
ICANN81 | AGM – GNSO: NPOC Membership Work Session
Saturday, November 9, 2024 - 16:30 to 17:30 TRT

ANDREA GLANDON: Hello and welcome to the NPOC Membership Work Session. My name is Andrea Glandon and I'm the participation manager for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior and the ICANN Community Anti-harassment Policy. If you would like to speak during this session, please raise your hand in Zoom. When called upon, virtual participants will be given permission to unmute in Zoom, on-site participants will use a physical microphone to speak. Please state your name for the record and speak at a reasonable pace. And I will now hand the floor over to our chair. Juan Manuel, you may begin.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Thank you, Andrea. Welcome, everyone. I will try to use my new words from Turkish, I think. It's like Merhaba and hos geldin, something like that, to everyone. Welcome to this session, NPOC session, NPOC Membership Session that is open for everyone who wants to join it. Actually, we always have a round of presentation from the people around the table. But in this case, I think I would not do that because I want our speakers to have enough time to do their presentations and maybe that give us some more time to maybe ask them some questions.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

Welcome to this session. This session is trying to be related about digital policy and privacy issues. NPOC stands for Non-For-Profit Organizations Constituency. Despite the many slides, it still says our old name that it was Non-For-Profit Operational Concerns. But now, it's just a clarification that we are now an organization constituency inside the NCSG. Having said that, I would like to start this meeting with the agenda we have already. A thank to this meeting.

So, the first speaker that we have here is Dr. Itir Akdoğan. I'm sorry for my bad pronunciation. She is the Research Director for Turkish Economic and Social Studies Foundation. And she will be talking a little bit about digital policy tools and some of the work that they do in the foundation. Also, Dr. Akdoğan has a PhD on this. She has also been a researcher for a long time ago. Sorry. I think that's it. It's a change of microphone. Just being able to be recorded. Thank you. So, I think that's it for now. I would like to give the floor for Dr. Itir Akdoğan, please. Welcome here.

ITIR AKDOGAN:

Thank you very much, Juan. Hello, everybody. My name is Itir Akdoğan. I'm very pleased to join your meeting. And as Juan Manuel told, I will tell you about the digital policy tools that we develop for local democracy. When I say we, I mean TESEV, Turkish Economic and Social Studies Foundation. It's an independent think tank working for democratization and that produces evidence-based policy recommendations for that. And since 2016, we are predominantly focusing on local democracy, local democratic governance. And we are

producing digital policy tools to improve the decision-making processes of the local decision-makers for a better urban policy.

I don't have the control of my presentation, so can I please ask for the next slide? Yeah. When we talk about democratization, we choose digital policy tools for a couple of reasons. They mostly are improving data-driven decision-making of municipalities. And through that process, we see the limitations of data, which is a general problem in Turkey and in municipalities in Turkey.

When we are collecting the data, when we are planning which data to collect and how to collect and how to analyze them to prepare our digital policy tools—I will shortly show you some screenshots to give you an idea—we are seeing the limitations of data and how data is missing, how not all the population living in the city are represented and how data is not openly shared in the municipalities. So, this inclusive data and open data, it's one of our predominant advocacy points, are also like when we increase, when we improve those areas, it also helps democratization of municipalities.

And the digital policy tools, we also see that they improve good governance principles like collaboration, accountability, transparency, which are all still limited, we observe in Turkish municipalities. And these digital policy tools, they don't only improve good governance and democracy within municipalities and within their decision-making processes, but they also help citizens and civil society for their informed participation and their informed advocacy. And ultimately, we see that municipality-civil society cooperation might also increase with this

digital policy tools that we develop. So, for all those reasons, we develop these tools and we monitor them, we update them and we monitor them to see their impact.

So, I will now show you a couple of them. We have three different kinds. When it is urban policy, it is unavoidably special policy. Municipalities make many special decisions. And one of our tools called Urban95, you might know it, it's an international program of a foundation called Bernard van Leer. It's based in the Netherlands and they focus on better public services for early childhood. So, we are worthy stakeholders of the program that was implemented in Turkey. We started in 2016 and 95 is the height of a three-year-old healthy kid. So, this whole project looks at the city from three-year-old eyes. And we actually, with this digital policy tool, with this data-driven policy-making tool, we are aiming to improve the special decisions of municipalities.

So, in this map, you see age and market value data. We use the market value data to replace the data that we miss in neighborhood level for income. In Turkey, you have the income data in the city level, but not in the neighborhood level. And since we wanted to show the inequalities, the social and economic inequalities within the cities based on neighborhood, we took the alternative data that is the market value that gives closer idea to wealth. When we combine age and market value, we can see where predominantly poor kids live in a city.

And the dark blue shows the poor kids. And when it's red and darker, you see wealthier and older people. And in this district of Istanbul, you see that there is this, where you see is when it is the clear cut is the

highway. All the neighborhoods which are between the sea and the highway are rather wealthiest of the district, and they are older. And above the highway, these are poorer neighborhoods where there are more kids. And the dots show the nurseries.

And we see suddenly that the municipality did not think of opening nurseries in the neighborhoods where they have the most kids and most poor kids, but they had rather more nurseries in the neighborhood where you have less kids and where those neighborhoods are wealthier. So, that is a very good example for municipalities to think where they should open the next time the nurseries that they have to, because the public nurseries are cheaper or for free. So, this is how municipalities can have more accurate decisions.

Next slide, please. This is still Urban95, but over the years, we updated the data, not only the data, but also different deliverables. I mean, different data. And on this one, you see access to a railway, public railway transport. And you still can pin on it the locations of hospitals. And we see that there are many hospitals and some are larger because when the dot is blue, it's a public and larger hospital. Like on the left side, if you could see, you can see that there are many larger hospitals where people don't have access with public railway transport. So, this also shows a special presentation of where to invest next time when it's time to plan the locations or the roads for the public railway transport.

The next one, please. Yeah, this is another tool. This is called My Purple Map. Again, a data-driven policy tool. We partner for this project with UNDEM in Turkey and the municipalities who are in the program. So,

this one is from Eskişehir. It's a bit south of Ankara, the capital city. And this is mostly focusing on better gender equality policies in the city. Again, we have different variables, different data, how we can map the city. And here, what you see is oranges and greens. Greens are where you have the larger households. And oranges and reds, they are the smaller households. And this time, normally these are interactive websites, but I didn't want to bother with the connection now because it's also on Zoom. So, that's why I took only the screenshots. But you can always play with the maps. These are interactive.

So, the one feature that I chose for this screenshot is the women heads of neighborhood to show the women representation in the city. And here we can see that smaller the household, like a single people where they live, we see more women representation with more heads of neighborhood. Whereas in the green parts, we see only a couple of them. So, this means that women who have at least one, but more than one child, they don't vote for, or there are no candidates, women candidates for neighborhood leadership. So next time an NGO or a civil organization who is working for women representation, they know through this map where to focus their efforts and their work.

That digital tool also includes citizen data. People living in that city, they can pin on the map, on the city map where they feel unsafe. And they have a very easy user-friendly form to fill in only to collect gender and age and the reason why they feel unsafe. And that information is directly going to the relevant unit of the municipality and they take the actions to make that area more safe. And that is mostly what we see so

far. It's mostly about lightning, where people, women find the streets or the parks dark.

Finally, a third, if you could go to the next slide, please. A third tool that I'd like to share is a monitoring, evaluation, and cooperation tool where citizens can monitor easily the strategic plan and the achievements of the goals that the municipalities are setting in their strategic plan. Because strategic plans and the annual reports have to be published online, have to be shared with the public, but because they are very technical documents, not all citizens know about that, but even if they know about it, it is not very easy to follow and to make sense of the documents.

And this tool shows more easily, it makes the information more accessible for citizens to follow, to monitor how the goals of the municipalities are achieved. And on the next slide, we also see that next to the performance indicators that we saw in the previous one, anybody, any stakeholder, any actor in the city can also see what activities and projects the municipality plans to achieve one goal and they might send an online form to propose cooperation.

So, all this, if you can go to the next slide. We develop these tools in partnership with municipalities and civil society organizations and all experts that could be included in it, that could be relevant for the project. And after we develop them, we always monitor to see the impact and we see some promising impact actually for this after the use of these digital policy tools. We see that municipalities use of data

increases, inclusion of data increase, collaboration and monitoring are also improved.

And to give you some examples, Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality, for instance, they decided their new nurseries locations and they later on have been inspired to develop their own maps. New kinds of maps have been developed and we are very happy to see them. District municipalities of Istanbul, they also started to use the tools and Sultanbeyli is one of them. They opened a new data unit for their strategic planning. Eskişehir Metropolitan Municipality revised their data sets to make it more gender sensitive and they also started data sharing system with district municipalities, which is very promising and very important, we find. Because we also, as I said in the beginning, we find this a very democratizing process for the municipalities.

Ankara Metropolitan, they started to collaborate with private sector for better lightening of the streets and parks after they started to receive data from the citizens on the website. And some district municipalities like Sultanbeyli and Maltepe, coming from different political parties, they cooperated in data-driven planning during the pandemic, which was also very democratizing, we found. Because given the polarization in the country, it was very important that municipalities from different parties collaborated and cooperated.

Adana Metropolitan Municipality, they included performance indicators referring to the purple map that I showed you in their strategic plan. That also means that they will invest and monitor and keep their website updated. And also, apart from municipalities, we see

that civil society organizations, they developed several projects. The websites, the tools, they inspired many civil society organizations. Not only they increased their informed participation, but they started to develop new projects.

And the tools, they also inspired academics for new research projects. They started to ask research questions, and they also, some included the tools in their curricula. So, we see that, and based on our advocacy on open data, inclusive data and open data, and we only use open data, the public data, to create the maps. And then we collect data from municipalities on their services and aids to pin them on the map. So, we see that more data is inclusive and more data is openly shared, more digital policy tools can make sense of this data for decision makers to make cities more equal and more sustainable. Thank you very much.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Thank you, Itir. So, now it's a good time to some many questions maybe. Anyone have any question for this presentation? Someone want to ask maybe? Go ahead, Ken, please.

KEN HERMAN:

Yes, thank you very much. Ken Herman for the record. Thanks for a very interesting presentation on the open data. I'm interested in and it was apparent to me where some of the data is coming from, some of it from government reports, some of it self-reported, but in the earlier examples that you gave it was unclear to me, especially where you were mapping things where people can make decisions and maybe there

were some income levels, for example. Is that also drawn from economic data or are there independent assessments of where the underlying data is coming from? Perhaps you can share a little bit more in depth about-- Because the whole thing is about where is it, where is this information stemming from? Thank you.

ITIR AKDOGAN:

Thank you very much. The market value data and municipalities, they identify the market value of every street and they have to publish this online. Sometimes you can find the whole data set at once and sometimes you have to collect street by street and so it depends on the municipalities, but they at the end have to publish it anyway. So, this is data from municipalities.

KEN HERMAN:

Ken Herman, again. If I may, how often is that data refreshed and does your organization sort of oversee or have any, I don't want to say responsibility, but do disclose on the sites that this data may not be up to date or it is in fact up to date and it is constantly refreshed?

ITIR AKDOGAN:

It is updated every four years, if I'm not wrong. I have to confirm that with my team, but as far as I know, it is updated every four years and we always enter the year so you can see from which year the market value data is from.

KEN HERMAN:

Okay, thanks. So, one last question then. I mean it sounds all very nice. Perhaps you can share what some of the challenges that you've had in creating these kinds of systems and in even promoting their use or in how useful it is. I see that you said that there were some success stories where decisions were being made based upon what you presented here, but tell us about the difficulties that you have had to overcome and you still are facing today.

ITIR AKDOGAN:

Well, the biggest challenge is to collect the data because when, on my first slide, when I wrote good governance and how these tools might also help increase collaboration and accountability and transparency, we see that not only public institutions and municipalities, they don't share data among each other, but they don't even share data within the same institution among different units of the same institution. They don't share and they don't even know.

So, we see waste of resources when they duplicate the work because they don't know that next door in the next room, the same data set is actually being created and when it is time to collect that data, it takes us too long time for them to prepare to fill in our Excel, for instance. So, the collection of data is, I think, is the biggest challenge. And they don't always make sense of big data and that is the reason, one of the reasons why we have these tools. When we constantly meet with them to also receive feedback, sometimes they don't even know that it's made with the data that they provided to us because they never thought of using

their data in a more accessible way, in a more like color-coded way, etc. So, that is one challenge.

And the last challenge will be the updating, of course, because when we when we prepare these tools, we also train municipal staff for them to update themselves. It is like the control panel, the admin panel, we also have those and they normally could update their data, but only some municipalities agree to do that because it's a work in plus for them. It's some tool that is created outside of their institution. Some, they accept it and they find them as a way to show to their citizens, to the constituencies, that they are happy to, they are open to share data, they are open to transparency and participation, citizen participation, etc.

Those municipalities, they do update themselves. All the rest, we have to update. And that requires resources, etc. So, that's the challenge. That is why I like very much to tell about the advantages to inspire municipalities. But thank you very much for your questions.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Thank you, Itir. I had a following question about the data collection, but you have told very well. And just maybe a short following question, maybe a big question, but I think it could be short. Because it's like, okay, how these tools that you show us are improving or helping or supporting or something like that to decision-making policy. It's how that tools are helping to do that decision-making policies. That's maybe a big question.

ITIR AKDOGAN:

Yeah, it is a big question. I can speak two hours about it, but I think the most important points and these tools make social and economic inequalities very visible on the map. So even if decision makers, they have some idea of where in their city the more vulnerable citizens live, they are not always able to understand fully before they sit on the map. And because sometimes it's really striking differences of inequalities and opportunities in the city. So, that, like when you see clearly on the map, it makes a difference. And so, this is like when I list the impacts, when we see how the special decision of a municipality changes, when we see how they think of including new performance indicators in their strategic planning, then we see that it actually has an impact. But of course, it's always open to be improved.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Thank you very much. I'm sorry, I have seen more hands here, but I have one question in the chat, and I think it's a short one. I need to move forward to the next presentation. So, the question is that if you are using data from Turkish Statistical Institute or not. The question is from Ali.

ITIR AKDOGAN:

The demographic data, yes, is from the Turkish TUIK. And actually, I have to say that, well, there are limitations of data. That's a big challenge in the country. And since we need neighborhood-based data, neighborhood-level data, TUIK is the Turkish National Statistic Institution. TUIK's demographic data in neighborhood level is only

limited to five or six variables. So, we have to be creative, like the market value. Yeah. So, that also needs to be improved. Yeah.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Thank you, Itir. Kathy, did you want to add something?

KATHY KLEIMAN: Very, very short. I just wanted to say thank you. That was very interesting and very special. So, thank you very much.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Thank you, Kathy. So, we have another one presentation. This is remote presentation. It's from Dr. Fatih Sinan Esen. I'm sorry, again, for my bad Turkish. But as a short introduction, Dr. Fatih Sinan is a senior computer scientist, researcher, and author. He's a specialist in advanced technology, areas such as artificial intelligence, large language models, open data, and metaverse. He is also working in topics such as ethical and responsible use of these technologies and combating disinformation. So, I know that we have Dr. Fatih online. So maybe you can hear us. Can you activate your mic, I think? Or maybe we can do the possible to activate his mic because he's remote.

ANDREA GLANDON: Yes, he is here and we have tested his audio. So, he's good.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Okay, thank you.

FATIH SINAN ESEN: May I begin?

ANDREA GLANDON: Yes, you can begin.

FATIH SINAN ESEN: Okay. Dear respected moderator and valued participants, first of all, thank you very much for the kind introduction and for giving me the opportunity to share my thoughts today. It's truly a pleasure to be here among such esteemed colleagues. And I look forward to contributing to our valuable discussions. While most of you are enjoying the ambience in person, I'm joining you from my virtual office today. And I don't have any PowerPoint presentations because I want to save your eyes. I wish to just speak.

First of all, I wish to spend some time on the country and the ecosystem. Despite economic and geographical turbulences and disasters in this geography, Turkey has made substantial progress in adopting technology as well as open data and acknowledging their transformative potential to foster innovation, enhance transparency, and drive economic growth. Our commitment to open data is exemplified by a myriad of initiatives and the establishment of an evolving ecosystem that promotes collaboration and co-creation

among governmental entities, private sector stakeholders, and civil society organizations.

In Turkey, open data initiatives are primarily focused on the standardization and facilitation of data sharing within public institutions in general. So, these efforts are strategically aligned with the European Union's objectives to establish a cohesive digital market which is supported by the development of robust data sharing frameworks. And the European Union member states actively encourage data exchange and processing across sectors such as mobility, energy, agriculture, health, and as well as tourism.

The emphasis in Turkey is on the public sector with a concerted effort to standardize and refine governmental data holdings which hold considerable potential for advancing public welfare, of course. Critical initiatives including the National Data Dictionary for example and broader open data endeavors are integral to improving data quality and ensuring standardization. As a matter of fact, a prominent example is the public data space project run by governments designed to enable public institutions to access one another's data in anonymized and systematically cataloged manner rather than just developing on unprocessed data forms etc., as usual.

So, this strategy aims to catalyze the development of data-driven and AI-centric projects at both the expert and administrative levels while simultaneously minimizing the redundancy of data collection across the institutions, thus optimizing resource utilization of course. The public data space also serves as a foundational infrastructure for open

data portals, enabling the distribution of standardized and anonymized data to the public and the industry.

Additionally, as my colleague Dr. Akdoğan stated, Turkish municipalities have been proactive in developing open data portals, offering citizens and businesses, industry access to an extensive array of information which they produce or the people produce. These municipalities provide data sets across various domains such as transportation and environmental factors and health and health care or well-being.

And what we do at the Open Data and Technology Association which has an abbreviated name of AVTED, we say in Turkish AVTED, we have undertaken numerous initiatives aimed at advancing the adoption of open data and nurturing an ecosystem conducive to collaboration among diverse stakeholders locally. And over the past three years, we have systematically organized governance and administrative meetings including bi-weekly board meetings and semi-annual general assembly meetings. Furthermore, we have adhered to obligations including the submission of annual declarations to the Ministry of Interior Affairs and maintaining requisite registry books, thereby ensuring compliance with all regulatory frameworks.

A central focus of our endeavor has been the cultivation of a robust open data culture with an emphasis on fostering collaboration among the volunteers. To this end, we have facilitated numerous virtual assemblies to connect open data advocates including the Open Data Volunteers Meeting which provided a platform for discourse and idea

exchange. And complementing these virtual engagements, we have also hosted in-person events such as the Open Data Gatherings aimed at bringing together open data practitioners and domain experts from various fields to promote knowledge exchange and cultivates a cohesive community dedicated to open data initiatives.

Our contributions to raising public awareness regarding open data have been significant. We have organized several open data summits with distinct thematic foci. For example, the 2023 summit titled *No Data, No Crisis* focused on earthquake in Turkey, earthquake preparedness, we can say, and response and was conducted in a virtual format. In 2024 our summit *What Does Open Data Provide to Businesses* was held in-person in Istanbul emphasizing the utility of open data in the business sector. These summits have functioned as critical platforms to highlight the role of open data in mitigating crises and risks and to articulate its value across various industrial sectors spanning from tourism, health and agriculture and the disaster management.

In line with our mission to increase awareness, we have launched multiple outreach initiatives which included conducting visits to municipalities, non-governmental organizations and public institutions. These initiatives were designed to advocate for the integration of open data practices in public services and to demonstrate the transformative potential of data transparency in enhancing public accountability and fostering innovation.

In the context of the 2024 local elections, for example, we issued a public call in Turkey urging electoral candidates to incorporate open

data initiatives into their platforms such as open data portals, emphasizing the importance of transparency and accountability in local governance. We have also actively pursued partnerships with local governments to implement impactful projects. A notable example is our collaboration with Tuzla municipality which is a big municipality in Istanbul.

We have served as the technical lead for the development of Tuzla municipality open data portal. This project aimed to make municipal data accessible in reusable formats, benefiting a broad array of stakeholders including academics and entrepreneurs and the general public. Additionally, we organized the open data-based smart city software competition in partnership with Tuzla municipality which exemplifies our commitment to leveraging open data for innovative and practical applications to address urban challenges.

Beyond events and partnerships, I want to say we have produced a diverse range of content to enhance awareness in public and understanding of open data. The Open Data Stories series we have, for instance, spotlighted exemplary open data initiatives from around the world, featuring projects from New York City, Ukraine and Germany. And furthermore, the Open Podium program we have, which we are broadcasting on YouTube, it initiated in January 2020, continued to expand its reach, reaching a total of 40 episodes by October 2024. Each episode explored different facets of open data technology, as well as transparency, and was disseminated across multiple social media channels to maximize audience engagement. If I'm not mistaken, it was in Spotify as well.

Let's come to our Open Data Index. In 2022, we launched our inaugural Open Data Index, evaluating the open data portals of just five metropolitan municipalities in Turkey. The main objective was to advance open data practices meaningfully, locally. First, we aim to encourage municipalities to adopt data standards and align with international norms, fostering a culture of openness and supporting transparency at all governance levels. We also sought to provide a comprehensive analysis of how open data is published and utilized, gaining insights into its role in accountability, innovation and social impact. This helped identify areas where improvements could benefit communities.

Another goal was to promote healthy competition among municipalities. The index allowed local governments to gauge their progress, fostering continuous improvement by showcasing successes, of course, and identifying growth opportunities. Lastly, we aim to inspire municipalities from the very small one to the large one, the big ones, to start open data initiatives. I mean, we aim to inspire all of them. And by highlighting early adopters, we sought to ignite interest and demonstrate the benefits of open data, offering a vision, of course, a vision of its possibilities.

Our well-structured methodology in Open Data Index involves evaluating the municipalities in three dimensions. First one is readiness, which has a weight of 30% to the overall points. And the second one is implementation, 50% effect. And the last one, the last dimension is impact, which has, of course, the remaining 20% of the weight. So, readiness assessed preparation for open data initiatives

and implementation examined the quality of practices and, of course, impact measured social and economic outcomes and impacts. Each dimension had specific questions and items weighted by expert input, similar to the Open Data Barometer, which is being published by World Wide Web Foundation internationally. This index provided a baseline for us for understanding open data among Turkish municipalities and highlighted areas for, of course, development.

And building on the previous year, our 2023 index, just one year later, expanded to cover 12 metropolitan and 5 district municipalities this time, totaling of 17 municipalities. It means a 2.5-fold increase in just one year. So, it's a big incentive for the municipalities to take part in our indexes. We believe that these indices serve as tools for benchmarking, encouraging best practices and fostering transparency and innovation. By offering clear assessments and actionable insights, we continue to advance open data initiatives.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Fatih, sorry. We have a question in the chat. Maybe I can share the question for you. Excuse me for the interruption, but we are short of time. So, the question is from Ali Kaner and says about the future goals. What are the top priorities for Turkey in the open data index for the coming years and what milestones are needed to reach these goals?

FATIH SINAN ESEN:

Dear Mr. Moderator, please, first of all, let me finish my speech, then I will answer all the questions. Thank you. Then to sum up, Turkey's

open data landscape is evolving rapidly, supported by the government's strategic initiatives, collaborative efforts and steadfast commitment to leveraging data for societal and economic advancement. So, we firmly believe that our country's technological potential and bolstered by a dynamic open data ecosystem sets the stage for a future--

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Sorry, Fatih, how many time are you left for your presentation?

FATIH SINAN ESEN: Just last two sentences. Last two sentences.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Okay, go ahead.

FATIH SINAN ESEN: Thank you very much. So, to craft effective policies, collective action is essential for us, uniting diverse perspectives and expertise. We warmly invite volunteers to join us in AVTED in this endeavor, as their participation is crucial for building a resilient and informed and proactive society. Together we can harness, we believe, harness the power of open data to create a safer and more prosperous future for all. Thank you. Now I can get the questions.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS:

Thank you. Thank you very much. We have no time now for questions because we are running out of time. So, thank you for coming, for being here. Maybe the people can write the questions on the chat. Maybe Dr. Fatih can write them. Because we need to move to another one. Where is Dennis? Over there. Yeah, to someone from house, from home, it's Dennis.

Dennis Chang is from PPSAI IRT, I think. So, we have like 10 minutes. I'm sorry for that. But it's a pleasure for you to have accepted our invitation to be in this table, in this meeting, to introduce us a little bit about this topic, the public privacy proxy services, something like that. Sorry, it's like a bit miss it. So, Dennis, thank you for being here. So, the floor is yours.

DENNIS CHANG:

Thank you for the invitation. Next slide. My name is Dennis Chang. I'm with ICANN Org. I'm a GDD program director, and I'm responsible for this policy implementation, specifically PPSAI implementation project. And it's a consensus policy from GNSO. So, I'll give you a little background, and as you requested, give you some overview, and then provide you with the project status and the awesome challenges that we're facing as we implement this policy. And I'll extend an invitation to one of our sessions later this week.

So, this policy, Privacy Proxy Service Accreditation Issues, PPSAI, refers to an effort going way back to 2013 to look at the way that we develop requirements related to privacy and proxy services. And of course, it's about the registration of domain names. Now in 2016, the Board

adopted the GNSO final report on PPSAI. This is a consensus policy that was generated by GNSO, and Board has to adopt them. And when the Board adopts, it becomes a project given to ICANN Org, the staff, me, to implement.

Now, the policy was started in that time for implementation, but then it was put on pause. Why? Because at that time, there was GDPR came on, and something called EPDP, if you recall, a temporary specification was issued, and that a lot of the issues that they were dealing with became redundant and overlapping. So, we decided to put the implementation on pause. Now in June of last ICANN meeting, ICANN80, we actually resumed that implementation by kicking off the project with an IRT.

So, the PPSAI Final Report that we need to implement contains 21 policy recommendations, and they deal with the definitions of what privacy and proxy services are, and terms and conditions that these service provider must provide, and how to label them, and relay the message, and so on and so forth. The implementation project takes these recommendations language, and we review them. We analyze them and design and produce the consensus policy language that we publish for the contracted parties to implement. Here, the contracted parties, I mean the registry operators and registrars. They have contracts with the ICANN Org that requires them to perform certain duties in certain ways.

The IRT members are supported by volunteers from the community, and we gather them because of their knowledge of the privacy proxy in

terms of policy, but also because of their expertise in practicing the policies or services themselves. And the way we do this is we have this IRT, and the IRT has appointed liaison to the GNSO Council who will take certain items to the council for further guidance when the policy recommendations language are not straightforward or is subject to multiple and different interpretation. All of these will be, of course, drafted and published for public comment before we finalize anything.

So, since the '19, right, we've been monitoring, and as I said that we resumed it. Now, when did we do that, and what caused it? In February 2024, this year, we published a consensus policy called registration data policy, and that policy established fundamental sort of a foundational level of how we treat or process the registration data, how we collect them, transfer them, escort them, publish them, and retain them. And we have started that work beginning, as I said, at our last ICANN meeting with the IRT, and we have been reviewing these recommendations, and there have been over 100 comments and sharing of our concerns about how we might implement these policies.

At this ICANN meeting, ICANN81, we'll conduct an IRT session where the IRT members will share their current practice on how they do privacy proxy and their current experiences. And this is particularly important because recommendations language that we are asked to implement was written so long ago, and so much has happened. The industry has changed. So, it's important that the implementation team understands what the current marketplaces look like before we try to design the new policy model or policy implementation.

So, with all these recommendations language, what we'll have to do is look at the language to see which ones are still consistent with how we do our business, but other recommendations language are not so straightforward. For example, the definitions that we're asked to use in the recommendations may not be good or consistent with the industry definition that is commonly used. So, we'll have to look at that. And challenges as there's many terms being defined in the recommendations language, such as beneficial owner, beneficial user, or register name, order, or even registrant.

These terms need to be very clear when we publish our policy so that we know the business entity that are responsible and accountable and culpable and how do we label these services if the service is used. Is it privacy or proxy? Does that come across clearly? And does the recommendation have enough for us to do this? So, all these questions we are dealing with right now. And what we are doing is forming our own questions around what we call three threshold questions.

ANDREA GLANDON:

We only have one minute left, Dennis.

DENNIS CHANG:

Yeah. So, these are the three threshold questions. And basically, we are asking the fundamental question, can this policy be implemented as they're written, or do we have to get further guidance on them? Next. This is a pictorial view of what we are showing you as after we do all our homework and research, we need to make some decisions on how we

go forward. So, invitation to you. Come learn about the privacy proxy policy implementation at our session later this week. You can join the IRT if you like. They're open. And all our public information that we're working with is on the wiki. That's it. Thank you.

JUAN MANUEL ROJAS: Thank you, Dennis. I'm sorry for the short time. But very informative. Thank you. We have some questions in the chat that we cannot answer right now. But thank you, everyone, for joining us. It was very informative session. Very short of time, but we have some very interesting speakers today. And thank you, everyone. Thank you, Itir, for being here. Thank you, Dr. Fatih. He's over there remotely. Thank you, Dennis, for coming. I think that's it for now. Thank you very much.

ANDREA GLANDON: Thank you. You can stop the recording.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]