

---

SINGAPORE – APRALO Monthly Meeting  
Tuesday, February 10, 2015 – 13:30 to 14:30  
ICANN – Singapore, Singapore

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Ladies and gentlemen, welcome to APRALO, February monthly meeting. And I would like to ask everybody here, in person, to introduce themselves please. [Sala], if we can start from you.

[SALA]: Hello everyone, it's [Sala] [inaudible], original vice president for the Oceania region, ICANN staff.

TOMOHIRO FUJISAKI: Hello. My name is Tomohiro Fujisaki, ISOC Japan chapter.

TOSHIO TACHIBANA: Toshio Tachibana from ISOC Japan chapter.

PAVAN BUDRANI: Pavan Budrani, APRALO Secretariat.

[ROD SING]: [Rod Sing], first chair of APRALO, now happily retired, and now with ISOC. Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hello everybody. I'm [inaudible], I'm a Fellow from Bangladesh, and I'm president of ISOC [inaudible] Bangladesh ISOC chapter, and recently the

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

ALS member, so I'm trying to figure out the chapter involvement with this activity with APRALO. So thank you.

[RAFITANI]: [Rafitani], ALAC.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Maureen Hilyard, ALAC member, that's right.

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche, ALAC executive.

YU-CHUANG KUEK: My name is Kuek, ICANN staff.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Siranush Vardanyan, APRALO Chair.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Silvia Vivanco, ICANN staff.

ARIEL LIANG: Ariel Liang. ICANN staff.

GISELLA GRUBER: Gisella Gruber, ICANN staff.



---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible], from Korea.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible], ISOC India.

KELVIN WONG: Kelvin Wong, ICANN staff.

YANICE LEE: Yanice Lee, Net Mission.

[WANG CHOY]: [Wang Choy], Net Mission.

SATISH BABU: Satish Babu, [inaudible] APRALO.

[WILSON LAMB]: [Wilson Lamb], Net Mission.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Hello everyone. I'm a college student from [inaudible] China. My name is [inaudible].

[LESLIE LOW]: Hello everyone. I'm [Leslie Low], and I'm from [inaudible] University China too.



---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: [Inaudible], if you can introduce yourselves please, and those who came, who just joined us, please introduce yourselves.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: [Inaudible] from ISOC [PH].

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Please introduce yourself.

HYEYONG KANG: Hi everyone. I am Hyeyoung Kang, the new head of Seoul office of ICANN. ICANN regional office. Yeah. Thank you.

SONG: [Inaudible] my name is Song. S-O-N-G. I work for ICANN's Beijing [inaudible], placed in Beijing. Nice to meet you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: I just got an email from Ali saying he's not able to connect to Adobe. Can someone help with a call to him. Is it possible?

ALI ALMESHAL: I'm just in right now, I'm just in.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Welcome Ali. Can you introduce yourself to people for sitting here?



---

ALI ALMESHAL: This is Ali AlMeshal, from Behan ISOC. And I'm the Vice-Chair for the APRALO.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Excellent. Thanks for joining us. And do we have...

ALI ALMESHAL: Hi to you all.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Same here. Do we have remotely joined except Ali?

[LEANNA]: Yes hello, it's me, it's [Leanna].

GISELLA GRUBER: Sorry, it's Gisella for the transcript...

[LEANNA]: Can you hear me?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Yes [Leanna], we can hear you.



---

[LEANNA]: Yeah, hello. Nice to hear so many voices. You're there. It's a pity that the remote connection is not working, any way I will join this call...

By the way, I'm from ISOC Armenia for those who don't know.

GISELLA GRUBER: Thank you [Leanna]. As a point of order for the meeting as we don't have remote participation, we have the audio bridge. It's very important to keep your microphones when not speaking. It creates a huge echo on the line. And also we have Chinese interpretation, for any Chinese speakers, please do take headsets, please remember to state your names before speaking, and speak at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Gisella. And welcome again. Welcome those who joined us through phone bridge. And especially, I warmly welcome the newcomers who are with APRALO for the first time. And I hope you will get the information, what we are doing here, and what is our main approach, and how we work with ALSs. So, without further ado, let us start based on our agenda.

And the first agenda item is just the potential new ALSs who are planning to join us. I would like to let you know that ISOC Delhi and ISOC Palestine applied, to become a certified ALS within APRALO. And they are currently in the process of due diligence. So whenever they officially become an ALS, we will let you all know.



---

And the second agenda item is APRALO showcase. You all know that tomorrow at 6:30 we have an APRALO showcase here, and I hope that you, all of you will make that time to be there, because we need to show ourselves to the rest of the community. So every single person there is welcome to come and to introduce themselves. There will be a possibility of networking, so please, come.

And one of the specifics we decided to have, if you have, with you national dress, you can come in your national dress. And it will be good if there would be some color in, red color. So, please come in red because APRALO's color is red. And we would need all of your presence there, probably 10, 15 minutes earlier because there might be, your support might be needed for handling out the takeaways, the gifts which we prepared.

I would like also to thank those who, before this showcase, with this short notice of three months having the meeting in Singapore, had chance to help a lot, particularly Yanice, who is here, and she really great, well, hard with, together with the staff to make it done. So real appreciation of that.

And just to let you know that the agenda is set. We will have Rinalia Abdul Rahim as a speaker. We will have Steve Crocker as a speaker. ALAC Chair, Alan Greenberg will have two minutes to say hello to everyone. We will have a great performance, I am expecting, already, and looking forward to the great performance for the kids who came from Malaysia, who will present [foreign language] performance.

And I'm sure those who are from Malaysia know this well enough. And I'm looking forward to learning dancing. Yes, we will have a lot of stuff



---

there. There will be calligraphy booth organized. So everybody can have a chance to go and learn how to write their name in Chinese. So those who know how to write their names can help also at the calligraphy booth people there.

A couple of presents, takeaways, because this is Chinese New Year. So we will have some specific gifts for our guests there. And I'm sure we'll have a lot of fun, due to the support of dot Asia, to serve us the catering, with some drinks and alcohol. So I'm sure we will enjoy, and this will be once again, a chance for us to show us, as a team, to the rest of the community.

So everybody knows that the APRALO showcases are always on the highest level. So, we will prove once again tomorrow. So looking forward to that. Any questions related to the update of showcase? Any specific questions related to the agenda details? Yes. And at the end, we'll have Fadi Chehadé coming and joining us, and to give certificates to the troops as well.

Any additions? Any questions? No? Okay. So without further ado, I would like to go, to move to the next agenda item, which is APRALO APAC hub pilot framework. And I would like, welcome Cheryl. And I would like to thank our colleagues in ICANN from Singapore. The Singapore staff, and thank you Kuek for being with us.

And especially Kelvin who is doing amazing job for dealing with us. So, I would like to give the floor to Kelvin, who will provide an update where we are now.





KELVIN WONG:

Thanks Siranush. I will just quickly go through, I think you have heard me talk about this before, for those who are here in [inaudible]. I think I went through in London as well, but for the benefit who hasn't, I'll just go through quite quickly. We wanted to capture some of the things that we had in common, and some of the projects that we can do together.

This is not really a total set of the good things that APRALO is doing, or will be doing, and not a set of, those are the set of things that ICANN APAC hub will be doing. But like I said, it's a common set of things that we can do together in the foreseeable future. Well so you can see some of the progress we made in ICANN 50 and 51.

So we've come together to agree on a common set of focus areas, which are the three things, yeah, I'm sorry, yeah. Next slide please.

So this is the progress that we have made from ICANN 50 and ICANN 51. Next one please. So you can see that this is the set of agreed common focus area, the top three things that we have there. Language localization, capacity capability building, outreach and awareness building.

This is a still from the focus areas that ICANN APAC hub has, and APRALO has. So I'll just quickly dive into the focus areas, as well as the action items and some of the updates that we have for you. Next slide.

Okay so we can see, I will not go through line by line. We presented this in LA 51, so you can see the three focus areas on the left hand side. I mentioned language localization, capacity building, and raising awareness. And on the right hand side is the proposed actions. I'll go through them in the next few slides.



---

So for language localization, this is a project by [inaudible], and the slides was a project by [inaudible], and APAC hub, and [inaudible] has a big hand in doing that. So with this set of slides, we wanted the ALS to help us getting the help of APRALO, to translate them into the language, the local language so that we can actually have them delivered to the local community.

So the update we have is that ISOC Delhi, they have completed slides in Hindi, and [inaudible] for the outreach activities. And for in Bengali, ISOC Bangladesh has also been helping us and this work in progress, and we have our friends, I think [inaudible] who is the main person driving it, is unable to make it here today.

And we have colleagues from ISOC Bangladesh. You have something to say? No? Okay. Please feel free to talk to him on the experience in translating the slides. Thank you. And this contributions from ALSs. Of course, we also have contributions from other community partners. So the slides have been translated into different languages, such as in Korean, in Chinese, in [inaudible] Indonesia.

Well, you can see a sample of some of the slides. I'm sorry, can you go to the next slide please? So these gives you an idea on what the slides are. We have a few decks of slides which is the introduction to ICANN, universal acceptance, IDN WHOIS, and new gTLD. So this is intended to give the local community a good flavor of the ongoing issues in ICANN.

And ISOC Bangladesh has also been connecting some outreach events using the local slides. Next slide please. And I mentioned about the ICANN languages, ICANN materials in other languages. Next one. On



---

supporting outreach and awareness building, I understand that we're going to have the next agenda item, which is to talk about CROPP.

So we hope to work closely with, we are working closely with APRALO, we have identified some working principles for the discussion. I hope this will be a good segue into next agenda item. So some of these principles that we hope to target a good balance of established conferences, which targets the regulars, if you may, who are very familiar with ICANN, but we cannot [inaudible] on more matters related to ICANN.

And also a balance between that and a more green field conferences. So we go out to people who may not necessarily be a usual ICANN community, but we go out to spread the word. So this is our way of raising awareness. So we thought that CROPP could have, be based on this. CROPP evaluation can be based on this principle. But lastly for this, for the discussion for the next agenda item.

So next, I also wanted to highlight the effort by one of our ALS, ISOC Japan. I have the chance to stumble on this presentation. They did a good job of actually collating information from the website, different sources to do their own outreach event during the Internet week. So I approach them and collaborated with them to translate this into English, call it the reverse localization if you may.

So that we have a ready set of slides that ALSs can use for their own outreach purposes, and their own community. They can do that in English, or they can well translate it into their own languages, and do the outreach activities to the local community.



---

And next, well this is the last focus area that I have. It's on capacity building. I think based on the feedback that we have gathered, we also understand that there is a need for capacity building program for the APRALO members. So on issues pertaining to IANA transition, for example. So the team has come up with some suggestions on what we can do this for this capacity building webinar.

I have to thank Silvia, and Tim, and Heidi for coming up with this. Maybe I'll let them take you through the next slide.

ARIEL LIANG:

Actually I will let Silvia talk about the goal and target audience for the capacity building webinar first. And now you can see the information on the blue, in the blue box. And Silvia, please start.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Okay, thank you Ariel. And thank you Kelvin and Kuek for the continued collaboration that we have among staff, across the world. We talk almost every night for me, and we coordinate everything. So I really appreciate it.

The goal is to have webinars that are interesting for you, for your region, for your needs. And to be customized. We have, across the RALOs we're doing a similar exercise, and we're also coming up with what they think is important. So the target audience is the ALS that are already existing, to prove their level of knowledge of all of the subject matters.



---

And, of course, to happen, also an outreach effect, but initially is to bring all of this people up to speed, because we realize that each ALS has a different background. Some are lawyers, some are engineers, users. So there is, every organization has its own point of view. So we want to be able to have had first level where everybody feels comfortable, and they can very navigate very, very easily throughout ICANN, which is a very challenging environment.

So that's the target I would use. And also we have the newcomers and Fellows. So we are proposing, this are just by DS that we are brainstorming among us, staff, to you, so you can digest and think about it, and come up with your own proposals. Then we start with webinars that are a very basic level, we can invite newcomers and Fellows to participate also in the webinars.

And the next one.

ARIEL LIANG:

Thanks Silvia. This is Ariel Liang for the record. I'm just going to introduce you to a little bit details of this capacity building webinar series. So we envision this webinar has two tracks, as Silvia just previously explained. One track is more like an introductory type of webinar, introduce what APRALO is, and what the members do.

The organization the option to just educate new members, who you are, and raise awareness of what you do. So that's the first track. And on the second track is more about capacity building of the policy topics that ICANN deals with and matters to APRALO, so that's more building the member's knowledge about those issues.



---

So these are two tracks. Now in terms of a topic selection, we definitely want this to be a bottom up process, and we would like APRALO members to propose your own ideas, and perhaps staff can facilitate the process and using survey where those tools to select the top choices, then we can build this a series.

So that's a first detail. And on the second detail, is about the time and frequency. We're envisioning this webinar to be monthly webinar, so at least one webinar per month, and we will make sure webinar is conducted at the time convenient for the people in the region.

And after communicating with the APAC communications staff, we learned that a lot of APAC webinars are hosting a 03:00 UTC, so seems to be a convenient time for the region. So we will make sure we do that. And on the third one, it's about the speakers, and then we want, and of course the subject matter experts to speak about, you know, the topics there, expert, and then we definitely want to encourage local involvement in that.

So if there is a APAC expert, experts in the APAC region, we definitely want them to speak for those webinars. And then we will work with APRALO leaders, and also the APAC staff, and to select those appropriate speakers.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Ariel. Thank you Silvia. Yeah, please Silvia.



SILVIA VIVANCO:

Yes. And to complete the ideas, we are also brainstorming this. This is for you to consider. In all the RALOs, what we are thinking about is to have perhaps, I don't know if I want to call it a test, but a quiz, after each webinar, a survey, or a few questions, to test the knowledge, to know, you know, if I actually got something out of the webinar, and some are suggesting in other RALOs, that perhaps there could be a grade or some sort of recognition, like a certificate of completion after a certain number of webinars have been completed by a person.

Like an incentive for the person to participate in the webinar. You know, they receive an electronic certificate of completion. That's just an idea we could explore as well, if that's interesting for you. Another idea would be, if the webinars produce a lot of content, we could make a connection with ICANN Learn Online, and bring all this content in a format, and put it on this platform, on the ICANN Learn Online.

So we have not only the webinar and it's gone. So there is a follow up. After the webinar, you are able to see the webinar online again, and continue your education. And the promotion of the webinars will be done through Ariel and the staff, through the social media channels like Facebook and Twitter, etc. So that's, thank you.

KELVIN WONG:

Sorry, we're all fighting to speak. Okay this is the last slide. This shows the journey that we have. I would like to thank Siranush and team for your guidance. I think it's shaping up to be a good framework. So I would like to reach out to everyone to let you know that, of course, it's still open.



---

So feel free if you think that the slides are useful to you, reach out to us to localize the slide so that you can present it to your community. So feel free to approach any of us. That's all. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Kelvin. Thank you staff. This is really great to see this moving forward. And I would like to, especially mention here, that without ALS participation, nothing would be possible. The localization language, localization, the information you are providing. So this is very important for us to identify the need, and then to work towards it, to meet that need.

So please, participate actively. And just for, about related topic for webinars, I would like to let you know that we recently collected some ideas from our ALSs, and submitted it to capacity building working group. The topics from APRALO. But we are going also to work on conducting one survey among our ALSs to find out the expertise.

So what kind of expertise we do have in our ALSs, in our RALO. And maybe we can add additional question there. Additional topics for capacity building. So we may find out additional information from ALS, from you, and we will all take into consideration this while selecting the topic for capacity building.

Any questions? Yeah, Satish Babu, please.

SATISH BABU: Thank you Siranush. Satish for the record. I'd like to point out that, in view of the excellent relations that the RALO has been having with the





---

regional directive, that there was a very major program launched yesterday on universal acceptance, which basically is about the acceptance of new gTLDs, IDNs, and internationalized email IDs, for widespread use.

There are some things that block it right now. And this initiative, the IDN working group of ALAC is planning to take this up for the ALAC itself. And given the fact that our region has a lot of diversity, this is one of the areas where we can actually contribute, and I would like to bring to the attention of the regional director and Kuek in particular, so that we can address this. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Satish. YJ.

YJ PARK: YJ Park for the record. And first of all, I really appreciate a lot of this APRALO's effort, which seems to be very helpful. But in reality, I really find it very difficult to participate because, mainly because of my, you know, the lack of time. So one of the suggestions we can do to sort of take advantage of this sort of resource is, why can't we have allocated some kind of storage space, where we can go to that recorded data session?

So whenever we have some time, we can go back to all of those webinars, so we don't really have to participate in specific time, when we might have some conflicts of, you know, time with other schedules. So I think that might be very good, you know, resources.



---

We can fully take advantage of. Yeah, anyway. Thank you so much for your all efforts, and hopefully we can further do with all IANA transition issues, which I understand a lot of APAC members are now fairly actively involved with, especially Asia region. So hopefully we can do that to educate more ALSs in our region.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you YJ. This is really great suggestion, and staff is already taking notes of that, and I assume that we will have the archive, so-called, of all of those webinars available with their transcripts, presentations, and yeah, and recordings. They all will be available for all of us for future as well.

So there might be new ALSs coming, and for not running the same webinar once again. We can direct them to that archive of information. So yes. We are looking forward towards those capacity building webinars. Kuek.

YU-CHUANG KUEK: Thank you very much Siranush. This is Kuek for the record. Before I begin, I just wanted to introduce some of the other team members we have as well. So we have [inaudible], who has recently joined us as ICANN staff, based in Delhi. We have [inaudible], who many of you should know very well, who is our SSR manager for the region.

As well as [inaudible] who is our ICANN liaison in Tokyo.

[Applause]

---

So again, I know I've done this before, but I would like to welcome you back again to Singapore. I feel a lot for this meeting because it's almost exactly one year since the last time you've been here. And I think a lot has happened since then, together with [inaudible], both of us have been trying to see how we can best meet the needs of APRALO, as well as the rest of our communities out here in the Asia Pacific region.

So with regard to YJ's intervention just now about the webinars, now that we have expanded our team in the region, and we have IT locally in region, were able to organize webinars always at 03:00 UTC, which is 11:00 here, I think, 8:30 in India, and a reasonable time, what? It's 4:00 in New Zealand, 4 PM in New Zealand, yeah.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: It's 7 AM for Armenia, but never mind.

YU-CHUANG KUEK: The Istanbul hub. Tune into the Istanbul hub, I think you'll have exciting things working out of the Istanbul hub. So that's one thing. So I'm happy to tell YJ that, if it's supported from our region, and I'm sure it will be, the webinars, all of our webinars are recorded. It's held every second Thursday on a bi-monthly basis, always at 03:00 UTC.

Also, you know, with the new resources in the region, I'm very happy that [inaudible] in his capacity development work in the region, has very concrete outcomes to show for in the region, after training and after training and [inaudible] in Indonesia, we had Indonesia and [inaudible] to sign on for DNSSEC deployment. So I think there is a lot of concrete things that we can do in the region as well.



---

As you can see, we're trying to increase our footprint in the region, but there is one thing that I can assure you, that no matter what ICANN staff does in the region to expand, we will never, ever have the footprints that APRALO will have with your At-Large structures across the entire region, which is the motivation for us to work together as one team, because you will always be able to do things that ICANN staff will never be able to do.

So I'm very happy that this group has been so welcoming of our proposal to work very closely together. I think in the way that we have identified focused areas, and subsequently implement them, has given us a more streamlined approach to the way that we conduct our work. I think there will always be ad-hoc needs, but having focus areas gives us a certain continuity for other projects so that we continue with a lot of these projects.

So thank you very much. Our team looks to you to do more work with the language localization tool kit. I think there are still many countries out there, and many languages out there, that I think will serve as, that will be well served by us, if we can just give them a very basic introduction of ICANN in their own, in the local language, so they can take back to their communities.

I've already spoken about the webinars. I would also like to speak a bit about working together on awareness and outreach. I'm very excited for the upcoming [inaudible] meetings in two weeks. We have Maureen and Satish representing ICANN from, through a CROPP capacity, and also representing APRALO at the meeting.



---

I'm really hoping that CROPP is a sustainable program. As you are aware, it's in a pilot phase, and I'm really hoping that collectively, between you and I, we'll be able to come up with proof points of why we should continue with the program, and we are able to talk about the merits of the program. As you may know, there are big events in the region every year.

The Apricot meeting is a big one. The AP NIC, AP TLD meetings are big ones. Another big one is the AP RIGF. I think at this event, we have fairly good representation from ICANN, and within these groups, there is a fairly good understanding of ICANN issues. If you look at the Apricot meetings, ICANN staff will be represented on the actual conference agenda, both at the AP TLD part of the meetings, as well as the AP NIC side of the meetings.

We are on the meeting agenda. Elise Gerrick, who needs no introduction, I'm sure, who manages our IANA function, is speaking on day one. We have three Board directors who are there, who are speaking in the sessions as well, in addition to the staff. But despite all of these big events in the region, there are many small events in the region that our footprint does not allow us to engage in.

So for example, you know, we have to fellows from Bangladesh this time. And we were happy to recruit them, because I was down at [inaudible] together with [inaudible], but I don't have, I don't go to Dakar as often as I would like. I don't go to Bangladesh as often as I would like. [Inaudible] does a lot of work in India, but even then, a lot of his coverage, and a lot of his time, is spent in Delhi, with the benefit of having ISOC chapters around the rest of India, or At-Large structures



---

in other parts of India, we would like to use the CROPP program to cover the other many meetings in the region as well, that based on our system footprints, we might not be able to cover.

Another example, for example is [inaudible]. Based on my memory, ICANN staff has never been on the [inaudible] agenda, and we have not attended [inaudible]. If we can use the CROPP funding, for example, to have ISOC Japan or someone else, represent us at [inaudible], I think that would be very useful.

And let me talk about why I think the kind of collaboration between APRALO and ICANN, in terms of awareness and outreach, is especially critical this year. Specifically because of the IANA stewardship transition that YJ talked about. We want to make sure that, you know, at such a critical point of the Internet's history, we encourage participation, and even if we are not able to garner participation, we at least create awareness as with many platforms as we can.

So I'm really hoping that we can do the CROPP program. I will struggle a little bit if the CROPP applications come in the next time around, and it's for AP RIGF, because I'm very confident that, you know, AP RIGF will discuss the IANA stewardship transition. Or, you know, if we go to the next AP NIC meeting in Jakarta, and if I get, if there is an application for CROPP funding to go there, I would struggle a little bit because I just know that the region is so diverse, and there are so many spots that have not been touched yet.

And I really hope that using the At-Large structures that we have, we will be able to get as much intelligence about communities we should be reaching out to, but we haven't. So this is something that [inaudible]



---

and I have discussed, I think on many of the points we have great progress. I don't know if [inaudible] has any further comments on what we are hoping together we can do in terms of outreach.

And it's the same for universal acceptance as well. I mean, when we go to the platforms, the APRIGF and APNIC meetings, the likelihood of people knowing about the issue, is I think is relatively high, but there might be communities, for example, in Bangladesh where they're using local language, and they're hoping that more can be done to promote the use of internationalized domain names.

But will just need a little boost, especially through colleagues here to do that. Sorry, that was a 14 minute monologue, but I just want to make use of this opportunity while we are face to face to thank you for the collaboration, introduce the team, and hopefully we can do more together.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Kuek. And this was really very important for you to present this strategical [sic] approach to CROPP. So I would like to let ALSs know and highlight once again that CROPP funding is available for ALSs, to use it. And we have to the end, for this fiscal year, to the end of June 13<sup>th</sup>, we have one slot left.

So if there is a very important local meeting where you can find important, your participation there to do outreach as Kuek said, use the capacity you have. So please apply. And this should go through RALO leadership so you know where to go. On the Wiki, there is all information about CROPP program is available. We also have Ali



---

AlMeshal and Cheryl Langdon-Orr, who are members of this CROPP program.

So if you have personal questions, so you don't know where to go, how to find the information, please send me, just send a private email asking, or myself. So try to use that opportunity. So by, and be aware that we need to apply eight weeks prior to the event. So while planning that, please plan in accordance. And Kuek, just one comment, please continue struggling with us, because your struggling makes us stronger. So please, we are looking forward to your struggling. Any questions related to that?

So we have covered also the CROPP part. And also I would like to thank Net Mission and ISOC Japan for volunteering and helping Satish and Maureen during the outreach activities in Apricot 2015. So thank you once again. And this is just an example of how ALSs can participate, can be involved in APRALO activities. So Yanice, please.

YANICE LEE:

Yeah, and actually we will have a community dot Asia [inaudible] so I'm not sure if we may, APRALO have some information materials that we want to put out, and is welcome to put up a booth as well.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

Great, maybe we can ask staff to provide the information. And if you can send what kind, how many examples of the outreach materials will be needed, staff may send it to you. So thanks, yeah.





---

YANICE LEE: Yeah. I can work with maybe Maureen, Satish and see how we can...

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Yeah, excellent. Any questions related to that? Yes please. State your name.

WILSON: Yes, my name is Wilson from Net Mission. I will just continue on Kuek's point on outreach into the community. I would like to draw your attention to another special aspects of outreach, which is the youth participation on Internet governance. As Kuek mentioned, APRIGF is a very important part of the Asia activities, and the Net Mission held the youth Internet governance forum, the YIGF every year in conjunction of the APRIGF.

And this year, we're going to hold the next APRIGF in [inaudible], and we really appreciate and happy to work together to make the next RIGF in upcoming 2015 [inaudible], APRIGF. Thanks.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Great. Thank you for this. And related to APRIGF, Yanice you wanted to say something? Or no?

YANICE LEE: Actually...

ALI ALMESHAL: Siranush, may I have a comment?



---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Yes Ali, please. Sorry, yes Ali.

ALI ALMESHAL: Sorry Yanice. Thank you very much. This is Ali AlMeshal for the record. Thank you very much Kuek for the [inaudible] about the CROPP. And I would just highlight the last statement that Siranush says, please continue struggling with us because what you have mentioned about the other international events, and that is covered, and well attended by ICANN staff, and BB's and others, you are absolutely right.

But on the other side, youth segments, or youth target, when you [inaudible] there, you are comparing separate, let's say, [inaudible] people then when we are presenting there by the ALSs or the APRALO leaders. You are there on the [pages], you are going to the mass of the people while we are, when we are there, we are targeting peoples. We are having different agenda, and trying to do more connect with the ALSs, or trying to recruit more ALS.

So I think, and you have already stated there, both of us will complement each other. So I don't see any conflict between ICANN staff attending these international events while the ALSs or the RALO is benefitting from the benefit as well. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Ali. Together with this, with the major international events in our region, I would also highlight what Kuek said, that this is very important also to, for our participation in some, maybe not such big



---

events, but local ones, which may be for the specific region, are much more important than, like global IGF for the whole community.

Thank you. And let's move forward. I think we are clear on that approach, and I would like to give the floor now to Maureen, to talk a little bit about the metrics working group activities, and also our approach to that.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you Siranush. This is Maureen for the record. Yeah, I don't want to scare anyone. As soon as I mentioned metrics, everyone goes eek. But metrics has sort of been actually like on the table for, you know, since 2012 as a working group, and it's going to become very much part of the whole ALAC review that we're going to be involved in. It's At-Large, isn't it?

Okay, whatever. So what I'm going to do is basically next. Are you with me Ariel?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:

You have only three minutes.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Yeah, thanks.

ARIEL LIANG:

Sorry Maureen. Just to interrupt momentarily, the AC room just got back on and I'm trying to upload that to the AC room and get that working.



MAUREEN HILYARD:

All right. I'll just talk and use my three minutes that I've got. Two? What I wanted to do was sort of to introduce you to the metrics from what we've actually been working on over the last couple of years even, since I became a sort of like more involved in it.

And what we looked at first of all was the ALAC, and the metrics we're actually going to be using for the ALAC. Then I want to look at what the expectations are of ALSs, because that's vital importance to us as ALAC members for APRALO. And then, look at some issues because you know, like when we're looking at participation of ALSs and the expectations that we have of them, there are some issues which I think we really need to take account of, and this will also be, I will also be making sure that this is raised up in the actual review.

Next. When we're talking about ALAC for example, the rules of procedure of ALAC said very clearly what the expectations are for ALAC members. And they're pretty specific, but from these, getting the actual metrics, wasn't an easy task. And we've only really just really made recommendations. It hasn't actually been formally endorsed yet. Next.

The sort of things that we're looking at for metrics with regards to ALAC are attendance and every meeting. In fact, for ALSs as well, every meeting that ALSs and ALAC members participate in, it's all recorded and is a matrix. And we can call up the matrix and it's not check, but it is definitely monitoring attendance of working groups and formal meetings, etc.



---

We also can assess participation and that's where, if you've ever seen the Adobe Connect room, there is a chat, and there is action items, and you know, just the general agenda, as well as the attendance record, but it does record participation. So that the Adobe will actually sort of like record your participation in the chat. It is recorded anyways, so if you actually contribute anything to the meeting, that's recorded.

And it's all, in some way, going to be monitored. I'm not quite sure if we actually just decided on how that is going to happen as of yet. For the ALAC members as well, we're actually, sort of probably, we are expecting some sort of like report to go to the ALAC Chair.

It hasn't been formalized yet as to what the expectations are at the moment, but some during the term of an ALAC member is two years, so sometime within those two years, we'll be expecting some kind of report to the Chair. And lastly, ALAC members are elected by the RALOs.

They're elected by the ALSs of those RALOs. And so therefore they are answerable to the RALOs. And to the ALS members. And therefore the final sort of like metric can actually be carried out by the RALOs themselves. And so that's a decision that could be made by the RALOs.

I mean, that's what we're expecting of the ALAC members themselves. Next. When it comes to ALSs, that is the individual members of the RALO, what we're actually sort of like ending up with now is that, we are actually finding that some of our RALO, some of our ALSs are not participating at all. They become, the register and they're accepted, and then we don't hear from them again.



---

And we need to know why. In the application form, there is a set of criteria which actually specifies what to expect when you actually become an ALS. And so that, the expectations sort of like, are pretty clearly stated in there, and we're assuming that people read that when they go to apply. Because it does, there is a very clear expectation of participation in that.

Next. And of course, once you're accepted, the APRALO actually has its own rules of procedure. And within those rules of procedure, we actually also specify the performance expectations of our ALSs. And I think what we sort of like got to realize here, is that the importance of having ALSs in the region, and within ICANN, the ALSs are the other feedback mechanism for ICANN.

The ALSs provide us with the voice of the communities. It's important that when you are, when you actually become a member of APRALO, that we provide the voice of the Asia-Pacific region towards the ALAC statements that are made in public consultation. So, you know, it's very important that our ALSs do participate, and all of your participation is actually recorded.

So you've got the ALAC, you've got the APRALO, oh crikey, really? Next.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Sorry Maureen for limiting your time. I know this is really a very important issue, but just one minute to summarize.



MAUREEN HILYARD:

Okay. I think this is the last one anyone, on no. The last one is probably where I need it. Okay so there are some issues that I would like to raise. For example, in the application form, it's really like a sort of important that we actually sort of like highlight, first of all, that the people who are making applications to actually belong to ICANN, do they actually understand what the expectations are?

You know, and also, the organization, some of the organizations that actually join up have no, don't have anything to do with the Internet. So we're actually sort of like, this is one of the things that we're also looking at, but a little bit more in depth, is to make sure that there is actually some Internet connection. There is domain names and numbers.

Some sort of connection within the community, and that there is some, you know, one of the expectations is that they will communicate with their community about things that ICANN is involved in. And also, the RALO role is the kind of support. And I think what we've been talking about just now about the webinars, and those sorts of things are really helpful because they help to keep people engaged. And I think that's really important. Communication is really important, like in the webinars, and any other means which we can actually to support, to keep ALSs engaged, really important.

Just remembering that we will be measuring, monitoring and measuring all the time, and the downside is that ALSs that do not perform, do not actively engaged are just not turning up. Then we go through a de-certification process, which we don't really like to do because it's really onerous on the ALAC.



---

Okay, so we'd like to keep people engaged. Okay. I'll stop there.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Maureen. Yes, I would like to highlight the point that we are looking to these metrics from positive point of view. So to encourage people to participate. And maybe they are ALSs who do not participate, just because they do not have enough information, and with this metrics, we also are going to find out why they are not participating.

Because these metrics are also on us, how we perform as the leaders of this RALO. How we come back to you with serving you properly, with the information unit. Shiva, please?

[SHIVA]: [Inaudible], ISOC India [inaudible] ALS. Whether it's measuring ALS performance, or the performance of ALAC members, the metrics that you talked about, probably looks at what is visible. For example, you measure a person's participation on an email list, which is public, but you don't go into how many emails he exchanged, how it was off list, which offers more qualitative nature.

Is there a process by which you could ask an ALS or an ALAC member or a RALO member to submit a self-assessment on what he did, and what he thought was an important contribution, based on his assessment. You make a judgment on his contribution. And secondly, apart from this quantitative assessment, or quantitative metrics measurement, that he had been at six meetings and made four interventions, is there anything that you do to measure the quality of his participation?





---

Or the quality of his intervention? For example, somebody could make 10 interventions during a meeting, but another person could make one intervention, which could be very, very significant, very meaningful, and important, and pointed. So, it is some way by which you make an assessment of what is not visible and what is not quantifiable.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Thank you Shiva. This is Maureen for the record. What you state has been raised several times before, and very valid. It's one of the reasons why we have offered that people can write a report, and you can actually write about what do you feel are the significant, what's the significant contribution you feel you have made.

We can get assessments, other kinds of assessments, but this is your own personal, and you can, you would be able to say that. We're never actually ever going to be able to quantify quality, but the quality of a person's contribution, but I think that if you were doing a report, and you would say that significant contributions that I have made to APRALO in this time, or whatever.

[SHIVA]:

Quickly. The point that I'm trying to make is that whatever assessment that you make, sometimes does not have to be entirely following a certain format, and a user sometimes have to go beyond the format. And this is a person in a manner that is not defined easily, that does not fit in a particular process and make judgments, which are not quantifiable. Thank you.



---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you [Shiva]. Self assessment is a very good point, and we'll take into consideration. It's noted. And I would like, once again, make sure that we are not just calculating... You are right. I agree. The person can be online participating, just switch on his computer and left the computer actually without any participation.

This is also happening. So we are trying to find the balance of participation, of investment of time, of participation in the working groups, so this is also one of the important aspects that ALS is participating. Their input in working group discussions, their input in any policy development, their input on any public comment.

I mean, everything is there to measure, to see, to identify. But self assessment will be, might be another tool. Thank you very much. And we have only, so the time is over, but we will have 10 more minutes to finish with the last point. We have, I would like to give the floor to Holly to provide just two minutes update on ALAC review, and we would like to identify a person who will be volunteering for this team. Holly, please.

HOLLY RAICHE: Try not to repeat too much of what I said. Many of you have already heard, many have not. As part of the overall ICANN accountability and transparency, there are regular reviews of all of us. The last review of ALAC was 2009. Now that review, because RALOs were new, there were barely any RALOs, let alone the metrics.

So what was reviewed at that time really was just ALAC. We're now at a point where we have RALOs established, we have plenty of ALSs, and



---

this review will largely focus not only on ALAC itself, but on the level of RALOs and then on ALSs, and that's where a lot of what Maureen is doing will be very useful.

The process really starts just with probably four or five months of thinking through what it is that we as APRALO, as ALAC, want to be included in the questions that we're looking for, what kind of information do we want? As part of the preparation of that, Cheryl and I have had a chat with the person who ran the GNSO review, who said, one of the things they ran into was they did not go wide enough in the sort of information they looked for, and they wound up not having the data they wanted.

So part of what we're doing in the next, in the lead up to June, will be, first of all, forming a working team. We will be the liaison between, [inaudible], but it's a structural improvements committee, it's a Board committee.

And there will be, as part of the lead up to this, the actual review will be conducted by what's called an independent investigator, who will be selected by the structural review committee, they will go out for tender, and a process people can bid, one will be selected. We will work with that individual or organization in developing the kinds of questions that we actually want asked, to gain the data that we want as part of that review.

So really we need to pick all of your brains as to what you think we need to do to better understand the efficiencies and the inefficiencies that the, are we meeting our objectives? What are our objectives? How do we meet them? How can we approve? They're fairly big questions, but



---

the, I will be leading the team. Cheryl will be backing me up. But we do, because it is particularly based on RALOs and ALSs, we will need regional groups.

So right away, the five areas, we're starting with the Chair, and the Chair will be responsible for either naming themselves or somebody to work with us, but I would imagine within each RALO, there will be a discussion about what we should be reviewing, what our objectives are, how we can test if we met them efficiently, effectively. By the time we get to the end of June, we will have a working committee, it's going to be, there will be at least five chairs or representatives, and an assistant.

There will be Cheryl and myself. We will have formed a committee. We will have drawn up a timeline. We will have worked through all of the information that all of you think are relevant. And we will have, the reason we're going to get an independent investigator onboard, is that they will have the expertise to be able to know if we want to know what information, how best do you ask it?

How do you obtain the information? And there is a whole sort of skill set in doing that. The actual review of particularly the RALOs and the ALSs will start at the end of June, and the meeting in Dublin will be a very good occasion for the independent investigator to actually sit down and starting to talk to some of the key people.

We've already identified the key people that we think, but we will need to talk to you now. The process from here is, I would like to talk to each meeting of RALO, say for 10 or 15 minutes, mainly to listen to all of you, and to listen to all of the other RALOs, so that we can have some really,



---

a lot of feedback to go to the independent investigator when they are chosen. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you Holly. I'm really very sorry, we are running out of time. I would like just to nominate one of our vice-chairs, Ali AlMeshal, and I hope he is hearing us and will say yes to be [inaudible] volunteer to this, yeah, review team, because otherwise we'll nominate him without asking him.

So I think that from APRALO, Ali will be investigator for this team, and will come back to all ALSs with the further activities. With saying that, Ali thank you very much for your smile and agreement. [Laughter]

ALI ALMESHAL: I can't hear you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: And with that, I would like to thank all of you and looking forward seeing you all tomorrow at the showcase. Ali and [Leanna], you will be missed. [Applause]

ALI ALMESHAL: I am the one who is missing all of that. Thank you very much, and talk to you soon.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Bye-bye Ali.

ALI ALMESHAL:                   Bye.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:           For those in the VIP room, the ALAC work session part two will be starting in two minutes. Please don't go anywhere, thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

