
ICANN84 | AGM – How It Works: ICANN Policy
Saturday, October 25, 2025 – 13:15 to 14:30 IST

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you. Welcome back to the next session for getting to know how ICANN work, and this session we will devote to policy development. It's one of the important directions how the ICANN community and ICANN itself works and it's my-- before introducing the presenter, Fernanda, can I ask you to read the script, please? Thank you.

FERNANDA LUNES

Thanks, Siranush. Hello and welcome to the How It Works ICANN Policy Session. My name is Fernanda Lunes and I'm a Participation Manager. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior and the ICANN Community Anti-Harassment Policy.

Please observe the following guidelines to participate in this session. I'll also post them in the chat for your reference in just a few minutes. Only questions posted in the Q&A pod will be read aloud during the session as time permits and when directed by the chair of the session. If you wish to speak, please raise your hand in Zoom or otherwise as directed.

When speaking, please state your name for the record and speak clearly at a moderate pace. If you'd like to speak during the

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

session, please raise your hand in Zoom and when called upon, remote participants will be given permission to unmute.

On-site participants will use a physical microphone to speak. Please state your name for the record, the language you will speak if speaking a language other than English, and speak clearly at a moderate pace. Interpretation for this session will include English, French, and Spanish.

All are welcome to use the chat. Please note that private chats are only possible among panelists in the Zoom webinar format. Any message sent by a panelist or a standard attendee to another standard attendee will also be seen by the session hosts, co-hosts, and other panelists. All right, and with that, I'll hand it back over to Siranush. Welcome, everybody.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you, Fernanda. And without further ado, I would like to introduce our presenter, Ozan Sahin. Carlos Reyes, our colleague who initially planned to be here, he will not be able to join us, but Ozan knows pretty well about everything what's going on the policy level. And it's my pleasure to have you here with us, Ozan. The floor is yours.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you, Siranush and Fernanda. Good afternoon, everyone. I'm Ozan, a member of the ICANN Post-Development Support Team. I've been with ICANN for more than 11 years now, and it is actually

great to be here with you this afternoon, although it's kind of hard to get back to work after the lunch, but we'll try.

So, we are here today to talk about the ICANN policy and advice development, but let's first start with what ICANN is and what ICANN does. Sometimes you may hear from people that ICANN runs the internet, but that is actually not true. ICANN does not function to run the internet alone. ICANN actually works with the partners to help make the internet work. Partners such as the Internet Engineering Task Force, partners such as the Regional Internet Registries, and the like.

So, if we can go to the next slide, let's see what ICANN's mission is. And on the slide, you see that ICANN's mission is to ensure stable and secure operation of the internet's Unique Identifier Systems. So, that is ICANN's mission, and ICANN, in its remit, plays its role in helping to make the internet function. Let's go to the next slide, Siranush.

In performing this mission, ICANN has some commitments and core values to act, and these commitments are preserving and enhancing the stability, security, and resiliency, and openness of the DNS and the internet, and then employing an open, transparent, and bottom-up multi-stakeholder postal process that are led by private sector, and then operating with efficiency and excellence in a fiscally responsible and accountable manner is also a value that ICANN has.

So, these are all important, especially the words that you see that are bold in here. You see in all the steps taken by ICANN, these are valued and underlined. Let's go to the next slide, Siranush. You may have seen this slide before. This diagram shows the relation between the ICANN community, ICANN Board, and the ICANN organization.

So very briefly, ICANN community develops the policies and then provides advice on the policies that are being developed, and then finally, recommends these policies to the ICANN Board, and then it is the ICANN Board that makes the final decision about these policies and then asks the ICANN organization to implement those when they are approved by the ICANN Board.

And then the ICANN organization implements, once we have policies, ICANN organization implements those, takes necessary measures to what is needed to implement those policies, and also there's a relationship between the ICANN organization and the community.

So, just like my department, ICANN policy development support department, ICANN organization also supports the ICANN community when the community is developing policies or developing advice on the policies that are being developed. So, let's go to the next slide, Siranush.

What is the multi-stakeholder community? The ICANN community is volunteer-based, and this is important. Again, you will see many participants during this meeting who are coming to this meeting on

a volunteer basis, and also not only coming to this meeting, as we go through the slides, you will understand that most of the work is done online between the in-person meetings through teleconferences.

So this volunteer community is participating in all of these in-person and online meetings to continue to work, continue to develop policies, and continue to develop advice. And this is a community group is working together, and the process is a bottom-up process, meaning that it is the community developing the policies and recommending to the ICANN Board. It's not coming from top to down, but it's being developed from bottom and being recommended to the top for adoption. Thank you, Siranush.

And also, you will see the community is diverse. You will see people coming from different backgrounds, with different interests, representing different groups, and these groups would include the businesses and the internet engineers. You will see technical experts, there's civil society, governments, end users, and others. Let's go to the next slide.

So in ICANN, the multi-stakeholder model works through supporting organizations and advisory committees. Does anyone know how many supporting organizations we have? Please go ahead.

TINUADE OGUNTUYI Thank you. We have the Address Supporting Organization, we have the generic name, the GNSO, that's the Generic Name Supporting Organization, and we have the ccNSO, which is the Country Code Names Supporting Organization.

OZAN SAHIN Thank you. These are true. And what about the advisory committees? Anyone knows how many advisory committees we have? Yes, please go ahead again.

TINUADE OGUNTUYI Tinuade Oguntuyi for the record. Okay, we have four. We have the ALAC, which is the At-Large Advisory Committee, we have the GAC, which is the Government Advisory Committee, we have the RSSAC, which is the Root Service Systems Advisory Committee, and the fourth one is the SSAC, which is the Security And Stability Advisory Committee.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN Well done.

OZAN SAHIN Very well done. Thank you. Yes, these are the four advisory committees and three supporting organizations that we have. And let us go ahead and take a closer look to what they do. So, let's go to the next slide and review these supporting organizations and advisory committees.

So the three supporting organizations, starting with the address supporting organizations, they develop policies for IP addresses, and then the generic name supporting organization develop policies for generic Top-Level Domains, and the ccNSO, or Country Code Names Supporting Organization, develops policies for country code Top-Level Domains.

On the other hand, the four advisory committees provide advice in their areas, and one is the governments and international trade organizations for the governmental advisory committee. We have the root server operators represented in the Root Server System Advisory Committee. The internet security experts are grouped in the security and stability advisory committee, and the voice of the end users that I can is the At-Large.

So, let's go to the next slide. And on the slide, you again see these four advisory committees and three supporting organizations in total, seven groups. And let's go to the next one. So taking a closer look, for the address supporting organization that deals with the policy development for IP addresses, it is the address supporting organization address council that is responsible for this task, for the policy development.

And it is composed of 15 volunteers, and there are five regional internet registries for different regions, and three from each of these five regional internet registries make up the 15 volunteers in the ASO address council. It is both the ccNSO council and the

ccNSO members who work on the global policies on the country called top-level domain names, just like .br or .uk.

And lastly, for the GNSO, there is a GNSO council which is composed of 21 members, and for balanced representation, there are like two houses in the GNSO councils for a balanced representation of different interests. And there's a Contracted Parties House, and there's a Non-Contracted Parties House, and the GNSO council works on the generic Top-Level Domains and the policy development on a Generic Top-Level Domains.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

And before Ozan will continue, just to let you know that today and tomorrow we will explore those specific communities in action, so they will come and talk about what they are specifically do, and how you can get engaged. So, this is just the overview of the system, of the process, and then you will hear from each and every one of them. Thank you, Ozan.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you for this intervention, Siranush. Let's go to the-- Yes, this is an illustration of how the policy development works in each of these three supporting organizations. I know the font is very small here, but I believe the slide deck is or will be available, so you can review this slide on your own as well. But what's important to note here is that in these phases, there's the identification of an issue, so there are common themes in these policy development processes,

like the identification of an issue, and then a scoping phase, and the initiation of a policy process, and then this is usually followed by a Final Report and a vote on this.

So, these are steps on this illustration, but the policy development work can take some time. It can take several years to complete, and when finally, you have a Final Report that is vetted by the relevant organization council here, it is up for the ICANN Board to consider this, consider the recommendations from a final report.

What is also important in these phases is there are opportunities for feedback as you go through. So, for instance, in the GNSO, Generic Name Supporting Organization post-development process, if you look at phase two, step two, when there is a Preliminary Issue Report that is put together by the staff, it is up for a Public Comment for feedback from everyone, from basically the ICANN community.

And then this is when and how the feedback is gathered from the rest of the ICANN community, not only within the GNSO necessarily, but from a broader group to consider, and before you move on with the policy development process, you get all the feedback from the community, and then consider, and then go through the process.

Let's go to the next one, Siranush, and talk about the advisory committees a bit. So again, we have four advisory committees, and the first one, ALAC, is the group that voices the interests of the individual internet users, and the ALAC is composed of 15

members. So again, similarly, there are five regional At-Large organizations, based on regions, and there are two representatives from these regional At-Large organizations, or RALOs, in the ALAC, and five of the members in the ALAC are appointed by the ICANN nominating committee.

And also, ALAC has over 200 At-Large structures, which are the grassroots feeding At-Large. Governmental Advisory Committee provides advice on public policy issues, and you will see representatives of the governments in the GAC, or Governmental Advisory Committee, so they have a particular interest on the national laws and international agreements as policy development process relates to them.

And in the Root Server System Advisory Committee, we have the representatives from the root server operators. Does anyone know how many root server operators we have? Oh, I see some hands from my left. Please go ahead.

SAMEER GAHLOT

Yeah, my name is Sameer Gahlot, ICANN84 fellow for the records. There are 13 root servers currently. One, three, 13.

OZAN SAHIN

Three?

SAMEER GAHLOT

Oh, 13.

OZAN SAHIN

That is true, there are 13 root servers, but we have 12 root server operators because one of them runs two of them, so we have 12 of them. And in the RSSAC, we have representatives, a primary representative and an alternate representative from each of the root server operators, 12 root server operators, and representatives from partners in the root zone. So, RSSAC advises the ICANN Committee and the ICANN Board on the operation, administration, security, and integrity of the root server system.

And finally, we have the Security and Stability Advisory Committee or SSAC, and it is composed of security experts for the internet and provides advice on matters related to the security and integrity of the internet's naming and address allocation systems. So, these are the three supporting organizations and four advisory committees.

Let's go to the next slide. And this is, again, an illustration of how the advice development works for these four advisory committees. And let's go back, Siranush, and talk more about this illustration. I'm, for instance, supporting the At-Large Advisory Committee's policy advice development process. And by the way, ICANN Post-Development Support Team has members supporting each of these supporting organizations and advisory committees.

So not necessarily one member of the ICANN Post-Development Team would support all of the post-development processes that ICANN, across the different supporting organizations, follows the

advice development process across the four. But we have dedicated teams supporting the work of each of these seven structures.

So, At-Large is one of the groups that I'm supporting. The way the advice development works is that when there's a Public Comment that's published, for instance, the At-Large Consolidated Policy Working Group, there's a Working Group for that, reviews it. If it relates to end-users, if they think this Public Comment would, or the topic would impact the end-users, then they would form a group, which would come up with some bullet points on how this can impact the end-users.

And then, once the group feels that these bullet points can be shared with the Working Group, the broader Working Group, Consolidated Policy Working Group, they present it. And then, once they agree on the bullet points, they then move on with drafting the At-Large advice.

So there's a small group that initiates that. And then, with respect to how you can get involved in all of these is based on your expertise or interest, when you decide to take part in any of these groups, you can start observing this advice or policy development work. And then, as you see people drafting text and contributing to this work, you can also start contributing and being part of these small groups and then move on from there.

So again, whatever is drafted as ALAC advice for a particular topic would go through a ratification process. And if ratified, it would be

published as a, like, advice or statement. So, let's go to the next slide now and talk about Public Comment process, which is very significant in the ICANN community, because it gives the ICANN community the opportunity to provide input on ICANN's work and policy.

So, we just talked about the GNSO post-development process. And some of the steps in this process included publication of a report for Public Comment. So, this is the opportunity of the ICANN community to provide their input on this, on the policy development, on the policies that are being developed or provide their view for consideration. If it's a Working Group that is seeking input on a particular post-development process you would provide your view and then make them consider your view before they move on.

So, this also gives ICANN an opportunity to fulfil its accountability commitments. The Public Comment is not only available for the post-development process. For instance, if there are any changes to ICANN bylaws this also needs to go through Public Comment. You need to get the feedback from ICANN community and then take action.

Let's go to the next slide, Siranush, and talk a bit more about how Public Comment works. There is a structure in how Public Comment works. So, it is easier for the ICANN community to submit their input to any of these processes. So, a proceeding opens, again, this can be on review recommendations, this can be

on governance documents, this can be on a registry agreement, and then once the proceeding opens, a minimum of 40-day period would start.

It can be longer than 40 days based on the topic or based on the needs of the group that are seeking Public Comment. But there are also some exceptions, like if in the bylaws it is mandated that this Public Comment proceeding would last for less than 40 days, then it's less than 40 days. There may be exceptions at times, but in general, it is open for a minimum of 40 days. And the ICANN Board can open a Public Comment supporting organizations, advisory committees, their Working Groups, or the ICANN organization, they can all open Public Comment proceedings. Let's go to the next slide.

And then, once the proceeding is open, it's time for the stakeholders to provide their input. They read the proposal on the Public Comment and determine if this is within their scope, this is within their remit, if this impacts their constituents. And also, on the Public Comment webpage, you will find relevant resources, like you will find different sections for exactly the document for which the comment is being sought. And then, you will find additional supporting documents that are related for you to formulate your comment and develop your comment.

Anyone can make a submission to the Public Comment proceeding. Individuals can submit Public Comments. And oftentimes, we see that ICANN groups would like to submit a collective comment, like

the comment of At-Large advisory committee, the comment of the governmental advisory committee. So, if the groups are able to develop a group comment after deliberations, they like, submitting it as a group comment, and they do that often.

And then, as I said, community groups, governments, civil society, corporations sometimes submit comments as a corporation. And also, individual end users, individuals can also submit them. They may be supporting the document or recommendations that are up for Public Comment, or they can disagree with the recommendations and bring up the concerns or problems with the recommendations that are suggested in the Public Comment.

And then, what is really cool is that all submissions are public and available. So, when you're making a comment, you also agree to the fact that it will be publicly available. And then, when you would like to review all the comments that are submitted for a Public Comment, you can go ahead and do that on the Public Comment webpage.

Let's go to the next slide. And then, the proceeding closes 40, 50 days after it opens depending on how long the proceeding is open. And then, the ICANN organization has 14 days to review the submissions and prepare a summary report. So, this summary report would provide you a list of all the individuals or groups who submitted a Public Comment and then provides an overview of the comments that they submitted.

So, this is a really useful summary. If you don't want to go through all of the comments submitted, you can just read through the summary and see which groups were basically agreeing with the recommendations or some of the recommendations, which groups or individuals disagreed with some of the recommendations. It's a good summary report that you can see after the proceeding closes.

And then the group that opened the proceeding reviews all of these submissions and the summary report and then they address the input and then they go to the next step. So if you think of a GNSO Working Group that is tasked with developing policy, for instance, let's say they published an initial report, open it up for Public Comment, then the Public Comment took let's say 40 days, it closed, the summary report was published and then the group comes together, reviews all of the comments submitted, reviews the summary report and then has a discussion on the feedback received and then they take decisions on the next steps.

Okay, so we are now transitioning to the beginner programs that we have at ICANN. We have three of them, but I'm sure Siranush knows these better than I do. Would you like to go through these or it's not? Okay. All right, let's then continue with how to get involved. Let's go back once and back to the previous slide. Yeah, the last one.

And talk about how you can get involved in the policy development and advice development process. So, we talked about different community groups and again, based on your interest, some of

them represent the end users, some of them represent the government, some of them represent the security experts but based on your background expertise, you can join one of the groups and start engaging with this group's policy development or advice development activities.

That's a good way to join ICANN policy development process. You can also join a beginner program as you are doing and learn more about the ICANN policy development process. And once you have joined, you can observe the running Working Groups and most of the Working Groups are open for participation and observation. So, you can start observing how a Working Group functions and start contributing when you feel comfortable.

And then we talked a bit about the Public Comment process. You can also, if there's anything that you like or you don't like about the proposals which are up for Public Comment, you can go ahead and write your Public Comment submitted. It will be available on the website and up for consideration of the group that's requesting Public Comment. I guess that's it for the slide deck and let's see if you have any questions at this point. Okay, I see one hand from the side, please go ahead.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Yes, Maciek, let's go. Let's start using this opportunity for asking Ozan whatever relates to the Public Comments proceeding, how it works and please tell us your name and speak at a reasonable pace

so our interpreters do not face challenges while translating all what you say. Thank you. Maciek, go ahead.

MACIEK PIASECKI

Hello, Maciek Piasecki, here. I'm ICANN fellow. Prior to coming here, I decided to issue a Public Comment and that was a very enlightening learning opportunity for me and I hope it will be helpful but I was wondering what happens next with the Public Comment. You've mentioned that it's being read and there's going to be a summary, right?

Can you give us maybe an example of when such a Public Comment made an actual difference and whether such a Public Comment from a user representative of not very high-profile organizations, is it even strongly considered versus the Public Comments I've seen done by companies like META or governments of big countries?

OZAN SAHIN

That's a great question, thank you. So, the last time I recall was a couple of months ago, I guess. It was ICANN organization who opened a Public Comment about bylaw changes, fundamental bylaw changes and then there was strong community disagreement through the comments submitted and then the proposal was just withdrawn and amended as an outcome of this Public Comment process.

So, ICANN organization heard what the community said and since there was disagreement, strong disagreement about what was

proposed about the bylaws changes, it was amended and then reshaped based on the comments received.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you. Om, please go ahead.

OM PRAKASH SHARMA

Hi, my name is Om from Nepal, ICANN fellow for the record. So, my question is how does the collaboration among different SO and ACs happen outside of the ICANN meetings? So, I was seeing the schedule, so there were a lot of cross-collaboration meetings, so I am wondering what happens outside the ICANN and how all of the people work together to work on the policy. Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you very much, again another great question. Again, as you said, during the ICANN public meetings, although all these groups have their own schedules throughout the week, they may have some joint meetings to exchange information among themselves.

Also, during the ICANN meeting, the leadership of these groups also meet around the roundtable on what we call Day Zero, even before the meeting starts today is day one, right? So that was probably yesterday. The leaderships also come together, discuss common issues to create a common understanding. But your question relates to outside of ICANN meetings, so how does that happen?

First of all, we talked about the Working Groups in the post-development process there, so we often observe that when a Working Group is set up, in order to ensure collaboration among different groups and interests, there is a call for volunteers from different groups in this Working Group. So, when a GNSO Working Group sets up, for instance, we often see that they invite the other supporting organizations and advisory committees to appoint representatives to this Working Group.

So, these representatives or liaisons, when they join the Working Group, they observe what is being discussed in the Working Group, and if there is anything that they think that may fall on the limit of their own group, they regularly report back. And then, if it makes sense to intervene and provide their own group's view in the Working Group process, they do that.

So this ensures, during the Working Group process, that different views and interests are being represented in the Working Group as the Working Group drafts its initial report and then the final report. That's, I think, very helpful in collaboration before they come up with the final report.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you. Kenny, go ahead.

KENNY

Hi, my name is Kenny, one of the ICANN fellows this year. So, my question is about the multi-stakeholder model. The model is

designed to ensure broad participation for everyone, and that's why we're all here today. But many of us start arguing that the model itself is becoming a bottleneck for the ICANN policy development because it really slows down everything. So, based on your experience, at what point does inclusivity undermine the effectiveness of the policy development? And in the near future, how does the ICANN try to find the balance?

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you. Another great question, just to make sure that I understand correctly, you're saying that the criticism is about multi-stakeholder models sometimes being a bottleneck and slowing down the process, right?

KENNY

Yes.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you. It is true that these Working Groups may function for several years at times, and sometimes there is criticism that it's taking a very long time to reach consensus and then come up with a Final Report and recommendations. But there's always a trade-off between taking all the views, addressing all different ideas, and then coming up with a solution that would work for everyone around the table.

So, that's why I think it's taking time. And if it needs to take time, it takes time. This is, I think, for the Working Groups to decide. But

what ICANN does to address this is another part of your question, I guess. And I can talk about the leadership program, the ICANN organization is offering, which tries to advance the skills of the ICANN community leaders who are sometimes leading the work of the work groups. And by advancing their skills, their ability to reach consensus, their ability to run Working Group meetings with participations with different interests also helps in the process, I guess.

And the other thing that I can mention is a policy accelerator program that ICANN organization is offering. So, individuals participating in the policy development process and who are new to this process with the policy accelerator program are meeting with seasoned members of the ICANN community and then taking online lessons about the policy development process and becoming familiar with the process. So, this is also a helpful tool to help new participants come up to speed and make them contribute to the process, which I think also adds to the efficiency of the policy development process in turn. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you, Ozan. We have a question over there and then we'll come back. Okay.

OZAN SAHIN

Yeah.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

When I'm asking if there are any questions, if you raise your hand, I will see you and I put in the line.

SAMEER GAHLOT

Yeah. Sameer for the record. So, the question is during the PDP, is there any survey or statistics on many organizations or whether we have appropriate representation from the global south or the global north? Is there any survey or statistics on what are the problems that they are currently facing?

OZAN SAHIN

Sorry, could you please repeat? Is there any...?

SAMEER GAHLOT

Is there any survey or stats wherein we could figure out during the PDP process which stakeholder or which region participated the most and what are the problems that they are facing in the participation or in submitting their comments?

OZAN SAHIN

So, I think one thing that continues to come up is the time zone issue when the Working Group is working. So, this is an environment where you have participants from all over the world and when you have a like Working Group meeting, you would want all of your volunteers or members, Working Group members to join and contribute, right? But sometimes it's just not possible for

somebody to continuously attend these meetings because they are in the time zone they are living.

The call is between their like midnight and 6 a.m. and that is a, I believe, a common barrier that we observe in participating these meetings. So, most of the groups, to share the burden of these time zone issue, they rotate their meeting times and also make the recordings available and most of the time you also see Action Items and the meeting summaries being made available by the staff on the dedicated Working Group pages.

So this is to help mitigate the again the barrier of time zone issue because there is no great time that works for the entire world. When you set up a meeting time and when you have participants from all over the world, some participants will suffer from bad time. So, one way is to rotate the meeting times so that it's not always the same geographic region or the participants that are suffering from this bad time. And then to, again, mitigate further, make it easier for these people who couldn't attend a particular meeting to follow via recordings, summary of the meeting, Action Items, and the like.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you. Koko?

KHUN SINT PHOO

Hi, this is Khun Sint Phoo from Myanmar. So, I'm a NextGen participant. So, my questions might be a little bit controversial, but

since there is no stupid question in ICANN, so let me ask. So, my question is that to what extent can advisory committees act independently without the influence of like industry, vendor, stakeholder, or government pressure?

OZAN SAHIN

May I ask you please to repeat the question?

KHUN SINT PHOO

Yes. To what extent can advisory committees act independently without the influence of industry, vendor, stakeholder, or maybe government pressure?

OZAN SAHIN

So, we mentioned four advisory committees.

KHUN SINT PHOO

Yes.

OZAN SAHIN

And they are grouped based on their, again, expertise and interests. So, if you ask me to what extent the Security and Stability Advisory Committee members are free from government pressure when they are producing their advice, I don't know. We just assume that they are free from government pressure. And I don't know, they are individuals, they are experts.

So, when you want to become a Security and Stability Advisory Committee member, you need to apply for it, right? And then this should be a really strong application proving all of your background accomplishments to show that you can be one of the Security and Stability Advisory Committee members, for instance. So, there's a membership group that reviews these applications and then finally, eventually approves the application and the applicant becomes an SSAC member.

So, I think it is the structure that each of these advisory committees set up to ensure that their members are strong enough to be free from government pressure. And also, once you join, in the case of an advisory committee of Security and Stability Advisory Committee, periodically, they review their members and their contributions. So, if the group feels that somebody is acting with pressure from some of the government, I believe the membership committee would address that and would bring it up in this case.

And then, there's the Root Server System Advisory Committee, which is composed of representatives from root servers. And then, by the way, root servers are the 12 root servers. Not all of them are based in the United States. I don't know if you know where they're based, but we have two root server operators in Europe. One is in Sweden, one is in the Netherlands, and there's one root server operator that's based in Japan. So, again, there's also some kind of balance in the sense, in the way root server operators are distributed and situated in the world.

And the Government Advisory Committee is just purely made of governments and international treaty organizations. So this is where you actually really hear the voice of government, government interests, what a particular government is advocating for. So, if you have time, or you'll, I think, hear from the GAC leadership as well, how the GAC works. So, that's where you hear about the voices of the government.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

And we'll have a GAC representative and presentation tomorrow, so you can listen from them. Ignacio, please go ahead.

IGNACIO SÁNCHEZ

Well, thank you. My name is Ignacio Sanchez, an ICANN84 fellow, too. My question concerns the participation of governments and international organizations under international law. I just heard we're having a GAC session another day, but maybe you can answer now. So, since these organizations, governments and international organizations participate officially in the GAC, are they expected also to provide input during the Public Comments, or their sole and official means of contributing is the GAC, considering that they do not have the voting rights under the bylaws? Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you. So, I would encourage you to ask again when you have this session with the GAC representative for maybe a better answer. But what I can say is that, if GAC is able to achieve consensus in

producing a GAC group advice, then GAC would publish that. And this comes in the form of a GAC communiqué, which is published after, typically after an ICANN public meeting.

So, if this is doable, then GAC does that. But if any member of the GAC would like to provide their own comment for a Public Comment proceeding, for instance, they are free to do so. So, they can go ahead and publish their comment individually for a Public Comment.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you. Tinuade Oguntuyi, please go ahead.

TINUADE OGUNTUYI

Thank you. Tinuade Oguntuyi once again, ICANN84 fellow. My questions are in two ways. Based on interaction and what I personally have observed, do I work with an ISP company in Nigeria? And I've been doing this for like over a decade. Coming into ICANN, I don't want to use the word that lack of better words, that looks a bit cumbersome. I'm speaking personally and based on my interaction.

So I'm just thinking, is it possible, based on some of the things you've shared with us, maybe the ICANN Learn courses are amazing and one can grasp a lot. But is it possible that it's structured in such a way, maybe even in civil society, I can have like a path that I can pursue, while some other things might just be additional for knowledge updates or just to know more about ICANN.

Also, the three parts that we have, like the Board, the community and the org, I assume that everybody that ends up in the Board is coming maybe from the community. Everybody that ends up in the org, maybe some of them, if not all, also comes from the community. What if I want to build a career path and like I want to work for ICANN? Is there like a pattern, like a structure to follow? That's one of the parts, just to help people settle in.

I'm not even talking about the acronyms I get with time. Joining meetings, everybody gets to know more about that. The second one that always confuses me is the nominating committee. I don't know if you can better explain what you do. Because while we were talking, you said for ALAC, there will be two representatives from the regional At-Large organizations and the remaining five would be nominated or appointed. I'm trying to see, nominated by NomCom. Can you explain how this works? How do they know this person fits right? Maybe the application process and all of that. Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you. As I was able to note down your questions, let me start with the first one. I think you mentioned whether it would be possible to restructure ICANN because you think it's cumbersome. These seven organizations, three supporting organizations and four advisory committees that we mentioned are in the ICANN bylaws. That's why we have them.

If at a point, ICANN community comes together and thinks that this structure doesn't work and we need a new structure, new supporting organization, new advisory committee, this can be proposed. It is the ICANN community to come together and then propose it.

TINUADE OGUNTUYI

The question is clear. I'm not even talking about the structure or the seven points. I'm talking of like an individual coming into ICANN and wants to follow a path. It's a multi-stakeholder environment. I deal in technical community because of the work I do professionally. I'm also a social impact person. I also have my art for civil society.

Some people might just be purely government. Some people might just be purely, I just want to be an end user to know. I'm just saying, is it possible? Not that the ICANN Learn courses will not be there. They will definitely be there. To form a structure, you can take this as an introduction. You can go to this next one. Just like somebody following a career path normally. If somebody comes into network engineering, for instance, I can tell them, go and write a computer exam or a CCNA exam for a start. So that you grab what this is all about. Then if you want to maybe now specialize in security, maybe you do this particular course. That's what I'm saying. With the seven structures, that's not what I am. Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you for clarifying. I can provide a few answers to that. When somebody comes to an ICANN meeting and solves like 200 plus sessions and can't decide which one to go and decide what really is in perfect alignment with their own interests or expertise. I think one tool that we have is the newcomers' program. You're here, you will be hearing from all of these supporting organizations and advisory committees' leadership on what they do and then how they are organized.

I think the primary objective of organizing the sessions is to give you an idea on how these structures work and where you may be best fit. That is one thing. The other thing when you organize your ICANN meeting schedule for yourself, the sessions are tagged with some color coding. If you want to follow some technical track, there will be a color coding for technical sessions that you can focus on. If you want to follow governance issues, there's color coding for different interests for that.

The third thing I would mention is for somebody who may have interest in more than one topic and doesn't know where to go exactly. These groups also offer some engagement sessions with the community to just take questions and then open it up a bit more to the ICANN community on what they do. For instance, Root Server System Advisory Committee and Security Stability Advisory Committee will offer an open mic. I believe that is on Wednesday morning or Tuesday morning.

Anyone interested in the technical side of things and would like to engage with these groups and ask questions, they go to the session directly and ask them. In addition to this beginner sessions that we're offering, we also have How It Works Sessions. This is to, again, make you understand how the root server system works in detail if you have interest to understand how it works. There's a session for that.

If you're interested in knowing more about the regional internet registries and the numbers community and how IP addresses are allocated, then there's a how it works session for the Regional Internet Registries, RIRs. You can go listen and ask questions. I think all of this will help you determine what sessions at an ICANN public meeting really is of interest for you. This may be one or two ICANN meetings for you to fully understand. In the third one, you will get a sense of which sessions will most likely appeal to you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

I think I will add a couple of points here. Ozan perfectly shaped the process and the way how each can identify the best sector. The point here is that there is no specific template or guidance where you should go in order to get this. The idea of this onboarding session is to give you the entire understanding of this multi-sector model, because each and every one is coming with different expertise and each and every one can find a specific place where he or she wants to make an input.

I cannot come to you and say, no, you should be here, that's definitely, but I can advise you that there are this type of groups who may have similar like directions where your interests can fit and where your expertise and your voice will matter there. But overall, there is no like structured, you need to go here, you need to go here. No, you need to find out the bigger picture that's what we can provide and then you can deep dive into the specific communities and on Tuesdays usually there is a constituency day we call here.

Each constituency, each group which was presented by Ozan, they have their own particular sessions, what they discuss, their membership sessions, where you can go, for example, you find like non-commercial stakeholder group or business constituency are like you want to go and learn more. This is how you on Tuesday pick up the sessions from this particular communities and go and listen how they work, what they discuss and how you can become a part of these discussions.

So, during the week, especially when you are a newcomer, you might have hard time to learning everything and about everyone. So, that's why you take this time, go back and listen to the recordings, maybe you want to be part of this community but when you go there and listen their discussions, you find out no, this is probably not the place I want to go.

So, it depends on your own interest and expertise and the learning way, the options which you may choose at the end. Okay? Thank you. Alfredo wants to add something on this but let's hear Ozan.

OZAN SAHIN

That was the first question and we had three.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Oh, yes.

OZAN SAHIN

So, let me continue with the other points that you brought up before we go to the next questioner. You also talked about the composition of the ICANN Board and the composition of ICANN organization, what if you wanted to work for ICANN organization and brought up all this.

So, starting with the ICANN Board composition, sometimes when you talk about ICANN Board, people think of individuals coming from nowhere and constituting a Board, but that is not the case. ICANN Board members are appointed by these supporting organizations advisory committees that we have just mentioned and then the nominating committee.

So, it is these committees and usually the seasoned members of these committees who run to become an ICANN Board member, and then these groups select their Board representatives. So, one of the groups that I'm supporting is Root Server System Advisory

Committee and I think their member serves for three years and then, every three-year, root server system advisory comes together to select their liaison to the Board. So, the Board is composed of the appointees from these organizations and again the appointments from the nominating committee.

And speaking of the nominating committee, nominating committee is also composed of members from supporting organizations and advisory committees, basically the ICANN community. So, again these groups make appointments to the NomCom, they make appointments to the ICANN Board and their well-known seasoned members who are elected to serve on these committees then serve.

One thing to note is that the structures of these are evolving, so it's not set in stone. For instance, for the composition of the nominating committee in the most recent organizational review of the NomCom, it was suggested that there were some changes suggested in the structure and initially the representatives from RSSAC, SSAC and GAC were non-voting liaisons in the NomCom. But then after these organizational review and suggested changes, they became voting delegates because the community wanted to do so. And then the years of service also changed.

Now all of the delegates serve for two years on the NomCom and they're all voting delegates and there's a like a staggering of terms to kind of keep some constitutional institutional knowledge within NomCom. So, these are evolving per the needs of the ICANN

community if there's a need. And lastly, it's working for ICANN organization, it's just like any organization. We are professional employees here, you just need to go to icann.org, go to careers webpage. If you see an open position that you think you would perform well, you apply for it and then the employment process would start.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

And please Alfredo, talk to Tinuade during the break about the further engagement. So, Tinuade, I would suggest you to talk to Alfredo. And please, Filimoni, you are the next.

FILIMONI PELENATO

Good afternoon, everyone, Filimoni Pelenato for the record, ICANN84 fellow. My question is out of curiosity for the Public Comments. I understand that English is the main language used in ICANN's Public Comment process. While I haven't tried submitting it in my native language, considering ICANN's goal of making the internet work for everyone, does ICANN provide its public proceedings and comment opportunities in multiple languages? If not, are there any plans to make the Public Comment process more accessible for non-English speakers? Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Yes, thank you. Very simply put, the ICANN Public Comment pages are available in six UN languages. So, you can go ahead and review them in one of these six languages. And if you would like to submit

your comment in your own language, you can do that. And then the group that is supporting the Public Comment process would then work with the ICANN language services team if they needed an English translated version of your comment submitted in the native language.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Hamzoz, you go.

HAYDER HAMZOZ

Hello, everyone, thank you so much for including our voice. I'm Hayder Hamzoz from the INSM Foundation. It's a digital rights organization, non-profit based in Iraq. I'm a newcomer too and a new fellow. I have two questions. First one, how does ICANN ensure that voices from unprecedented regions like our region, MENA region, are included in this global policy discussion?

Especially when I visit the ICANN website, I see a big gap between my language, Arabic language, and the English language in terms of resources and translating all the reports or the engagement here and how we can help. Maybe this is part of our responsibility too here. And my second question is, what is the key policy issues or debates currently shaping the ICANN agenda that newcomers like us should focus or pay attention, special attention for? Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you for the question. If you are referring to representation of regions in the policy development process, the groups that are

organized based on regions such as within At-Large, you would find regional At-Large organizations. For these groups, of course, they represent the interests and concerns of their own region in their own regional At-Large organization.

There is one for the North America region called NARALO, one for the Latin America and the Caribbean islands, LACRALO. We have for Europe, EURALO. For Africa, there's AFRALO. And then for Asia, Australasia and Pacific Islands, there's APRALO. And this is the regional representation within ALAC. And then for the executive council that I talked about, the At-Large advisory committee, it is composed of members appointed from these regions.

Similarly, in the address supporting organization, there's again the regional internet registries are also regional. And the ASO address council is composed of representatives appointed by representatives from the five regional internet registries. So, when we see this regional representation in the group, the group operates on this regional basis. But for groups like RSSAC, the Root Server System Advisory Committee, where the membership can only be representatives from root server operators, there is no such regional structure that we don't see there. But for RSSAC, I should note that in order to have a pool of DNS experts to help with the RSSAC work and the RSSAC publications, there is a group called RSSAC Caucus.

So, if you would like to help with the work of the RSSAC Root Server System Advisory Committee, and if you have a background of DNS

root server system, then you can apply to become an RSSAC Caucus member. So, although it is possible for non-representatives from root server operators to become an RSSAC member, you can apply to become an RSSAC Caucus member.

And then there's a membership committee for RSSAC Caucus membership as well, which also monitors from which regions their membership is coming. And if they think they are lacking members from a certain region, then the membership committee can encourage RSSAC to have some engagement opportunities within this region to increase the membership and representation from this membership.

So, I don't know if this makes sense, but there are groups that are operating based on a regional basis and trying to make sure that their executive council has representatives equally represented among the regions. And then there are groups that are not operating based on a membership basis.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

And we'll take the last question, Seth, please, very brief.

SETH ADJEI GYIMAH

Okay, sorry, I'll be very brief. My name is Seth Gyimah, for the record, a GhanaSIG fellow, EU SIG fellow, now ICANN84 fellow from the University of Ghana Accra. Now, my question, during your presentation, you mentioned that when policies are developed, they move from the community to the Board for approval. And

then when the policies are approved by the Board, it moves from the Board to the organization for implementation.

Now, my question is, are there any mechanism the organization, the org, ICANN org puts in place to ensure that they're able to evaluate the real impact of these policies implemented? Because personally, I have made to have provided to Public Comments in the past. And over the years, I wanted to see whether that policy went through and whether it was able to make any impact in the real world. But I couldn't get my hands on anything to help me see the impact of the policy that was approved by the Board.

So, I just wanted to know, do you have some mechanisms in place that you can evaluate whether these policies are really making impact in the real world? Thank you.

OZAN SAHIN

Thank you. That's also an excellent question. So, when a final report and final recommendations are up for consideration of the ICANN Board, the ICANN Board, if it anticipates the impact would be huge. And if they think they can benefit from the expertise of the ICANN organization, they can go to ICANN organization and ask for an impact assessment report before taking an action. And also, after taking an action, the ICANN Board still can ask ICANN organization to compose a team on the implementation and regularly report on the impact.

And they can ask ICANN organization to work with the ICANN community together to continuously assess this impact and report back. So, based on all of these impact assessment reports and reporting from ICANN organization, the ICANN Board may also defer its decision and to get a really sound picture of what they're about to take an action on. So yes, the short answer is to your question. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN

Thank you very much. Thank you very much for participation. And Ozan, thank you very much for this session, for this interactive introduction to the ICANN policy. And I hope that if there will be more questions coming, but you can see Ozan in the corridors or you can see any member of our policy team there use the opportunity to ask questions.

And with that, I just want to thank once again you to be here and appreciate all of your questions. See you during the next question, which will be taken here in 30 minutes. Thank you. And the session is adjourned.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]