
DURBAN – AFRALO / AFRICANN Joint Meeting
Wednesday, July 17, 2013 – 14:00 to 15:30
ICANN – Durban, South Africa

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Hello, everyone I am going to be speaking French today. This is Fatimata speaking. Welcome to the AFRALO AFRICANN joint meeting. This meeting has by now become tradition and we have already helped eight to this day. Each time we consider at the community level what the problems they are, we try and discuss those issues that were mention and we suggest statement for ICANN. Today, after some questions that we have asked ourselves at the community level namely what happens with those statements and how they are treated we wanted the issue for this present meeting to be the follow up of the statements. We think this is an important issue for us to consider and to stop taking our current situation with all the statements we have issued so far. We have the honor today of having here with us Olivier Crépin-Leblond the Chair of the ALAC, we have Dr. Steven Crocker the chair of Board of ICANN and we also have Pierre Dandjinou, ICANN regional VP for Africa. We also have Mr. Fadi Chehade the current CEO of ICANN, without any ado given that we are already late; I am going to get the floor immediately to Olivier, who will make an introduction, Thank you. Olivier you have the floor.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Mrs. Chairwoman. I am going to speak in French for once which is not in my habit and it gets hard for me because at the end of the week of speaking in English it gets harder, but I hope the

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

interpreters will be able to help me. It is now the time to see all 8 statements I had just gone through them from AFRALO/ AFRICANN together. It is a great number of statements and it is many meetings at which the African communities has undertaken to make common statements and joint statements and these of course makes me very happy because when you see the first statement which was drafted so long ago already it was drafted on June 22nd, 2010 in Brussels. This first statement was a proposal to support new gTLD applicants from the African ICANN community that's how they were called at the time and I know whether that was already called AFRICANN but that was their first statement. After that when ICANN set up a system African Support for new gTLDs program, and I know that there has been many changes in ICANN and in fact I commend for those changes because the ICANN we have today is completely different from we had in Brussels in 2010.

Thanks to the arrival to our new CEO and of course to our new chairman here the Chair of the Board Mr. Steve Crocker, there have been many more things done for this community than we used to have this has a community which has to struggle for everything, for starters because nothing is easy in their environment in ICANN, where most of the initiatives are expensive and so they need to get funds and such funds are usually quite limited particularly as it is about helping those communities who have no other funds in order to come to ICANN meetings to meet and to participate at dialogues and current discussions. So, it is important I think that we support our community and it is important for ICANN to do so. So I am very happy to see that today thanks to all the different initiatives which were suggested by this

community in this very table at this very table in the last years these initiatives little by little started to be implemented.

We haven't got universal remedy yet or universal solution and answers to all the questions that this community has asked but clearly presently with this changes that we have seen throughout the last year I must say there have been great improvements at all levels. So I expect that with the continuity of the work that this community here does, such changes will go on. There is lots of work to do yet. Still a lot remains to be done, 8 statements have been drafted and who knows how many additional statements have been drafted, we should look outside ICANN and see how much knowledge people have about what we do around this table in this very halls and rooms with this community. Not enough people know about it yet we don't have enough support for community and for other communities. So I hope that your committee here around this table and those who weren't able to join us here because of the different issues they had. Thank you Tijani for helping me, I am having a hard time speaking French, but then in spite of all these problems I hope a machine can continue to work the engine keeps running, so that we can contribute to the enhancement of the participation of internet users of the African Region, who may I remind us so is a region with great distances.

It is a very big region and rural communities in Africa are usually quite isolated so there is still lot to be done here. The last communiqué, which was drafted in Beijing, was a statement, which in a way

supportive policy the policy that ICANN is considering right now. We heard them say so through Fadi Chehade's statements some days ago and it isn't only about seeing what we can do for ourselves. We must really have a global view what can we do for the entire continent for the Africa and for the rest of the world as well because this is a multi-stakeholder system, which is open and where everyone can join and participate and/or debates to our discussion and our issues so that we can together prepare policies, which will help the internet to grow and for the word population to have additional advantages thanks to the internet.

I do not know if I had expressed myself correctly here, but I think this synergy is a goal which should all have for the sake of transparency in not only the internet governance but also for global transparenance as regards to the distribution of resources and international polices and of course for the wellbeing. He is trying to find a word in French, the well being then, of people and humanity. I didn't want to say humanity because it is such a big word but clearly what you do here all of you is pioneer work and I know we never know which way we are going but with your help I am sure we will have a clear insight of the way so that millions of people can follow in this direction which I think is right one. So thank you for taking your time for coming to this meeting and discussing issues and trying to find solutions to problems which will probably take a weeks, months and maybe even years to solve but what's important is for them is to be solved.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Fatimata Seye Sylla speaking. Thank you Olivier for this wonderful introduction you have really managed to summarize our debate and then we will immediately give the floor over to Dr. Steve Crocker for his introduction.

STEVE CROCKER: I will be quite short because I know we are little behind schedule and I am supposed to speak a bit later and will be pressed for time. So I want to be helpful to all of us. Its real pleasure and honor actually to be here. I was listening to Olivier acknowledge the some of the hurdles some of the challenges. Africa is big, African doesn't have many resources as rest of the world perhaps it's a lot of help is needed. My focus is on the positive side the enormous warmth in Africa and the great amount of intelligence and skill that is all over the continent is best I can tell in the high sense of cooperation, whatever the problems may be the opportunities are larger and so I come here to listen and to learn and to absorb a sense of what the opportunities and of course to enjoy the enormous amount of warmth and good feeling that comes here. Later on I am listed to give a response to some of the things that we are going to hear shortly and I will be happy to do that so I am going to just suspend my comment here and look forward to responding bit later.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Fatimata speaking. Thank you Steve, for these encouraging words so as you said we will be looking forward to your answers to the questions later. As Pierre is not yet in I think Aziz is going to talk about the meetings, the declarations the statements.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you Fatimata. This is Aziz Hilali speaking. I am supposed to be speaking to you today and introducing a bit the state of affairs of the different statements that have come out of this AFRALO-AFRICANN joint meetings, which started as Olivier said in Brussels and the first statement which was drafted in Brussels then was just after the Nairobi meeting with the ICANN board had resolved, through its resolution #20 to create a networking group to develop and approach a support for those applicants who needed support in their application for new gTLDs. So the recommendations I am sorry but I have to go fast. I have to remind you that the recommendations, which were fixed at the different statements regarding the support were four so we have made four recommendations on the financial side we recommended that the application and ongoing fees be reduced and then in the linguistic domain we said that all the application documents the African guide book and other documents be translated in six UN languages.

In the legal field we said that applicants should be assisted in preparing their applications properly and then in the technical view point we said applicants should get help to define the infrastructure options and to address also the issue of the infrastructure problems in some African countries such as IPBC, internet connectivity, etc.

Now we are going to see what (inaudible 00:25:21) where we dealt with effective participation of the African community at ICANN activities and so in the second statement we asked for major awareness campaign to be carried out at local and regional levels and a capacity building program we thought was the best way to do that, and we also said that

we should ask for the support of other development agencies, the private sector and another potential **actors** to facilitate African participation to ICANN policy development processes, and then we asked the number of fellowships be increased for African regions, then at our San Francisco from March 2011 we dealt with the work that we had done and which is still ongoing on our region fighting for unity. Tijani will deal with this later on. In this statement we specify that we didn't want the African continent to be divided there was the matter of separating Northern Africa from Middle East and they were going to be united. So in our statement we unanimously asked for the African continent not to be divided as this would compromise our efforts to realize this is our objective and would not meet then the community approval.

So we recommended to keep the integrity of the African continent as such with all its countries as they were currently defined in geographic region called Africa. In Singapore, I remember that was where ICANNs board voted on the start of gTLDs and which chose to focus on what was going to happen in Dakar because that was the following meeting and we expected for a big African submit for developing countries to come and so we focused on our Dakar submit, where we then we stated that we welcomed and supported the initiative for sufficient help to be provided and we thought the summit could a means to make ICANNs agenda more solid on our continent, and that it could have ICANNs support for more inclusive internet and at the same time we called up on the public, the private sector in Africa to participate at that submit

actively, and so we made a list also without the different issues which we considered should be included in the said summit.

We're now then Dakar, at our Dakar meeting we felt it was very special because we focused on the dangers for end-users and what special then about that meeting was that our statement wasn't so much addressed at ICANN but more to all African actors and players. So we asked our operators our CCTLD operators from Africa to apply and to implement DNSSEC, which was very important for internet security and to encourage African countries who didn't have such certificates to proceed to the creation of such an entity, and we also recommended to African parents to control software and what materials their children access to and to all African internet users to work on software security in the country so that they could see what the latest alerts were, and then once again we made a list with the recommendations that were made that are minimum safety rules.

Then in March 2012, at our Costa Rica meeting our main theme was the final report. Tijani is going to speak about this later on, but so the adoption of this final report from the (inaudible 00:26:21) working group regarding the support for Africans new gTLDs who needed such support and the items we quoted in our statement concerned the ASP, the African Support Program which wasn't much deployed where the community might have been more interested in such a program. So we asked ICANN to organize events in such countries and for CEO's not to be able to attend. We didn't foresee particular implementation for

those applicants who most needed it and then we asked that the work be ready for the next batch and the next round so that there would be sufficient means for support.

Now, we asked for a fund to be created, which would be fed from the revenues from the new gTLD program for instance and then we underlined the fact that the participation of experts in the development of these assessment **period** and process without them we wouldn't support this inclusive model that ICANN tried to guarantee. The multi-stake-holder model, then in **front** we had first bidding process for the first round of application and so we said there was lack of interest. There were only 17 applications which were filed from Africa and most of which came from South Africa in fact. So our joined meeting there dealt with the reason for such low participation levels and we thought that this was mainly due to our communication issues and to the almost inexistent persons of the domain name industry and accredited registrars in the regions.

So, we proposed for ICANN to once again strengthen its communication policy in the region. So we asked for outreach activity, capacity building activities and so on to organized and for local ICANN actors to be engaged in the activities I just mentioned, and finally that we encouraged and facilitate the accreditation of new African registrars who used derogation if necessary and who could offer Africa the possibility of joining in this evolution and then we also made recommendations for the government. I asked you to please **wait** I am

going to skip this line, so that we can go faster, which finally brings us to Beijing.

At our Beijing joint meeting we dealt with a call for the creation of the development fund to help the developing countries, so we first highlighted the fact that ICANNs efforts over the last years on the internationalization of ICANN and its willingness to integrate developing countries. We also highlighted the commitment and the involvement and the willingness of the new direction of ICANN regarding Africa by setting up an African strategy, which Pierre was supposed to speak about but he is still not here and you see how we have here some bullet points with the different objectives, which represented the regions global interests in supporting then the creation of this fund and such bullet points as you see say the facility in accrediting mode registrars from Africa and from developing countries, organizing activities of information and communication. Promoting and supporting capacity building activities so that the industry is better understood and the support of the development of African based registries in technical marketing and communication aspects the organization and the creation of information sites which we encouraged and the adoption of the multi-stake-holder model by all structures of internet in Africa and sharing good practices and finally we said that we had to go on supporting Africa participation in developing countries at all meetings and all ICANN activities. Thank you.

(Inaudible 00:31:24)

Thank you very much Aziz, and Fatimata that for your presentation which was quite detailed. Have we any questions so far? And I am going to give the floor to Steve. I think he has followed, Aziz's is presentation. Olivia wants to ask a question, yes, go on.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you Madam Chairwoman, I just have a question with all these statements do you think that ICANNs response was adequate around these 8 statements which you just explained?

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

Thank you Olivia. This is Fatimata, do you want to take it. Okay I think that with the statements we had made there are some beginnings of results everywhere. We see that a good chair of all statements had been implemented where there are working groups created and I think it is already a good start we should have additional efforts of course but I would rather give the floor to Steve so that he can tell us what's being done, I cannot really answer for him. So, did anyone else want to take the floor before? Dr Lee No? Ok then, please you have the floor.

STEVE CROCKER:

Thank you, thank you Aziz, thank you Fatimata and Olivier. It's a bit of a challenge to respond to because there is a lot of material here and much is happening that I'm not familiar with in detail. As on the side I have my own sort of humorous measure of how big organizations are. In the very smallest organization nothing happens unless you make it happen yourself, in the next size up nothing happens that you are not absolutely involved in and it gets a little bigger but you still know what's

going on. When organizations get big enough not only you are not involved but you can't even find out what's going on. I don't think ICANN is quite that big but we are now certainly large enough that there are many things that go on and I feel a bit challenged to try to say everything.

So with that as a sort of weak apology let me tell you what I do know. In broad terms so a year ago exactly, Fadi was introduced to the ICANN community. He was not yet quite ready to start working full time that came in the middle of September but he did, even though he came to Prague, only to be introduced to say hello, he jumped right in, its quiet striking to watch, was not planned at all and he fully understood the need to engage with Africa. His very first focus of attention, his very first action was to formulate and bring together a set of people to help develop an African strategy, and you have all watched this and been part of it and frankly I would like very much to understand how you feel about that.

So that's one element. With respect to organization, a couple of things are intertwined, some of which are directly related and some which are (inaudible 00:35:50). You've heard the not only the plan but the forward motion of taking our headquarters function from Los Angeles, dividing it up into three hubs; one of which is in Istanbul and one of the reasons for choosing Istanbul was to provide a closeness to Africa as well as being able to serve Europe, that is in consideration of various places one might expect that we would have chosen an European capital Geneva,

Brussels, Paris perhaps, whatever but Istanbul has many positive attributes and one of the strongest ones is ability to be closer and more accessible to Africa as well as being able to serve Europe, and so that was an important part of that thought process and then we have Pierre. We don't have Pierre here today in the room. He is coming ok; I'm being a little bit silly. Pierre, an extraordinarily good guy I have known him for several years and a real strong addition to our staff and I understand that there are positions available to be filled that he is trying to fill to expand his team to provide a lot more access and interaction on the continent. In terms of specific programs, one of the things one of the themes that is mentioned several times in these 8 different statements is DNSSEC this is a topic that is very close to my heart.

I see **(inaudible 00:37:52)** over here always enjoy that he single handedly put Namibia on the map in Africa as the first country to have DNSSEC signing the Namibian top level domain and but the map is getting filled in, there is quite some distance to go but we are no longer at very beginning and I gave a little talk this morning as I usually do on Wednesday mornings at the DNSSEC session and we keep track up the status of top level domain implementation around the world and after I gave the talk somebody sent me a note saying "well here is some stuff you don't know about, but in these places in Africa there is forward motion" and I said "okay we will update our maps right away and that's not uncommon when I give a talk somebody says "yeah, but you missed us", so it is sort of acts as a provocation to get more information otherwise the DNSSEC road show with Rick Lamb and others from ICANN and other organizations that are providing quite a bit of

assistance and other organizations. The note that I mentioned that I got was from Andre (inaudible 00:39:15) Republic so I don't know if everything that can be done about DNSSEC has been done, but I know that quite a bit its very positive and if anybody has specific requests and isn't getting enough help communicate somehow and we'll figure out how to be helpful there.

A number of the points in the communities all the way through from the first to the current spoke about the gTLD program, which is quite natural from the early ones that requested assistance to the later ones that said "Gee, not enough people applied or we haven't had enough attention in this the outreach program has been weak, and we need to plan for the second round". So, we did make limited attempt, I remember at the time when the board was discussing the idea of validating 2 million dollars that number felt that was useful step but it was far less than what would be necessary to make a significant difference. Let me speak quite frankly about this because I think in the frankness there will be possibility of making either forward progress or adjusting expectations to match what the actual facts are. The application fee of \$185000 is an awful lot of money; it is a very small amount of money compared to the total amount of money that it takes actually create a brand new top level domain.

So, in providing support and reduction of the fee even though it was a significant portion of the application fee it was almost incidental portion of what the actual cost would be of creating a new top level domain and

then there were suggestions that some of the requirements for how to operate a top level domain should be loosened to make it possible for more people to come and we did not want to go down that path because it's one thing to provide a certain amount of financial support its quite a different matter to create a situation, which is going to lead to trouble. There is a reason for the way those requirements are structured. They are intended to prevent future problems and just making it easier to get into the business doesn't make it easier to run the business or to survive and so I think one would have to take a closer look at what the objective is.

I think there's no question at all about the desire to be supportive of the domain name industry if you are in Africa. The fact that there are very few registrars is an important statistic it says quite a lot and it's indicative of the state of **maturity** now there are those are ICANN credited registrars that we are talking about. There are clearly local registrars associated with the local CCTLDs and that probably is another important picture to keep in mind. One of the things I worry about that about ICANN is the natural tendency to be inwardly focused on our contracts with the gTLDs and the accredited registrars and as I have said many times including last night's tenth anniversary celebration of the CCNSO I think the CCTLD community has the genetic diversity, it has the richness, it has the entrepreneurial spirit, the ability to solve problems locally and a source of great wisdom that we need to pay attention to, so I like to see a very strong CC community.

One thing that was very evident to me painfully as I listened to these 8 communiqués over time is the question is to whether we have been paying attention not just when it was issued but also tracking overtime whether we sort of absorbed each of the points, understood them and even if we don't do anything to know that we don't do anything and to do that as a decisively as rather than passive that way that we actually made a decision not to do anything and we don't lose track of things. It has been frankly a frustration of mine and the time I have been chair, which now surprises me but it has been a full two years but it's been very turbulent two years. We have made extraordinary progress but it has taken quite a toll. It's taken a lot of energy in the year from prior to Prague from Singapore to Prague in mid-2011 to mid-2012 was the period when **Rod Beckstrum's** last year he announced in mid-August that he wasn't seeking time past the end of his contract. The board was fully engaged in recruiting process, which was very extensive. We had a public meeting in Dakar, you may recall. I don't want to beleaguer it, but its not much of an excuse but it is bit an explanation of where the focus of attention was and also it meant that not everything was functioning perfectly. A year ago we introduced Fadi, and it has been a breath taking but very busy and very turbulent period as he has come on board as he reorganized as he put new systems in place, and really put a lot of energy into the management.

It's been a total pleasure to work with him but it is also has meant that some things that I had really strongly wanted to put in place at the very beginning of my time as chair I had to hold back on and wait for the time. That time has come and not just this minute but a couple of

months ago I made internal you know personal decision about that we had held back on building the board processes and support processes and that it was time to actually bring that up to date and one element of that is the interacting with the supporting organizations with the advisory committees with all parts of the community and handling advice in whatever form it comes. There's an awful lot of attention on GAC advice because of the formality and the way the (inaudible 00:47:13) written, but in truth we absolutely must listen to and pay attention to and respond and give weight to treat as important advice from each of the groups and not put one in a supreme position over any other that would be in contradiction to the multi-stake-holder model and in particular, the self-organization the bottoms up cohesiveness that comes from a group like AFRALO is the highest form of input that we could hope for. I don't want to be dismissive governments but they're organized, and you call a meeting of all the governments, and they send their people and so on and so forth. They spend 100% of the time being organized and (inaudible 00:48:15) the organic nature of group like this that is where the fervor, the real energy comes from and indeed is strongly connected to the original origins of the internet, which was very much a bottoms up community driven process.

The whole notion of the internet was to have possible or separately constructed networks to interacted each other with each one having to be administered by some supreme group and having had the privilege of being involved in the **openade** at the very beginning it was the kids, the students, who did most of the work and put the pieces together and infected in a positive sense each other across the community and built

the organizations, the internet engineering task force and the subsequent organizations.

So what I am trying to convey is that AFRALO is in the top tier of organizations that we need to pay attention to and I have a sense from listening to this and guessing that it doesn't feel that way and so one of the objectives in addition to each of the specifics that you have listed and all the tracking that I would like to do is we need to reach a state in which we not only treat the things that you say with proper amount of attention and forward progress, but that it becomes clear that's where things are in our value system that you are valued and that your desires and your aspirations and your advice are valued and nothing is a one way street equally that you are actively engaged in making all of this happen and so that's as much of a response I can give you in the setting at this time. The real important things are not only these kinds of interactions but also continuity and follow through and I made some notes and I have said already a few times during this week that I am committed to improving the tracking process and in that tracking process it's not only can we keep track, but you can see that things are being track of and to build that. So I call on you to hold us to account and to be helpful in constructive way. Some of its mechanics and so far we just need to bolster that and to build a system that is facile and effective. Thank you.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

Fatimata speaking. Thank you very much Steve I think this is, I mean, I feel very happy hearing all this and I think it's very encouraging for us

because we worked hard to create these statements and it feels good to listen to your declarations right now, and I think at some point we still have something to do to show you what we still expect from you regarding these declarations. What has been done what needs to be done and then come back to you? Thank you very much Steve. I know that you have to leave.

STEVE CROCKER:

Yeah, I do apologize I am sure that the rest of the meeting will be very full of lot of content and very important I look for reports from any of you, from Pierre, from you, from others and its sort of a requirement of the position Im in, I mean stay too long here and don't do it. It looks nice from the outside but it's just a lot of work so with that I apologize and excuse.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

Thank you. (clapping) So now we have our VP Pierre, and he's in a hurry too. Pierre Dandjinou is Vice president of ICANN AFARALO, here was supposed to talk to us about the ICANN Africa strategy. So we have few minutes to....**(speaking in French)**

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you very much I apologize for this delay. I had to participate to an urgent meeting with Fadi and other persons so I wasn't able to change my schedule so I am sorry. Okay, so I am going to speak French. Now I am going to speak very quickly because there is another session starting in a few minutes and now I want to speak about the African strategy and I think you were participating in the session of Monday and

Monday afternoon we spoke about this strategy and we also gave some rewards.

It was the first time for Africa, there is a brochure circulated and for those who didn't see it I will leave that brochure here so you can see this strategy and what we want to do about that. Now, I just wanted to tell you that what is important for us is to have an action plan and an action plan that will have some priority projects as the African people ask for and that was showed in the strategy document and it's very important. I think we have to think that here what is important is the capacity building for Africa. Capacity building in a lot of questions, in a lot of topics, what is clear in ICANN engagement is that we want to build an African market this is about that. This document was very clear there is no African market with African people and we need to build one. We have only 5-6 registrars and they are losing money today, so we have some CCTLDs in Africa and they are all working with a difficult management that we can't improve.

They don't offer an online access. They don't offer easy way to pay for example so we have to organize those issues something that I have seen when I have arrived in ICANN that there are a lot of delegations and **redelegation** as for those countries and here I have participated with some meetings with people from those country saying that they have problems with redelegation its very long with ICANN to work with ICANN why a country manage our CCTLD so those problems I can see that those problems are very serious here in Africa. So when we have

ministers saying that we decide to manage our CCTLD and when you have to explain that they can't work like that they have to manage that issue with ICANN it's not so simple. So we need everybody's support and your support is very important. I want to recognize with the help of this group because you are and you will still be the voice of the African path and we need also the (inaudible 00:57:22) that you can do you can able to do I was very happy when I discussed about that with my colleagues from Africa.

I do lot of teleconferences and I tried to work with you to find the time to work with you because I know it is very important. So here the important point is the budget that ICANN is going to give us, but it's not the most important. The most important is how to mobilize our partnership at the international level and at the national level also. The engagement of all the people is very important it must be the project of a few people. We must know, we must learn how to work together. This is what interests me, so please tell me which ideas you have to work together. Our action plan for June 2013, we want to do for example a structure. What is the domain name today in Africa and how would does it work? Today we are speaking a lot but we have no data, we have no information on that question, on that topic. We don't have and system to observe the domain name in Africa. On Monday on the GNS forum we spoke about and we saw what Europe and Latin America presented very clear data.

In Africa we have no data if we say that we have 800,000 registrants well we are not sure about that number. So we need a serious study about that and there is project that will go on for DNSSEC. We are going to work with 16 countries. There is also the engagement with policy parties and we are working to enroll more staff. We need, two managers working with me that will allow me to work on that to go on working on those issues that are very important issues for ICANN. ICANN want to have an important to play an important role in those issues so ICANN want to be acting in the internet governance. So those are the things about which we want to speak and debate, and we want to work with you and we need your support to work on that I am not working.

I can't speak about the details but I wanted to tell you that we have an important activity the one, the first one we are going to launch with ICANN we have invited young entrepreneurs and we have a meeting in the 1A room. We have an entrepreneur from here who made very important things for Africa, so these young people are going to speak about what they do and we are going to reflect on the way to develop their work on basis of their ideas how we can solve some prevalence they have so we are going to debate about that. There are a few other things but please come in the hall 1A to participate to this meeting with young entrepreneurs.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

Thank you Pierre. Fatimata speaking. We know that we have an agenda with a lot of activities, so thank you for your presence with us and about

the strategy we can't keep Pierre with us too long because he has another activity, which already started so Pierre left us some brochures, and after this meeting we are going to join him in other room and afterwards we will be able to ask him questions we want to ask online or face to face as you want. Thank you Heidi, are you here. Okay, I would like attendees here to go back for like 5 minutes and I would like Tijani to chair the meeting, while I will be out with them for few minutes to meet Fadi. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you Fatimata. Okay, well know I like to ask you if you have some comment, if you want to have the floor.

(inaudible 01:03:04) I found it very rude on the part of the African VP, to come late and to leave early.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, you know that he is organizing the meeting now and perhaps that's why I don't know what is the problem for him but me.

(inaudible 01:03:10) It shows the respect that this working group gets.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: He is sharing a panel.

(inaudible 01:03:16)

It shows the respect that this working group gets coming late going early.

MATT ASHTIANI:

Okay. Hi this Matt Ashtiani from the record. Please remember to state your name before speaking and please remember to speak slowly and clearly.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay. Understood. Yeah, now we are moving to the next item of our agenda. Well I like to tell you how our statements had impact. It was not a lost time we didn't lose our time. There was an impact with those statements and I am going to tell you with two examples. First **gTLD** program and the support to the gTLD that we are needing some support. The board had a lot of work. Steve told us and we all know that we already tried to send the statements to the board and to the secretariat and to the members of the board also. So the impact of all that is that those who read the statements are not about people but they can reflect on our programs they can know our problem and some of them come back and told me "okay you may be right and we are going to think about that", but it's true that our statement were not taken into account in an official way by the board, but it had some impact on the members of the board and for the support program at the beginning when we began or when we start working with the **GAC** group there was some opposition, some objection from the members of the board.

They didn't want to reduce the fees for the applicant, and I was working in the **GAC** group I tried my colleagues to convince the group to ask for reduction for those fees for the application because for the people who needed those reductions. So our statement was presented to the board and those of the members of the board who had read that statement came to speak with me about that issue and finally the board decided to reduce the applicants fees for some cases for people who need support so the impact was real. We are not the only one who made those kinds of statements but the influence of our statements in the **GAC** group was also important. I am a member of this group and this statement was discussed and had lot of impact in the decision of the **GAC** group. So this is about the support to the applicants who need some support gTLDs applicant.

The second issue has a strong impact in which our statement had an impact was the one about geographical region. AFRALO was the first group to recheck the statement of the working group because we decided that it was wrong, totally wrong and that it was going to distract some regions without any meaning as well, Aziz got a mistake. African region was not affected as he said there were no changes for Africa region in the proposal of the working group, the working group wanted to use the system proposed or recommended by the internet registries for the geographical regions. (inaudible 00:08:01) is region was not affected but we rejected this way of dividing this division of the region and AFRALO this position was presented to the board and the members of the board read this statement and I think it didn't change their point of view but it had some impact on their decision.

They didn't have to take a decision on that issue but the way the working group spoke and worked during the first comments, the second comments all that had an impact and I think our statement was really heard. We didn't lose our time. So what I want to tell you is that the board didn't officially take into account our statements that's important. Now, I don't know if you have any comments, anybody want to have the floor. No comment. Okay, everybody is satisfied with what I said. Okay next item is a discussion. What do you think about what we said? I want to remind you that we wanted to discuss that issue today because a lot of people, some people in this group thought that we were losing our time, that those statements had no value at all and also that when we consult during the meeting, when we consult the people are asking which topic do you wanted to discuss. Some people asked us to come back on the statements, on the past statements to see the impact those statements had on ICANN and this is the reason why we choose that item. So, if you have some **success** some comments, some recommendations to tell us how do you want to go on from now on. Yes you have the floor.

BEN FILLER:

Dr. Ben Filler, I am from (inaudible 01:10:48) to say, I think it is obscene that the VP for African affairs and the chair of this session have actually walked out. This is really upsetting to me. I wanted to make two points about generally with regard to various statements in the activities of this group. The two points focus on participation of Africa into the internet. The first, I see too much focus in the discussions here on creating on the gTLDs and creating African accredited registrars that's very nice but its missing I think a larger and more beneficial part of half

of the coin, which is how do we focus on startups? How do we focus on getting the small SMES that are going to do the domain name registration for us. How do we focus on an easing their way into the market?

I think that is very important for us to start talking about because it's just not the big guys, the big guys are already organized. How do we get the new and emerging people organized as we know there is an African middle class that is booming, Africa roughly 50% of the continent is under the age of 30. These are people who are entering the market and we need to start thinking about how we deal with them. The second point is Africa is actually showing us a new way to get involved in the internet, okay. As I gave a talk the other day the tech day about some of the things we are doing in Namibia. Namibia is one of the most sparsely populated countries on the planet, population of less in 2 per square kilometer of Africa. We have some of the most remote parts of Africa, yet we have 96 cell phone accounts per 100 Namibians. We have incredible penetration both in the market and the network covers 95% of our population. Namibia by the way is twice the size of California, and has 2.2. million people. I won't finish that quote, a famous I don't remember the name but there is not a lot of **there** in Namibia I think is the, I remember the name of the quote, an American artist who lived in Paris if remember correctly. So what we are thinking about is in Namibia is what is the mobile revolution doing to our access/Africa's access to internet and some other things we have thinking about is the standard when we talk is as ICANN, the standard ICANN model is registered, registrar someone gets a domain name and puts up a website.

That's the way we think, it's something that worth for us a longtime. Invariably young Namibians, and I imagine young Africans all across the country are not much difference invariably all of the people we have under 30, who have mobile phones their access to the internet is through face book. They are bypassing our traditional model and I think we have to think about some of the impacts upon that. I know a number of young entrepreneurs, some of them my niece and nephews extended family who when they started business they don't go looking for the domain name and a website. They put up a face book page and I think we have to start thinking about in this group because this is where it is happening to us here in Africa. How do we start engaging as people who do DNS and domain name system, domain names how do we engage with them, so that we can eventually encapture and enhance and work better together with that new emerging (inaudible 01:15:20) of internet users okay. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much Dr. Lee. For the record, he is a real doctor, he has a PhD, and he is the Dean of the faculty of sustainable development at the University of Namibia so you might want to listen to him, but again as I said how many people are sitting here, where are the decision makers? They come early, they go late. They come late, they go early. Session chair has left, the CEO is late, its Chair, I maybe wrong, but the chair of the board has basically said he took 20 minutes to not answer your questions. I may be wrong but he spoke something that we didn't ask him. He did it very nicely but let's probably and I maybe wrong he is the chair of the board. This group his statements do not achieve

anything. I have no answer to what to do to achieve something but basically he basically told us we don't even read these things.

I don't know what happened because it has never come to my attention. He didn't even say we should read them, he says we haven't read them so far and then he left, to now delude ourselves and say that they lead ourselves and say I don't think that he should do that. Look at this, how many people are sitting here.

Sorry for the record Dr. Lee.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Dr. Lee. There is very few people are around the table you are right that the Chair of the meeting left. You are right that Pierre came late, and left but this is not a sign of negligence moment. Let me speak, please. I don't think it is a sign of negligence. I know what is behind everything. Fatimata left because Fadi is waiting for her. It came at the last minute, so we are sorry for that but we can't do anything against. Pierre, he has his work, I will not say anything about him, he is responsible, he can say he can apologize, he can do what he wants, but Fatima I know we were here. We are prepared for this meeting you remember very well that we did 8 meetings like this and she never left. It is not a sign of if you want bad behavior. Yes I will give you floor please. So, I prefer not to what said your colleague is very important and I am really proud of that, and I agree with him full. I will ask you a question Dr. Lee. They didn't read our statements, shall we

give up? I don't think so, I am the one who is always trying even if we don't reach what we want now we have to try, and he said something very important Steve. He said we had turbulence before and now I am organizing in the board so that the procedure will be better and he said you are the group that we have to pay attention to. He said that so I think that it is positive it is not absolutely negative, this is what I wanted to say if so, please Doctor.

Dr. LEE:

My point is not that I want to criticize people who are not there. My point is that this is symptomatic and I maybe wrong it is symptomatic for the assessment that this group gets. Yeah Wednesday afternoon 2 O'clock 1 hour finish and done. We are deluding ourselves if we believe that we have any impact. We don't and I think we must come up with something else. The statements don't work, so we must find some methods that work. That's my point I want to make.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Please propose.

Dr. LEE:

Sorry that's good, rhetorical part from rhetoric's one-on-one deflecting argument by countering it with what you proposed. I don't know what I proposed. I only say what we did so far didn't work.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Okay, thank you. Titi?

TITI: Titi for the transcript records. I just wanted to come back to the issue of people having to literally chase their tales around in meetings. It's what happens at ICANN. If you look at today's **shuttle** two important sessions are not back to back really integrated to each other. So I think we need to be able to factor that in when you see people getting up and leaving. Two, the fact that what we are doing in terms of statements are making an impact or not. I think one of the things that I learnt early on is the fact that you speak you write it might look like I am making no impact but consistency pays up. Yes, it really does and as much as we might not see as much impact as we would like to do immediately and there is a continuous perception that we are not able to create as much change as we want to, if you are confident at what you do you know the content of what you are producing is excellent, yes but in all fairness Dr. Lee is saying, we need to explore about how we can engage people more and I think that is something that we are conscious off as African ICANN community and hopefully we are not discouraged particularly for those who are attending this first time, this kind of conversations we will go on. We just have to learn to deal it and make an impact as much as you can. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, and back to you Fatimata.

(inaudible 01:22:12): Just quickly I don't want to monopolize this but if this Crocker has interest in DNSSEC he is there for as long as it takes. So they have a huge budget, they have a meeting team, there is nothing wrong with scheduling meetings that people can spend, arrive on time, spend in

time listen to what is being said, and not just grace us with their presence for 2 minutes. It's a indication that they don't take us serious and it think it's wrong if we accept this if we let him get away with it, I am fighting with somebody who just arrived [rap session (01:22:38)] but my point is this is indication that we do our things, they come for 5 minutes flitter and flitter out nothing else, and after 8 of these statements nothing happens, it's time to change to do something that works. I personally am in a position to say that I have done few things and whatever I have done has worked, and I didn't do it with 8 statements.

TITI:

For the transcript record, I agree with what you said in terms of it shows a level of disrespect if they are only able to give 5 minutes of their time, but in recognition of the many roles that needs to be played, I think we have to factor that in, without saying the same things over and over again I think particularly and please permit me to share a bit of my background prior to coming into ICANN. I joined the entire conversation around on the internet policy based on the (inaudible 01:23:41) here and for the longest tie it was just an issue of a side conversation what persistence pays off, and I am saying this as one of this young people looking into bring into more of the conversations around ICANN and I do agree if it really is important they will spend more time but the fact that they are beginning to show up, I think is progress in the last three years.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you Titi. Fatimata back to you.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you Tljani. So we have now our president and CEO Fadi, who will talk about our theme today, which is how we treat the statements AFRALO and African prepared for each meeting and we have today like 8 of them. We had some answers from Steve, and we would just like to know what he thinks about all these and we know that things are moving with the Africa strategy and would like to know what he thinks about it.

FADI CHEHADE: Thank you Ms. Chairwoman. Thank you for welcoming me for your council. I know this is complex work and inviting people in and out is always complicated so I appreciate some of the frustration. If I could finish please, yeah so I would like to say that my Chairman came to me on Sunday night and he said “I am going to speak tomorrow morning at the opening of the ICANN ceremony and I would like to introduce something new”. I said “what you have in mind Steve” he is the chairman he is the boss so listen to me, he says I would like to introduce something cold empathy, I said “Steve this is not your place this is an emotional concept why are we talking about empathy?”. We are here to make policy and get the internet to run in secure and resilient way. He said because that’s why many of us who started the internet if you knew (inaudible 01:26:18) many of them went to high school together, these guys days, he said we built it great oneness to create unity in the world to make people one. There is no policy or statement in the world that’s worth dividing and what divides is not part of the community what divides should be cast out. This is about unity. The internet was built to build unity in the world that’s why ICANN motto is one internet one world and this is the principle that my Chairman meant when he

said yes efficient and he knows efficient. He is an engineer's engineer, he said yes effective because he is a very capable and effective manager but he said also the third E is empathy.

All my ancestors came from Africa, my father and mother was born in Africa, my father was lived many years in 40 and 50s in Addis Ababa, my brothers were all born in Africa, I am a very proud African not because of anything other than the African spirit. I wake up every morning and I thank God that my parents left me with that African spirit. This is the spirit of unity that despite our differences we remain one Africa shows us that today so please I urge just all North Africa, South Africa, East, West anywhere even the islands Mauritius and (inaudible 01:28:17) we are one network when it comes at ICANN we are one. Your statements are extremely important. I must tell you I've only read I must admit and I am glad you gave me this package, this is now of extreme value to me because I have only read last one.

I have joined the ICANN in Prague and for those you don't remember in Prague as I mentioned before I was pulled into my first meeting, my first meeting, I still remember till now and there are many of you are sitting around the table and It was a sad meeting, it was a lot of dysfunction and there was a lot of people saying what is going on? ICANN is not doing anything right for us in Africa and as an African you know that I was moved and I even had tears in my eyes because I felt that here is my first meeting at ICANN with my fellow Africans and it feels like we are not one, and it feels like we as a community have failed Africa, and I

made some decisions immediately that we should move and people then leaned on me and one person told me I am sorry to inform you but you are not a CEO for another 3 months you can't make these decisions.

I said I don't care whoever it is this they should do this and we did in the new season in the new spirit of Africa we need to take your statement seriously. You need to hold your board members and me accountable for these things I would like you to put on the top of this document a score card that says we asked you for A,B,C,D, on this date. when are you going to respond what is the action and demand that when you start your next meeting in reference indifference to your point about commitment there will be a response on the scorecard from the board and the staff. If you don't get that then you tell them you are going to protest and not show up. This is efficiency. This is effectiveness, and that's what I invite you to do but before I leave I remind us all we do it with empathy because this youth that I just met and the world is watching us and if we do not live by these standards of oneness, frankly the rest doesn't matter because people want to divide the internet, want to divide us. It's (inaudible 00:31:06) upon us to show them we will not be divided we may disagree and we will fight and being upset is okay, so long as we do it gracefully and graciously but we stay one.

So please I want the score card done and I encourage my staff to help, I don't encourage my staff, I ask my staff to help, I want to see score card and I don't want you ever to be in a position of thinking do people listen to my statements? Of course, if we don't listen to your statement what

are we doing? Making our own statements? This is for you that you are here when I am to service and we need to show that with our actions. “Our actions express our priorities” Mahatma Gandhi said, not our words at ICANN meetings 200 sessions full of words. We need the actions, please demand us and I will support it and if I will don’t do it take me to task.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you very much. This is Fatimata again. I think now the ball is on our side. Yeah, yes go ahead.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you Fatimata, this is Olivier Crépin-Leblond from the transcript. Well you have heard it and you heard nearly and drive it and I really hoped that you don’t get disheartened by your statements not being read or listened to the ALAC for many years has not had statements read or listened to, but we struck at it for so long and things are changing. They might be changing very slowly but they are changing in that because we preserve, we push, we try again. I really think that in the new spirit of what’s going on the ICANN today with time we will be listened to and we as in not in the ALAC I guess as in my way but also the community here certainly of the statements that are released I have seen lot of the recent events taking place appearing to follow this, so I don’t think that it is 100% true that these statements are not read. They might not be read by the chair, they might not be read by specific people but trust me, some people read this and even if it inspires them to move forward with something at least that’s the seed that gets the plant and the tree to grow and that really needs to be continued

forward, so water that plants and plant new seeds as well and make a forest that you are going to build.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA:

Thank you very much Olivier. This is Fatimata. I thank you and I think we will almost at the end of our session here unless someone wants to make a comment. We are then going to close the meeting, I think it was a very important meeting because it was very important to ask ourselves what happens to our statements, unfortunately we had agreement here tonight whether it was because of what Steve said or from Fadi's words, we were all assured that it is true that perhaps they have not followed out statements the way that wanted them to but that in any event the ball was in their field and it was up to us to run the statement and to do the follow up for what we had asked for, and so now it is up to us to act.

We are going to work on the score card, we are going to prepare it and I would like to ask the staff to write this on the agenda for the next meeting, by then we would have has worked on this score card, so we can move forward. I would then like to invite all our local AFARALO, ALSS to participate including the new people who are here in the room of course who can participate at the AFRALOs meetings. We hold open meetings where everyone can join so that you get knowledge of the discussions we had every month. Aziz, why don't you take the floor as he is speaking I just wanted to suggest that we vote on volunteers to work between today and Buenos Aires so that we start on working on the next meeting. Thank you very much says Fatimata Seye Sylla.

Thank you all, but before that I would like to apologize before everyone I had to leave for a moment because Fadi needed to meet these youngsters who have come to see us at the ICANN meeting for the first time. It was important to us and to them. It was a big thing and we have done it. I hope you didn't see it as a bad thing; we apologize you and we thank you and so until next time please do suggest issues for statements. Thank you and good bye, and I would like to thank the interpreters, Oliviere and the staff. Good bye.

[END OF AUDIO]