
HYDERABAD – At-Large Technology Taskforce Working Group
Tuesday, November 08, 2016 – 15:15 to 16:15 IST
ICANN57 | Hyderabad, India

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Test, test, test. Right. Nothing.

All right, let's try that again. Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Dev Anand Teelucksingh. I'm the Chair of the At-Large Technology Taskforce. Also, I'm glad to see some people are here this afternoon to review some of the work of the technology taskforce as done for the year, and also, to have some ideas and brainstorming as to what we want to do for after this meeting.

Our co-chairs are here, Glenn McKnight and Judith Hellerstein. We have an agenda, so let's just quickly go through our slides.

So what we want to do is just give a brief introduction of what the Technology Taskforce does, especially for those persons new or if this is their first meeting, or this is the first time they're attending a Technology Taskforce session.

We will then discuss and write some of our activities we have done for 2016, and again, have this brainstorming session as to what should we do or discuss for the future Technology Taskforce activities, and of course, any other business.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

So, let's move on to the next slide just to give a welcome and introduction to the Technology Taskforce. Next slide.

So, what is technology? Judith actually provided this definition. So technology provides the tools that enable people to connect, collaborate and work towards making the world more accessible, and enabling the benefits of the Internet to be available for all. Next slide.

What the Technology Taskforce does is it evaluates and reviews different technologies that can help the At-Large community communicate, collaborate and accomplish their goals and objectives for ICANN activities. And some of these examples include [Shock] tools, conferencing tools, captioning, but generally, anything that would help Internet individual end users become active in the At-Large community. Next slide.

It's open to anyone interested in ICT, or Information and Communication Technology, and it's very easy to join. Next slide.

We often have usually one or two conference calls per month. On the slide there, you'll see a link to some of our work and projects and our group page on the At-Large Wiki. Next slide.

Okay, so now next, we're just going to look back on our 2016 year and review. Next slide.

Okay. We've been very busy. We've had ten conference calls, including two face-to-face meetings at ICANN 55 and ICANN 56. Just to note that Technology Taskforce calls since August 2016 has Spanish interpretation. This was due to an interest by several persons from the LAC region wanting to get more involved in the Technology Taskforce work. So we've been having interpretation since August.

The TTF has been looking at three things: At-Large Summit 2 recommendations, the technology issues raised by the At-Large Community, and various testing of conferencing tools and captioning. Next slide.

So, just to summarize what the At-Large Summit was for those who don't know, it was essentially a meeting where all the At-Large Community came together and at the ICANN 50th meeting and came up with a bunch of recommendations, 43 in all, for the At-Large Community and for the ICANN Board to help implement.

Some of these recommendations were allocated to us, and we have been working over the past two years to accomplish those recommendations, and in fact, the ALAC has just approved the implementation report. There's a link there where you can go and read the total, full implementation report. Next slide.

Some of the activities we've done: we had a session with David Goulet, who is a TOR developer. Glenn was able to have met the TOR developer in Montreal and invited him to come on a call. We talked about how the TOR project works and some of the advantages and disadvantages and the challenges. Next slide.

We also had a session with [Ericos Picos], a developer of [KLO.com]. This is also thanks to Jimmy Schulz, who knew the developer of this platform. [KLO] is a type of solution where persons can vote arguments, like pro and cons. And just like in a tree structure, you can have comments/arguments for and against each of those arguments and it can break down those things in a granular manner. Next slide.

We also had a session with James Gannon from the MCUC about Rocket.Chat. Rocket.Chat is a group chat application, and that is a system whereby conversations can be separated with hashtags and it allows different conversations to happen in a seamless manner. It also allows for mobile access. So it makes it much more easier than e-mail overloads. Next slide.

The TTF also tested captioning under the captioning pilot. Judith Hellerstein has been more involved in the captioning pilot, so perhaps, Judith, you could take the floor and just give an overview.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: This test that we had done was in 2015 when we did a test of the captioning pilot. This is just an example of the Adobe screen that we had doing it. We later then did a pilot of nine calls from different RALOs, working groups, committees who had sent in requests. The calls were done from January to June of 2016.

It was very well-received. We have done, we've had calls in three RALOs: NARALO, APRALO, LACRALO, and also, the ALAC call. We also did several working groups. The Technology Taskforce was one, as well as the Cross-Community Group on Accessibility. We did the call on outreach and engagement. APRALO had printed several requests for their webinars.

In all these nine calls, we then had a survey that we were taking and we analyzed the results. But we'll discuss later on in here how the issues and problems with technology issues we had in getting survey data and getting the needed metrics.

The pilot is entering a second phase this year, and we're going to start that in January, where we are doing it for six more calls. We hope we get better survey data, as many of the glitches that we had in collecting data will have been fixed with the new upgrade of Adobe and new entrants with the newer versions of Adobe. I think it's this next slide. Next slide.

Later on, we'll be discussing here on issues of Adobe connect. I'll just give it quickly to, back to Dev to finish up the discussion on

what we were doing on translation tools. Then I will come back and talk to some of the issues of Adobe Connect that are on our technology issue page.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Glenn, I see your hand raised. Quickly, go ahead.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Perhaps, Judith, you can give some community feedback on what they thought of the captioning and the results.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thank you, Glenn. Sure, we can. A lot of the feedback was very helpful. We thought many of them put in comments of saying what really prevented keeping them engaged in the session is that sometimes they had problems, often times early on, with the Adobe and loading it or crashing.

They often had a lot of issues in trying to figure out what was going on in the second session, but with the caps thing in there, it enabled them to get a better understanding of it. I think I might also turned to a colleague, Renata, who had given excellent commentary about how she's working in the LACRALO call for Portuguese and Spanish and how it was helpful to her to figure out how to get engaged.

RENATA AQUINO RIBEIRO: Thank you. Yes, I think that it's very important to have the text along with the sound because we, who are not native speakers, have a lot of struggle catching up to the text. But also, I think that for the sake of record keeping and for analysis of the data and use of social media, this is also very interesting. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Thanks, Renata. And thanks, Judith, for the summary on captioning. So some of the other activities. We continue to update the Wiki page on translation tools, which has a listing of all the various machine translation tools, sorted by platform, by mobile device, on the types of tools that you can use to translate and help the machine translate documents and text. Next slide.

Also we started to look at the XO platform. There's a link to a two- minute YouTube video for those accessing the presentation. Generally what this is is an all-encompassing solution that has a built-in Wiki, social media platform, knowledge management tool. It has an ability to create profiles, and, similar to how the activity stream in social networks like Facebook – when a person posts their activities that you're subscribed to – you get notifications, and so forth.

It also does document management and so forth, so we're thinking it's probably a very important tool to help test. And Stuart Clarke from EURALO has been instrumental in trying to get the beta up and running for us to start testing. Next slide. Question? Renata?

RENATA AQUINO RIBEIRO: This is like a Trello? Just for me to have an idea.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. No, it's not just a Trello. It also does calendaring as well, so you could schedule events, and it has a built-in Wiki, so you can have the meeting notes and so forth that can be edited in a collaborative fashion. We have yet to really fully dive into it. We haven't really fully tested it yet. So it's possibly something for our future activities when we come up to that in the agenda.

No further questions? Next slide.

One of the other things from the ATLAS recommendations was the technology's issues page. What we tried to do since last year was to try to come up with a way of documenting the issues that the community faces when dealing with ICANN and to visit with ICANN staff. So we've set up a Wiki page and every call, we go through the technology issues page and try to address the issues

in a systematic manner. So we just wanted to spend some time just addressing two of the key technology issues. Next slide.

Some of the key issues noted was the LACRALO mailing list translation issues, the ability to export Adobe Connect recordings from Flash-only recordings to formats like MP4. There's been various Adobe Connect issues related to polling and captioning, and there's also been an issue regarding the ICANN meeting app and the use of Schedule.com for the ICANN scheduling. Next slide.

Just to give some background about this LACRALO mailing list translation, we have two mailing lists in LACRALO: one in English, one in Spanish. The idea is that e-mails in English sent to the English list are machine-translated using Google Translator and posted to the Spanish list and vice versa. Next slide.

However, there's been several issues that doesn't make this a very seamless process, and I'm just giving one example. If you look at A there, you see that that's the subject line when somebody first posts an e-mail. But as people start replying to it, it breaks down. Next slide.

Literally, after several people have replied, that long line of gibberish is what the end result is of that machine translation, which is terrible, because obviously, machine-[treated]

conversations are totally broken. Nobody can look at that on their mobile phone and see what the heck that is anymore. So it's been a big problem. Next slide.

There's a detailed Wiki page that details all of these issues. In 2016, we submitted a budget proposal to fix these bugs. This was approved by the ALAC and by ICANN. What has happened now is that ICANN staff has now put things in place to have this looked at. I see Mark Segall, who is the Delivery Manager for Community Services at ICANN, has taken this, as well as Corrina Ace, who is now looking at this directly.

Mark, I think that perhaps you can give us an update on what has happened since you all have taken this under your care.

MARK SEGALL: Absolutely. We, starting in July, had put a formal team together. In the past, this was really an ad hoc request.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Mark? Sorry, you just need to come closer to the mic, so you can – right. Thanks.

MARK SEGALL: Am I better now? Yeah, I can hear myself. So, starting around July, we put a formal team around this, as you can see, with

myself and Karina leading on the respective sides. We have a developer that's dedicated to it, and they've resolved all the issues at this point that are the recorded issues. But we just didn't want to do a deployment right before the ICANN meeting, so we're working with Dev very closely afterwards to deploy those fixes into production.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Mark. It actually was gratifying to see some of these longstanding bugs finally starting to be addressed. I'm subscribed to the test versions of these translation lists, and I can see a lot of testing happening. So it's good to see this, and I think what we need to do then is just announce a next round of testing for persons to join this new translation engine and start posting messages to see if there's any critical bugs, and then come to a conclusion whether it's safe to deploy or not. Any comments or questions? Satish.

SATISH BABU: Do we have plans to increase the number of languages that can be covered since the translation engine is elsewhere? The technology that we have developed now – can it be used for a bunch of other languages also?

MARK SEGALL:

We knew that that was coming up. In fact, as we've been going through the last few months with given updates, we've heard about French, we've heard about some other languages. It is possible, and we just need to prioritize it. I think the first thing is getting it through this stretch.

There's still a couple things that we want to address foundationally. UTF8 is not fully – we found as we were addressing the [SIDEA] issue we wanted to get ahead of that so that we're finding it before you guys do. And we also want to make sure that we're all solidified, just like I said, foundationally on the platform that we're using for scripting it and make sure it's scalable.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Mark. Any other comments or questions? Go ahead. Please introduce yourself.

ANIVAR ARIVAND:

I am Aniva Arivand, Fellow, and a member of APRALO [inaudible]. If you're increasing the number of languages, I think maybe we need to wait up to the Mailman 3 update because Mailman 2 has a lot of longstanding bugs, especially on subject lines and approval lines. And maybe there's another way in

which many of the communities are approaching this – a platform called Discourse instead of Mailmans.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks for that, actually. Indeed, we've heard of this course and we have to also consider whether we want to go into testing of that.

But you raise an interesting point regarding Mailman and perhaps, Mark, you can take on whether that is possible. You want to respond to that regarding Mailman?

MARK SEGALL: I'm sorry. I didn't understand what the question was there. Can you repeat? Sorry.

ANIVAR ARIVAND: Yeah. Instead of mails, many open first communities are now moving to Discourse which is more [inaudible]. But at the same time, you can, it may be a single platform in which every thread, you can fix and do mailing list kind of [inaudible]. You will get the mails as [inaudible] thread and it's a mail-to web kind of gateway. So Discourse is popularly used in [modular] communities and many open first communities as a replacement of Mailman to [open web].

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Perhaps can I suggest then, you can come on a technology taskforce call and just show us how Discourse works?

ANIVAR ARIVAND: Yeah. If you want, just go to [Discourse.Modular.Community](https://discourse.modular.community). It's a very active online community. You can see a working example, there.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Laura?

LAURA BENGFORD: Yeah. Thank you. We are familiar with Discourse. We did a small pilot on that about a year ago. And you are absolutely right. It's more of a platform than a mailing list. It's a more kind of modern version of a forum. We're open to kind of looking at that. I will tell you and just caution you that we did get some feedback that even though we did this test with Discourse – we did it on actually the IANA Stewardship pages on ICANN.org when that came out – and we did get some feedback that people really like those mailing lists. So it's kind of like you please half and you got the other half to kind of consider as well. So I think we should

continue to look at these modern platforms and maybe we can evolve to that one day. Thanks.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks. Oh well, I see a queue here. Judith and then Satish.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: We can look at the Discourse, but I know, as you said, at least from past experience with ISOC, when they attempted to move to a platform, which they had Connect, which was a lot to try to get a lot of these issues resolved, a lot of them strip out the name of the person who is writing the e-mail. It makes it very difficult for people who are not on the web or to respond and it gets people very frustrated because they can't respond in both areas and they can't easily respond with different e-mails, know who they're responding to. So we will keep that in mind if we'd like to have it as a discussion. We don't want to create the same issues that they're having, which is basically they're now running two lists. They're posting everything in Connect and then posting everything on the old thing. And doesn't solve any problems, any issues.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Satish?

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Dev. I think the original point raised was that Mailman 2 has a bug in the way it handles the subject, and while you may be fixing it, when the new version comes, you might have to redo the work. That's something that you might want to consider. That's it. You don't have to really move to Discourse at this point.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Renata?

RENATA AQUINO RIBEIRO: Open Knowledge Brail moved to Discourse, but it took somewhere from six months to one and a half years. So far, there are no assessments but some comments along the line of people really liking the mailing list have shown up, and there's difficulty on low connection. It's easier when you are on low connection to, say, just reply to an e-mail than to get into a platform.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks for that, Renata. Thanks, Mark, for giving an update on the mailing list translation issues. And like I said, I'm glad to see this finally after many years of no progress. Finally,

some progress has been made on this. So I'm very grateful. And the At-Large community is also very grateful.

I think next we're going to be looking at the Adobe Connect issues. Next slide.

So perhaps, Judith, do you want to take the floor?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN:

Sure. Many people who are in the Working Group within At-Large listen to calls on mobile devices. Adobe Connect has not been very good with mobile devices. The old ones are Flash-based. We keep hearing an update from ICANN IT that they're going to HTML5. We keep hoping that it's going to happen. But some things already have happened. ICANN has configured the Adobe Connect so that now staff can export Adobe Connect recordings to MP4 format, which will then allow for easy playback on mobile devices. It's not for when the sessions are happening, but it is for people who miss a session and are trying to catch up. It's much easier for them to do it that way. So they're working very hard. We keep talking to and having Josh Baulch from IT come on our sessions and keep giving them feedback on Adobe Connect issues. We've had several calls that were just dedicated with him on these issues. Next slide.

Here's just a testing of how to convert recordings to MP4 that we had done. Next slide.

There were many other challenges. As I mentioned, during the captioning pilot, we had issues. It's very difficult after the session in getting metrics from people because people don't want to do survey. They never mail them in and then you have trouble collecting metrics.

So we had thought to use the polling feature in Adobe Connect. We had several different issues with that, and the earlier versions were not compatible with multiple devices. They could not see the polls. We had no web polls after that. We have various ways of collecting data.

Also, when we had our captioning pilot, people needed to have two screens open because if they're on a mobile device, the captioning pod, which is based on Flash, does not show up. So it was inaccessible to people. Although people could see the stream text and have a different screen on their mobile, that also was more cumbersome.

The polling feature is getting fixed. We are told by Josh that now mobile devices can see the polls. We're going to be testing that on another test and also testing an additional feature, which is exit polling.

After the session is held, we could, before the Adobe Connect recording has ended, force a movement of everyone to another poll which is web-based, which we then can give out to people later on to finish. And one of our – I think it might be on the next page, next slide. No, okay, so it's not. There wasn't a lot of education of how to do polls in Adobe, and we had first thought that the polls would be web-based, and then we thought we would use polling, but it was difficult to try to get everything fixed up in time for our original test.

Now with our new test, our new pilot starting, we will be able to collect better metrics because we can have questions that can have multiple questions. Before, people had to choose what answer to pick and they didn't have enough time to figure that out. We didn't have as many answers as we like to get the generated metrics to show. So that's something in a new version we're talking about.

The next slide, I think, is about the mobile app. This year, ICANN –

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Sorry, Judith. Just one quick question, just to jump in before you switch away from Adobe Connect. Any comments or questions regarding Adobe Connect?

Okay.

I do have one question, and that's regarding the conversion of our Adobe Connect recordings to MP4. I think one of the challenges has been is that, essentially, you have to play back the Flash recording in real time. So if it's an hour long, somebody has to dedicate their computer to do that generation to MP4. So I'm just wondering – perhaps I'm looking at you, Mark, or Laura maybe – is there a possibility that this could this be automated? Because I imagine this applies to everything that ICANN does. All these Adobe Connect sessions are inaccessible to people with mobile devices, so.

MARK SEGALL:

I did have a discussion with the Meetings Team today. Unfortunately, there's no new updates on this or the HTML5. He has looked recently. Unfortunately, it's something we've got to wait for Adobe to work on. I know that, when they were so tied to Flash for so many years, it is a big deal to make that transition. It's a major platform transition for them, so it's going to take some time.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks, Mark. Olivier?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks very much, Dev. At some point with the introduction of the move of Adobe Connect from the Adobe servers over to the ICANN servers, there were some voiceover IP issues or a higher percentage of voiceover IP issues from some parts of the world. Has this been fixed?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Mark? Go ahead.

MARK SEGALL: Yes, there were some challenges as we made the switch over to the new server. I know that the team has worked through all the recorded issues that were happening, but as recently as a couple of days ago, Josh was requesting that, if you're having issues, please speak loud and clear. He'll be happy to lean on our new vendor.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Judith?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: And we had a meeting with Josh about a month or two ago where we had asked him about all these issues and questions. A lot of the issues, as Josh was saying, were early issues of audio quality, but they also had to do with where the data center was

based and the pairing links that were happening there. It was a rocky road in the beginning because they had to figure out new agreements, new pairings, and which would be better, which would have less hops. I think that was a lot of the issues of that. I think he's working to get that fixed up, and that's why he wants you to e-mail him about these: because they're still in the early phases of this and they're wanting to make sure that they can get better pairing and better issues and know what are the problems are on that. I think the slideshow that he had done – I don't know if you have – was on a past call where he had went in detailed discussions on a lot of these. Olivier, I see you have an additional question.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Go ahead.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Yeah, thanks, Judith. That's the very reason why I'm asking. It's been a month, so usually things happen in a month. Maybe they don't. I don't know. I don't know what the timescale is for working out all the quirks on this, but in the meantime, we do have some members of the community that have problems, and so we've had to dial out to them at the very last moment and wasted time on calls and so on. So that's why I'm sort of

applying general pressure and trying to find out if some things happened in the past month.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. I see there's a queue here. I think we have Sebastien and then there's a remote question. Go ahead, Sebastien.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you, Dev. Yeah, first of all, I want to say that it's very painful what we're experiencing. And from [inaudible] perspective, I think it was a bad idea to move the system in such an unprepared way from our point of view, our usage of Adobe Connect.

The second is that, if staff is requesting that each time we have a trouble that we come back to you, may I request that you come back to us when any change has been made in the system and that we don't repeat the question already asked and we can progress?

I can just report my own experience. Now I'm obliged to have two devices – iPhone and my laptop, or any other device – to have Adobe Connect. And so it was a dream to have just one tool a few years ago and it was quite well-working before, but is not anymore possible. And that's a real pain because when you have to do things on two devices, I'm not very good at that. I know

that women are better than me, but I am not good at it. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks for that, Sebastien. Let's hear a remote question before I comment.

YESIM NAZLAR: Yesim Nazlar from ICANN staff. There is a question on the Adobe Connect from Beran Gillen. She is asking, "I wanted to ask Judith or Dev whether we can test the Adobe Connect polling in the next Technology Taskforce call. Thank you."

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I would say the answer would be yes.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yeah, we had that scheduled. We had wanted to do it in the last call, but we had so many technology issues with this changeover that we ended up having the whole call diverted to that, and so we weren't able to do it. That's still as a priority, and I think we're going to do another special budget, special purpose call, or something else. We have to try to get Josh's time again booked.

It's always hard right after the sessions to do it because he's so booked up with clearing up this with the conference meeting. So we'll try to schedule that because we do need it quickly to make sure, before we start the second phase of the pilot, that the polling features are working correctly.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks, Judith. Regarding this issue, regarding the voice of IP connectivity used with Adobe Connect, I think I remember seeing an e-mail going out asking people to give feedback. Perhaps an action item can be to reissue that e-mail to go out again with specific instructions as to who to forward the issue or complaint to. Perhaps, on a future Technology Taskforce call, we can get some reporting feedback as to what were the issues being raised and what's being addressed and so forth. So perhaps tick that as an action item: for the e-mail to go out again, asking people who have been having connectivity issues with Adobe Connect, give them the new changeover, to participate ICANN.org, to please inform whatever the contact e-mail address was. Okay? I don't know yet.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Satish.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Satish, go ahead.

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Dev. I don't want to be repeating this many times, but there are few of us who are a minority using Linux. Now whenever you have a technology transition, I would request that the perspective of these minority users also be kept in mind, and any testing should also extend to this platform as well. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks for that, Satish. Incidentally, we're going to have to restart a little bit of Linux testing given that the Flash player is now in sync with the Windows and Mac versions. So we probably do need to do some testing on that as well, so let's just note that as well for an action item: for TTF to test Adobe Connect with the new Flash player with Linux.

SATISH BABU: We would be happy to volunteer for the testing.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Please. Yes. Excellent.

ANIVAR ARIVAND: Just one comment. With the Adobe Flash version –

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Just introduce yourself for the transcript record.

ANIVAR ARIVAND: I am Anivar Arivand from [inaudible], also a Fellow here. Adobe Connect does not work with the [Adobe] version of Flash. That means in Firefox, it won't work. In Chrome, because of [inaudible] Flash, it works. So that's a suggestion now.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Okay, let's move on to the next slide. Oh, I'm so sorry. There's a follow-up question, and remote. Sorry.

YESIM NAZLAR: Yesim Nazlar, ICANN staff. It's again from Beran Gillen. She's asking, "Perhaps we should have an internal test for the polling first and then give Josh some feedback and perhaps have him on the next follow-up call." Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yeah, that's a great idea. I only don't mention him right away because we may not be able to get him for a few weeks as he closes down the meeting. So that's the only reason why I didn't

mention him first. I want him as soon as possible, but “as soon as possible” may mean a month for him.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks for that. Let’s see. Let’s move on to the next slide because – you wanted to talk about this issue?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes. This year, our group had been giving feedback for Josh and Chris Gift’s office on the mobile app that ICANN had done. Several of the feedback we gave him was that the Event Mobi app was not pulling the data and the choices from the schedule on the web and that you had to do the schedule in two places and it didn’t work well at all. As a result, they went to a new company, with Sched. You can log in and do your schedule on the web, on your desktop device or any other device, and it will sync with your calendar through a subscription link. That way, when you look in the app, you would see all your schedules and it has a nicer formatting of scheduling.

Unfortunately, it only has schedule in their app, so we still have the problems with Event Mobi because we have all of the other stuff on that app. It’s continual frustration because the Event Mobi app does not work with the scheduling, and there’s no connection with the web and the app, even if you log in. So

you're now forced to use two different apps, which is also a problem.

We had looked into a great idea, not necessarily here, but in some other venues, about beacons because it's so hard sometimes to find the location where your meeting is. And that was especially true in Marrakech. I know I got lost so many times there, and so the beacons would help you, sort of guide you where to go. So that's still an interest of ours to have. Next slide.

Okay. I can talk.

DEVANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, I can take it, actually. By the way, one observation. I noticed in the app stores, even though the ICANN meeting is gone, the old versions of the app are still there. So when you tell people, "Just search for ICANN," they tend to find the old app. I think that's perhaps there's some need for clean-up to be done in removing the old apps or something like that. Or just have one dedicated ICANN app totally. Just a suggestion.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yeah. If I can ask Mark if you can follow-up on that. An action item is: do we need to keep the old apps or what is the process of removing the old apps from the app store so that there'll be no confusion? So after the meeting is over, take down the app so

when a new one comes up and they search ICANN, they don't have to put in ICANN 57 or ICANN whatever to find out. I know Josh said he tried to get both apps having different names, but it wasn't possible.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So Mark and then Olivier. Go ahead, Mark.

MARK SEGALL: No problem. I'll chat with Josh. I believe he's already having some discussions with communications on the same topic, so I'll double-check on that.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Mark. Olivier?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. One of the things that I've been trying to do for each session is download that session and put it in my Google calendar. I did a wonderful thing, which was to, at some point, after selecting sessions, click on a thing that says "Download to your Google calendar". I proceeded to download 157 sessions which I was not planning. I was planning on seeing a lot of sessions, but not all 157 that were here. That was two days ago, and ever since, I've been spending every spare moment to delete

sessions from my calendar because you have to do them manually.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: I can't read small lines. I just read big titles these days. So yeah, I don't know how we can resolve this. I'm surprised that when you go into a session in Sched, you can't just click a link in that session and just say, "Download this thing to your Google calendar." There's no instructions for this.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Olivier, yeah, I think they can make it clearer. Having used Sched before, I know you don't want to download them because it doesn't update then. What you want to do is subscribe, and then the subscription creates a special link that is subscribed to it. Then you click that and then all of them come onto the web, and they change periodically. The only problem you have with that is that sometimes you have to add new sessions and then you have duplication. I have some duplication because I have two subscriptions. But it's getting there. But you just have to use subscribe and not the download.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. I see there is a queue. Please introduce yourself.

HOWARD BENN: Yes. I'm kind of new to this community. I work for Samsung Electronics, a little phone company. We are actually developing a whole set of technologies that are going to be very useful here, where you can use HTML5 as an app rather than having it as a webpage. So maybe we can talk about whether that technology is going to really help here bring together both the web world and the app world because you don't want to be doing things twice.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Good point. All right. Want a quick response to that, or? Go ahead, Laura and then [Jason].

LAURA BENGFORD: Just a couple points, and thank you for that. One of the reasons that we did go to Sched is that it does sync up between the web and the app, so that's good. Like Mark mentioned, there were some issues going through the Apple process. If anyone's launched mobile apps, it can be difficult to get it to work the way you want. So that's a continued issue to look at.

I'm just curious with this group, is there any feedback on Event Mobi versus Sched? Are people liking Sched better in general, or are there things that it seems to be missing that Event Mobi had? Does anybody have any feedback on Sched versus the older Event Mobi?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Sorry, I see there's queue. Satish then Judith and then Jason, we'll come back to you. All right?

SATISH BABU: My feedback is that it is satisfactory. It seems to work fine. I haven't had the problem that Olivier had, so I am reasonably happy with it.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: I'm next. I like Sched because I get changes and it updates. What's great is, for instance, this session used to be on Monday and [then] was Tuesday and Sched makes sure that the correct time and place are in my calendar entry. So that's great. I really like the scheduling of Sched. But the app only does schedules, so I have to use the Event Mobi for everything else. I wish that I can have everything in one place.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: All right, I see there's a queue. Actually, let me take Jason then Glenn, then Sebastien.

[JASON HINES]: Let me start with the feedback. I'm liking being able to use both the web and the app and have it synchronized. I want to support Olivier's point where I really would love to integrate it with my Google calendar better and seamlessly because that gives me alerts in a different way. So I think that that is one of the things that I would really like to see: a better way and an easier way to be able to add my ICANN calendar into my Google calendar en masse and accurately so that I'm getting updates from that.

And I would really love to see one ICANN app and not have to download and install an app per each meeting. I think the ICANN community has maybe diversity in terms of how people connect and the technology they use and everyone is not necessarily using the latest and fanciest phone from any of the companies in the room or the popular laptop logos we're seeing. I don't like downloading extra apps each time.

I didn't quite understand how Judith has to use Event Mobi for other stuff, so at some point, I'd like to get a further explanation.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Jason. Glenn and then Sebastien.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Great. Thank you, Dev. I think what I take away from your question [is that] this is a few people here. This is not our community. It's not fair to get assessment from a few people's opinion. I really think as an action item, Chair, that we work with you. We'll come up with a proper survey and get suggestions. Many of us have been at many, many conferences, where we like the tools they use, and come back with some solid suggestions. Okay? Can we do that?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I think that's a good action item, Glenn. Thanks.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: You do notice I didn't say my opinion. I just –

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Sebastien?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you. Yeah, in the same vein, I guess around this table, you have some people with some technical background of usage of those crazy things that we are using. And if your question was, "Is it better with these tools than with the previous meeting?" yes, I think so, but not quite. I have done this twice, once for me

and once for Anne-Marie. And when I have done it for me, I didn't have any trouble. But when I have done for Anne-Marie, I got the same problem as Olivier. And it was a second time I was doing it, and I don't know why. Something was not clear enough to remind me that, if I click there, I will download all the things and not just the calendar. But it's still painful on small devices.

During the meeting – it's not a Google calendar; I use the Apple one, but that's not a big deal – I was using the calendar and going back to the app to be sure there that there is no update to meetings. When you do your first calendar or schedule one week in advance, I didn't try to add them because I will have to go to links and to my mail to be sure that I will download again something. Then it was already too complicated for me. And I think I am less technical. That's the other guy here. But I think that I have a good knowledge of usage of those type of tools. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. Thanks. Well, obviously, we have a lot of opinions on our meeting app. So let's continue to follow it up on future TTF calls.

Oh, I see there's a remote comment, and then let's move on. [Inaudible]. Let's get a remote comment.

YESIM NAZLAAR: Yesim Nazlar, ICANN staff. There is a comment on the Adobe Connect from Alfredo Calderon. He says, “Recently, I was at the ARIN 38 meeting and they used an app that links to the calendar and that [allows the syncing of presentation materials and contacts of participants of the meeting] and has an internal messaging tool. I suggest contacting their technical staff. Thank you.”

[GLENN MCKNIGHT]: Alfredo Calderon was our representative from NARALO at the ARIN session, which was in Dallas just about a week ago, right? So they use another tool. That’s what I was saying. Let’s look at best practice and if Aron [has] a great tool, we can get to Aron people into our call.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

[GLENN MCKNIGHT]: The tool? No, we’ll have it as a TTF call.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. And Alfredo, do send us some more details on the list.

Okay. So let's move to the next slide because I want to just get in the last few minutes to future activities. This is one of the other final activities, just to acknowledge Judith and Glenn's work – continuing to update this newsletter and to make multilingual versions. Sebastien, is that a new hand, or? Okay, thank you.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: I was hoping that you were also thanking me for the interpreters.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes, and I'm acknowledging that the translation was also done by Sebastien and Eduardo, too, for the French and Spanish versions. So thanks to you all in continuing to do this. Next slide.

What want to do is spend the last few minutes just bringing up some ideas for future Technology Taskforce activities. I've put some obvious choices: continued testing of LACRALO, deploying the [rocket chart] for At-Large, looking at this XO platform, and looking at open PGP. [inaudible], a TTF member, attended the conference and was interesting in sharing his findings with us.

But I just want to ask the question from the community. What do you think the TTF should do? I see some hands raised. Okay, excellent. Glenn, then Shiva, then Sebastien.

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Okay. Very quickly, Laura knows this from experience being at the end-to-end sessions. Each of the end-to-end sessions has a Google doc that people have not only the slides, but the community interaction where they share best practices. So if we were in a session on mobile, like I was, which was on gamification – absolutely phenomenal session, but what was the value of the session was not just the presentation, but people were contributing their best practices, their links. They were sharing their ideas. We only find it by accident. I really think maybe we could push this concept for meetings in the future. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Shiva?

SHIVA UPADHYAY: Shiva Upadhyay from ISOC India [inaudible] At-Large. There's a good amount of work that is being done by the Taskforce and there's quite a lot of experts and so many meetings held. And why should it be an At-Large Technology Taskforce? Why not alleviate it as an ICANN Technology Taskforce? The work we do is relevant for the whole community, and why do you restrict it to At-Large?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. I can respond quickly. We do have members from the GAC and now the GNSO involved in the work. We started to look at what are the steps to make this a, I guess, cross-community working group and I think it will be a good idea to do so. So perhaps let's take it as an action item: look again at the steps to do it because we kind of started to do it and then we were kind of waiting on the Cross-Community Working Group's final report.

SHIVA UPADHYAY: Okay. Dev, my suggestion is not only to make it a Cross-Community Working Group to involve participants from other constituencies, but on the other side, to reach this benefit across communities and ICANN-wide. When ICANN as an organization has to learn this, they probably pay out millions in consultation fees to an expert to find out that they could use Rocket.com for chat.

So we have this expertise, we have this output. Why not use it for the whole organization? This also becomes a model by which ICANN starts functioning. It could save several hundreds of thousands of dollars paid out to consultants.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: All right. Well, I just want to get all the suggestions in. Sebastien?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you, Dev. Maybe I will not suggest to go to a Cross-Community Working Group with all the necessity to do something with a comma here and a dot here. But maybe you can call it Open At-Large because I think it's also good that we show to the overall organization that the end user is really taking into account the technology and how those meetings are taken. One of the reasons I say that is because very often, people say, "But why are you here, what are you for, and what you are doing?" and if we can show to the rest of the community what we are doing, it's a good way also. It's not in contradiction of what Shiva says, but [maybe keeping the name that At-Large is the] aim of this project and concerned with that.

Now coming to the proposal, I feel we need to decrease part of the cost of the participation. One thing I was puzzled about is that there is no tool to allow people to say when they will arrive, on which flight, and how they can share a cab or car or whatever to come. In fact, in At-Large, there's is a list of the participants – it's not public and that's good because there is personal data – in which I was able to find three other people arriving at the same flight and then we took a cab together. But Olivier, who was arriving just the same day but seven or eight hours later, was the only one in At-Large. But I am sure that he may have found a colleague in the other part of the organization.

And so we need a tool to help us when we come and when we leave, but maybe also when we are in the reception. Yesterday we were struggling to get a collective car to go from one hotel to another. I know that there is Uber and so on, but some tool will be very helpful and decrease the cost for each participant. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Sebastien. Interesting suggestions. Olivier?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Dev. Of course, we do have to raise this point that Sebastien has said, as I was on the flight with some board members, but of course, they had a car that was waiting for them and that took them to another hotel. So, unfortunately, although they were willing to perhaps take me if I was in the same hotel, they couldn't take me on this occasion.

But, of course, the Board is not aware of these things as they are in their own world.

And may I just add Board and staff. I know that staff members arriving in foreign countries, I think, are picked up at the airport. They're not just let out in the open. We have a lavish, very lavish, per diem to pay for our cars.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. We're actually almost out of time, so Jason, quickly.

[JASON HINES]:

I actually like Sebastien's contribution just now. I think it brings the community together better. So I think we should investigate such a tool, app, spreadsheet or whatever because we do have a travel matrix in the Fellowship program, for example, that's intended to do that. But if it extends to other receptions and so on, that sounds really good.

I was wondering now for this list of activities, if we can have some type of online polling to try to establish what is more popular.

And lastly, congratulations on the PTFF newsletter. Tremendous work by them. I would love to have some input on maybe some of the other ones. I did think it would have been extremely helpful to have more information on the electricity per each territory we were visiting and maybe an extension into a second page to cover it all. So I would like to help out next time.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. All right. Short interventions. Satish and then Jimmy.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Dev. There was a discussion earlier in our mailing list about periodic advisories, on matters that impact the end users, or at least, our community.

There are various issues that are happening and problems that are happening. The Skype providers which is hitting a lot of our friends, is sending out this mail to everybody on the mailing list. So can we do something about these kind of issues and give periodic advisories on how people can avoid these kinds of situations? Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Satish. I think that’s a good idea” to have some sort of security awareness, feedback. I’ve seen lots of people get, well, infected by the Skype chatroom, I should say. Jimmy, last comment.

JIMMY SCHULZ: Hi. I’m not sure if the TTF has ever done that, but is there some kind of rules on how we select software or tools? Do we have some foundation which is good, which is not good? Because otherwise, I would like to start a process like that and to start with, for example: software tools, whatever we do, should support open formats, open protocols, open standards. It doesn’t have to be, but it should support them so everyone can

take part and communicate with each other and to avoid [Walt Gardens].

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Jimmy. So just quick acknowledgements before it's time to close off this meeting. This actually has been a very interesting session and I'm very appreciative of all the comments and contributions made.

I just want say a few acknowledgements. First of all, Nathalie Peregrine was our staff lead for this group and she had to step aside to do the GNSO work. So I just acknowledge her. And thanks to Ariel for stepping in so wonderfully as the staff lead for the Technology Taskforce.

I just also want to thank the ICANN staff. I think, over the past year, we've seen a lot better interaction on the technology issues and getting some feedback and so forth. And it's been really greatly appreciated. So thanks to the ICANN staff on that.

Just one more final acknowledgement is that Glenn McKnight is stepping down as one of the TTF coaches. But he's not going away. Thankfully, he'll still be contributing to the Technology Taskforce. We just want to thank and acknowledge Glenn for his co-chairing.

And I think from that sense, we exceeded our time. We'd like to thank everyone. This this session is now adjourned. Thank you all very much. Have a wonderful afternoon.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]