

# ICANN Accountability & Transparency Forum

*ATRT Implementation*

*Status Report & Community Discussion*



*24 October 2011*

*Dakar*

# AGENDA

- **Opening Remarks** – Board Chair, Steve Crocker
- **Presentation, ATRT Implementation** – Staff, Denise Michel
- **Public discussion, questions & answers on:**
  - **Board Operations, Composition & Review of Board Decisions** – Discussion Leaders, Board Members Bruce Tonkin (BGC Chair), Bill Graham, Ray Plzak, Cherine Chalaby
  - **GAC Operations, Engagement, Interaction with Board** – Discussion Leaders, GAC Chair, Heather Dryden and GAC Member, Manal Ismail
  - **Public Input and Multilingual Access** – Discussion Leader, Board Member, PPC Chair, Mike Silber
  - **Measuring Success, Miscellaneous Issues** – Discussion Leader, Board Chair, Steve Crocker

# ATRT Implementation

At [www.icann.org](http://www.icann.org)  
click on –  
Accountability &  
Transparency:

- Track ATRT implementation online – <http://www.icann.org/en/accountability/overview-en.htm>
- Updates, activity summaries, implementation plans are all posted, including today's handout

Accountability  
& Transparency  
AoC Reviews



Accountability & Transparency Review Team (ATRT) Report Recommendations	End Date [i]	Status [ii] ○ pending/ ● completed milestone	End Goal [iii]
---	--------------	--	----------------

## Board Operations, Composition & Review of Decisions

1. <b>a-d. Mechanisms for identifying collective Board skill set;</b> benchmarking Board & BGC skill sets; tailoring & consulting on skills; reviewing annually for each NomCom; publishing outcomes & requirements w/ NomCom's notice.	Mar, 2012	●●○○○	Publicly identify Board skill set & requirements for 2012 NomCom & annually; incorporate public consult/assessment.
2. <b>Regularly reinforce &amp; review training &amp; skills building programs</b>	Mar, 2012	●●○○○	Establish Board training program.
3. <b>Increase transparency of NomCom's deliberations &amp; decision-making process.</b>	Oct. 2011	●●●○○	Establish new NomCom guidelines.
4. <b>Continue to enhance Board performance &amp; work practices.</b>	Jan. 2012	●●○○○	Establish Cmt work plans; refine Board tools & processes.
5. <b>Implement compensation scheme for voting Board Directors.</b>	June. 2012	●●●○○	Implement or reject Board compensation scheme.
6. <b>Clarify distinction between PDP &amp; exec function issues.</b>	June. 2012	●●○○○	Post categorization & consultation needed prior to Board action; refine distinction if needed.
7.1 <b>Promptly post all appropriate Board materials re decision-making processes.</b>	Sept. 2011	COMPLETE	Regularly post detailed Board material.
7.2 <b>Publish rationale for Board decisions, include action on public/community input.</b>	June. 2011+	COMPLETE	Regularly post rationales for Board decisions.
8. <b>Publish redaction conditions.</b>	Mar. 2011	COMPLETE	Post & follow redaction conditions.
19. <b>Publish translated Board material within 21 days.</b>	Apr. 2011	COMPLETE	Timely posting of translated Board material and Bylaws
20. <b>Certify policy-making process inputs are considered by the Board.</b>	FY2012	●○○○	Create tools, processes to assure proper inputs.
23. <b>Get/act on independent experts' input on restructuring review mechanisms.</b>	June 2012 +	●○○○	Board action on report; Bylaws changed, if needed.
24. <b>Assess Ombudsman relationship and achieve international standards.</b>	TBD	●○○○	Post approved Ombudsman Framework, if changes needed.
25. <b>Clarify standard for Reconsideration requests.</b>	Mar 2012+	●○○○	Post clarification, if arising from work on 23.

26. Adopt standard timeline & format for Reconsideration Requests.	July 2011+	COMPLETE	Modify Reconsider. Req. page, add rationales, post template.
--	------------	----------	--

### GAC Operations, Engagement, Interaction with Board

9. Clarify what is GAC public policy "advice" under the Bylaws.	TBD	TBD	Post clarification of what constitutes GAC advice.
10. Create formal, documented process for requesting, tracking GAC advice.	TBD	TBD	Create public register of GAC advice & follow-up action.
11. Ensure timely provision/consideration of GAC advice & Board follow-up.	TBD	TBD	Formalize schedule & methods of Board-GAC interactions.
12, 13. Create/implement process to inform & engage GAC earlier in the policy process.	Dec. 2011 +	TBD	Execute agreed upon engagement plans.
14. Increase support & commitment of govts. to GAC process.	TBD	TBD	Execute agreed upon engagement plans.

### Public input & Multilingual Access

15. Implement stratified, prioritized public Notice & Comment processes.	Dec. 2011 +	●●●○○○	Post re-designed webpage & stratification components.
16. Provide Comment/Reply Comment cycles.	Dec. 2011 +	●●○	Implement new public comment structure.
17. Review/adjust fixed timelines for Notice & Comment.	Dec. 2011 +	●●○	Implement new public comment structure.
18. Ensure multilingual access in PDP to maximum extent feasible.	FY2012	●●○○○○	Issue Language Serv. Pol. & plan for multilingual website.
21. Create annual public comment forecast.	June. 2011	COMPLETE	Post forecast, develop process for compilation, maintenance.
22. Ensure senior staffing arrangements are appropriately multi-lingual.	June. 2011	COMPLETE	Update job postings; implement language training.

### Measuring Success

27. Evaluate/report annually on ATRT Recs., accountability, transparency.	June. 2012	●●○○○	Institute metrics, post dashboard, issue assessment.
---	------------	-------	--

[i] Estimated date of completion based on current, Board-approved Implementation Plan. Note that much of the work is ongoing.

[ii] Estimate of how far along we are measured by key milestones for each project (green circle indicates completed milestone, white circle indicates milestone to be completed); details on milestones are in the implementation summary/plans linked to ICANN's ["Accountability & Transparency webpage"](#)

[iii] Example of what constitutes completion. Items we will be able to point to when we say we're done.



# Overview

*Affirmation of Commitments' first community review assessed progress, suggested changes to maintain, improve mechanisms for public input, accountability, transparency.*

- Board accepted and called for implementation of Recommendations (research on Board Compensation Rec.)
- Board Committees were assigned implementation oversight; new Board group to coordinate with the GAC on Board/GAC improvements
- Board called for regular public reporting on implementation; asked for benchmarks, metrics



# Board Operations, Composition & Review of Decisions

- Board Governance Committee (BGC) lead - members assigned oversight of specific recommendations
- 5 Recommendations fully implemented, part of standard operating procedure
- Work underway on implementation of 10 Recommendations



# Board-related Recommendations Completed, in SOP

- 7.1 Detailed Board materials regularly posted
- 7.2 Regularly post rationales for Board decisions
- 8 Redaction conditions posted and followed
- 19 Timely posting of translated Board material & Bylaws
- 26 Reconsideration Requests webpage modified, includes rationales, template





# Work Progressing on Remaining Board-related Recommendations

- 1 a-b Mechanisms for identifying collective Board skill set.
- 2 Regularly reinforce & review training, skills building programs
- 3 Increase transparency of NomCom's deliberations & decision-making process.
- 4 Continue to enhance Board performance & work practices.



# Work Progressing on Remaining Board-related Recommendations

- 5 Implement compensation scheme for voting Board Directors
- 6 Clarify distinction between PDP & exec function issues
- 20 Certify policy-making process inputs are considered by Board
- 23 Get/act on independent experts' input on restructuring review mechanisms



# Work Progressing on Remaining Board-related Recommendations

24

Assess Ombudsman relationship and achieve international standards.

25

Clarify standard for Reconsideration requests



# GAC Operations, Engagement, Interaction with Board Recs.

- Board accepted Joint Working Group Report, will appoint working group to lead coordination with GAC to implement both reports
- Method for tracking GAC advice created for working group's consideration
- Additional funds, staff resources, interpretation services provided for GAC in

FY12



# GAC Operations, Engagement, Interaction with Board

- 9 Clarify what is GAC public policy “advice” under Bylaws
- 10 Create formal, documented process for requesting, tracking GAC advice
- 11 Ensure timely provision/consideration of GAC advice & Board follow-up
- 12,13 Create/implement process to inform & engage GAC earlier in policy process
- 14 Increase support/commitment of govts to GAC process





# Recommendations on Public Input and Multilingual Access

- Board Public Participation Committee guiding implementation
- 2 Recommendations fully implemented, part of standard operating procedure
- Work nearing completion on implementation of 3 Recommendations



# Public Input/Multilingual Recommendations Completed, in SOP

- 21 • Create annual public comment forecast
- 22 • Ensure senior staffing is appropriately multilingual



# Public Input and Multilingual Access

- 15
  - Implement stratified, prioritized public Notice & Comment process
- 16
  - Provide Comment/Reply Comment cycles
- 17
  - Review/adjust fixed timelines for Notice & Comment
- 18
  - Ensure multilingual access in PDP to maximum extent feasible

# Recommendation on Measuring Success

27

Evaluate/report annually on ATRT Recommendations, accountability, transparency

- March & June ATRT status report issued
- ATRT implementation plans, activities posted on [Accountability & Transparency Webpage](#).
- Additional outreach, solicitation of public feedback ongoing.
- Annual (FY) Report to be prepared.



# Upcoming Opportunities for Public Input

- Skill set identification and NomCom work
- Expert's Review Mechanisms report
- Board Compensation and Conflicts of Interest Policy
- Language Services Policy





# Board Operations, Composition & Review of Board Decisions

## Public discussion led by:

- Board Members Bruce Tonkin (BGC Chair), Bill Graham, Ray Plzak, Cherine Chalaby



1. a-d. Mechanisms for identifying, benchmarking collective Board skill sets; tailoring & consulting on skills; reviewing for each NomCom; posting outcomes/requirements..
2. Regularly reinforce & review training & skills building programs
3. Increase transparency of NomCom's deliberations & decision-making process.
4. Continue to enhance Board performance & work practices.
5. Implement compensation scheme for voting Board Directors.
6. Clarify distinction between PDP & exec function issues.
- 7.1 Promptly post all appropriate Board materials re decision-making processes
- 7.2 Publish rationale for Board decisions, include action on public/community input.
8. Publish redaction conditions.
19. Publish translated Board material within 21 days.
20. Certify policy-making process inputs are considered by the Board.
23. Get/act on independent experts' input on restructuring review mechanisms.
24. Assess/bring into compliance Ombudsman operations & Board relationship.
25. Clarify standard for Reconsideration requests.
26. Adopt standard timeline & format for Reconsideration Requests.



# GAC Operations, Engagement, Interaction with Board

## Public discussion led by:

- GAC Chair, Heather Dryden, and GAC Member, Manal Ismail



9. Clarify what is GAC public policy “advice” under the Bylaws.
10. Create formal, documented process for requesting, tracking GAC advice.
11. Ensure timely provision/consideration of GAC advice & Board follow-up.
- 12, 13. Create/implement process to inform & engage GAC earlier in the policy process.
14. Increase support & commitment of govts. to GAC process.



# Public Input and Multilingual Access

## Public discussion led by:

- Board Member & PPC Chair, Mike Silber





15. Implement stratified, prioritized public Notice & Comment processes.
16. Provide Comment/Reply Comment cycles.
17. Review/adjust fixed timelines for Notice & Comment.
18. Ensure multilingual access in PDP to maximum extent feasible.
21. Create annual public comment forecast.
22. Ensure senior staffing arrangements are appropriately multi-lingual.



# Measuring Success And Other Comments?

## Public discussion led by:

- Board Chair, Steve Crocker
  - 27 Evaluate/report annually on ATRT  
Recommendations, accountability, transparency



*Thank you*

