
ICANN84 | AGM – ccNSO: ccTLD News Session
Tuesday, October 28, 2025 – 10:30 to 12:00 IST

CLAUDIA RUIZ

Hello, and welcome to the ccNSO ccTLD news session. My name is Claudia Ruiz, and I, along with my colleague Joke Braeken, are the participation managers for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Community Participant Code of Conduct, the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior, and the ICANN Community Anti-Harassment Policy. Please observe the following guidelines to participate in this session.

I will also post them in the chat for your reference. During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will be read aloud if put in the proper form as noted in the chat. Interpretation for this session will include English, Spanish, and French. If you would like to speak during this session, please raise your hand in Zoom.

When called upon, virtual participants will be given permission to unmute in Zoom, onsite participants will use a physical microphone to speak. Please state your name for the record and the language you will speak if speaking a language other than English, and please speak at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation. Thank you. And with that, I will now hand

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

the floor over to Russell Deka Harada, chair of the session. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Good morning, good afternoon, good evening, everyone. Thank you, session manager. My name is Russell Deka Harada. I'm a ccTLD manager of .pg from Papua New Guinea, and also I'm an academic. This morning, I'm a session chair with the ccNSO News Session. As you know, news means everything new, not old. So today, out of these presenters, I want to deliver two news recently.

One news is, as you heard in this cyclone, cyclone Marissa hit Jamaica and the Caribbean Sea. Hope these people are surviving well, and we have to pray from our room and maybe everyone stays safe. And maybe my second news will be delivered after this presentation. So, let me introduce the first presenter from Nigeria, .ng, Sola, please go ahead. Thank you.

ADESOLA AKINSANYA

Good morning, everybody. So, my name is Adesola Akinsanya from the .ng ccTLD registry. So, in the following slides, I'm going to be showing us the .ng approach for driving innovation, operational excellence, and partnership. So, who are we? .ng ccTLD Registry is a non-for-profit organization, non-governmental, self-regulating body that manages the .ng ccTLD, and it's a membership-based organization.

So, the vision and mission as clearly shown on the screen, so we have over 150 accredited registrars, and the domain count is over 230,000 and still counting. And we have two special purpose vehicles. One is the Ndukwe Kalu Foundation and the second one is the .ng Academy. The Ndukwe Kalu Foundation is what we use to promote child online protection. This is through the Online Protection Policy Strategy document in the Nigerian space, while the .ng Academy is the capacity building arm of the .ng ccTLD Registry.

So, the ccTLD Registry initiatives. One is the Automation of the Registrar Accreditation Process, second is the Tech Convergence Program, and third is the .ng Academy Learning Management System. So we automated the registrar accreditation process by developing a portal. So in the past, this is a manual process and normally ranges between 14 to 21 days with so much emails follow up on document submission.

So our response to this was to develop a portal to automate the process from end to end, from the application to approval to activation. So it's an end-to-end, and with real time tracking, secure document upload, and instance notification. This is purely done in-house. And we also integrated an online payment on this platform for easy processing of payments, and that is still worked on for the international registrars. And so, the impact, the turnaround time gradually reduced.

So, a registrar can be accredited within less than five days. The registration and accreditation process related issue decreased by 95%, and since quarter three this year, we've accredited over 10 new registrars. So, just on the slide there, just feedback from one or two of the registrars.

So, tech convergence right now. So, this is a platform that brings together policy makers, lawmakers, registrars, business developers, creators, innovators, this brings them together to position the .ng ccTLD domain name as a unifying asset in Nigerian digital economy. This serves as a key driver for the Nigerian Force policy by fostering collaboration and shaping digital strategies and influencing action that leads to greater .ng adoption.

We want have more of .ng adoption within the country, so, this platform was initiated to handle that. And from what you can see, key outcomes, we have .ng visibilities as Nigerian digital identity. We're now having more stronger collaboration within government industry and the academia. And with greater inclusion of the micro and small medium enterprises, startups, and creatives to use the .ng domain name.

So, impact snapshots, we're in the second edition. The second edition of tech convergence took place two weeks ago, October 14th, precisely in Abuja. So, the first edition took place in Lagos. You can see the impact snapshots on the screen. So this is just pictures taken from the maiden edition and the one that took place this year two weeks ago. So, the .ng Learning Management System,

the LMS. So, this provides a customized platform for structured training for our registrars, resellers, government agencies, and the wider community with strategic partnership for developing high quality, robust content.

The link there actually takes you to the platform, and this is being developed in-house. Excuse me. So, this was in a response to the various needs for adequate training for people in the ecosystem, especially in the DNS industry. And this was not also limited all to that, it was been expanded. We have various courses from cybersecurity and the rest things.

And also, we have some recent registry updates that was being done. Number one is the WHOIS redaction, secondly, registrar incentives and community engagement. The WHOIS privacy redaction, this is a response to the government. In 2023, the government signed into law the Nigerian Data Protection Act. This framework was signed in to protect personnel data of the citizenry.

So, our response to that was registry wide redaction of the registrants, and this was done fully NDPA compliance with zero public exposure of the registrant WHOIS data. And also, for coming next year, we are also expanding it where we are gonna empower the registrars to control the redaction privileges for legitimate data privacy requests. So, if a registrant doesn't want their data to be redacted, so the registrars will be able to take action on this.

So, Registrar Incentive Scheme, we operate a three R model, registry, registrar, and the registrants. Our registrar is our go-to

market, and our approach was bringing this incentive was to see how to further encourage them to do more. And the first piece of this was we're targeting only registration, where you do some amount of registration and 5% rebate is being peeled back to the registrar's account.

A second phase is gonna be launched next year, where we're gonna be considering, but not only the registration, we're gonna be considering the renewals too, just to make sure that the retention rates increase also. I think this should be the last slide or not. The community engagement initiatives.

So, we have three of them. We have the registrar community, we have a registrar forum where we engage actively with our registrars twice in a year, one virtually and one in-person. And this is being done to have a feedback mechanism and updates with our registrars and share problem solving if there's any. And also, there's a WhatsApp platform where we used to also engage registries.

So the .ng Academy also brought back an initiative where a reseller entrepreneurship program was launched. This is for individuals or organization that don't have the work to do means to become a registrar. So, this is in partnership with the registrars so they come in under any of the accredited registrars where they start their business and they grow.

And lastly, on the community engagement, we have the Ndukwe Kalu Foundation Child Online Protection. This is targeted towards

the youth, and also the secondary school students where we try to educate them early on online safety and protection.

So in conclusion, the .ng Registry has been growing a self-sustaining ecosystem of registries, resellers, and developers. And we also been building local capacity to align with global DNS standards, and also reinforcing the Nigerian Force Digital Vision through community-driven innovations. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you, Sola. And do you have any question on floor? Yep.

ROELOF MEIJER

Thank you very much for your interesting presentation. It is a good track, I would say. Roelof Meijer from .nl. You mentioned your registrar incentive program, and I think you mentioned also that registrars could get a 5% discount. Could you explain a bit more? Are there certain criteria that they have to meet, or...?

ADESOLA AKINSANYA

Okay. So, the incentive program is towards new registration. So, any registrars that identify to be part of this, what they need to do is to, per quarter, at least register 20 new domain registration. And within that quarter, a 5% rebate is being peeled back to them on the total amount that they did.

ROELOF MEIJER	Okay. Thank you very much. We run quite an extensive scheme like that, so if you're interested, I could bring you to contact with people.
ADESOLA AKINSANYA	Okay. Thank you. I'll reach out. Thank you.
RUSELL DEKA HARADA	Right. Next, please.
RIYADH ZEHLAH	Thank you. My name is Riyadh, ICANN84 fellow. Are these learning programs available for online?
RUSSELL DAKA HARADA	Yeah, thank you. Okay.
ADESOLA AKINSANYA	I didn't get that. Okay. Thank you.
RUSELL DEKA HARADA	Thank you, Sola. Thank you. And I think we will go ahead to next presenter from Norway. Hilde, you ready? Thank you.
HILDE THUNEM	Thank you. My name is Hilde Thunem, and I'm the managing director of Norid, which is the registry for the Norwegian top-level

domain, .nl. So, we are the just say .nl people. And I am going to be talking a bit about the affected registration policy regulation and accountability can have on building a top-level domain as a good neighborhood.

But before I dive into that, I'd just like to remark that just like in the offline world, whether it's something is a good neighborhood or a bad neighborhood, has a lot to do with complex societal factors. So, it's not all DNS, although we love the domain names, but DNS is not always the solution to everything. Still, I do think that the Norwegian model can sort of provide one example on how different stakeholders can come together and have a positive effect.

So, the first thing to sort of notice is that all TLDs, even the gTLDs, operate within an ecosystem of the local law, wherever they are, and the registration policy that they have decided on. And for NL, the registration policy is of course, developed in a consultation process with the local input community.

And we have one of the registration policies also influenced kind of the certain neighborhood that top level domain fosters by setting some requirements on the people who want domain names. So we are one of the TLDs with a local presence requirement. I will talk a little bit more about what that means. And we also, in a very Norwegian manner, limit the number of domain names that each subscriber can have. So, if you're an individual, you can get up to five domain names, and if you are a company, you can get up to 100 domain names.

And this is from the sort of thought that the first comers should not be allowed to eat all the cake on the table. There has to be some domain names left for the late comers. The other thing I think is important for all of us as TLDs is to have in mind is that domain names and the DNS is not magic. So, cyberspace is not a magical place where the law does not apply, but also the checks and balances that belong in the offline world applies in cyberspace as well.

So as I said, we have a local presence requirement. We require everyone that wants a .nl domain name to be registered either in the Norwegian Register for Business Enterprises, if they're an organization, or in the National Population Registry, if they're an individual. So, this encompasses also foreign companies that have local subsidiaries or people that have worked in Norway for some months and gotten a number in the National Population Registry. And yes, we check every application.

So, Santa Claus does not have a .nl domain name, although he's obviously Norwegian because he doesn't exist. And we do check before granting the right of use to getting a domain name, and we check daily afterwards for organizations that they still exist. So, if they are going bankrupt, we start a process based on that, that they no longer exist. With individuals, we just check once a year that they're still alive.

And if they're not, we will not allow them to register anymore domain names because we do not believe in zombies. So, this is,

of course, data quality is not a registry only effort. We have registrars and they do their part. So, one of the things that we require the registrars to do is they need to know who their customer is because they are the ones in contact with the prospective domain holder.

They can pick any method that works for them, because if you're a small registrar, you may know your customers personally, if you're large, you want to build on identity solutions or other ways, but we want you to know who they are, who your customers are.

The other thing is that we want the registrars to help the customer keeping their data updated because it's the customer that knows what their email address is, if they have moved, they have to update their data, but it's hard for them sometimes to know what data is inside our registry. So, the registrars have to show the customers the data inside the Norwegian registry every year.

And this of course, ensures that behind each NL domain name, there is a real organization or a real individual that can be responsible for how that domain name is used. And yes, criminals are bad people, so sometimes they steal people's credentials, so this is not a sort of foolproof system. The other thing is that Norwegians sometimes commit crimes, I'm ashamed to say, even when they do it by using a domain name they have registered on their own personal identity number.

So, it's not like you can trust anything that is an NL domain name, but there is a responsible personal organization that you can start

asking questions if something happens. And the good thing about this is, of course, that while these requirements are not here primarily to stop criminals, they're here because we want to know who our customers are.

They create a slight friction for criminals. Spammers really hate the 100 domain names max limit because they need to steal more credentials to get a lot of domain names they can run through quickly. And at the same time, that friction is not as much a problem for legitimate users.

And we want that because we want people to be able to have domain names, and we want to take into account that most people are not criminals. So, we don't want to drive them all to use Facebook instead of having a domain name.

And then when a domain name is used to point to legal content or services, I mean, the conflict of a domain name itself is a separate issue. We know about UDRP, or in our case, we have local disputer solution, but here we're talking about a domain name being used to commit crimes or being used to point to illegal content or services. That's when the regulatory ecosystem surrounding us comes into play.

And that's when the Norwegian law applies, of course, and also the principles of due process rule of law applies. So, preaching to the choir here, everybody in this room knows that the most effective way to handle illegal content or illegal services is to take them

down at the source, but sometimes you can't. Sometimes the only thing you can do is to act upon the domain name.

While not perfect, in certain cases as a last resort and when it is proportionate, then you can have actions on the domain name itself. And then the process has to have safeguards to ensure the rights of every party involved. And this is especially important for top level domains like .nl with a local presence requirement, because research shows that in these cases, most of the illegal content, illegal use happens on compromised domain names.

So, the domain subscriber is a victim. They have had their website compromised, they have had their domain name compromised, and that means the take down is often not the answer. It's to help them to stop having their domain name compromised. But when a domain name should be taken down, we have a legal framework that is fairly clear all the way back in 2009.

The Supreme Court in Norway made a couple of decisions making clear that having a domain name is a right of use not the sort of property. And that it is the domain subscriber that is responsible for the use of the domain name, not the registrar, not the registry.

And this has been upheld in later Supreme Court decisions, and this year, it was entered into the Electronic Communications Act. So, it's very clear who's responsible for the use of the domain name. The other parties, of course, giving law enforcement and other public authorities the power to actually act, and the Supreme Court

have decided that the domain name is a thing that can be ceased by law enforcements.

Just like they can cease a car that has been used in a crime or a dog that has bitten someone, they can also cease a domain name the right of use. And then it's transferred to the law enforcement, and it follows the same process as for any other seizure where all the checks and balances, the possibility of protesting, the requirement that police have to keep the domain name alive just as they have to feed the dog if they have seized the dog until the criminal case is concluded.

So, that's fine. They don't have to go to court in order to start the seizure process, but of course, it ends either in a court case at the end, or it ends with them saying there's not enough evidence, we hand the domain name back. And then consumer protection authorities also have been given mandate in law, most of them, to request the court to order either deletion, suspension or a transfer of domain. This comes out to the European Consumer Corporation Protection Regulation.

But it is the last resort, they have to go to court and just show that they have tried the other things first. The exception is the medical products agency, they can come directly to us with an order, and that is of course, because in the case of fake type of medicines, life can be on the line. But then as well, they have to show that they have considered and tried other measures first before going after

the domain name. So, that's sort of the legal framework that surrounds us.

And then, the Supreme Court in 2009 decided that they needed to comment on the registries mandate as well. I just want to note that we were not part of this court case. It was the law enforcement up against the domain holder, but the Supreme Court made a note that Norid as a registry does not undertake any control of the content of websites, and does not have any mandate to decide what is illegal to react to websites that may appear to violate law.

This is the task of the police and the judicial system. So, yes, we are not the magical authority of what is legal or not legal on the internet, and I'm very glad for that. But while we do not have the task to judge what is illegal, we do help the public authorities whose task it is to carry out their work.

So, we work on making sure that there's clear and predictable procedures for those who have to take actions against domain names, and that these procedures are published on our website that we help the police with. This is what you need to do in a seizure for us to be able to handle it and carry it out in the system.

Here are some materials on how the DNS works for judges and the court system to know what happens and what does not happen if you act upon a domain name. So, we really try to make it clear and predictable, also for the domain holders, what is going to happen and not happen to you in such cases.

So, to summarize, the Norwegian model is sort of one example, and every ccTLD is different, but it's one example of the combination of the registration policy that we have, the clear regulatory framework that surrounds us, the effort of us, the registrars, and public authorities that together sort of build .nl as a good neighborhood that you can mostly trust. But I would never say just if it's anything .nl, you can trust everything that's there.

You still have to, as a person, be careful on the internet. So, this is time for questions. I also have a slide at the end with all of the resources on our website if people want to look at the guides we have produced for police and others. And we are very happy for people to take whatever good ideas they think we have had and use them for their own TLDs or for their own procedures.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you. Before asking questions on the floor, we have one question from Nigeria, Busayo Balogun, and I can ask you on behalf of him, "With these safety measures in place at .nl registry, what do the domain abuse statistics look like? I'd imagine they are quite low given the static regulatory and the registration guidelines?"

HILDE THUNEM

Yes. If you are aware of the DNS Research Foundation statistics that they sort of publish on measurements of spam and malware and the percentage under a top-level domain, we are currently being the TLD that is the best in the world among those that have more

than 500,000 registrations. We're competing with the Danish, so sometimes they go up. Sorry, Laila, currently we are at top, but it is, I think, a reflection of how it works.

We do track the statistics just to get an idea of whether the system still works, but of course, there's not a one-to-one correlation that just because we are doing this, that is the sole source of what that statistic represents.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you. On the floor, do you have a question? Yes, please.

IRINA DANIELA

Thank you, Hilde. And this is Irina for the record from .ru. Could you remind me how do you check their person where they register the private individuals domain holders? How do you check them?

HILDE THUNEM

Well, we check by when we get the application, we get-- oh, let's start with the National Population Registry has a sort of personal number for everyone that is in the registrar. Now, this is of course personal information. So, what we do is we have a service where the individual can go and they can put that into our system and get a code, a PID, back so they can use with the registrar so they don't have to show their number to the registrar.

When we get the application, we take that PID, we get the number, and we look up in the National Population Register, and we check

that the name of the registrant matches what is in the national register and that they are still alive and that the sort of combination of name and number matches.

But of course, if somebody has stolen my name and my number, they can register a whole number of five domain names in my name, and the police will talk to me if those domain names are starting to behave suspiciously, and I will then say, these are not mine, I want them removed.

And the registry will remove them, of course, because then we can also know that we are in contact with the one that has the right of use no matter who went to the registrar. It's the one that's in our register that actually has the right of use that is the subscriber to the domain. So, I hope that helps.

IRINA DANIELIA

So, in other words, you do not receive any data from the National Registry, but you receive yes or no, whether there is a match?

HILDE THUNEM

Yeah. We just look up yes or no if there is a match, and that is because taking data out of the National Registry is a bit more complex than just getting data from the registrant and checking that they actually exist.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

All right. One more question. Yeah.

MURTALA ABDULLAH

Okay. Good morning. My name is Murtala, I'm the Vice President of NiRA, that's .ng. I have a couple of question, I think two. When you were presenting, you mentioned that you have some five registrations for individuals, and then I think 100 for businesses. Can you explain more about that? I don't know why there's a restriction on that.

And the second question is you mentioned about maybe a website that is violating, you don't have a right to take it down or something, you have to wait for the police or judicial system to take action. I'm just curious, when you have an issue whereby maybe there's an urgent issue that you need to take it down, if you do not take it, maybe some kind of things can go wrong. So you'll just wait and be just looking at the [00:35:12 - inaudible] until the police take action and maybe the damage has been done at the time? So, is there anything that you can do or is there anything that you can mitigate this? Thank you.

HILDE THUNEM

Okay. The reason for the limit, to start with that, is sort of the ID that we have from the very beginning, that domain names are a limited resource and they're fairly cheap in Norwegian terms. I mean, you pay less for a domain name for an entire year than you pay if you go and have a cup of coffee in a cafe. So, it's not like price is that much general object, so we wanted to make sure that

domain is taking everything and there was nothing left for anyone else.

Now, this is not your typical commercial way of thinking because we are not-for-profit, which is why I'm saying we are one example. I don't expect .com to want to adopt this policy. I would assume that if they try to introduce a limit, that there would be riots. So, it doesn't fit for everyone, but that was the background for this.

Now, in the case where a domain name is used to commit a crime, we will wait for the police because we are not really equipped to decide whether this is legal or not. If we think it's urgent, we would presumably contact the police and say, can you have a look at this? But also, for us to start, there's both the question of due process. If we as a registry start just interfering in what could be a free speech issue, what could be other things, but it's also the case of not interfering with the investigation to the police.

Because if you have an urgent issue happening, the police might need the information that is there instead of us just taking it out. Now, in the extreme event, there is a part of law in Norway that means that every citizen have the possibility to act in emergency situations. So, there would be a sort of possibility for us, but our first instinct would be to call the police and say, can you have a look?

Can you that knows what is decide on what is the appropriate action. And that is also because they have the responsibility and accountability in those cases, while we are an operator of technical

infrastructure. We are very good at keeping the DNS up, not so good at deciding what should be illegal.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA Okay. Thank you, Hida. And I think some comment and question from online, but time catch up, so later if we have time, we ask you again. Thank you. So, next presenter from all the way Columbia, maybe early in the morning. Diego, are you ready?

DIEGO LUNA-QUEVEDO Yes, I am.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA Yeah, please go ahead.

DIEGO LUNA-QUEVEDO Can you share the presentation, please?

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA Thank you.

DIEGO LUNA-QUEVEDO Hello, good morning, everyone. My name is Diego Luna-Quevedo, I'm the legal consultant for the ccTLD .co, and today I'm really pleased and excited to share with you the story and the future of the .cl and what we are going to plan and what we are going to do in the next few years. Next slide, please.

So in short, in this representation, I'm going to talk about the origins of the .co. Later on, how its management evolved, and the recent RFP or public tender, and finally the future and how it looks like for the .co in the next 10 years. Next slide, please.

So first, the origins and the early delegation. Next slide, please. So first, the .co domain was first delegated in 1991 by Jon Postel to Universidad de los Andes and Universidad Nacional, the largest universities here in Columbia. And they were responsible for managing the .co as the identity digital online for almost 17 years.

But later on in 2002, there were some legal decisions that determined that the Ministry of Communications today, the MinTIC was responsible for the .co. And in special, the Law 1065 of 2006 made the .co a strategic resource for the ICT and determined that the ministry was in control of that resource. Next slide, please.

So the management of this resource began with the Ministry of Communications, and the first decision that we took was that we were the one in charge for the public policies, especially DNS abuse, pricing, but also we have one specific task on a specific problem, and it was to delegate to outsource the management of the .co.

So, as the management, as the administrators of the .co, we have all this to do to take care of the public policies, but also to determine what was going to be the best possible way to manage the .co itself. Next slide, please.

So, back in 2009, the decision was to outsource to do a RFP, a public tender to have this registry operator. Next slide, please. In 2009, as I told you, we have the first concession contract for the .co, and the idea was to hire a registry operator for the .co. So, just to show you something, at the beginning, during the time of Universidad de los Andes and Universidad Nacional, there were the manager of the .co, they had almost 27,000 domains of registrations, and after this concession, we finalized with almost 2.6 million domains globally.

So, it became really popular as you know, because the .co can be like a replacement for .com and also can be considered for company, for commerce, for corporate, so that help us a lot to grow in that term of time. And it is quite important for all of you know that during this almost 10 years, MinTIC received only 6% of the gross revenue for this country. Next slide, please.

So, we knew that we need to do better, and that's why we decided in the ministry to have a public tender to have the best possible contractor for this. Next slide, please. And that's why in 2023, MinTIC began planning a new public tender, RFP, as you know it. And we work with national international experts to design a transparent and competitive process.

So, we have some ITU consultants, actually, I saw that Olga Cavalli, [00:43:10 - inaudible], that was one of our consultants, and Olga and her people, Michael, Gaurav, David, help us with the best practices available, not only for ccTLDs, but gTLDs, the whole TLDs structure with technical financial expertise and ensuring that the

process was fair and aligned with international standards. That was a key decision that we had at the ministry, and I'm going to tell you later on, but that turned out really, really well. Next slide, please.

So, these ITU consultants, as I told you, help us with technical financial expertise, the best practices, best international practices, and also to be very effective and competitive. Of course, as you know, the MinTIC is a government institution and we need to comply with some legal procedures.

So, we have a public gender in some higher standards, and we wanted to not only comply with data standards in Colombian law, but also with the best international standards and with the best international best practices for this public tender. Next slide, please.

So, in March of 2025, this year, we officially launched this RFP and include some time for comments, to have feedback, to really understand what all the stakeholders think about this public tender, to participate. And just to let you know, we have in almost three months, over 500 comments for this public tender.

Usually, in Colombia, we have 20, 30, but in this public tender, we have almost 500 comments for the whole process. But this help us really to ensure that the best possible outcome was available for the country, of course, but also to be some kind of leaders in the LAC region for the ccTLD environment. Next slide, please.

So, be ensured this is kind of the results for this public tender, we award this contract in June of 2025. This is going to be a contract that is going to be 10 years old. The current contract or the last contract was only five years. This is going to be for a period of 10 years.

So, from October, 2025, we started just two weeks ago, and we're going to end it October 2035. And this new registry operator will manage the .co with some strategic and operational changes, but the idea is to contribute with the community, to keep on growing, and to ensure that we are a healthy ccTLD. Next slide, please.

So, what is the impact for this product tender and the future for .co. Next slide, please. So, as you can see on the screen, this is just a small capture of the economics of these contracts. So, this first contract, as I told you, in 2009, the gross revenue was 6% that it turns out to be like \$20 million. But right now, with this new RFP, with this new public center, this new registry operator, that changed a lot. And today, we have 92% of the gross income for this contract.

So, the new registry operator that is a consortium with a local company and also participation for MinTIC internet group, they have only 8%, and the expectation for the ministry is that in this new contract, in the next 10 years, we're going to receive almost, we are not completely sure, \$500 million. So, this is going to be huge for us. As you know, the ministry is also responsible for all of the infrastructure here in Columbia to help really our community

with this ecosystem, the environment. So, we are planning to use this amount of money, of course, to make a huge change if possible in Columbia in the digital aspect. Next slide, please.

So, kind of a conclusion for us, of course, for this small presentation is that this trust in Columbia shows the Colombian commitment to the modernization of the ccTLD and the digital aspects in general. It also was quite important for us to be transparent and inclusive during this process. We have several companies interested in this process, almost eight companies from global registry operators, infrastructure, and they were huge.

They were GoDaddy, they were [00:48:54 - inaudible] and other companies. But that help us, of course, to have these results. And also the idea is to have a strategic position and leadership with the LAC region, but we are also aiming to be, if possible, of course, leaders in the future for the whole ccTLD community.

Next slide, please. I guess it's the last one. Yeah. So, thanks again for your time. It was a pleasure to share with you about this public tender. And of course, if you have any questions, just let me know. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Okay. Thank you, Diego. And do you have any question on floor? Yes, please.

LOEK BAKKER

Yes, this is Loek Bakker from SIDN, .tn. Thank you, Diego. I have a question about the tender process. You mentioned that you awarded to the bid with the best conditions. Can you elaborate a bit more on what conditions you looked at?

DIEGO LUNA-QUEVEDO

Sure, of course. We have several components like the financial and the technical perspective, but in the technical perspective, we want it to be with the best practices available. For example, use of DNSSEC, the migration standards, of course, there was a chance to modify the registry operator from GoDaddy to another company, so this kind of migration needed to be in compliance with the [00:50:22 - inaudible] standards. Of course, the ISO and all them kind of soft law that you have in ICANN and also in the legal perspective.

So, we need to comply with that, and that was really important. So, this is just the technical perspective. In the financial perspective, we did an analysis of the whole TLD management, not just ccTLDs, but also gTLDs, and we determine what is going to be the revenues, some perspectives, some analysis that help us through the whole process.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you. Diego, I have one question. I'm facing the same thing like currently, .pg is under the University of Technology as a history

card same as you before 2009. So, at the time, you said only 27,000 users, and now I think you mentioned 2.6 million users.

So for the revenue side, example, I don't know the registration fee of your registry, but the example \$10 per year, which means previously you can collect around \$16,000 a year, but now I think I just calculate around the 24 million, example, huge amount you can collect. Are you making some disclosure of these revenues are used for infrastructure or some technical training or whatever, your ministry discloses this information or not?

DIEGO LUNA-QUEVEDO

Well, to begin, right now, we have almost 3.4 million domains. In 2020, there was 2.6 million. Now, it's almost 3.4 million domains under management for the .co. And in Colombia, we didn't have a fixed price for any domain. It's part of the registry operator to determine what is going to be the price for any kind of registry of the .co.

We have some premium domains, but also like the standard domains and the pricing as I told you, is part of the obligations to these registry operators. And right now in the last contract, we have almost \$200 million in revenue for the ministry, and what we did was invest in our community.

So, infrastructure not for the operation of the .co, but like wires, wifi, internet for the communities that really need us in the forest or other communities far away from the center [00:53:13 -

inaudible]. So, that's part of what we do. Also, we help a lot with the ecosystem here with the digital evolvement of these communities. So, we invest kind of the money and also like the administrative matters here in Columbia for the ministry. We help a lot with that, too.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

All right, thank you. I think time catch up. So, we will go ahead to the next presenter, .dk from Denmark. Laila, please.

LAILA JENSEN

Yes, thank you. My name is Laila Jensen, and I'm head of legal at the .dk. What I want to tell you about today is our decision to change our administration model, whereas domain name can no longer be handled by the .dk, but only by the registrar.

Just short about our registry, we look after domain names ending with the .dk, and we have been entrusted with this test since 1999. And we have about 1.3 million Danish domain name, and we have about 620,000 registrants.

About our registrar market today in Denmark, we can see that it's an ongoing consolidation between the registrars as in many other countries, at least in Europe. In Denmark, we have around 120 registrars and we have two really big registrars, and it's one .com and team.blue.

And then we have a lot of smaller registrars. The historical background also telling little about why we are changing this

model, when we started in 1999, there was this wish from the society that we will handle the domain name for the registrants and we will invoice the registrants to ensure that the prices for domain name in Denmark will be low. Then in 2021, also because of the wishes from the registrars, we open up for registrar management.

And this means that a domain name could also be handled by the registrar. So, today we have a two-type model, meaning that the registrar could choose to want us to handle the domain name, the registry handle domain name, or do they want the registrar to handle the domain name. And today, around 35% of the domain names are handled by a registrar.

So, what we did, we asked the internet society, we are going to make big changes in our registry, we have to ask the internet society. So, we asked the internet society in the end of 2024 and the beginning of 2025, we asked internet society, what do they want? Do they want us to change model or to a registrar model?

Or do they want us to keep the model we have today? And based on this hearing, our board decided that we are going to change the model, registration model. So, we are going to change to a model that will look like this. You could say we have the model that is primarily a registrar model, I think it looks a lot like in other countries. We will still be the one running the Danish zone and we'll be updating the zone, and the registrar will be selling the domain names as today.

But the new thing is that the registrar will invoice the registrant in the future, and only the registrar will do it. Also, the registrar will handle all the customer service for the registrant. This will also be new. In Denmark, we decided that we will still do the data and ID control if the registrar doesn't want to do it, then we will do it. And also, we will still have the agreement with the registrant. So, we will have a direct directly agreement with the registrant.

Why did we change model? Well, we are changing model because we want to make it easier for the customer to be customer. Today the customer doesn't really know who we are because they have all the contact through the registrar and with the registrar. And then when they get an invoice from us, they don't know who we are. So now, we are given the registrant the possibility to have one point of contact, and we think it would be easier for the registrant.

Then we'll also have the same model as in many other countries, I know, at least in the Europe. And we believe that this is also strengthened the competition on the Danish market. Today, we have heard from foreign registrars, they don't want to enter the Danish market because we have this two-type model and this is too complex to be a foreign registrar on the Danish market.

So, we hope that with this one-time model, there will also be more foreign registrars that will be interested in competing on the Danish market. Even though, but we are handing over, you could say, the customer service to the registrars. We won't have less to do.

We still expect that we have a lot of things to do in the future, and it's also because that we worked a lot on how to secure to make the Danish domain name one of the most secure in the world. And we will continue this work also going forward. And we think that our awareness work and our policy work will grow in the future. So, we also have to secure maintenance in the future.

Just very short, our timeline, a road map forward, we told the registrars in the beginning of September that we had decided to change model. Then we told our registrants the same also in the beginning of October that we are changing the model. We did it very simple. We said to the registrants, you don't need to worry right now. You just know that we are going to change model, but you have a long time to decide who the registrar should be.

And then also in the beginning of October, we made a press release on this. When we have to transits into this new and implement this new administration model, it'll be in two steps. The first step will enter into force the 1st of July, 2026, where it will no longer be possible to register new domain name handled by us.

This means that all new domain names will be handled by registrar. Then we also have to make a new registrar contract. We will impose more obligation on, on the registrars also because we have some obligation towards the registrar today. We have to give further to the registrar. Then there will be this, we will update the registrar agreement from 1st of July, 2027.

And then on the 1st of July, 2028, this transition period will end, and from the 1st of July, 2028, no domain names can be handled by .dk. So, we expect that there will be, you could say, remaining group that have not decided who should be the registrar, and we haven't decided on what should happen with this remaining group. We will decide when we come to 2028.

So, what did we expect? How have the reaction been in the public? Well, we expected that there are some registrars who manage everything themselves. They're very IT and have a great IT knowledge, and we expect them to be skeptical because they want to handle things by themselves through our self-service portal and now, they need to go through a registrar. So, we expected this group to be, you could say, concerned, and we were right. Then we also expected there would be concerns about the prices.

When you have to buy the domain, the domain needs to be handled by the registrar, with the prices on the Danish domain market increase, we expect that this would be a question, and it has been a question. So, we expect the prices to increase, but we also expect the competition. On the Danish market, we keep the prices on a fair level. Then we expected that the registrars would be happy, and we were right, they were very happy.

And we also expected that some of the smaller registrars who doesn't provide a registrar handle management today would be concerned. We have heard that some of them are concerned, but they haven't really taken up that much space in our change of

model. Then we expect that the press, the general public, even though it's a very historical decision for us, it's huge. We didn't expect that the press would be that interesting in it, and we are right. It hasn't taken up that much space in the public.

And how was the pressure on our organization? Well, in the first period, we got 73 questions or reactions, inquiries from the registrars. And after we got a set of requests from registrar that is interested in being a registrar. now in Denmark. We have received, you could say, not as many as we have expected but still okay.

Then from the registrants, we expect after that a lot of them would be concerned, but we didn't get so many inquiries from the registrants. Our number from the call, telephone calls, and from the written cases, less than 10% of the inquiries was about our change of the model. So, this has actually been less than expected.

The questions from our customers are in general, what is a registrar and what registrar should I choose? And you said it would be easy for me, but I'm not sure. And then of course, the prices will be more expensive. And for the one who hosts the domain name by themselves, can I still do this? And some of the customers thought we were closing down.

But the main topics, the two main topics has been the prices, concerns about the prices on the end user market, and concerns from the registrants hosting everything themselves and want to do everything themselves. So, the conclusion is that we have received both negative and positive reactions just as expected. We have in

general, received very good reactions from the registrars just as expected.

But we didn't receive as many calls to our customer service as we expected. It has been less. And then we have been pleasantly surprised by a lot of more registrars that have contacted us and want to hear more about how to become a registrar in Denmark and on these conditions. Yes. Thanks.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you, Laila. On the floor, do you have any question to Laila? Yep, please.

ANDREAS MUSIELAK

Andreas Musielak from nic.at. First question, do you see already an increased deletion rate for .dk domain names? Because people say, okay, I don't need my .dk domain name, do you experience something like this?

LAILA JENSEN

[01:06:25 - inaudible] people believe that they-- yeah. No, we haven't seen this yet and we don't expect it. We have been discussing it, because often when you contact the customer, they remember they have this domain name and should they keep it. But we expect that maybe we'll lose some domain names, but then we will come back. We have spoken to the Swedish registry and

they didn't experience any calls in the Swedish domain names, but of course we don't know. But we are optimistic.

ANDREAS MUSIELAK

Okay. And one follow-up question. So, we'll not have any registrar of last resort within the registry, which mean there will be no direct registration anymore with .dk hostmaster, or...?

LAILA JENSEN

No. But we are going to think about that-- we will be a last resort if something happens and the registrant cannot come in contact with the registrar, then we some way have to be able to step in and help the registrant.

ROELOF MEIJER

Yeah, thank you very much. Roelof Meijer from .nl for the record. I'm a bit confused because you said the change was that no new registrations could be handled by the registry. That suggests a bit that you had direct registrations, but if I understood correctly, you didn't. The only part...

LAILA JENSEN

Yeah.

ROELOF MEIJER

You had?

LAILA JENSEN We have the direct registrations today, the registrant could choose between us or the registrar.

ROELOF MEIJER Oh, I thought it was just for the invoicing, but it's for the whole process.

LAILA JENSEN Yeah, but except you can you buy the domain name through the registrar, but everything else you could say, do you want us to invoice you or the registrar to invoice you? Who would make that data, IT control? Yeah.

ROELOF MEIJER Okay. But to me, direct registration means I can bypass the registrar, I can directly go to the registry and register the domain name there, but that is not the case at the moment.

LAILA JENSEN No, no, you have to bypass through the registrar.

ROELOF MEIJER Okay. In the present system, is it possible for the registrar to additionally charge for the domain name, or does he have to kind

of fix that through his invoice for hosting or email or something like that?

LAILA JENSEN

I don't know if I understand the question correct, but the registrar, we have a host price, you could say. In the future, it would be a wholesale price. And then the registrar can take whatever price he wants towards the end user.

ROELOF MEIJER

But at the moment, a registrar cannot add to his invoice an additional fee for the domain name on top of the price that you are invoicing to the registrar.

LAILA JENSEN

He can, but today the registrars are not happy because they say when you sell the domain name, because after one year, the registrant could choose to be with us. And we sell the domain name for like, less than 10 euros, and then the registrar say it's hard to compete when the registrant could choose you, because if you have a higher price, then we are in competition with the registrar.

ROELOF MEIJER

Yeah, okay. One remark and then a last question, if that's okay with the Chair. The remark is you said that you got less questions from registrants than you expected, but you said in the beginning that

nobody knows who [01:09:59 - inaudible] is like in our case, our registrants normally don't know who IDN is.

So, I think it's normal that you get very few reactions from registrants because they read something, but they don't know you. My last question is, do you think that your market, because you mentioned it, do you have two large registrars, Team Blue and one.com, and you have a few hundred smaller ones that have less than a thousand domains each. Do you think your market is competitive enough to prevent those two very large registrars to seriously increase their prices?

LAILA JENSEN

Yes, we think that because we expect that also foreign registrars from outside Denmark will be interested in competing on the Danish market. It was a question that was raised by the Danish competition authorities concern because there are two dominated registrars on the Danish market.

But we hope that there will be competition also in the future, we expect there will be competition, and then we will also look after the retail end user prices to follow the pricing in the market because it is what the surrounding society is most concerned about is the pricing of the Danish market and the competition going forward.

ROELOF MEIJER

Okay. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Okay. Thank you, Laila. And time catch up. So, now 11:40 AM. So, last presenter from Armenia, .am is Katarine. Maybe you can finish within this AM period. Thank you.

KATARINE GEVORGYAN

Thank you. Good morning, good afternoon, good evening, everybody, and thank you for this opportunity. I'm Katarine Gevorgyan from Armenia, and I represent the .am Registry. I'm the manager of external relations. So, shortly about Armenia, you can find some information on the slide. We are a small country with around 3 million population, but with a big potential.

My presentation will be more about how we promote our .am ccTLD around the world. But before that, I would like to share some information. AM NIC is the manager of the-- AM NIC provides .am registration service, manages the domain database, and AM NIC is managed by the Internet Society NGO of Armenia. You can find the URLs to the websites, and in case you need more information, you can look through.

So, to whom can be provided .am registration? Our registrars which are .am accredited, they should be only based in Armenia, the legal entities. But they are, of course, working through their resellers globally.

In total we have 78 registrars by today. .am ccTLD domain name can be registered by anyone physical or legal entity all over the

world. And of course, the registry provides private WHOIS which can be activated with the option by any registrar, as well as we have the DNSSEC and registrar log activated already.

A little bit about numbers. As far as the registration can be done by anyone over the world besides Armenia, the first three levels are gained by US, China, and Russia. Sometimes these numbers are going up and down, but usually these three countries are holding the main part of the .am outside of Armenia.

As of today, we have still 46,000 plus domains registered. Of course, it is not a big amount of domains, but I would like to say that we're working hard with our registrars and our marketing group. About 2, 3000 domains were registered during last year. We're mostly promoting .am ccTLD with taking account the trends that are developing now in the world.

And besides that, that it stands for Armenia, we can use it for different purposes. And here are just five, six examples, but we have over 100 ways of using .am. So, artificial intelligence and machine learning for sure nowadays, innovations, manufacturing, asset management, after market for any kind of markets, domains, cars, et cetera. Also, for Armenia made or American made products, of course, also the countries, America, Amsterdam, .am can stand also for these countries.

Usually, not only us but different ccTLDs use this trick, the hacking system of the domain when we can separate the world. And now, this [01:16:17 - inaudible] will.i.am pretty famous in the world, and

they use .am as their websites. Also, as I already told, this artificial intelligence and machine learning can also be used as a combined word in this market.

And we already have registrars whose customers already provided that kind of websites. I mean they use for their websites, .am in this purpose. As news for our ccTLD and also taking account the new technologies that are coming and developing such kind of like web platforms or crypto currencies and the blockchain technologies, .am ccTLD integrated officially with blockchain technology. And now, our users can use it, their domains, their blockchain wallet numbers instead of their wallet numbers.

So, anyway, I'm not like a technical person to provide all the detailed information, but of course, if someone is interested, I can provide the contact information how it is done technically. So, it keeps traditional websites working as usual while adding new decentralized features like NFT links, digital wallets, connections, and Web3 branding options.

Last year in 2024, we celebrated 30 years of .am and we initiated a journal with the people whom you may might know already who started from the beginning the initiation and .am ccTLD, the management who brought all that stuff to Armenia, connected to people.

And in our website, you can find more detailed information about that people looking through this journal in a digital version. I think

I was very fast because we didn't have enough time, but if any questions, I would like to answer with pleasure. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you, Katarine. And on the floor, do you have any questions to .am during the morning period? It's the right time to ask her. Afternoon, .pm. Yeah, please.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER

Thank you, Katarine, for your presentation. I just want to ask and congratulations for your 30 years.

KATARINE GEVORGYAN

Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER

I just want to ask, 30 years is a long time, and I'm looking at the number of domain counts that you have. Could there be any challenges that you have faced or you are facing in increasing the adoption? And what are some of the things you want to do to increase the adoption? Thank you.

KATARINE GEVORGYAN

Thank you for the question. Yeah, the number is really low still, and probably the main challenge is that we didn't promote .am fully in global market before. Like we started, for example, this last two years. And also, some people who are even running businesses,

especially small businesses, they sometimes think that Facebook pages and Instagram is enough to have their business.

But now, ISOC NGO Armenian Internet Society are also initiating some kind of learning to trainings to provide the information that for any business, Facebook or Instagram page is not enough and it is not safe to keep their customers only there. So, we hope that trainings will help us to gain more numbers also. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you. Yeah, this social network issue is very interesting and the same as .pg. You imagine, we are 34 years old, but we only have 3000 domains, very small numbers.

KATARINE GEVORGYAN

So, we are far away.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Yeah, because we didn't do marketing nearly over 20 years. So, after a bit, just four years before I joined .pg and I automated and the rapidly, 30% increase from 2000 to 3000. But now many people ask why create a website rather than Facebook page? But I can say Facebook, you can create, but it's under the control by other people. You can't control. Sometimes Facebook down or even government shut off Facebook access, then no one can access.

So, these things we need to encourage. Anyway, do you have any more question? We have big time. Ah, okay. I think, yeah, Sammy

from online asking questions. Thank you for the great presentation, Katarine, and congratulations for the 30 years anniversary. Question, "for Web3, did you require a legal framework development ensuring that Web3 functions within country's law?"

KATARINE GEVORGYAN

I don't think I understood the question clearly, but to be honest and like to give a proper question, please contact ISOC Armenia and we'll provide more information about this.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

All right. Sammy, you have heard, please contact ISOC Armenia. Yeah. Do you need to make any law or any regulation? Same, I think you can contact ISOC Armenia and get more question. Yep. Thank you. And the comment, marketing is a key resource and increasing the domain count. Yes, I fully take note. Thank you. Do you have any more question? Yeah, please.

VOJISLAV RODIC

I have a question for Hilde for the previous presentation. For the record I'm Vojislav Rodic from .rs, Serbian registry. And this is a follow-up question to a question I asked about 10 years ago. When I ask you who pays for the renewal of the domain registration or domain subscription while it is in police custody?

And then, you answered, of course, the police, they have to take care of the domain as much as they would take care of the dog.

Now, my follow up question is, if the final decision, core decision for the domain is deletion, does it mean when you say just deletion, it means next moment it's free for registration. Is there any period that it might be reserved against any reservation or maybe permanently? Thank you.

HILDE THUNEM

Okay, thank you for your question. It's a very good question. In the case that a domain, in a criminal case, it's found by the court that the domain has been used to commit a crime, then the court can decide on a confiscation of the right of use. And this is like if you have a stolen bicycles or other things that is found to be part of a criminal case, the court can decide to confiscate it on behalf of the state.

Now, then they have several options. One is to give the thing back to the people they were stolen from, not the case in the case of the domain, but in the case of stolen bikes, they will do that if they know the owner. They can sell it. If they can't find the owner, they can sell it.

This is what they do with stolen bikes, but not with drugs, of course. With drugs, they will destroy it. And for the right of use of the domain name, the domain name subscription, they can choose to sell it if they want to, and it will go onto a new registrant. Of course, the registrant has to fulfill their requirements for having a domain name under .nl, so no Santa Clause.

But they can also decide to destroy it, and if they do, and they tell us that there's been a court decision, it is final and we want to destroy the subscription, then we will decide to have a period of time where nobody can register it. And that is just to ensure that the next registrant that comes in is not registering a domain name that was recently used for a crime.

But we do not believe that domain names are inherently evil and should be taken out of circulation for all time. We just think there has to be a cool down period, and that is something we as a registry will initiate.

It has never happened because we have had in all the years, one case where the police actually got a decision to confiscate a domain and they instead said, ah, we will be keeping it and paying for it and using it to give information to the society about what happened on this domain, but that could in theory be the case for us.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you. I think I have to wrap up this session. Very interesting. Olga, that's yeah, one question. Thank you.

OLGA CAVALLI

Thank you very much. Very quickly to ask a question for Katerine, comment. Have you explored the possibility of marketing the .am ccTLD in other, sorry, in other languages? I can think of some examples in Spanish that could be useful. Maybe you can explore

that and you could market it, good example of .co for example. Maybe you can think about it.

KATARINE GEVORGYAN

Thank you, Olga. Pretty good question, and we have to talk about it and think about it. Maybe we can talk later. Thank you.

RUSSELL DEKA HARADA

Thank you. I think a very interesting session and quite cold in this room. So, I'll wrap up this session and .ng, Sola, I have a big interest about this .ng Academy. I think I'm .pg, so I have to start .pg academy and I seek your assistant. And Hilde, I think this DNS abuse, very important.

Many things I ask you this question. And also, my Japanese friend are worried about this illegal content, especially manga anime, these things. So, we'll discuss later. And through online, Diego, thank you. Very interesting. You rapidly increase number of users, including my country. You see my shirt? This one.

We are celebrating 50 years anniversary in this year, and this 50 years png50.co, .co domain we are using. Our government are unfortunately not using .pg, but using your Colombian domain. So thank you for your presence. And .tk, Laila, very interesting using a two R to three R model. We will exactly follow your model very soon. And Katerine, Armenia, thank you.

Within morning period, we can finish your presentation. And also, you mentioned this internet society, we have to work closely with

this internet society because my understanding, this DNS is a public property, not government property, but a public property.

So, we have to look after where, and I believe, I promise my last news, I want to present to you is as I mentioned Papua New Guinea independent from Australia, 50 years before September 16, and this year we are celebrating 50 years anniversary.

And I'm very privileged to honor and receive this king medal award from PNG government on the way traveling to here. Before I arrived here, I arrived at Paris Airport, Charles de Gaulle, and I heard this information from my government, Papua New Guinea government gave me a Kings Medal Award. And I'm very privileged and honored to announce this news to you all.

So, my presidency in PNG 28 years, more than half of my life contribute to Papua New Guinea, especially higher education universities. So, I'm glad to present this information to you all. And also, I'll maybe, small ccTLD, become a session Chair as this ccNSO new session.

So, I believe any other small ccTLD, follow me and become a session Chair. So, on behalf of this organizing team, I acknowledge to you all present, and please clap your hands to all presenters. Thank you. So, please...

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]