
ICANN79 | CF – ccNSO: ccTLD Registrant Capacity Building Group Work Session
Saturday, March 2, 2024 – 4:30 to 5:30 SJU

JOKE BRAEKEN:

Hello. Welcome to the registrant capacity session by the ccNSO. My name is Joke Braeken and I'm participation manager for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and governed by the ICANN expected standards of behavior. During the session, questions or comments will only be read aloud if submitted within the Q&A pod. If you would like to speak during the session, please raise your hand and zoom. When called upon, virtual participants will be given permission to unmute and zoom. On-site participants will use a physical microphone to speak. Please state your name for the record and speak at a reasonable pace. I will now hand the floor over to Bart Boswinkel.

BART BOSWINKEL:

Thanks. And I'm not the chair. This is a very ad hoc group trying to come up with ideas and developing a work plan and to present at the Kigali meeting on improving the registrant capacity building information available by ICANN for ccTLDs. So adjusting it, et cetera. And what we were doing to date is we met quite regularly since the start of this year. It's a small group from ccTLDs, ICANN staff, and then the ccNSO support staff. so just for those who are not familiar, what we're doing.

The way we do it right now is really trying to set up some requirements, and we're using a special method. It's using personas. So you think about avatars, almost, of users and what type of information, how they

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

get them. So we'll show them in a minute, and then what you try to do is map their user journey in finding the right information and whether this is really, say, the registrant capacity building as it is right now does provide that information and to define effectively going forward the requirements for information for registrants on the ICANN website and which might be relevant for ccTLDs and maybe also what ccTLDs could do. So this is really still in the exploration phase of what we're doing.

So maybe let's start with the personas that we've built today. So can you go to the Jamboard? Show the Jamboard. Yeah. So this gives you a rough idea of the personas and persona builders. So this is clearly someone from a non-ccNSO member. And they have a certain need for -- is this the right one? This is the -- I still can't read it. No, this is what you got, the Jamboard from the -- yeah, but we do have two. This is the wrong persona builder. Yeah, no, but the persona builder is -- this is -- we've done this so you see the confusion. We've done this with another group as well, the website. And trying to find people how they use the website. This is the one, yeah.

Okay. So give you a rough idea. We built a few personas. One is Silver, a human rights activist, a .br domain registrant and wants to understand what and how they can protect their own physical safety. And in order to find information about this, so he's completely unaware of how the real world looks like or our real world looks like. So from that perspective, they start to -- sorry? Oh. They start to look into, say, what kind of information can I find to assert my interest? We haven't built a user journey. We're going to do it in a minute.

So the other personas -- can you go quickly through the other ones? The other personas we build is, for example, this one. It's very minute. Again, they want to understand best practices for registrants and around, say, if registrars or registries include credit card information in the applications. Some people come up with these ideas. You look very puzzled.

And the next one, this is, again, a persona. Trying to get a domain name in another country, fictional .bz. How does she or he goes about to get this? And what will happen if that person is going to the ICANN website? Will he or she be redirected to the information that is necessary?

And I think the final one is empty. That's the new one. No, that's the new persona. So to date, we've done three user journeys. So can we go to -- and Hilde, that's a new one as well. Yeah. Can we go to the whiteboard? A new one. And I think what is an interesting one is -- I don't know if Everton is around. No, Everton is not here. There we go.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: One moment. Technical difficulties. Thank you.

BART BOSWINKEL: Very strange that it doesn't work. Or don't they allow you to use it? Hi, Brian. Go ahead.

.brian GUTTERMAN: Hey. Yeah. While we're figuring out the whiteboard, I just wanted to thank Bart and the whole ccNSO for having this working session. And I guess to provide a little bit more context, this exercise and the work of

the small group has been really good for me. And you know, beyond thinking through how we can improve sort of the ICANN.org content, what I'm trying to learn is just sort of the unique perspectives of the respective ccTLDs. So you know, as the members here today are following along in this and thinking about the user journeys of basically the customers, right, the registrants in this sense, would always like to hear from others about sort of the unique needs or issues or topics that they are hearing from their customers in different ways. Because what we always talk about is if these registrants are ending up on the ICANN.org pages they're in the wrong place, right? At some point, they were misdirected. And you know, they aren't finding who they're really supposed to be talking to to resolve their issue or problem for the most part. And I'm also trying to learn out of this not only how to improve the content, but to how to better help facilitate dialogue within the ICANN community, within the ccNSO about, I don't know, customer issues generally. And you know, if we can help talk about specific things, specific topics, any way we can facilitate a good dialogue that helps us sort of come up with solutions, best practices, whatever it is. So that's also part of the broader work of this small group. And everybody's invited to join the small group and share their perspectives. Because I think that's what's really important. And then if one ccTLD can learn from the other, that's great. Then we're really accomplishing something. So that's all I wanted to say. And now we can move on with the customer journey.

BART BOSWINKEL:

So we have to increase the size, [inaudible], otherwise people can't read it. Yeah. If you're in your Zoom room, you can do it yourself. Go to the

whiteboard. We are on the limits of technology. Okay. Yeah. I don't know whether it's worthwhile to – this really works virtually. I don't know if we really want to do it right now. Oh, it's increasing in size. That's right, because from a, let's say, support point of view, that's interesting.

Okay. Let me take you through this one. So can you type in the – so this is going to be the journey of Silver. And Silver is a human rights activist. She's a female activist in her 20s and a young person. She is a .br domain name registrant. And she wants to protect her physical safety because of potentially WHOIS data, that it is made available, yes or no.

She's concerned, as I said, about her info in the WHOIS. And her real question, therefore, is who should she contact to hide her info in the .br name. She doesn't know and doesn't make phone calls to solve her issues itself. So she's very concerned about this.

Now the way this works is she will start to look for information somewhere. And she doesn't know how to find information about WHOIS. She's not really a person WHOIS familiar with DNS, just one of your ordinary customers. So the question is, how does she get to the initial information? Yeah, you could type something in in a Google search to find a hide WHOIS information or, yeah, any other means. I don't know if anybody of the group has an idea of what her initial action would be. Anybody?

MICHELE NEYLON:

I'm not part of this group, obviously, since I'm not ccNSO. But have they already registered the domain? I don't know. Because if they've already

registered the domain and the data is public, then they're screwed. No, I'm sorry. I mean, just the thing is if you – because if you want to register a domain name without sharing your details, you need to register the domain with some form of WHOIS privacy or proxy.

BART BOSWINKEL: How would you know?

MICHELE NEYLON: I think you'd have to look into how to register a domain anonymously or something. Or safely, securely.

BART BOSWINKEL: Yeah, she wants to understand if she can hide herself, if she can get rid of the WHOIS information. How would she go about –

MICHELE NEYLON: But you have to do it before you have the domain. Because once the data is public –

BART BOSWINKEL: You know this, but how would she learn to do this? Or how would she understand this is available, that information? Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I am from the ccTLD .rs. For persons, for physical persons, the data is closed. It just says physical person. Where can she find it out in the rules and regulations for registering the .rs domain name? And for physical

persons, it is by default hidden, and she can ask to make it public if she wants.

BART BOSWINKEL: But that's for you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: This is the view from one ccTLD.

BART BOSWINKEL: Yeah, no, but this is – I don't know whether she had a – she's a .br domain name registrant, so she wants to find out if .br is doing this, but she doesn't know .br. It's a bit – in that sense, a bit weird. But she doesn't know how to get there. Would she end up somewhere to find information if it's possible at all? How would she go about? That's the question, the starting question. So what is her initial action to get this done? Where would she end up? Would she type something? Go ahead, Fernando.

FERNANDO ESPANA: Yeah, I would think that the first place that she can go is the place where she actually registered the domain name. If it was through a registrar or a reseller, they would know if that TLD offers proxy registrations or not.

BART BOSWINKEL: They hope they do. Okay. So reseller information. So that makes it interesting. This is somebody who clearly, if you have a domain name,

you go for – I got a .br domain name, so therefore I go to a reseller for the .br name. So it would never end up with ICANN to seek information.

MICHELE NEYLON:

You're assuming that somebody knows the difference between a browser and a search engine, and they don't. So what would they do? They will put the question or a – they will put a sentence into the browser and they will hit enter. And we get a disproportionate number of queries every month from our clients saying my website is not on the internet. And we're going, yes, it is. No, no, it's not. We're going, no, no, it is. But it's not. We're going, okay. Why do you think it's not on the internet? And it's because they type the name of their business – not the domain name, the name of their business – into the browser, hit enter, and don't get to their website immediately. So, they don't know what a domain is at all.

BART BOSWINKEL:

That's why I'm asking this. No, that's the whole thing about this. Yeah. So what would you do? So going back as a first step, if you were this customer, what would you do?

MICHELE NEYLON:

I would probably be asking a question of how can I protect my privacy online? And how do I keep my personal details private? How can I use the internet safely? How can I say bad things about Margarita without her finding out about it? Yeah.

BART BOSWINKEL: And I don't know what would happen if we would type this in. I don't know where you would end up. Let me see. So what is interesting, I've typed in how can I protect privacy online or my privacy online. And what is the type of question?

PETER KOCH: Sorry, this is Peter, interjected that this is already a nerdy question. Because protecting my privacy online is way beyond the average user language. And that matters, I think.

BART BOSWINKEL: Yeah, it does. What would you do?

PETER KOCH: It's not what I would do because I would phrase it that way. So the question might be if I want to be active on the internet and not be harassed or something. I don't know.

BART BOSWINKEL: Go ahead, Michele.

MICHELE NEYLON: Okay, the question I have is for you as a group, how are you generating these personas and other things? Has ICANN actually gone down the route of talking to anybody who specializes in usability? Or is this just a case of a bunch of like-minded, well-intended ccTLD people trying to kind of muddle their way through this? I'm not trying to upset anybody, but just really how is this being done? Because it looks to me like the

intention behind this is great, but I think you need outside help for this. There are companies that specialize in coming up with those kind of questions that an average user would ask as opposed to us, because we actually understand this stuff a lot better, so we're going to ask much more pointed questions.

BART BOSWINKEL:

This is a bit of a muddling through. This is just to understand a little bit, say, what would happen – and maybe we can't share some of the other ones – what would happen if you say, how do you end up on, say, the registrant capacity pages of ICANN?

MICHELE NEYLON:

But that's my kind of question is, because it's muddling all of those personas. It's a usability, user journey type thing. And we're going through this process right now, which is why it's become like one of my pet things. So we've contracted with an external agency that specialize in this, so they've kind of been talking about what kind of users are there? What are they doing? Why are they doing it? What are you doing for them? Why are you doing it this way? How can you show them where they are, etc.? Obviously our approach is purely commercial. I want to make more money because I'm a dirty, filthy capitalist. But it ties back to the better user experience, more sales kind of thing. Whereas in this case, it's, how do they end up on the ICANN website? Well, look at the web logs. Look at the analytics data. Look at the search queries. That's going to tell you a lot of—

BART BOSWINKEL:

And what you get – and that's the interesting – and maybe that's the way to do it. What you get is a kind of statistical analysis. It doesn't get you to the underlying queries of the persons themselves. That's the danger of using the statistical analysis. So what you do is you create diverse – the other word is avatars – and then you just run them through and what would you do with your mindset of that avatar? It's just to get sensitized about what you think people will do doesn't work. Because we think – and you could see this in a lot of conversations. We think we know what the customer wants, but we don't. So it's just to sensitize this small group on say, yeah, it might not be the case, and that's why we just use this as a tool. This is not to be scientific and it's not to increase, but at least to show what is currently on the registrant capacity pages of ICANN will not work for ccTLDs for various reasons and what should we do to improve it. And you end up with something – and unfortunately we should have tested this beforehand – that, say, you end up with some real gaps in what they're doing and some areas for improvement. And that's where you really want to add. Once you do this according to all these personas, then you get a list of requirements. That's where we're heading. [inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:

Is it too late to suggest a fourth persona? Because all these three personas know what the domain is, basically, and they are asking specific questions. They are far above the average, let's say several hundred thousand sole traders in Serbia, population 6.5 million, 300,000 entities, LTDs and sole traders. And their question is, how can I establish presence on the net, in the virtual world, in the digital world? But he already knows that internet platforms or social networks are

really not the best way. So they feel that there is something, they don't know it's a domain. They usually confuse that with websites. They will never ask about the domain. I know that after 15 years, I'm one of the small accredited registrars, I know all my registrants. On the other hand, the biggest registrants don't know a single registrant because they are registering automatically. And most important thing, we are talking about registrants. As if speaking about the data behind the domain name, or who is the registrant, who is the admin contact. Those registrants actually don't know in most cases that they are registrants. And they don't know what is an administration contact. What does it do? They have addresses which are, we started in 2008 with .rs. Even today, I have people who have renewed their domain names for five years at a time, who know what it is, and they still don't have a clue. One asked me a few days ago, what is Admin-C really for? I said it's the person, it's the function that receives and processes all requirements about your domain, let's say transferring to another registrar, which is a simple operation. But if the email address of the administration contact is someone who left your company years ago, or the address doesn't exist anymore, well, you have a minor problem. It can be overcome, but you should be aware of that. No, they are not aware of that.

BART BOSWINKEL: No, no, absolutely not.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: So how to approach people, companies, sole traders, especially sole traders, who feel that there is significant improvement for their

business in the digital world, but don't have a clue about not even ICANN, not the local, the ccTLD? They know the guy, usually, or small company, or marketing agency, who developed their website. And within that whole deal, they register the domain, often, even bigger marketing agencies register it in their own name. That's what we keep saying all the time, even to those agencies. Maybe it's easier for you.

BART BOSWINKEL:

So in your case, the scenario you are using right now, it is effectively the customer himself, he has no clue, but he goes to his supplier, his digital supplier, for lack of a better word. It could be everything. He could supply him the computer, he could supply everything as well. So that's your initial contact. This is where you go to somebody who really doesn't know, then he goes to, and he relies on that digital supplier.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER:

And the digital supplier should also be a subject of our effort, because those digital suppliers know how to make a website, how to make a shopping cart, etc. They even know that they should register a domain, but their knowledge of domains is, they know one of the accredited registrars, with whom they usually have cooperation. Often they register it in their own name. Why? It's simpler. I have to collect the data, they don't know what I'm doing it about, etc. And then you have such a, you see registrants in your database, but that registrant doesn't know that he, she, or the company is actually a registrant. They know whom they paid for the whole bundle.

BART BOSWINKEL: So if I understand what you're saying, you say these people are almost, yeah, completely tied to their digital supplier, will not go outside that relation, unless there is a real issue, but then they will probably go to another digital supplier who will tell them the other one sucks. Go ahead, Michele.

MICHELE NEYLON: Just a couple of points, just to reinforce what he's saying. Our experience, identical, pretty much identical. I mean, sure, big corporates, all that, that's a totally different conversation, but the average small business hasn't got a clue. And what we see a lot of, this kind of thing, the domains are registered in the name of the digital supplier. I like that, actually, it's kind of a nice all-encompassing term. So it could be an IT service company, it could be a web developer, it could be a web designer. We get a lot of this kind of things where it's that company or that business disappears and the client then has no idea who the hell they have to go to. Look, if I look at our help desk any day of the week, if I logged in now, I'm sure I'd find at least six tickets. And it will be, I've been given the task of running website for X, or maybe they'll actually include the domain name, if they do, that's really helpful. I don't know how to log in, I don't know who the contact is, I don't know who the details belong to, I don't know who's paying the bill. I mean, there's a list of questions. And it's like, how do you even begin to unpack that?

BART BOSWINKEL: My question is, and that's the level we rise at, because this is, how do they get to you?

MICHELE NEYLON: If your company is big enough in your market, then you get the phone calls for everybody. Sorry, because we get the phone calls for everything that's internet-related.

BART BOSWINKEL: You're a bit like the honeypot.

MICHELE NEYLON: Yeah. So people will contact us for issues that have nothing to do with us whatsoever. So my internet's not working, you guys do internet, so can you fix our internet? We're like, no, because you're not our client. Or my domain is not working, it's like, okay, but it's not with us. What do you mean it's not with you? It's like, no, it's with that company over there. But we get a lot of that.

BART BOSWINKEL: It is, probably, if you look at your colleagues, your competitors, they will get the same kind of question.

MICHELE NEYLON: No, as we answer the phone, they don't. So that was a marketing message on behalf of Blacknight. We'll sell you hosting and domains.

BART BOSWINKEL: Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: There is one more situation about the digital supplier. I also like that term, newly coined term, digital supplier, not an accredited registrar. Usually they piggyback on the rules and regulations for registering domain name in certain ccTLD. But sometimes they get innovative. Like on their page, where they accept the request for registering the domain and other services, they say you can transfer your domain only 30 days before expiration. Which is not in .rs. When we made the rules, we said not only until the expiration, in those 30 days after the expiration, where you can still renew it, you can also transfer it to another registrar. So the person who was complaining, and where he was complaining, on Facebook. They don't allow me to transfer my domain name to... And everybody told them, well, who is your accredited registrar? He named the company. They are not an accredited registrar. How do I know? You have a registry, .rs. There is a list of accredited registrar. Your domain is actually with the accredited registrar with whom the digital supplier actually had a contractual obligation. Then there is a problem. What is the problem? The registry, the ccTLD, has contractual obligations with accredited registrars. But they don't see legally the hundreds and possibly thousands of digital suppliers who appear on the market, muddle the picture, muddle the clarity of the regulations, obscuring them in their own interest.

BART BOSWINKEL: I appreciate this, but going back, because you already started that you have your naive customer who goes to his digital supplier. How does the naive customer know that he can move it?

MICHELE NEYLON:

The thing I think is, all that we're saying here is wonderful, and probably it's interesting, but not helpful for you. Because the kind of thing I was thinking about, and I know some of the ccTLD people get very upset with me, but I don't care. The issue is consistency, consistency of experience, so that you're able to say to people, "Okay, these are your rights, these are your responsibilities, this is what you should be able to get, what you should be able to ask for from a digital—" I do really like this digital supplier thing, it's really helpful. I really like it because we get so much of this thing, people get fixated with registrars, registries and resellers, but the reality in the marketplace is a lot of the time they're just buying a solution to a problem. And they could be dealing with a registrar, or they could be dealing with something else, we don't know. They're just looking for a solution to a problem.

And one of the things is, I suppose, is how do they know where to go? And trying to educate them on that's not easy. But it's things like in Ireland we have citizensinformation.ie, it's a huge bloody website. But if you want to know about your rights for employment, for taxes, for pensions, for health, it's all in there. Everything's in there, and it links on into other government departments. The ICANN website is fine for gTLDs, but for ccTLDs I suspect it would be a very frustrating experience trying to get an answer to some of these questions. Because .cl will do it one way, .de will do it in a totally different way, and don't even get me started with .rs. I can't even get accredited in .rs. At least she doesn't mind me getting accredited, and he doesn't mind if I pay him enough money. But .rs is like, no, no, no, you have to set up a company with us.

BART BOSWINKEL: It sounds like the German became Dutch.

MICHELE NEYLON: Whatever. But how do you be able to set a baseline of, okay, you are a small business, you have an online presence, this is what you should be able to access, this is where you should be able to go to verify certain bits of information? Because the registrar record is always going to be public. There's no privacy implication with that. Knowing what to do. The larger reseller-based registrars, like the wholesale registrars, like the Tucows, they offer tools on their websites where you can put in the domain name and it will tell you which company is the reseller and give you their contact details. And then if that reseller is unresponsive, they have some kind of process in place for that, which I think is really helpful because that's simple and straightforward. It's like, okay, this is my domain. Who do I talk to? So, I mean, maybe looking at those kind of things. But I think one of the things is that for the ccTLDs is just to kind of think, okay, what can we agree on that we all allow or all expect our registrars to provide? I mean, do you all expect your registrars to provide customer service to their registrants? Or is that too much to ask?

BART BOSWINKEL: I'm not a ccTLD. But what is interesting—

MICHELE NEYLON: But we're going to choose you as a ccTLD. You work for the ccNSO. You're a ccTLD now.

BART BOSWINKEL: Yeah, but it's-- no, take a step back. The intention of this-- I saw your hand, Christian. It's going back. This is really about how can we use the information which is on the ICANN website on registrants? Is it useful? And how can we update it? Or if somebody goes to the ICANN website, how can we redirect them to ccTLDs? And what should ccTLDs provide? So in that sense, it's almost a small building block in what you're saying. But if there is a consistent way of doing this, that already helps in the market. And it adds value to, say, some of these questions. Christian. Okay, go ahead. Brian, go ahead.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Oh, thanks. I had a few points. First off, thank you, Michele, and the other registrars who have spoken up, the other gentlemen. I think a lesson learned here is having-- what we're going to call the digital suppliers or registrars in the room for these conversations is really important all the time, one.

Number two, when you were talking about the tickets that you're dealing with, Michele, and the other is of the really layman average registrant, this is the exact same sort of experience that our global support team has. So again, some might know about the ICANN global support team, but they field thousands of tickets, which is maybe nothing a month compared to-- might be nothing compared to other, obviously, bigger registrars or some of the bigger ccTLDs. But they're usually dealing with folks that definitely shouldn't be contacting ICANN for help, but we're there. So what they have is sort of a database of knowledge of FAQs, so the common questions they get. Okay, what are

you looking for? okay, again, let's redirect you to try and get you to where you need to go.

And that's part of this exercise, is actually enriching sort of the information that our global support team has, because they're really at the front lines. The content on ICANN.org is, I guess, complementary to our folks who are really fielding tickets. And I would say complementary to the other customer service teams of whoever it is, of the ccTLDs. But again, we know that each business, especially in the ccTLD world, the business operations, the business models are very, very different. And there's different requirements for registering, etc.

And then, I guess, the third point, we-- this group, we wanted to evolve. So what we hope here is that these sort of reminders, these interventions about really remember that the average customer, the average registrant really doesn't know anything. They're thinking about, I want to register a website, or I want to have a website, whatever it is. How they're getting to ICANN.org or somewhere else to find the information they need ... I'm not a UX expert. I'm trying to get better. We're always trying to get better at the org about improving ICANN.org experience for all sorts of users in different parts of the community. So that's complicated, but we're always trying to get better, and that's part of this.

But my hope here is that the other ccTLDs in the room and following along online can learn something, right? And they might not have the resources to have a robust customer service place, but if they can take something away from this, like remember, don't assume anything about your customers. From the beginning, what can you do at

registration, at first contact-- before registration, at first contact with these folks, what information can you give them to keep them engaged and to get them coming back to get the information they need when it comes to managing the domain after registration? So just having these dialogues, and hopefully, we're talking about best practices sort of here. I hope it's useful for everybody else, and then we can sort of slowly get better together in terms of improving these customer journeys, which we're sort of doing at this micro level in the small group, but these broader conversations, to me, are really useful for my own purposes, but I hope they're useful for other folks. So sorry for the long intervention, but this is really good to me.

BART BOSWINKEL: Thanks, Brian. Christian?

CHRISTIAN: Thank you. I really like this digital supplier term because the problem with ccTLDs is that many are so different, so it's going to be difficult to put information on the ICANN website that would not lead to confusion in many cases. This digital supplier term is kind of broad enough to cover both ccTLDs and gTLDs. It would be able to provide some good information that could be used, but also, I think, like this whole thing we are doing with the personas is, in the end, going to show us that the most important is that we have to make sure not to confuse people and redirect them to the correct registry or something. You can't really say registrar because in ccTLD world, you still have registries that do direct registrations and so on, but the digital supplier term there would still work, so I like that.

MICHELE NEYLON:

Also as well, I just want to pick up on one thing that our learned friend remotely said that I thought, I mean, I'm amused by it, but I think it does need to be corrected. Talking about business models when you're talking about ccTLDs, a lot of ccTLDs don't have a business model. They're not run as businesses. They really aren't. I wish they were, but they're not. So they don't have those resources or that mindset. A lot of the larger ccTLDs and medium-sized ccTLDs do have the mindset, but a lot of ccTLDs don't. That is one of the challenges within all of this because it goes to, I mean, Christian's being super diplomatic and talking about the diversity and how there's differences and the differences are what makes it all so much more interesting, but from an end-user perspective, it's just really confusing. It's really, really confusing. The idea that you can register a website, for lack of a better word, for 10 years in many places and then with some of the other ones, oh no, it's two years and you can only renew it for two and then with some it's for one and then for some they allow—it's billed monthly and then some people are offering perpetual domains or domains for 100 years. I mean, all sorts of other weird things. It's very confusing.

BART BOSWINKEL:

Thanks. I don't know how to—I think we got a lot of food for thought for, say, the next week. So you caught us right in the middle of the discussions we're having. So that's the interesting part of it and it opens the perspective. Peter, you had a comment?

PETER KOCH: No, actually I didn't want to stop you from speaking. I have one question because it occurred to me that there's at least two different things that are being dealt with. From what I heard from the global support, I'm not sure whether it might help if global support had more precise information where to send the customer to.

But first of all, I wonder, the average customer would probably not end up at ICANN anyway. That occurs to me, but then we have different ideas of what the average customer is. But the point is, if there's somebody talking to that support team and the support team figures out, okay, this is about a domain and probably the, I was going to say complainant, it's customer, right? So the customer is, a potential customer is asking for a particular domain if they are that far, then it might help to not send them to whoever is in the IANA database, but to have more information about who to send them to. That's just a raw idea and I've--

BART BOSWINKEL: Maybe just the IANA database is you've got a .br domain, so go to .br and not try to seek the information on the ICANN website. Yes, people do this.

PETER KOCH: Yeah. It may or may not be helpful depending on what's in the database, right?

BART BOSWINKEL:

But the direction of travel to date of the small group is that if you have a query about the ccTLD domain, you go to the ccTLD registrar at the end of the day. You don't end up, because again, the diversity, UDRP is a good example. Some do offer it, some don't. If you have IP issues with a domain name, go to the registry that is involved. And if you just use it from, say, follow that line for a user and you end up on the ICANN website, there is no way that you know that you need to go to the registry, the ccTLD registry. So that's one of the things that already became clear. What type of domain name are you having? Please go there and don't even—or you can add a little bit additional information, but that's it.

MICHELE NEYLON:

Just a practical question. Okay, the bigger ccTLDs, if the IANA entry does actually point to something that will be somewhat useful, it will take you to something that's probably a website controlled by the registry. But I know from past experience that with some of the smaller ccTLDs, that's not the case because it could be like the Department of Telecommunications for the People's Republic of whatever the hell it is. And when you get there, if you're lucky, it will load a website. If it's in a language you can understand, you might be able to find something on there that kind of says something about domains, but it's not a given. Has anybody actually checked whether the URL in the IANA listing is current and is actually useful?

BART BOSWINKEL:

We haven't, but it's a good point. But at the end of the day, at the end of the day, ICANN is not in a position to resolve this.

MICHELE NEYLON: Yeah, but it's costing you money if you're getting a lot of queries about it.

BART BOSWINKEL: I agree. So therefore you need to go before—and if you have an issue with this, this might be helpful and then you redirect. But you put the question, the query to the party to whom it belongs. In this case, who is your digital supplier?

MICHELE NEYLON: No, I mean, I'd say be pushing it back to the ccTLD in the IANA listing. It's like, why is your listing out of date? So you can't force a ccTLD to do anything. Fine, we all agree on that. I mean, there's upsides and downsides to that. But I don't think it's unreasonable to expect the ccTLD to keep their IANA listing current.

BART BOSWINKEL: I invite you to the Tuesday block two session or block three session. The reason is this is one of the, we're going to run a hypothetical on exactly that.

MARGARITA VALDES: Margarita for the record. One of the things that we have in mind in order to do this kind of work, especially trying to be in the shoes of the very elemental user, is trying to figure out how can they look for a domain

name or look for, well, bottom line, Google, bottom line, a browser that you mentioned.

The thing is that trying to look for the ICANN information that is available for whatever user, that probably is not so easy that they finally get to the ICANN website. Information about the ccTLDs for a ccTLD registrant, it doesn't exist currently. So our challenge in this group is how we can improve this information in many ways that probably internet will help us. For example, if you look for registrants in the ICANN website currently, you will see a list of links, but if you are a ccTLD registrant, you will not find anything.

So for example, maybe something simple could be, well, if you are a ccTLD registrant, have to be a landing page that is not the long, very long list of the TLDs that are available in the ICANN website, perhaps ccTLDs, for example. And then, well, perhaps in the future we could see if the accurate of the quality of the information that is available in the ICANN database, which is another part of the story, but in the very beginning, try to figure out, try to give some kind of simple information for this registrant that is not currently available in the ICANN website. And well, we have many opportunities to do it better. That's the idea. Thank you.

BART BOSWINKEL:

Thanks. So it was an interesting discussion about the user journeys in the sense, and I think—Yeah, go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I don't want to interrupt your final words, and I'm actually doing it, but I have one question after listening to all this. Have you ever considered to have this kind of discussion with the ALAC, or has this taken place already and it was not fruitful?

[SANDRA HOFERICHTER:] It was not considered, but at the same time, the starting point was different. I think ALAC is considered too much to be a GTLD-focused area from a cc perspective.

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Sorry, we have had dialogue, and good question, good point. We have had dialogue about registrant issues with the ALAC actually many times because we know, and it's not just ALAC, there's obviously many other groups in the community that are interested in these topics, if that helps, but we haven't brought into this current discussion that's been kind of going on since before Hamburg over the last six months or so, it's just been sort of this small group. I think that was Sandra, but good point. And this, it always should be cross community the same way. I'm like, this is great that there's registrars in the room, but we're getting there. But you're right, like getting the perspectives of ALAC or NCSG representing registrants themselves in the community is something that we try and do as a registrant program as well. So I don't know if that fully answers your question, but we do like to encourage cross-community dialogue on this.

PETER KOCH: Just one remark, NCSG is only representing GTLD registrants. So we're back to square one and ALAC is not about users.

BART BOSWINKEL: So going back to the agenda, but thanks, it's probably something to discuss at the later stage whether or not to involve ALAC and ALSes and everything else, but that's more at the local level. Yes, I think what this small group needs to think is how do you want to present the outcomes of the discussions today on Wednesday? Is it just going through the process and describe what we've done? And who is going to do it? Margarita, will you do this? Yeah, okay, yeah. And I think that would capture item number four because it's -- we're almost done. Any other business, anybody? Brian, any last words?

BRIAN GUTTERMAN: Nothing. Thanks for the interventions and for the good discussions. I appreciate it from the staff side and I think it was helpful for our small group work. And always inviting others in the ccNSO to join the small group and share their ideas and perspectives. So I appreciate the dialogue about these issues. I think it's really important.

BART BOSWINKEL: So thanks for participating. This closes the meeting. You can stop the recording.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]