ICANN75 | AGM – Joint Session: ICANN Board and RSSAC
Monday, September 19, 2022 – 16:30 to 17:30 KUL

KAVEH RANJBAR:     This is the RSSAC session with the board, the meeting normally has two parts, one is dialogue between RSSAC and the board, and the second part is the question that the Board poses to all ACs and SOs. And since this is my last meeting and Wes is taking over my role as RSSAC liaison to the Board, I asked Wes to please sit next to me so in the middle of the meeting, I will hand over the meeting to Wes so we will basically copilot. This is my last meeting and I will eject at the end of the flight.  That's how we plan to run this.

Welcome, we have a nice clean agenda, so we if can have the agenda on the screen.  We have three topics for the first part of the meeting, where we discuss with the Board. I will start with the roll call with the people around the table and of course if there is anyone from RSSAC who was sitting in the audience, I do not see any, please introduce yourself.  And then we will jump into the agenda.  Let's start with Akinori.

AKINORI MAEMURA:     Akinori Maemura, Board member and liaison to the RSS GWG, that's why I prefer to come here. Thanks.

ROBERT CAROLINA: Rob Carolina with ISC.

GÖRAN MARBY: My name is Göran Marby. I'm the ICANN president and CEO and sometimes meddle in root server business.

KAVEH RANJBAR: Yes, and you're in charge of IMRS as well.

JEFF OSBORN: Jeff Osborn, ISC.

LARS-JOHAN LIMAN: Lars-Johan Liman, Netnod, RSSAC member.

HARALD ALVESTRAND: Harald Alvestrand, IETF liaison tgo the ICANN Board.

CHRISTIAN KAUFMANN: Christian Kauffman, future Board member of seat 10.

LEÓN SANCHEZ: León Sanchez, ICANN Board.

JIM GALVIN:              Jim Galvin, SSAC liaison to the ICANN Board.


MAARTEN BOTTERMAN:   Maarten Botterman, ICANN Board chair.


KAVEH RANJBAR:        Kaveh Ranjbar, RSSAC liaison to the Board.


WES HARDAKER:         Wes Hardaker, USC ISI, future liaison to the Board.


DUANE WESSELS:        I am Duane Wessels from Verisign and I'm the root zone maintainer liaison to RSSAC.


KEN RENARD:           Ken Renard, U.S. Army research lab and RSSAC vice chair.


TRIPTI SINHA:         Tripti Sinha, ICANN Board, and also root server operator.


ASHWIN RANGAN:        Ashwin Rangan, ICANN Org, responsible for IMRS globally.

KARL REUSS:             Karl Reuss, University of Maryland, RSSAC.

BRAD VERD:              Brad Verd, Verisign.

TERRY MANDERSON:        Terry Manderson, ICANN Org, IMRS representative to RSSAC.

KAVEH RANJBAR:          Thank you very much. And it might be good to add, Tripti started with RSSAC, joining the RSSAC and then of course, joining the Board. And as we hear this morning, she's also the chairwoman elect for the ICANN Board. Welcome, everyone. If you can go to the first slide. I think it's introduction of Wes.  I think to many of you, Wes doesn't need introduction. I will give the floor to him to add. But just to start, Wes has been involved with root server operations since many years ago.  A lot of standards, a lot of policies we work on have been initiated by Wes or Wes has contributed to those. He also does a lot of research. in parallel to all the operational work he does.  And I am very happy that we have Wes because I've been an intermediary, basically, translating what Wes and many of my colleagues have produced, and bringing them to the board. But now the board will get it

directly from the source which is really good. So Wes, a few words, please.

WES HARDAKER:     Thank you very much, Kaveh. I certainly look forward to the new role. I'm following somebody that made it look easy and I know it was not.  I greatly appreciated as all of RSSAC has with his diligence in his role over the past six years, he's done an absolute fantastic job.  If I could get a round of applause thinking Kaveh for his time as liaison to the board.

[APPLAUSE]

It is not a minor role, I think collectively we would also like to thank Fred Baker today too who is the chair of RSSAC, and this is essentially his last ICANN meeting as chair, it's early in September but in December essentially will be his last month.  He has held more leadership positions in all of Internet governance than I think anybody I know. His dedication to the Internet is unmatched to many extents, so thank you to Fred as well, I don't know if he is online yet.

[APPLAUSE]

**ICANN|75**
**KUALA LUMPUR**

| | |
|---|---|
| KAVEH RANJBAR: | Great thank you to Fred, and Ken. |
| KEN RENARD: | Sure. Thank you, Kaveh. I want to say thank you to Wes for joining the team. If any of you remember the very high honor in the old UNIX world of calling somebody a wizard, that is Wes. I too would like to express on behalf of RSSAC appreciation to Kaveh for what you've done the past two terms on the board and appreciate that. And Wes has big shoes to fill, but he has the full confidence of RSSAC to do so. Thank you. |
| KAVEH RANJBAR: | Thank you, everyone, for the nice words, and yes, it's been a pleasure. Okay, so moving to the next item, it's an update for the board and anyone who is interested about update of basically current work in progress in RSSAC. We will start with Duane giving us an update about RSSAC001v2. Duane. |
| DUANE WESSSELS: | Thanks, Kaveh. RSSAC 001 is a publication that describes best practices and expectations of root server operators. The current version was written many years ago I think in 2015, so RSSAC thinks it's time to look at it and see if it needs to be updated. That includes the specific expectations, maybe changing some, adding some, deleting some, as well as looking at the document as a |

whole in terms of the way it phrases the expectations, it is a little bit inconsistent now. Sometimes stating them as requirements, sometimes as expectations, and so on. This working group has only met once or twice, so just getting started. But we plan on meeting quite often and making progress on this and hope to report back to you at the next meeting.

KAVEH RANJBAR: Thank you very much, Duane, and I think it's good to mention that when this document was born, in parallel there was also an update and basically a new document in IETF, I forgot the RFC number, but as many things RSSAC does, we document and support things we do in multiple venues, and this document is supported by the relevant RFC. Does anyone have the number? 7720 from the author. Thank you very much. And the next one is with Ken. RSSAC 002 version 5. Ken, please.

KEN RENARD: Thanks. The other active work party we have now is for this document update, similar to the 001. RSSAC002 is measurements that root server operators gather and report, essentially daily numbers that we report to the community, really on the health of the root server system itself. So in that document, it specifies that this should be reviewed every few years. It is time and we're looking at that for a few pieces. Is there anything that should be

added to these metrics to publish, anything that needs to be clarified, or one of the other things we're going to tackle is the optionality of metrics. Are things required to be collected, are they optional? What have you. We will visit those and make some clarifications. That group met earlier this week and we will set a cadence to continue to update the document. Thank you.

KAVEH RANJBAR: Thank you very much. Any questions, Maarten or board members from RSSAC on ongoing work?

LARS-JOHAN LIMAN: We might want to add to this that the RFC 7720 and RSSAC001, as you said, are companion documents where the RFC specifies the very deep technical expectations and the RSSAC document specifies the, so to speak, procedure document expectations, and the intent is of course to investigate both of them to talk to the ITF to see if the IETF sees a reason to update the RFC as well, because they need to remain matching, and if there are changes to the RSSAC document that somehow relate to the other document, we need to make sure that these go in parallel. Thank you.

| KAVEH RANJBAR: | Thank you. Exactly as mentioned, it's like wearing a belt and a suspender at the same time, and we are looking to renew both. Good, I see no hands or questions.  I guess that takes us to the second part of the meeting.  And that is where I will hand it over to Wes to take on the meeting. |
|---|---|
| WES HARDAKER: | Thank you Kaveh, and what is better is thank you for pulling this on me very late in the day. I appreciate it. What's next is a collaboration about the legislative activities affecting the root server system and things like that. The RSSAC really thanks the ICANN government engagement team for its effort in providing input to the EC and the EU on NIS2.  In particular, there has been an increase in regional policies about how to affect global services, and that's a difficult policy line to walk, and we've been discussing that heavily in RSSAC.  I don't know if you want to say anything else to that, Ken. |
| KEN RENARD: | This is Ken.  We just met with the GE team, and they are amazing, we appreciate the work they have done.  We want to offer our support and say hey, what can we do to contribute to that effort. Mostly on the technical side. And, we look forward to working with them in the future and set a cadence for regular meetings with them. Thank you. |

**ICANN|75**
**KUALA LUMPUR**

KAVEH RANJBAR:    I wanted to just add a quick comment. I was in a previous session, and I want to thank also Elena and Jamie as one of the members of RSSAC. It is really great work, not only the outcome is great, and then they put a lot of effort, both Elena and Jamie and the whole team, but also, I think it was a great show of collaboration between different organizations, different participants. Two of the organizations running root are Europeans and there is also one American based in Japan.  There has been a lot of collaboration between these organizations and communities and also other organizations, and I think ICANN, the team did a great job in making the collaboration work.  I haven't seen that much collaboration in a long time on the same topic. It was great to observe. And a big success, thank you.

WES HARDAKER:    Definitely.  And I was talking to Ken earlier, and the plan is to continue that engagement over time and have it sort of be on a regular basis as this sort of percolates and the emphasis gets higher and higher over time as well.  Is there anyone else that wants to speak?  Göran, please.

GÖRAN MABRY:    I want to say the same thing basically as Kaveh does, but with a small caveat.  It's a fight we should never have had to have. I am

still surprised that the European commission decided it was a good idea to regulate the root service all the way back to IANA. I think we should treat this as a win, but we should really ask ourselves what we can do to avoid it, make sure that we avoid that fight going forward. And there, we're going to need everybody's help. Not only in this room but also from the rest of the community, but also from the member states we all represent, because it took a lot of effort from many people. It was fun to see. It was one of the first times since the transition that all the communities came back together this way and talked about something so essential. But we have to continue to talk about how can avoid a fight in the future by talking to governments, talking to parliamentarians and talking to legislators, because in the end, it was the help of the actual Parliament and the European Parliament and Council, they decided this was not a good idea. So it was a good cooperation with them.

WES HARDAKER: I think the importance of that second sub bullet comes out, and just what you said, Göran, in that the root service system needs to be independent of governments at large, and stand on its own so it acts for one world and one Internet. In order to do that, we need to maintain that principle of independence which is well discussed in multiple RSSAC documents starting in 37 and

creeping forward in a number of other ones as well. Is there anybody else with comments on the topic?

KAVEH RANJBAR: I just want to mention in the last session, also this came up, what Göran said, that basically, if we have to do this much engagement with friends, with bodies that we know support the multi-stakeholder model, that is a bit alarming., because we know there are other regulators and bodies that don't support the model fundamentally. And if among friends we have that much effort, how much effort will it take to deal with actors who do not support the model fundamentally? So there's a lot of work ahead of us.

GÖRAN MABRY: Because I can't stop talking, I want to emphasize that one of the things you are doing is very beneficial for us this, and that's of course the work you are doing with your governance model. Because that discussion shows that the community, your community, your stakeholders take a serious question to improve, not because it's bad, but because it does not work. As I said this morning, you would never hear that Internet does not work and that is very much thanks to you guys. So the fact that we can—your communities are having these conversations, look at the things that need to be improved, working together, is really

**ICANN|75**
**KUALA LUMPUR**

strong. I use that in my relationship. We know there are things we have to improve, not because something is burning but there always needs to be improvement, and this is one of the models of that. So again, I want to congratulate you because that's your initiative and there are a couple of you who I think wrote some part of it on this table. That is important, the outcome is important. I'm trying to be very nice because I actually think this is important.

WES HARDAKER:          Liman.

LARS-JOHAN LIMAN:    One of the challenges with even interacting with government system is the constant turnover of staff. So it is a constant challenge to keep educating and keep informing governments. And as you say, governments all over the world. It's a daunting task, but we try to chip in wherever we can and to help. But as I mentioned in the meeting with the government support team, we also need help to understand where and when we can contribute, because there is no chance that the RSSAC can see what's going on in all the world at the same time. If essentially anyone sees a need for education and information, please bring that to the RSSAC so we have a chance of knowing about it, at least. Thank you.

**ICANN|75**
**KUALA LUMPUR**

WES HARDAKER:            Thank you, Liman. I will interject, one follow-on, and then Göran.

GÖRAN MABRY:            Thank you.

WES HARDAKER:            Go ahead.

GÖRAN MARBY:            Which is fun, because I got to know him when I was working for the Swedish government and he was lobbying me. But apart from that, I said this earlier this morning, you have, as individuals, as representatives of root servers, a golden opportunity. In this house right now, you have people that work for you as government civil servants, they are in the GAC, they represent their governments, and one of the things, knowing how it works, they're not there as individuals, they're actually there as a representative of the government. If you go and talk to them [inaudible], they will probably with a high probability take that and send it back in their report from this meeting because one of the things they all do is to write—I won't say all, but the majority of the majority do, after this meeting, is they send a report back to their bosses about what happened in the meeting. They do not

ICANN|75
KUALA LUMPUR

validate that, civil servant does not take that opinion-based. If you go and talk to your GAC rep here—I think you know him, by the way.

LARS-JOHAN LIMAN:    I do but he is not here.

GÖRAN MABRY:    Ola Bergström. He's the vice chair. He used to work for me when you were lobbying me. I'm pointing out that we are sometimes not using the fantastic opportunity you have. You have your government representatives in this room. I know it can be hard for some of you. But for the other ones, they are all here, and you all live in a country. And if you want to help to formulate those messages, we would be happy to help.

WES HARDAKER:    Thank you. One other comment for those that want to see the history of the root server system and how it was developed and how it's become independent and the importance of it—and this is probably a document we can point to a lot of people, especially with high staff turnover rates, is RSSAC 23 version 2, and it really describes the history of the root server system since its beginning. It's actually a pretty fascinating document. And I'm not a history

buff. Is there anybody else with comments on this subject? Maarten.

MAARTEN BOTTERMAN: Just to express my enormous appreciation for the effort. I remember I wasn't even on the ICANN Board when I stepped in the room where Tripti and Brad were talking about RSSAC 37, and it's like, wow, this is happening. Because before that, it was really like independence was the first value. And with that, you managed to really together come to where we are today. And I think that is amazing and needed. And my deep appreciation for that.

WES HARDAKER: Thank you. Any other comments on the subject?

KAVEH RANJBAR: I think I can say we've come a long very way. RSSAC 37 is a lot of work. Since I'm leaving the board, maybe I can say that. RSSAC did really great work with 37 and then 58, which was actually a very quick turnaround for such a document with so much content. So I'm proud that RSSAC was able to deliver, and of course, you know we are an independent body so we have different opinions, different governance structures and all of that, and still we have been able to make that happen and it took a lot

of effort for RSSAC, but I think these are fundamental documents and it will help us in the future to make sure the system is basically a closed loop. I think the whole model that we have had had this big hole in it. That's the only place at least I was able to identify that we really did not have an answer for some questions. And with the work of GWG and the outcome of that, hopefully that will close that gap and we will have an answer for basically everything that's thrown at us.

WES HARDAKER:    With that I see no other hands, so we can go to the next slide. Which is really the board topic of what collaboration action should the community, board, and the org be undertaking to further progress achieving our strategic priorities. I think, Ken, you were going to speak to that, right?

KEN RENARD:    So, this goes along the lines of the government engagement as well, educating the Internet about the fact that the Internet doesn't have geopolitical or geographical boundaries and can continue to allow us to engage with the GE team and help battle things like these regulations that may end up causing more harm than good.  So I will open that to anyone else who wants to comment on the topic.

MAARTEN BOTTERMAN: [inaudible] basically, as you said, in line with work [inaudible] and I think the reconfirmation that it is really the awareness that together, we need to find the best way forward is at the very core, and any suggestion that comes up would be very much welcomed by the Board and the organization. So Göran's call about, hey, there's more links than you may think of, is the right one, and it is about doing Internet together. So thank you very much.

WES HARDAKER: I would like to complement ICANN and RSSAC, and ISOC, I think, who all spotted some of these issues before they got solidified into law, and we had the opportunity to give feedback when they were being drafted. Otherwise it might have been quite a bit different. Anybody else with comments? Tripti.

TRIPTI SINHA: I would like to make some final comments before we close out. When I first came into ICANN, RSSAC was sort of a loosey-goosey organization. And today it is a substantially different organization making significant contributions, and recognition of what the root server system is all about and why it's important. And I think in the [inaudible] mysterious kind of organization that was floating around that did something. And I think the relationship with ICANN has improved tremendously. It is a close

knit group, so don't lose that closeness that exists today, work together, continue to push the governance model, let's get that in place, with accountability and transparency mechanisms. Just hats off to everyone for working so well, thank you.

KAVEH RANJBAR: I just want to add, exactly what Tripti said. And I want to mention that none of that would have happened without the support that we got from our staff, fantastic what we got from Steve, Andrew, Ozan, and Danielle, and Carlos who is now supporting still the RSS but from different front in GWG, and also for my job from the Board, and there's so many—[Lisa, Aaron, Franco,] and I will forget names, Wendy, we have—and fantastic support, thank you to all of you. Normally, you are not seen, you're not sitting on this side of the table. But I can say for myself, my job is not possible even slightly without your fantastic support. Thank you very much.

[APPLAUSE]

WES HARDAKER: Are there any other comments on this or any other subject? This is our last slight, I believe, correct? Last call for comments, otherwise this would be a shorter than average meeting but we did not have a huge amount of discussion topics. And again, I will

think Fred and Kaveh for their time in service. Ken is right, I have big shoes to follow. Thank you everybody.

**[END OF TRANCRIPTION]**

**ICANN|75**
**KUALA LUMPUR**