
BUENOS AIRES – Glossary Update Session
Tuesday, November 19, 2013 – 10:15 to 11:45
ICANN – Buenos Aires, Argentina

MALE SPEAKER: This is the Glossary Update Session in Libertador C Tuesday, November 19th at 10:15 AM. This is the Glossary Update Session in Libertador C on Tuesday, November 19th, at 10:15 AM.

NORA ABUSITTA: Okay, good morning everybody. My name is Nora Abusitta. I'm VP of Public Responsibility Programs at ICANN. Thank you for those who are participating remotely, and for those who are here. This session is a working session which follows up on a project that we started about six months ago. I thought it would be worthwhile to start the session with just a couple of comments on Language Services. If we can move on the slides; I don't know who has the control of the slides.

So, the main goal of Language Services is to help inform as many people as possible. The focus is not just a linguistic focus; it's also a cultural focus. It's also a perspective focus. So how can we reach as many people as possible in their own languages, to ensure that should they choose to participate, they can participate in an informed manner? And for an organization like ICANN, where the bottom up process is very important, reaching people in their own language is critical.

We started the Glossaries Project in an interesting way. We had a couple of complaints from community members that they felt the

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

terminology that we used in Language Services did not reflect the way terms are used in their own countries or in their own industries.

So the complaints were not really about the quality of language itself, but about preferential usage of certain terms. So we actually saw that as an opportunity to review all the glossaries used by Language Services in ICANN and to start a project with the community, where every language expert would be responsible to review all the glossaries, with the help of community volunteers. And many thanks to all of those who volunteered from the community. Now Christina, if you can please introduce the language experts and talk a little bit about what their responsibilities are before we move on to the actual terms.

CHRISTINA RODRIGUEZ:

Hello. For the transcript, my name is Christina Rodriguez. And I am the manager of the ICANN Language Services Department. We have today, very happily, a fabulous group of language experts who work and lead the different languages within the department. We have Jessie Doherty. She is the Chinese Language Expert and Head Interpreter for ICANN. Maya Smundak, she leads the Russian Language Experts. Sabrina Mosquera, she is a Spanish Language Expert and Head Interpreter. And Maria Vilardo is our French Language Expert and Head Interpreter.

We also have in the panel Sawsan Aldawodi who is one of our interpreters for the Arabic English language there. She's been working with us on the glossary and helping us on everything related to terminology in that language. They've been with ICANN, most of them been with ICANN quite a while, so they are very familiar with terminology, with acronyms, with the jargon and the issues, and subject

matter within ICANN. It was a great idea since interpreters are, in most cases, translators or language experts who became also interpreters.

We thought a great opportunity on bringing them on board so they could use their knowledge. The knowledge they acquire as interpreters already and help us in our work as a language expert for the department.

Their duties or their responsibilities within the department relate to glossaries, of course, and establishing certain terminology and ensuring that there will be consistency when we translate documents. They will also be looking and working on the quality assurance process for translations, so that we make sure that our translations are more or less the same in regards to consistency and regards to terminology and so on.

At the same time, they lead the team as head interpreters and anything that is related, of course, to terminology, translation, and everything related to the language that they own, they distribute and share with their colleagues or the person that they are the leaders for in the interpreters' teams. They will be also working very closely with the community in trying to find consensus when it comes to terminology, so that we can make sure that we provide, or that we are using terms when in translations, that the community and the people there are listening to and using, are comfortable with it and familiar with.

Translation is not only that. As Nora said before, it has to do with culture and sometimes we just need to localize and not translate to make sure that we are able to provide or to reflect the same message

for the other communities or community members from other countries. So with that said...

NORA ABUSITTA:

So going back to the project itself, this project was handled in several phases. The first phase, obviously, was to look at what we had and invite the community to participate. The next phase after this working session will be to publish the draft of the glossaries, and basically we look forward to everybody's comments. We've created an e-mail address for the glossaries, so it's glossaries@icann.org. So anybody from the community that wants to give input on the usage of certain terms is more than welcome to reach out to us. And we're hoping that the glossaries will be published by the end of next week. So let's start with Spanish.

SABRINA MOSQUERA:

Good Morning. For the record, my name is Sabrina Mosquera. I am the Spanish expert in the ICANN Language Department. We will start presenting the terms that are to be debated after the review of the glossaries. Some of the modifications that have been proposed by the members of the communities I've already incorporated into the glossary, and now we want to debate these terms that we see on the screen. First of all, there is a proposal regarding the term Dominio de Alto Nivel (or [domain and sublevel] domain). This was a proposal that was proposed by one of the members of the Review Team.

When it comes to this term, we believe that there is no lack of understanding or there is no problem in terms of understanding the

terminology. And within the ICANN terminology, the term top-level domain (or Dominio de Alto Nivel) is used in the New gTLD Program launched by ICANN which is a very important program. This is a term appearing on the Applicant Guide for the top-level domain applicants. So we believe we are going to use the term Dominio de Alto Nivel so as not to generate confusion among the users, taking into account the importance of the program.

Then we have the term in English, phishing. This is a very technical term. For a long time, the translation being used by the community and by different members of the Spanish speaking community was Suplantación de Identidad. Regarding this, we know that the phishing term, as well as spoofing, and many other various, specific terms refer to technical and specific issues on the Internet, generate confusion. Therefore, the proposal presented by our review team is accepted and we will leave these terms in English and in italics, because they are well known by the Internet community in English. So phishing will be left in English and in italics.

And finally, we have Representational State Transfer (RESTful) in English. Our translation is Transferencia de Estado Representativo. Transferencia de Estado Representacional was proposed. Both translations are being used. However, given the fact that Representacional, in Spanish, is not the term being used in the [speaking Spanish] and given the fact that Transferencia de Estado Representativo is understood as it is by the technical community, we have decided to keep this version, Transferencia de Estado Representativo. These are the terms that were to be debated with the

community in terms of the Spanish glossary. The rest of the suggestions were very welcome and accepted. We thank you for your participation.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you Sabrina. I don't know. I think we should have a discussion of the terms after every language instead of leaving it all until the very end. So does anyone here have any comments about these terms? Or maybe any of the remote participants have any comments? Okay, great. So we can move on to the next language. Which one are we doing next? French.

MARIA VILARDO:

Good morning to all of you who might be listening on the Internet remotely. Let's wait until we can get headsets for everybody. Good morning. I'm going to speak about the review that was done, the revision of the glossary in French. We did receive some comments from many volunteers that helped us out and those comments were very well received because they are coming from ICANN members who are real experts in the area. And I did sum up in my slide, the few comments that we did receive.

We have an acronym of GNSO/ccNSO. The comment was that the article in front of the acronym, the suggestion was that in the community we say "the GNSO" and this is the way we do translate at ICANN.

Since it is an acronym and an organization, we do think that the correct way of doing it is to apply the rule with acronyms which is that we're going to take the first term, the first word of the acronym and take its gender and apply the gender to the article, La or Le. This is the term

which is used in the community, and we do think in our case, we are linguists, we have to apply the rules of our language. We're going to keep using La GNSO.

Another remark regarding the term ICANN. ICANN is an acronym. In the community and in other organizations, we have a tendency to say ICANN just like the name of a company; just like you could say Siemens or you could say Nokia. This is not the case. This is an acronym. This is not the name of a company. Once again, let's apply the rules for acronyms in our language. That's why we say L'ICANN instead of ICANN, without an article. I wanted to let you know why we do use those article.

The third point was, Étiquette vs. label. This is used for domain names. And in that case, we can use the name in English, Label, [speaking French], different pronunciations. In some translations, we do use Étiquette but we would like to have more comments from the community regarding the use of Étiquette vs. label; more comments coming from our experts.

We have Chaîne vs. terme, when you talk about a string. For instance, string contention, string similarity; the issues with the different strings. We have translated it with [speaking French]. Strings translated with [speaking French]. We have been suggested to use terme. It would be clearer in French to use similarity of term to translate the French translation.

Fifth point, engagement center. You know that ICANN is becoming more and more internationalized and is opening some engagement centers to have more participation. And the issue that we do have is with the term

Engagement. What does it mean? Two definitions – to get involved in something, or to participate. There is a nuance there, and our choice was to talk more about participation. But we need more comments regarding those terms.

And lastly, Registrant in English, we have used it as it is in English. We used to say [registrant] with the French pronunciation, but we've been asked to change this into titulaire de nom de domaine. It's clearer, and this is what is used in the industry. So we're not going to [registrant] in French anymore. And instead, we're going to use titulaire de nom de domaine. I wanted to thank all the experts that did work on that because that was very much appreciated. Thank you very much.

LYNN LIPINKSI:

We have a comment. This is Lynn Lipinski, Remote Participation Manager and we have a comment from [inaudible] who is participating via Adobe Connect. The comment is that the brand abbreviation ICANN should be maintained across all languages and, I believe you mean, and not done differently in French. Can you address that, why that choice was made?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

I would say that ICANN is not a brand. If I understood well, he is talking about ICANN brand, but ICANN is not a brand, it's an acronym. Yes, using the article. That's what we said, that we have to use the article. Just should be ICANN. Yes, okay. Well, as it is an acronym, we think that we should apply the rule that says that acronyms, in French, take an article before.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Like many terms that are very ICANN-specific, also our job, as language experts, is to normalize certain approaches to translation or interpreting. There's many terms that actually come out of sessions like this or more technical sessions, and we familiarize people with them. And so I think the more we use L'ICANN, for example, the more people will be comfortable with things like that.

I actually have two comments about the French. One is a general comment about the engagement center, and specifically the word Engagement which has proved problematic not just for French, by the way.

And I belong, for example, to a department called the Global Stakeholder Engagement. And every time we try to translate our business cards, we ran into problems because you can't say [speaking French] doesn't quite get it. So we always look for community suggestions on what they see these engagement centers are, rather than literally translating the word Engagement. So we definitely invite everybody to give us suggestions about the word engagement. The second question to you I have is the following.

Now, we know with French in particular, some countries don't have a problem with using English terms in French, and others are more conservative about maintaining the French itself. So you can think of Canadian French vs. French French. What direction is ICANN in? Would we rather use English terms for terms that are not very familiar in the French language, or are we trying to find French equivalents? So are we

more open-minded about using English terms in French? Or are we trying to find French equivalents, and normalizing them?

FEMALE SPEAKER: That's the whole point in French. Honestly, because on one side, we've got what it's used in the community. And as there are many, many new terms, these terms have not yet been translated into French, and even French people tend to use the English words. So it's really a choice we will have to make about that. Some of the terms have been already translated. It's the case for [speaking French] Registrar, which is used in English but it is also used in French, [speaking French]. So it's a very, very interesting point. And I think the input from the community will be very important at this stage.

NORA ABUSITTA: Any more comments about French? No?

FEMALE SPEAKER: Well, I think I answered this correctly for [inaudible] but they had written in that they understand that ICANN is an acronym but their belief was that the acronym should not change over other languages. But I think you understood that point but they just want to clarify.

NORA ABUSITTA: Okay, so we move on to the next language please.

MAYA SMUNDAK: Hello, thank you very much for coming. First of all I would like to thank my community participants for their involvement in the project. I have had three people help me – Siranush Vardanyan, Michael Yakushev, and Alexander [inaudible]. They were very helpful with glossary and some of the explanations that helped define the terms. So, yes, it will be. Right. We'll do the rest of this in Russian and so we will stop interpretation for Russian, for now. Thank you. [Speaking Russian]

NORA ABUSITTA: Thank you. Quick comment about a couple of things. So the pronunciation of ICANN is interesting because I'm not sure if the French also has the same issue. I've heard it said ICANN or ICANN as well. But I'm just intrigued. Do they say iPhone or ePhone?

MAYA SMUNDAK: They say iPhone. iPhone.

NORA ABUSITTA: Okay. I think this is another term that we can familiarize people with, in the way we use is. And the more we use it in our interpreting booths, the more people become familiar with a certain pronunciation. Thank you. Thank you.

JESSIE DOHERTY: I'm sorry. This is Jessie Doherty, the Chinese language expert. And before I start, I would like to thank my community participants who really helped my development of the entire glossary and gave me a lot of useful comments and technical explanations to me, which is really,

really helpful. I would like to point out Dr. [inaudible] from Beijing Normal University. And she's just wonderful when we were trying to figure out the glossary. So as for the Chinese glossary, I have several points to make.

First of all, because in Chinese, we do not use Latin scripts, this way it will actually help us because we don't have the acronym issue because we use different scripts. This way, we will keep all the acronyms of ICANN. And as we know, ICANN has more than 200 acronyms. So that's actually a great part for Chinese because we don't need to worry about that. We just keep that in English, in the acronym form. The second part is that before the formal development of the entire Language Service Team, ICANN used to send out all the documents for ICANN to different kind of vendors.

So, for different kind of vendors in America, they will come up with terms in their own way. Sometimes, several terms to a specific English term in ICANN. So that means they're already a lot of versions for some terms, such as like Registry, Stakeholder, there are already several terms. But also, because in China, Chinese authorities, such as CNNIC they would use ICANN's English documents and translate them into their own version. This causes another problem that we have several terms to a specific English term in China too. So that just gives a question now where we are determining which term to use, what to use – to use the term from ICANN translation, or to use the term from the Chinese authorities? So that's a problem.

Another point is that in ICANN, there are several terms which are really, really hard to translate. Or we can actually say they're not translatable

because we do not have the equivalent in Chinese, such as At-Large, and Engagement, things like that. And the fourth point would be that because Internet is changing so rapidly that there lot of new terms coming out that we actually did not, or have not created a proper translation for the community.

Now that all that community members are looking at us, the ICANN Language Team, to develop a version of translation, so that is a kind of a big burden to all of us. We need to really come up with a proper term for the new terms, such as Thick and Thin WHOIS. We have no idea what that means really. And another thing would be Adjacency Attestation, which is also a WHOIS term that is very, very difficult to translate. So that said, I would like to switch to Chinese, and our interpreters can stop working now. Okay. [speaking Chinese]

NORA ABUSITTA:

So no comments on the Chinese and unfortunately I can't comment either. But thank you Jessie. Thanks very much. Oh, there's a comment? So Sawsan will tackle the Arabic and what shows on the screen is one of the major issues we face with Arabic which is either that the script doesn't display. This is first time I see squares frankly, but it either displays in the wrong order, or it displays in funny fonts. So Sawsan, if you can start please.

SAWSAN ALDAWODI:

This is Sawsan Aldawodi. I am one of the Arabic interpreter and translators with ICANN. It was my pleasure and [inaudible] to be engaged with this project, maybe a little bit later of my other colleagues

but we did great job. I would like to thank the individuals with whom I work with, [inaudible], Mr. Tijani and supervised by Nora [inaudible] and my supervisor Christina, and Ricardo, of course.

I was asked to provide the most contested terms yesterday, but I could brief the main challenges that the Arabic interpreter and translator face while working on the material of ICANN, and one of them is the Arabic language is unique in many aspects and the abbreviation approach that used very widely in the English language cannot be applied in the Arabic.

Like, for example, I gave an example for ccTLD which is country code top-level domain. We translate it into [speaking Arabic]. So for this Arabic sentences, that cannot be [inaudible] in the slide which I will address this technical issues at the end. This is can't be adopted or implemented with the abbreviation approach. That's why, for this second point, we tend to keep the English abbreviations or the acronyms that used by the ICANN, assuming first that people who are addressed with these documents are familiar with these abbreviations and these English letters.

And if we have to, in some occasions, we can add a footnote at the bottom of each page explaining each term, although I [inaudible] myself in written translation when I write these English letters or abbreviations I try to write the translation in English and in what are these letters it refer to, and then I do the write the Arabic translation for it, of course. The second point, At-Large, it is referring to organizations on the international levels and all part of the world. If I have to translate that I need to write a paragraph to explain that. So also in these cases, or in

such cases, I used to maintain the English term that's used, like At-Large.

This is one of the example of many, of hundreds of examples that I am facing while translating. The most also contested terms that I am facing while translating the written documents I am assigned to do to work on is the Registry, which means in Arabic [speaking Arabic], and Registration [speaking Arabic], Registrar [speaking Arabic], and then the Registrant [speaking Arabic]. Few can be Arabic words that can't be – it's omitted although I remember I sent it yesterday. In Arabic language, we are using some other signs within the letters that affects the pronunciation, and then affects the meaning of the word at the end.

So I have to give it another thought and a double check and review before submitting the translation because I need to make sure that I use the right word and the right translation at the end and the right meaning meant to be.

Also, because of the Arabic language is written from the right side to the left side in the opposite way of the English, from the left to the right, it requires a specific hardware setting in the computer that I'm using, because when I have to include the English term within the Arabic sentence, it needs a specific movements and clicks on some keys to maintain that.

Although I do that but when I upload these things on the website – for example, the [inaudible] page within ICANN website – I'm facing problems because the order of the words are messed up. So the final sentence sometimes doesn't make sense when you read it. It looks very awkward, so that's why it needs to be addressed technically and some

technical steps need to be taken by people in charge, professional people [inaudible] in this kind of things to get the final, correct shape of the sentence, or the translation of the specific sentence. So this is the main issues that I'm faced within my work in translation, written translation of ICANN documents. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you very much Sawsan. We have had a problem throughout ICANN with Arabic script and Arabic translations, and unfortunately this was misinterpreted many times by the community as a neglect of Arabic language. And it's not the case. It's as you mentioned, technically Arabic script can be very problematic. And so we are going to seek the help of community members from the Arab world to put a list of guidelines and advice on people who are using Arabic script in their presentations or in their web announcements, for example, so that they can learn how to avoid the problems that come up with Arabic script.

I would like to thank everybody who participated remotely and who participated also in the work that our language experts did. I believe that after we publish this draft of the glossaries, we will seek your comments and then we will publish a final draft probably within a month. We are planning to review the glossaries once a year, not in a big project like this one, but just amongst ourselves. And we always look to the community for their suggestions and input. Thank you all.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]