

---

CR – LACRALO Capacity Building Session 2  
Monday, March 12, 2012 – 08:00 to 09:00  
ICANN - San José, Costa Rica.

Jose Arcé:

Good morning everybody. Morning. You seem to be quite happy when it's in the morning, I like your attitude. It would seem you were partying last night. Some people are saying "Not at all." Morning RALO; it's quite a revolution this morning. I'm very happy to see you so happy. There is translation, yes there is translation. Before we get started, happy birthday Marcelo Telez; happy birthday.

Welcome everybody, happy to be here with you today. I'm happy that we start the morning with this mood, with this energy. So thank you very much. I'm going to introduce the first guests we have today. After the picture... Actually, today we have special guests because most of the people have been part of and are part of the At-Large world for a long time, even now some of them are not here but they are still contributing enormously to what we're doing. The first speaker is Carlos Aguirre on my right, Carlo, raise your hand. Carlos is a former ALAC member and now he's council of the GNSO; Carlos, thank you for joining us today. We would like to welcome you.

Carlton Samuels is an ALAC member, appointed by the NomCom. He is the vice-Chair of the Ex-Com, is that right? And thank you Carlton, thank you for being with us today. And Andres Piazza, he was the Chair of LACRALO before and now he is at the LATNIC. He does the function of the foreign affairs. Thank you so much for being here. The dynamics of the presentation, I don't know whether the speakers would like to have the Q&A at the end or if they want to be interrupted as they go. Carlton, Carlos – they can interrupt us, they are saying.

Carlos Aguirre, Carlton Samuels, if you want to take the floor, everything is set for you.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

Carlos Aguirre:

Good morning everybody. The presentation Matt, please. We would like to share with you a presentation and some slides has already been shown in Cairo, because at that time I was Chairing ALAC and I thought it would be timely to revisit that; at least some slides. Carlton and I were talking about this and we're going to share it because we agree on many topics and it will be a bi-lingual presentation. I will speak Spanish, Carlton in English.

Matt, if you please. That's us. As Jose said, Carlton is the vice-Chair of ALAC now and myself in the GNSO appointed by the NomCom. We will start talking about the involvement of the final internet users in the Latin America and the Caribbean; that is to say, us. In order to get started and we're starting to share with Carlton, I believe that we should remember these words by heart. You as no commerce, or us people who have not just started but need to be acquainted with this, I believe that we have to start somewhere and starting is, I believe in place remembering these words – knowledge, participation, engagement, outreach and capacity building.

From there we will be able to develop our presentation today. So remember, knowledge, participation, engagement, outreach, and capacity building. It's like a timeline. It is like an evolution from the beginning to what we want to get capacity building. Carlton, any comment on this?

Carlton Samuels:

Morning everybody. We looked at the presentation together, and because the themes were so coincidental, we thought we would share this one set of slides. It is very important that you understand that the main themes that we are proposing here is what you will need to adopt if you are going to be successful as a representative in LACRALO and in ALAC.

I would like to say I would focus on probably the last two bits, and my colleague will deal more extensively with the first three. So, next slide, thanks.

Carlos Aguirre:

After having identified a timeline, which I have asked you to remember, we will show you a snapshot from our standpoint as to which is now where we are standing in relation to knowledge and engagement and the education that we have in relation to ICANN and its environment. I do believe after having been for six years sharing in this environment, that the participation in our region has a low degree of engagement.

And this lack of commitment of engagement involves some leaders in ALSes and At-Large, that is to say At-Large structures. And if leaders have low engagement the end users aligned with those organizations will also have a low level of engagement or lack of commitment. I don't want to go over the board, I don't want to be too harsh and say that it is the ALSes leader responsibility alone. I believe that there is a low level of engagement because sometimes it happens that we do not have outreach enough or reception enough from those who should provided the information so as to create our skills.

So there is a low level of commitment but that can be changed, that is not serious. It will be serious to the extent that it remains the same, but it won't be if we adopt the attitude of trying to improve things. Our level of knowledge is low as we will see in the next slides. That low level of knowledge is associated to the lack of outreach, to the lack of knowledge required so as to be able to get involved and actually engaged.

Anyway, this is not an easy work getting to know ICANN. In ICANN you can see the principle of learning by doing. At ICANN you get to know as you do. That is why engagement is important. If we're not part of it, if we're not committed, if we don't get involved in this environment we will not learn. Because it's so dynamic and it has such a wealth of subjects to develop that it is practically impossible to get to know things if you are not involved in them. And in this slide, there's a lot of time between what we get to know and then to be able to invest that knowledge in order to be able to train other players.

---

In that mid-term there is wear out, there is tiredness, but this is also associated to the first point of commitment or engagement and taking it on as it is. Some comment?

Carlton Samuels:

The last two lines take too long to understand ICANN processes. And because of that there's a waste of time to be able to contribute peaks to the issue of learning by doing. You are not going to understand the world of names and numbers policy making unless you engage; you learn by doing. And those of us who have been involved for a long time, we have been sweating the small stuff for a while.

We have participated. We have read the documents. We have engaged in the conversations. We have not only been in face to face meetings, but we have participated online in teleconferences and so on. That is what we mean when we say you can learn by doing. You have to actively engage in order to begin to understand ICANN. As my colleague says, it is a complex place to operate and it is a lot to learn. And the only way that you are going to move forward is that you have to start. And starting means reading the documents, engaging in the teleconferences, taking every opportunity to interact with people who already know; that's important. Next slide.

Carlos Aguirre:

So before engagement, which is necessary, you need to participate to be involved, but an informed knowledgeable participation; knowledge is required. Just showing up is not enough. As Carlton said, learning by doing is something that we do through a committed, engaged, informed participation through face to face meetings, conferences; any opportunity that comes up before us to be able to exchange knowledge and alternatives that are associated to this environment.

I believe, and Carlton also shares this, it is practically impossible to get into this world and be part of it and actually be effective. Because one thing is to be able to participate, just participate. I have seen in this ICANN environment many

people who give their opinion, who I call opinionaters; I'm so fed up sometimes of opinionaters who speak about everything without knowing a thing about it, but you can see them in every subject that is dealt with and they speak, such as we say in Argentina, without baseline.

But there are many other people that work and work a lot and work very well, even not participating in every single subject, because this is also impossible. Knowing everything is impossible. So we need to focus on something. We need to aim our cannons at the subjects we know the most and develop there. It is impossible, as I said in the last line of our slides, to be really participative and effective with an effective participation if we do not know anything. This is the first commitment. Carlton, do you have anything to say?

And what is participating; what does it mean? What is the meaning of participation then? Participation is a kind of connection. Of course there should be a connection to participation. At least two people need to be involved - one person giving and one person receiving; one person giving knowledge and one person receiving. And the person receiving can also provide knowledge to the person who supposedly is giving knowledge. So it is a sharing, it is a connection.

If this connection does not exist it is impossible. And therefore in this item especially I would like to ask regarding commitment that in this region we should start speaking Spanglish. I would like to ask to those that speak English to speak a little bit Spanish and vice versa, so that everybody can get to know each other and can understand each other.

Many times in this region there were misunderstandings, and why; because we do not know, we don't speak the same language and sometimes translations affect. So let's share and we will adapt to give importance to the region that could now show its capacities. But the other items will be in charge of Carlton.

Carlton Samuels:

Next slide. Okay so, if you have some knowledge and you are engaged and you're going to participate then it is incumbent in you, it is required that you share it with others. The way we are organized is that you are representative of an At-Large structure, meaning that there are others behind you who will need to share this knowledge. It is very important that you do so, so there is this requirement of what we call outreach that is outside of yourself. And when you are together we call it inreach. So the question is what is the objective for outreach?

Well, we are trying to bring others into the process, so we are building the capacity of end users to understand the issues within the ICANN realm. And we are doing it as a way to build the next generation of leaders. That is the objective of outreach. Getting people sufficiently engaged, sufficiently knowledgeable so that they become productive and they are able to give knowledge, give opinions, make comments that seek to secure the best future for the users in our regions.

There are lots of ways you can do outreach. And most of the tools are available and they are familiar to you. You know about social networks, that is the Facebook, the Twitter and all of the other pieces of modern communications that's available to you. There's always printed material that you can provide. And then what I call old technology; radio is very critical in our part of the world. Radio is still a very important means to reach people; communicating by radio.

And Carlos will tell you that one of the first things we did when we got into LACRALO and started was to insist that ICANN have a radio outreach capability built. Some of you around the table here have actually put in exactly that, have appeared in radio shows and have spread the word about names and number policy development, telling people what's happening with the internet. These things are very important.

It's also important that you can face to face meetings in your own space. That is to say in your own countries, in your own At-Large structures and civic

organizations. That is a challenge but is fairly easier. But in LACRALO itself, when we get together as a group, that is a challenge because of the costs associated with face to face meeting. And I will admit that it creates a problem, because we are culturally we tend to be oral, we tend to like to talk. And it's every important to us to talk. It's also one of the areas where we fall down because in speaking in different languages, oftentimes because we are not seeing each other, a lot of the communication is lost. Because we tend to read body language as a part of the communication process; this is the oral tradition.

And so, we have a real challenge in face to face meetings as a group because of the costs. And that in itself has contributed to a lack of understanding and less work being produced. It seems to me that it seems we have this institutional problem that we can't necessarily solve on our own. We will have to revert to using communication tools more effectively, and that's a challenge for us.

So the outreach capabilities that we must develop is specific to the objective of improving the knowledge of our user base and creating opportunities for a new generation of leaders to emerge from our institutions. We have the tools. What is required now is more effective use of the tools. Carlos, you wanted to say something?

Carlos Aguirre:

Thank you Carlton. In this presentation I would like to say something. I have AGEI DENSI's because our organization has been working for eight years with an altruistic attitude without receiving anything back. We are working on transmitting knowledge. We are fully committed to getting all the knowledge we can have to be able to spread it in all Latin America; that is required with all organizations that invite us to listen to us. And we are doing that in Argentina, in Uruguay, in Bolivia, Brazil, Columbia and where else; in Mexico.

That is to say this is the idea, that each one of our organizations, as I know some others are doing the same thing, spread this knowledge so that we can make the region grow. Much more participation is needed. Next slide? And in this issue of participation, this outreach having knowledge building capacities, who are the

---

responsible people if this is not present and if this is not available? We are the responsible ones.

When I say all of us, it is not only the leaders of the ALSes, I think it is the whole environment, the whole package. I think it is the final users, the governments, I think it is ICANN; everyone that is committed to this issue is in some way responsible. So let's take up our responsibilities. We have decided it that way. Nobody forced us to do that. We wanted to participate and we wanted to be involved in this relationship. So let's assume something that we have ourselves decided, this obligation that we imposed on us, because nobody forced us. So if we do not do that we are lying to ourselves.

It looks like a self-help talk, but it is not like that. The idea is that if we assume the commitment we should go forward with that. We are all responsible, and as responsible we have to work together, we have to collaborate. There is no place for divisions because what we want to build is bigger than our own space. We want to build a Caribbean and Latin America all together with a lot of knowledge and providing knowledge to others.

So this is our wonderful commitment to assume and not to let it go by. Carlton, anything to add?

Carlton Samuels:

So, we need commitment, we need knowledge, we need ideas on how we're going to make this better. And of course, we need funds. That is always going to be a challenge for us. It's a challenge for us when we have to meet face to face. It is a big part of our dilemma and it often means that we have to get the support of ICANN. When Carlos speaks about the commitment, this is something that we recognize has to happen with ICANN.

My colleague on the ALAC, Tijani is here. And he will tell you that one of his areas of specialty is the budget and financial matters. And there's always intense negotiations and conversations with ICANN about getting budget; budget not just to meet, but budget also for outreach activities that we would

wish to participate, or we would wish to put on for our constituencies or the end users. This is a real big part of it. The question than comes, well is it necessary for us to do our own fund raising? And there is differing opinions on this because quite frankly, we are engaged, some of us do lots of other things, some of our organizations do lots of other things, not just participate in ICANN names and numbers policy development; we do lots of other things. And we have calls and this.

And oftentimes you have to make a decision about where the small amount of funds we have go. And so it is a difficult situation for all of us. But I think as a group we will have to grapple more intensely with this issue of funding and where we might get additional funds to do what we think we need to do. I am going to urge you in all of the deliberations to think deeply about this issue. Because as it is right now, it is one of the limiting factors to our effectiveness; effectiveness in outreach, our ability to speak to each other more frequently face to face and so on. These are very important matters for us. Carlos?

Carlos Aguirre:

The idea behind this slide is that ideas are more important. Money is required, but not that much money. Rodrigo de la Parra and I were talking about a training program for the region and we said “We don’t need to go to five star hotels. We don’t need to take planes. We don’t need to have a huge room at a hotel. We can borrow university rooms. We can take buses in some countries to be able to cover more cities. We don’t need that much money. We need to have ideas and we need to want to do it.” And this is what we have our backs full of. Next. And to wrap up, some conclusions. Carlton.

Carlton Samuels:

Thank you Carlos. Well, we started out by telling you what the terms we were hoping you’d keep in mind – knowledge, commitment, capacity building, outreach. We told you why they were important to our existence. We told you something about the challenges we face. And we also let you in on the fact that we are collectively responsible for the outcomes. So, it is now up to all of us to

---

do what we must if we are going to prosper, if we are going to be more effective, if the community is going to see more from the Latin America/Caribbean region as input into the policy development space of ICANN.

This is the message that we would wish for you to have from this presentation. Carlos?

Carlos Aguirre:

Thank you. The floor is open for questions. I don't know whether we can have Andres talk for a question of time and the Q&A will be at the end. But all the speakers, if we don't have time because it's four to nine, to get in touch again so that you can exchange your views. But I would like to take advantage of the time we still have to be able to listen to Andres. He has something so important to speak about.

Andres Piazza:

How much time do we have? In four minutes, this session, two minutes. Thank you for having allowed me to be here. I was five years with LACRALO and I'm pleased to be here again. In these five years I thought this session was wonderful. I'm sure this came from Tijani's head from the fellow people and it's so good to do it here. And I thought it would be good to have a capacity building session on IP addresses because it's something that is not part of the policy in ICANN meetings, it is part of something else; it doesn't happen here.

That is why I tried, and Jose allowed me, to create this capacity building session. But I don't think that there is a one directional capacity building session and especially in this subject that has not been dealt with by most people. I will do this tomorrow at 8:00, between 8:00 and 8:30 for the Fellowship Program. You are all invited to join in. Rodrigo will speak. At 8:30 I will do what I was supposed to do here today. And I am interested and in exchange I want to listen to you. Raul Echeberria will speak in consideration of the LACNIC, he will talk at the Opening Ceremony and he will be the keynote speaker at the LACRALO

---

showcase, so you can get information there as well. And we can reschedule this. Thank you very much.

Jose Arcé:

So we go back to the Q&A, those who want to ask questions.

Sergio Salinas Porto:

Thank you Carlos. For the record, I don't know whether record is being taken, but this is Sergio Salinas Porto. I have some reflections to share as to the presentation made. Some things were voiced and I would like to check some thing. When we talk about low engagement level I made a list of fellow LACRALO members who are working at different constituency units at ICANN. Let me tell you that Alejandro Pisanty, Carlos Aguirre, Silvia Herlein, (inaudible), Dev, Cintra, Natalia; there are many – Fatima, [Jose], [Antonella], Federico, Christian; Jacqueline and myself involved in other, and Carlton of course.

When you see all these plethora of people, I understand you Carlos, because when we gave birth to LACRALO with (inaudible), [Vladimir], and many people here, I don't see Lars but he must be somewhere. Dev himself of course. What we dreamt of at that point in time was that all the ALSes would be operating. But the possibility has not been that all of us have the leaders here. But we propose a large amount of things for ICANN policy in relation to the division of LACRALO.

The low knowledge that you are talking about, and you said something that was “we cannot get the know if we are not involved, if we do not participate” and something else comes up to my mind. You can only participate where you feel safe. When you don't feel safe you don't participate. If the documents are only in English, if they are pdf's and you cannot translate them with Google translator and when you want to write an email on the other side, the other side is something different. And when you get something they tell you the RALO is called pre-term baby (inaudible).

It's very hard to participate and it's hard to feel safe at a place you cannot be safe. And our ALSes themselves operate in a structure of insecurity. I agree with the analysis of the subject focus; it is very important. And I think we have spoken about this a lot and this is the way. If we create a subject leader we cannot see the whole universe of ALAC. ALAC has a number of issues to get involved with, but if we have region mates with a look at specific subjects, quite probably we will be successful in the region.

And with the radio, such as Carlton said, we have two programs in our country. One in the Province of [Mizzones] three times a week, an IT program in the [Posada] City in [Pizziones] Province where it was full. And another one is in the city of [Marda Plata] on Saturday's and we talk about internet governance and subjects associated to ICANN. I agree with the analysis that radio gets everywhere; you are driving, you just listen to radio, at least in our countries.

And these meetings, we cannot challenge that. We can have regional country meetings, more economic, and money should not come from anywhere else but ICANN. We are the weakest link in a chain of economic powers in this structure and this should support this. We do not create money by selling domains. I will wrap up soon. We're not providers of internet services. We're not governments that can manage a national budget. The only thing we have is our will to get involved and bring the voices of the users to this place. So those who get nurture from this structure have to put with the voice of the users at this organization. That is all Carlos and Carlton, thank you very much.

Jose Arcé:

Excuse me, Cintra was before. Can we give the floor to Cintra first? Cintra, please, go ahead.

Cintra Sooknanan:

Thank you very much Jose. I understand that we are working under some time constraints right now. I thank Carlton and Carlos for their presentation. I do want to change the somber and serious tune of this presentation a bit. Certainly

ICANN and LACRALO is fun and quite empowering to participate on behalf of end users and in many of our cases it is mandated as part of our organizations, as part of our mission. With regard to some of the points that you touched on, I don't necessarily agree with all.

I do think there needs to be a level of empowerment in LACRALO and funding is perhaps one area that we should look at. And as well, I think that we all know what we've really signed on to. When you sign on any dotted line you have to read the caveats of that and part of that is the fact that ICANN is a technical ecosystem and the documents are in English. Thank you.

Jose Arcé:

Jose Salgueiro?

Jose Salgueiro:

Jose Salgueiro from Venezuela. Everything that has been said is great, I agree completely. I have been part of ALAC for a long time, even since I was a RALO, since it was founded. And in ALAC I was three years represented RALO. And I asked myself why, if we are so interested in getting engagement, there's a mechanism at ALAC which is strange that it's called ExCom, that it's a bypass of RALOs decisions.

Jose Arcé:

Carlos?

Carlos Aguirre:

What Jose said I cannot say anything about it. It got a round of applause, it's clear enough for me. In relation to what Sergio and Cintra were saying, when I talked about lack of engagement I didn't mean that the ALS leaders don't work, but that we need more because we have 580 million people in our region, and we only have 15 or 20. And in relation to the second item, between what Sergio and what Cintra said, documents English and Spanish, that is why I was asking

---

in the middle of the presentation those who speak Spanish to get to speak more English and vice versa. That's why I said let's talk Spanglish or else we are in this dichotomy that we'll never understand each other. But we will see that as we go. Carlton, you want to say something?

Carlton Samuels:

Well there's two things I want to say. We never intended to give you the impression that nobody from Latin American and Caribbean is involved and has been working in ICANN, because we would be doing it against ourselves. What we must do though, and to emphasize, and I totally agree with Carlos on this, there are too few of us working. And we don't have a second team to take over. And what we are trying to do is to develop a second team.

We have to step off the stage in a little while. I know I have a commitment probably to seven years, eight years of this thing because I do lots of other things. And what I really am interested in is having persons from the region who are sufficiently engaged and knowledgeable to sit in ICANN councils and not embarrass us. Straight up. That's the first thing.

I know that there is an issue in the region regarding this organization, this unit called the ExCom and I have the greatest respect for my friend Carlos because I remember in the days when I used to sit right by him. And he's quite right; we used to communicate in Spanglish. But I tell you what. I understood what he was trying to say all the time. And we helped each other to understand the issues and to grow with it.

The ExCom was a response to low participation, even at the ALAC level. It really was that. And even in the ALAC right now, we still don't have an even distribution of the work. Some of us are still working too hard. Others of us are hardly working. It is a fact. And what we want to do is that the institution, the ALAC, the At-Large Advisory Committee, the people who decided in it made, I believe, a sensible compromise. And the compromise was that if we do not find a way to shorten the time that we get together to decide what we should do, and

if we have to wait all the time for others to come to us instead of trying to start something then push it out, we are always going to be behind.

The reason for that is that we have a comment period, a process in which we are locked. That was time limited. And if you did not make the time within which to offer comments, within which to send statements about opposition and perspectives into the decision making process of the Board, it would have been irrelevant. And I totally agree with Carlos, because he knows this. If you look at it from a purely legal point of view, there might have been an argument to say that it was not subject issue. But it had to be done because of the exigencies of the situation. And I respectfully agree with my colleagues who disagree about the ExCom, but it really was a response to a situation that existed, that if it had continued would have embarrassed all of us. And that's where I saw the difference. Thank you.

Jose Arcé:

So, we are on time, but three people raised their hands – Fatimata, Alberto, and Guillermo Zamora. I would kindly request you to be brief because we are over time. And with that we will conclude our session for today. So Fatima has the floor.

Fatima Cambronerero:

Thank you. I am Fatima Cambronerero. Thank you Carlos and Carlton for the presentation. I have a comment. You spoke in the presentation regarding inreach and outreach – regarding inreach it should function inwards among ourselves. It is supposed that the new people, the newcomers could reach for those that are from the beginning of LACRALO. And in this it should be a one way street. The persons who know the most have to teach those who know least. Not only content, because we can study that, but also the day to day LACRALO issue.

---

Unfortunately in some situations when help was requested from those that know a lot, this help was denied. So please do not speak so much about inreach when in fact it is not complied with.

Jose Arcé:

Alberto has the floor.

Alberto:

Thank you Carlos and Carlton. Regarding those that have the language deficiencies, I think the ALSes or those here will make a great effort. So, not to have only a one way effort, I think you should try that at least documents are not in PDF. This should be a great help to work. And when migrations are made, regarding the webpage for example, there are documents that are required for investigation and we need to have the issue date if there is a migration, and all the dates where the migration of the webpage migration. So the documents in English, Spanish, and French documents were not able to be studied.

Jose Arcé:

[Guillermo Zamora] has the floor.

Guillermo Zamora:

My name is Guillermo Zamora. I am from Argentina. The ID rights association in Argentina, this is my first meeting. I ma trying to observe everything that is being said and exposed. I was speaking with my wife in (inaudible), and I was commenting that there are different positions regarding an issue. And she asked me “Who is right” and I cannot tell who is right because I am learning there are different criteria. This is what I have seen up to now.

Something that is very clear, based on the conversations I had and based on what I hear here, personally I worked in many organizations and always the same happens. One person works and the others applaud or criticize. One person says let’s get organized and you work. And in every organization there

is the same; there is a problem, which is marvelous. To detect something that hinders us means that we need to try to get a solution. My consultation and questions are fought too. There's problems detected that are being addressed. Why did they come up?

And secondly, instead of posing the questions or the problems that have been around for a long time, and this is my first intervention, I am not judging, what is the possibility of solving these issues? That's all. Thank you.

Jose Arcé:

Did you understand what I said? Would you like to have five seconds, four seconds?

Male:

I wanted to wash my hands off. It is not my case. I do not apply to what Fatima said. And regarding the answer to Alberto, there is no answer. It is very clear regarding what – we need to modify that of course. And regarding what Guillermo said, Guillermo there is one solution because we are speaking from the legal point of view, the non legal point of view and sometimes the situation calls for something. Respect the Bylaws. Respect the rules. There is no situation outside the rules. There may not be situations outside the rules. If the rules are there, they should be respected and observed. Otherwise we need to amend the rules, but not to do it beyond the rules. Thank you very much.

Jose Arcé:

We would like to conclude this session. We will meet again at 12 noon where we had the meeting today with the fellows. We will start our work meeting and work session with lunch, an informal lunch. So 12 noon at Orquideas room. We will meet there.

---

Dev Anand Teelucksingh: A quick reminder that it's a working lunch, so you have to buy your own food and bring it.

Male: We need to take the food to the Orquideas room. We need to buy food somewhere else, there are many places here around the hotel and we will meet at Orquideas room for the working session. Thank you.

[End of Transcript]