
SINGAPORE - Africa Strategy 2016-2020
Tuesday, February 10, 2015 – 11:15 to 12:45
ICANN – Singapore, Singapore

CHAIR:

Colleagues, good morning. May we start? Shall we start? Welcome to our Africa Strategy. Today we have business to do. We're going to give you feedback on what we have done. This is the Program for the day. The most important thing for today is the background to the African Strategy and to give you feedback on the work that has been done, that was produced in Mauritius last year, so that you can have sight of it and give it your thumbs-up so that we can continue with a clear Strategy going forward. After this presentation we'll then go through a review of the Strategy. I'd like for you to interrogate and question some of the things we'll be presenting, to get more substance out of it and come up with better AIs.

We intend to finish at 12:30 PM. Before I continue I want to recognize a few people where who are important to propping our Africa Strategy, who also give support to some of the initiatives that we do drive. This group owes its existence to ICANN, so I'll start by recognizing the Board Members of ICANN, who are out there. We're happy to have you, gentlemen. I see George, I see Mike, thank you for joining us. Also we have the local registrar here, Janna. Because of the good work that they've been doing with us in partnership, accepting our interns, coming here for training, I think I'm going to allow them to make a few comments, remarks on their experience and what they've covered with our interns.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

Then of course we have Sally. Welcome, thank you for joining us. I cannot finish without recognizing NEPAD here, Dr. Katiti. Thank you Sir. NEPAD is a very instrumental as an institution on the continent. Just before I ask Janna to come up I just want to share a few things, some of my thoughts that I think at some time, either today or tomorrow, need to be considered extensively. We have a challenge as a continent, in the sense that our domain name growth is not happening, and this growth could be attributed to a number of factors, but there are two that I think I'd want to raise that need a heads-up, need more discussion. One of them is policy. We need to have an alignment of policy, in one way or another, to ensure that it's easy to attain a domain name for that to find traction and growth on the continent.

The second issue is pricing. Pricing is one of the biggest inhibitors to growth in domain names. I'm going to share one thing - not because I want to gloat but just to present some facts to support those contributing factors to this domain growth. Two weeks ago in South Africa the SLD and the gTLD that was launched in November last year reached the one million mark of registrations - last week. If you think about it, we should celebrate it! Thank you. Now, co.za, it's the SLD and it's inching very close to one million. It's sitting at 970,000 plus. The gTLDs that were launched last years, your .capetown, .durban and .joberg are at least 9,000, and this is two or three months later. The general availability of these was on the 4th of November and in February there's already 9,000 names registered.

Now, I think this is why I'm saying pricing and policy. The ease in getting a domain name in South Africa has proven that it's important in the growth of the names - the pricing equally. Our wholesale pricing for our



SLDs I think is very affordable. Wholesale price it's less than \$5, so if you think about it, this is going to be an issue that I want us to discuss again as a continent. Those are our remarks - that if we want to change this landscape, if we want to achieve the growth that we all envisage, there has to be an alignment in thinking, an alignment in policy, and an alignment equally on pricing. Before I ask my other colleagues to continue, let me ask Janna to come up please and give us two minutes.

JANNA:

Hi. Good morning everybody. I'm Janna from IP Mirror. In Asia people call me Janna, but I know in Africa or Europe they call me Yanna, either way I'm fine. When we were first approached by ICANN to start this internship program we were very glad to host such a program. In the beginning when we understood how the African community is, it takes me back to ten years ago when Singapore first tried to develop the domain name industry, so I thought it could be a very good sharing session that we could do. I have to say that IP Mirror is doing this for the first time, and we are like the first guinea pig testing if this program works or not.

I'm quite glad that when the two interns, who have been with us for two weeks, they spent two weeks with us, we share a lot of things with the interns and although I've not seen their report or their feedback if the program is good, I understand they ask a lot of questions and they're very interested and trying to absorb as much as they can. Like I said, I've not received their feedback so I can't say if it's good or not, but I know they've enjoyed their time with us and they've learnt a lot, according to them. So I really hope that with this internship program we will actually



help the African community to progress further, above the one million mark, and now that you've reached that maybe two or three million.

CHAIR: Janna, I think any internship is very important. We really applaud that, and thank you so much. This is a good thing by IP Mirror and we hope that other registrars will consider interns for further training. Thank you so much. May I then move on into our Agenda? I've been asked to invite Sally also for quick comments.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you so much. Good morning everybody. It's very good to see so many of you here. It really is. This is a great environment and it's a very multistakeholder environment. That should go without saying, but it doesn't always, and particularly in Africa it's very important from ICANN's perspective that we do everything we can to facilitate this process of building engagement over a three-year period and now a second chapter of that, which you're going to cover today. I know this has not been an easy process. When we started this three years ago, just after Fadi arrived and just after I arrived, it felt like, "Whoa, we're just going to do what we can and we're going to stand on the shoulders of those who have gone before us, and we're going to try to be more structured, we're going to try to put some more organized resource behind this as ICANN."

Just listening to that now, that internship, this seems so easy when you hear Janna sitting here and saying, "Anyway, we had these guys and it was great, and they're learning all about how to build their capability



and build their confidence, to take that home, to take that into Africa to extend the amount of registrars that we have,” but the work that’s gone into doing that is really very, very significant. The good news is that these things are always hardest the first time around. So once we’ve built a program and best practice, which under Pierre’s leadership I think he’s been very patient, very tenacious, certainly with me. He never let me look the other way, he never let me have other priorities, he kept banging on my door saying, “We need to do this and we need to make this happen, we need to facilitate.”

I congratulate you, Pierre, and I congratulate those who have been involved with this. I’d love to see this evolve and develop more. My team, which Pierre is part of, is a global team of engagement leaders. Their job is not only to reach out into their own region and extend and deepen the multistakeholder engagement for our important work around ICANN in the region, but also to exchange best practice and innovation, as we develop it in different parts of the world. Because in some areas - and the development of the DNS industry is a good example - regions have far more in common with each other than they have nothing else in common, except that they’d have a very immature, developing DNS sector.

I want for those who are not aware in the room, I would like to raise awareness of the priority that we place on the ICANN Leadership Team to make sure that where we see those innovations bubble up, wherever they are in the world, that there’s a mechanism to capture those and share them, so that we are saving time, we’re saving resources, and we’re coming up with solutions more quickly. This is a very good

example of that. That innovation has come from Africa, but I'm very confident that it will be extended to different parts of the world.

So I wanted to thank you again. I also want to encourage you, as you move forward into this next chapter. On the one hand it will feel easier, because you're coming to the end of the first chapter and you've learnt a great deal, and I know that you spent time discussing how to improve things. On the other hand, the stakes get higher. We just heard about the ambitions of new registrations and growth, and we all want more - we become more ambitious. So I hope that we will continue to facilitate that energetically, to help you. Thank you for the time that you give. I hope you have a good session today. Thank you.

CHAIR: Thank you Sally, much appreciated for the warm comments. Yes, indeed, a tenacious young man I must say Pierre is. May I ask the tenacious young man to take over and take us through the background of the African Strategy? Pierre, thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much [Laki 00:32:09], and a very good morning to all. Thank you for coming. I'm going to share the background of the Strategy and then Bob will take us through the Strategy itself and then we'll be having a question and answer session, and then the closing of it. Well, of course what we are supposed to be doing today is considering the Draft 0 of our Strategy, which is from 2016-2020. As a background of course, the first Strategy came up at the request by the incoming CEO, Fadi Chehadé, and that was in Prague. That wanted the African



community to elaborate on what Strategy they would like ICANN to pursue in its engagement with Africa. That Strategy was worked out by a special Working Group and it also used whatever comments were coming from the region, so what we had there was quite important, because one or two key things came out of these comments and were used to develop the Strategy.

One of them was to strengthen the African presence within Africa, with much participation actually. But the second thing also was that we realized that Africans weren't really that much on the business and the industry of the Internet, per se, and the DNS, per se. So that's also why the Strategy really concentrated on how do you really have to develop that market in Africa. These are the two pillars that I'd say, that we really used to develop the first Strategy. Of course, a few projects came after this, some of them that we've now tried to develop and roll out, and one of them is the internship program, but also DNSSEC Workshop, roadmaps, and some of the few things we've been doing is for instance making sure that the registrar/registry community talk.

We did have this Domain Name Forum that we started in Durban, and that's now being replicated in different regions as well, so it's quite important for us. I'd like to also thank the global registrar that assisted in organizing this DNS Forum. The third one is happening in early July in Kenya. The second one was in Nigeria and I'd like to thank Marie here, who really was our host. It was quite important that this platform was developed. Now, what's the rationale behind the new Strategy we want to talk about? I think the rationale here is quite simple. First it's about further supporting the ICANN events in Africa, because that was what the African Minister in charge of ICT was complaining about when they



sent that declaration to the ICANN Board saying that ICANN should strive to have a better presence in Africa.

This is happening anyway now. We do have a few staff on the ground, we do have a few programs of engagement in which ICANN is assisting with, and of course the question people are putting to me is, “Okay, when are you going to have a hub in Africa?” and I say, “This will be coming anyway.” I think the other thing is how do we increase Africa’s participation in ICANN? We are seeing more and more Africans, but I think what we are also looking forward to is what we are calling an informed participation - not just coming to meetings, but at least being able to really contribute, be in the Working Groups, and also be in the leadership positions within ICANN. This is something we’d really like to talk about.

I think the third reason why we’re having this invention of this Strategy is that we really need to align this Strategy to the one ICANN we serve. You also know that ICANN has developed a new Strategic Plan - 2016 to 2022 - so we are aligning our Strategy with that. The fourth and last reason I would say, as the Chair, is that this was meant to be an evolving document anyway. Conditions are changing, so the ecosystem also was changing, and it was important that we really align the new Strategy with that one. What you’ll be hearing later from Bob is the work that a group of Africans did in Mauritius three months ago during one of the AFRINIC Meetings there. We convened that group to really think about what could be the next generation of our Strategy. What was developed has transpired into the document that’s there, that has been shared with you at least online, to further get your comments.



So what we're going to discuss today is the final stage I would say of what we have, and of course we're looking forward to your comments, your contributions, so that we will have the documents that we'll be working upon. At that, I'd like to leave it to Bob to take us through the Strategy, the way it is today, and after that we will respond to any questions and receive your comments. Mr. Chair, that's what I'd like to say by way of background to this work. Thanks.

CHAIR:

Thank you Pierre for the background and setting the scene, and creating a [betting 00:38:21] platform. I think from the points that Pierre has raised we need to see if we are going to be covering them in the Strategy, and not just tick the box but come up with action items. Without much further ado I'll hand over to my colleague here, Bob, to take us through the presentation itself. Thank you. Bob?

BOB:

Thank you Chair. I'll quickly run through a brief overview of the document that was a result of our meeting in Mauritius; a meeting of a select group of representatives from different constituencies in Africa to revise our African Strategy. Just speaking from where Pierre left off, our motivation was really to support a stronger presence of ICANN in Africa - obviously this is really important for us - but also to increase African participation in ICANN. so it's both ways - it's ICANN's presence in Africa but really Africa's stronger participation in ICANN. As Pierre mentioned, this is an evolving document. Today our needs are not the same as tomorrow, so we need to make this Strategy responsive to our changing needs in Africa, so the Strategy document is an evolving document.



Lastly, it's about the new ICANN Global Strategic Plan. Of course, ICANN has recently adopted a new Strategic Plan, and of course in Africa we also needed to align our strategic plan to the ICANN Strategic Plan. Today ICANN has got a 2016-2020 Strategic Plan and therefore we also need to align ourselves with that. These are the four major pillars for really going up to a document to really look at it again, as we update it. So maybe just a brief background of where we are coming from, and why we are saying we're evolving. Previously ICANN had a Strategic Plan for 2012-2015 and based on that the African Strategic Plan was developed. You could see that in that time we had four major pillars, which our goals were premised on.

The first was on DNS security and stability, competition, consumer trust and consumer choice, cooperations including IANA, and lastly a healthy governance ecosystem. So the African Strategy was based on these four pillars of ICANN at that time. But today, after a review period, which was bottom-up, the ICANN community participated in revising the ICANN Strategic Plan and now ICANN has recently adopted the ICANN 2016-2020 Strategic Plan, which has identified five strategic objectives, and under those we have 16 goals. Just to present a matrix of the current ICANN Strategic Plan with the five strategic objectives; the first is to evolve and further globalize ICANN.

The second is to support a healthy, stable and resilient unique identifier ecosystem, and then advance organizational, technological and operational excellence. Then there is promote ICANN's role and the multistakeholder approach. Of course, yesterday during the Opening Ceremony you had ICANN's CEO stress on the last one, which is develop and implement a global public interest framework bounded by ICANN's



mission. So these are the five strategic objectives that are going to guide ICANN for the next five years. Under each objective there are what we call the goals, which are 16 in number. So this is at ICANN level and therefore we are to move from this and adopt this to what we're working in in Africa.

So this came from the community, and as Pierre mentioned, last year during the AFRINIC 21 Meeting a representative group from the AFTLD, which is the top level domain association for Africa, for ccTLDs, a representative from GAC and SO representatives, AFRINIC, Registrars Association, AFICTA, which is an affiliated association of IT organizations in Africa, AFRALO and NEPAD, and a few other individuals that are prominent and a unique experience in the African DNS industry - they came together to look at our Strategic Plan. This team was called the Africa Strategy Review Group. So having looked at our regional plan based on the previous metric that I shared, they came to a conclusion that our Strategic Plan was largely in-line with the new ICANN direction. It only needed to be presented properly.

So we restructured ten objectives, which really doesn't change what we had before; we just realigned them and restated them. If you download the actual documents from the same link in the online chat, you'll find that we have ten objectives. The first one is to strengthen ccTLD development in Africa, enhance regional and international corporation, especially with DNS players, and then support and facilitate competition in the DNS business. Encourage resiliency of local DNS infrastructure in Africa - of course, we're very keen on really expanding the L root outreach in Africa, so we want more root servers in Africa -, promote



local partnerships regionally and globally - of course, that's led to some of the programs that you've seen, like the internship program.

We have to regionalize IANA and ICANN operations in Africa. Of course, Pierre is talking about the community asking for a hub in Africa. So it's a goal for us, but most importantly it's effective communication and outreach by ICANN in Africa, so this is very important and this is actually for us to deliver - and promote multistakeholderism in Africa, especially at the national levels, and support capacity building and development of Internet governance in Africa. So our strategic document is going to be striving to achieve these broad [unclear 00:46:48]. The other idea that the team came up with is the creation of a Steering Committee, really to strategically support and monitor the implementation of this Strategy. But if you look at the goals of the Strategy it's really going to need a lot of funds and resources for us to achieve this, especially in five years.

Therefore, one of the objectives of having the SC is to look at innovative funding mechanisms - how else or where else can we find these programs, apart from at ICANN? So just based on that, this document is coming in when we already have a plan already - so we're just revising what we already had. So we already had some key projects that were already launched, and of course we have others in the pipeline. Some of these have been mentioned by Pierre. Of course, the DNS [unclear 00:48:02] Program was very key for us, and we thank IP Mirror for hosting us. We also have a DNS Entrepreneurship Center that has been set up in collaboration with the Middle East Team, and of course we shall be utilizing this resource for both regions, to help in developing capacity.



Of course, we've been conducting DNSSEC Roadshows in Africa, and we've already done a number of countries. This has led to some ccTLDs signing their zones, which is contributing to the security of the DNS. This is key for us. Of course, Pierre talked about the DNS Forum, which has been a benchmark, and of course now we have different regions implementing the same. This started in Africa. We want to have more topical workshops that are addressing specific needs and specific requests from registrars in Africa, from intellectual property and trademark issues to marketing issues. So we would want more topical workshops that are actually helping in growing the DNS space. Of course, in communication it's key that whatever we're doing it reaches the community, and how best can we communicate this in the community?

So far we've had a website that's dedicated to Africa. Of course, we've also created a number of mailing list that we're using to send out a targeted communication to specific groups, be it the GAC, be it ccTLD Managers, be it SOs and AC representatives, be it the entire African community. So we also want to request, especially of Fellows, to join some of these mailing lists, because this is where we reach you. We also encourage you to visit our website, because most of this information is also posted on the site. We also started working on bi-monthly newsletters.

Today we have a bi-monthly newsletter for Africa and we also have one for EMEA - that is Europe, Middle East and Africa. We really hope that this media is going to help enhance our communications with the community. Of course, we have regular blogs. So really we're looking at how best to ensure that we communicate everything that we are doing



in Africa. Of course, our outreach activities remain to the different stakeholder groups - ministers, ICT organizations, academy and civil society - and we also continue to support and participate in international conferences and regional events. So this is key for us, and some of this we'll be introducing with the new Strategic Plan.

So just to finalize, in the ten objectives that we've identified, there has been listed over 20 projects. Like I say, some of it is capital-intensive, but we still need you to provide your final comments on the document, and of course it's available on that link. We shared it on the 26th of December last year. We want this Forum to be the final session where we present this, and after this adopt this document. So we encourage you to go on and give your input. We've only received one comment so far, so we encourage you to go ahead and give your input. I thank you for your attention.

CHAIR:

Thank you Bob for that briefing. Colleagues, you probably have seen what has been put together that emanates from the sitting in Mauritius. The intention is to share this document with you for you to own it, so that it becomes part of your Strategy. It need not be a Strategy that's owned somewhere - it needs to be part of us, it needs to talk to what we intend to achieve, and the goals that we've set for ourselves need to be the goals that we set and achieve jointly. Those objectives need to be our objectives and not the objectives for Pierre to work on and chase. The projects equally are our projects that need to talk to our needs as a continent, and if we think there's anything that's glaringly absent or not included, this is a time for us to include it.



If there's any clarification that we think we need to get regarding this project, so be it. One of the things Bob did talk to was the capital intensiveness of this initiative, and you will notice that there is a Steering Committee that will be equally tasked with finding innovative ways of funding these initiatives. Now, I think I'd want for us to spend a little bit of time on this innovative funding mechanism, taking into consideration that we do not have a big budget to implement these strategies, but we do need to have some kind of support to ensure that we win as a continent. Any Strategy, any initiative, does need funding. Absence of funding will really put this thing flat on its face.

Yes. Now, back to the house, colleagues. There is a roving mic somewhere. If there are any questions or comments, this is your opportunity. Thank you. I'll start on the front row. If we start off by introducing ourselves before we make comments or questions? Thank you.

ISAAC MBOSO:

Isaac Mbozo, first-time Fellow from Zimbabwe. Mine is a comment: like you mentioned, we are facing a problem because of pricing and policies. Besides pricing and policies I believe also our systems are not that good. Most of the systems are being done manually and all that stuff. I think and I believe if we can revamp our systems or do a great job to our systems, that will also improve the update of our ccTLDs. Thank you.

CHAIR:

Thank you Sir. I think you're doing a good job over there. George I think was next.

GEORGE SADOWSKY:

Thank you. George Sadowsky, ICANN Board. I found this discussion really interesting, and I haven't read any of the prior documents, so it's a little bit new to me, but a couple of observations. It struck me when we were looking at the goals that a lot of them were means to goals and not really goals, and that there were implicit goals but they hadn't been stated. I'd encourage you to sharpen the goals that you're looking at and identify the means to achieve them. I think it's a little bit easier to prioritize if you take that step. With regards to innovative funding, one of the things I find a little bit frustrating about these discussions within the ICANN context is that ICANN has a relatively narrow mandate - it's focused on the DNS industry and the stability and security of the Internet with respect to the identifiers.

It doesn't include, for example, fundamental access issues. The Internet Society is doing something about that, ITU has a role in that, the European Union I believe is doing funding in places in Africa, so I would encourage you to look at solutions that are broader than just the goals that you have on this screen, because first of all what you'll be able to accomplish will be more comprehensive, and second, the sources of funding will be significantly larger. The third thing is with respect to the statement that every initiative needs money. I'm not sure that's completely true - although most initiatives benefits from money and a lot of them certainly need it.

But what's also needed is a fair amount of concern about the Internet in Africa and how it can be made better, and that demands a sacrifice of



personal time and personal effort, and I would not want to minimize that component of getting things done. Thank you.

[BARIK]:

Hello. [Barek 00:58:18] from Sudan, .sd registry and AFTLD Board Member. As I remember, we had a talk about the Strategy, about what we have to do, how to increase the domain names in Africa, in [unclear 00:58:34], as I saw. We recognize a lot of issues. One of them is not included here, but I think it's very important. It's an e-payment - how to pay to register a domain, because it's a big problem in Africa. Most of us don't have a way to pay electronically for this domain. At least what we are facing in Sudan is this: just to buy a domain from another city you have to do a lot of work; transfer the money, prove that you've transferred the money, a lot of things.

This can be done just in a few seconds or minutes if you have e-payment. I think it's very important if we concentrate on this. Thank you very much.

PAUL MCHENE:

My name is Paul Mchene, so I just want to commend Bob and the Team at ICANN in Africa, especially for trying to increase the resiliency of the root server system, by establishing L root. MY point is going to be on your engagement with government. I think in the long-term for you to see success in your Strategy you'll have to work really, really much harder in engage the government of many nation states in the continent, to the level that the ITU has reached. I know the ITU is an intergovernmental organizations, but most of the time most



governments are still very skeptical about ICANN. So I'm asking if that is something that will be part of your long-term Strategy? Thank you.

SPEAKER:

Good afternoon everybody, I'm [unclear 01:00:45] from Whogohost in Nigeria. Basically I have three comments. You mentioned the bi-monthly newsletter. I for example am a newcomer, even though I'm a part of the Business Constituency. How do we get this newsletter? Also, as part of the 16 goals for ICANN in the Strategic Plan there was something mentioned around global diversity for registries and registrars. I did not see anything on plans for getting more ICANN-accredited registrars in the Africa Strategic Plan. Are there any plans for this? Lastly, on the community.icann.org in terms of the plan, I tried to register but I couldn't. Definitely if we have to comment we have to be able to access these resources so that we can comment. Thank you.

[ACHA SELOYE]:

Thank you. My name is [Acha Seloye 01:01:44], I'm from Kenya, ISOC Chapter. I think all of us here would like to see a wide interoperability of the Internet where everybody can access and use the Internet. AS we sit here now there's a very big digital divide between the developed world and the developing countries in Africa. I think ICANN knows that very well. Why isn't ICANN taking any action to assist the developing countries to catch up? Because I have been doing lots of ICANN remote participation in my country, and most stakeholders on the ground don't really understand ICANN. They don't know where to take their issues, and those are the issues that I think if ICANN could address could help

alleviate the problem and increase participation, and increase Internet connectivity.

The other thing is that a few years ago we had a meeting in ICANN - last year - but then they were telling us they didn't have enough budget to assist Africa to do activities. I wonder if it is by design or... I don't know. Can you give a little bit of information on that, please? Of course, the problem is that we technology people know how we can achieve development using the Internet and be at the level of the first world. But [unclear 01:03:45] are not helping us at all. Thank you.

CHAIR: Things are really mushrooming. Yes sir, go ahead. Come to the front.

CLAUDINE SUJIRA: My name is Claudine [Sujira] and I work with .rw, Rwanda registry. My comments are on educating our consumers. I think in as much as we look at pricing and e-payment, the truth on the ground is that we need to educate people more to actually go online. Secondly, I want to talk about localization of content. The content that we have in Africa, that should be consumed by people back home, is hosted in Europe. So when we have that, the user experience of the Internet is not the best, and it's mainly to do with pricing and educating. Those are my comments - if it's something that we add into our Strategy it would really help.



ABDALO MARI:

Thank you. My name is [Abdalo Mari], the manager of Kenya registry. Now, we're talking of domain growth and if numbers serve me right in Africa we have 1.3 million domains registered, South Africa taking 1 million of the 1.3, which means 78 per cent of the domains have been actively registered by South Africa. It means there is something right that South Africa is doing but the rest of us are not doing. My challenge to ICANN and maybe AFRINIC is to encourage cross-training within registries in Africa, so that we learn what South Africa is doing; how they've been able to get the 78 per cent of the 1.3 million. Thank you.

TYLUM GOODWIN:

My name is [Tylum Goodwin], ICANN Fellow from Kenya. I also work for the .ke registry. I'd like to comment on the Strategic Plan. I just have a few things that maybe we might need more elaboration on, or we might need additional information on. I've seen the way we have capacity building, and we are one of the registries that we had the DNSSEC Roadshow, and actually it was a good activity by ICANN, and it made us push signing of our zones in our registry. For me, what I looked at, the best way perhaps we can approach this is we can set up a frequency of DNSSEC Roadshows and follow up in the specific registries. Because if we continue doing DNSSEC Roadshows and we don't have follow ups then I think we might have other registries that will just take it as an event that ICANN is doing.

The other thing is that we've seen internship programs for registrars who are ICANN-accredited. I think it's also good for us, as registries, to have our internship programs within Africa. We can send someone to South Africa, South Africa can send someone to Kenya. At least we need



to share and see how we operate within the region. The other thing is capacity building. Looking at it in this perspective, if we have our local capacity building in Africa I think it's easier for someone to understand. I can do capacity building with someone in Uganda, and I think it will be easier for them to understand. I think these are some of the things we might need to look at also. Thank you.

ONE KAMAKWAKWA:

Thank you. My name is [One Kamakwakwa], I'm a first-time Fellow here at ICANN. There's been a lot of comments about pricing and the digital divide, and I don't want to repeat some of the comments, but I just want to urge ICANN to really look at this issue of affordability - both from a domains acquisition perspective, because it does trickle down to user and individual access. We are in an information economy and the Internet is the absolute currency of that economy, so ultimately this issue of pricing becomes an issue of global competitiveness for the continent. Thank you.

MARK SILBER:

Just one comment. My name is Mike Silber. I'm the only ICANN Board Member living in Africa. The one thing I'd encourage - and I'm hearing some very good interaction and some great ideas - I would really like to explore further questions of [playman's 01:09:37] local content. Bringing people online at the moment, apps like Facebook and others are the dominant interaction of many of our compatriots with the Internet, and in order to use those the need for naming is very significantly reduced because you have your own identifier. So it's creating other forms of content or expression that are not necessarily in



the control of a large, multinational corporation, where it gets really interesting. That being said, I'd like to pull back from some of the comments made about, "ICANN should get involved in things like affordability."

Because one of the issues about the ccTLDs is that ICANN has no power to impose or get involved in any policy work over there. There is complete sovereignty around ccTLDs. So please see us as a facilitator, see us as enabling conversations, bringing in experts, helping to exchange ideas. But we as ICANN cannot take action, when it comes to ccTLDs, around affordability. We can have that discussion when it comes to the new gTLDs, if it's appropriate, but with ccTLDs we can't actually do that. Same thing with content - we can't create content but I certainly think it's worthwhile seeing how we can engage and facilitate some of these conversations to move that forward.

Lastly, seeing as Mr. [Masialela 01:11:12] is not going to blow his own trumpet, one of the ways South Africa has moved to this number is, yes, an economy that is growing - but not as fast as the Nigerian economy - a reasonably simple registration system, general availability, but most importantly a very good technical operator. That's something that we as the .za board did. I also happened to sever on the board of .za. We outsourced technical operations to a competent, local, South African-based technical operator. Instead of trying to do it ourselves and believing we could do everything ourselves, we found a company that had the ability and that we could trust, because they were local.

We said, "Guys, take the technical burden off our shoulders and we can then focus on more of the policy issues." But make sure the technology

runs. You want almost instantaneous registrations. You want economies of scale so that it is affordable, and by doing that then you, as the regulator, can actually be involved in policy and you don't have to worry about technical, day-to-day operations. [applause]

ALICE MUNYUA:

Thank you very much. Alice Munyua with the African Union Commission and on the GAC. I'd like to agree with what the two Board Members George and Mike Silber have mentioned, especially regarding the Strategy and sharpening our goals, and I can imagine that the Working Group is going to try and sharpen that so that the activities and indicators are very, very clear, so that it's then leading us to a very specific outcome at the end. One very important issue, just listening to many of the discussions going on, some of them, like Mike Silber has mentioned, regarding perhaps [unclear 01:13:21] digital economy, affordability, issues of access and content.

I think it's going to be important for the Africa team to actually take quite a lot of time to really educate and create awareness regarding ICANN's mandate and role - it's very important - so that we are clear on what ICANN can do and cannot do, and where ICANN is able to facilitate our areas, and where for example African participation is really needed. Two of those processes are to do with the current accountability process and the IANA transition process where we hardly have any African intervention or input, especially on accountability. Then a very important one is regarding African governments. Again, I agree with the notion from my Kenyan colleague that because African governments will



not probably understand the mandate, they're beginning to look at what's most important to them, and that's security.

We just had a very important meeting between the African and European governments, and I can tell you just from that discussion, well, we had discussions regarding ICANN issues and basically we always ended up talking about security. So it's important for the Africa Team, together with Dr. Tariq's team, to make sure that African governments are actually getting the information they need. To this end, the African Union has offered at the GAC level, because it's already coordinating very well through the .africa... And that's another question I want to ask. Yes, taking advantage of the two Board Members, where are we with .africa?

Because that project, that initiative, was what was going to be providing some of the finances to be able to facilitate some of the requests being made including supporting and strengthening ccTLDs, the content area, educating governments, including enhancing participation of African governments. So we do need to have an update on where this .africa project is, and African governments are actually getting extremely frustrated with the delays that are ongoing that have nothing to do with the African continent. It rather has to do with issues that are beyond that. I think I've said it. Thank you very much.

MARY UDUMA:

Thank you. My name is Mary Uduma from Nigeria. I've listened to most of the comments on our Strategy. We made input to this Strategy quite all right. One thing I want to say is that when it comes to Africa we don't read a lot, so we don't know what's going on. Secondly, we're not

online - probably challenges of access, challenges of infrastructure, challenges of even the knowledge level. So we have those challenges. Again, because we've been running against the foremost domain, the generic domains of .com, .org, .net, they came earlier than some of us, so we're doing a catch-up.

So one of our ICT journalists did some research comparing the number of .com domains of website in Nigeria against the .ng, and he just found out that we're losing so much money from Nigeria to .com and .org. So what am I saying in essence? We need to look back, look inward, and see that there is business in domain name business. That would be my slogan to my people in Nigeria, to everybody I talk to - there is business in domain name business. So we need to bring the business case to our people, our businesses, the big ones that have succeeded. The mobile - the domain name might overtake mobile if we do the right thing. So we need to do it in such a way that the business community will see that they could move as much revenue and as much income as they do in the mobile.

Again, I think I mentioned this last year, that if we bring the attention of our government to the fact that in as much as they are doing a lot for us in the area of telecoms, the ICT or the domain industry is lagging behind. I want also to ask the team, especially ICANN, since our Board Members are here, I think the team needs a lot of support, a lot of resources, to be able to get to the vast population of Africa. Out of the 52 countries, when we call for meetings at AFTLD we don't get up to 20, because they're not there. Some of our ccTLDs are still being managed outside. I saw one of them when I went to IETF. He said, "I have only two now. I think I've released so many of them and I have only two now." So those



are the things we need to develop. I think they need the resources to develop our local people to do the local thing, that Mike said, to become local registrars, to become local DNS business people. Then we'll see the growth.

So that's one. Then two - to also add to what Alice said about .africa. We want to know from our Board Members, where are we in .africa? Our governments are involved, the local people are involved, the businesses are involved. Why is .africa not moving? We want to hear that. Thank you.

SEAN:

Thank you. My name is Sean from Nigeria. I work for a university and I'm speaking on my personal behalf. Last meeting or in during Singapore we talked about pricing; that there's a huge difference between the price by which we get a ccTLD, a user gets a ccTLD domain name, against getting a .com gTLD domain name. I think it would be good to hear whether there was any action that was taken towards bridging or reducing that huge difference between the pricing? Because I think that was one of the things that's actually discouraging people from using local ccTLDs.

The other thing I'd like to mention is yes, it's good to send our people out of the continent for training, for experience, but I think we have done enough of that. Going forward we should try to leverage on our own Internet resources as much as possible. We have brilliant, we have very great people amongst us, and we already have a few registries within the continent that can actually help in training some of the people who are doing this business. So we should leverage on local

resources as much as possible. I understand that AFTLD are doing training and AFRINIC workshops and so on. I think there should be some concentration on taking that to national levels, if possible, and partnering with local [unclear 01:22:58], et cetera.

The last thing I'd like to mention is in relation to the Strategy. I think going forward we should start talking to ourselves on the mailing lists. The only place where we actually do this talking right now is here. When we leave here we go back home, we all scatter again. I think we should reactivate that. Perhaps reactivate isn't the right word. Let's activate it, because it's never been activated. So let's activate it and let's start talking to ourselves. Thank you.

CHAIR: Let me take comments from the Panel here. I think you'd want feedback? We've noted a few things, but I'll ask my colleagues to comment, particularly Pierre, and then we'll close.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much Chair, and thank you all for your comments but also for your questions. I think these are very good contributions. Of course, I'm not going to respond point-by-point, but I'll say that indeed, in terms of the comments, we're of course going to incorporate them in the document. Some of the points deserve some attention though. For instance, when we're talking about e-payment, my response is, well, don't just wait for ICANN to help do this. We do have AFTLD. We're supposed to be assisting the ccTLDs. I don't really think that we should wait for ICANN to help and come and do this. This is important. We've

been talking about this for so many years. Let's just do it. Of course, ICANN can facilitate at some point, in terms of best practices, and eventually if there are any applications, yes, but I think definitely that some of those things can be done at home. That's number one.

I really appreciate that we should move on the engagement with governments so they really know where we stand, what exactly ICANN can do. Yes, you are right, because most of the time it's so easy to compare ICANN to ITU and most of the time our governments know more about ITU because they're used to ITU, and don't ever forget that ITU is more than one century old, and ICANN's just 50 years old, and ICANN's remit is very specific. Certainly we need to have this message out there. ICANN's remit is not about connectivity or digital divide, per se, and this Strategy is concentrated on how do you make Africa market to the ccTLD industry? That's one of the key things we're doing.

I think your questions that relate to connectivity, I do think we can solve those issues in other domains. Now, when it comes to registries, I consider educating the consumers quite an important issue. The whole idea of localization of content is quite important. Hosted in Europe, yes, but I would say maybe nothing prevents Africa from hosting it in Africa. But at some point there needs to be some work on this issue. Cross-training between registries and registrars, yes, definitely, and the DNS Forum was meant for that actually. I think three years ago we noticed that there was no discussion between registries and registrars in Africa. That Forum now provides the platform for this.

So capacity building on the whole is definitely there, but we also add a few aspects of it. Also we recognize that it's not just for us to be sending



people outside the country - no. What we are trying to do is different modalities or activities that really are going in the same direction, which is capacity development. So I would say why not? Because our colleagues that went to IP Mirror, some of them will be going to [AFILIA 01:27:54] soon and some to AFNIC and also EURid for instance. I recognize my colleague who is in the Middle East, and we had a good discussion with EURid who is ready to support. So yes, we need to dwell on those different components - use the external facilities if they are there, but also do things internally. So we've taken note on those things.

The question about where we are with .africa... Security issue definitely for governments. Of course, the Strategy is not about addressing .africa. There are issues, you are right. There are procedures that are ongoing, of course, and I don't have details personally, but if you really think that a Board Member at this stage has any answer, I can open it up to my Board Members and they will just chip in quickly on that. Because yes, I'm receiving many requests and I can see that frustration coming, even from the highest level. When I meet African ministers one of the first questions is, "Okay, but what are you doing with this .africa?" and I say, "It's about procedure. It will happen." But I'm certain that they're not quite satisfied with that one.

So yes, we'll be considering all of your contributions, and thank you very much for those. If I've let out anything, please let me know. Maybe before I forget, we're also having a session tomorrow, but that's going to be on the way to Marrakech. ICANN has decided to have a special engagement with Africa with a set of specific projects, and we want to discuss those tomorrow, starting at 10:30 AM in the VIP Lounge. That's



where we really want to talk about how we are preparing this Marrakech Meeting. Please come again if you can. With that I'll leave it to the Chair.

CHAIR: My Chief, we've totally run out of time, but I've seen your hand for...

AUDIENCE: The Board Members?

CHAIR: Okay, noted. The hub? That was an issue that was raised. I think what I'm going to do, before you respond, George, is I'm going to steal five minutes tomorrow. If you can come in on time at 10:30 AM I'm going to ask somebody from one of our technical backend operators to share their best practices for us, for five minutes, so that we can see some models for attracting and growing ccTLDs, and models that can be shared for addressing issues on e-payment, your issues like your shared services platform... I think in five minutes, when we go back to our respective countries, we could go back with some models that we can begin to implement in our countries. George, if you have a comment, Sir?

GEORGE SADOWSKY: I think we're all frustrated with the situation with .africa. I don't know what it is currently, but what I will do is see what can be said about it at the meeting tomorrow. I don't know how much can be said, I can't promise anything, but I'll ask.



MIKE SILBER:

Just on the point of the hubs, point taken, but we need to address a need. We don't create engagement offices and hubs for the sake of it. There needs to be a need. We've barely bedded down Istanbul and Singapore. Give us a little bit of time - I'm not asking for an indefinite amount, but we need to create and build on this model. We're not going to build offices to stand empty. Once we've hit limitations in AP and EMEA then we can start looking at expanding beyond.

CHAIR:

Colleagues, thank you for that. I have a lot of comments, I know you have a lot of comments, questions, but let's reserve all these thoughts for tomorrow as we discuss our journey to Marrakech. I thank you again for your comments. They will be considered and implemented into the document. Thank you. See you tomorrow.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

