
ICANN79 | CF – ccNSO: ccTLD News Session
Wednesday, March 6, 2024 – 10:30 to 12:00 SJU

CLAUDIA RUIZ:

Hello, and welcome to the ccNSO ccTLD News session. My name is Claudia Ruiz, and I along with my colleague, Bart Boswinkel, are the remote participation managers for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior.

During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will be read aloud if put in the proper form. If you would like to speak during this session, please raise your hand in Zoom. When called upon, virtual participants will unmute their microphone in Zoom. Onsite participants will use a physical microphone to speak and shall leave their Zoom microphones disconnected.

Interpretation for this session will include English, Spanish, French, and Arabic. Please state your name for the record and the language you will speak if speaking a language other than English. For the benefit of the participants, please state your name for the record and speak at a reasonable pace. Onsite participants may pick up a receiver and use their own headset to listen for the interpretation. Virtual participants may access the interpretation via Zoom toolbar.

Thank you. And with that I will now hand the floor over to Jenifer Lopez, the chair for this session. Thank you.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Claudia. Hello, everyone. My name is Jenifer Lopez. I'm from the .pa administration. I'm serving as your chair for our ccTLD News session. I will like to welcome and thank you for joining us today.

Before we start this session, I would like to invite people in the audience, if you haven't already, please join this Zoom Room. Just having everybody in the Zoom Room helps to make sure that everybody is having the same experience to the extent possible in a hybrid meeting. So thank you for that.

The purpose of this session is to present news for unbiased ccTLDs covering best practices, case studies, recent developments, ccTLD activities, and ccTLD management-related topics. During this session, we have some representatives from ccTLDs who will talk about some interesting practices, projects, initiatives, and general information about the ccTLD they represent.

In our agenda for today, we will have presentation from Byron Holland from that .ca, Boyoung Kim from .kr, Andrew Lewela from .ke, Suzete Centeio Pereira from .cv, and Russell Deka Harada from .pg.

To start the session today, we will be inviting Byron Holland. Byron is the president and CEO of the Canadian Internet Registration Authority, CIRA, the .ca country code top-level domain registry. Byron, the floor is yours.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Thank you very much, and good morning, everybody. As you just heard, my day job is operating .ca, the Canadian TLD. But I'm here really to talk about the other part of my job, like many of you in this

room, which is all the work that we do in, well, windowless conference centers around the world, helping to shape global Internet governance.

Just to start this off, I think it's very important to consider one thing, and that's the governance of the Internet that we have had for the past 30 years is not necessarily going to be the governance of the Internet that we will have in the coming years, and what do we as a community want to do about shaping that. Because governments regulate. That's what they do. Their day job is getting up and legislating and regulating. And more and more we're seeing legislation and regulation that is going across national borders. Of course, in this community, we're all well familiar with GDPR, which is very much a creature of Europe, but that its legislative tentacles has reached out across the world and impacted many of us even though we had little or no say on what GDPR was going to be all about. We're all subject to regulation—domestically, regionally, globally. We all have some form of privacy law likely as an example. So we know that regulation is a part of our lives even though we operate our piece of the free and open Internet. So we're not talking about if there is regulation. It's really rather about how much, and very importantly, by whom.

If we move on to the next slide, I want to have a conversation with you really about three things in the context of global Internet governance right now. Really, what's at stake, as an example, what is CIRA doing? And as a community, how can ccTLDs work together to make sure that our voice is heard and amplified through many of us participating? I think we know, and certainly this week we've talked about it, heard many sessions on it in different ways. The Internet governance is at an

inflection point. And the ccTLDs as a community don't get very involved soon, I think we could definitely see a weakened multistakeholder model in terms of the model of Internet governance that we know and an increased multilateral influence in the Internet's global operations.

To provide an overview, to provide a sense of how and where you and we can engage, I want to share with you three things. First, really, what's at stake? What is the state of play with the United Nations-led global dialogues about the future of the Internet and Internet governance? Things like the global digital compact or GDC and the upcoming World Summit on the Information Society plus 20 Reviewer, WSIS+20. Second, really, how are we in some level of detail engaging, as just one example, to support a strengthened multistakeholder model of Internet governance and participating in and helping coordinate other international and domestic technical communities? And third, how we as ccTLDs can really share information, maximize resources, and ultimately, I think, mitigate increased multilateral control over critical Internet resources.

So first, what's at stake? Next slide. So let's start with just with a quick level set. I know many of us have heard bits and pieces, some are deeply involved in this process, some understand certain points, but let's just level set on where we're at right now. So in September 2024, so later this year, the United Nations member states are gathering together in New York to endorse an intergovernmental agreement called the Pact for the Future. The Pact for the Future is going to contain a whole bunch of things but it is also going to contain specifically some work and some words around the Internet and

Internet governance, because the global digital compact to the GDC will be an annex to that broader agreement. And importantly, in the UN's words, and I quote, "Outlined shared principles for an open, free, and secure digital future for all." Of course, that sounds good. Who could disagree with that? That's more about where it's being said, which is in a multilateral treaty-based UN environment.

Then in 2025, so a little ways out, but really not that far, the WSIS+20 Review will see the member states come back together to make among other decisions, a call on whether the mandate of the IGF or the Internet Governance Forum should be renewed going into the future. While 2025 may feel ways away, we know that the GDC will have implications for WSIS+20. And discussions about the GDC are happening, well, right now. Literally, right now. In the past week, member states took part in an informal consultation process at the United Nations in New York City to talk about what the GDC should actually look like. External stakeholders were invited to participate virtually but it's not clear at all how their inputs will get factored into the document.

So why should we care? Why should you care as a ccTLD operator? In 2003 and 2005, the original WSIS formalized the multistakeholder model that we know today. The way that we just take for granted the operations of Internet governance was formalized by the WSIS process then. So for most people in this room, that's all we, you have ever known in terms of how the Internet is governed. But just because it has been this way does not mean it will always be.

So in 2025, WSIS+20, our models certainly could be weakened with the UN playing a more hands-on role on the governance of key Internet infrastructure. And certainly in some quarters, there's growing support for this change of direction. In recent consultations, certain member UN member states are calling for governments to play a far greater role in global Internet governance. In fact, just last year, the UN Secretary General put forward a proposal for the creation of something called the Digital Cooperation Forum or DCF. Sorry to add so many new acronyms so early in the morning, but I think that's it. That's my last new one for you, the DCF. And that would put governments in fact at the center of Internet governance and replicate key elements of the Internet Governance Forum. It's possible that this document will find its way into the GDC document, and that's a pretty significant change in terms of who's at the center of Internet governance.

So if these proposals and views, multilateral ones, are reflected in the output of key UN processes and documents, then the technical community will almost certainly have a reduced role and input into global Internet governance and critical future decision-making processes. The voices of everyone in this room who plays a role in the day-to-day operations of the Internet and the unique insights experience and expertise that we have, would carry less weight in discussions about how the Internet can and should work. And the same goes for all the other stakeholders in the multistakeholder process as well.

So how is CIRA engaging? Next slide. Over the past six months, CIRA has engaged in dialogues to support a strengthened multistakeholder

model by engaging in particular our own government, Government of Canada, and the domestic technical community. And we are actually participating in some of these UN-led processes. So recognizing that the GDC and WSIS+20 Review are fundamentally multilateral processes, we focus a lot of energy on developing our relationships with the Government of Canada. And while CIRA is a private, not-for-profit corporation and not a government institution or agency or anything like that, we have a long and productive relationship with Canada's economic ministry in particular. But in light of the fact that a lot of these UN processes like WSIS+20 are very much on the horizon and happen in different environments, CIRA spent quite a bit of time building relationships in our Foreign Affairs Ministry as well, because those are the folks that are actually on the ground in New York at the UN or in Geneva, for example, and they're the ones negotiating the text of things like the GDC. So we try to support and advise the Government of Canada however we can, whether it's by sharing our views on relevant issues or connecting them with other members of the technical community in Canada and abroad.

Second, we're connecting others in the Canadian and international technical communities who are thinking about engaging in the future of Internet governance. As an example, we send out a short questionnaire to members of the technical community in Canada, their views on Internet governance, and then provided all of that input into the relevant Canadian government departments to help them shape their thinking about the creation of these UN documents and processes. We also regularly connect with other ccTLDs on these issues. There are a number of quite engaged ccTLDs in the space.

We're also a participant in the ccNSO's Internet Governance Liaison Committee and do our best to share information and find opportunities to coordinate.

Third, we actually participate in the UN processes where we can, the ones that feed into these broader dialogues. In fact, we presented oral remarks at the first round of consultations of the GDC. And we've also made numerous written submissions to the UN, relevant agencies, on the future of Internet governance. So those who have participated in these consultation processes will know that—I mean, this is to put it mildly—they're not particularly straightforward or well understood even by people who do it regularly. Sometimes the deadlines and the questions are overlapping. And often it seems like—well, more than seems like—and often is the case that different parts of the UN are working on similar things at similar timelines, which can make it confusing.

So that said, I think it's important that we collectively share our views publicly on these issues, and wherever and whenever, we as cc members, can take part. So how can ccTLDs work together? How can we leverage this whole community? As ccTLDs, I think we should be working together to maximize our resources, because as we know, all of us have constrained resources. So how do we maximize the resources we have and have a meaningful impact on some of these critical dialogues? In ICANN meetings, in between meetings, and venues such as the International Governance Liaison Committee, we can develop a shared understanding of these processes. At least for CIRA, certainly UN decision-making is not our expertise. So how can we share with others who have that expertise so we know where and

when to plug in? And I think if we work together, we can create a shared awareness of these processes so that we can all participate more broadly. And where there is alignment on some of these critical issues, ccTLDs can work together on potentially joint statements and submissions. We know that many voices speak louder than one. We see it in UN context where member states often vote as a block. So, I think there are opportunities for ccs to do something similar. When time doesn't allow for the steps of coordination, ccs can also signal explicit support for others who are doing some of this work, a plus one, if you will, to support others' independent contributions. And we shouldn't be shy to do that where we have common ground.

So in pursuit of a shared vision of a strengthened multistakeholder model, I think there's great opportunity for us as a community to work together in informal coalitions. In fact, beginning late last year, CIRA has been meeting with several other ccs, who were particularly interested and focused on the space, to just sync up on key details around these processes, share information, share perspectives, and also where we can develop shared responses for maximum impact. We welcome discussions with others in supporting this cause and adding your voices and values to this very important discussion. And with that, I hope that is a catalyst for further discussion and participation in this very important space over the next 18 or so months. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Byron, for your very interesting presentation on supporting the multistakeholder model and for aligning us with this idea of working together to strengthen the effectiveness of this model. I will

open the floor now if there are any questions for Byron. Just a reminder that the session doesn't have interpreters, so if you could speak slowly. This is a reminder for myself, too. And be mindful that the floor is open. Okay, Alejandra. Go ahead.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you. This is Alejandra from ccNSO Council. Byron, I think this is a very interesting presentation and it's good that we keep the conversation ongoing so we don't lose ourselves from meeting to meeting, because we started a little bit of this in Hamburg and it's good to keep it fresh for everyone. One thing that I am wondering is what advice would you give to ccTLDs that don't have as much resources as, let's say, CIRA, how can they get involved or have a meaningful way of participation?

BYRON HOLLAND: Thanks. I think that that's a very important question for many people in this community. I think part of it is just keep the conversation going, so making sure that over the next number of ICANN meetings that there is some regular dialogue in this forum and in others. That's certainly one way that people can participate. And at the very least, keep up to date on what's happening. There is the Internet Governance Liaison Committee where much of this will be talked about. So participating there is another opportunity. On a more informal way, I mean, there's CIRA and other ccTLDs who are fairly active in the space, so please come up and have a conversation. There's lots of work to do in the space. We're always happy to have willing hands to help.

Because your question was really about resource constraint, if resources are constrained, I think anybody in this space is very willing to share. So some of it is you don't have to do it all yourself, that's totally fine. Stay up to date. Just do a plus one because numbers matter in the space, too. So being able to participate in just in that way will also be very helpful if views, of course, are aligned. So I think there's multiple points where folks who aren't on this regularly can still stay up to date and participate. Thanks.

ALEJANDRA REYNOSO: Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ: Thank you, Byron. Now we have Jordan Carter, and then Nick.

JORDAN CARTER: Thank you, and thanks for that presentation, Byron. Interesting thinking. I was just going to say as another thought in response to Alejandra's question that one thing people can do is talk to their national governments in the course of their normal discussions about what's happening there. You may find your government is engaged or has some knowledge there or has some connections for you. So that's another one to think of or at least a topic to put on the table in those discussions where you'd have them.

Then the other thing, to just let people know is that, well, two more things. On Thursday at 1:15, there's going to be in the geopolitical forum, I think ICANN is going to be announcing some thinking about a

way to keep in contact about these issues. So that will be a session to go to if you're interested in these topics. Then I guess it'd be remiss if I didn't say that one of the processes that's going to do some work about how we make this model stronger as multistakeholder is the NETmundial+10 event that's coming up in Brazil at the end of April. If you want to chat about that one, I'm one of the people running the high-level Executive Committee organizing it. So feel free to grab me and have a chat, if you like. Thanks.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Nick, please.

NICK WENBAN-SMITH:

Thanks very much. It's Nick Wenban-Smith for the record from nominet.uk. Byron, you know we're strong supporters of this initiative. So my questions are more sort of from a provocative perspective. So I've got two questions, really. The first question is that I know this is one of Sally Costerton's objectives, and I know there's obviously the session that Jordan referred to. So the first question is to what extent can we relax because ICANN's got it covered and it's part of the CEO's objectives and we can be happy? So that's my first question. The second question is what is the worst possible outcome that could happen? What's the most disastrous thing that could end up out of all of this that needs to be our call to action to galvanize? Thanks.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Okay. Thanks, Nick. I can't really comment on CEO goals. I guess that's between Sally and the Board, even though they're somewhat public.

But I suspect—and again, this is my opinion—that ICANN is a little bit skittish about being seen to lead in this space. Can we convince them if it's useful to ride shotgun or be a partner in this dialogue, but not a leader in this dialogue. They clearly have the resources on the ground in a way that I don't think any one of us do. In New York, in Geneva, in other places, entire teams focused on monitoring this. So I think if we can leverage those resources and make some demands on those resources to provide that synthesized information to us, that will be very useful to all of us. I think that we as a cc community need to act on our own and certainly not wait for ICANN to do something or not. And that's why I think—and thank you for the phrase—a call to action is actually important. It may seem like 18 months is a long time. But like anybody, like all of us who run technical operations, this is a project. And we need a project plan and it ends in 18 months, which means we've got to work back to the processes that are happening now. And 18 months, in fact, is very short. Processes are happening now. That's when we need to get involved now. Because if we don't, things will happen around us.

To me, this is how I look at it. The Internet that we've had for the last 30 years is not a guarantee. The Internet we will have in the next 30 or even the next 10 is going to be different in terms of how its governed, certainly, and I'm not talking to technology, of course, which changes all the time, but how its governed is going to be different. There are some legitimate reasons on why some things should probably be governed differently. But we need to have a meaningful role—and I think here's where some of the rub is for governments who think about this or the UN. Their issues are upon layer seven, the top, what

we see, the platforms, the Facebooks, all of the things that people are interacting with. Whereas we're down in layer two, layer three, at the technology level, and that's where we need to make that very critical distinction, and that the Internet governance of the Internet, what we do is very separate and distinct from Internet governance on the Internet, what we see the platforms, etc. And we need to articulate that and I think hold firm on that and have a combined and shared voice. Otherwise, we will find ourselves caught up in trying to solve the problems of other layers of the Internet stack, which won't be good for us, and quite frankly, is a very blunt hammer and not very good for solving the actual real and legitimate problems that governments really should work on solving.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Byron. We are slightly behind schedule. We have one more question and Joke is going to read it.

JOKE BRAEKEN:

There's a question on a chat from Boyoung: "How did CIRA find a way to communicate with Foreign Affairs Ministry? As mentioned, GDC is UN process and Foreign Affairs Ministry do their job, sometimes get advice from technical community (the ccTLD registry). What should we consider when ccTLD collectively submit the opinion? Should we consult with each country's Foreign Affairs Ministry?"

BYRON HOLLAND:

Building relationships with ministries, different ministries, and in this case, whatever your version of Foreign Affairs is, often takes time and

effort. So in my experience, there isn't a silver bullet. But if you can prove yourself to provide substantive and useful information to the folks who are negotiating and writing text in this space, most of them have no background in this space. It's been my experience that they will actually be fairly welcoming of expert, unbiased, non-ideological perspectives. Now, the key is can you find that person or persons, those people? I mean, we're fortunate geographically and then New York is relatively close to where we're based out of, so we've actually just gone down and essentially knocked on the door of the relevant actors and say, "We have useful information for you," and just slowly built that relationship and reputation that on specific issues, we can add value for them. We've taken a kind of a long-term approach on that and I've built those relationships out over time. So now that when they are in the middle of it, they actually rely on us more. Sometimes we'll proactively ask but are certainly willing and receptive to hear our views on the technical subjects. So part of it is just identify the person or people, knock on their door. Knock on their door, they will know who you are as a ccTLD operator for their country, it's a great entrée, and go in with information that is helpful to them. They don't want to hear your problems. That's been my experience. They need help in understanding their own problems and possible solutions to their problems. Be realistic about the timeline. But also, don't be afraid just to knock on the door. You come with a great calling card as a ccTLD, and offer expert advice.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Byron, for your answer. Maybe you're willing to answer additional questions offline during the break. Now we might move to

our next speaker. I think we have Boyoung Kim on the line. Boyoung is deputy general researcher and has overseen international relations and Internet governance at KISA, Korea Internet and Security Agency, KRNIC since 2012. Boyoung, you have the floor.

BOYOUNG KIM:

Good morning, everyone. Hello from South Korea. My name is Boyoung Kim from KISA, .kr registry. Today I'm going to share .kr's effort for the Asia Pacific community. Next, please.

As one of the biggest ccTLD in Asia Pacific region, KISA hosted the 81st APTLD meetings last September in Seoul, South Korea. This is the group photo of the members in front of the Korean traditional building for the 25th anniversary venue. As of today, APTLD has 78 members. We published the APTLD statement, the Internet for All, as a result of the 25th anniversary of the APTLD. Next, please.

While preparing the APTLD 25th anniversary, KISA suggested to develop some meaningful project to promote best practices for APTLD members to consolidate regional Internet industry organizations effort and to leverage the APTLD standing in the region.

APTLD formed the dedicated working group to develop the statement. We had 11 representatives from all sub-regions and held more than four intense meetings to develop short but coherent and meaningful document.

Draft statement was supported by many active and thoughtful comments from APTLD members during Public Comment period. And it is reported at the high level meeting of APTLD84 which is attended

by leaders of the members and AP* organizations. It is very supported by high level meeting and suggested for implementation.

Working group considered the outcome of the high level meeting and final version was reported to the Board. In the APTLD Board meeting on 17 October 2023, the Board approved the final version of the statement and it is moved to the next step for implementation. Next page, please.

While working on the statement, our working group considered that all the actions and action items should be realistic, feasible, scalable, measurable, and promote collaboration between members and other regional Internet industry organizations. Next, please.

Statement has three parts. First, the Preamble is to emphasize the APTLD community's perception, motivation, and affirmation. And second, main part is to list and highlight directions and commitment. Last, concluding part is short and powerful call for action. Next, please.

In the Preamble, APTLD members recognize that Internet should remain unique global public resources and medium serving the public interest and recognize the Internet plays a particularly important role for our economies and recall that integrity, openness, interoperability of the Internet, and robust performance of the DNS. We also recognize the governance of the Internet should be inclusive, participatory, and human rights based, and participation by all the interested parties. Also, we have affirmed support and commitment to Tunis Agenda for the Information Society, and also UN Sustainable Development Goals. We call actions to maintain a multistakeholder Internet governance

system that acknowledges the role of the technical community. Next, please. Next page, please.

First direction and commitment is to leverage the unrestricted advancement, access to and use of the DNS as a unique backbone of the Internet. We should safeguard and advocate the robust and trusted DNS. We need to ensure that collaborative development, dissemination, and uptake by the regional community of a robust and best practice space, the cybersecurity and Internet Information security policies, and operational protocols. And we need to step up and coordinate efforts to promote Universal Acceptance. Next, please.

Second direction in the coming months is building capacity of all significantly interested parties. Sharing knowledge about the Internet and its core components of functioning and proactively contribute to the collective development of cybersecurity and cyber hygiene-related awareness raising effort, and also develop and deliver dedicated Internet governance capacity building program for decision-makers, public servants, and next generation leaders. Next page.

The third direction and commitment is new and emerging technologies, improving the integrity and robustness of the DNS and contribute to digital transformation process and the advent of the digital economy and society by conducting joint research and apply the project aimed at improving the management of ccTLD and other core components of the DNS and Internet ecosystem and infrastructure for more secure, resilient, and affordable Internet. And lastly, by collaborating for integrity with such new and emerging technological developments. Next page.

At the concluding part, we call for actions to ensure that benefits of the Internet are available to everyone in the Asia Pacific region. So, this APTLD statement for Internet for All, you can find in the APTLD website. Next page, please.

Implementation phase has started just now. Two weeks ago at the APTLD85 meeting, we had a brainstorming session and discussed what has member organizations done to elaborate these action points and share their best practice and what they wish for APTLD to assist in implementation of such good practice across the region. Future consideration will be done by APTLD members and APTLD Board will take into consideration to sort out the action items and future plans. Next, please.

KISA is learning a lot from members in APTLD and also in ICANN. I'm happy to share recent development by KISA and APTLD today. Thank you for listening.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Boyoung, for sharing this initiative by the .kr ccTLD and interesting call to action to work together under the multistakeholder model, not only for the APTLD community but for all the actors that have a role within the Internet community. Now we have a comment from Leonid. Leonid, the floor is yours.

LEONID TODORV:

I'm sorry, I was supposed, I guess, to discuss this at the end. But yeah, okay. So just one quick minute, just to add to what Byron and others suggested, just to put it in a more practical ground. Discussing this

collaborative approach, and in particular, what has been done by APTLD, I just thought that there might be an opportunity for the Internet Governance Liaison Committee to come up with a playbook for ccTLDs that do not have enough resources and capacity to elaborate on the matter and engage with their respective governments. So there might be some cards, if you will, which would help them as templates to leverage a dialogue and to contribute to their government's stance, whether in the UN or some other fora. Thank you very much.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Leonid. Now we have a raised hand from Ai-Chin. Ai-Chin, please go ahead.

AI-CHIN LU:

Okay. I think back to Boyoung's presentation, I don't have any questions. I just want to add some more. I think the project was initiated by .kr and the Board of Directors lead in the discussion and the gathering of members' opinions. I want to emphasize that it is collaboratively consensus building model. So I believe it will be a successful project for APTLD with the next step being to implement and realize the key point for an Internet for all. APTLD is willing to share the outcomes with you when we finish. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Ai-Chin. Is there any other question? Okay. I see none and none in Zoom. So we will move to our next presenter. Thank you, Boyoung. For a perspective from the African region, we will have now

Andrew Lewela, chief evangelist at .ke or Kenya Network Information Center. Andrew, please go ahead.

ANDREW LEWELA:

Thank you, Jenifer. Greetings to all the people joining us virtually and presently in the room. For the record, again, I'm Andrew Lewela. I'm the chief evangelist, the CEO at KeNIC. Today, I really want, as a typical African, to tell our story, what we will call a fireside chat, about how .ke got here and where we think we will go in the next couple of years. Next slide, please.

A good place to start, ladies and gentlemen, is the Africa story. While we have a lot of things in common as African countries, we also have a lot of diversity in the 54 countries on the continent. The best way to create a segue into Kenya is if today you were to buy a T-shirt and had the map of Africa on the front and you touched your heart, that will be Kenya. Next slide, please.

Africa is also the home to lots of potential. A few statistics, ladies and gentlemen. At 1.4 billion population, in the next 20 years, one in five people in the world will be from Africa. So, growing very fast, just behind India and China. And not only in population, but also in the potential of GDP growth. Potentially, that is how large the African economy will look like, 29 trillion in a couple of years. We also have a youthful population. 70% of our young people are under the age of 30. So a really futuristic consumer market and labor pool. Next slide, please. Next.

So this is how I will characterize Kenya, before I get into some of the milestones that have made .ke, an up and coming registry in Africa is the only place, I will say, on earth where you will enjoy a sunrise with the best coffee and the best tea. And by midday, you will enjoy the Big Five in terms of seeing all the potential animals you'll think about. And by sunset, you will be standing on the highest free-standing point on earth, on Mount Kilimanjaro, 5895 meters above sea level, all in under a day. So such diversity, such beauty. Next slide, please.

So a few more seconds to just walk through who we are as KeNIC, what we stand for, our why, and how we do what we do. At the very core of our mandate, really, our why is really to not only promote .ke, but to ensure a trusted domain system for all individuals and businesses within our ecosystem. And this mission has been thought through with our stakeholders, and I'm happy to say we are currently reviewing our three-year strategic plan which will breathe life into the next couple of years. And underpinning this mission is our core values: excellence, innovation, and integrity. We have four strategic pillars that give us the tactical opportunity to deliver this around people, which is talent and leadership, technology, which is critical to ensure a secure reliable and accessible infrastructure, and partnerships that can deliver value for our registrants. And finally, it's not just about stability and security but growth and sustainable growth as it were. Next slide, please.

So our story can be summarized as follows, ladies and gentlemen, and especially for the emerging or up and coming ccTLDs in Africa or the Global South. So in '98, IANA delegated the mandate to run the .ke registry to an administrator who was an individual supported with a

technical resource. These two gentlemen, for a couple of years, were able to deliver what was then the .ke registry services. But very quickly, the Internet community started to emerge around the country. And together with government, it was clear that they were not able to scale the registry services in terms of availability and responsiveness. So a dialogue emerged, a very robust dialogue, on how to institutionalize the registry.

In 2001, KeNIC was birthed as a company limited by guarantee with representation from the public sector and the private sector, so ensuring this multistakeholder. This ensured the solid foundation on which we are able to rely on to date.

In 2015, 2022, and 2023, we also started what I will call thought leadership around the DNS services. We started holding DNS forums, a Kenyan DNS Forum and an Africa-wide DNS Forum. I'm happy to say that we will sustain this thought leadership in terms of just sharing what is critical for all our peers around the continent to ensure that we can secure the future for any ccTLD on the continent.

Then, in 2015, we got some support from the regulator in terms of cementing the role of KeNIC as a licensee to deliver the very unique services that we give as a registry. I'm also happy to say that that was a watershed moment when we crossed the threshold of 50,000 domains on .ke.

Later on, in 2017, two things happened. We not only introduced our second level .ke extensions as part of our service offering, but we also are third on the African continent to have our DNSSEC implemented after South Africa and Tanzania. And 20 years on, ladies and

gentlemen, we were able to cross our 100,000 mark in terms of domains. By no means is this where we want to be. We have an ambition to grow this 3x, hopefully 5x, in the next couple of years. And hence, the reason why we are sharing this story. We would like to benefit from peers in the room and all over the world in terms of what does it take to then sustain this growth in the medium to long term. Next slide, please.

I would like to conclude with some key lessons from this journey that has been .ke, especially for the emerging small ccTLDs across Africa. Number one, do not do this alone. If you're a one- or a two-man show, if you're hiding in a university, or any of those places where many ccTLDs start, it is time that you brought more people on board. Involve the community around you. Involve the global practitioners to help you go faster and farther. Build your governance early. I have a board made of seven members. Four are sort of our stakeholders and three are independent. So the very onset oversight is useful for any registry to deliver value. And for heaven's sake, share your story along the way, which is what we are doing today, because only then do you know what you can build on. Suffice to say, ladies and gentlemen, it is critical for you to deliver reliable and secure services to build a world-class infrastructure and architecture with the necessary redundancies to ensure uptime for your services. This is a critical cornerstone for any registry.

While there are many business models around the registry, we have the 2-R model or the 3-R model, we have seen as Kenya, as .ke, that the 3-R model works for us. It's a sell through model with registrars who are our partners and resellers. But we also together support the

owner of the domain. So we encourage you to have a clear business model that consistently delivers for the entire ecosystem. Finally, learn from your peers. Appreciate other ccTLD peers who have held our hands along the way and we continue to work with them to ensure that we can succeed.

So those are the key lessons we've picked along the way. We are here to share that what we have been able to deliver so far, but hopefully pick along other lessons from other peers across the continent and across the world. With those many remarks, I wish to say thank you very much.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Andrew. Interesting case study, building a model registry. And now I will open the floor to any questions for Andrew, or maybe in Zoom. Okay, Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Thanks for that. That was very interesting. You noted that you hope to see between three and five times growth over the next handful of years, the next few years. I'm wondering if you have any specific plans, marketing plans, or others to achieve that. How do you think or what is your intention to grow to that level?

ANDREW LEWELA:

Thank you, Byron, for that question. These two areas, we see potential growth. We have a sectorial approach. So, for example, we are looking at an SME as a potential area of growth through strategic partnerships,

either with telcos, with banks, who already have this SME on their books. How do we layer in opportunities for domain or the Internet pathway for them? So that's one way we think we can show up some numbers.

We have also been, to a large extent, a very close registry in terms of our registrars. So we are also opening this up for international players to bring some of the competencies into our market and help us scale. So we are exploring sort of partnerships to help us sell the .ke promise beyond the Kenyan territory.

So those are two sort of approaches we think can really show up some numbers, our strategic sectorial approach and have other partners who can bring best practice. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Andrew. Are there any other questions? If no, we're moving on with our next presenter, Suzete Centeio Pereira. Suzete works at the entity that regulates the electronic communications market in Cabo Verde, ARME, and is responsible for the management and maintenance of the dot .cv domain registry. Suzete, the floor is yours.

SUZETE CENTEIO PEREIRA:

Thank you. Good morning or good afternoon, everyone. My name is Suzete Centeio Pereira. I'm so delighted to be here today to present our globalization strategy to implement the .cv registration. I work at ARME, the Multi-sectorial Regularity Agency for the Economy. Among other things, it is the registry of the .cv ccTLD designated by ICANN. Next slide, please.

ccTLD .cv is the domain name representing Cabo Verde. The Republic of Cabo Verde is an archipelago located in West Africa. It's consisted of 10 volcanic islands with a total area of about 4033 square kilometers. Our official language is Portuguese. Next slide, please.

The ccTLD .cv has existed since 1996. In the beginning, the .cv domain management was technically supported by the .pt. The .pt is the Portuguese registry. ARME supported the administrative management. Once the technical condition for registering the .cv domain has been created, ARME took over the effective management of the .cv domain in 2010. Next slide, please.

Afterwards, considering that the general rules for registering the domain worldwide have evolved significantly, and based on the maturity achieved in the domain registration here in Cabo Verde, the government decided that there was a need to make this registration even faster and this allowing any person, a national or foreign company, to have a .cv domain. In this sense, new rules for registering the .cv domains were approved, and these rules aimed to liberalize the .cv domain in accordance with the best international practices. So, anyone can register a .cv domain as long as the domain does not correspond to the words or expressions that are contrary to the law here in Cabo Verde. The word is not contrary to the public order or accepted morality, that did not coincide to any top-level internet domain existing or in the process of being created, do not correspond to the name that mislead or confuse its ownership or the word or expression to promote abusive behavior like violence, racism, obscenity, and so on. Next slide, please.

In the meantime, we realized that the .cv could be a very appealing ccTLD since it is strictly connected with the curriculum vitae. In particular, for a natural person, it's the perfect digital address for people who want, for instance, to promote their job careers. So we thought, "Let's take advantage of it." So, under this context, ARME contracted a specialized company to create a business plan to have the best strategy for globalizing the .cv domain registration. Next slide, please.

The business plan provides ARME two choices: the possibility of seeking direct funding and self-invest in the building capacity to launch the .cv domain on the international market or the possibility of contracting a partner willing to invest the necessary funds and share the profits with ARME. After analyzing the document, the business plan, the second option seemed to us the most viable, developing a partnership with a company in the domain name registry business. This company must have extensive experience in the registrar industry. This option minimized investment risk to ARME with the advantage of reaching the global market more quickly. Next slide, please. I'm sorry.

So, in 2023, ARME signed a contract with WhoGoHost to join ARME to implement the globalization strategy for the .cv domains. WhoGoHost create a special proposed vehicle named OLACV. According to the contract, among other assignments, OLACV must provide and operate .cv domain management server, the information system that will receive the domain registration request. They must ensure that the ccTLD .cv DNS service provides a high degree of robustness and accessibility through user-friendly platform. They must keep the

WHOIS system operational and updated, and develop and distribute the EPP software to the registrar. Next slide, please.

We are in the final stage of implementing the .cv globalization strategy. This will be the website where you can apply to register a .cv domain and where you can find all the information related to the .cv domains such as the rules, how to become a registrar, how to become a seller, and so on. That is in the room, a representative of our partner, of OLACV. His name is Opeyemi. Please, Ope, raise your hand so the people in the room can meet you. Thank you, Ope. Ope can answer any question you may have about registering the .cv domains. Next slide, please.

To ensure that Cabo Verde continues to have control over the registration of the .cv domains, OLACV does the sales and control part of the .cv domain registration application system, and ARME publish the .cv zone on the primary zone server. Therefore, the publication of the .cv zone is done in Cabo Verde on a server located here in Cabo Verde with Cabo Verdeian IP.

This is the diagram for publishing the .cv zone. First of all, the zone file is generated by the OLACV system. The zone is sent securely to ARME using the DNS server. Once the zone has been received by ARME, it is validated and then it's archived and version controlled. Through an encrypted channel, the zone file is sent to the DNSSEC server. Once it reaches the DNSSEC server, the new zone is signed. Once the zone has been signed, it is sent to the master DNS server, which is hidden for the public to avoid DDoS attacks. Then the hidden master DNS distributes the new zone to the primary servers. All of these steps are monitored.

The logs are recorded and the tailored notifications are sent out if any anomalies occur. Next slide, please.

We hope that the whole process will be completed by the end of this month, and that the globalization of the .cv will be a reality, and that the profits generated by this liberalization will contribute to Cabo Verde's digital development. So it will be a challenge, a difference. But in our perspective, the better part is to put the .cv in the world map. Next slide, please.

As this, obrigada. If you have any questions, please, let me know. Feel free to contact me via my e-mail, suzete.centeio@arme.cv, or you can talk to Ope in person there in Puerto Rico. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thanks, Suzete, for your very inspirational presentation about globalization strategies. The floor is open now if there are any questions for Suzete. Okay. I see none. Also the Zoom. But I do have one. And my question for you, Suzete, is once the transition to the new system is completed, will the current registration fees remain the same or will they go up or down?

OPEYEMI AWOYEMI:

I don't know if I could chip in on that.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Okay. Thank you.

SUZETE CENTEIO PEREIRA: Please, Ope.

OPEYEMI AWOYEMI: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, Suzete, for the presentation. Again, my name is Opeyemi Awoyemi and I represent OLACV, the joint venture between WhoGoHost and ARME.

To your question, the answer is it's going to go down. The reason why that is it's all about economics of scale. Now that we're globalizing, we are able to reach more people, and then the cost of operations definitely goes down. To make that happen, we're just going to reduce the prices to the best minimum as long as it remains sustainable.

I should also mention that we're also keeping in mind issues on spam on making domains very, very cheap. We're talking to partners. We're looking at what spammers is also doing to make sure even as we make the price go down, .cv does not become accessible for spammers across the world. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ: Thank you for your answer. And thank you, Suzete. I don't see any other question for Suzete. So thank you so much. To conclude our session today, we will have Russell Deka Harada, director of ICTS at the PNG University of Technology. Russell, the floor is yours.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA: Thank you, Jenifer. My name is Russell Deka Harada. I'm originally from Japan, but living in Papua New Guinea nearly 27 years. Almost half of my life with [inaudible].

I know, before lunch, everyone tired. Just relax. Please, make a stretch, make a stretch. Also, if you can stand, please stand and stretch like this. Then I can remove my jacket. There you are. This is the country flag, Papua New Guinea. Let's start my presentation. Next slide, please.

Do you know where is Papua New Guinea? Before I went to Papua New Guinea, I don't know where Papua New Guinea is. I'm sorry, [inaudible]. But Papua New Guinea is located in the South Pacific, above Australia and next to Indonesia. Very unique culture. We have more than 800 languages out of 2500 languages in the world. Very unique culture and you see many different colors of people. For the past 20 years, I was living in Goroka, which is a very famous local tradition, Sing Sing, which means the dance group. More than 200 different groups joined together and celebrate our independence. Next year, September 16th, we will celebrate the 50th anniversary of independence from Australia. How we can achieve? Next slide, please.

VIDEO:

I really love Papua New Guinea and the people here. Everywhere that you travel to in the country and their customs and culture. There's just so much beauty in their smiling faces.

Super interesting. A lot of fun. PNG is awesome.

Unexpectedly amazing.

You can be hiking in active volcano one minute, you can go down and cool off in the blue waters the next. There's just no shortage of adventures to be had here.

You can see the fish swimming and all the dolphins jumping. It was just a magical experience.

I've been having amazing experience here in Papua New Guinea.

I think this is the most beautiful place I've ever been. The crystal-clear water and the people, there's just no place like it.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA:

Thank you. Next slide. About our .pg ccTLD. We are served a bit early 1990s, recorded as a 67th country and managed by DNS section ICTS department, which is my department. I joined to this PNG University of Technology as a director just three years back. At that time, we have 3790 domains, but I found many free riders, nearly from government and industries. After I joined to this university, I found no longer free riders. We need to delete. Almost one-third of the domains we deleted, April 2023. Next slide, please.

We have a domain policy, but nearly 25 years, no one touched this policy review. I found this .pg is a neglected child nearly 25 years. My colleague, Andrew, he said that 100,000 domains, but we only have 3000 domains because of limited activities in the past 20 or 25 years. Next slide, please.

After I joined to this university, I found this .pg is a gold mining as other countries already faced. First of all, I launched a new logo because no one knows .pg, and purchased a small/mini bus for .pg marketing. We recently started. Next, please.

One of the milestone achievements is our deputy secretary of the Department of ICT, Government of Papua New Guinea, Mr. Russell Woruba, is here with me. We signed MOU with this government, especially regulated this .gov.pg in November 2022. Next, please.

Thank you, Russell. Next achievement is participated in the presentation, APTLD83 and 84. Continuous participation. And also participated in APNIC Regional Conference 54 and 55. Also communicated and partnership with our neighbors, AuDA. Thank you, Jordan Carter and Bruce, Steph, many Australian partners, especially policy advisors, advisor Donna, who assisted us to review this .pg domain policy. Lastly, we launched the PNG domain name standard under the government .pg led by Mr. Woruba, and we achieved. Next slide, please.

So we are seeking a registry software. Currently, our old processes are doing manual. You need to download the PDF form from our website, fill it, stamp it, attach it, process it by command. We need some registry software. Very soon, we'll call for tender and automated our system definitely. Because the 3000 plus/minus domains, we can manage by human. But if we reach 10,000 domains, impossible. Also, I participated a new membership over this DNS org, Operations, Analysis and Research Centre. As academics, we need more research about the .pg DNS. Also very soon, early May this year, we will co-host this first PNG DNS Forum which my friend Kenya said nearly 10-12 years back hosted. We are a bit late. Next, please.

I did some basic research, but unfortunately, we don't have a time. Majority of our students, they don't know who is the domain

administrator. You see, this is basement research. So maybe next few years, if this number will change or not, I'll report to you. Next, please. Next, please. Next, please. Sorry, we are skipping a lot.

Finally, we did some marketing because our product without marketing, no one buys this brand of soft drink. So we did the marketing, especially sponsorship of some sports event. And also we visited several schools to make awareness. Next slide, please.

So my philosophy is very simple, improve the service before increase the price. My boss finds this is a gold mining. So we have to increase the price before improve the service. But I said, "[Inaudible], please wait. We have to improve the service first and then we can increase the price." So my main focus is automated registry system. Of course, we need to sign DNSSEC. And also, we have to create some online portal and also payment gateway. Next slide, please.

.pg marketing, like some majoring point, I set on. Before end of 2025, we need to participate all schools, most of the government, both national and local government, and also we are targeting small SMEs, and also all our political leaders, they are using Gmail account, who is a genuine political leader. So all political parties, including the political leaders must apply on domain. Also, we are very famous to play this rugby league. Recently, I talked to our team coach as a branding ambassador. So through the sports, we have to do more marketing. Next slide, please.

As you know, I'm working for the university, and the university is a key hub of this capacity building. We have to train our students and our youth. Because the past 20, 25, 30 years, no one did the training, no

one knows about the DNS, no one knows about the importance of DNSSEC. So I collaborate with our academics, not only mathematics and the computing department, but also business IT, electrical, applied physics, many engineering science department, I'm collaborating and to make some capacity building. So before this ccNSO session, I participated in the UA. Unfortunately, this year we are not ready, but must prepare for next year. So everyone must include. My task during ICANN79, I'm very happy to meet many people, learn many new things, and research for DNS wholesale pricing. Sometimes, it's very difficult to find this wholesale pricing, but I'm trying to. Also prepare ICANN80, which AFRINIC hosted in Rwanda. And the further ICANN meetings, I have to send my young generations. Next slide, please.

I always stuck this word, better education with technology. My friend from Kenya said that, "If you want to go fast, go alone. If you want to go far, go together." But as our Pacific, "If you want to sail fast, sail alone. If you want to sail far, sail together." You must go one time and I think we can achieve. Next slide, please.

As I said, we have 800 different languages in my country. Tenkyu tru, tanikiu, lamineve, boina tuna, arigato, asante, danke schoen, [inaudible], gracias. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ:

Thank you, Russell, for sharing updates on the excellent work being done by .pg. It's very inspiring to see .pg's training efforts even though you're just a few managing the registry, so congratulations for that.

Also, congratulations because you're a Fellow and we are so pleased to have you here. Now, are there any questions for Russell? Yes, Wafa?

WAFI DAHMANI:

Thank you. Thank you for your presentation and thanks also go to all the distinguished speakers today. My question is—and correct me if I'm wrong—I didn't see that you can register directly under .pg. I only saw sectorial domain names. So you don't allow in your policy to register directly under .pg?

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA:

Thank you. Currently, our policy stated that this is a .pg for only domestic market. So you need to show the presence, especially company registration by company registry or even some interest. We are not open for global. We want this .pg become adjunct space so we really restricted only domestic market. But of course, after reviewing this policy, we can consider. Like this .pg mean the postgraduate or .pg for Procter & Gamble or even Pacific Games or some other meaning. Also, currently, we are not allowing to open this second level domains, only third level domains. Companies that are .com.pg, government, they are gov.pg. And also after leaving after call for tender, of course, we will introduce this 3-R model. Recently, we have a 2-R model. All domain users directly inquire to us.

WAFI DAHMANI:

So some users can't register.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA: Sorry. All right.

WAFI DAHMANI: Some users can't register under your cc.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA: Yes. Currently, all within Papua New Guinea presence. Outside people, we are not allowing. But after reviewing this policy, yes, we'll consider.

WAFI DAHMANI: You should consider that, I think, if you want to reach your goal number because there are many experiences that—and many .cc are open to register under directly their cc and there are no problems.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA: Thank you. Also, I met your PR, Dr. Pablo. He's my new mentor. I have to learn many things from you and your country. Thank you.

JENIFER LOPEZ: Thank you, Russell. Are there any other questions? I don't see any.

I think, in closing, I believe that these practical examples demonstrate why a multistakeholder approach has been critical to the success of the Internet. So I take this opportunity to thank all. We'll have more to learn from each other and to share. Unless there's anything else, I think we might call the session to a close. I want to thank our speakers for their time and for sharing all the information. Thank you to our interpreters for a job well done and to our secretariat and ICANN staff for the help here. Thank you to the onsite and remote participants

also. We hope that you found this informative and enjoyable and that you were able to connect with others in their communities. We value your support and attention. Thank you very much. This meeting is adjourned.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA: Thank you. After I stop recording, I want to make some traditional custom of Papua New Guinea. I want to present this coffee. Papua New Guinea is also very famous, this specialty coffee. So I'll present this coffee to this session chair, Jennifer, from my deputy secretary, Russell. Please present to her. Thank you. Also, Byron, please bring back to Canada. And Andrew.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]