
LOS ANGELES – ICANN Africa Strategy Session
Tuesday, October 14, 2014 – 11:15 to 13:00
ICANN – Los Angeles, USA

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Ladies and gentlemen. We are very sorry for the delay. We are about to start very soon.

We have interpretation – French and English, so we are going to have the session in the two languages. Thank you very much.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you all for coming and apologies for this slight delay. We will start our Africa-Strategy Session.

Lucky Masilela will be co-moderating this and I think you do have the proposed agenda. We have a packed panel here but we manage to have everyone to speak. I will just be highlighting a few points on the implementation of our Africa strategy.

But I will like to leave it to Lucky so that he quickly recognize all of our panelists and before we start.

LUCKY MASILELA: Thank you, Pierre. Welcome again, colleagues. I think it is another time whereby we need to refresh and try to cover grounds that we intend to be covering in our strategy session.

This time around we hope that we will be able to go through the time that we have set ourselves. We are supposed to have started five

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

minutes ago and we intend to go until 13:00 hours, and hopefully, there will be no disturbance until we conclude at 13:00.

Now, as we proceed today, we have a panel that will shed some light on the development and some of the things that we need to be pondering on. And the intention today is not to listen to ourselves as the moderator here, but to allow the panelists to share the insights and then for the community at large – this African community – to then engage on the presentations that will be shared with us.

As I introduce the panel – unfortunately, the panel is not seated in this common point. They are spread all over the show, but I think it’s good for the continent putting those dots together that define the continent even better.

We have in our panel, who will also be talking to us. It’s Mike Silber and welcome. He’s in the Board of ICANN. And Mary Uduma, I think I see her somewhere. Mary? Yes, thanks Mary from NIRA in Nigeria.

Then we have Baher Esmat the Vice President Middle East North Africa. Welcome. Then Dr. Paulos Nyirenda. Thank you, Sir Nyirenda. You’re most welcome.

And then we have George Sadowsky. George, thank you, George for making it. We have Amy Bivins who will be sharing with us some thoughts. Thanks, Amy.

And then of course, there are certain people that might not appear in the agenda, but they’re very instrumental in the shaping of our thinking. I would want to recognize Dr. Andy Lingaba. If [you] does have some

thoughts, comments, you are also welcome where once the panel has gone through to share some of your insights.

I'm going to allow the panel to take us through their thoughts in at least 3.5 minutes. I will not be keeping time, but I'll trust your judgment in this one. Thank you.

Please, I will start with Mike Silber.

MIKE SILBER: Pierre, I think wants to present some slides in terms of status before we go.

LUCKY MASILELA: Sorry, yes.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: If we may quickly go through the slides at least to set the stage for the [inaudible] brief remarks by our panelists. Please.

I would like to welcome Tarek who has joined us, Tarek Kamel, who as you all know has been quite instrumental for this strategy. Tarek is special advisor to our President and CEO.

So quickly, I will take you through, some of the what we might call, the key, sortof what we've done, what we have achieved so far, kind of an overview, and then highlight some of what we are calling flagship project that I will be implementing. And now has come also for us the time to review our key indicators. We also need to hear about some of

our outreach efforts to Africa, so we need to engage with all of our stakeholders. The challenges we've been facing and, of course, the way forward which will be guided by your contribution.

So I'm going to be quite quick on that one because I really want us to not repeat what we did in London where we didn't have enough time, and of course a few issues to solve there. So by way of implementation, maybe a brief background here.

All of this started two years ago. The Africa Working Group developed this strategy and this came as part of this new season that the new CEO – and I'm [inaudible] – which led us to have kind of closer, I will say relationship, with stakeholders, especially from Africa, and that was the first strategy to be developed.

The strategy of course has a numbers of what you might call [new] strategic objective, eight of them. But also these were translated in to I will say many projects. We are talking about more than a hundred projects.

So what we did when we started a year or maybe slightly more than a year and a half ago was to choose a few projects. [Not that way for that] will make a difference, you know, kind of quick wins if you take it like that. So we had about eight of them during our financial year 13 and then during the financial year 14, then we [went to] 10 or 11 of them actually.

So this is the data, the information we are having there is about those that have been started. So the presentation we're there. We've started

of course practically almost of the 11. We are on course, of course, for most of them. Maybe, quickly going through them.

The DNSSEC roadshow is quite popular. This is what helped us build capacity within the ccTLDs, especially when it comes to assigning the zone file. We've been already to eight countries and we have a concrete result as well because some of them are now signing the zone file. Capacity has been built locally and there are details where we are and where we should be heading.

We also have, of course, our Stakeholder Engagement missions to different places. We do have two managers. We are expecting to have more, but so far we managed to reach out to our government and also to our private sector, the academia, different places, and we are happy to have [Ashwin], I will say, been instrumental for new members that are coming in to GAC for instance.

You all know that in this ICANN session we have to let you know two new members on the GAC, which is quite good. We should continue.

Of course, project on DNS incubation.

Also understand that there are two key words to retain out of this Africa Strategy. One of them is increased participation from Africa. The second key word, in fact, is the domain name in the certain business in Africa.

So we see most of our projects now are concentrating on that one. How do we strengthen the African market? How do we strengthen the African domain name industry?

So we have a few projects, for instance, the Exchange program with DNS industry leaders is something quite concrete now. We are developing kind of internship program. Right now we have six Africans who will be spending some time with in a few global DNS industry leaders. Of course, one of them is Afilius. So two of them will be in Canada at the end of this month and are going through the whole technical but also business component of managing the registrars.

We are also sending a few of them to Singapore with IP [Mirror] and AfriNIC also [inaudible] in France and we're also working with a few of [the rest].

Of course, policy advice also on re-delegation and you all know that Africa is one of the places where we do have this issue of re-delegation. Currently, we have at least six to eight countries that are still looking forward to re-delegation. We are working with them providing whatever is needed.

Of course there are also [inaudible] project. But let me say that what's important for us is how do we build this strategic partnership that will really help us implement this.

The strategy was developing funds to ICANN. Definitely ICANN is certainly providing some resources for us to implement it, but we do believe that if you really want to have this massive impact that we will like for Africa, we really need to find other resources. That's why it's key for us to work on this strategic partnership and I hope our panelists will give us a few ideas on that.

Of course, some of the key performance indicators, for instance, are a number of L-root copies that are deployed, for instance, because we are working on that in many places in Africa. We have right now at least six countries that have request it and I do believe that by the end of this year we might have three to four of them that will adapt to the nine or ten countries that we do have today that are already hosting the L-root server. There is also work on this. Go ahead, please.

Okay, I don't know whether you can read this for now, but key results. Well, thanks to this partnership we are having with ISOC and also I will say under the guidance of the AfTLD, which is the African TLD Association, we did organize the second DNS Forum. You also remember that we started this in Durban. That was the first time ICANN was launching this DNS Forum. Now most regions are actually organizing their own DNS Forum, but we started in Africa in Durban. The second one we already have in Abuja and we are planning the third one sometime in maybe next July, but probably Paulos will tell more on that as we are thinking.

Now, yes, we also – some of the results are there, but let me go quickly because we really want to hear from you.

Challenges – well, as I said before, the Africa Strategy when you read it through, you will see that it's quite a big document or so. Big expectations are there, but then when you now see what you need as a resource in order to implement these, it's massive for me. Ao we do have limited financial resources. As I said, ICANN is doing what it has to do, but definitely, we need more on that.

We also felt that we need to engage more with our community because we are seeing that we are having more and more African participation to ICANN meetings and that's a yes, but I have to confess that we are yet to see this sort of effective participation – meaning informed participation. That also proves that you do have the leadership.

Right now in terms of leadership position, we don't have much in ICANN. So it's good to have more and more people attending, but we would like to have you in there. When I mean leadership position, it's about you working within [ISO] Working Group, for instance. It's about you being in the constituencies on the Board. Well, we see. We think needs no more of African coming to this position, but you need to be involved, definitely, and that's what we are calling for.

Language barrier, as you know, are still there. ICANN is doing what it has to do in terms of language or translation, whatever, but certainly this is also a bit slow for us.

Okay, in terms of re-delegation, yes. Most of the government that I meet know that this is one of the issues they are having. Therefore, that should be done right away, but it takes some time. They believe that it is taking too much time. So how do you fast track this for instance?

Of course, the problem connectivity in Africa. But that's not our issue per say as far as ICANN is concerned. But it still prevents us from, for instance, launching some of our projects. For instance, the webinars that we would like to be organizing with each of our constituencies for instance. So what we really need in terms of a way forward for us is, of

course, we need to review our KPIs, and we want to work on that with you.

Also, we want to establish the Steering Committee that we need and we want to hear a little bit about your ideas, about those things, how we do implement those tools out of items we have here. That's important for us.

So I would like to actually stop here and, of course, to respond to your questions, but we do have our other panelists and I would like the moderator to take from here now. Please, Lucky. Thanks for your attention.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Okay. Thanks, Pierre, for the highlights on the status. I think I would want to allow for about five minutes questions on the presentation before we proceed to the next item, which would be the establishment of a Steering Committee. Let me allow for five minutes on the presentation that Pierre has given us. Any questions? Yes sir.

JIMSON OLUFUY:

Thank you. My name is Jimson Olufuy, Africa ICT Alliance. Just to thank Pierre for the presentation and to note that this engagement has been quite constructive.

I represent ICT Alliance, Africa ICT Alliance, and we did say before that Africa ICANN needs to engage the ICT industry association and I want to report here that the engagement has been quite constructive and we need to continue with the collaboration. In fact, in two weeks' time

Kamel will be hosting us in Egypt as part of our implementation of the strategy with the DNS Workshop along with about 20 African business people. So we need to continue with this.

And lastly, I would just recommend that we should also engage the regulators. You are engaging the ICT industry, good. But you need to engage the regulators.

Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Okay, Thanks James for that comment. Any other comment/questions? Yes, I have one. Hold on, Tarek. My apologies. I meant to recognize you, Tarek, you know, and you're welcome. Let's take two questions and then I'll allow you to respond to that.

UGO AKIRI:

My name is Ugo. I'm from Nigeria. Until recently, I used to work with .NG.

I have a concern here. I think this forum is concerned with the penetration of Internet, the uptake of domain names in Africa. I think [inaudible] if we talk about statistics, the African region is the only place where IP version 4 has not been exhausted. I think that should give us cause for concern. I think many ccTLDs are not doing very well if we compare it with successful ccs in North America, in Europe. I think that should give us cause for concern, too.

I've observed some common features. I think many ccs in Africa don't have strong secretariats. I think there's a management problem. Is there a way of addressing that here?

LUCKY MASILELA: Thanks, Ugo. If you may, any other question/comment? Then we'll take the questions off. Yes ma'am.

ANNA SECKA SAINE: Good Morning. My name is Anna from the Gambia. Given that he said there are budget issues, I was wondering how we would address the issue of outreach because most people in our region are not aware of what ICANN can do to be able to effectively participate. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA: Thank you, Anna. May I then request Pierre and Tarek, if you would want to respond to the questions posed?

PIERRE DANDJINO: Thank you very much. I will take the last one, which is about outreach and especially the resources that ICANN is already committing. Definitely, ICANN is committing a few resources.

You saw the fellowship program. If you are working with inconsistencies you also see that there are some facilities there. But my concern also because I do have concern – and let me be frank with you. How long are we going to have African just being subsidized or sponsored to come to

these meeting? We should work so that the business also be part of this and send African to these meetings.

So, I know that ICANN is doing what it has to do and the setting will be ready to do more, but we should be participating to ICANN as I will say may the business and the industry should be there definitely. And it's not just about sponsoring. It will be there. Facilitation will be there. But it should not just be the only one way of finding resources to be at ICANN meeting. We need to work out this definitely.

And with some of the countries, when we are engaging with them the message is about we meet with the regulators. For instance, we know that regulators are able to facilitate more and more people to come to these meetings. Of course, when they understand, it happens.

I do have two or three countries in Africa where this is happening. They are sending many people here. They don't need ICANN necessarily to provide the means for that. So, when they understand, they will come on board so I think that's what I should say.

The other thing, Ugo, you are right. We should still do better. I know fTLD has projects on the ground. Maybe we need to beef up those program and also inject much more on the business skills maybe that people need. And, that's why we went for this [internship] thing. We are having some topical meetings. I think that [inaudible] mentioned our partnership there and then we'll be going to Cairo and there we are working on DNS entrepreneurship, for instance. We do have this DNS entrepreneurship center and [inaudible] is going to talk about that one.

But these are initiatives that we are taking as ICANN, but I think we need to amplify those things by finding local resources. I think apart from that, maybe Tarek, do you want to add anything on that?

TAREK KAMEL:

No. Thank you very much for inviting me. Concerning government engagement, which is a part of the time responsible for within the engagement at ICANN, we don't spare effort to engage with governments and outreach to governments. We fully understand the role of governments still in the developing countries in the policy setting as well as in helping us really to develop the DNS industry by providing incentives, by providing support for the entrepreneurs, and by helping us really to push the DNS industry forward

Recently, Pierre and Mike have been in Rwanda hosted by the minister of Rwanda in an event within Smart Rwanda. So we look for full partnership definitely not only with governments but with civil society and private sector as much as it is possible.

But let's not forget that Africa has more than 50 countries and some of the initiative has to come also from the local community. ICANN can only stimulate in some part of it, but the rest we look forward for stimulation from the local community and we see some good leads. As I mentioned, Rwanda and others. Thank you.

ANNA SECKA SAINE:

Sorry, I have one quick comment. I think it's more of an awareness issue. Because if you talk to a lot of people – I'm in the technical field –

they are not even aware of ICANN to begin with. So I think we should worry about awareness once people are aware of ICANN and then they can effectively participate rather than the budgetary aspect of it. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA: Great. Okay, Anna. Thanks for that. I want to go back to a response that I feel needs to be addressed properly. Ugo raised a very critical issue about the Internet economy and the growth on the continent, the growth of ccTLDs. We cannot skate on this matter lightly and I know they referred to Dr. Nyirenda that you will address is there are programs on the ground that will be addressing the growth of ccTLDs or the uptake of domain names, which is a challenge comparing the continent against the rest of the world. Do you have any specific comments or will you cover that in our discussion, Dr. Nyirenda?

PAULOS NYIRENDA: It was one of those things that I was going to cover. So, do you want me to comment now or during my briefing?

LUCKY MASILELA: Are we stealing your [inaudible] if we ask you to do it now?

PAULOS NYIRENDA: Okay. So, I'll do just a brief on what we do, how we participate in the strategy.

I come from the Africa Top-Level Domains Organization (AfTLD) and we are a focal point for African ccTLDs. We run a number of programs and our operations. We have a very good working relationship with the ICANN Africa strategy. Pierre mentioned some of the projects that we did under that collaboration. I'll mention a little bit more.

So, our main activities are to do with the developing ccTLDs, but we also work with other TLDs and we also work with registrars in our initiatives. Most of our activities that we deal with involve capacity building and we run at least three workshops a year on capacity building for ccTLDs. So indeed, the status of African ccTLDs – we had an assessment on this in 2008, and under the strategy, we have a project to run a ccTLD watch or observatory. That project will start soon so that we can have some definite assessment.

I think that one of the issues that we have on the continent is that there is not enough data on ccTLDs in Africa. So, when you're talking about assessment, you need some kind of data and you need that to do some basic planning. So we have this project. It's a study. And I think that when it commences maybe later this year, we would like to invite active participation from ccTLDs and from stakeholders.

The workshops that we run for development of ccTLDs mainly involve registry development. One of the observations that we have is that African ccTLDs really, as Ugo has mentioned, have lagged behind. There are very few domain registrations, there are few registrars on the continent, there's little penetration for domain names, and the ccTLDs mostly are still not sustainable. So supporting the ccTLDs is a relatively big challenge.

Our next capacity building workshop will be in Lesotho between 10 and 14 November, and this is an initial registrar operators' course. We've just gone through some basic planning for it. We are looking for partners and we would appreciate any partnerships in addition to the ones that we already know that we have, which is with ICANN, ISOC, AfriNIC, and Francophone. We do welcome additional partnerships to run this.

We have been aware—

LUCKY MASILELA: Can I, Dr. Nyirenda?

PAULOS NYIRENDA: Yes.

LUCKY MASILELA: When you come on as a panelist to address those in detail, we just wanted just a highlight of what you're doing as a response to Ugo's question. But I think we have a sense and we'll take more when you proceed in that three minutes that you'll be having as a panelist, yes? Is that fine? Please.

PAULOS NYIRENDA: That's fine. That's what I asked. I thought these were my three minutes.

LUCKY MASILELA: No. I just wanted a quick response to that, but thanks for the highlight. I think this matter does need a place somewhere to give support to its success. Any other questions?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes. We have some people following remotely and we have a question from ISOC Uganda and he's written his in.

LUCKY MASILELA: Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: "Can ICANN set special strategies be set for Africa?" This is his question so I'm just reading this question from ISOC Uganda.

LUCKY MASILELA: Pierre?

PIERRE JANDINOU: I'm not quite sure I understand. But ICANN already has a strategy for Africa, which is the one we are talking about so if it's – yes. Yes sir?

VICTOR NDONNAG: Thank you. I'm Victor Ndonnag. I would just like to get an update from the African Bureau about something that we discussed back towards this in March 2013, where the ICANN CEO announce that in 18 months he would do his best to increase the number of ICANN accredited

registrar in Africa from, that time I think it was five to 25. But I know that there is an ongoing work on that issue directed by ICANN staff, but I would like to know what is the involvement of the Africa Strategy Team in that work because we are talking about a few number of domain name registration in Africa.

If you want people to buy bread, you have to allow them to open a bake shop. To buy shoes, if there is no initial way you can buy shoes, you can't buy them and we complain that people are not buying shoes.

The same thing is true for the domain names. Someone want to register a domain name from Cameroon, the cc is not doing very well and the person want a get a .com for example, but it's not quite easy.

You have to go through a foreign accredited registrar with foreign currency with foreign registration. That is a point that I want to address. I want to hear about the African team. What's the involvement to, let's say, it was announced to be 25 – 18 one has already been passed, but we still have, I think, 7, so what's going on on that issue. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Any other question comment?

JEREMIE GODRECHE:

Hi. My name is Jeremie. I'm from Freenom. Actually, I wanted to propose to answer Victor's question because I gave a small presentation on this topic at AIS in n Djibouti. But, it's up to you.

LUCKY MASILELA: Can you—

JEREMIE GODRECHE: I wanted to [inaudible] an opinion about the ICANN accredited registrar business in Africa. I'm not sure why that's important for the development of this industry here.

The ICANN accreditation for registrars is not required for any of the African ccTLDs. And basically, what you're saying is that you want to find more places to sell gTLDs in Africa. Of course that's going to be important for .africa at some point, but none of the other African ccTLDs require this to distribute their domains. So I'm very curious why that's a very high priority.

Next to that, there is a very high cost to becoming ICANN accredited as a registrar and I think for a lot of businesses starting up in this space, for a lot of companies who want to become registrar, it doesn't really make much economical sense to directly go for an ICANN accreditation. There are many, many ICANN accredited registrars who offer reseller programs where you can basically buy gTLDs from them and then resell them with a small mark up and it's much, much better from a business point of view. That's our opinion from the private sector.

LUCKY MASILELA: Thanks for those comments. Any other questions?

Now, I just want to just reiterate two things that I've noted from the questions. I think we do need to revisit the African strategy. I think it needs to be much clearer. If it's not clear to the community at large that

they are uncertain what needs to be done and the issue of outreach needs to be emphasized significantly. So, I'm hoping that the Steer Com that will be established will assist in these matters. So, thank you for those questions.

We have one panelist who has left and we're trying to not lose anymore panelists. If you permit me, I can change the agenda around or just go further in to the steer com as per the agenda, the Steering Committee, the key issues and the strategy. I don't know what is the feeling of the VP here.

PIERRE JANDINOU:

No. I think we should give a chance to our panelists to go through because we really wanted them to tackle a few aspects of the strategy, provide their own thinking, and then we'll proceed with question and answer and provide ample time for discussion.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Okay. I am happy. May I look around and see if there is any other differing view, opinion? I see everybody's in sync and agreement with the VP. So, Okay, ma'am.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

Hello everyone. My name is Miss [inaudible] and I would like to contribute at this level regarding the African strategy. I will ask the different actors of the strategy to take in to account the problem of literacy in Africa. If we are looking at literacy rate in Africa, it has a

strong impact on our goals that we want to reach to democratize those domain names.

When we do communicate to bring awareness in TV, radio, so that people come to us – some of them come to us – they do register a domain name, they go back to the site, and they are expecting to have the site available right away. So, we do have to do a lot of explaining. People do not understand how it works. So we have to ask our registrars to do a better job for the community to explain very well how it works.

This is what I wanted to day. I saw it, I do a lot of communication in my area, but the return is very slow. They come back to us. We can do a website for us. This is one cost which is too much for them. We are trying to give them the best cost, but unfortunately, the people requesting for us to do a site are telling us we're too expensive. This is an issue.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Pierre, you need to assist. I missed out quite a bit by the time I got the headphones. Thanks.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

I think basically it was about the issue of literacy and she said we should also make sure that we deal with that when we're talking about this. We are responding the DNS market basically. But we will come back on when we are discussing on this.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Okay. Thanks for your comments, ma'am. Much appreciated.

May I then proceed to the panel and get some notes on the thinking of panel, so that after this I would want us to spend a little bit more time in formalizing the Steering Committee, so if we're to jump in to the panel presentations.

In the order of the speakers here, we've missed I think Amy Bivins. She would be talking to us about the GDD, the brief on the status, but she has left so we'll just proceed with the speakers that we have starting with Mike Silber. Thanks.

MIKE SILBER:

Thanks, Masilela. I think there've been some brilliant, interesting comments. I think Victor holding the promises made back when the African Strategy was envisaged is an important reminder. I think the critical thing and I think why this African strategy can and hopefully will be successful is because it was developed by Africans for Africans rather than being imposed from the top down or put together by external consultants. And that, to me, is incredibly positive.

At the same time, we need to recognize that we're working in an environment which is at the moment fraught with issues. The IANA transition is consuming a massive amount of time. Issues around the politicization of Internet access, surveillance, human rights issues, they're all consuming an incredible amount of time and we need to decide what the focus of the strategy is because we cannot cover everything.

And, I think things like outreach, computer literacy are essential. They're absolutely essential, but we need to decide if that's where we start because the idea behind the African strategy is to use business as a driver to drive some of those issues. Is, as we improve the operation of ccTLDs as we improve the ability technically and from a policy and business perspective of people to participate in this community, hopefully that raises the level of their ccTLDs, hopefully it raises the level within their country, and then there should be a trickle-down effect. Now, if people don't feel that's the appropriate strategy, then we must have that discussion.

And it's the same with outreach. The idea is as far as possible for ICANN to assist and contribute materials that can be reused.

If you just think about it from a cost perspective, the cost of flying a speaker to a conference from the United States, for example, to attend a conference for three or four days, speak to a limited audience of 50-60 people, fly back, rather than the opportunity to deliver material and provide training, which then allows people to use that material multiple times in multiple countries and create a pool of talented and capable people within Africa. The cost may very well be the same or even lower as compared to flying a speaker.

But unfortunately, we Africans tend to look for the high-profile speaker. We're looking for the foreigner to come and talk to us because we don't necessarily believe in the value of our own people, or at worst somebody who comes from one of our neighbors but who has expertise in the topic.

And I think if we take that general approach, which is ICANN is here to provide resources, but we need to step up and we need to become the local and regional experts using the knowledge we've gained, using the materials that have been shared.

But we need to become the champions. We can't rely on people flying in. What they sometimes refer as to pigeon consultants or parachute consultants. They fly in, make a lot of noise, leave a little bit of mess behind, and then they fly away again.

We can't have that because it's not sustainable and we don't leave a lasting legacy. And, that to me is the critical thing here is what is the best way to achieve a lasting legacy in terms of growing the industry – and I think that's a good thing – improving outreach, communication, computer literacy, knowledge in the space; and as that expands, the amount of revenue generated by the ccTLDs expands, which means they can devote more resources to even further expansion in their territories.

LUCKY MASILELA:

We'll have comments then.

MARY UDUMA:

Thank you very much. I want to say that we have progressed in Africa from what we used to be before the strategy and most important to me is that we should also develop our national strategies. There should be a national call it, what we are now going to form a Steering Committee, but like minds in the country or multi stakeholder that will sit down and

look at this African strategy and be able to adopt some of them as national strategy.

Because if you start at home, then you can grow. If you don't start at home, you're just looking at African strategy. We cannot grow. So, it's important.

Now, all of us that are sitting here, when we get back to our countries, we should be able to look at the African strategy and see what is there for me in my country.

In my country, Nigeria, our national idea is drawn from what actually is good for us in the country. We don't look at the global scene, what the global idea. Even though the form might be the same, but what is it that we want to have people to hear? What is it that we want our people to benefit? Should it just be a talk show?

So, there is the need for us as the expert of those that are informed to preach to those that are not informed. How can people know about ICANN?

You may be surprised that even in the U.S. there are some universities that don't talk about ICANN. I visited a university on my way here and when I spoke to them about the DNS industry, they said, "Well, we do DNS."

They don't even understand that there's business in DNS. So that brings to mind for us at the national level how to reach out to the business community. The business community and unless we see the domain

name business registration as a business, it cannot progress. It must be seen as a business.

I know that in some jurisdictions, government registers like some that are private and ongoing multi-stakeholder are now being taken away by the regulator. One of the countries, the regulator wants to take it over. I think two of the countries I know. So that's another thing we should look at.

And, if we don't get the business people involved, the business will not grow and it's only when you see business in domain name business, then you generate the revenues to be able to attend ICANN meetings without being sponsored.

We have nothing less than 10 or 11 participants from Nigeria and most of them are not sponsored by ICANN. I'm not sure there's any, maybe one or two people that are sponsored or one person that is sponsored by ICANN.

So we try to preach this message back home. We try to tell our business people in every opportunity we see. When there's any activity, any ICT activity, we'll be able to communicate to our people that there's business in domain name business.

Then the next thing I want to talk about is cross country. Mike raised that. Neighboring countries coming together – synergy, collaboration, partnership, cooperation at the regional level. For instance, Gambia.

We could go to Gambia and talk to Gambia and be with Gambia and see that Gambia's re-delegation is done. So, there should be that

opportunity instead of flying people from everywhere. Why fly people? We can walk from Nigeria to Benae Republic or you can walk from Tanzania to Malawi.

PIERRE DANDJINO: Senegal to Gambia.

MARY UDUMA: Or Senegal to Gambia and just let us talk to ourselves. Let us support ourselves and see that we would grow the industry. I think those are things that are very critical for me in implementing the strategy.

So let me stop there and maybe if I have opportunity to say any other thing, I can say it again. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA: Thanks, Mary. May I request, I think Baher has accepted. Dr. Paulos, may I request you that that since George has to attend another session after this, if I may ask him to give us his brief comments. Then I will have Baher and Dr. Paulos after that. Thanks.

GEORGE SADOWSKY: Thank you very much. There's a lot to say.

The first thing I observe is that you've made a lot of progress in the last 20 years. If you had been in Montreal in 1996, at a meeting of Africans to talk about Africa and Internet, you would have heard about lack of access, lack of connectivity, lack of understanding, lack of people who

knew what they were talking about in all dimensions of computing and networking. We've come a long way, but there's a long way to go also as you can tell.

It's easy to determine that. You just look at some of your neighbors and they're more mature in their Internet working, they have more access etc. etc. And I think part of the feeling that I have is it's a feeling of impatience and I sense that also here. IT'S because I think we're dealing with a technology that is increasing in power at Internet speed and we unfortunately, as human beings, are only going at human being speed and it's very difficult to keep up. So, that's one comment.

Second, the areas in which help is needed. First of all, it's needed in lots of areas if we're going to make progress. But there are really three and I think we need to weight them more or less equally recognizing the unique characteristics of each.

The first is the technical area. Twenty years ago, no country had an adequate amount of technical knowledge to use the Internet the way it wanted to. Now we're catching up, but still in many developing countries there is not the critical mass of people who understand the details of routing, for example, in order to satisfy the demands of those who want the network to grow.

Secondary is business. If we're going to use this program as a way of getting business involved to increase the domain name business and the number of registrars or resellers in a country, then business has to understand business models, the characteristics of the particular markets that they're in, the ability to expand the business, and I'm not

sure how much of that there is. There are probably not enough. You'd probably like more.

And the third is government because the posture of government with respect to legislation and regulation is very important in terms of how any part of the Internet ecosystem can improve. Recall that only 10 or 20 years ago regulators and governments were concerned about how to regulate, not why to regulate or how to un-regulate and they were regulating a technology which is very different from the Internet technology. So, there has to be a fairly radical change in the way in which legislators and regulators think about this technology and think about it in terms of what's good for the country as opposed to taking the old patterns of regulation and imposing them on a new technology where they don't fit.

Third, I wanted to emphasize the critical role of registrars and resellers. These are people in the business community who are connected to the global DNS industry. They're also the retail outlet to all the people in their communities and their cities. There are low barriers to entry to this business

Unfortunately, as was pointed out by the gentleman from Djibouti, the barriers to entry to becoming an ICANN registrar are still very high and that is something that we as ICANN if we really want to improve the representation of our registrars in Africa, we've got to look at issues such as the issue of payments held in abeyance by registries, the insurance issues, the 58-page contract that you're being asked to sign, and things like that. We have a high barrier to entry, but the reseller market is somewhat different.

I hope that we can make the market for ICANN accredited registrars a little bit more friendly.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Why?

GEORGE SADOWSKY: Why? Well, I don't know. Let's come back to that.

I'm impressed with the notion that Pierre has brought up of strategic partnerships because I think that that's really got to be the way in which you grow significantly for a variety of reasons.

20 or 30 years ago if you wanted strategic partnerships and you needed hardware you went to Hewlett-Packard, and if you needed software you went to Microsoft. Now, hardware is not really an issue anymore, although clearly there is a cost to hardware, but hardware has been miniaturized and the costs have gone down. Software is available from multiple sources. That's not the issue. Human capacity is the issue.

And the way in which you've manage initially to leverage the cooperation of AfriNIC and IP Mirror and Afilias is really commendable. I think these people should be thanked heartily for their willingness to train people, to impart what they have to Africans who are interested in learning that business. It's not nearly enough. It's a start.

And what's really required is a program in countries, in regions which avoids the model of—what did you call it, Mike? – parachute consulting, which I think is absolutely right. Maybe you have to have that in the

beginning, but you should get away from it as quickly as possible because it's really costly on a per capita basis. And to the extent that you can leverage these partnerships to provide substantial time in country or in region training, we'll all be better off. I hope that ICANN can, either us as individuals or as an institution, can help push that very strongly to make what I think Pierre would want a reality.

A final point is there are two things that are not completely synonymous. One is the use of the Internet for economic and social development in your country, and two is the DNS business in your country. DNS is only one part of how to exploit the Internet for economic and social development.

I would say that there are a lot of people who never need to know about ICANN. They have no interest in it. All they want is a domain name. Maybe they don't even want that. Maybe they just want an account somewhere to do e-mail. Some people don't need to get involved with Internet. Many people don't need to get involved with ICANN and many people don't need to know about it, but we need that critical mass of people who do know about it in every country and can take advantage of it.

So in terms of economic and social development, think of ICANN as one component. Think of the DNS as one component – a very important component. But think of others and other organizations, ISOC the RIRs, the Bilateral and Multilateral aid agencies, the experience and expertise on the ground in other countries in Africa that can be exploited to achieve that goal. Thanks.

LUCKY MASILELA: Thanks, George. Baher, please.

BAHER ESMAT: Thank you. Good afternoon everyone. My name is Baher Esmat. I lead a global stakeholder engagement in the Middle East. I work very closely with Pierre on coordinating activities in the northern part of Africa. I come from Egypt and I'm based in Cairo, so I consider myself very much from Africa as well.

I just wanted to talk to you briefly about a new project that ICANN is working on in partnership with the Egyptian Telecom regulatory authority, NTRA, which is also the IDN ccTLD registry. And the project, as Pierre alluded to, is the DNS Entrepreneur Center.

Just a bit of a background -- the idea behind the center came from the regional strategies both in Africa and in the Middle East. There was a clear observation and recommendation in both strategies that more development and more work need to be done to strengthen the domain name industry in both regions.

Of course, there have been efforts to develop local capacities to do training and technical workshops and that has been done together with many community members from the ISTAR community, from registries and other members of the Internet community.

There was a thought and a notion that this is not enough and we need to do more in terms of ensuring that those who are trained in Africa or the developing regions in general can then take this knowledge and

move with it to the next level. They can go themselves and try to build more local capacitors in their countries.

So, the idea was to start with this center. And basically we're not here talking about a like 20 people organization. We're thinking that in the beginning there will be 2-3 people to start off this operation. And even before that, there will be a phase of training and mentoring programs that will take place. According to our time line, this will start off early next year. Early 2015, we're going to start off the training and mentoring programs. We're currently in the process of finalizing the training programs.

We have two main tracks. One is technical track, the other one is the business track. We've been coordinating and working closely with folks from the community from ccns, registries, registrars, and other parties. The ultimate objective here, to be honest, is not to increase the number of registrars or registries, it's mainly to transfer the knowledge, to make sure that there are enough knowledge in the regions that can then figure out what is required for the regions.

It could be that we need experts to help ccns improve their operations. It could be that we need consultants to help with future gTLD applications. It could be that someone could figure out a business model to start a reselling business or registrar business. So that is up to the individuals and the businesses in the regions to figure out, but what we are concerned with in the project is to spread the knowledge and to make sure that in all our activities we have this component of training the experts and training the trainers and make sure we have continuity.

It's not going to be like one training or one phase of training and that's it. We're also thinking along the lines of how to ensure that those people have the opportunity to go and attend meetings based on their interests, whether business meetings, technical forums. I think George has alluded to the program that we, ICANN, started with some of the registries like Afiliis and maybe others to send people from Africa to engage in an internship program for some time.

So these are the kind of things we're looking in to right now to try to do more. We realize that no matter what we do, there will always be more to be done and more expectations from the community so we're trying to do our best.

Pierre also noted something very important. We're not doing this alone. We're not doing this as ICANN. We're seeking partnerships. We're looking for partners from within the regions. We're looking for partners from the community.

I've been spending most of my time here this week in LA to talk to many friends and colleagues from the ICANN community about this project and will be happy to also talk to you and take any questions. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Thank you, Baher. George and Mike, you are excused gentlemen. You may leave. Thanks for your submissions. I don't know if you have any questions before the two gentlemen run away. They did talk to us about these consultants that come in and fly in and out of the country and controlling the movement and how to better use our resources. Any questions to the two gentlemen?

I want to clarify for these two gentlemen, there is Mike Silber and George who presented and they are leaving shortly and if there are any questions for the two gentlemen, I will only allow for that. All right.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I'm not sure mine is a question. I think it's a comment. I liked George's comments, but I beg to disagree with something he said about impatience.

When we look at the community, there are some new gTLDs that have registered 100,000 domains in a couple of months or some couple of months and it's the same technology, same world. So what's holding us back in Africa? Why is it taking us so many years? In [inaudible], we don't have 100,000 yet and the re-delegation happened in 2009.

LUCKY MASILELA: Okay. Thank you. Any other questions? Gentleman, comments.

MIKE SILBER: Other than to thank you and I think that there's a lot to be discussed in that discussion. I will go back and say if the purpose is not to sell names and make money then is the 100,000 9 targets that important or is it service to your community? And I think that's the critical thing. Is your community being served? How they're being served?

But yes, it's really useful and Masilela will acknowledge as CEO of the ZACR. As you get bigger, your ability to expand, do other things, your staff that can devote time to policy issues does improve. It's really

difficult and Dr. Nyirenda will confirm. As a registry operator of one or two people, it's difficult to devote the time required to policy issues as well as running technical operations and registry operations.

And that, to me, is the advantage of size. It's not a question of we want to catch up, but rather what advantages does size bring us. And if we're not there yet with size, what other things can we use to try and bring about those advantages?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We have some remote participants so please before speaking if you can introduce yourself, there are people following remotely. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA: Okay. Dr. Paulos. I've introduced you, Dr. Paulos Myirenda.

PAULOS MYIRENDA: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I think that I already said quite a few things on what we are doing. And by "we" I mean the Africa top level domains in conjunction with the ICANN Africa strategy.

So I looked at some of the things that have been mentioned, some of our activities really on capacity building and in partnership with ICANN, ISOC, and other players. Just as a reminder, we have a registrar operators course in Lesotho between 10 and 14 November.

One of the really important things with respect to the strategy is really development of registries in Africa. We concentrate on ccTLDs,

development of ccTLDs and we run these courses at initial level, security level and advance level.

I think that one of the things that has been mentioned is the fly-in trainers. Mike mentioned that. Africa Top Level Domain Organization is promoting local development of trainers and this is one of the things that we're trying very hard to do for the last two years. We have been engaging purely local trainers for our workshops in order to develop ccTLD registries. And we invite sponsorship, but we prefer the sponsorship to be able to support the trainers.

I also mentioned – maybe if I could also dwell on this – the development of registrars. We think that this is very important for our registries, for our ccTLDs and I would like to disagree that Africa doesn't need ICANN accredited registrars. We do. We need it for the capacity. We need it for our own registries. We need it for development of our registries.

So this stand that was taken to increase registrars 5 to 25 was an under estimate for us. We need more ICANN accredited registrars on the continent.

Monetizing the DNS is a big issue for us, and this in collaboration with this strategy. We run a DNS forum in Abuja in July where there were already many excellent presentations from various countries on how to monetize the DNS. We think that the development of the business side of the DNS is a critical factor in development of the ccTLDs in Africa.

Let me also mention the issue of governance for ccTLDs. We think that this is an important issue if TLD is participating in the IANA stewardship

program. We nominated Mary to ICG and we are glad that she is very active in that capacity.

We have an issue on the continent which we are talking to the Africa Union about, and this is the flight of management of ccTLDs in Africa from the continent to abroad. For us, this is a critical issue. One of the parameters of our best practices of ccTLD management is that the management should be done within the countries.

So we are concerned about a few ccTLDs over the past two years that have moved out. I can name them: Mali, Gabon, and I think Central Africa and one other. This is a grave concern for us on the continent because we see this as loss of capacity on the continent and we would like as many of the operations to stay on the continent as possible.

Lastly, let me close with challenges. We have challenges with resources and we welcome partnerships. We have challenges on the continent for participation, for awareness – I think that has already been mentioned – and this is particularly for governments. So we think that the strategy needs to build in more partners.

If there is a review, we would recommend building in more partners like regulators, governments, and civil society. We think that civil society is important when you're addressing governance issues for ccTLDs and for the sector on the continent.

Let me stop there. Thanks.

LUCKY MASILELA: Dr. Nyirenda, thank you so much for your comments and now may I then come back to the floor and take comments and questions. But before I come to the floor, do we need to check on these remote participants? Any remote participants on the line?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes. We have some few questions but I think they have been answered from the presentation because of the time. Maybe we can continue for an hour, come back to the questions from them.

LUCKY MASILELA: We still have 20 minutes at least. May I start with the gentlemen to my right?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: 10 minutes please.

LUCKY MASILELA: Yes. May I start with the gentleman on my right then I have you over there recognized, then you ma'am, then we'll take questions in that order.

Oh, yes. Before you – my apologies. I need to recognize two people here. I need to recognize the CEO of AfriNIC Adiel, welcome. And James from Afiliat. Where are you? Thank you.

Yes, go ahead. That's you there.

JAMES GALVIN:

So, thank you. I'm Jim Galvin from Afilias. I think what you were thanking me for is our involvement in the mentorship program.

We're actually scheduled now to host two people from Africa, one from Ghana and one from South Africa. We're currently – as long as the visas all come through – we're expecting them to come up to our Toronto office the 1st week of November and spend a couple of weeks with us in our operation as well as CIRA the Canadian Registry. We've arranged for them to spend some time with them so they can get two perspectives on registry operations.

And, I also was able to put together some nice contacts with Ryerson University. It's located in Toronto, Canada, but there are some folks there who are active in the African region and so they're very interested in meeting folks from there and this will provide an opportunity for some longer term connections. Some of the professors who are involved in this program also do come to the African region so there's an opportunity for continued engagement there. They're setting up a program some students at the University to allow for some discussions.

What I really wanted to speak about here was to respond to Baher and the DNS Entrepreneurship Center. So we had volunteered a year ago to two things as part of our wanting to get engaged in expanding and sharing knowledge, communication, and working to grow this entire industry in the African region. We were committed to that, being part of this internship program with African registries is a piece of that. But we also offered at the time to extend a program for DNS operations and

secondary DNS operations to registries and countries in the African region. I don't see any reason not to expand that in to the Middle East region.

So I just want to bring that to the table again and remind us that we had offered that a year ago and I'd very much like at some point to have an opportunity to chat with you. We certainly should build on this mentorship internship program we have and include some kind of program to extend some DNS operations, secondary capabilities to registries, countries in Africa so that you get a global presence with your operation. So, thank you.

[SEAN]:

Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Before I start, I will just give you a disclaimer. I don't run a registry and I am not affiliated with any of them.

So, my first comment is in relation to the ccTLDs and this goes to the ccTLD managers. I think I'd like to mention that there is just a lot of ccTLDs that are very expensive compared to the gTLDs and there needs to be a way by which the operators of the ccTLDs to find a way of reducing the cost. It does not make sense to me as an end user with registering a domain to pay [on represent more than what's all of page] if I'm getting a gTLD for the same purpose. So if it's going to be used, then it needs to be affordable. It's too expensive to use to consider wanting to buy a ccTLD domain instead of a gTLD.

I know some countries are – for instance, Nigeria is quite cheap to get a ccTLD, but I think the other countries are [inaudible] . We've discussed

this on the African list also. So, if there's something that needs to be done and if there's anything that this strategy is going to do to encourage that, please then they should think of doing that.

My other comment is in relation to what Dr. Paulos has actually mentioned. It's a concern that's management of ccTLDs is not going outside of the region. I think something needs to be urgently done about that. Maybe it's an issue of awareness, maybe the [inaudible] because don't know what is going on, so if there's a need to get closer to decision makers and get them to really understand what has happened to the ccTLDs. Because even if it means to get to [other] avenues, if they are going to be at the ITU Meeting, if they're going to be at the African Union Meetings let's get them and tell them what's going on, because I'm assuming that awareness is one of the problems.

My last comment which – I'm going to say it fast – is in relation to the ICANN accredited registrars in Africa. I think one of the success of the strategy program would be to see how much of gTLDs are these registrars actually managing as one of the goals and successes. And, I think it would be good to have a point where we can actually or a location, a web presence where we can actually see the success stories of these registries. Thank you very much.

NKEMDILIM NWEKE:

My name is Nkemdilim Nweke. I represent Digital Sense Africa from Nigeria. I personally think that the press, which is the most important, has not been carried. And for me, the mere fact that we're not carrying the press along, we may not ever get there because they are the people

to take [inaudible] and enlightening the people. They are the people to take the message even to the rural people, the message of the ccTLDs which is the basis for which we gather all the time, the penetrations and how to go about it. The press has to be carried.

Besides the press, the women too. Because if a woman accepts something in her home it's likely that every other person in that house will too. So we must make special provisions in carrying the women along in the African strategy plan. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

[inaudible]

[BARAK]:

Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to raise the issue of common payment gateways on the African continent. Maybe the strategy should focus more on how we can bring together people who are developing payment gateways.

Europe has Visa and MasterCard and so it's easy to transact wherever you are. But I think we have challenges on the African continent and we can't do business when we can't exchange financial resources.

So probably we may want to look at the people who are developing local payment gateways in the different African countries and see how we can bring them together so that we can have a common payment gateway for the continent because I think this is one thing that is really drawing back our businesses.

Thank you, chair.

LUCKY MASILELA: Yes. Mr. Adiel?

ADIEL AKPLOGAN: Thank you, Chairman. I'm Adiel Akplogan from AfriNIC. I would like first of all to thank Pierre and his team for the work that they have been doing for the past two years to try to operationalize the strategy plan document from Africa. From the record, I think Africa has been the first region that come up with its own original strategy and I think it is something that we need to build upon and I think we also start seeing some of the result.

Now, I just want us to maybe refocus the debate a little bit by differentiating participation and engagement with ICANN from development of the DNS and the Internet business. Those are two different things. Who do we want to be more engaged with? With ICANN, government, business, end user? Because if we do not identify clearly those elements we may be chasing the wind.

Engaging government to participate in the GAC is one thing, but when they go back to their country, they need to be able to put in practice the multi-stakeholder that we are talking about. Then they have to engage the industry. They have to engage the end user. They have to engage the other local part of the government. So, if we do not build the local ecosystem, participation at the global level will be difficult.

The second thing is participation can be support more effectively by business. If you look at people who are here at ICANN meeting, most of them are here because they come to [defend]. They come to talk about their business, the DNS business.

If we do not develop the DNS business locally, we will continue to struggle about engagement and participation whereby we will get our self in the same trap where only government will be participating at this level and then we will not build a very sustainable multi-stakeholder environment.

So business – how can we get business involved? I think that is the one million question, because if ccTLDs and domain name business in Africa want to continue or want to try to do business the same way others are doing worldwide, they will fail. They will fail just because the environment is not the same.

How many data center do we have in Africa? How many companies really offer a very dynamic web hosting web service in our different countries? How can you develop business about DNS when behind what do you do with DNS? You don't eat them. You should develop service around them.

When behind, you don't have means to create websites. You don't have means to provide service. You don't have means to develop that digital economy.

So, Barak talk about payment. If you want to buy a domain name in 30 minutes, if I sit down, I can buy my domain, create a website, create address in 30 minutes online and it costs me \$15. But in Africa, we don't

have those automatic and very fast payment methods, for instance. So you have to go through a lot of very heavy process before buying a domain when somebody can do it very quickly. So, how can we adopt new method of payment to domain name, for instance, to all the services around domain name?

Mobile – we are talking about mobile payment in Africa. It's the new buzz in the region. How much work are we ready to do to adapt mobile payments to domain name registration, to data center development, and etc.

So we need maybe to think about the business model of the domain name a bit differently allowing innovation and that's where maybe the regulation comes in. How do we favor regulation that allow innovation in this area? That will be also key for the success.

So I think the Africa strategy is good but we should not expect it to happen overnight, because the element of its success are very diverse, sometimes very complex, and we have to slice them in pieces and take piece by piece and evaluate them. So I'm very happy that there is a KPI that will be developed so that we can follow this piece by piece instead of taking everything and want to solve all the problem at once. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Thanks, Adiel. There are quite a lot of interesting comments and questions that I would want us to entertain, and at the same time with your guidance we still have the Steer Com that we need to establish. May I then, with that, use the next two minutes. Please, I will chop you

if you extend any longer. I was hoping to get my panelists to respond to some of the comments but I will take you, sir.

Do you have a comment? No. Then I will go to my panelists. A minute each closing then we will move in to our steer com matter. Thank you.

JEREMIE GODRECHE:

Hi. Thank you. I'm Jeremie from Freenom. We're a technical company that supports a few ccTLDs in Africa and I actually wanted to say something alongside what Adiel just said.

We are private sector and we establish several strategic partnerships in Africa with ccTLDs and I must say that it is true that the context is very different. We do want to put more infrastructure locally. We do want to put more operations locally, something that surely would please AfTLD a lot because obviously, we work with the ccTLDs that he mentioned. But it is always a challenge for us.

We deploy servers, we deploy infrastructure, and there's always a lot of difficulties getting it online, getting it connected, getting it to function at the level of performance that is acceptable for international standards and to be able to just sell domains like any other TLD in the world and this always puts us in a very difficult situation where are partners, the ccTLD managers, have to compromise and decide which way to go between having 100% of the infrastructure and operations locally or delocalizing some of it to achieve short-term performance and giving a good service to the community.

So it is something that we always think about and I would like to ask a little bit Pierre and let's say the team that's behind the African Strategy how they see more of those strategic partnerships being done with the private sector knowing all those business limitations?

For a private company, those are very serious issues because we need performance. We need regional investment and we can't just dump server, dump technology, do [inaudible] transfer and everything for free and without any returns. So I really would like to know a little bit more about what is the vision for those private sector strategic partnerships?

LUCKY MASILELA:

I will come back to you, sir. I want my panelists. I'll start with Mary. There are a number of very interesting issues that were raised. I don't know if you [want to] comment to some of them then ask Dr. Paulos Nyirenda, then Baher, and the pledge and the support that you are hearing from Afiliis and Freenom. And please, Mary.

MARY UDUMA:

Thank you very much. If I go over the comments again, I think I will delay.

What I want us to go home with is that we should take back what we have heard from Adiel, from Mary, from Paulos, and all of us and get back and get to work. It's only when you get to work then you see where the challenges are. If we just listen and go back without doing anything, then it might be very, very difficult.

As for having our registry managed locally, it's good for us so that it will develop our people, it will retain our revenues, and also will quickly face the challenges as they are and try to solve them. For us in Nigeria, we started with difficulties but as we continue operating, we learned the ropes. And as long as we allow others to do it for us, we'll never learn. So I want Africans to learn how to do it.

Secondly, as I said, there's business in domain name business. Our people need to know that there is business there. Tell them they will make money.

When we started our registry [inaudible] registrars, "You're going to make money out of this business." And they started and when they saw the money in there, its money, they are all going on and going on well. Some of them have become ICANN accredited registrars. That was our aim. So I think we need to give the right communication, we need to give the right environment, and it will thrive. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA: A minute, sir. Thanks.

PAULOS NYIRENDA: Thank you. I think that I need to emphasize capacity building. I think George mentioned human development. This is what AfTLD is really promoting and I would like to support what Mary has just said. We need to do this on the continent and not move things out of the continent.

Maybe just one more thing is money. Barak mentioned payment systems. This is a really big problem on the continent. So, if partnerships can be made to make payment systems more efficient, we will be able to see what, for example, Adiel has said, buy a domain and have it activated in five minutes. In Malawi, it takes two days to create payment, so I can't activate a domain within five minutes unless I want to lose money. So payment systems is a critical issue. Thank you.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Thank you, colleagues. Then I'm going to be pushing you. I'll give you my comment as a closing matter. If I may ask, Pierre, you want to talk to the Steer Com and then the formation thereof of it. Mr. Vice President [inaudible] we still have a bit of time.

PIERRE JANDINOU:

Oh yes, because we should be leaving this room in five or seven minutes for the next session to start. Well, thank you very much.

This is a concern we have. We really want to have this Steering Committee set up. Maybe what we need now is to maybe hear about what you think, but obviously, we expect the Steering Committee to provide guidance in [inaudible] to permutation of these Africa strategy. It's also important for this to help us through what we are talking about. The strategy partnership – how do we do this? It will be interesting to have this board working on those issues and providing the proper guidance on this. Of course, the other issue is how do we select those people?

[inaudible] a quick historical background. The strategy was developed by what we call the Africa Strategy Working Group. It was a group of I think 9 to 10 people that really work out of this. Of course, having heard from the community, the needs that were expressed, and they put all these things together.

Now, do we really reconvene the same group? Do we make sure that where we do have maybe new membership whatever?

What we did was make sure that most of the constituency – at least ICANN constituents – were represented in that group. We are talking of a group of maybe maximum seven members and – well, in terms of they may have face-to-face meeting, but it's not the most important part of it. We really want them to be able to interact with us. So basically, that's what it's all about and we would like to hear from you and then we will act upon that in the coming weeks. That's all.

LUCKY MASILELA:

Any thoughts, ideas, comments? I know even to begin the nomination process or formalizing the Steer Com as it is now, it's going to be very difficult, but if there are any quick thoughts, comments?

Then, we need to establish another platform for communication in between meetings so that we do not belabor this meeting with issues that we could have addressed online. Thanks. Any thoughts?

Okay. Again, we are extremely pressed for time. We have exactly two minutes to leave this room before we get pushed out like in London and I would hate for a repeat of that occurrence. So, let me thank you again

for attending and again, I'm going to ask the Vice President Pierre Dandjinou to also in between the sessions to find another way of communicating with us so that when we do meet again, which is Marrakech I believe, we shouldn't be proceeding with these issues that are hanging over but we should be addressing new matters that will assist us in growing forth.

And also, communication, the summary of the matters that were raised today is very critical. How we can support the AfTLD, the issues of money matters, payment issues, matters of cost. We shouldn't just be using this platform as a wailing wall but we must come up with the plans of how best we can address the issues that were raised in this meeting.

I want to thank you again for making time and attending and we'll see you again at the next meeting in Marrakech which I believe the Vice President will announce. Thank you again and bye.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]