

---

TORONTO – ALAC Policy Discussion Part II  
Tuesday, October 16, 2012 – 14:00 to 16:00  
ICANN - Toronto, Canada

GISELLA GRUBER: ALAC Policy Discussion Part II, Tuesday, 16<sup>th</sup> of October, at 2:00 local Toronto time. I'm just going to remind everyone to state their names when speaking, not only for the transcript purposes, but we have simultaneous interpretation in Spanish and in French and the interpreters do not know you and we'd like it to be as accurate as possible. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much Gisella. My apologies for this slight delay, which was due to our needing of food, basically. Today we have quite a lineup joining us with a number of chairs, former chairs, advisors to the chairs and advisors to the advisors to the chair, starting with Vanda Scartezini, Yrjo Lansipuro, Sharilyn Wagner, Adam Peake, and Ron Andruff. Welcome.

[background conversation]

MALE: And Glenn, who is a NomCom member and advisor to the advisor to the advisor to the advisor, as well, so great stuff. I hand the floor over to you, Vanda.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

Okay, thank you. Thank you for the good welcome for us. Yes, it's a very good group here.

Why we are here, everybody knows we would like to share with you two things. One, the requirements you have made this year for us and what we got, and ask you also if you have other recommendations, change something, make any withdrawal or something like that.

Any recommendations, Yrjo will be, of course, open to receive any other comments, but just to get our metrics, if you want to have all the information and statistics, et cetera, there is inside the NomCom website, is [noncom.org.icann.org](http://noncom.org.icann.org), and there will be all the statistics about regions, about anything that you want to know about the candidates.

One thing that's interesting to see is that in the matching metrics that we did matching the recommendations that you have done with the people that we got, so we could not put it over there, but I just get two points that was not just excellent. One is in which way we -

[background conversation]

VANDA SCARTEZINI:

So what we used to make these qualifications and point out the points that you recommend that we match or not, we have an internal analysis for any candidates. Also for many of them, especially for the board members, we had a personal profile analysis for outside independent



---

organization. This time we had the luck to have the two candidates, those candidates for ALAC or candidates for a board, so we could have this deeply analyzed from outside, so give us two points.

Most of them are excellent, and one point that was disqualified was about the gender because we could not find better woman to go over those two guys.

Even another point that I would like to raise here was the few candidates from Europe to ALAC. It was really a small number. Thanks to God it was very qualified. It was a small number, but anyway, it's something to pay attention because it's too small number like a five or something like that. You can see the numbers inside my report so it's very important.

Another point that I would like to raise because it's quite important for this next NomCom is this time we have just few Africans for any position, so it's really real disappointed. Of course, there was no position in ALAC for African or Latin America or Asia, but anyway, for all the other positions we got only few Africans to do. So let's pay attention please and make some good outreach in those regions. They have very good qualified people so why not to have those apply? So please convince them to apply.

So that's it. I'll be here for any question, but I'd like to introduce the new members and give the floor to Yrjo, the new chair.

YRJO LANSIPURO:

Thank you very much. I don't think that we have to present our new team with lengthy introductions. I haven't so much to say yet because



we start our work on Friday, but at this stage I would like to ask for your help. All of you know, I'm sure, people whom you think that would make great ICANN directors or members of the councils or this committee, so please tell them to apply. Send in their SOIs and the updated NomCom website will be upgraded soon and instructions on how to apply will be there. We are dependent on the candidate pool so that's why we really need good candidates.

I'm sorry to say that three members of the NomCom did not get here because they didn't get visas, and I'm even more sorry to say that all of them were ALAC appointees. That is to say ALAC appointees from the European, from the Asian and African region. I think that this is something we should do something about because if we want to be global, if we want to be inclusive and include all regions and countries of the world, then just decisions by some authorities can effectually nullify our efforts.

So when we start our work on Friday we'll look at the recommendations coming from 2012 Committee and how to incorporate them into our rules of procedures. We value all input we're getting and I would like to say that even if we are hit on the head with a bottle, we still look inside the bottle for a message, which probably is there. So that's what we try to do, but certainly on Friday we want to start from a clean table. We're not going to fight old battles again. We concentrate on the task on hand.

Last, but not least, the timetable this year will be a quite challenging one because all these ICANN meetings are later than usual and that's another challenge for us to deal with. Thank you.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Yrjo. Any questions? Garth Bruen.

GARTH BRUEN: Thank you. Garth Bruen, Chair of NORALO, for the record. That's troubling that the members could not get visas and they had visa problems. That is a serious issue.

In terms of what I think Yrjo just referenced, most of us don't know what's going on inside of the NomCom space. They are closed sessions. Obviously, you don't want to fight previous battles, and I'm sorry for the bluntness of the question, but there is a controversy swirling around the NomCom that most of us are just hearing about or reading about.

I think we're all very concerned about the integrity of the process and want to make sure that this controversy is probably addressed. I didn't know if you had anything that could help us push it behind us.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Okay, thank you. First of all, it was really something that shocked all of us, but we believe that this has impacted the whole organization, and because of that, I addressed the issue to the board and we expected to have a meeting with the board, the BGC, the governor's committee inside the board that is related to these issues, probably tomorrow and to decide what could be the best address for that. This is for the blog, okay?

---

But considering...about the sense of closeness is if you could see during the whole year, this 2012 committee just put finally all the movements that we have done during the year.

The timeline was updated. What was not there and will never be there is the name of the candidates. Where we were and what we are doing, next steps, and what the candidates could expected information about how to proceed and now all the recommendations about issues that you raise that we inside the committee are proposing for better procedures in the future and it's all posted there. Certainly, NomCom would like any comments that you have that could improve all those transparency and accountability with the community.

So this is a process for NomCom. This was the first year that we start to open up. We start with [ADM] in 2011 to make all the requirements, ATRT, just ask us to do, and we finalized this year and they start to publish. Since the first moment in December last year we started to publish everything that we could.

Certainly there is a lot of room to improve and I'm sure 2013 we'll do much more than we have done from ADM to now. Certainly we'll continue '14 and so on because it's always room for improvement, but mostly there is nothing that we recognize internal as a group that was something that could be named [I-coropsy or junior behavior] or something like that. It is just not true. We are here in this committee most of the persons in this committee this year and the next year, certainly -



---

[background conversation]

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Yeah. Certainly. Yeah, we need to go but he needs the answer. But it is like that. We need to just respond those kind of things publicly. It just feed more gossip and so on, so it's not for us to do that. If the organization wants to say something, it's for the organization to say. Thank you for the question.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Vanda, and just before you go, I believe most of this...well, in fact, this community knows, all of you, perhaps from Ron, and I wondered whether you could just introduce yourself however fast you can do it.

RON ANDRUFF: Very rapidly. As a Canadian, I'll make the translators work very hard. First of all, Ron Andruff, a member of the business constituency for about 13 years now. I've been with ICANN since about '98, very active in the community, serving on the Standing Committee for Improvements right now as well as the Credentials Committee for the BC.

Happy to be a member of the NomCom and thank you all for any input that you have. My ears are wide open and we hope to make great selections to lead ICANN forward for the next decade.

[background conversation]



---

RON ANDRUFF: More women for sure. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Ron, and thanks to the whole NomCom. Their work is very hard trying to find applicants out there who don't know about ICANN who are not going to be paid for what they're going to do and who have to be gender and geographically balanced.

[background conversation]

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: And not recognized either, so thank you. And, of course, the outreach work to try and find candidates is not one that only the NomCom has to do, but that our whole community has to do in trying to find friends, colleagues, people that we know that would be a good addition to the various positions that the NomCom searches candidates for.

We're now moving to the next part of our meeting, agenda item number two, the At-Large Policy Development ALAC Working Group Relations. This morning we already touched on this, actually. We heard from several of the working groups, not all of them, but several of them, and found out that some of the work that they were performing was linked to the work of other working groups. I gather that rather than the working groups working in silos, there might be a way for the working groups to work together.



---

The purpose of this session here, which actually might go a lot faster than the time provided here, which is 45 minutes, is to generate a discussion as to how those working groups should interact, whether the chairs should be in touch with each other or any other means, but I hand the floor over to someone who is about to explain to us this whole thing, Rinalia Abdul Rahim.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I think that it's a no-brainer that we need to delegate this function to the chairs of the individual working group when the issues are intersecting, such as IDNs on the WHOIS field or in the Internationalized Registration Data or in other fields. The chairs must be in touch with each other and I think that we need to let them know that that's their responsibility. Got it, thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Rinalia. Well, that sounds like we've closed the subject. Thank you. We can go for a break. No, I'm kidding here. With regards to the actual resources provided to each one of the working groups, as we know, there are wiki pages which are set up for each one of the working groups.

There are no joint wiki pages or tools which could help in this cross working group interaction. How would you go over this? Are there any tools or any set processes? Because at the moment, what you're relying on specifically is just the interpersonal relationship of the chairs of the working groups.

---

But as we continue scaling up, I think it might be harder and harder with more and more working groups, more people getting involved, to have all the chairs constantly talking to each other, especially if there's no specific working group chairs call or working group chairs' mailing list, perhaps, or working group chairs' Skype, Twitter, et cetera. Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: I think you're jumping the gun. This subject was brought up because they don't talk to each other at all right now. Let's hope for such a problem that we have too much interaction and too much volume.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: I'm being suggested some very democratic ways of doing things. The word *forcing* the chairs to speak to each other -

[background conversation]

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Proactive, sorry. Here we go. Proactively asking the chairs kindly to work with each other. Rinalia?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Rinalia Abdul Rahim for the transcript record. I believe you just proposed a solution which I think is workable, which is to have a mailing list comprising of all the chairs of the working groups, and because you personally are subscribed to all the working groups and you have a good overview of what issues are hot and requiring



---

collaboration, I suggest that you use this special working group to trigger collaboration among the working groups. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Rinalia. Carlton?

CARLTON SAMUELS: I have an easier proposition. Just subscribe to all the working group mailing lists. Don't need a new mailing list.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Carlton. I see Garth Bruen and then Fatimata, so Garth.

GARTH BRUEN: Garth Bruen, NORALO Chair. In response to Carlton, this is something that came up in our meeting this morning. Is there a list of all the working groups out there? Does staff have such a thing? Okay, they do. Alright. Maybe if we knew where that was, people could pick and choose.

[background conversation]

GARTH BRUEN: Oh, okay. I haven't seen it.

---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Garth. I think maybe we can take an action item on this because we do often have such a list being distributed. There is a wiki page with all the working groups.

[background conversation]

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: That's a good point, actually, or maybe periodically sending the pointer to this page. So there's a page that has all of that. There is a page that also has all correspondence. There's a page that has all policy development and I think these are particularly important. If you manage to read through these pages you can keep pretty good track of what the ALAC is doing. Very good point. Maybe a reminder of this. Fatimata.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: I'm going to speak in French. My name is Fatimata. I would like to say that the idea of asking everyone to subscribe to all the working groups, I don't know if this is something that can really happen, that we can really do and do a good job with it.

I would like to maybe propose something that would be to look at one working group, and in certain working groups you only have two or three people so that's going to be difficult, but if one working group... I am a member of a working group and I am interested, but what happens in another working group, I can represent my group and report to my group. Maybe I'm going to wear two hats, maybe three hats, but I'll be able to report on another working group.



---

I think if each of us subscribe to all working groups, that doesn't work. We're all going to be over communicating. That's what I think.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Was it Dev who put his hand up? I saw so many hands up simultaneously. Yes, Dev.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. With regards to the things like the wikis and so forth, of all the various working groups, in terms of trying to get everybody to track a particular topic or whatever, what could be done is taxonomy. By that I mean wiki supports the tagging of the pages, so if there is an issue that does come up, let's say the registrant comes up or got a related WHOIS issue, once that is tagged and the persons subscribe to all instances related to that wording or WHOIS or IDNs, whatever, then they could be notified and then be involved.

I'm not sure if this is really a huge problem at this point, but I understand the concept of scaling. When it scales, how can we do it? An additional mailing list, well, it's got -

[background conversation]

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yeah, I guess so. What would be the purpose of such a mailing list? That, what? The chair sends reports on the mailing list? I'm not sure.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. Next is Sandra.

SANDRA HOFERICHTER: Thank you. Sandra Hoferichter speaking. I agree with what Fatimata and Dev have said. Subscribing to all the mailing lists makes no sense. I can't manage to follow and get extracted what's really the issue in another working group. I'm sorry, this would not work.

An additional mailing list might be an option for announcements which goes directly to chairs of working group which comes from staff or Olivier or something like that.

For the communication, I would rather propose sort of a What's Up Call, maybe with a fixed agenda to say each share of the working group gives a short update and we have the possibility for question and answers if there are some. This could be, on some points, a very quick call. On other points it could be a more extended call.

Not sure if this should be on a regular basis or on demand, but this is something I think could work. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Sandra. Next is Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: There's an old expression in English—I'm sure in other languages, too—"You can lead a horse to water, but you can't make them drink." You can subscribe everyone to 1,000 mailing lists. You can't make them read



---

them and think about them, so the concept of subscribing everyone to every mailing list is, I think, dead in the water, for another water analogy. I recommend the KISS principle—keep it simple. There’s another S there. You can fill in whatever your favorite S word is.

I would suggest a mailing list of working group chairs. If nothing else, it will make it easier for someone to remind them to submit their monthly reports. If it doesn’t get used, you’ll find out soon enough. It hasn’t cost you a lot. Mailman doesn’t charge a lot for adding a list and it’s a repository. At least you know who the chairs are.

And, a modification of Fatimata’s suggestion. We talked yesterday at the Rules of Procedure meeting about enforced slavery and I think saying everyone in a meeting group has to subscribe to three other lists and read them diligently... No, I’m exaggerating.

There’s an awful lot of overlap in these groups, including some people like the chair who subscribe to a lot of them and actually at times pay full attention to them. Just make it everyone’s obligation. If something comes up in one working group that is of interest to the other, somebody should point it out. Try it informal. Try it simple to start with and see if the problem is addressed before trying to invent huge complex processes which will take a lot of staff time to maintain and probably won’t help a lot because they’re too complex.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Alan. Next is Carlton.



---

CARLTON SAMUELS: Thank you, Chair. Carlton, for the record. Let me tell you what my problem is. I do not wish to have my life further aggravated. Every month I get a mailman list that says, “You are subscribed to these lists,” and there are ten of them. Ten.

Now, am I always posting to all of those lists? Hell, no, but I do get the messages and if my interest is there I will read the message and I will respond to the message if it interests me.

I really have a problem with being put to subscribe to another mailing list. I really have a problem with that. I have enough. Thank you very much.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Carlton. I see a lot more hands now coming up. I don't know who was first. Let's do ladies first, so Fatimata, then Tijani and then Dev.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Fatimata again, and in French. I'm going to speak French. I would like to propose something else. Already said that one member from a working group who's interested in the work of another working group can report on his own or her own working group, and if you have several members in one working group, we don't have to cover them all. We can cover quite a lot that way.

Another proposal I was just thinking about, I was thinking about the president of those working groups. I think we should have a meeting regularly between those working group presidents just to have a



briefing of what happens in their working groups—where they are going, what they are talking about.

At this time, each president of a working group would be aware and knowledgeable about what goes on and then they would report to their working group. This is a good synergy. We have to make some efforts to communicate more and better and it's going to bring results. I think it's worth it.

To what frequency do you think we should have some calls or some meetings? Once a month, maybe, or once every two weeks. It depends. It depends on the work of the committee. For instance, if we have some results that are expected in a short period of time, let's say that Carlton's group delivers some results regarding WHOIS because there is a new policy development, a new PDP which is going to be public, Carlton can give the results and share them on the list.

Maybe once a month would be a good frequency. That's reasonable. Working group presidents could meet to do just like we did together. Very quickly say, "That's what we did. That's what's new. That's what's important." Notable new orientations, we're going towards that direction and they could share the information that way between working group presidents and then report back. That will be taken into account in the decision-making process.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

I will continue in French. I might not be in agreement with my president, but the briefing she was talking about might not be necessary because it's going to be time consuming and—this is Tijani here—and some



---

working groups here, it's in the case where they do work on the same type of topics.

We have to make sure that we don't have results and decisions that are in contradiction. I don't think we need those briefings because we hardly have any time for our families. If we decide today that everybody subscribes to all the working groups, I'm not going to do it, period. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Tijani. We have Dev Anand Teelucksingh next.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. I think perhaps simpler put is what we should strive for. For the monthly ALAC meetings, I believe the chairs of all the working groups are required to submit reports on the wiki. It's not absolutely considered every single month, though, because of, of course, the ALAC call.

However, what could be done is something similar to what the ICANN newsletter does and that could go out on the ALAC Announce list so that all ALSs are aware of what's happening each month on all the working groups. That would be the summary of what's happening, especially taking the links to the reports as posted on the wiki.

So all the chairs file a monthly report as for the ALAC monthly call that gets certainly when ALAC announced all the mailing lists, and also, the RALOs could then also use that information to, if they want more information or something like that, have them on the call or something.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. Next we have Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: I suggest that all the chairs of the working group participate in the monthly ALAC meeting and report there as part of the agenda, period, on, what they're doing on the working group. Just make sure that you are in the conference call.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Eduardo. One of the problems is we have a lot of working groups and the ALAC calls already have the policy development and the monthly reports from the different RALOs and the monthly report from our liaisons. How many hours do you wish to make the ALAC call?

EDUARDO DIAZ: One.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: You'll have to speak very, very quickly for that.

There is a queue in operation. It's Alan, Sergio and then Fatimata. Thank you. Oh, and Tijani wishes to jump the queue and respond specifically.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yeah, specifically. Even if we don't present the reports during the ALAC meetings, the reports are on the wiki pages so the person who wants to



know what happened can go and read so it is a problem of reading. It's not a problem of information. The information is there.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Tijani. Next is Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Alan Greenberg. Dev and Tijani said pretty much everything I was going to say. The reports are supposed to be there. If not, they should be.

If there is really a feeling that they need to be read out and other people listened, scheduled the five minutes, the ten minutes, the hour, the six hours before the ALAC meeting for the chairs to get together and do that, and any other ALAC members who want to listen, because it's rather important for the ALAC members to know what's going on on their own committees and working groups.

So we have some mechanisms. Let's use them to the extent possible and let's not try to invent too much to solve this problem until we find out if the simple things work.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Alan. Next is Sergio Salinas Porto.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you. Sergio Salinas Porto for the records. Thank you, Chair. I was thinking that 24 hours ago a new and wonderful tool was released. That is myICANN and you can subscribe to anything you want. We could do



---

something to link myICANN to this thing we are discussing and we would have a direct channel to work this entire issue. So maybe if we think about a solution, it would be quicker and more accessible than the one we are discussing now. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Sergio, and actually, at the end of this session we will have a demonstration of the new communication platform, which will include, I believe, myICANN, so that certainly is something to keep in mind. Fatimata.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: This is Fatimata again. The reason why I'm suggesting a meeting—and I agree with Eduardo's suggestion; I'm no longer an ALAC member—is that here we're talking about working together. If you want to work together, at some point the working groups will have to meet and talk. That's why I'm suggesting a meeting of the working group chairs. If it's just about informing or about what you're doing, that's fine.

I think if it's about that only, you can keep the system as it is. That's my point. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Fatimata. Next, I know that, Alan, you put your hand up.

ALAN GREENBERG: I was indicating strong support for what she said.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, thank you. Any other thoughts? I've heard a lot of different thoughts—yes, no, a monthly call, a mailing list perhaps, perhaps not.

I think that the concept of having everyone on all the mailing lists, or at least the working group chairs on all of the mailing lists, sounds as though there will be a lot of emails coming through. That might be a little bit much. I'm also mindful of Carlton not wishing to receive one more reminder, but then I have been told by those powers that be that apparently you can turn these off.

I wonder, perhaps we could actually have this as a standard. I'm not quite sure we need to be reminded.

[background conversation]

ALAN GREENBERG: It's not another option, it's a mailing list option.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: I know I'm speaking to myself at the moment. I'm having a voice telling me in my ear and trying to reply to it. After so many hours you start thinking, "Is it reality or is it in my head?" No, the gist of what Carlton was saying is he just doesn't want to be on yet another mailing list. That's a fair point as well. Dev?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. Regarding the use of RSS feeds and so on, yes, that can be done. Confluence does have that wiki.



---

I've discovered how to use it with the social media strategy, just as how the blog from one of the spaces can be used to update the Twitter and Facebook page.

In a similar way, the monthly reports could be filed, then that becomes like a blog post. It will still be the same action. The working group chairs file their monthly reports, the ALAC can, and I would say ideally before... Well, they should be a few days before the ALAC monthly call so that anything can be raised to be discussed during the ALAC call, and again, it could also be posted to the ALAC Announce List, actually, because I think a lot of times the rest of the At-Large is simply not aware.

I think it really should go out on the ALAC Announce List. Even if the chairs aren't producing monthly reports, maybe that should go out, too, so that there could be a query to say, "Hey, what is going on?"

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. Rinalia?

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. I would operate on the basis of when there is a need, the mechanism will appear. When do you establish that there is a need? The need for cross communication between working groups would appear when someone flags to their respective chairs that there is a crosscutting issue requiring some discussion.

The first level of discussion needs to occur at the working group chairs' level. I'm not saying all the working group chairs need to be involved, just the two or three working group chairs that are implicated by the



---

nature of the substance. It could come from you, it could come from staff, but I think either one of you could trigger this process and then it's up to the respective chairs to determine in terms of whether or not they want to escalate it to their respective working groups, whether they want to establish one wiki page for all of their working group members to contribute, et cetera.

So I don't think that you should specify the implementation mechanism. I think that you should agree that there needs to be a mechanism where you trigger the process that something needs attention. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you very much, Rinalia. That is a fair point to do when you have only a small number of working groups, but when you start scaling up I'm not quite sure how the chair will be able to be knowledgeable enough in all of the discussions that are taking place to find the actual parallel between those things.

I had no idea that WHOIS and IDNs might have a common issue when one has to use IDN and WHOIS and it didn't even come into my mind, but as we've found this morning, there was such an issue.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM:

Rinalia Abdul Rahim for the transcript record. It was I who discovered that link. I notified my working group chair and put it on the agenda. The discussion happened this morning, so perhaps you may not have discovered it, but someone would notify you that there was something requiring cross working group discussion. Thank you.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Rinalia. I'm always worried about the use of *someone* as a thing. Imagine if I said, "Would someone speak, please?" Yes, someone, please take the mic.

CARLTON SAMUELS: Actually, the concern about the -

GISELLA GRUBER: Sorry, please say your name. This is Gisella. They are going to have a nervous breakdown otherwise. And if you could please speak in the microphone, Carlton, please. Thank you.

CARLTON SAMUELS: I love to do what I'm told by Gisella. So, this is Carlton for the record. I hope I'm speaking clearly.

There's two things. The issue of WHOIS has always been a part of the [firma.net] for registration anywhere. The question of how internationalized domain name registrations would have impacted WHOIS, true, did not come to the fore until the registration data model was proposed because the data model actually went down to...

Well, Alan will tell you that it's been around for a couple of years, but in this go around that data model...because if you look at the elements that were placed as part of that model, it became very obvious that we had to do something extra for it, so this is the sense in which there were connections between it because the model is supposed to be universal.



---

It is supposed to be the same whether it's internationalized domain names or the regular ASCII domain names.

The Registrant Rights Group, we've always had the intimation that WHOIS data was a part of that scenario. If you look at the aspirational charter that was devised back in Costa Rica, I think it was, it was definitely a part of it. What was good about it is that we had cross membership between the working groups.

I am on that Working Group Registrant Rights. I am also on the WHOIS Working Groups. I am not on the Internationalized Domain IDNs because I always defer to people who know better than me there. But there are people who are in IDN who are also part of the WHOIS Working Group, so that was the way we thought we had it covered.

Once the information came up out of the working group demonstrations, then we would popularize it through the various working groups and the other connections that we had. We were never of the view that you had to have a special vehicle to do this. No.

I will grant you that the fact that we have not had a kind of rolling insistence that these are issues that we should all be aware of, it may be failure on the part of the members of the working groups to insist that all of this is heard many times, but it has been recognized.

All I'm saying is this. The way we are structured now, there are sufficient threats that connect all of us to make what we know popularized across the entire At-Large sphere and we can do it without having another group. That's my only problem.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Carlton. I think you meant without having another mailing list.

CARLTON SAMUELS: This is Carlton. Thank you, Chair. Yes, that's what I mean.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, thank you. Fatimata.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you. Fatimata again. Just a question. That does mean that there's no more need for improvement? I thought it was something new we wanted to push, have the working group work together. If there is no need for improvement, think about a new mechanism to make it work. I think the meeting should be... If you all agree on that, I don't know if it's worth even discussing it then.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Carlton.

CARLTON SAMUELS: Thank you. Carlton for the record. In response to Fatimata, I accept that what has happened does not work very well, but the framework exists. We don't need a new framework. What we need to do is to ensure that we have a better working of what exists today. That's my point.

---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Carlton. Any other responses or thoughts on the issue? There is, of course, another way, an additional way which could be used, which is using the wiki. If the working group chair reports were posted on the wiki page on which all chairs of working groups would be watching, then they would be notified.

So that would be a thing where whenever somebody posts their little report, all the working groups would know about it. The only upside to that is if somebody makes a typo or whatever and saves their report four or five, six times, then all of the working group chairs would receive all of the little changes that are there.

At the moment we have a page which points to all of the working groups, but it doesn't actually point to the reports, so if you update -

[background conversation]

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yeah. If you click on those, but when you update that page, whoever is registered on that page is... Holly first and then Alan and then Dev.

HOLLY RAICHE: I'm going to say something before Alan does. Alan has the experience I do of every so often hunting down on the wiki pages and then giving up and then having a glass of wine.

I would like to work with Matt so that it's really easy to find stuff because sometimes I have enormous difficulty finding stuff. So if we



could construct a page, start with our ALAC page, then understand what goes where, then I would be really happy. I had great trouble. Matt found it in a jiffy. I couldn't find out where my contributions had gone to so I had to abandon ship.

I just think maybe we could spend five minutes saying what is where. I know Alan doesn't like that. Alan's got another contribution.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Holly. As I said, there are several pages which I think we should all be aware of, but yes, starting from the front page going down, the problem with the Confluence is that there is no single front page. Well, there is, but you have to be lucky enough to fall on that one to start with. Sometimes you fall on it, sometimes you fall on the GNSO, sometimes you fall on the ccNSO Confluence. So let's have a little demonstration, then.

ALAN GREENBERG: Could we adhere to the speaking order?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: First we'll have Alan.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you, Chair. Alan Greenberg for the transcript record. The problem Holly is describing is real and a demonstration doesn't fix it right now. I was trying to find a page I had written this morning and I found several



---

pages that were entitled slight variations of ALAC and At-Large Policy Development page.

I'm just commenting on what Holly said. The reason I put my hand up was to the original suggestion. I follow many, many, many pages. I get an unending list of community subjects in my list. I don't go follow all of them. Occasionally I will go back when something's relevant where it becomes obvious someone posted something on Tuesday, I may go look for it.

If it really catches my attention, which it rarely does because the really salient part is so far over on the subject line I don't see it because it scrolled off my page. If you want to catch people's attention, putting it on a wiki page and making them go and look at it when they get notified may work for some people. It's not going to work for me, I can tell you. Just a note. Wikis are not going to hack it.

As Cheryl has said in one of the Rules of Proceeding things, if you have something really important to catch someone's eye, you've got to push the message out to them and a watching message from a wiki when you get thousands of others per week doesn't do it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Alan. So much for my idea. Well, that shot it down in flames, but anyway -



---

**ALAN GREENBERG:** Alan Greenberg again for the record. You may be much more organized than I am and have a much better mail program and web browser than I do. I'm giving you my reality.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** Thank you, Alan, and of course, we all have our own realities and I perfectly understand. We were about to get a quick demonstration, which was going to take one minute, from Gisella into finding the important pages. Gisella, you've just clicked on the right button and I would ask everyone to look at the screen. Here we go. It's there.

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** This is Heidi. Just 30 seconds. This if you go back to the Dashboard. When you log in, you're going to come to what's called Dashboard. It's on the left hand side. This is not what you're looking at right now. You'll see it's all oriented into groups. You'll see the ALAC page.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** That's a terrible Dashboard, but that is the Dashboard, actually.

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** There it is right there. You click on that. That comes to the main At-Large ALAC wiki page. The purple box on the upper left, that's the Gateway page. That goes to key workspaces, so for example, the Policy Development wiki is right there in that Gateway. If you scroll down, Gisella, please, you'll see that in that grey box... No, go back to the ALAC main page. Scroll into the grey box, please. There you'll see things like

---

the regional working groups right there. You click on that. That's all the working groups—Standing, Ad Hoc. They're all right there. Thank you.

GISELLA GRUBER: Gisella for the record, if I may. I think one of the easiest things... Matt is a whiz kid. Different. Very different. I have to bookmark my pages. Do you want to know how many -

[background conversation]

GISELLA GRUBER: Yes, same here. That's the only way I can work. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you. Next, Oksana.

OKSANA PRYKHODKO: Thank you Mr. Chair. Oksana Prykhodko. Where is versions in different languages? Could you please show on this Dashboard?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Oksana, if I could ask, are you asking about the use of the translate tool? Because there is a translate tool.



---

HEIDI ULLRICH: This is Heidi for the record. We have installed a translate tool. Gisella, it's right below the main title of the page. You'll see it says Translate right there, all those languages. You click on that.

This is the Confluence wiki, Oksana. You may be talking about the website. That translation tool is a fantastic tool. You can translate into lots of different languages. Our websites, I will admit, it is rather static. It does have the six UN languages. It is rather static. I admit that. We are working on that.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Heidi. You can also use the Translate Tool to teach yourself a new language by reading the pages in Russian and other languages.

I think we're moving off the track at the moment and before we close this particular session, just looking back at how we can work smarter and be able to get the working groups to know what they're doing, perhaps I could ask for the Technical Working Group that deals with this sort of work to try and find a solution.

I'm not sure if this is a tool that needs to be thought of or it's a method to be thought of or it's just good housekeeping practice from the working group chairs to speak to each other regularly. If they don't have a specific mailing list for themselves to talk to each other, then it would really have to be for the chairs themselves.

The problem is if you have an absolutely dreadful chair there is no way that no one else will find out what happens in that working group. So the practice to have monthly reports put onto a wiki page is a good practice. The practice of subscribing everyone to the changes seems to



---

be not such a good practice for some people, and I gather it probably is the case for many others. We still do have to find a solution. Dev?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. I should point out that the Technology Task Force did identify several aspects of the wiki that was confusing. Several At-Large members in the task force complained, especially when it was simply hard to find information. Right now the Technology Task Force, as chair I requested that we should try to document any proposed solutions for this before we try implementing anything in an ad hoc fashion, so that's one thing.

Secondly, the At-Large Working Group's page, the thing is it can be improved in a sense that what is prepared on the ALAC template is not reflecting the current list of all those working groups there. You edit it in one location, it's replicated in all other places so there's not duplicated content that you have to go updating 20 places at once. You update it one place and you just say, "Include working groups," in another page and it will be there. So that's one way and I will be more than willing to help work with that to do it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. Holly.

HOLLY RAICHE: I think what we might do is have a little instruction page at some point that says if you're chair of a working group this is what you do, this is where it goes so that everybody... It's almost like I want to have



---

everybody around the table, everybody go through the computer, everybody knowing where they're supposed to go so that you don't go looking for things in the wrong place. I just have noticed stuff that's on my wiki page I've done nothing about.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** Thank you very much, Holly, and thank you for smacking your hand. Very good. Good start. I think that this actually could be taken as an action item, a starting kit for working group chairs to know what... I wouldn't say what the responsibilities are, but what things they should really be looking at doing so as to keep people informed in both their working group and also other working group chairs. I see Yaovi Atohoun. Yaovi and then Dev. Yaovi?

**YAOVI ATOHOUN:** Yaovi speaking. I want to make a suggestion. If you can have maybe what would be now on the wiki it may be useful because myself, I'm not sure I'm using 100% of the some of the facilities of the wiki, so that may be helpful, and then from that we can also make more observation. Thank you.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** Thank you very much Yaovi. So two things. Staff, having anticipated this—I don't know how they do this—has actually put the link to the Wiki Training Guide on the Adobe, but the other things is that there is a 20-minute session on Thursday morning for the NORALO Capacity Building, which will deal with teaching how to use the wiki, so you might be interested in attending. It's, of course, open to everyone.



---

Well, I think we've got a couple of action items out of this one, and in the meantime, I really do urge the working group chairs to liaise with each other and make sure that they don't work in silos. There certainly is some cross linking between them.

Let's move on to the next part of our agenda. Dev, I know you were queued up. Did you want to just add one more thing?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: No, just what Holly said was, I think, a good suggestion. Perhaps also as a part of a longer term, we have to look at probably the template for how the working groups are structured so that becomes easy to find information and so forth, but that's a longer term thing.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Heidi?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. Just going onto that—this is Heidi for the record—perhaps one request from staff would be that the working group chairs consider assigning a rapporteur to that group so that staff don't need to take notes that we are currently having to do.

You may notice that At-Large staff are on basically every call and it brings up major bandwidth issues, so as you scale up we need to adapt to that as well. One of those ways that we're planning on doing that is to have At-Large staff, not all of us be on the same calls so we can get other work done, so that would be one way that would really be useful for us.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, Holly, if it's really important, please go ahead.

HOLLY RAICHE: First of all, I notice there are lots of people on my working group and I'm not sure everybody wants to get an email every time, so I think you have to be really careful what you sign up for because this list will be whittled down to the people who work.

The other thing, I think, is why can't, if I'm on a chair with one of the team for the Drafting Team, I just send around an email to everybody saying this is what we did in the last call. That becomes just dot points that can be put in here. It's a lot less work on you and it's just a conclusion this is what we came to.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, thank you. I now understand that's normally done. Let's move on to the next part of our agenda and that's the At-Large Policy Development ALAC and RALO Relations.

As I explained in my introduction on Sunday morning, there is going to be an emphasis on the RALOs performing more work in the integration of policy development, and especially empowering those users at the edge to be able to be both more informed, but also to be able to inform us more about what's going on in their part of the world and about the issues that are important for them with regards, of course, to the ICANN processes.



---

The question really is how to formalize this. How should the ALAC relate to the RALOs regarding that? I had breakfast with all of the RALO chairs and for those RALO chairs that couldn't make it, their vice-chairs and colleagues that were designated to attend the breakfast. We discussed the idea that the RALOs would have to be more integrated in the policy development and how to achieve this.

So this session really is for all of us to discuss that. Both ALAC members, but also RALO leadership, and see how we could work better at integrating the RALO's work in the ALAC and the ALAC's work into the RALOs.

Very open question. The floor is open. Perhaps to send some stimulating thoughts into the discussion, I should yet again point the microphone towards my colleague, Rinalia Abdul Rahim.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM: Mr. Chairman, I don't have anything to add at this point in time.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Holly.

HOLLY RAICHE: I think this ties in with the use of the website and how best we can use it. I'd like to think Sandra's around so we can actually talk about resources, telling everybody what the resources are, but then putting action items on RALOs to say, "What are your top issues?" and that becomes the start.

---

And then probably expecting at least some of the RALOs to participate. For instance, in Asia Pacific the Internationalized Domain Names has become a really big issue, so think about the one or two or three issues that are really important for your RALO, something you know that people will just participate in. That's a way to probably get an interest from the ground up.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Holly. I think I was also alluding to public comments periods, for example, which get distributed over the ALAC list, but are not necessarily sent to absolutely everyone.

HOLLY RAICHE: When you're looking for a comment, what would really help people who haven't been following an issue is somehow draft up a two- or three-sentence...instead of just hitting, "Here's the link, by the way. Go read the thing," and usually that's got links to and links to and links to and links to and that's not going to do it.

Two or three sentences that says, "This is what the issue's about. This is why it may impact people," and you get people's interest, because otherwise if you say, "Let's vote on this," and there's a link, it's almost like hard work. Unless you've been involved in it, you sort of think, "Well, why should I bother?"

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Holly. There's a queue at the moment. Alan, Sergio and then Rinalia, so Alan first.



ALAN GREENBERG:

I don't think there's any magic answer to this. I think we're looking at incremental things. It always strikes me as being interesting when you hear a financial forecast for the country and the auto industry is doing well and they will add .015 to the GDP. It sounds like such an insignificant number but they all add up.

I think that's what we're looking at here. I've many times sent things out to the ALAC list saying, "Distribute to the RALOs," and the RALO list that I want that I do watch, no one ever does it. If that problem would get fixed by someone taking responsibility it might attract a bit of interest. If a RALO person happens to meet an ALS person or an email indicates they are interested in something that is within ICANN's purview, put them in touch with someone who knows something about it.

The only way we're going to do this is by a combination of a lot of little things which slowly draw people in and push the subjects out. I don't think we're going to find a magic bullet which is going to fix the problem. It's going to be very, very many incremental fixes. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Thank you, Alan, and Heidi wishes to respond to this.

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Alan, just in response to your very good suggestions, can I just ask the chairs or the secretariats of the RALOs, when you receive a notice on the ALAC Announce, how often do you push it to your actual RALO lists?



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Wolf?

WOLF LUDWIG: This is Wolf Ludwig speaking. It depends to a certain extent. The team forwards and sometimes it depends on relevance. If I really think this is out of the radar as a community, I sometimes put it into the files, but in most cases I simply forward it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: That's just in response to Heidi's question. Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: It's the same in AFRALO. We do the forward when we feel it is necessary, but I do think that there is a better manner to do that more systematic. There is a list which includes all the ALSs. Why don't you send the announcement that you feel that it is necessary to be forwarded to the ALSs on this very large list?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Heidi?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Tijani, are you talking about the At-Large worldwide list or are you talking about the list that your ALSs would get?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: At-Large.



HEIDI ULLRICH: Okay, so At-Large worldwide.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Actually, I do have a question to staff. All of the new requests are usually sent out to the At-Large distribution, the public comment request. That actually brings me to the next one. Let's just go first through the queue and then I'll make a suggestion. Sergio.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you, Chair. I will be speaking in Spanish. This is Sergio Salinas Porto for the record. I think that Holly hit the right key or pushed the right button in that she has showed us all the right direction or the right path to follow.

My role as an ALAC member is to try to distribute or circulate feedback among my colleagues every time something happens in ALAC. Every time there is a vote call or a call for participation I circulate that among my list. I have always done so whenever I have been able to participate.

If I have failed to do so I have simply sent something, sort of a cold-blooded message, and I got nothing in reply. So I think that part of our role as an ALAC member is to circulate something in our list and wait to have enough or sufficient feedback.

On a separate note, except for voting procedures that have to do with accepting ALSs, which to my mind are not very useful, all the other material is circulated with or through the list. So this is what I usually



do. My point is if we do that, then it is likely that somebody will become engaged and will participate regarding things that happen within ALAC.

The secretariat has an issue. The thing is that in our region we have very few English speakers, so that email is overlooked or bypassed and it will be read only by those that are proficient in English or whose mother tongue is English. But in the rest of cases, it's not going to be read. It'll be simply overlooked.

So the point is the chair or secretariats should draft this in plain language that will be understandable by people that are not fully knowledgeable in technical aspects. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

In response to Holly's suggestion I was looking at one of the pages that Matt very kindly puts together when there is a new public comment starting up. What he does is to do a cut and paste from the public comment request. There are two small parts which might be helpful, then when issuing a call for comments within our lists to include in the mail that we send out.

There is a purpose brief and there is current status. For example, the At-Large use of a drawing for prioritizing New gTLD Applications Workspace, Purpose Brief, an equitable and reliable method is required for prioritizing new gTLD applications to meet Root Zone Scaling requirements and enable timely processing of applications through contract execution and pre-delegation testing.



---

So maybe including this cut and pasted when we do send the request out would be a thing that's helpful without imposing a huge amount of work on staff or on the chair. Next is Rinalia.

RINALIA ABDUL RAHIM:

Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Rinalia Abdul Rahim for the transcripts. I like Holly's suggestion very much. I think that at the regional level, at least in the AP RALO calls that I have been participating in, there is very little policy discussion. A lot of it is mostly administrative. Whenever we go through the agenda, the policy development that we always revisit in the ALAC meeting, that's sort of glossed over so there's very little value for the community.

If there is a bottom up proposal in terms of agenda item, that would be great but I think it needs to be solicited before the call and participation needs to be mobilized. I think this is where the secretariat needs to come in. I'd like to ask Pavan to say a few words in terms of how he has experienced it and if he has any suggestions. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Pavan Budhrani.

PAVAN BUDHRANI:

During the AP RALO calls, as mentioned by Rinalia, they say it's very administrative in process. Before the calls—I would suggest maybe one or two weeks before the AP RALO calls—we would reach out and try to get staff involved to see what the policy issues are at ALAC level, what information would be needed by AP RALO, and that would probably



---

make the calls more instructive in that way. Maybe setting the agenda two weeks before the AP RALO call would be a good idea for that. Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Pavan. Holly?

HOLLY RAICHE: I think I'd add to that and not just ask the staff what interests them. I think I'd ask our members what interests them as well.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Heidi and then Fatimata.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. This is Heidi for the record. Two things. I think two weeks might be a little bit too far in advance because things are changing a lot, particularly for the AP RALO, which is basically twelve hours prior to the ALAC meeting, so you might want to do that a little bit closer when the ALAC agenda is developed, but very much so.

At-Large staff will work with Pavan and the leadership to develop the agendas. We might draft to propose the agenda, but then it's always obviously up to you what you would like on your agendas.

We would like to stress that if we could have the agendas at least three or four days prior to the meeting... In the past we have followed up with the RALO leaders and sometimes we get them the day of the meeting. It's stressful for us, but it's also you're doing an injustice to your ALSs



because there's no way that they can see the agenda and understand the issues if they only have a moment's notice on the agenda.

The second point is if you look into your AC chat, at least for the AP RALO region, is approximately two years ago upon the request of AP RALO we created an AP RALO Policy Development page. If you click on that you'll see that not much activity has taken place.

Wolf, I think your RALO has a similar page that was created a couple of years ago. There was activity for a while, but I think that that has been in disuse as well, so again, perhaps if you, the RALOs would like to see such pages, we can easily develop them, but also then please use them.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Heidi. There's a queue building up again. Wolf, I know you put your hand up. You've spoken less than Holly so let's do Wolf.

WOLF LUDWIG: Okay. It's Wolf Ludwig speaking. I'll try to catch a little bit up now. From the lessons learned—let's put it that way—I became rather hesitant over the years to offer tools or anything technical, but might be meant in the best way, but I'm not sure whether there will be a demand.

My experience in the RALOs, we tried out many fancy things over the last year of how to encourage them, how to motivate them, blah, blah, blah. Sometimes where it's where some are response the next three weeks saying, "Oh, great."

Four months later, nobody cared about. Therefore, I became very reluctant, hesitant, and I say, "If somebody stands up telling me we



---

need...” then I say, “Okay, let’s start a discussion how it can be designed, how it can be promoted, blah, blah, blah, and let’s do it then.”

But I think it doesn’t make a lot of sense to play kindergarten and to offer a new fancy tool to the community what may be commanded to have it, but it finally doesn’t prove to be very useful. Therefore, let’s concentrate on other ideas, methods how we can strengthen the motivation.

I think it’s a social, it’s a cultural phenomenon and it’s not a technical issue. Therefore, please forgive me. I tend to be a little bit cynical. I don’t mean it negative, but I think let’s ask the right questions. Let’s come up with appropriate answers and we will be closer to the realities than just reinventing new circles and having some technical ideas. Thanks.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Wolf. Fatimata.

FATIMATA SEYE SYLLA: Thank you, Olivier. Fatimata speaking. That enables us to wake up a little bit. I’m going to speak French. I think that the question is more complex than that. It goes quite deep.

There were several initiatives that were made that were tried out in our area of the world. We did include our agenda with some information point. This was capacity-building, really. We tried to motivate ALSs much more and we do just like NORALO is doing. We do send



---

announcements on the list when we believe it's important and necessary.

And I agree with Holly regarding the short messages, the short descriptions. At the NORALO levels we have to think at our own level of what we can do more to motivate our people better. It's not easy, just like Wolf said. Sometimes it's a little bit disappointing or discouraging but we have to do it in our area locally and work in agreement with ALAC.

In each and every region we have a representative. We have several representatives at ALAC and the policies that are being discussed, the issues that are being debated in monthly meetings, we can have those debates with those members.

Rinalia said that we discuss policies. I don't think we need to discuss policy in advance. It's going to be quite difficult. That would be ideal, but it's going to be difficult to do that in advance and to wait for the agenda, if I understand correctly, and then wait for the ALAC At-Large agenda to discuss it and then to go through the information. This is not an easy task.

My recommendation is for us, the RALOs, to take this role of a strong motivation of our members, what type of incentives we can give. What can we do about it? Thank you.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Fatimata. I've got Dev in the queue, Oksana and then Alan. I think we need to cut the conversation short after that because we have Denise



---

Michel, who has made it to explain to us, maybe give us one of the answers of what we've been trying to find. Dev?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you. Dev Anand Teelucksingh speaking. I guess there's something at the very start of all of this. You said that the information from the Announce List should be pushed to the RALOs. I guess I'm a little confused about something because I was under the impression that all the ALSs subscribe to the ALAC Announce List. Isn't that so? And if so, are they notified already?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. Who is on the Announce List?

MATT ASHTIANI: Hi, this is Matt Ashtiani. It's the ALAC and the regional leaders.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: So Matt, you're telling us that only the ALAC and regional leaders are on the Announce List, not everyone?

MATT ASHTIANI: Yes. Everyone would be subscribed to the worldwide list, but the ALAC list is for the ALAC and the regional leaders. The regional leaders are included on that list because it was thought it would help disseminate the information to the RALOs.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: So the ALAC Announce List is the Announce List just for the ALAC and regional leaders. To reach the widest membership possible, then it's the At-Large list that one would have to use. Is that correct?

MATT ASHTIANI: The Announce List has essentially the same membership as the ALAC list.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Everyone is waving at me. I don't know what's going on. Let's do an action item. Check what the membership is on each one of these lists because we need to be sure about this. You just did it. So the ALAC Announce List has got the same people as the ALAC Working List.

MATT ASHTIANI: For those two I'll get you the list of who's on it and who's not because that'll just be easier.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, thank you. Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Can the action item be find out who is subscribed on each mailing list of the At-Large? We need to know because when I send the message on a list I need to know who is on.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yes, thank you, Tijani. If you go at the bottom of the message it has a link to the dashboard of that list. You click on there and there's one place which says, "Find out the members of this list." It is available only to the people who are members and have a password of this list. You click on this, you type in the details, and you can find the membership of that list yourself. A seldom-known feature.

We're going to have to close this very soon. Just Yaovi and then one last question that I will ask. Then Oksana as well, sorry. And Alan.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Yaovi speaking. There is the Beginner's Guide for ALAC. I think there is a page where you have the information about all the lists so maybe what is important to see if it is updated. I know that we have an explanation on the various lists that we are using on that page, so what is needed to do is to update that list. There is something new. If everybody goes you shall see who should be on which list.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you. Oksana?

OKSANA PRYKHODKO: Thank you, Mr. Chair. Oksana Prykhodko for the record. I just would like to support Wolf and I'm sure that everybody who is really interested in translation can find the technical solution for such translation.

Our task is really how you can do it. For example, I am absolutely sure that Russian speaking community is interested in public reports, but I can't send to Russian-speaking communities this message. If I will have



---

one, three sentences, explanation for his ideas in absolutely simple English language I can translate it into Russian and so everybody interested can translate it into Russian for himself. Thank you.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** Yes, thank you, Oksana. That's what the purpose thing is on the page. I see Sebastien as well, but first Alan because he's been waiting for a while.

**ALAN GREENBERG:** Two quick ones. First, a reminder. Remember how difficult it is to get ALAC members and the regional leaders, the people who come to every ICANN meeting to get involved in working groups. We have very, very little participation. It's always going to be harder to get the people who haven't seen an ICANN to get involved in these obscure topics so let's focus on reality and not be too unrealistic.

If anyone watched me, I used to send messages to the ALAC list and to the worldwide At-Large list. I don't do the latter anymore because I would pretty much only get the usual suspects coming out and it would just annoy people more than anything else, so let's try to be realistic about what our targets are in these cases.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** Thank you, Alan. Next is Sebastien Bachollet.



---

**SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET:** Thank you. I'm going to speak in French. To answer and add new elements to what was asked by Oksana, there's a document that was commented upon and which is going to be approved by the board, I hope, on Thursday afternoon regarding language services, regarding translation, interpretation and so on and so forth.

One point of this document is how to write the first document in English, and in English that is understandable by many people with a summary at the beginning. I hope this document is going to help out with translation issues and language issues.

The second point—you're going to see it with Denise in a few minutes—myICANN.org is a better version and you can access per language all the documents being published in a specific language. I think it's going to help out quite a lot.

When everything will be implemented if we have to change a few elements, please let us know and this is through the Public Participation Committee to do this work. Thank you very much.

**OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:** Before closing off I have one last question which is going to be a yes or a no answer. If you go to [www.icann.org](http://www.icann.org) you will find on the bottom left hand side a Stay Connected box. The Stay Connected box has got the ability to subscribe yourself to news alerts, newsletter, compliance newsletter and policy update. These are particularly important lists because they actually allow for people to be able to be connected.

I have heard some suggestions that the ALAC list should be subscribed to these as standard. The news alerts, by the way, is whenever there is



---

new public comment coming out it gets sent to this. You receive a notification of it should the ALAC list be subscribed to this. Evan?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH:

Hi, Olivier. It's Evan. I think I made one of the original ideas to try and subscribe us to a group which would say that every individual needing to subscribe individually, my suggestion would be, if possible, to have this subscribed to the Announce List because these notices by and large and not meant to be replied to.

These particular kinds of notices are one way and would be suitable for an announce list, but not for an interactive one, and if somebody's trying to keep up on what's going on this would seem to be a reasonable place for it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND:

Okay, thank you very much, Evan. Since we've run out of time, any other answers will be provided by email, please, to staff or to myself.

We now have Denise Michel, and sorry about the short delay, but I understand you might actually have the answers to all the questions we've been asking for the past hour and a half, which, in a way, is a shame because we could have had a coffee in the meantime without talking about these things.

But then again, if you have a solution, it's always welcome. So, welcome and please take us through the myICANN website.

DENISE MICHEL:

Thank you. I'd be happy to. I haven't been here to hear all of your questions, but I'll give you a quick run through of myICANN and then I'd be happy to answer any questions.

As Fadi indicated—it was yesterday; it seems like so long ago, Monday morning when he unveiled this—myICANN.org is a new web-based portal. It's intended to be a multi-stakeholder information-sharing platform in its first phase to provide you the information from across the thousands of web pages that comprise ICANN, including over 15 different entities that have microsites or websites within the ICANN community.

It pulls the information from all of those areas and organizes them into topic streams and group streams so you have the ability to more easily keep up to date on the most recent information that's being posted on the public web pages of ICANN.

MyICANN.org does not replace ICANN.org. The primary ICANN.org remains the primary website for ICANN, the Archive, the place where newcomers go, the place where you conduct research. Information in myICANN.org actually will only be there for about 90 days. The intention here is to catch the latest information in the various streams.

Especially for those remote, but I invite people in the room as well, if you have your laptop or iPhone or iPad or Nexus or Android, to hop on [www.mycann.org](http://www.mycann.org) and follow along.

Myicann.org is designed for use in all mobile devices. It's also a low bandwidth application to ensure use in developing countries. Let me help take it through a test drive so you can get a sense, for those of you



---

who have not yet signed up. By the way, since we launched it yesterday morning, we have now 500 user accounts on ICANN.org and about 7,000 page hits a minute.

This is the home page you'll see when you sign in if you don't have an account. You don't have to have a user account with myICANN.org. You can simply use it as a portal and browse topics and groups of interest and look at the calendar entries.

If you click on the Create an Account and simply enter your name, time zone and email address and click this you'll get an email that then asks you to create a simple password and then gives you a menu of choices. You can select your time zone, you can check all the different topics and groups that you want to be kept apprised of and receive emails about.

So you have two ways of getting information from myICANN. You can go to the portal here or you can sign up for emails on just the topics that you want to be kept apprised of. You can get these emails daily or once a week. You have a whole variety of options.

Also, after you create an account you have access to additional features. For example, it allows you when you're looking at an article or a posting of interest you can save it. It creates a My Saved Articles space on myICANN.org and you'll see it right there next to groups. It'll say My Saved Articles. You can start saving things here for reading or referring to later.

It also allows you to forward information or articles to other people via email. It allows you print things like that. So very simple to create an account.



---

Let's go to All Topics now. We've seeded myICANN with, of course, the streams for each group within ICANN including, of course, the At-Large Advisory Committee, the At-Large Community and GNSO, all the SOs, advisory committees and the board and then we've seeded them with some initial topic streams that we thought would be of particular interest to the ICANN community and Toronto.

We are very eager to get your feedback and input and what additional topics you'd be interested in seeing on myICANN. We've purposely released this as a beta to get the community's input and advice on how to build out additional features and which additional topics to add.

Let's click on one of these items.

[background conversation]

DENISE MICHEL:

Sorry, I already clicked on IDNs but you can go to myICANN yourself and check out WHOIS.

iSo, Internationalized Domain Names. You click on IDNs and you'll see some of the latest postings on ICANN's website on this topic. It includes meetings related to IDNs that are happening here in Toronto, a lot of meetings that are happening here in Toronto. Here's a NORALO event related to IDNs, some additional At-Large activities that are occurring here. Quite a bit of At-Large activities.

It looks like I clicked on a topic that's of particular interest to you.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: No, Denise—it’s Olivier here—that’s the subject we treat the least, actually, so you could imagine how much more work we do on other things.

DENISE MICHEL: I know, so an ironic aside, when we first started activating feeds, pulling things from very select pages on the ICANN website, we activated a number of At-Large pages and wiki pages and then we carefully deselected a lot. There was so much information, so many postings. Too much, so we took a number off and then were very carefully select parts of wiki pages on.

The intention here is to capture really the most relevant and important information for each group in each topic stream. We don’t want to know every time someone adds a yes plus one to a wiki page or tells us that a meeting is starting half an hour later. You can imagine the challenge in refining our feeds to get really useful and timely information.

So, you click on IDNs, click on a topic. Here I clicked on Phase 3 IDN Variant TLD Program. There’s been a recent post on this program. It’ll give you a blurb about what this posting is about and it will always give you a link back to the original source so it’ll always take you back to the appropriate place on ICANN.org for additional information and then it gives you a little bit more about what this topic is about.

The page will always contain a little grey box that says More Like This and it has a powerful backend server called Attensa Streamserver that



---

will do keyword searches and put together additional postings with myICANN that may be of interest based on what you clicked on.

As I mentioned, once you sign up for an account you have the option of saving a particular article you're on, emailing it, printing it and getting a link.

Going over to the calendar on myICANN, as you can see under Calendars, we've included in the myICANN Master Calendar the calendar events for all the major SOs and ACs as well as for the board. All the ICANN Toronto activities are here. The start and end dates of the public comment periods are here, and then we also seeded one topic calendar to give you a sense of the possibilities here. We'd like to hear more from you about what additional calendars you might like to see.

A calendar event is, on this calendar, color coded. If you click on an event the box will open giving you just the basic information about the event, title date, where, calendar source, the URL. Again, it takes you back to ICANN.org and the page for this event. It tells you a little bit about it. That's the case for every event we have on the master calendar. So it's nice and you can see what's happening in Toronto as well.

You can click on different calendars to see only those calendars. This gives you the GNSO Events Calendar. Then at the bottom of every calendar you'll see the iCow tag. You can click on that and then automatically download a particular calendar stream to your own laptop calendar.



---

Once you do that then it automatically synchs those calendars. Let's say you synch the ALAC Calendar or the GNSO Calendar to your laptop calendar, if any changes are made in those events, the change will automatically be made on your laptop calendar as well. We don't yet have the ability for you to synch a particular event, but right now you can synch calendar streams.

A couple other things I want to point out before I take questions, on the home page we just have a rolling list of the most recent All Topics that are posted through myICANN. We feature a key opportunity for feedback right here, which is a link to the Internet Governance and ICANN ecosystem maps that Fadi has asked for the community to provide feedback on. You can click there and provide input. We also have featured key events and items that are coming up on the calendar as well.

As rich as this is, it only Phase 1 for the myICANN project. Fadi's vision here is to make it immediately useful for the community to get information and stay on top of ICANN activities from across the broad community.

His vision for Phase 2 and Phase 3 is to go from an information portal to a collaboration portal as well and then Phase 3 would be incorporating operational and administrative services in the portal as well, sort of a one-stop shop, if you will, for your interaction with ICANN.

Phase 2 will include a new method of collaborating through conference calls and web-based collaborative systems. Phase 3 involves some of the operational services that ICANN provides to members of the community. You'll hear more about that as we continue and we'll be



seeking, obviously, At-Large’s input as well as other community members as we roll out our collaborative tools in the future.

Newsletters, it seems like an obvious direction to go in the future is to... Well, right now all the newsletters that we’re putting out, the subjects are parsed and put into the appropriate stream. The Compliance Newsletter comes through on the GNSO and the gTLD stream. It also comes through on the registrar and registry streams, those articles in there. The Policy Newsletter is parsed by Supporting Organization, Advisory Committee Group as well as topic group and you’ll see those articles in the streams.

It will likely raise the question in the future, depending on the adoption of myICANN, whether you need separate newsletters if you are constantly giving people immediate information about the latest activities, so that’s something we’ll be exploring in the future.

Other issues that you talked about before I got here that you would like me to address in the context of myICANN?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Denise. I see Eduardo waving his hand so I gather yes, there are. Eduardo Diaz.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Chair. This is Eduardo Diaz. Maybe I missed it but I didn’t see a search box somewhere.



---

DENISE MICHEL: There is a search box, and you know what else I forgot to show you, and it's very important, especially for At-Large, is News in Your Language. We also stream all the documents and postings that occur in the five additional UN languages besides English. They're right here and you can also sign up for those to be delivered in your email address.

[background conversation]

DENISE MICHEL: No, just by language—the five UN languages—which is the methodology we use on the ICANN.org site.

I'm looking at the search tool, which we have. I think it's activated by signing in. You also then get a search bar when you click on a topic and you can do your general keyword searches.

I think I also forgot to mention that the bottom of every single page in myICANN is a Contact Us and that's the button we're asking people to use to give us feedback if they run across any bugs. But equally important, if they have suggestions of additional features you'd like to see here and topics you'd like us to incorporate in the future, we're considering all those comments and really encourage you to provide that.

So create an account and let me know how that search feature works for you. Other questions?



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Evan?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Hi. This is Evan. I have a quick question about the Calendar function. I've been relying for an awfully long time on the calendar stuff that ICANN has been doing. Is this a replacement? A supplement for what already exists? Bringing it together? Because I've been relying on what I've had there, so is that going away in favor of this or is it a supplement?

DENISE MICHEL: Like ICANN.org, as with that, it's a supplement. The intention here is simply to pull all of the calendars together into one place from all the different sources and the sources aren't going away. The GNSO will still maintain a GNSO calendar; At-Large will still have its calendar.

Actually, At-Large is the only community that has, I think, a Google-based calendar that allows you through Google to download the calendar events. No other supporting organization or advisor committee has that option.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: And how lucky they are because ever since I've been on that I've received hundreds and hundreds of messages all the time. Then again, it is helpful, so thank you, Gisella, for filling up my calendar. Cintra Sooknanan.



---

CINTRA SOOKNANAN: Hi. Thank you. My question is similar to Evan's in that how does this relate to the wiki?

DENISE MICHEL: I'm sorry, did you say how it's related to the wiki?

CINTRA SOOKNANAN: Yeah. Is it just to be used with ICANN wiki or do you actually have wiki tools?

DENISE MICHEL: Yeah, it's intended to be used in conjunction with ICANN.org and the wikis that are associated with that. At this point it's not replacing those at all. Rather, it's pulling selected information from your wiki. I think, in particular, the page that myICANN.org pulls from in particular in the At-Large wiki space is the wiki page where you post your final decisions and position statements and things like that.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Okay, and last question from Oksana Prykhodko.

OKSANA PRYKHODKO: Thank you, Mr. Chair. I'm Oksana Prykhodko. I have no question but I have a very short comment. I did subscribe to this email but the first one I will receive on Saturday, but today I received ICANN Policy Review in Russian and thought it was time. It was really useful because all abbreviation were not translated. It's very important to understand what is going on, but the bad thing is there was no ALAC news in it.



---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Oksana. Just for the record, how do you translate International Corporation for Addresses, Names and Numbers in Russian?

OKSANA PRYKHODKO: Actually, a lot of Russian-speaking translate this, says ICANN. It's very rude translation, but they say so.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Very rude, oh, dear. Okay, well, interesting. I think we've run out of time for this session.

I thank you very much, Denise, for passing by to show us this. It's been very helpful and I think that this community is going to welcome this new tool very much since we're all about communication and all about collaboration. Thank you.

DENISE MICHEL: I'm happy to do it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: And with this long, long session, we're going to close the current meeting and to start the Registrant Rights and Responsibilities Working Group in a moment. Alan, you wanted to touch on something before we close.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: I just wanted to ask are you pushing the comment statement on how to comment to the board to Friday at this point now? To the email cancelling? Just tell me and I'll follow your lead.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Yes, the issue of how to comment. The commenting period on how to comment asked and we are asked to comment on how to comment so -

ALAN GREENBERG: I can send a URL -

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Alan has prepared a text, reading some feedback. Some people have said it's worthless commenting on how to comment. Some have said it's useful to comment on how to comment.

I think that in the absence of anyone objecting and therefore not commenting on how to comment, then you could comment. And the comment that you've made is the right comment to put to the comment period.

[End of Transcript]