
ICANN78 | AGM – ccNSO Registrant Capacity Building
Wednesday, October 25, 2023 – 4:00 to 5:30 HAM

CLAUDIA RUIZ: Hello, and welcome to the Registrant Capacity Session. My name is Claudia Ruiz, and I am joined with my colleagues, Bart Boswinkel, Andrea Glandon, and Joke Braeken. And we are the remote participation managers for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Good afternoon to all of you in the room, and hello to all remote participants. Welcome to this registrant capacity building session. My name is Guðrun, and I'm delighted to be the chair of the session.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: The session will include English, French, Spanish, and Arabic. Click on the interpretation icon for this session. If you wish to speak, please raise your hand in the Zoom room. Once the session facilitator calls upon your name, kindly unmute your microphone and take the floor. Before speaking, ensure you have selected the language you will speak from the interpretation menu. Please state your name for the record and the language you will speak if speaking a language other than English. When speaking, be sure to mute all other devices and notifications.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

Please speak clearly and at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation. This session includes automated real-time transcription. Please note this transcript is not official or authoritative. To view the real-time transcription, click on the close caption button in the Zoom toolbar. To ensure transparency of participation in ICANN's multi-stakeholder model, we ask that you sign in to Zoom room sessions with your full name. For example, a first name and last name or surname. You may be removed from the session if you do not sign in using your full name. Thank you. And with that, I will hand the floor over to Guðrun Poulsen. Thank you.

GUÐRUN POULSEN:

Thank you. Good afternoon to all of you in the room and hello to all remote participants. Welcome to this registrant capacity building session. My name is Guðrun and I'm delighted to be the chair of this session. I'm the managing director for the ccTLD of the Faroe Islands .fo, and I'm also the vice chair to the ccNSO Meetings Programme Committee. Today's session will be about how the team behind ICANN's registrant program and ccTLDs can explore if and how further collaboration can benefit both ccTLDs and the registrant program. The team behind ICANN's registrant program have developed a number of informational series that aim to help educate registrants about their rights and responsibilities. And furthermore, the program aims to help the end users about the domain name ecosystem, how to navigate it and the ICANN pulses that may impact them.

The ccTLDs participating in this session shall be seen as reviewers. They will reflect on the suggestions by ICANN and provide their feedback

based on experience. They will highlight what they believe is relevant and mention what they believe is missing in the material. But now comes the more exciting part. All of you who are participating in the session will also be participating as reviewers of this session. You are welcome to share your views of what your ccTLD is doing in terms of registrant capacity building. But before we go to the many meter question, please let me introduce the people participating in the panel of this session. I'm going to start with Margarita Valdes. Margarita is the legal and business director of NIC Chile and the people that have been around in the community for some time now know Margarita and her lovely personality.

Margarita is going to speak in Spanish today, so those of you who don't have a headset, please grab one. You can find them at the door. At the opening ceremony of this ICANN meeting, Margarita was recognized for her hard work...

BART BOSWINKEL: Could you speak more slowly, please.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: I will. Sorry. At the opening ceremony of this ICANN meeting, Margarita was recognized for her hard work in the internet community and was awarded the Dr. Tarek Kamel award for capacity building. Let's give her a big applause. Our next panelist is Kristian Ørmen from Denmark. Today he works for Internetstiftelsen, the Swedish Internet Foundation, where they manage .sc and .nu. Kristian is the vice president for their registry services. Before joining the registry, Kristian has been working

at the registrar side for more than 20 years and comes with a lot of experience in the internet community. Thanks for joining us in the session.

Our third panelist is Grace Ingabire, who is joining us remotely. She's the CEO of RICTA and the ccTLD team manager for Rwanda .rw. She has also been working in the internet community for many years and comes with a lot of experience in the field. Welcome, Grace, and thanks for joining us in the session.

And our last panelist is Brian Gutterman from ICANN. Brian is the senior program manager and manages the engagement program and is responsible for Globeholder stakeholder engagement program as well. Today, Brian will start by giving us a presentation of ICANN's work in terms of stakeholder and end user engagement. He will give us an insight of what material ICANN has to offer on their website. Welcome, Brian, and thanks for joining. But before I'm handing the floor over to Brian, let's have the first Mentimeter questions up.

BART BOSWINKEL:

If you want to join the Mentimeter, please type in menti.com and then the code or use the QR code you see on the screen. Thank you.

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

I'll just read the questions. My ccTLD develops educational materials for its domain name registrants, and I'll give you one minute or a little less to answer. Should we go to the second question? My ccTLD shares

educational materials with. Thank you very much. And now the floor is yours, Brian.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN:

Thank you. And thank you to my fellow panelists, to Grace participating online for the prep work leading up to this session, and I'm happy to be here with you all. I promise we won't carry into the reception later on, and I know it's been a long week for everybody, so thanks for hanging in there with us this afternoon. I'm here today just with an offer to collaborate and to tell you a little bit about the registrant program and the sort of services that ICANN org provides to registrants in general. But more so I'm here to listen. I know each of you, each ccTLD has different business models, different ways, and I think we saw with the polling different ways of interacting with registrants, with your customers.

I really would like to hear feedback, and that's part of what I enjoy doing the most at ICANN meetings is listening and providing a channel for feedback for the community, for you all, for others in the community to raise issues of importance when it comes to registrants. So I hope that's what we can do today.

Next slide, please. And next slide. So throughout all of ICANN's work, we strive to serve the global public interest registrants themselves and end users, of course, of the internet by ensuring a secure and stable domain name system while promoting trust, choice and competition in the industry. ICANN org has always recognized registrants as being essential to a robust DNS and marketplace. But more can always be done to improve the experience that registrants have when interacting

with the organization and for that matter others in the ecosystem in different ways.

Next slide, please. So the org services and attention to domain name holders to registrants go far beyond the registrant program. We have our goals that you can see here. But there's other parts of the organization which I would always want to recognize that have more direct touch points with registrants, and they can be gTLD registrants, they can be ccTLD registrants. So we have a global support team and we have a contractual compliant team that receive complaints. So these are the sort of front lines of when registrants interact with the organization on a day-to-day basis. So we get complaints into our contractual compliance team that we handle and the global support team receives calls and messages from many registrants, again, both gTLD registrants, ccTLD registrants, about issues they are having.

And a lot of the work that we do is trying to educate them and help redirect them to whoever it is that they should really be contacting, whether it's their registrar, their web host, the ccTLD organization. Because there really are limited things, aside from educating registrants, that the org can do directly to help registrants that are having problems. But we do serve, I think, an important role in helping them and aiding them in finding who they should talk to. And I will present a little bit of data later on. But overall, the goals, as you can see, education about registrant rights and responsibilities, education about the domain name ecosystem and how to navigate it, and information about ICANN policies that may impact registrants in different ways.

We also work to identify and raise awareness about issues and challenges that registrants face. We do this by publishing data. We do this through engagement, like what we are doing today. And we do this by listening and gathering feedback about issues and challenges impacting registrants. And then try and educate registrants based on that feedback to help. Because more informed and active registrants, whoever they are, wherever their domain name is, contributes to a healthier DNS and a healthier ecosystem. And happier customers are good for all of us. We also work to ensure that registrant perspectives are reflected in our work, services, and reviews.

Next slide, please. Here's just a snapshot. So I've interacted, the program has interacted with ccTLDs in the past. Here are some events just over the past year that we participated in. The Africa DNS Forum last year, we did a training series in the Middle East region on registrant rights and responsibilities. We participated on a panel at the Middle East DNS Forum in May, and at the APAC DNS Forum pre-event webinar. So we have been doing regional engagement at sessions such as this, based on invitations from the community, all in an effort to educate and to raise awareness about issues and challenges. And again, to listen to the community and to registrants themselves.

Next slide, please. And next slide. So what kind of content do we have? You can check out sort of our main homepage and there's a lot of subpages covering different topics on [ICANN.org/registrants](https://icann.org/registrants). We have a variety of types of content, blogs, articles, FAQs, infographics, and then we also have training series available, presentations and webinars aimed at capacity development based on the needs and sort of the demand of the different audiences within the community.

Next slide, please. Some of the topics that we cover and I'll say now, I think the beginning of the program, there was a focus on gTLD registrants. For some of the reasons you might think the contracts that ICANN has with contracted parties with gTLD registrants, there is more of a direct link there. However, as the program has evolved, it's become clear that a lot of the educational materials that we have are certainly relevant and can be useful for ccTLD registrants. So this is information about domain names, information about the ecosystem, registering domain names, managing, transfers, renewals, securely managing domain names, and best practices.

Next slide. And next slide. And so now I just have a bit of data to share here and some observations that we've sort of compiled over time from both our global support team about who are the registrants that are coming to us. It's usually registrants that consider, for example, their website to be mission critical, revenue impacting. They usually have a heightened sense of urgency and oftentimes they aren't aware at all about ICANN. They don't need to be. If they sometimes lack the sort of basic domain age management tools and resources, sometimes they don't have a technical background. This is not to say that there aren't lots of registrants who have very strong technical backgrounds. Those aren't the kind of folks that we usually hear from. It's usually sort of maybe a small business, somebody with one or two domains. And those are the sort of registrants that our work focuses on.

Next slide. So a bit of data here, and this is something that I had not yet shared with the panel, but I would ask if it would be useful, we have a bit more than what we are sharing on the slides today and we would be happy to share with the entire ccNSO. If the ccNSO thinks it would be

useful, some additional data to what I'm sharing today here on the slides from both our global support team and our contractual compliance team at ICANN.

So this shows just in this year so far, since January 1, 2023, almost 1,700 cases identified from registrants who identified themselves as ccTLD, registrants came into global support, an increase from the prior year. But this also is something we've noticed. We've had generally more cases to our global support team. I think that's because folks in the community registrants are more aware of the global supports function and service. So they are just getting a higher volume and they are there, of course, to help in whatever way they can via education or oftentimes helping registrants identify who their registrar is and how they can contact them to get the help they need.

Next slide. Here's some data from compliance and again, I have more data to share in a report and I can share that via email along with my staff colleagues after the session. And when cases come into compliance, it's usually the case that these are out of scope, for the most part, right, because of the lack of contractual relationship that ccTLDs have with ICANN. These numbers, I would also like to say that they don't include compliance cases and complaints that include maybe five gTLD names and one ccTLD name. That is the case sometimes so that the data here does not include those.

Next slide. Here's a snapshot of some of the types of inquiries that compliance sees and this gives, again, an overview of some of the types of issues that we are seeing from registrants that are contacting us. Again, we are often, what we try to do is redirect these registrants to

whoever it is that they should be talking to, their registrar, again, for the most part, but also back to the ccTLDs depending on the business models, et cetera. So transfers, renewals, domain suspensions, registration data, inaccuracy. And these trend along with the data that compliance shares about gTLD registrants too. These are similar issues.

Next slide. And so in terms of next steps, you can go to the next slide please. I'm here to listen. I want to hear your thoughts about topics that might be of interest to your customers, the way you interact with registrants. The work of the program continues, educational content based on feedback we get, community engagement and collaboration like this. But again, this is an offer to collaborate and hopefully we can improve the experience for your customers together. So thank you and I look forward to your comments and to hearing from the rest of the panel.

GUÐRUN POULSEN:

Thank you very much, Brian. Are there any questions in the audience to Brian? Please state your name.

ABDALMONEM GALILA:

This is Abdalmonem Galila for the record. Actually, from the experience of for being a registry for the 3R model, actually the transfer and the old code and the renewal fees. These are the points that we have problems from those areas all the time, from all registrants. I hope to have some material in different languages published for ICANN in order to follow. Thank you.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Thanks very much for sharing that and that is our common issues that we hear about and thank you for flagging that and maybe those are topics that we can think about education wise or what information can be made more available about those topics.

CLAUDIA RUIZ: We have a hand in the Zoom room too. Andy, you may ask your question.

ANDY: Andy. This is Andy from .ID for the record. I just have a suggestion about another content for the record, for the registrant is about the dispute resolution. It is also important for them to know how they can handle the dispute resolution. Thank you.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Thank you for raising that point. We do have some information about specifically things that registrants should know about the UDRP and that's something we addressed in the panel. We did the Middle East DNS Forum previously, but we also know that not all CCs participate or use the UDRP. So that could be something we work on with you individually or in the region to think about more materials and things that your customers should know about dispute resolution. So thank you for that.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Yes, please. Are there more questions in the audience? Please.

IRINA DANELIA: Hello, Irina Danelia for the record. Maybe I have missed, but when ICANN Compliance receives a case with regard to the ccTLD, what can you do? What would be your typical reaction?

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: The responses from compliance would be that the complaint is out of scope and then they get into more education and they try and redirect that complainant to address their issue with their registrar, with the ccTLD themselves. So it's a matter of educating them and explaining why it's out of scope and pointing them in the correct direction to hopefully resolve their problem. And it's a good question.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: First, the person in the back.

MARTIN LEHMANN: Hello, this is Martin Lehmann from Varimedia. We are a registrar in Germany. And one troublesome issue is always different transfer procedures between ccTLDs -- gTLDs are kind of standard with EPP and AuthInfo code. But on the ccTLD level, there are so many different ways and confirmation sometimes by email, sometimes the AuthInfo allows an immediate transfer, sometimes there's a pending process, sometimes it will be auto acknowledged after five days, sometimes it will be auto rejected after five days.

Is there any approach maybe of collecting these in a table available to all registrars or registrants on the ICANN level? Because it's pretty hard to keep track of all the changes because particularly ccTLDs change a lot and you may not be aware and all the procedures also what's required on maybe local presence in terms of creation of domain names will change over time. It will be hidden in some registry guidelines, in some FAQ sections. So it's really hard to find everything in one place. Would you maybe consider getting with all the ccTLDs to collect this data and keep it up to date in one central place?

BRIAN GUTTERMAN:

This is a good suggestion and exactly what we're trying to solicit. And we understand the complexities of if you're a registrar in Germany, the types of customers that you have vary between ccTLD customers and gTLD customers and keeping these things straight is, again, something that we try to complement maybe the information that you have available at your registrar. It depends on the size and scope of your business and your model. But yes, I hope that's something we can work on to make information that is available, one, a little bit easier to find, two, a little bit easier to understand. So thank you for the recommendation. And, of course, that's something we can think about. Thanks.

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Excuse me, just another reminder, especially for our participants out here, please make sure you state your name and speak slowly. Thank you.

GUDRUN POULSEN: I will allow two more questions first from the person here and then Svitlana.

ABDALMONEM GALILA: This is Abdalmonem Galila again. Actually, I'm thinking about that in case of the ccTLD retired. I saw many documents related to ccTLD retirement, but actually when I am the registrant, what shall I do? As I think nowadays, I saw many examples that there are retiring out of service, whatever, something like that. So a registrant should be aware enough about his rights. What shall he do with regards to the retirement of his engaged ccTLD? Thank you.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Thank you for that. I'm taking note of the different issues that I'm hearing about and thinking about ways we can follow up, but that's a very good point on ccTLD retirement and perhaps something we can help with in terms of providing information.

SVITLANA TKACHENKO: Thank you, Svitlana Tkachenko, ccTLD .UA. I have a question about language. Do you provide this information only in English and is there ICANN support. Is it possible to translate this to other languages for some licenses, especially for video material or not text materials?

-
- BRIAN GUTTERMAN:** Very good point and we do provide a lot of the information translated into UN languages on ICANN.org, not all of it. That's something we try and do is keep information up to date. Some of the information comes from other parts of the organization and we always are trying to keep information up to date. I will note and highlight our global support team does speak a number of languages and does its best when interacting directly with registrants to speak in the native language of that complainant or that registrant that is having issues. But yes, we do provide translations to most of the content, but too, we can do more and we understand what you mean by that.
- GUÐRUN POULSEN:** Thank you very much, Brian. We will continue and please keep interacting like this, it's much better. I'll give the floor to Margarita now. She will give us some perspective from the ccTLD.
- MARGARITA VALDES:** Sorry. Hello, everybody. My name is Margarita Valdes. I'm from .cl registry and I will speak in Spanish. [Spanish 00:33:17 - 00:33:55]. Next please. [Spanish 00:34:00 - 00:35:23]
- CLAUDIA RUIZ:** Margarita, can you please slow down too? Thank you.
- MARGARITA VALDES:** [Spanish 00:35:41 - 00:42:18].

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Thank you very much Margarita, very interesting. Are there any questions for Margarita in the audience or remotely? Please.

PABLO RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Guðrun and thank you to all the panelists. Margarita, my name is Pablo Rodriguez and I'm from the registry that we are in Puerto Rico. By the way, having mentioned it, the next ICANN meeting ICANN79 is going to be in Puerto Rico. Hey, my question is for Margarita. More than a question is a comment. I really appreciate the information that you have shared with us because I do agree with you that the majority of the information is based on gTLDs rather than ccTLDs and as Margarita already has mentioned correctly, the one thing that we have in common is that we are operators of two-character TLD but besides that we are very different so we do need that help and it is important to prepare materials that can find those common grounds that we all can share in use. Thank you.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Thank you very much. Do you have a comment or anything to Pablo?

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: No, I appreciate the presentation too and I think I agree and we're listening so this is great feedback so thank you.

BART BOSWINKEL: Guðrun. There's a question online. Can I read it?

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Please do Bart.

BART BOSWINKEL: This is a question from Nthabiseng Pule. I hope I pronounce your name correctly and the question is, can the ccNSO develop a set of recommended best practices for ccTLDs? For example, I have noted some concerning privacy practices of some ccTLD registry operators in my region and thought maybe recommended best practices could be made available to them for reference. Thank you.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Thanks for the question. Do you have a comment on the question Brian?

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: No, not a comment. Again, thanks for the recommendation and again, that would be sort of a ccNSO question as to what sort of work they want to pursue and sort of the offer from me is to help in any way I can. What kind of best practices would be developed specifically in terms of the recommendation but thank you to the colleague that asked the question and I think it's a good thing for the whole group to discuss.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Thank you very much. We will continue and I will give the floor over to Kristian.

KRISTIAN ØRMEN:

Thank you. Can I have my slides please? Thank you. Next slide please. So my name is Kristian Ørmen. I work at the.sc .nu registry and I used to be a registrar so quite familiar with a lot of registrars and contact also and working with different TLDs. As I was asked to review the registrar program, I decided to take a look at the registrant program website from ICANN to see and try to pretend I was a confused registrant trying to find information. I think also from the previous speaker, it was clear.

Next slide please. Clear and I agree that there's not much information about ccTLDs which makes sense since ICANN doesn't make the registration policies for ccTLDs but I thought let's look at what could we give of suggestions to the registrant program website that could at least improve it if a ccTLD registrant comes into the website to seek information. I think the most important is information about the fact that ccTLDs policies can be different and on the website for the different policies described be very informative that this is for gTLDs and doesn't necessarily work for ccTLDs as well.

Another suggestion that on the website there is a link where you can look up your domain name and currently that would fail if you put in a ccTLD so I would definitely suggest that you use the URL from the IANA database and in that way redirect the registrant to the ccTLD registry in Kristian which I understand you also do in your support channel. Another thing is that the website can be quite confusing with the different links. If you're already there because you are a bit confused and you come into the registrant program website you see a lot of links and other information to all the different groups in ICANN, the different policies. If you click on some of the links for example to transfer you get redirected to the registrar part of ICANN.org.

I would suggest that you make a standalone landing page for registrant that everyone can this address you could give to a registrant and they would find more information about how domain names works in general without being confused about the multi-stakeholder model and other works being done within ICANN. I have a couple of slides just to make some examples of what I've been saying so if we take a next slide please.

So this is the website we get into today if we go to [ICANN.org/registrants](https://icann.org/registrants) and we see the menu in the left half the registrant section but it also have a lot of other information that could be confusing for a person that is already a bit confused and seeking information. I think in this like very first page it would be good to directly already here explain that there are two different types of TLDs and they are managed differently.

Next slide please. So I'm not the biggest graphic person but I did remove the rest of the menu there in the left I think you skipped the slide but that's okay. Then slide we add now is the data lookup tool where it shows TLD not supported if you put in a ccTLD and if we go to the next slide I made a short suggestion of how that could look instead and I think that would be a easy improvement for the site. I was also asked a bit like so what do you do as a ccTLD to inform registrants and registrars and I of course looked into that ourselves we do have most information in Swedish but we also do have some in English.

So if we go to the next slide I can just share a tiny bit of that and that is a bit like same as the ICANN register and program with how do you register a domain name we have the terms and conditions and then we

have a section about abuse and who takes responsibility for content online.

Next slide please. We have a section for dispute resolutions and as you also can see here it's even different for the two ccTLDs that we're running so that also again complicates it for the registrant that the policies are different.

Next slide please. We also have a section for registrars informing how to become a registrar we have different tech articles we have self-study material and then we have information about the registrar association which is in the Swedish TLD kind of the same as ICANN's registrar stakeholder group but we have a like small local stakeholder group but this is of course information mainly for .fc and .nu. I think a lot of the articles both that we have and you have can be shared among each other and I would definitely propose that you look at some of the ccTLD materials already there and try to see how much you can include. Next slide please. I think that was the last one. Thank you.

GUDRUN POULSEN:

Thank you very much Kristian. Thanks for your very interesting suggestions. I'm sure that Brian has written them down and has a comment.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN:

Absolutely no thank you for sharing that perspective and suggestions and we do have it in our current plans to listen to your group here to improve the accessibility the type of content there already these good

ideas from you both about creating or repurposing what we have to give ccTLD registrants a space to find the information that they need not only with the lookup tool the IANA lookup tool using some of the resources that ccTLD is like you already have available and using some of the content that we do have that does apply to ccTLD registrants and making it a little more visible and easier to find so I think we already have some sort of good next step so thank you.

GUDRUN POULSEN:

Michele has his hand up.

MICHELE NEYLON:

Thanks. Michele Neylon sitting down the back here. First off I think this is an interesting discussion and I think it's good that you're having it. I do take issue with the way both Margarita and my learned friend are presenting some of this. The average small business user doesn't care. They have an issue with their website their email or something like that they're not going to care whether it's a ccTLD or a gTLD and expecting them to know the difference between the two is just not helpful at all.

The WHOIS lookup thing technically to get it to redirect more gracefully as Kristian's suggesting is not hard and I would hope that I can confine developers that were capable of doing that because technically it's not complicated. A command line who is to a client handles it quite gracefully so why a web-based one that you spent thousands on doesn't is a bit of a mystery to me.

But in terms of the language and everything around that for the average hunter the average small business the average client. You need to keep it as simple and as plain as possible in whichever language you use be that Spanish, Italian, German whatever. Now for the more advanced users sure you want to direct a trademark attorney to the correct policies you want to direct a cyber security professional to the correct registry operator or registrar but if the end goal is helping the average small business who are the rather confused registrants of domain names that still that do not know the difference between a browser and a search engine then please do not get so hung up on ccTLDs and gTLDs because the average punter does not care. And please don't fight over who gets to respond to me.

KRISTIAN ØRMEN:

Thank you for the comment, Michele. This is Kristian speaking I really agree with you in I think almost all that you said and the problem with the register and program information as it is today is that a lot of the information just why this is for domain name holders this is how it works for domains. So if you are this small business confused registrant that for example wants to transfer to another registrar and kind find out how to do it, they go into this page and read about the transfer process and then they think it works like this for the .sc domain or .rw domain and this is not the case. So because of this, it's important on this registrant information that we do have some clarification about the policies and which type of TLDs that they're reading information. So they don't waste time on reading the wrong information for the domain they have an issue with.

MICHELE NEYLON: The facetious answer would be, God, you ccTLDs why can't you just be normal but obviously that won't work. Margarita. [Spanish 00:57:38 - 00:57:44]. But I think the maybe the maybe the way to address this is to start using a little bit of the technology so when somebody lands on this page you ask them are you trying to fix a problem with a domain if so enter your domain and then if you're able to parse that you can then say this page is for you or this page is not for you. That technically is possible. So maybe that's the way to look at it it's just from my perspective I completely agree with you Kristian but I'm just thinking about the very confused small business who as I say can't tell the difference between a browser and a search engine. Thanks.

MARGARITA VALDES: [Spanish 00:58:36 - 00:59:58].

MICHELE NEYLON: [Spanish 00:59:58 - 01:00:00].

MARGARITA VALDES: Siempre.

GUDRUN POULSEN: Thank you very much did you have a question. Let's continue and now I'll give the floor to Grace.

GRACE INGABIRE:

Thank you so much for giving me this opportunity to join this session and give my observation around the registrant program. So next slide please. So my colleagues who have just presented, I think they spoke about majority of the things that I did on my side. I'm coming from the side of, when I saw this program, I went to the website straight forward just to look at what is going on there.

So the first thing that I realized, I think my colleague just spoke about it, I tried to do a search of my domain name, rictor.org.ru. Can I find myself if I land into this ICANN website? So unfortunately, you can see the results that I got. And then I went far. I'm like, probably let me try another domain. And they had to check for a gTLD, which gave me all the answers.

So just to summarize on this, then I had to understand that this program is probably or the website is meant for gTLDs. When thinking about it, I'm like, probably this is a question that I can ask in the meantime. When I came up with this program, what was the motive behind this? Because we could not see ourselves as ccTLD represented or recognized here. I will ask this question, was it intentional so that because we don't see ccTLDs here or is there any plan for ccTLDs as well?

So my second comment or my second observation, apart from the website being meant for gTLDs. I'll recommend that we create a separate page for ccTLDs. And coming back to the comment that my colleague just said, when an end user can't land to this website, majority of these people, they don't know what or how they have no

information. And majority of these people, they don't even know what the domain is.

I think I'll talk about it, about the different initiative that we are trying at the registry site just to educate people around what a domain is, what a website is. So these end users, when they land on their website, probably they have something that they are looking at. They don't know if they own a domain. For them, probably they are looking for an email address or they are looking for a contact of such any company worldwide. So to me, coming back to that and while suggesting to have content that can be really beneficial to the end users, I understand what has been developed is there and it's really innovative. It has relevant data, but we need to put ourselves in the shoes of the person who is reading those content materials. Do they have really the levels to understand what is there?

Since they don't know if they own a domain, for them they are just online. Or probably they are willing to go online, thinking of people who are on social media platform. They have been using probably Instagram and others. They want to venture and have their own online presence. Will they really get what a domain is? So to me, probably a recommendation that you can think of is to come up with a page that will be more information and that will include everyone. So that everyone who lands on the page, they really understand what to do and where to go and to find more relevant information.

The other comment I had was mainly on the ICANN website. To me, even though I'm in the industry, but sometimes I get, if I can say confused, because it's full of information, relevant information, but too

much on the website. So if there is a way, probably just to create a dedicated page, either that can land to the ccNSO website or elsewhere, otherwise someone gets lost within a lot of information that is available there.

And then what I realized later is that registrants are referred to only ICANN accredited registrars. So as a ccTLD, so this came to me as a question, why only accredited registrars? Why can't we create as well a section for other registrars who are registrars of the ccTLDs but who are not ICAN registrars? So this is a thing that you, ICANN, can consider as well and to give visibility for other registrars who are not yet at that level of being accredited registrars.

And then as a ccTLDs, we use three R model. Registry, registrar, registrants. So, and to me, when I was looking at this program and since majority of our engagement is through registrars, my question was, do we have any plan, the same way you came up with a plan for the registrants program? Is there any program for registrars in the pipeline?

So the rest, I think you can just go on the next slide. The rest, I think, have been raised by my friends. I will not delay on that. Just move to the next slide, please. So I'll be now focusing on what we are doing currently on the level of the ccTLD. I'll talk about two programs. One, which is the brand protection. This is a current initiative that has been going on that aims at educating registrars about the importance of protecting their brand.

So the focus group for this campaign or awareness are people who are using generic domain names. I believe in so many countries, probably, let me start in Africa, whereby you will have a lot of organizations still

using gTLD. They're using gTLDs, but they have not thought about protecting their brand with the ccTLD. So what we are trying to do in Rwanda is to try to create awareness that, yes, this is good to own your gTLD, but it is very important as well to protect your brand within your ccTLD. And this is being done through different campaign awareness using Twitter spaces that we are currently doing. We go on TV, radio, and we create as well educational materials to this registrant for them to understand why they need to protect their brand.

So the second initiative is mainly on the WHOIS. Most of the ccTLDs in Africa, I think we have issues of data accuracy. So as I said earlier on, registry use the 3R model. So majority of registrants, when they land on the registrar's portal, they just register the domain name. Sometimes they don't fill in all the data required. And the implication at the end is that sometimes when the end user is not notified about the domain that is about to be deleted, or when there is any issue on the website, sometimes the registry doesn't know who to talk to. Because even those registrants, sometimes they have either one if one data or one contact for that domain. So we are trying to educate. This is an ongoing program as well to educate end users on the importance of having data for all the domains that they own.

So in a nutshell, I think I'll stop here because majority of the comments that I had my other colleague, they said it all. But to me, just as a conclusion, while reviewing this registrant program is to think about the people who are reading this message, the registrant who don't have any clue, who don't have any idea that they even own a domain. For them, what matters for them is to go online and to go online, probably to have a website or emails. I think I will end her, so thank you so much.

GUDRUN POULSEN: Thank you very much, Grace, for your perspectives. I'm sure that Brian will comment on.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Well, I wanted to say thank you as well to Grace for reviewing, for all of your comments, for sharing some of the things that you're doing for your customers. That's also great. And these are topics that are important that you talk about, registering domain names, data accuracy, brand protection. Again, we do have some content on that available, but an overarching comment is this is exactly why we wanted to speak with you all. I hope it's useful for you to speak to one another about the services you provide to your customers, the different ideas you have, the topics that you cover, that your customers are most interested in, because I think we can all learn from one another. There's differences, but I'm sure there's similarities and overlap.

And the point is taken again about repurposing, reorganizing, and being more clear when it's a ccTLD registrant versus a gTLD registrant, not over-complicating things, keeping it simple, focusing on really directing them to the right person to talk to, which, again, I think is really not ICANN. It's going to be you all, if it's your customers, it's going to be the registrars that you have. So again, that is where our attention is, but I'm excited about some of the actions that I'm hearing and some of the things we're going to take back to try and improve what we have. So maybe we can move to the poll questions.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Let's move on to the end of the session where we are going to go to the Mentimeter questions. And after the questions, Brian will wrap up the session. The first question is, educational materials developed by ICANN's Region program team may be useful for my ccTLD.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: There are no wrong answers, and any answer is going to be useful, I think, for many reasons.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Please, Irina.

IRINA DANELIA: If I may, I just would like to make a comment. Irina Danelia for the record. So since ICANN is quite actively engaging with registrants at different forums and in different countries, it's definitely important that at this engagement you don't build a wrong perception that all the domain names are gTLD only, but that you demonstrate that there are a lot of different domain names.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Thank you for that. And fully agree, which is also why we are encouraging participation from the CCs via the ccNSO. And we have this space here at ICANN for you and to discuss these issues.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Thank you.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: The Bee have his hand up in them in the zoom room, perhaps. please go ahead. Hand in the room and Bee.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: There is a microphone on the table.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: This one works. My intervention is just pretty looking at the way the structure of the registrant program is. While we're making inputs into what it should look like the work that Brian and his team are doing, we should also, as ccTLD is knowing fully well that we have different ways in which we work with our registrants, also consider and ask ourselves, is this something that we can also adopt within our own environment?

And if we are adopting it within our environment, what sort of language, what sort of information are we going to pass across to registrants so that we can make whatever relationship we have with our registrants more robust, and then be able to reach them adequately with more information for them to know what their rights are and the things that they could work with within our different environments. I just felt I should put that out there and as a ccNSO or ccTLDs, can we begin to look at how we evolve programs that are similar to that in our own different environments? Thank you.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Thank you for that comment, and that's what we really want to encourage and just acknowledging that one size does not fit all in terms of all of your respective organizations and the registrants, the customers that you are trying to serve in different ways based on your business model, the issues in your region. So what we hope is that the materials that we have can complement what you are doing yourselves and we can learn from one another. We can certainly do all we can to improve what we have on our end, but more so we want to help you in your interactions with registrants, your customers, so this is great.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: Thank you, Brian, and let's continue to the last question today in the Mentimeter.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hello. Can I?

BART BOSWINKEL: Could you please continue with the Mentimeter, we have 20 minutes overtime already.

GUÐRUN POULSEN: No more question. Let's continue to the next question in the Mentimeter. ICANN educational materials may need to be adjusted to be useful for my ccTLD. Please specify the areas that require adjustment.

BART BOSWINKEL: This is an open question, so you type in what you think needs to be changed, adjusted, improved to make it more helpful.

GUDRUN POULSEN: Bart, I don't think it works properly. Let's just continue to the last question. Further collaboration with ICANN's registrant program team on educational materials and or capacity development may be useful for my ccTLD.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Thank you, everyone, for your responsiveness and for answering the Mentimeter questions. It's very useful. Maybe the rest of the panel, if you want to have one final word or anything to conclude, I think from my perspective, we've heard a lot of great ideas. There's things we can take back and we, again, an offer to continue collaboration to facilitate sharing ideas of how we can help registrants in different ways, how we can improve the resources. And again, an offer to help with specific trainings and sort of bilateral cooperation is encouraged on my part. But please, the rest of the panel.

KRISTIAN ØRMEN: This is kristian speaking. Well, I just wanted to thank you for asking us to review the program. It was interesting. And if you make new materials also that mention ccTLDs, like you're very welcome to reach out. I think I'm guessing to basically anyone in this room. But of course, you're welcome to contact me also directly.

GUDRUN POULSEN:

As chair of the session, I would like to thank everyone for participating in this very interactive session. Thanks to the panelist. Thanks to all of you who are participating both here in the room and online. We are very thankful for your engagement and country contributions to the discussions of the polling results. And at last, but not least, a special thanks to the Secretariat for arranging these sessions. And as Brian and the panelists just concluded, collaboration is key. We can always do more in terms of collaborating.

Please be so kind to take the survey that will be sent out to you. And a document has also been shared with you where you can write your thoughts. We would appreciate very much your feedback. All feedback is useful and will be used reviewing and improving ccNSO related sessions for the next ICANN meetings. Once again, thank you all for participating. The session has come to an end. Enjoy the rest of the evening. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]