EN

BUENOS AIRES – ccNSO Council Meeting
Wednesday, November 20, 2013 – 16:00 to 17:00
ICANN – Buenos Aires, Argentina

BRIAN CUTE: Today is Wednesday, November 20th. Local time is 4:00 pm at ICANN 48, Buenos Aires, in the La Pampa room. This is the ccNSO Council Meeting. Hello. Hi, the meeting has not started yet, so there's no audio to send to you yet, but I believe you can just wait here, and as soon as… Perfect. Will you be speaking to the group? Okay.

BYRON HOLLAND: Good afternoon everybody. It is the start of the Council Meeting for ICANN 48. Are you trying to tell me something? [laughter] Have we fixed the mics so they don't cut out every 30 seconds? Okay. Welcome to the ICANN 48 ccNSO Council Meeting and my first as Chair. I'll try to keep us all on track and on time. Lesley, I understand you're with us virtually. Are you there?

LESLEY COWLEY: I am indeed, Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay, well, I'm sure you'll keep me honest. Good to hear you. You've had a big week, announcements wise. What do you have for the back-half of this week?

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

EN

LESLEY COWLEY:	I thought I'd go and lie down somewhere.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Welcome. Before we get started I'd like to acknowledge two folks; Maureen Hillyard, who's over here. She'll be joining us in place of Cheryl, going forward. Cheryl couldn't make this her final meeting, unfortunately, so Maureen is going to stand in with observer status for this meeting, on behalf of Cheryl. So welcome. A little early, but welcome.
	I'd also just like to make note because we had somebody leave the Council between meetings, we do have a new Councilor from the NomCom, and that's Jordi Iparraguirre. He's obviously no stranger to the cc community. I'm sure we all remember him from the .cat days, and he's back around to join us. Welcome back.
	Okay. Onto the formal Agenda. Are there any apologies, Gabby?
GABBY SCHITTEK:	No. I'm sorry, there is an apology from Patrick Miles, the gNSO Liaison.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Okay, thank you. Agenda Item #2 is the minutes and actions. Gabby, could you walk us through the actions?
GABBY SCHITTEK:	Yes. We have action #8801. Gabriella Schittek to send a note to the Council with a link to the Council meeting preparation material on the ccNSO website. That's been done. Action #8802, the Secretariat to

arrange for the study group on use of names for countries and territories resolutions to be adopted on the Council email list. That's been completed.

Action #8803, the Secretariat to arrange for the resolution on appointing the volunteers for the joint ALAC ccNSO meeting to be adopted on the Council email list. This has been done. Action #8804, Hong Xue to send the Chair a copy of the ICANN Academy curriculum for the leadership training in BA. This has been done. Action #8805, Bart Boswinkel to follow up on the progress of the ccNSO statements on IANA delegation and redelegation of ccTLDs and on the geographic regions' Working Group report. This action has been overtaken by time.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Moving onto Item #3, updates. In terms of my role as Chair, I participated in a couple of events. First I was at the IGF, not in my role as Chair, but in my capacity as .ca manager. I was there for the entire event. During that event I also took part in some of the meetings that went on around Internet governance and the outcomes of the Montevideo statement.

There were several during that week, because it was quite organic in the way it took shape and formed. It started… The first meeting was probably less than 40 people. The second meeting was 200+ and the third meeting was much larger again. So over the course of that week this whole notion of the post-Montevideo environment really exploded organically. I sat in on some of those meetings.

I was also at the SO/AC Chairs' meeting on the Friday that precedes any ICANN meeting. That's an opportunity for the various Chairs to get together and talk about what's going on in their relative communities; to see if there are any common themes or issues where there might be some opportunity to work together, and really just to surface what we anticipate the issues of the week will be.

There was little uncertainty about what the primary issues of the week would be, which has proved to be true around the Montevideo statement, One Net and all the other issues around that. That's my update as Chair. Vice-Chair?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Thank you Byron. Since the last Council meeting I attended the Australian IGF meeting, went straight onto the Bali IGF, and covered most of the same meetings as Byron, in terms of the excitement in Bali over the future of Internet governance in Brazil and so on. Other than that, and being here, I've been continuing in my FOI work and also been pretty tied up with my ISOC Board role.

Interestingly, the ISOC and ICANN Boards will be meeting on Friday morning, and I think that's an indication of some greater harmonization between the two organizations. That's it from me. Thanks.

BYRON HOLLAND: Are there any Councilors… Perhaps starting from my left, are there any Councilor updates? Anybody from my left? Going, going… To my right, any Councilor updates?

SPEAKER: I'll just mention that on the 16th of October I participated in a global meeting of experts on the ethical aspects of the Information Society, organized by UNESCO in Riga. There I tried to explain the role of the ccTLD community; especially ccNSO, and I tried to stress some ethical aspects, the ones at least I could think of. I tried to explain the multistakeholder model of ICANN and its importance in Internet governance, and the importance of ccTLDs.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. [Rolaf]?

[ROLAF]: Thanks Byron. Well, you've all heard about the SOP, I think, and what I could call the exchange of letters. I went to the IGF as well and I attended the same lunchtime meetings about Internet governance. I also attended the one on Friday that marked the start of this coordination movement, mailing list of whatever we call it. My other point has been upgraded and it's now a point on the Agenda, so we'll get back to that one.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Any…

JORDI IPARRAGUIRRE: Just one brief comment – I just attended the ICANN Academy that was held here just before the ICANN meeting. I think that experience was

really valuable. We really learnt quite a lot, even though I have some experience in ICANN. What was more important was the exchange amongst the people from different areas of ICANN. That really brings quite a lot of value and I think it's something we have to follow quite closely, to really help them improve on the next additions.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Jordi. Young Eum Lee?

YOUNG EUM LEE: I just wanted to mention that KR hosted the APrIGF this September, and we're grateful that Fadi made time to come. It was a very well attended event in both the number of participants, and it was reported that the APrIGF seems to be growing.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. I'll take that as all the updates from the Councilors. Lesley?

LESLEY COWLEY: Like many others, I attended the IGF, as both a Nominet person and a ccNSO person. As others as well, I've been involved in the Finance Working Group and the SOP. I've also engaged in several offline email conversations about the outputs from both of those groups, and finally, with great thanks to everyone there, I've booked to go on my ccNSO-funded cookery course at the start of December, and I'll send you some pictures of whatever I manage to burn.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay. Thank you very much Lesley. Thus concludes the Councilors' update. Regional organization updates? [Katalina, Brack]? We'll need a mic. Thank you.

[KATALINA]: We've nothing to report because… Well, we did provide the updates about the regional organizations in our previous session, so I can…

BYRON HOLLAND: We'll do it for the record for the Council meeting though. It can be a brief version.

[KATALINA]: Excellent. We were part of the Organizing Committee of the LAC DNS Forum on the 15th of November. It was the first LAC DNS Forum held in the region and most ccTLDs in the region were here. Then we organized our legal meeting. It was the first time in two and a half years that LAC TLD has organized a legal meeting, on Saturday 16th, and we had great participation from nearly 20 registries. That was an interesting highlight.

There are other updates regarding our current work with the ICANN LAC strategy, both in terms of ccTLDs and LAC TLD, and they're available on the presentation I presented today before lunchtime. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you.

SPEAKER:	Thank you. On the AFTLD part we just concluded security training in Madagascar for about 26 officers from 12 African countries, with NSRC and ICANN, and ISOC as well. Right now we're working on DNSSEC on our ccTLD observatory project. We're also working with AFNIC, ICANN, LACTLD and CENTR on the same project. We're trying to build our one portal where you can get [town? 00:15:30] African ccTLDs. That's what we're up to at the moment.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Thank you.
DON HOLLANDER:	I'm Don Hollander from APTLD. The big news within APTLD is they have a new general manager.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Congratulations to APTLD.
DON HOLLANDER:	They have an old general manager too, and working on planning for next year, with a big focus on security and stability, the deployment of IDN, and focusing on business models.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Thank you. I know that Peter from CENTR has had to leave already. Are there any staff updates? Thank you. That's concluded Agenda Item #3. We'll move onto #4 – membership applications. [Rolaf]?

[ROLAF]:   Thank you Byron. We have two applications on the Agenda. One about
which I communicated with you last week, and one which I sent to you
yesterday evening; one from Estonia. Our colleagues from Estonia are
here. They're participating in the meeting. They're even in the room.
Hello!

I suggested that we'd approve both applications during this meeting, so
the first one for Vietnam and the second one for Estonia. That would be
member numbers 143 and 144 respectively. I've received no objections
so far.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay. We have a resolution in front of us. The resolution is that the
ccNSO Council approves the application of both .vn and .ee and
welcomes both .vn and .ee as members 143 and 144 respectively. Can
we have a vote on that? All in favor? Yes? Lesley? Thank you. It's
unanimous. Welcome. [applause] It's great to have you join us.

Okay, Item #6 – Final Report on the Joint ccNSO/gNSO IDN Working
Group. Young Eum, could you take this please?

YOUNG EUM LEE: Thank you Byron. I'd like to point out that this is Item #5, not #6. The
JIWG was formed as a joint effort of the ccNSO and the gNSO. We
identified three issues of common interest. One was the use of single
characters, the other was the use of variants. We've submitted final
reports on these two issues previously, and during this meeting we've

submitted our Final Report for the third issue, which is universal acceptance of IDNs.

It was recognized that the group participation was not active enough to go further with some loose ends that were left as a result of these Final Reports. So we have suggested that since this is the Final Report, on the third item, that we put this group to a close and we are awaiting your guidance on what to do next. The draft resolution that's in front of us is the one the gNSO will also be either accepting or not accepting. Would you like me to read the resolution, or…?

BYRON HOLLAND: Yes, for the record if you could read the resolution and just to enforce the point that as this is a Joint Working Group there are parallel resolutions in each of our SOs, and as Young Eum said, they'll be voting on a resolution extremely similar to this one.

YOUNG EUM LEE: Okay. A draft resolution: "The ccNSO Councilor adopts that JIWG Final Report on universal acceptance of IDN TLDs and its recommendations, and will submit it to the ICANN Board for its consideration. The ccNSO council thanks the JIWG for its work with special thanks to Jonathan [Friggs] for his contribution in proactively reaching beyond the ICANN community to address issues identified in the Report.

"The ccNSO Council recognizes that further work needs to be done in relation to IDNs, in particular, IDN variants and universal acceptance of IDNs, and asks the JIWG to put forward suggestions on how to deal with

these issues, and deliver these suggestions to the ccNSO Council by the ICANN Singapore meeting in March 2014.

"The ccNSO Council requests its Chair to inform the Chair of the gNSO of the decision of the ccNSO, and the Co-Chairs of the JIWG accordingly, and submit the report to the Board of Directors of ICANN, together with the Chair of the gNSO, when the Report of the JIWG is adopted by the gNSO."

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Young Eum. Can we have a vote on this resolution? All of those in favor? Unanimous here. Lesley? Thank you. It's unanimous and carried. Thank you very much Young Eum and the folks on that Working Group. A lot of very good work was done on that, so thank you. Moving onto Item #7 – the Final Report on the Joint DNS Stability and Security Analysis Working Group.

I'm going to speak on behalf of it for the Council. This is a Joint Working Group that involved ALAC, ccNSO, gNSO and NRO to better understand the security and stability of the global DNS. It was started back in 2011 and originally it had a task to, as they said, both to go fast and go deep. They broke that into two components – the first part, they did the fast part, and then they were going to go much deeper into the subject matter.

They produced the initial report, but during that time period another Board group was formed that had a significantly overlapping remit, and based on the recommendations of the Chairs of that Working Group

they have elected to cease their work after the production of the first report.

There is a resolution associated with that, and that resolution is – I'll read it for the record: "The ccNSO adopts the Report submitted by the Co-Chairs of the DSSA Working Group, as the Final Report of the DSSA Working Group in accordance with Section 2.4 of its Charter. The Chair of the ccNSO is requested to inform the Co-Chairs of the DSSA Working Group of the adoption of the Report by the ccNSO Council.

The Chair of the ccNSO is also requested to inform the Chairs of the other participating SOs and ACs. Finally, the ccNSO Council thanks and congratulates all, and in particular the Co-Chairs of the Working Group; Olivier Crépin-Leblond from the ALAC, Joerg Schweiger from .de, from our community, Mikey O'Connor from the gNSO, James Galvin from SSAC, and Mark Coster from the NRO, and all the volunteers and staff who helped with the effort." That's the resolution before us. Can I have…? Are there any comments?

[ROLAF]: Thank you. Maybe just to inform my fellow Councilors, I was a member of the Board's Risk Management Framework Working Group, which had the task to come up with a risk management framework; not to identify the risk or check what measures are currently being taken to counter those. Although there was potential overlap, I think it could have been dealt with differently.

I don't think we have another option now to approve the resolution, but I still think it's a pity that it went this way, because I think we all

remember that this Working Group partly originated from some alarming remarks that ICANN's previous CEO made during the Nairobi ICANN meeting. If you look at the objectives of DSSA, I think there would have been room to work on those.

That work still has to be done, to identify the risk and identify the measures that are presently taken to cover those risks. So I'm not too happy about this development, but I think there's nothing else we can do now than approve their report. Maybe we should have a discussion one day on how we can move this forward.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you for that context, [Rolaf]. I'd certainly like to call out our peer, Joerg, for the work he did on our behalf in that Working Group. With that said, we have the resolution before us. All of those who support…? Lesley? Thank you. That's unanimous. Thank you very much. Resolution is passed.

Before we get to Item #8 you'll probably see there is an inherent conflict in the Chair chairing his own Report, so at this stage I'm going to pass the chairmanship of the meeting itself to my Vice-Chair, Keith.

KEITH DAVIDSON: Thanks Byron. Chairing Item #8 on the Agenda, the Final Report of the Finance Working Group, can I invite the other Byron Holland, as Chair of the Finance Working Group, to take us through this Item? Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thanks Keith. I'll put on my other hat right now. As has been much discussed, the Finance Working Group is coming to the end of its work after roughly two and a half years, 13 meetings and presentations at every ccNSO meeting since its inception. It's been a fairly long journey but certainly a very robust one, and I think came to the conclusions required as per the mandate of the Working Group itself.

Its primary mandate is included in the document here. I won't read that out, but I think it's safe to say that there's been fulsome and robust discussion right up until the end, and all of that discussion and input has, without a doubt, created the best available solution. So I thank everybody for their input over time. There are a couple of important links within the document that I'd encourage you to take a look at if you have the chance.

As such, we've posted the Final Report, and there is a resolution associated with that Report. I'll read the draft resolution. "The ccNSO Council notes and welcomes the exemplary long and intensive consultation efforts and process the Finance Working Group went through to gather input and feedback from the community. The ccNSO Council notes and welcomes the letter from ICANN's CEO and President on the overall level of financial contributions and the voluntary nature of the contributions.

"The ccNSO adopts the proposed November 2013 Guideline for Voluntary Contributions of ccTLDs to ICANN, and requests the Chair of the ccNSO to inform the CEO and President of ICANN accordingly, once the Guideline becomes effective. The ccNSO Council requests staff to

publish this resolution as soon as possible after the closure of the ccNSO Council meeting. Keith?

KEITH DAVIDSON: Thank you Byron.   Are there any questions, queries or comments? [Becky?]

BYRON HOLLAND: Sorry, it's not done yet.

KEITH DAVIDSON: Okay, over the page.

BYRON HOLLAND: In accordance with the rules of the ccNSO, the November 2013 Guideline will become effective seven days after publication of decision by the Council. Finally, the ccNSO Council wholeheartedly thanks and congratulates all who participated in the process and in particular the Chair and the members of the Finance Working Group, and Xavier Calvez, the CFO of ICANN, and other staff, and all the members of the community who were involved in this long and sometimes challenging effort. Keith?

KEITH DAVIDSON: I'm not sure if we should amend to get rid of the word 'sometimes'? Always challenging effort.   Are there any comments or questions? [Becky]?

[BECKY]:   I'd just like to say that I attended the very first ICANN Meeting in Singapore in 1999. This was an issue then and it's been an issue at every single ICANN Meeting since then. It's never been not contentious, and I'd like to thanks Byron and the members of the Committee who worked so hard to get this done.

KEITH DAVIDSON: Thanks [Becky]. Any other comments or questions? I'd like to add my own support to Becky's comments. I've been involved since 2001 in terms of finding a satisfactory model, so it's good that I think we can finally put this to bed. Are there any other comments, questions? Byron?

BYRON HOLLAND: I'd just like to make one comment. This was a big Working Group. There are a lot of folks who did a lot of heavy lifting and helped me guide this process. I truly appreciate all of the insight and guidance and hard work that I got from the Working Group itself and the many other people who helped shepherd this process to this point. Thank you.

KEITH DAVIDSON: I trust you'll duly reward them in the bar shortly. Lesley, comments?

LESLEY COWLEY: I'm missing out on the bar again! I'd like to effort the comments already made. This has been a long haul and I think the outcome is good for us. It may not feel that way currently but I think it is. Well done.

KEITH DAVIDSON: Thank you.   I think rather than a show of hands, can we pass this resolution by exclamation? Please join me in thanking Byron and the team for this.   [applause]   Just to finish the vote, is there anyone abstaining or anyone voting against?   I'll call it as a unanimous resolution.   I'll now relinquish the Chair and hand back to the other Byron Holland.

BYRON HOLLAND: Other hat is on. Thank you Mr. Vice-Chair. Onto Item #9 – next steps to identify potential issues and propose next steps pertaining to cross community capacity building.   This is more of a discussion point that flows out of the conversations we've had in Durban and even the panel we had this morning, to see if there's any comment for the Council on whether to pursue this subject any further in terms of additional potential panels at future ICANN meetings, or future ccNSO meetings, or even if there's any interest in trying to more effectively share information around capacity building.

This is meant for discussion purposes only. I open the floor to any comment, input… I won't take silence as consent here, so… Hong?

HONG XUE: Thank you Chair. For the Cross-Community Capacity Building Working Group we have one already, and ccNSO is trying the Working Group as one of the stakeholder groups, the ICANN Academy Working Group. It is now running a couple of capacity building programs, including the one that Jordi just mentioned, the Pilot Leadership Program. Of course, I fully support that if we want to form more Cross-Community Capacity Building Working Groups for your information.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: May I make a point of order? This was intended as cross-regional capacity building, so it is not cross-community capacity building. Maybe we defer this item to the next meeting by telephone call, in terms of December. Everyone is a bit confused by it right now.

BYRON HOLLAND: Bart certainly makes a good point of clarification. This was meant to be a follow up from the conversations in Durban and here, which were about regional and organizational capability building. Are there any further comments? No? Okay, well, we'll probably move that to the next meeting. Item #10. This is a late addition to the Agenda and it's a result of trying to be responsive to what has transpired during the course of the week here, and certainly calls that we have heard both…

I've heard both from within, and most definitely from outside the community, for the cc community to get involved or put a person or

persons forward to really try to spearhead or convey information back and forth, as a focal point between the One Net endeavor, the Brazil conference, and the Panel on Internet Governance, because time is short on all of those things.

I have had a conversation with my Vice-Chair, Keith, and I'm going to put forward a suggestion to the community in terms of a slate of individuals who could be a point person on each of these endeavors. That is not to say that, as usual, we are all free to represent ourselves as cc operators in these endeavors; to make comment and engage as you see fit.

On the other hand, I think it would be important that we do actually have a little bit of structure to ensure that this community stays informed by people who can afford to engage in a very meaningful way. So, for the One Net endeavor – I'm not going to call it a 'movement', for those of you who've been watching Twitter or anything.

It's a robust mailing list. Part of the issue here is simply to have somebody who can distil what is relevant, and separate the wheat from the chaff and report back to this community about the key elements that are transpiring on that mailing list, and also surface any particular issues or activities that we think would be a point of interest for us as individuals to get involved in the conversation.

In terms of the Brazil conference, we know and have been asked as a community to get involved in helping on the Steering Committee, and for the Panel on Internet Governance, the fifth Strategy Panel, there has been a call for us to have somebody participate. On the third point, there was some discussion stimulated originally by Peter Van Rosten, at

the Council Prepatory Meeting, and I'll tell you that my name, as Chair of the ccNSO, was floated for that role.

Matthieu I think is an appropriate person and has agreed, if we agree on that, to participate as a point person on the One Net role. [Katalina] from LAC TLD, I think, is a clear choice for being a point person around the Brazil conference. She has the resources and support of her organization, and the obvious advantage of being on the ground and in Sao Paulo to begin with.

I'd like to propose, along with my Vice-Chair, that we put that slate forward under those auspices. Are there any questions? Young Eum?

Young Eum: I'd just like to point out that the One Net thing is something that everyone can get on, so I do agree that we should have a contact point, or a person that would be more responsible than others for bringing the important issues up, but I'd like to suggest that everyone get on this list.

BYRON HOLLAND: Yes, and I would just echo that. This is my no means to suggest that Matthieu is shouldering the load for this whole community, or representing us in that endeavor. He's simply agreed that given the flow of information happening on that mailing list, that he would take the responsibility of trying to distil it to its most meaningful essence for our community, and surface and highlight any particular things that come up on that mailing list that we might be particularly interested in engaging in. I'd certainly, as Young Eum has just done, encourage all of us to pay attention and be engaged in that. Keith?

KEITH DAVIDSON: As well as adding my support for the people proposed for these roles, I think it's really important that we add these three items as separate Agenda Items for all future Council and member meetings, until exhausted, and that the people appointed are the first reporting mechanism back to us, on as much information as they can provide.

I think particularly the One Net, but each of these tasks is going to be quite a high noise to signal ratio, so as you say, Byron, separating the wheat from the chaff and reporting back to us the important elements is going to be quite an onerous task, but one that's definitely necessary. Thanks.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Are there any other comments or questions? [Rolaf]?

[ROLAF]:   Yes Byron. One other thing on this subject – this morning in the 7:00 - 8:30 am meeting there was a suggestion from ICANN's CEO and President that the communities would form cross-community Working Groups on each of the three subjects. Is that something we want to discuss; whether we'll do that – if we'll initiate it, or if we'll participate, or if we'll do anything at all?

BYRON HOLLAND: I think… My personal opinion is that we should participate in some way, shape or form. In terms of how we begin to organize that I'm open to input and solutions. Do you have any for us?

[ROLAF]:   If I remember correctly he was calling upon the leaders of the constituencies? I'm offering help. I don't have any clear idea on how to do it, other than liaise with the other constituencies. I don't know if there's an upcoming meeting of the Chairs of the different constituencies, or…?

BYRON HOLLAND: Bart, can you shed any light on what's expected here?

BART BOSWINKEL: I have no clue, but I was not there. What I suggest is that the Chair of the Council comes back say in two weeks with more idea of what's required and what's happening, so in a short timeframe, and that we discuss it at least by email and on the conference call on the 10th of December. That's the next Council meeting so that's relatively quick.

[ROLAF]:   Okay, but maybe in the meantime, while we're still here, maybe we can reach out to the chairs of the other constituencies and…

BYRON HOLLAND: Yes. Okay.

SPEAKER: Hello. I'm the Chair of one of the other constituencies. I don't know whether it helps but I just want to point out that I'm at least as confused

EN

as Byron, so I think that all of us are on the same level. Don't think that Byron hasn't done his homework, because we're in the same situation. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you for your support Mr. Chair. I appreciate that. Here's what I can commit to: since it's unclear what the requirements are, I'll certainly take the lead until those are known, and then report back and we can act accordingly. As it's clearly a work in progress I don't think I can do anything on that at the moment.

SPEAKER: Thank you Mr. Chair.

KEITH DAVIDSON: I was just going to say I was at the meeting and am equally confused this morning. I was going to avoid raising that topic, [Rolaf], on the basis of the lack of clarity about what that might mean. Byron, you volunteered to keep an eye on all three – I wonder if the three people we're appointing could act as the appropriate vehicle for any further discussion or commitment or requirement?

Not to say that they should serve on the cross-constituency groups, if they emerge, but just that each could take the lead for their group. That might be appropriate in sharing the workload.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Keith. [Rolaf]?

[ROLAF]: Keith, maybe we can agree that you raise the points on which there's clarity, and then I'll take the ones on which there is none?

KEITH DAVIDSON: That would be a very short discussion.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay. Are there any other comments or feedback on this particular point? I do want to make one. Given the nature of Item #3 I have sought my own personal guidance from my Board on looking for their advice and commitment that should this go through, and should I be the person to do it, that I would have support of my own Board.

I certainly expect it, but given the short notice of this whole thing, I still await confirmation, and though I anticipate it immediately, in the spirit of full transparency I just wanted to make that known. Okay. Lesley?

LESLEY COWLEY: I was trying to participate remotely, and I don't have a clue.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay. Thank you. All right, Item #11 – Working Group and other updates. I'm going to pass the first one to Katrina, regarding the Program Working Group. First I'd like to say that I think the Program Working Group has done a fantastic job here, not only just in terms of the actual Items on the Agenda, but some of the enhancements; as simple and straightforward as putting the pictures and names up of the

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much Byron. This is my first meeting in the capacity of Chair of the Meeting Program Working Group. I'd like to thank Byron and Bart especially for helping out. Now I'm in good shape to keep working on the program for the next meeting, especially because there's growing support and more and more ideas are coming from the Working Group, so I'd like to thank the Working Group for that.

As you noticed, there are some new things that we experimented with this time. First of all we advertised the most interesting things; to attract more and more people and invite you all to come to our meetings, to the most interesting sessions – well, all sessions are interesting, but we picked up some just to give you a highlight and an idea of what to expect.

This was the first time we tried that. I hope the next meeting will do a better job, and that's why we really rely on feedback from you. As you'll soon notice, if Gabby hasn't… Gabby has already sent out an invitation to fill in our post-meeting survey. This is a new survey. It's shorter and we really want to gather key input from the community on what you like and what you didn't, and some ideas.

Unfortunately our Working Group lost Vikram, a member. Unfortunately he had too many commitments and couldn't continue the work, so if anyone interested in participating in the Working Group, you're always welcome. If you don't want to be a part of the Working

Group but still have ideas, we'd really appreciate it if you could share them.

There are also some other changes, and here I'd like to thank Alejandro for taking the lead and preparing the Google Calendar. I'd really like to apologize to [Hern? 00:51:17] and especially the community that we didn't distribute this Google Calendar thing earlier – my mistake. It will be corrected and you'll have this information on time for the next meeting. Thank you very much for your good work. I'm really relying on your feedback. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Katrina. Item #11.2 – incident response repository. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: The Working Group sent an Interim Report with some questions to the community. This will be followed up shortly with a survey for all the broader ccTLD community. The Working Group is looking for guidance on whether it needs to continue given the limits that have been proposed by the previous Working Group.

In order to make this successful they want to ensure that a large number of ccTLDs will get involved in the incident response initiative. Read the Report and a survey will follow shortly.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Any questions or comments on #11.2? No? Election Review Council Committee. Katrina?

KATRINA SATAKI:	Thank you Byron. We have updated our Report to reflect the latest changes in the election process. We've discussed recommendations during our face-to-face meeting that we had this Sunday. We'll update and polish the Report and hopefully send it out to the Council prior to the meeting in Singapore.
	We also discussed the online tool that we could offer to the ccNSO with our colleagues from the Czech registry, who kindly agreed to help us implement that and make the voting process easier and more efficient. Thank you.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Thank you. Any comments or questions for Katrina? Wait, 11.4 – Quorum Study Group. Katrina?
KATRINA SATAKI:	Thank you Byron. Quorum Study Group had two phone calls, where we discussed different issues regarding quorum and all those votes that take place, and when we need quorum and when we perhaps do not need it. As a result, we have our first draft report. I was a bit optimistic.
	I really expected to submit it to the Council before this meeting, but our face-to-face discussion on Sunday showed that there are still some things we need to add to the report. We'll definitely send it to the Council for discussion before Singapore. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you very much Katrina.   Any questions or comments?   okay, moving right along. ICANN Outreach Program. [Sokul]?

[SOKUL]:   Thank you Byron.   Tomorrow there is a session at 9:00 on global stakeholder engagement. The idea is that in the past there have been discussions on how to improve communication, digital engagement, a better calendaring of all events, whether they're local, original or global, and the capacity building efforts on a regional level.

The session tomorrow will focus on updating and informing participants on what's happening with all those ideas that have been discussed in the past, and progress with regards to different tools. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you.   Comments or questions?   Okay.   Hong on the ICANN Academy please.

HONG XUE: The ICANN Academy Working Group, along with ICANN staff, designed a first Pilot Leadership Program. This is the first capacity building training program for ICANN community leaders. It's three parts. The first is the online learning platform. The second is skills facilitation training. The third one is orientation courses.

The last two parts were held four days before the ICANN BA meeting, and the two councilors appointed by NomCom, our two new councilors, joined this Program. According to the feedback received so far, more than 72% of the participants gave the positive feedback, and according

to the rough assessment provided by an ICANN Board Member, this Pilot Leadership Program will no longer be Pilot.

It's going to be a regular event organized every year, but it's only available to the ICANN community leaders; the Chairs of SOs and ACs, but other community members are being considered by the Working Group, so in the future, possibly the capacity building program for community members could be held at the regional level, at something like the European Summer School on Internet Governance. That's my update. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Hong. Are there any questions? Comments? I think we're done with Item #11. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: Just one point with regards to the ATRT meeting yesterday – I think in the prep meeting we discussed the possibility of compiling a document with submissions or comments prepared by councilors. If they could send those to me over the next week or two, I'll compile the document and send it to the Council so that we can submit it in time.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you for that.

SPEAKER: I just want to add that the preliminary comment period is closing very soon, so we'll be submitting our comments in the reply period, but we

do want to get them in. I've been told by several people in the ATRT that they're very much desiring to have comments.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Becky. Onto #12 – Council election update. Gabby is our election manager, so over to you.

GABBY SCHITTEK: Thank you. We had a nomination period starting mid-October and ending early November. It had to be slightly extended for the North American region, but due to lack of nominations and seconding… The outcome was that Victor Abboud, Hiro Hotta and Dotty Sparks de Blanc have been re-selected for their respective regions, and there needs to be an election held in the European and African region. The election period starts next Friday, the 29th, and runs until the 13th of December. The elections will just be held for the members of these two regions.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. Are there any questions or comments? Okay, thank you. On to Item #13 – back to the election manager.

GABBY SCHITTEK: During the same time period we had a nomination period to the ICANN Board, and the only candidate that was nominated and seconded was Chris Disspain. As there are no other candidates he is the only candidate, but he will actually formally be appointed after the Council has approved my nomination report, which will be submitted to you shortly.

EN

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Gabby. Comments? All right, thank you very much. Item #14 – update on the work plan. Bart?

BART BOSWINKEL: this is fairly simple – you'll receive an updated work plan by the end of next week, taking into account the developments of this week, so I can strike some of the Working Groups.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you Bart. Any questions for Bart on that? We eagerly anticipate that. Item #15 – liaison updates. GNSO, Patrick? Not here, right? Okay.

SPEAKER: Apologies from Patrick, he's in the gNSO Council Meeting, but he's sent his written report.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay. I just want to say that the reports I think we've received from Patrick are very strong and very helpful. I'd encourage you to read them if you want to get a fulsome account of what's happening there. #15.2 – the ALAC liaison, Ron Sherwood, who can't join us here… Is he online or on the phone?

RON SHERWOOD: Yes I am.

BYRON HOLLAND:	Welcome Ron. Could you provide us your update?
RON SHERWOOD:	You have a written report and I do not have anything to add to that. It's fairly comprehensive. It doesn't include a report from this meeting because I'm remote, but I will get the report about subsequent actions and debates in ALAC. I'll get that to you for the next meeting.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Thank you very much Ron. Any questions for Ron? Okay, thank you. Close that number #15 and move onto Item #16, which is just a confirmation of the Council teleconference on December 10th at 12:00 UTC. Any questions? Bart?
BART BOSWINKEL:	Not a question, more a point for clarification or a point of clarification: the schedule for 2014 needs to be established with our current Chair and Vice-Chair. This is still based on, say, the schedule established with the prior Chair, Lesley.
BYRON HOLLAND:	Thank you very much. Okay. Duly noted. Item #17 – Any Other Business. Would anybody like to raise anything? I'm going to raise a couple of items but I'd just like to check… No? I'll take that as a no. There are a couple of items I wanted to add here. One is regarding the Travel Funding Working Group, and as [Sokul] will be stepping down after this meeting, Victor has generously volunteered to take his place, so I just wanted to confirm that. Okay. Thank you very much.

I would also like to, for the record, thank Cheryl, who, although she couldn't be with us today, this would be her last meeting in her capacity as an ALAC liaison, so in the usual way I'd like to thank Cheryl for her commitment and service to this group in that capacity. Thank you very much Cheryl. [applause] Welcome Maureen.

A couple of other notes. In terms of NomCom, as you know, Hong stepped down so there were two NomCom appointees in this period. I've already noted that Jordi is joining us. [Sokul] will be, as I just said, leaving us in his capacity as a Councilor via the NomCom, so I'd also like to say, in our usual way, can we thank him for all the service he's provided here? [applause]

In his place, shortly taking her seat, is Celia Lerman Friedman. Welcome to the Council. We look forward to working with you shortly. That's what's happening on the NomCom and from the ALAC liaison standpoint. Yes, there are a couple of other things that I'd like to take care of, and they're about recognizing people.

The first thing I'd like to do is also just provide [Sokul] a little recognition on behalf of the Council. It's something I've looked at often, and I'm waiting until I get mine. [applause] The next items that I'd like to provide are recognition of folks who've made outstanding and lengthy contributions to this community, and we have a number of pins for those who've been to 30 ICANN meetings, which is quite remarkable.

Even more remarkable is that we have people here who've been to 40 meetings. I want to recognize those folks, most of whom are with us today. I'd like to welcome you up, as I call your name, to receive your pin. I almost feel a bit awkward, because relative to these folks I've

barely been here. In spite of being a relative newbie compared to these folks, congratulations of course and thank you for the service you provide to the ccNSO.

It's a remarkable list. I will start with the folks who've been here 30 meetings. Annabeth Lange. [applause] Annabeth!

ANNABETH LANGE: Actually, it's 33 this year I think. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Congratulations. There's a lot of them. We are going to take a picture after, but let me give them out first. The next is Bernie Turcott. Bernie? I know he's here. God knows we all know when he's here. Okay, I will save that. [Dava Tamiliongilan]. We know she's here but not in the room? Giovanni? Congratulations. [applause] I won't make Keith get up. I'll go to him. [applause] Next we have Margarita. [applause] You may detect a pattern here.Martin Boyle. [applause] Congratulations.

MARTIN BOYLE: Thank you. Long service! As somebody said to me though, as half of those years were in the GAC, I've only really done 15 meetings.

BYRON HOLLAND: Relative newbie, yes?   [laughter]   Next is Patricio.   [applause] Congratulations. Richard Wine? Not in the room I'm afraid. Now we move onto the 40 meetings, the marathoners here. Carsten? [applause] Congratulations. A remarkable achievement.

CARSTEN SCHIEFNER: I just had a peek at a picture of when I started, and this was in '98 or '99 or so, when my hair was still light brown. Now it's gray, so thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you! Demi, 40th. [applause] Desiree? We know she's here. Not in the room? Okay. I'll make sure she gets that. Virtually, Lesley Cowley. [applause] Congratulations Lesley, it just keeps coming this week.

LESLEY COWLEY: [laughs]

SPEAKER: Lesley, maybe for your information, when Byron talks of you – and I'm doing the same now, I see – he looks at something that's hanging from the ceiling and that radiates light and warmth. So I think you're dearly missed. [laughter]

LESLEY COWLEY: I'm not upstairs, it's okay.

BYRON HOLLAND: Yes, you are omnipresent in this meeting. The next is Oskar, who was here, but we know had to go home on short notice. Congratulations to Oskar as well. The last person on the 40th list, who I believe is also not here, is Stefan Welzel. He's not here, I believe. Right.

ICANN 48 · 17-21 Nov 2013
Buenos Aires

SPEAKER: This is extracted from what you indicate when you're registering, so next time.

BYRON HOLLAND: Okay, so I have the designated list, which I'll stick to for now, but also Stefan. I'd like to acknowledge Stefan. [applause] Clearly you'll be next up I guess. This is the 40th? Okay. With that, congratulations to all of the folks who've received those pins. What I would suggest is that upon completion of the meeting, which will be very shortly, that those folks stick around and we can take a picture behind here, I think.

                               I think Gabby will no doubt get us in order and tell us what to do. Thank you. On that note, those are all the items under Any Other Business that I had, and with that we'll move to Item #18 and close the meeting. Thank yous, sponsors… Thank you Bart. Who should I thank in particular?

                               Obviously our local host, .ar, NIC Argentina, certainly LAC TLD… I'm going to keep winging it here. the financial sponsors of the evening last night, which by memory included .pr, .nl, Nominet, NIC .ar, Chile… I think I covered them all. Thank you very much to all of our sponsors. [applause] On that I will call the meeting to a close. Can I get somebody to…?

SPEAKER: To complement you with your chairmanship?

ICANN 48 · 17-21 Nov 2013

BYRON HOLLAND: No!

SPEAKER: Yes. Well done Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND: To bring this to a close?   [applause]   All right, thank you very much. Thank you Lesley for joining us, and Ron. See you all tonight at the gala.

LESLEY COWLEY: Thanks Byron. Well done.

BYRON HOLLAND: Just a reminder – we would like to get everybody who received a pin to come on up for a photograph. Please don't forget. Come on.

SPEAKER: If someone wants gala tickets for tonight, I have some, just come up to me.

[END OF TRANSCRIPT]