of, I think, input] tools are going to change, and I think you need to think of the [leveraging] some of these tools.

So in Sri Lanka at the moment actually our keyboard is very cumbersome now. We are trying to make it simpler. But a lot of people are using the speech-to-text. So that's something I think you need to look at and continue to talk about the keyboard issue, input issue.

But then there are a lot of other issues in universal acceptance, and I think I do concur with you that there are some problems with the EAI because we tested and we have some issues. And also, we had the ccTLDs, two ccTLDs in non-Latin for a very long time in Sri Lanka. A lot of people have not used it, so we are now just trying to popularize it.

The other third one actually I want to comment on the content and the search engine. Now a lot of times what happens is that you type it in a Latin script, in English so you may miss the Sinhala content also. There is a growing content in Sinhala as well. Unfortunately, I realize there is a segmentation on that. So I think we need to develop some tools to bridge this [rather than] actually typing in Sinhala. So we have to come up with some sort of bridging kind of tools.



---

Anyway, those are my things. At the end, I think it's a good idea of the universal acceptance that will enable a lot of our people, people who use non-Latin, I mean, basically because we have more people who use Sinhala and Tamil in Sri Lanka. So I think that will really be a very great idea just bringing universal acceptance. But I think we need to develop these tools. These are my comments. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC:

We have a poll that we need to launch so that we can...it's a Mentimeter poll, so it's just to feel the temperature in the room as far as the role of ccNSO with universal acceptance. So, Claudia, can we launch the poll? There are 15 questions. It takes a few seconds to answer each one. And then we can take the other two interventions after we have the polls. Thanks. The link to the poll was sent to the ccNSO mailing list, so you would need to actually work on it there, okay?

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Will you please let us know when you would like us to go to the next question?

---

DEJAN DJUKIC: Well done. So let's go to the next question. All right, next. Next. Next. Next one, please. Next one. Next. Next. Next one. It looks like we skipped one.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Do you want to go back to 10?

DEJAN DJUKIC: Yeah, I think we should go back to 10. We skipped it.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: There's the poll and the results.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Oh, okay. So let's go to 12 then. 13. There are just two more questions. Okay, next one. And the next one, which I think is that last one. Okay, thank you. All right. We are near to the end of this session. We have only a couple of minutes left, so we have to be very quick on these few questions that we have. And I'll right after that ask our panelists for some quick remarks before we end. Okay, so would have one minute and Ajay will talk for 30 seconds.

BOYOUNG KIM: Okay, this is Boyoung Kim from .kr registry. When I type IDN domain name in the URL browser, it automatically change into

---

the Latin script that the website owner registered or change into the xn—automatically. So if it stays as an IDN itself, it will naturally promote the IDN. So I wonder if there some protocol or [ruse] we can keep the IDN on the browser.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: If I can answer very fast. This is under RFC. IDNs are treated on the level of the browser, and they're converting the real name into Punycode. Punycode is known as xn--. So the browsers who are not UA ready, let's say, they are not accepting other scripts but xn--. When you type in your script, they are immediately converting to xn--. This is about the particular browser.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Okay, comment?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Just to add probably this is redirection not conversion between IDN and Punycode. But when a site owner has redirection from IDN domain name to ACSII domain name it will show in your browser. So if there is no redirection, it will stay on.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Okay, Ajay, 30 seconds.

---

AJAY DATA:

Thank you. I think we had a lot of [inaudible] discussion. The universal acceptance steering group is simple. It revolves around email address and domain names, not above, not below. And obviously, the problems that Dusan said, that Edmon said are many. But we as a group are not trying to solve every problem here. We are trying to solve of acceptance of those.

So when Edmon said about other scripts to be supported, it really does not worry about the content. It worries about when I go and [register] a domain name, let us say, .rs and if I have a Hindi [email ID], it should be accepted to enter into [email ID].

That does not mean the interface has to be in Hindi. That is not the expectation of universal acceptance steering group. The expectation is that all email addresses, all domain names wherever they are entered into the software and applications, and especially for ccTLDs, they must be accepted and entered into the system, and not worried about the language of that [by choice]. So for Russia it not to be only [email ID]. It could be any [email ID].

The content point obviously is very different than the UA. The UA doesn't worry about the content at all from the [scope] perspective. But obviously, people would like to have a best practice where the IDN's in Cyrillic and the content is in Cyrillic.

---

That’s a different discussion altogether. But of course, UASG is standing by and help to support this as much as possible.

And the last comment, 16 February is the date. Edmon also said and [inaudible] said, and we would encourage every ccTLD operator in this opportunity to do something around UA on that particular day. And we would request ccNSO to take this mission forward. We are happy to provide content and knowledge, whatever is required to celebrate that day with all of us together. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC: All right, thank you, Ajay. Yes, Alejandra?

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you very much. I just want to thank all of you for this session and to let everyone aware that the outcome of this session is going to be discussed tomorrow in the council meeting to seek next steps for the ccNSO regarding this topic. Thank you very much.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Okay, thank you, everyone. We are a bit overtime, so I will ask our panelists for quick remarks. We will start with Pensri and then Anil and Dusan. We’ll start with Pensri. Pensri, your closing remarks, please.

---

PENSRI ARUNWATANAMONGKOL: Okay, thank you. I think we have [inaudible] meeting today. While there is still much work to be done, we are encouraged and excited by the activity [inaudible] are working on. I wish that ccTLD as important stakeholders of this ecosystem will take a measure to ccNSO in supporting these UA activities. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you, Pensri.

ANIL KUMAR JAIN: First of all, when we are talking about universal acceptance, the acceptance about this concept should come within all the stakeholders. Today's discussion which we have seen, and I'm able to read the chats also, it appears that I think all of us have accepted that this is going to be the next big thing in Internet revolution and Internet technology. So this is a great thing which has happened, and the contribution from ccNSO, GNSO, GAC, everybody is important in this.

The second thing, I just wanted to again elaborate about the UASG role and the development of the contents. I believe that if you are able to create an equal system around UA in the sense that everything is possible using the domain and the EAI, contents

---

will get generated themselves. So content is not a [related] that we need [efforts]. Once the ecosystem is ready, I think contents will come automatically. And then we'll see a new phase in the whole system in the coming days. Thank you.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you. And Dusan?

DUSAN STOJICEVIC: From my side, as I said, the domain names and email addresses are just part of the user experience, overall user experience. And effort put in developing just this part will not bring next billion Internet users. You need to develop the whole system.

Is it part of ccNSO or ICANN role? No. But playing with this that it will bring next billion users and investing money in villages as we heard, etc., is something that doesn't go along. That's from me.

DEJAN DJUKIC: Thank you, everyone. Everyone, since we are five minutes overrun, we have only option to conclude this session. I would like to thank everyone for a productive discussion. It's definitely a very interesting topic for this community, and I hope that we'll have another opportunity to more discuss on this. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**