HYDERABAD – Joint AFRALO-AfrICANN Meeting
Tuesday, November 08, 2016 – 15:15 to 16:45 IST
ICANN57 | Hyderabad, India

AZIZ HILALI: …declaration so we can express the opinion of the AfrICANN Community – that it is from AFRALO and all the participants in other constituencies of the ICANN. And this regarding all the interests in questions that we have in our region. Therefore, we can express our opinion, but also so we can give to the board of ICANN some information about the problems that we have to face in our region.

I want to thank, as well, the committee which was put together for the drafting of this declaration. This committee worked really hard on this theme. I'm talking about Mohammed, Tijana, and Seun who worked really hard. And I proudly remind you that we were the only RALO who had participated in the public comment on this question. This committed spent hours and was present during all of the discussion.

Without waiting, I am going to give the microphone to our guests. And I want to first of all thank Mr. Göran Marby for his presence at each session of the African Meetings, and a lot of

---

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

people in this committee wish that Mr. Marby comes to Africa to meet us. And he's welcome.

GÖRAN MARBY: My French isn't very good. More or less, the only thing I can say, which I can't say is (speaking French). And that is after four years of study French.

I actually think I'm… I'm looking at Tarek. I'm supposed to go to…

TAREK KAMEL: Yes.

GÖRAN MARBY: When?

TAREK KAMEL: January 23 through 25th. This is a proposal that we [forwarded to you].

GÖRAN MARBY: I haven't said yes, have I?

TAREK KAMEL: Not yet.

EN

GÖRAN MARBY: No. I always try to refrain to say "go to Africa" because that's like saying that I'm going to Europe. It's a very large continent with many countries. So, I always try to be more specific.

First of all, thank you very much for inviting me here. It's a pleasure to be here. Some of you have heard the speech now a couple of times because I've given it like 10 times this week. But I want to go back to something as well.

In my opening speech, I talked about what happens after transition. And I said that – we are not done. We saw, for instance, last week in Tunis that there were discussions about what we do and how we can proceed. There were countries, also African countries, who entered into that discussion. I think that one of those antidotes for that is to have a very engaged and diverse community.

So, what is in a diverse and engaged community? We're all [for instance], we come… I'm a European. The Internet started out as a North American project, Latin language. Latin languages have been around, and now when Internet usage is getting more, we have to be better at engaging ourselves and port and work together with countries outside Europe and North America.

We need that diversity because the Internet is much more… we often use the world "global," but the Internet is actually both things. The Internet is a global thing, but what you're looking for is often local content.

Now, we have to be better – and I have to admit that – within ICANN to figure out how we're going to do working forward. So, what you're doing is essentially very important. We have 3.6 billion Internet users right now. That was at least week. And that's going to continue to grow. But it's in your constituencies, it's your part of the world that a lot of that growth would come from, so we need you doing that.

I will now let you in on secret. We are now currently, within my organization, trying to figure out how we're going to do engagement going forward. One of the questions we're asking ourselves is, can we actually decide where to go and how to engage? Probably not, or we can't. Because we've been approaching this a little bit from…

Within our mission and within our bylaws, we're also going to be restrained by that. But we've always been looking at it as this is the only message we do. This is the only thing. [Comparisons] say that the country in Africa and our Washington, D.C. office says the same thing.

So, we're entering in a road and I don't have the answers to exactly how to do that because we are going to engage our local teams to do that. We have to do what we call more demand-driven engagement. That means that we will actually go out and talk to people to see what kind of needs do you have.

I'm, again, emphasizing that we're going to stay within our mission and within our bylaws because the only measure I have about what we do and how we support you is, actually, if we do support you. And the only one that can validate that is you.

So, we are entering a new phase in how we do things where we will interact with you in local part of the community to see how we can do things in a better way. And it's going to be different because the difference is going along – it's bigger than we've ever seen before.

But I want to come back to one thing, and I repeated that many times. One of the things that I'm really amazed coming into the ICANN family is the amount of volunteers who spend so much time, free time, and I understand that some of you actually have a life. I gave mine up. But I want to engage with you, also, how we can make that time effort both well worth it. But also, how we can do it in such a way that we don't end up…

And Alan is a strong… every time I speak to Alan, a gentleman I respect a lot, he's talking about the fatigue that you can have coming into those processes.

So, another thing we tried we will look into a little bit later is how can we work together in a most important way, a more infected way. The reason I do that is because I'm here to support you. I can go on for this one, but you are actually much more important than I am. I think that this meeting and what you do is very, very important. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank. Thank you very much, Göran. And sorry, Alan, I didn't respect the schedule of the meeting. But first, I would like to speak. But if there are questions for Göran, maybe we'll let them for later after Alan is finished with his speech.

ALAN GREENBERG: I'll make half of my speech right now. Normally, I've been conflicted and had to run out as soon as I spoke. I don't have to today. I will be here for – well, not the whole meeting, but most of it. So, order things in whatever way you want. That's fine.

I thought we were going to take questions for Göran. Okay.

GÖRAN MARBY: Go.

ALAN GREENBERG: Okay.

GÖRAN MARBY: For the record, Alan, I think that you're much more important than me, so speak at length.

ALAN GREENBERG: All right. I rarely speak at length. And I've just given the introduction already that I'm delighted that today I don't have to run out as soon as I finish speaking. I've been working with At-Large now for 10 years. For a good number of those years, the people we had working with At-Large – the regional leaders, the ALAC members from Africa – would regularly say we have real problems engaging people; it's hard finding people who are really willing to work and understand. I'm sure that's still the case to some extent.

But when I look at the people we have taking responsibility now, both on the ALAC and within the RALO, you're doing as well or better than any other region. It's hard to find people that are committed and willing to work, I know, but I have to say you're doing really great and I'd like to hope you'll continue that.

We've got a great team of people on the ALAC. The regional leaders are active. And we also have people who are no longer regional leaders who are staying active and participating, and I can't imagine a better scenario than what we have right now going forward.

So, I congratulate you on getting to this point, and I'm waiting to be able to make this talk and say you're better than any other region. I won't let them hear me say that, of course, but I'll give whatever words of encouragement I can. It's delightful to see the commitment that we have from people who are engaged right now. And just looking at the number of people in this room, knowing there are competing sessions going on, you're going great. Thank you.

AZIZ HALALI: Thank you, Alan. Now, I would like Pierre Dandjinou to take the microphone, and I hope that we can finish a discussion now because Mr. Göran has to leave very soon.

So maybe we could accept a couple of questions now if Pierre and Khaled don't mind. So, therefore, let's give 5 to 10 minutes to questions to Mr. Marby, if that's at all possible.

EN

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you, Aziz. I don't have much to say because at At-Large, I feel at home as you know. So, I'm here to thank you, thank you for all we do in Africa. We need a lot of your support. We have a very good relationship, but I hope we could do more since with ICANN right now we have a certain amount of things important to do when it comes to engagement at the African level. At all levels as you said earlier that all of this, especially, the engagement part was very important.

These last three or four years, we have tried to push and we have tried to do what we thought was so important to Africa when it came to strategy – especially, the one we have developed together we had good results. But we need to be more efficient and so we have to do on-demand engagement. We have a challenge to be understood. We have to be understood by the leaders – by the African government – and we have to work with the private sector in Africa. We don't do that enough.

So, for me, I know that you are engaged in At-Large, but I would be so happy that you could help us to go deeper in the country and speak to other part of the society who do not understand the principle and that is the challenge in Africa. The government themselves do not understand. The rule makers do not understand. We also have the private sector and the academia which does not always understand. Therefore, I would like to thank you anyway for this tradition that you have pursued since

ICANN|57
HYDERABAD
3-9 November 2016

2010. I'm very proud of the effort. And I want to thank you so much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Pierre. We are going to take 5 or 10 minutes for questions to Mr. Marby or Mr. Greenberg.

WAFA DAHMANI:: Just one thing. Later, you said, Göran, you support us that we will benefit with this support. That's what you said earlier, no? I think if it can't engage and support AFRINIC, it will be ever a deal win-win between ICANN and this region. The more you engage in Africa, the more the more the industry and the more the benefit also comes to ICANN. That's what I wanted to say.

GÖRAN MARBY: As I said, we're starting a process of how to interact, and it has to come from… It sounds like I'm selling something, but I have a fundamental believe that you're the ones who actually sets the score how well we do. You are the ones who should tell us and help tell us what kind of support you need in a region. We just have to figure out the mechanics of doing that so we can also have this all the way up to the budget process and the way we do things.

For the last couple of years – This is an evolving thing. I had a fantastic meeting with the NextGen people yesterday. If you ever have the opportunity to meet Next Generation, do that. It was extremely… The questions were really hard, but I felt so energized. And the reason why that is, the more we can tap into the knowledge of what we don't know, the better we will be going forward.

For me, that is really what I am trying to do – to figure out this small thing how we can better engage in such a way it suits your needs going forward. The mechanism of that, I don't have yet. Now, working together with Sally and David and Tarek and the other ones who try to formulate that and then come back to the community in different parts and ask, "How should we do that so that we can build that into a process so you can measure how we can do things?"

I don't have the answers right now. I came so far. I actually have the questions, which satisfies me. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much. Thank you, Göran, as well, for your passion and your support for Africa. And thank you, Pierre and Tarek.

I just want to mention that, especially as it concerns new gTLD, if we look at the past, the first round, you will notice that applications from Africa were significantly low. And then right now, we are now talking about the second round, a possibility of a second round happening soon.

I don't think it should make a difference for any intents of increasing applications from Africa. So, that means that before any round can happen, there has to be some level of increase in capacity within the region. Capacity in terms of economic capacity; in terms of capacity of personnel. And I see that a lot of workers started already, even though there's still a lot that's required to be done.

So, I would like to ask to what extent is ICANN collaborating with governments because, of course, ICANN can't do these things alone towards trying to gather resources towards a empowering the people in that community. Because if the economy is strong enough, then maybe we'll start sending some applications, survive the process because we have a lot of – a number of applications that couldn't survive the first round and they lost some amount of money in the process. Thank you.

GÖRAN MARBY: It's really been a theme for many of us here to talk about the next round or the even newer gTLD. We have to stop calling it a new gTLD Program. We can come up with something new. I noted, I mean, my role in this is really to step back and support the community discussion in that. You're doing the right thing. You're raising questions that you may or may not look into.

When it comes to us engaging, we don't have money to help governments. According to our mission and bylaws, it's very important that we stay within our frame. With that said, I think that a lot of discussions that go wrong, also in Africa right now – that if those ideas goes on it, will have a negative effect of interoperability of Internet where people are talking about alternatives.

We need to figure out a way engaging with those governments to talk about, yes, it maybe sounds like a good idea, but it could actually hurt the interoperability and, therefore, it could hurt your citizens potential to reach inside and outside the country.

Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Before passing the mic to Tijani, I just saw some stats not long ago and I saw that the next billion of users of the Internet will

EN

come from the region of Middle East, Africa, and Asia. There is an evolution of the users of Internet of four digits. Therefore, we have to be ready right away, especially us Africans. We need to adapt.

We need to be ready and do some outreach towards the governments, towards the organization. As Seun said earlier, during the first round of applications for the new gTLDs they were only 17 requests, and those 17 requests came from South Africa. So, this is where we have to work. Let's now let Tijani take the mic.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: [inaudible] It is not in the remit of ICANN to empower the underserved countries to make them able to apply or to help, or to run a gTLD. But the issue is not that. What we are requesting is to consider the underserved region when this kind of program is developed. Last round, when it was developed, the application fees was—

TAREK KAMEL: I think there has been a little bit of misunderstanding as such. We have a program that we are starting with Alice Munyua serving underserved region. Alice is from the African Union, and Africa has a priority, definitely, in this program, but not an

exclusivity. It includes, also, some parts of Asia as well as islands and some other locations.

But the target of this program, Seun, is the following: To train GAC members, members of the GAC, to participate – not governments to improve their economy as such. But to train the members of the GAC on the complex issues within ICANN, as such, of this very specific program in Phase 1 in order to make their participation more inclusive and to encourage them to come and participate.

So, if this is what you mean, this is being started with Alice and Anne-Rachel and Pierre and the whole team.

The other global stakeholder engagement, maybe Pierre can say something about it.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Well, we're already doing some of those things now for our Africa strategy, definitely. So, what we need now is maybe consider, what I might say, the new era now that we are entering in ICANN and make sure that all of this conquer to [inaudible] engagement with Africa.

So, I hear you, Seun, but also, at some point – and what [inaudible] is saying – that it's also up to us at some point to

voice out what is actually we need in terms of new engagement like we did last time.

So, things have been done, and Tarek has just said, that all of the new ideas and initiatives. So, I will just say that let's continue discussing about these issues and finding the best way Africa being presented. And as far as I'm concerned, it's about participation of Africa.

GÖRAN MARBY: Thank you. Unfortunately, I have to leave. I feel awful because I would like to have stayed on. I bet this discussion is going to be more interesting than the next one, but maybe next time I can have more time. It's probably my fault anyway.

But you're doing a very important job. I would like to learn more from you and, as it looks like, I'm coming to – where in Africa?

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Nairobi.

GÖRAN MARBY: I'm coming to Nairobi in January, I think. Thank you very much. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: We have one more question. New Speaker. [inaudible]

We'll continue with the speeches. And we're going to let Monsieur Tarek Kamel speak. Thank you, Tarek, for being here.

TAREK KAMEL: …inviting me, and I'm delighted here on behalf of my colleague Sally Costerton as well and myself and the other colleagues on the executive committee, definitely who are very happy and delighted that Göran was here. And I think that your invitation to him to come to Africa will encourage him definitely to do this step very soon.

Let's talk about the issues… Unfortunately, I couldn't be with you in the African session the other day because we had a conflict. But I have been living that with my friends here, Aziz and Tijani and Pierre and Adiel and Fiona and Seun. I don't want to mention all names because I'm [inaudible] definitely as such.

I think that we have a challenge as an ICANN African Community at the time being. The challenge is that we need to overcome a little bit the issue of .Africa with our community. Whatever the result of .Africa, this issue has caused a lot of bitterness in the region. But it cannot also stop our engagement activities and will stop everything in the region and overshadow ICANN completely because of one single application, one single TLD

that has been handled with different legal aspects. At the time being I don't want to get into details.

Why am I saying that? Because last week, honestly – or in the last two or three weeks – we have seen something that is not positive. And when I say not positive, we have in this case to blame ourself. The African ministers and the African governments, as such (it started with a meeting in Cairo, but continued afterwards in Hammamet at WTSA) were very negative about the multistakeholder model and about ICANN – not all of them, but many of them.

Let's be frank – mainly triggered by .Africa and looking for alternative solutions, and a tone that we haven't heard at least within the last five, six, or seven years. Let me put it like that. It might not be very new, but it was a quite aggressive tone led by African – and supported by other regions – against the GAC, against the multistakeholder model, against ICANN, and against different things, and wanting to take the work over to ITU. Whether it's possible or not, that's something else.

But just this position has been an awkward position for us as an African ICANN Community. So, I want to put this on the table because, although it is a political issue, [inaudible] it is an issue that is related to the gTLD Program. But it is definitely something that we need to be working on, not to let out of our

eyes or we will find that we are losing the support of different African governments in the region.

Therefore, and before that, we have been working to answer Seun's question very specifically. On our program was Alice Munyua to work with the GAC on a capacity building for GAC members and government officials inside the GAC and outside the GAC, for law enforcement and other issues, in order to help in the direction that you are talking about, Seun.

We have the sources for that and it's being supported and adopted. We hope that we will have an African event that we will invite you to because it will not be only for GAC, but also for the other stakeholders event that we were talking about on the 23rd to the 25th of January in Nairobi.

It is a first experiment that we are doing at capacity building for African government. And Alice and Anne-Rachel are leading that together with Pierre and Adiel and a number of pioneers. Why? Because we have done an outreach all together and made the participation a number of [inaudible] members in the GAC to [170]. But are they all coming to the meetings? The answer is no. Are they all as active as we want them? The answer is no. Do they all see the value of their participation of ICANN? The answer is no. And it's not a matter fellowships, because we provide fellowships and they still don't come as such.

So, we need to look how to make the participation within ICANN meaningful for them. And you need to guide us as a community also to tell us, "Here are the main players in the governments that we need to work with together." Because you have your contacts within your countries. You are there.

It is our responsibility to partner with others to do the right capacity building programs for them in areas related to ICANN, in areas related to law enforcement of DNS issues in security of DNS and DNSSEC and alike and different priorities. But we also count on you on working together because at the end, it is a support for the multistakeholder model.

So, we have you as our ambassadors there from At-Large and from AFRALO – very specifically in the African countries – pinpoint to us for the influential government people that we need to be talking to. I don't have embassies that are representing ICANN in 50 countries or [170] countries worldwide. And this will never be the case; let's be realistic. But I also have very knowledgeable community members like you that are helping us and are guiding us in this process.

So, do we have an issue with some African governments? The answer is yes. But we count on working on that together in order to bridge the gap, very specifically that Suen is doing. And then, automatically they will be enhancing the relations and policies.

Then when they have enough awareness and will be encouraging industry that could happen there.

So, we have a framework. We have the resources. We have presented it the other day to the GAC. It was adopted because it has to have a whole more than within ICANN – the constituencies, you understand. But it will not be exclusive only to governments, and we need your help when we go to the different sub-regions of Africa in that.

We'll start on the 23rd of January [inaudible] as such. But then, we need to go to West Africa and South Africa and Central Africa and other parts of Africa.

So, that's an issue that I wanted to put on the table to bridge over the issue of .Africa – irrespectable what will happen with it now and we look forward to your support as usual and your participation and your guidance in that.

So, thank you very much, and I think this clarifies a bit the immediate plans that we have very specifically for Africa. And I'm happy to answer any questions.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tarek. We have listened to the plan which you described, and we thank ICANN for their efforts, like the event you're going to organize in January in Nairobi.

We are going now to speak with Khaled Koubaa who just became Chairman, one of the members of the Board of ICANN. He is from Tunisia and he's going to speak now. Thank you.

KHALED KOUBAA: Thank you, Aziz. Hello everyone. I'm very happy to speak French, but for the continuity of the discussion I'd rather speak in English.

Well, I'm from Tunisia. I recently joined the Board, in fact today at the general meeting. I'm glad to be here as member of the African Community.

For the record, I would like first of all to recognize and thank Aziz Hilali as a person, because, for those who don't know, 11 years ago I was trying to find a way to participate at the WSIS. And because I was not capable to get accreditation, Aziz has accepted to consider me as a member of the ISOC chapter in Morocco and helped me to be inside this great space of the Internet governance.

This, in fact, led after that to the creation of the ISOC chapter in Tunisia, and then we became active and later on in 2007 we became a founding member of the AFRALO. So, we are proud to be part of the AFRALO. We are proud to be part of the African community.

I think I have seen the statement about the Transition when it was prepared by the community. I found it, since I've seen it, a great statement and it shows how much the African Community and AFRALO was important for the Transition.

We recognize, in the Board, the role of the African Community in that. I think it's obvious, and everyone has said it, which makes us very proud about the African Community. This is, in fact, the result of the great work of you guys doing a lot of capacity building to every one of us to be as much impactful as we need to be.

And this is to answer the theme of this meeting. Obviously, our friend and colleague Renalia – unfortunately she was not able to come due to a very urgent personal issue. But I would like also to recognize her work. Even though I know her now a few months, but I'm so happy to have such a great colleague from the At-Large Community, very active and very impactful. She shared with me some thought that I will be also happy to share with you.

Both of us we agreed on several points in regards to the AFRALO Community. One of them is we would like first to recognize the work that the African Team in ICANN has been doing to engage the African Community. The strategy meeting yesterday, I think,

EN

with Pierre was to show a little bit of the work that had been done.

And I recognize the numbers that Pierre was sharing with us. He said there were more than 150 persons registered and 100 persons attending this meeting. I think the fact that this meeting is so far from Africa and we have here 100 persons shows how much we are dedicated, how much we are engaged. And this is a good point to highlight.

One of the other things I would like to stress, and I will take it as one of my priorities, is to ensure that there is continuous support from the ICANN to the community whenever – from the African Community side or the At-Large in general. This is a very important task for us in the Board and then the ICANN Org. as well.

I think the reason for me as, a person, is that in order for us to support the multistakeholder model, we need to support all the stakeholders together – but each one of the stakeholders and in a manner that will fit to its needs. I'm sure that the need from the private sector is not the same than the civil society, so we need to make sure that there is equal or at least a fair support for the civil society to support them.

There is also the fact that we need to engage the AFRALO work on more the policy development work, a little bit as impactful as you guys are doing in the generic side of the policy development.

We recognize that the AFRALO is doing great work when it comes to discussing policy related to the GNSO side, to also in the same level than the African Community is making impact on the discussion about policy related to numbers. I'm personally not seeing any, but I think there is much more work that needs to be done on the CC level as well.

One of the remarks that I heard yesterday in the strategy meeting was about how to engage and make sure that there is more registration at the domain names, ccTLDs, in Africa. This is something very important, I think, for us. But for sure, it needs to be done at the policy level and it needs to be discussed in the African Community.

Other than that, I also would like to highlight that one of the issues that was raised in the strategy meeting was about the need to bring more business, highlight more the entrepreneurship side of the domain name sector.

I think, somehow, we need to stress that there is a lot of benefit for the startups in Africa, for the young generation of participants to show them what are the several possibilities for them to engage in a business way that will add value to their life,

to their business, to their economy through a business of the domain name industry. And this also was mentioned in yesterday's meeting.

So, overall I think we're so much proud of being African, so much proud of the work and I wish you continuous excellence. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much Khaled.

Lawrence? Now Lawrence wants to speak.

LAWRENCE OLAWALE-ROBERTS: …from Nigeria and a member of the Business Constituency. Thank you, Board member, because you touched on something I was going to speak about, which has to do with engagement of the business community within the African region.

I'm in total support of the issues that Seun has brought up, but I feel that, in the same vein in which we are interacting closely with government – with the GAC – we actually need to mobilize and educate better the businesses that we have within the African region. I believe that if we do, we might end up having better success with the New gTLD program and we'll definitely record more active participation.

You will recall that in the last days of our wait for the Transition to go through, it was actually with the help of some big businesses that we had in the U.S. standing behind the IANA transition, we were able to block the interest of governments.

And so, there is so much to gain if we extend our reach outside the premise of the registrars and the registries. I know that they contribute a lot to the funding of ICANN, but we can also use this opportunity of being around this table with the focus of developing the DNS sector in Africa to also give a focus to businesses outside the registry and the registrar side of the business.

I believe that if businesses within the African region are better educated on the business side of the DNS, if they're better equipped with capacity to not just be able to integrate and be technically sound, we have the advantage of number on our side.

And so, my appeal is to see the kind of intervention that we're giving to the registry, that's the registrar side of the business, the kind of intervention that we're giving to GAC and others could equally be extended.

We're not saying throw the [phones] in, but let's see how we can mobilize and build capacity within the African region for businesses. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Lawrence. We are late on our schedule because now we have to let Tijani and Seun speak. But first, I would like to give two minutes to Allan. I'll remind you that we have a memorandum that we signed with AFRINIC within which we have a lot of cooperation. I want to give you two minutes first because we have to keep on going.

ALAN BARRETT: It's nice to be here, and thank you for giving me the opportunity to say a few words. I will indeed keep it brief. I'd just like to emphasize that AFRINIC would like to continue our good cooperation with the AFRALO community.

And as you know, Aziz, but perhaps the rest of you don't, AFRALO will have a booth at our upcoming AFRINIC meeting in Mauritius in the last week of November and everybody is invited. Please come to the beautiful island of Mauritius and join us in our AFRINIC meeting. And also, don't forget the Africa Internet Summit which will be in Nairobi, Kenya in May.

Again, you're all invited and I'm not sure that AFRALO will have a little side meeting there as they usually do during the AIS events. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Alan. I wanted to tell all the participants that during the projects of AFRALO, we will prepare the AG which will take in Johannesburg. We will invite all the ALSes. I have a very large amount of ALSes, 45 of them. We have doubled the number in very little time, within 10 years, and I would like to tell all the representatives of the ALS that they will be invited.

Please, for those who don't know, tell them. Sometimes we have difficulty contacting them because they have changed their e-mail or their phone numbers. So we will need for you to communicate with them and help us.

First, I would like to ask Alan if he can help us as well in organizing the meeting in Johannesburg because there will be a general assembly and there will be activities we will put together. We are telling you now and we are asking you for some sponsoring.

Adiel? If I introduce Adiel, I will introduce him badly. So I'll let him introduce himself. I'm very happy that you're here, Adiel.

ADIEL AKPLOGEN:

Thank you, Aziz. Adiel, Vice President for Technical Engagement at ICANN. I will speak in English. I just want to thank you, Aziz, and all for the thought you have put in developing the AFRALO and the link between AFRALO and the African Community, which

is a wider community. And I think when we started, this was a very small group but it has grown and become consistent in terms of participation, contribution, and also in the number. I think that is something very encouraging.

I also think that, to follow-up a little bit on what Tarek just said, we all – collectively and usually – we are the ambassador of what is happening here at ICANN. And the fact that now the At-Large Community is organized with the ALS gives even more power because the ALS at the local level can reflect the needs to the ICANN level.

As we always say, think global but act local. We have to take that up, and it is our collective responsibility to do that. And we at ICANN are very much open to have your feedback directing us to where we should put the resources to be more efficient both in engaging the community at large locally, but also government which are the big actors in our region. Thanks.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Adiel. We will go to our discussion on the theme, which I remind you we needed to decide on the declaration. A lot of work has been done by the team. I would like those who worked on the draft to speak first. I'm going to start with the youngest one. Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay, thank you. Yes, the young one. The young shall grow. Thank you very much. I won't take five minutes. I'm given five minutes, but I think I'll just do it in one.

The statement is right in front of us. It's been a very engaging last three years for us as a community, and I think it's a very good improvement from Africa as a whole as it concerns the participation in the stewardship transition.

But I just want to say that it's not over yet. We're going to WS2, which is Work Stream 2, and I think we need to be reenergized. I noticed that we are perhaps getting tired. We need to wake up back and then start participating in the various subgroups that have been created.

[inaudible] I'll just say thank you to those that have participated in WS1, and let's keep it up. Thank you

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, Seun. I can tell you we have experts for the transition. Now if you have any question, you can ask us. I will now let Tijani speak.

EN

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Aziz. When we started working on this, we wanted to know which themes we were going to talk about during this session. There were many propositions, but people said, "Ah, they're enough. Enough is enough. We have spoken about Transition all the time, responsibilities, etc." People thought that the Transition is finished, but it's not the case.

Transition was done, that's true. But there are mechanisms within the Transition that have to do with responsibilities. And those were necessary because before you had the NTIA and the American government which supervised the functions of IANA. But now that this link was cut, who is ICANN responsible towards? Who do they need to respond to?

So, the work group on the responsibility had done the work in two ways – in two phases, sorry. There was a phase about the accountability mechanisms which were necessary for the transition. And the second part was the work on the mechanisms which were not necessary for the Transition, but were necessary for the work of ICANN after Transition.

We're working right now on the second part. It is much harder than the first part because all the hot topics led to the second part, and now we have nine groups that are working on all the different themes. And this is all very necessary for the good functioning of ICANN in the future.

ICANN|57
HYDERABAD
3-9 November 2016

And I can tell you that we are far from having a consensus on most of the issues, and this is why it was necessary that we speak yet again of the Transition and the accountability. First of all, because we wanted to thank the community for this Transition because it was really a good thing; but we also wanted to thank those who have given their effort and their time in order to go through this Transition.

And also, we wanted to tell which were our worries for the future in order to find out how the second part was going to be led – what would be the means we could use in order to have the right results for that second part for those results to be in interest of the community, for the public's interest and not only for commercial interest or political interest.

That is why we have chosen this theme, and this is why we have written this declaration. That statement is not that long. It's very clear, but it shows, in my opinion, that we have followed the process. We have participated in the process, and there are worries that we have that we want to avoid and we declared and we have put them in this declaration.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tijani. Thank you for having summarized this declaration which will be read right now. I will let Sarah Kiden who is a little less young, but who is the last secretary of AFRALO

because she has this new role as of this new meeting. Sarah, do you want to say it in French or in English?

SARAH KIDEN: After all this, because I've spoken in French, I'm almost tempted to read the French version, but I'll do that two meetings from now.

AFRALO-AfrICANN joint meeting, Hyderabad, Tuesday 8th November 2016. The topic is The Impact of the IANA Transition and ICANN Accountability on Africa.

We, the African ICANN community members participating in the ICANN 57th International Public Meeting in Hyderabad and attending the joint AFRALO African meeting on Tuesday 8th November 2016. discussed the IANA Functions Stewardship Transition and its implementation as well as the ICANN Accountability Work Stream 2 Proposal Development.

We first want to congratulate the entire Internet community for the completion of the process of the IANA Functions Stewardship Transition from the U.S. government to the Multistakeholder Community.

This transition would not be possible without the huge amount of work undertaken by the ICANN community over the past years towards developing the various proposals with the precious help

of the ICANN Board of Directors as well as the dedication and hard work of the wonderful ICANN staff.

Our thanks go also to the NTIA and especially to Larry Strickling who was one of the key persons in the Transition initiative, together with the former ICANN president and CEO, Fadi Chehadé.

We are pleased that the U.S. government kept to its plan of completing the privatization of the DNS as planned since the inception of ICANN in 1998. That Act will also strengthen the Internet Multistakeholder Model of Internet Governance.

We commend the effort of the Cross Community Working Group on Accountability for forming nine subgroups to address the various issues identified by the supplemental final proposal on Work Stream 1 recommendations.

We strongly recommend to the nine subgroups to strictly follow the recommendations detailed in Annex 12 of the Work Stream 1 Supplemental Final Proposal, and specifically to remain focused on the scope of the Work Stream 2 as described in Annex 12 to address all the issues identified in Annex 12 without addition or diminution;

To keep in mind the narrow mission of ICANN while working on those issues and avoid to give recommendations that burden it;

and while the inspiration from other documents is encouraged, the only reference document that is binding for the various subgroups remains the Work Stream 1 Supplemental Final Proposal.

We reiterate our support to the CCWG's idea of subgroups, and we expect that it will make the work more productive. However, considering that these are concurrent activities, it becomes difficult for the community members to be able to participate actively or even follow the discussions. We are concerned that participation within the subgroups may lack the desired level of diversity that is required for such work.

In view of this, we suggest that a phased approach to the subgroup is considered so that all the activities are not happening concurrently to reduce the level of burnout on the volunteers.

As the CCWG continues its work for Work Stream 2, we'd like to reiterate our previous comment in Marrakesh and in Helsinki. The Work Stream 1 was developed at a pace beyond average. This has made it difficult for some volunteers to follow-up with the process, hence may have reduced the level of diversity of use in the development of the proposal.

In view of this, we recommend that adequate and flexible time be provided for the development of Work Stream 2. ICANN

accountability is a continuous process, and while we understand that, we do not have all the time to ourselves. We believe that we no longer have a hard target compared to Work Stream 1.

Finally, we would like to acknowledge and welcome the new era ICANN is entering in by the fact that the expiration of the U.S. government contract and the transition of its stewardship to the Internet community. We look forward to participating in further contributing to the development of ICANN in the global public interest. Thank you.

AZIZ HIALI: Thank you, Sarah. We will now ask [Nasan] to speak.

If you have modification, if you have comments or questions to Seun, Tijani – concerning the Transition – you can do so. We still have 20 minutes.

FIONA ASONGA: I just want to understand what you mean when you say in the statement that Work Stream 2 – that the working groups are moving at the same pace. They are not. Each Work Stream has its own schedule with which to work, so there is actually room and it's possible for us to engage in the work streams. They're not all at the same pace because of the way the work is being

approached. Some are faster than others. Others are slower and also much more complex.

So, the way in which the work streams are structured, there is the target when all the work needs to be completed. However, the pace is varying. and for some they might slightly overshoot that set target. So it's not cast in stone. So. I needed to understand what you mean by saying that they are moving too fast at the same time.

SEAN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much, Fiona. Maybe it could be a choice of words. I think the intent to communicate there is the fact that all the subgroups have started and they're working concurrently. They are operating concurrently so you can be able to have an oversight of each of them if you really want to.

So, maybe it's a choice of words. We may reword it from fast pace or same pace, perhaps to call it concurrent. They're happening concurrently. That's what is intended to be communicated.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Tijani. Yes, you spoke about the pace. We mentioned the pace but it was on another…

EN

We said that the Work Stream 1 was at very high speed, at a very fast pace. And we said that for Work Stream 2, we don't want it to be like this because we don't have a hard stop as we had in Work Stream 1.

And the second issue is about the simultaneous work of all the subgroups. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. Barrack?

BARRACK OTIENO: Thank you, Aziz. Mine is to commend Seun and Tijani and Fiona for being at the frontline in this exercise, and just to encourage more of us from the African Community to participate.

You can participate as an observer. Some of us just observe and occasionally comment, but I think if we are going to be effective in ICANN, then it's important that we really understand what this organization is, especially when it's going forward.

So, let's not be those who shout from the wayside, but let's understand. And I'm saying this in relation to what our colleague, Lawrence, from the business community said. I think if we are able to understand, then we'll be able to get the most out of ICANN as an institution. Just a few comments. Thank you.

EN

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Barrack. Fiona, you have the floor.

FIONA ASONGA: The challenge is on us as a community to encourage more Africans to participate because we cannot say that because the work is happening simultaneously, we would like to appeal for it to sort of be staggered. Already, in the CCWG, the participants are split to be able to get that work done.

As a community, we must make sure that there are enough of us going on to those calls and participating in the calls. Maybe, for example, one thing that I do – and this I don't do because I'm a CEO – but I have encouraged my staff in the office – when there are different calls at different times during the hours that are comfortable for them in the office, I allow them to listen in to those calls, and sometimes even ask them if there's anything say that is interesting, make a note and let us discuss.

So, we do have a time in the office where we sit and discuss ICANN and the Transition and what new things have come up on the calls. What is that doing? It's empowering those teams, the team in my office to know what the discussion is about, to be involved. And if they were tasked to participate, they would do it effectively.

EN

And I think all of us here need to be able to have a team that we are encouraging to participate in that manner so that we're not feeling restrained. Because for those who've taken on some of the sessions, I don't even appear on the call, though I'm registered maybe as a member or as an observer.

They come in and I'll get the notes. I'll go through the transcript. I'll listen to them. I'll guide them. We'll have the discussion. At the end of the day, there should be someone else – for me, I look at it as there should be someone else who knows what's going on and that can update my constituency other than me.

If we all think of it that way, we will make sure that there are enough Africans participating and we will not be strained by the simultaneous activities.

AZIZ HALALI: This is a very difficult subject to explain even to our governments, to our communities within Africa. That's why Tarek Kamel, earlier, was saying that we were the ambassadors. And this is the case for everyone.

We have tried to create – or at least to do at AFRALO level – we have tried to do a webinar with ALS. Tijani and I have tried with a little bit of financial help from ICANN to do some outreach on the subject, but very few people can understand. They have to be

ICANN|57
HYDERABAD
3-9 November 2016

really interested. This is good what you do in your office. I hope everybody does that. Thank you. Anybody else want to speak?

CHRIS [CHUMANGA]: My name is Chris [Chumanga]. I'm from the CCTRDCD. I just want to ask somebody, if possible, because I'm just reading and I'm trying to understand the Work Stream 2 and Work Stream 1. Is it maybe, in two lines or briefly – just for me, it was a bit new on the document. Just to understand that there's an issue in terms of the way things should be handed over. Is it just possible that maybe for some of us who did not really follow up at the beginning, just to give a brief on the Work Stream 2 in the document that you're mentioning? Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you for this question. As I told you, CCWG accountability worked on two tracks, or two work streams, if you want. Work Stream 1 was for all the accountability mechanisms needed for the Transition to happen, and Work Stream 2 was for the other mechanisms that are perhaps not necessary for the Transition but they are necessary for the functioning of ICANN. So, we can make the transition and finish them later.

So, the Transition has happened; now we're working on Work Stream 2 and, as I said at the beginning, it is even more difficult

– this Work Stream 2 – because all the hard issues have been passed to Work Stream 2. And that's why the work has been broken down in nine subgroups. Each group addresses one topic such as jurisdiction, human rights, diversity, transparency, SO and ACs accountability, staff accountability, etc. Nine subgroups.

The work of these subgroups is different from what we did in Work Stream 1 because in Work Stream 1, we worked altogether and we advanced altogether because we need the result at a certain date.

In Work Stream 2, we don't have this hard stop, but we also don't have all the time we want. So, the work was broken down and each subgroup is working according to the complexity of the subject. So, I don't know how to explain that it is more important because the things that couldn't be solved in Work Stream 1 are now in Work Stream 2.

So, that's why I believe that we will finish this work, but we will have our time to finish it because otherwise we will not do it properly. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. Tarek?

TAREK KAMEL: Thank you, Aziz, and thank you, Tijani, for the comments. And I want to add also to what has been said about the Work Stream 1 and Work Stream 2 participation from Africa the following:

At the end, we wanted the Transition to happen in order for ICANN to be independent, and as one of the satisfaction of the requirements since WSIS, as Khalid has mentioned. So, no one single government has a special role when it comes to the critical Internet infrastructure.

But let's look now beyond work Stream 2. What do we want out of that? We want an inclusive ICANN; a more accountable ICANN; an ICANN that has a new governance model that is inclusive. And if this doesn't happen at the end that we participate as Africa in the empowered community and in the different stakeholders, then the whole process from an accountability and governance point of view did not pay off for us.

It will become more legitimate by being more inclusive and by our participation in the empowered community via the different SOs and ACs. This is what will make, really, the new experiment of the empowered community feasible and legitimate as such – in addition to the importance of discussion, as Tijani has mentioned, in Work Stream 2, in jurisdiction, in privacy, in human rights and in different things.

I just wanted to highlight that on the midterm – maybe not on the very short term – on the midterm, this is a goal that we want really to achieve. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Tarek. We have less than seven minutes left, therefore I would like to see if we could validate the declaration first before ending the session because also we have interpreters and I wanted to thank them.

First of all, though, now the last two people who want to speak will take the floor.

[HAZIZ]:   I am from Burundi. I'm the representative to the GAC for my country. I have just a little comment to make. Like our friends from the African Commission, I think that there should be more government will.

If they could help us at our level, we already do a lot of things about outreach for the Internet. But if they also could put on the agenda, I know that – I work with the infrastructure, DTIC infrastructures. When I have to work with the African minister, as I am the intermediary for them, if we could put this on the agenda – the governance of the Internet – they could help us. They could help us.

All the ministers have a lot of work to do with IT, etc. and really, I think, that before we integrated ICANN, we were more involved with other sectors. Now we need to call upon our African Commission to see how we can integrate the agenda with the questions of the Internet.

There's a confusion. We have confusion in Africa about what goes with telecommunication, IT, and Internet. Internet will be there no matter what.

Also, I wanted to thank ICANN which allows us to come to this kind of forum and support capacity building on very specific theme, well identified, so we can go from participation to action. Thank you, Aziz.

AZIZ HILALI: I want to give the floor to Liz.

LIZ OREMBO: Hi, everyone. I'm Liz Orembo from Kenya, and I'd like to thank the team for producing this document because I know it's so much work that goes into it.

Now my question is – okay. First of all, I'd like to apologize for my lack of background knowledge to this document. Okay, then I'll go straight to my question. What are the specific things that

EN

we want from Work Stream 2? Instead of being so general like "inclusivity," what do we want with that inclusivity in ICANN and inclusivity, and with accountability also? What do we want in it? Can we be specific to that? Because maybe we don't need more time, but we just need to organize the issues that we want and be more specific so that we can do it with target timelines.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Liz, but it would take too long to answer your question and we only have three minutes left. I am asking you, also, to stay here and not to leave right away because we want to take a picture here with all of us.

And, also, we need to let the interpreters go whom I want to thank once again because they do an extraordinary work. Thank you, the interpreters.

Seun, you will take the floor for the last time and then we will have to try to validate – or not – the declaration. Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI: I just wanted to mention three things. The first thing, Fiona suggested some edits. It would be good to have them clear and then reflected in the statement.

Secondly, this statement is normally sent to an e-mail list which we call the African list and is also copied to the AFRALO list. It's usually sent ahead of the meeting. It would be good for us if we're not subscribed to that list, to subscribe to it. Let's make it more interactive on the list. Raise your comment, raise your contributions on the list so that we can maximize the time where we come to a physical meting like this. Ask your questions on those lists as well. You don't' need to be an AFRALO member to actually contribute to these statements. It's very important.

The third thing, to your question, the issues on ground now is being discussed in the various work groups. What we need is going to be discussed in those work groups. Inclusivity is very clear. We want things to be – we want to be part of the discussions. But the specifics of those things are still going to be developed and it's still work in progress. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Seun. You are absolutely right. This shows how complex this [subject is].

We have one more minute because we have to let the interpreters go. Is there a little modification we had to do?

[CHRIS CHUMANGA]: To clarify in terms of what is on WS1, when you provide the statement like this, my opinion is when you go, for instance, on a specific, it should be mentioned because you say we mainly focus on the scope of WS2 as described in our next round. This is the statement. The statement should have – perhaps if I'm wrong you can correct me – indicate exactly what we want because this is just a statement where we can –we clarify exactly what we want.

But when you – it's like adding in another document and then somebody will go and search it in another document and don't even understand. So, that's basically what I want to say.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much. I understand what you say. It is done for all. All ICANN knows what is Work Stream 1 and Work Stream 2, and it is addressed to the ICANN Board. But we will try to make links, perhaps, so that you can go and see what are the documents we are talking about. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Yes, you're right. There's always a confusion because all the declaration documents that we publish, they're not directed to the community. They're directed to the Board of ICANN who

already knows the subject questions, or there's someone who is against the declaration, against for—

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: …as proposed by Fiona, we will do them. Is there any other modification someone wants to do?

AZIZ HILALI: Aside of the slight modification suggested by Fiona, are there other modifications or can we consider that this declaration adapted?

All right, then we want to thank you. We're going to let the interpreters go because we want to sincerely thank them for all the work they do.

And I want to thank the staff – Sylvia, Gisella, Heidi, and everyone for their help, as well as the technicians. And also, especially, this gentleman, Glenn, who's the President of the North America Region.

Who is going to take the picture for us? Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]