Wildcards Study Group Report

37th ICANN ccNSO meeting
Nairobi
March 9, 2010

Ondrej Filip
Young-eum Lee
(co-chairs)
Content

• SG Overview
• Scope of the SG
• Actions so Far
• Notable SSAC Documents
• Wildcarding cc’s Results Pages
• Timeline
SG Overview

- Created by ccNSO council during ICANN Seoul meeting (Oct. 2009)

- Members
  - Wali Berjasta, .af
  - Keith Davidson, .nz
  - Joel Disini, .ph
  - Keith Drazek, .us
  - Afaf El Maayati, .ma
  - Khaled Esheh, .ly
  - Ondrej Filip, .cz (co-Chair)
  - Patrick Hosein, .tt
  - Erick Iriarte, LACTLD (observer)
  - Young-Eum Lee, .kr (co-Chair)
  - Rungang Mo, .cn
  - Kathryn Reynolds, .ca
  - Yoshiro Yoneya, .jp

- ICANN Support Staff:
  - Bart Boswinkel
  - Kristina Nordström
  - Gabriella Schittek
Scope of the SG

1. Summarize the issues associated with "redirection" as identified by SSAC in its reports

2. Liaise with SSAC to seek further clarification and input if considered needed and appropriate by the group

3. Liaise with the ccTLDs who are currently using "redirection" to solicit their views and perspectives on "redirection"

4. Prepare a session at a ccNSO meeting either at the ICANN meeting in Nairobi or Brussels to present and discuss the results of the study to the ccTLD community.

5. Provide a final report of its findings to the ccNSO council
Actions so far

- Scope of SG defined
- Members decided
- Reviewed SSAC documents
- Email to cc’s requesting information
- Informational session in Nairobi
SSAC Documents on cc Redirection

• SAC041: Recommendation to prohibit use of redirection and synthesized responses by new TLDs (10 June, 2009)
  – Advises ICANN to take all available steps to prohibit redirection
  – Recommends ICANN communicate dangers
  – ICANN Board resolution during Sydney meeting June, 2009

• SSAC Presentation to the ccNSO (28 Oct, 2009)
  – Architectural violation
  – Impact on Internet protocols
  – Single point of failure
  – Reserved and blocked domains ‘appearing’ alive
  – Privacy concerns
  – Lack of choice for Internet users
  – Poor user experience
  – Impact on IDN TLDs
Harms of NXDOMAIN Substitution

- Nov. 2009, ICANN Staff document
- Harms Listed
  1. Architectural implications
  2. Impact on Internet protocols
  3. Single point of failure
  4. Reserved and blocked domains appear alive
  5. Fragmentation of the DNS ecosystem
  6. Privacy concerns
  7. Lack of choice for Internet users
  8. Poor user experience (e-mail)
  9. Use of privileged position
## List of Redirection Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SSAC List</th>
<th>ICANN Staff List</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Architectural violation</td>
<td>Architectural implications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact on Internet protocols</td>
<td>Impact on Internet protocols</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single point of failure</td>
<td>Single point of failure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reserved and blocked domains ‘appearing’ alive</td>
<td>Reserved and blocked domains appear alive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Privacy concerns</td>
<td>Fragmentation of the DNS ecosystem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of choice for Internet users</td>
<td>Privacy concerns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor user experience</td>
<td>Lack of choice for Internet users</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact on IDN TLDs</td>
<td>Poor user experience (e-mail)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Use of privileged position</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
SAC Documents on Redirection

- SAC006: Redirection in the COM and NET domains (9 July, 2004)
  - Found that redirection had adverse effects
  - Disrupted existing services such as e-mail and spam filters

  - Tralliance request for redirecting service evaluated by Registry Services Technical Evaluation Panel in November, 2006
  - Risk on adverse effects for security and stability

  - Result of a study in 2007 investigating the unintended consequences of a growing error resolution market
  - Demonstrated vulnerabilities in web applications running at redirection sites could be exploited to the harm of domain registrants
cc’s using Wildcards

1. CG : Congo
2. KR : Korea
3. NU : Niue
4. PH : Philippines
5. PW : Palau
6. RW : Rwanda
7. ST : Sao Tome and Principe
8. TK : Tokelau
9. VG : Virgin Islands
10. VN : Viet Nam
11. WS : Samoa
NIC - Network Information Center

Domain Name Registration in the .RW and .CG top-level domains
.RW - Republic of Rwanda
.CG - Republic of the Congo

NIC provides domain name registration ending by .RW and .CG. In order to register a domain name (domain sub-delegation) ending by .RW or .CG, you can submit your request on this site.

The aim of NIC is to provide one free domain registration for the citizens of Rwanda and Congo, with some conditions.

It is possible however for foreigners to register domain names, but different regulations and pricing are applicable.

When you request a domain sub-delegation with NIC, when you make use of a domain ending by .RW and .CG or when you make use of this site, you accept all the terms and conditions of NIC that may vary from time to time.

Procedures

- Domain creation
- Domain modification
- Payment of domains

Documents

- Policy, terms and conditions of NIC
- One free domain for citizens/residents of Rwanda and Congo - Price for non-residents

Database

- Search for an existing domain name (WHOIS)
레이저를 표시할 수 없습니다.

검색할 메시지는 현재 사용할 수 없습니다. 웹 사이트에 관련된 문서가 있거나 보안상의 필요를 변경해야 합니다.

다음은 체크요청

- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기
- [ ] 시스템 정보 확인하기

네트워크 설정을 확인하면 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램 클릭에서 설정을 클릭하시십시오. 설정을 변경할 수 있는 메뉴가 나타날 것입니다. 엔터넷 응용 프로그램 설정 변경 대화상자에서 설정을 변경하시오

- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.
- [ ] 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 엔터넷 응용 프로그램을 클릭하시십시오.

네트워크 설정을 확인하면 웹 사이트에 다른 링크를 시도하십시오.
This domain name, "aoweirufjdweoiruhdkvwo.NU", may still be available for registration!

You have arrived at this page because the domain name you entered is not currently active on the Internet. If you have recently registered or modified this domain name, you can expect it to become active within the next 24 hours.
aoweirufjdweoiruhdvkwo.PH : Philippines

Get the Perfect Domain in 4 Easy Steps

1.6 7.5
MILLION UNIQUE VIEWS MILLION PAGE VISITS
EVERY MONTH

There are tons of publishers online, but what makes us different? Well, we can give you a FULL PAGE AD SPOT. You never have to limit your message to a small space on a website with competing content or ads. We can also set your ad to appear at only during specified days and time. We can show them to certain countries.
Real-time collaboration and chat for companies and individuals.

- Get Started:
  - email address
  - Sign up in under 60 seconds
    - Free - No Credit Card required

-.pw for Domains:
- Instant Messaging for all the users at your domain
- Public and private multi-user chat rooms
- Easy and quick setup, no hardwire required
-.pw is provided through Domain Registrars, Web Hosts, ISPs and other partners.

-.pw for Users:
- Customize your own personal website
- Chat with your co-workers and friends
- Share short messages and find out what everyone's up to
NIC - Network Information Center

Domain Name Registration in the .RW and .CG top-level domains
.RW - Republic of Rwanda
.CG - Republic of the Congo

NIC provides domain name registration ending by .RW and .CG. In order to register a domain name (domain sub-delegation) ending by .RW or .CG, you can submit your request on this site.

The aim of NIC is to provide free domain registration for the citizens of Rwanda and Congo, with some conditions.

It is possible however for foreigners to register domain names, but different regulations and pricing are applicable.

When you request a domain sub-delegation with NIC, when you make use of a domain ending by .RW and .CG or when you make use of this site, you accept all the terms and conditions of NIC that may vary from time to time.

Procedures

- Domain creation
- Domain modification
- Payment of domains

Documents

- Policy, terms and conditions of NIC
- One free domain for citizens residents of Rwanda and Congo - Price for non-residents

Database

- Search for an existing domain name (WHOIS)
This domain name, "aoweirufjdweoiruhdkvwo.st", may still be available for registration.

You have arrived at this page because the domain name you entered is not currently active on the Internet. If you have recently registered or modified this domain name, you can expect it to become active within the next 24 hours.

For more information on how to register your own .ST domain go to The Official .ST Domain Registry website at www.nic.st
메시지 표시할 수 없습니다.

경색된 태그는 현재 사용할 수 없습니다. 웹 사이트에 기술된 문제가 해결되지 않아야 합니다.

다음에 사전에 보เหมาะสม.

- 새로운 고객 단추를 클릭하거나 태그를 다시 시도하십시오.
- 이미지 주소를 목록 표시에 선택한 경우 해당 주소를 놓아야 합니다.
- 사용자의 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 도구 메뉴를 클릭하고 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 인터넷 연결 상태를 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 인터넷 연결을 사용할 수 없습니다. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 인터넷 연결을 사용할 수 없습니다. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 인터넷 연결을 사용할 수 없습니다. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 인터넷 연결을 사용할 수 없습니다. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
- 인터넷 연결을 사용할 수 없습니다. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오. 연결 설정을 확인하십시오.
This domain name "aoweirufjdweoiruhdkvwo.vn" may be pending for final approval. Please "Check Whois" before "Registering".

Tên miền "aoweirufjdweoiruhdkvwo.vn" chưa cấp phát chính thức. Hãy "Kiểm tra Whois" trước khi "Đăng ký".

"Sử dụng tên miền quốc gia ".VN" được pháp luật bảo vệ"  
Using ".VN" domain name are protected by the Vietnamese laws.
Future Action Items

• Gather Information from cc’s
  – E-mail
  – Approach individually
  – Enlist help of regional liaisons
  – Sample inquiry of cc’s that have stopped redirecting

• Summarize independent findings
  – Independent review of the types of redirection
  – Assess redirection results, resolution time, IANA database on registry, etc

• Evaluate the SSAC documents

• Map the cc’s according to the ‘harms’ list

• Submit summary of findings to the ccNSO council
  – Determine whether we would want to make certain recommendations to the ccNSO council
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Event</th>
<th>Tentative Date</th>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Gather information from individual cc’s on reasons, background, service duration | End of March | - e-mail  
- Individual approach  
- Regional liaisons | If no response, will rely on independent findings |
| 2. Evaluate SSAC documents | End of March | - e-mail | Will receive comments on docs |
| 3. Summarize independent findings | End of March | - Redirection results page assessed  
- Response time | Conducted by volunteers of SG |
| 4. Discuss SSAC ‘harms’ list  
Mechanism for mapping cc’s | Mid April | - SG teleconference | Based on findings above |
| 5. Finalize mapping | End of April | - e-mail  
- SG teleconference | Based on discussion among SG members |
| 6. First draft of summary report | Early May |  | To be published for comment |
| 7. Draft final report | Mid May | - document submission | To be published for comment |
| 8. Submit final report to ccNSO council | Early June | - document submission | To be publicly available |
| 9. Report findings during ccNSO meeting in Brussels | June 20-24 | - presentation |  |