HYDERABAD – NextGen@ICANN Sessions Saturday, November 05, 2016 – 13:00 to 15:00 IST ICANN57 | Hyderabad, India

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Okay, everybody, let us go ahead and begin. I want to first of all thank you for the audience members who are here. Thank you to you NextGen for being here ICANN 57 and for preparing your presentations for us to enjoy. First up, we have Mohammad Haolader from Bangladesh who is going to present for us. Mohammad.

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

Thank you. I am Awal because everyone calls me Awal, it is the shortest name otherwise it would be a very, very long name. My t-shirt says bdyigf.org, so this is what I am doing nowadays. I am an Asian and I thank you everyone to be here. I want to talk about our initiative of Bangladesh Youth IGF which is not mature enough but still we are working to do a good event.

We are also working with Youth IGF. This is another initiative together against several crimes which is a [friend's] best initiative. This is a picture of our first meeting. We did this maybe two months ago. We did our first meeting on September 2 and there were 13 members and now we have got total on board 14.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

We did two meetings so far. We discussed how we should proceed and what could be the discussion topics and how can be the [inaudible] panelist or participants, and where should be the event.

We use the Zoom 3 account to organize for our virtual meetings among us. Then we have mailing list already it is discuss@bdyigf.org which is open and you can join, and you can participate and suggest us to do something together. Actually, it is not a full-time Secretariat so we are running this voluntary list, so for the Secretariat's job is just to help us organize the discussion on this platform.

If you go and visit our website, maybe you would suggest more information to put in there. What we planned is we will do our annual event once in a year which the first one will be on November 25th [EDACA]. We will continue this one in improving ourselves to this event. We had that idea of Youth IGF camp from the YIGF which is with the EPRIGF. From EPRIGF, David told me that it would be good if we can do something like camp for two days or three days. So that we can go to the nearest campus and spend some two, three days with a group of young students and make them involved with the discussions.

This is also plan, the Ambassador program. Once we go to the campuses, we will identify two, three active members then we



will make them empowered more, so that they can continue the work to their nearest institutions like for schools or colleges. Now our focus area mostly will be a privacy service security and getting involved with. Like this year, we have an interesting topic like responsible use of social media because these are big thing for us. Most of the Internet users nowadays in our country are young.

Sometimes they post something or sometime they use social media but they did not know that this should not be done here. This is not the platform to share something that is not good. We should educate them or restrict them, send them the message how to use the social media or how it can be a problem for him or her. There are other areas also.

One of the thing we are planning to work after this event is that the local content in local language. What I did is I collect some of the acronyms from ICANN wiki booth. Our first [track] will be to make these acronyms with some leader descriptions in Bangla language like our language. We will upload it in our website so that this can be a content for the people in our country.

And we already started working with Youth IGF who are helping us with some concept in our first program on November 25th. We talked to BIGF which is the national IGF in our country. We found two members active there who already sent us the e-mail. We



invited one of them to come to our program. I am a Chapter officer now, we had Internet Society Bangladesh Chapter which helped me to include the local chapter as well in our program.

Luckily before coming here, I got a message from the chapter president that they will separate us with financial some amount to do this. We are looking for opportunities to work with IGF ICANN Internet Society BIGF and EPC, maybe many more. Not only for financial support but also giving us concept how we can go.

Because there is no senior person in the group, everyone is young. Maybe we need more information, more knowledge to run this program every year. This is the banner that we have for our November 25th event. This is a half-day event. Because we could not add much program or much speakers there and there are financial issues.

This year also ending so we could hurry up, we did hurrily run this event so there will be a half-day event. There will be a one game for the participants to discuss something and their idea I got it from [Ipega]. We will do this there and there, the first session will be about knowing IGF and how Youth IGF comes in to play in the [inaudible] system.

The second session will be about learning how Internet works which is kind of a history of Internet and how the stakeholders



are involve in this process. There will be a panel discussion where that the main session which will be like responsible use of the social media. Participants who will also share their experience if they face anything odd in social network area or if they have any bad experience or good experience they will share there.

This is our presence in social network as well. So if you have any suggestion for me or question for me, I will be really happy because we need to empower ourselves as well. Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Okay. We want to open up the floor to questions for a while. How many members do you have in your group?

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

Fourteen. We are inviting 30 people in our first program and it will be a closed session because we do not have that much room to accommodate for open events. We want to invite let us say 25 participants and five guests as a speaker.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

Hi. I do not know if you know the ISO class Special Interest Group called Youth Observatory. Now, it is made by Latin American people especially but it is open to everybody. So



maybe you can call the [mate] initiatives with the Youth Observatory. In fact, the president of the observatory said the [ALAC] with our own here and I can introduce to you if you like.

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

This would be great. I had that Special Interest Group from [Joyce] so yeah maybe – yeah. Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Any other questions?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

What do you find as the biggest challenge in running a group like this?

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

Yeah, that is a good question. Everything was this challenge. So first one was making the young people themselves to understand what we want to do. So we are two, three people who had to personally visit some other active young people to make them understand what we want to do. So participation is a big problem and then the second problem while we are trying to arrange the event was the speaker.

So there is very limited local speaker who can talk about these topics. Maybe we should go for remote sessions, maybe remote



speakers can join. Let us see if the venue permits us to do this sort of online collaboration, maybe we will go for that. But right now we do not have any international participation here, yeah. I will try to do this, yes.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

[Taxevo] it is a great initiative. My question is have you thought of partnering with the university which can support you with venue accommodation and things like that?

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

We talked to University of Dhaka because one of the professors, he is the Chapter President of Internet Society Bangladesh, so we talked to him. And also previous president Dr. [inaudible], he was also from the university. Because it is very close to our area like in Dhaka. We talked to them, yes, and they said they will provide us the location, support. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Hi, Awal. Thank you for that presentation and congratulations in that initiative. Since you talked, the group is the youth in Bangladesh, what is the current situation of the penetration of Internet in the youth of Bangladesh specifically? And is your group also looking into increasing that penetration considering if use of Internet is greater in the youth in schools and



universities their indigents in the issues regarding IGF might also increase?

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

Thank you for the question. It is another good question. Right now, the participation is – not in terms of youth but in terms of whole population, only around 15% is connected. But still in terms of youth, among this 50% of the total population maybe more than 70% they are actually young. I am not sure about this but this is my guess because the population is actually, in our country, actually the previous generation, they are not like to get involve in Internet.

So most of the Internet users are using the Internet are actually young. But because the social media is so popular in our country, this is one of the main reasons why young people are actually getting involved with the Internet activity. The second part was –

UNIDIENTIFIED MALE:

Are you specifically looking to increase awareness?

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

Okay. We are looking for specifically to make awareness building on responsibly using the Internet. Because there are so many



issues in our country and also the law that recently got passed by the parliament is actually a little bit tricky. And any young people can actually get misused by the law. Because the act is something tricky and it says that it is Act Number 57 which is ICT ACT, so it says that anybody who post something on the social media and if it has some impact which can create some instability in the country, can be fine with 1 crore of Bangladeshi taka and also 14 years of jails which is a big thing.

I think before applying this act, I think we need to make ourselves be [inaudible] awareness about responsibility use of social media. We are focusing on that right now. Yeah.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you for the presentation and congratulation on starting this. My question actually pertains to the act you just mentioned. I just wanted to know, do you plan or like this organization plan on taking a stand against this particular act or against freedom of expression online? Or would you rather or would the group rather plan to advocate safer posting online for the youth which stays within the limits of the act, or rather would the group engage with the government too? Did they use to draw the parameters set by the act for punishing people?



MOHAMMAD HAOLADER:

Yes. Thank you for the question. Our current focus is not on that to protest against the act because it is already there. And also there are some limitations from our domain here, we are really young and we do not have that much connection or that much power to stand against this. But there is a good side of these things.

So if we can make people aware, maybe this problem may be lessen a bit. If we stand against that, that means we are standing against the government which is I think we are not in the right place right now to do this. Maybe later we will go for it maybe.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: Okay. Thank you very much, Awal.

MOHAMMAD HAOLADER: Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: Okay. Our next presenter is Poornima Meegammna from Sri Lanka.

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA: Good evening, everyone. I am Poornima Meegammna from Sri Lanka. I am going to present a project we did with Shilpa Sayura Foundation. This project was funded by ISOC. It is a Respect Girls

on Internet, Community for Cyber Harassment Protection. So before I start talking about the project, I would like to tell you a story.

When I was 17, I was harassed online. It was not someone who I did not know. It was a really close friend of mine at that time. It was not really hard time for me like anyone who has gone through something like that would agree. I was 17. Imagine a 13-year-old, 14-year-old going through something like that and not getting the right support. Luckily, I had a good mentor and then I got advice and I was able to go through that [piece] and get my life back on track.

So after this incident, I talked to few of my friends and they came up with this project idea of Respect Girls Online. In this project, we focused on teens but this is a special focus on teenage girls about cyber harassment. This issue is growing with the growth of social networks especially now in our country, it is a trend now of like ethical hacking and [infosic] is becoming a trend.

You can ask any small boy in school like, "What you want to be when you grow up?" They say, "I am going to be a hacker." In Sri Lanka, it has become a huge trend and that increases the risk even more. Also something we found is many victims; they keep silent when something happens. Because Internet is a privilege to most young people like our region.



So they are free, they feel that they will lose that privilege and also lose cannot alone stop it. They are lost but it takes time to go through that procedures and most people does not want to take legal action because of that. That is why we wanted to come up with the solution with empathy and technology to tackle this problem and also ignore it.

You go to a parent or a teacher with this problem and the most common advice they get is ignore it. And ignoring it would not have the person and also the issue as a whole. How does this happen? Especially for teenagers, the harassment is mainly hate speech and bad comments, and also does uploading of photos, hacking into accounts, bullying like a whole class get together and bully one person on Facebook or somewhere.

That is becoming an issue. And also it is like when we talked about harassment of girls, the first thing that comes to mind is that boys who are harassing girls. But girl on girl hate is also a big problem right now, so it is both ways. What happens when someone face this kind of issue? It is not just the victim culprit suffers as well. They both have psychological effects and the victim might have a mistrust on Internet.

And that could affect he or she of using the Internet to its full potential. And also the culprit might go into exploring more dark activities if like they do not get caught and these tools now are



really easily accessible to them. And also taking legal actions against these teenagers is very tricky. And if we take some other action it might affect negatively on them. So the children – so we have to be very careful dealing with these issues.

Respect Girls On Internet project, we mainly focus on awareness. We wanted to get to these teenagers before they have get into these problems or face these problems. We wanted to great awareness about how to face this kind of problem. For that, we created Cyber Safety handbook in three languages; the main three languages in Sri Lanka; Sinhalese, Tamil, and English.

And also we made a lot of creative materials to generate awareness; short films, graphics, [mims]. Also we created an app that – it is a self-evaluating app of your cyber goodness. Those are the things we created for awareness. And also we trained youth in cyber safety and how to use social media responsibly. We developed a community of support network that help someone with when they are faced with this kind of a problem.

Also we did advocacy on cyber safety, we have more than 8,000 likes and now which is more than 100K for our content and awareness projects. So this project is also funded by ISOC and implemented by Shilpa Sayura Foundation.

I am going to show you a video of some of the things we did to the project. And also with the help of youths of ISOC, we were



able to translate the app for two languages; Spanish and Portugal.

Okay. So what we found to the project is – because we had a special focus on girls in this project, girls reveal their problems they face online if they are granted the privacy. Like we say that no one would know that you were a victim then there is a good chance of they are opening up about the issues. And also they want to solve ASAP. That is one reason they also do want to take legal action because they wanted solve right now.

And also this is very critical because the first 24 hours is the most critical piece when someone is faced with the cyber harassment problem that is when the problem could go would it be good or bad. So within this 24 hours, it is really hard for a legal body or the government to reach teenagers. But someone by the neighbor who is next door or some friend from school, the community can reach these teenagers within this 24 hours. And that is why the community plays a big role in this cyber harassment protection.

So the challenges we face when doing this project is mainly this project is return in social like we did not really have a way of making revenue through the project because we are volunteers. So that was a challenge we had. And also, the thing that we have to reach teenagers before they become victims.



So we have to create more awareness throughout the country that is also a challenge we face. And also increase access to that knowledge like one click, you can find anything that is for hacking. All these tools easily online today and a lot of teenagers experiment with these tools without knowing the consequences. So it could affect the victim and also it could change the person who are using the tools for life forever.

So those are the challenges we face and for the future, of course, with the growth of the Internet, the problem grows. So we want to expand our support groups throughout the country and make more support groups so that teenagers can get help when they are faced with the cyber harassment problem. And also we want to train especially women in cyber safety and leadership to prevent these kinds of issues. And also to like know how to protect themselves online. So yeah, thank you. That was our project. Questions?

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Thank you, Poornima. Very nice. Okay. Let us open up the floor to questions.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

This was very useful presentation and it is very important what you are talking about. But I am wondering if you have any



cooperation with Ministry of Education to reach the girls in the schools? Maybe it is an easy and all girls in one place, you reach a lot of girls actually. Did you have any cooperations?

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA:

For this project, no. We went through community societies but in the future, we are planning to connect with the government. Actually, recently, government started an initiative to create awareness on cyber safety, so I think that is a good start in the top level. Because now that they are starting to recognize the problem and taking action against it and hoping to work with the Education Ministry and take this forward. Thank you.

[SASHI KUMAR]:

I have one question. Like you said, everyone wants to be hacker. So this one phenomenal like [why hate] hackers? So they put their skills for the good of society. Would it be beneficial if awareness can be both to the children's that these skills, if they learn can be put for the good of the society?

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA:

Yes. That is one of our saying like if these teenagers know that it could use for good, they would use it. But most of the time, they want to hack into their friend's account. That is –



[SASHI KUMAR]: But yeah, we will be responsible to make them aware, that this

can be put to the good. So it means like in the Star Wars, you do

not know the power of dark side.

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA: Yes, of course.

[SASHI KUMAR]: So we should make them aware of that – know the dark side of

the power.

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA: Yeah, okay. Thank you. But yeah that is what we want to do to

create awareness how these tools can be used for good. And if

you use it for a bad cause, what would be the consequences you

have, yeah. Thank you.

[SASHI KUMAR]: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Actually, I have a story I like to share with you. It happens in

China. On the famous actress named [Yonan Shenzhen]. And she

had so many anti-fans. Every time she appear in social media,

they just send a lot of criticism to her but instead of fighting those anti-fans, she kind of launched a program named Loving Criticism. And every time she received criticism from the fans,

"she would donate like 50 cents to the charity."

Within 24 hours, it is very impressive that she collected more than 50,000 RMB and she donated those moneys to the charity organization. And after that, she just disappeared from the public and then she come back. She was invited to had a speech and she shared her experience about the cyber bullying.

By sharing the story, I just want to say that I think cyber bullying is just around us, everyone, everywhere, anytime. It can reach you but not all of us will be as lucky as this famous actress. So I think deserve our attention and thank you for raising this problem. And also I think if you want to get more attention is also deserved trying to work with maybe some super stars. I do not know whether the social media is as popular as in your country as in China, but it is also an approach. Thank you.

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA:

Thank you.



[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Okay. Just as a reminder, when asking a question please state your name because this session is being recorded. Any other questions? Go ahead.

[AMAR DATIER]:

[Amar Datier] from India. You mentioned what is important is community support for these victims, so I was just wondering if there is at all have you started building cyber or group of cyber mentors for the victims here? And if there is one, what is the method to which you can get in touch with the cyber mentors and how do you maintain an anonymity of the victim in this regard?

Because as you also mentioned there are a lot of people only comfortable with coming forward if you [necessitate] the privacy there, so just wondering about that?

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA:

Yes, we have a group that we have trained in these issues and what other actions that they could get in this kind of a situation. So there is a Facebook group and also we have a Facebook page. So if someone has a problem they can reach us through that and also that in some places in schools and some societies, we have support groups. So they can reach to them if they know anyone, so this is still in a small scale.



But we have solved some issues through the Facebook group and also like when someone goes to in a fast of coordinate works; they have tried to know what they can. And then if they cannot advise them on that issue, they reach to us. And then we have a Board of advisers who is working with us. So if we can support them, we take it to them and then if the legal action is necessary, we go there like that is how we support.

ANNA:

Just a couple of questions. Do you have any legal remedies available for online harassment? Do you also advocate for using legal remedies for online harassment? And secondly, you mentioned that guaranteeing privacy is a problem for girls, so could you explain how that happens.

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA:

Okay. So for your first question, yes we have some legal remedies in Sri Lanka against harassment. And there are some cases that have been solved. Actually, we advised them to go for legal action if they really want it. Because like most cases, it is a friend or someone close to them that is in the other side of the harassments. So they really want to take legal action most of the cases that we found. So if they wanted to take legal action, we direct them towards that.



And for your second question. Actually, what it said was if we guarantee them that we keep their privacy they talk about the issues with us. So that's yeah.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

Hi, Poornima. My name is [Sadela]. I am from [inaudible] program. I am a huge fan of your project. I have been helping you also. I got a question and it is about trust because the whole project is about trust. What is your vision over there because here you got people from everywhere and trust can be very different? How do you see the impact on generating trust among the communities with this Respect Girls Online and the possibility of growing the projects throughout of Sri Lanka and within the region? Thank you.

POORNIMA MEEGAMMNA:

Thank you. Well, actually I would like to say she helped a lot with app to translate it, so yeah. I am very happy that you are here. To answer your question for trust, that is why we want to build the support networks around schools and communities who would be close to people who are using like being faced with these problems. So they already have that trust with those people and if they are able to help them, they do not have to go to anywhere this.



That is why we want to expand it furthermore to like the whole country and have support groups everywhere we can. Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Okay. Thank you very much, Poornima. Okay. Next, we are going to hear from [Thena Douglas] from Palestine. [Thena].

[THENA DOUGLAS]:

Hello, everybody. Welcome here. First, I use the ICANN format first slides because I like it so much. I read a lot of presentations so I like it so much so I can use it if you like. This is [Thena Douglas] from Palestine, Telecommunication Engineer, working as [switch] engineer for mobile network operator. I am doing my masters study in software engineering.

Also I am an ISOC chapter member in Palestine chapter. Also I attended IUTF96 in Berlin last July. This is my first ICANN meeting as NextGen.

Can I use the right one? This is an introduction as I told you. I am doing my masters study in Birzeit University and my Bachelor was in an American university. Also, my presentation will be about the challenges we face in Palestine in Internet and the IT field.



First, well we will talk about the mobile technology. We still have in Palestine 2.75 G it is called GSM due to political issue and another issues. We are under occupation as you all know. We have an expensive cost SMS, all of this stuff, it is very expensive. And also the GPRS does not use the 3G so the data mobile is very expensive.

Also, that 2.75 G does not give you a high speed of Internet so you will not connected or we would not go abroad and travel. Actually, we are very happy to use the 3G or 4G networks around the world. But they are just a [hunch] before we have it expected to launch 3G in the next year. We hope so in the next year we have 3G. Also to mobile technology, when we request for equipment from Erickson, Nokia or whatsoever they went there.

All equipment may go out of support when it is stuck in the airport because also political issues. It's come out of support and all these equipment if it is complete, because this is delayed many projects for our mobile communication. Also, the lake of frequencies, it is something related to IT, the IT on distribution of frequencies. So we have a lot of congestion in our network as mobile communication.

For Information Technology field as well, the job opportunity is something like you are very lucky if you have a job in Information Technology. Also, the graduation internship is very



small because not a lot of people can go and travel to have the internship. Also, as Palestinian, not all of people know about this global organization like – I will talk about. This is something negative but I will talk about how we can overcome for all of this challenge.

Also, Internet it is very expensive in Palestine. Also, the average speed in all homes 4 mega, it is too slow. But now we are going to VDSL, we have ADSL technology. Now we are going to develop in this section, we go to VDSL, so we have Internet maximum about 30 mega. And also we are starting the fiber technology, but it is too expensive, about \$100 for 8 mega Internet using fiber using infrastructure and everything.

Also for engineering and IT student, lack of resources and automated libraries. Actually have a lot of project about automated libraries. Lack of resources, I mean when you need something – actually from books maybe you will need some books to request something it is also delayed to come.

And some devices and equipment does not allow to enter the country. And also student for some reasons they cannot reach all the university use checkpoints and all of this stuff. The Palestinian's situation, yes, if we have something people from Birzeit University, my university cannot go to An-Najah



University which is two cities only have one hour, far away from each other.

A research and the projects fund because as I told you the internship and also all this job opportunities is very like. So the research and the projects funds also is very – we do not have a lot of projects fund. Even we have a good idea and amazing idea in Palestine universities, conference and internship, this was a challenge. But now we are trying as ICANN NextGen IETF NextGen, we are trying to speak to spread all of these things to our colleagues and to the new fresh graduates.

How we can overcome these resources? We use available resources as much as we can. We use not the library as electronic libraries, this stuff uses our normal libraries and you will know. We go to the libraries and research and do research. No Internet although this work for us actually.

We have to say thank you for Internet because now after we have a fiber technology and we are going to 3G technology, all these challenges it decrease actually. The available resources via Internet, via our [inaudible] accounts –

I forgot to mention that. I am in the Committee of Palestine Subsection IEEE subsection. It is a new and we are developing it.

And we are doing – sorry for the interruptions but I will talk about something is this teacher in service. It is IEEE idea. Now



we have one test and we are trying to do many tests to teach the teachers how to know the idea of technology to the children and teens in a good way in practical way.

And also we tried as mobile operators and ISPs to give the best quality as much as we can. So we use the best thing that we could have in a best way. We have a lot of clever engineers. So as I said, we do serve with the best thing as we could. And to try to find a lot of solution to all of these problems comes with congestions and lake of frequencies, all these things.

Also we are trying to attend IETF meeting, ICANN meeting as one of my colleagues, this is the fourth ICANN meeting for him. This is my first one. He spread the idea with all the engineers, so I hear them speaking he called – [Sami Tamimi] maybe you know him. So he is speaking a lot about the IETF and ICANN, so I am applying a lot of – engineers also applying. I am so lucky to be here.

Actually, I am coming from pure technical things but I prefer to present something about our situation. Maybe next time, I will present something specific in mobile communication. Also, to get involved – actually ICANN also we have Google. We have a lot of organizations that is helping us to be more open to all over the world. And we are improving as much as we could. Thank you. This is my presentation. Thank you.



[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: Thank you, [Thena]. Do you have any questions from the floor?

[THENA DOUGLAS]: Do you have any questions? Yeah.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you very much for a very interesting presentation. I

believe like Palestine will be one of the most challenging place in

the world to provide a reliable and fast Internet connection. My

question is on that topic. How is the backbone infrastructure

now in Palestine? How do you create a reliable backbone to

other parts of the world given the political constraints and

economic constraints that Palestine is facing right now? I would

like to know more about that.

[THENA DOUGLAS]: Yeah, okay. First of all we have an ISOC Chapter, it is not recent

actually we have two years ISOC Chapter. They support us to

operate exchange point. We have an exchange point in Birzeit

University, my senior university. Also, we have to deal with the

other side the international carriers and all of this stuff. It all

goes through Israel, links yeah. That is all.



UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

That is why. Given that it goes through Israel, how do you plan for outages that – has there have been the cases where Israel cut off the connection?

[THENA DOUGLAS]:

Actually, I told you we have this point separately but right now, I do not know what the pivotal phase issues. But as engineers, we do not face something like that. We do not face something like that. Because there is an international and the global organization like ITU, like United Nation, a lot of things to refer to. We do not accept something like that, expect something like that. And there is contract in all of this stuff, they do not supposed to do something like that.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Okay. Yeah.

[AMAR DATIER]:

Hi. [Amar Datier] from India. Thank you for that presentation. It is really hot, like great to see you're taking such an initiative there. I'm just curious about the licensing mechanism available for the telecom companies, which operate and provide the Internet.



Is it under the Palestinian government's control or is it under the control of the Israeli government in terms of checking the standard and [inaudible] the telecoms have to operate? And if it is under the Israeli government, what are the general [encryptions], standards that are readily available in terms of the privacy on Internet?

[THENA DOUGLAS]:

No, actually, we have the Minister of Telecommunication and Information Technology. It's the only part to give the license for the operators. But for sure, they have concerns and they deals with the other side but it's under Palestinian Authority and Minister of Telecommunication and Information Technology specifically.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Hello, thank you so much. This is [inaudible] from Pakistan. I was wondering what kind of problems there are that you are seeing that if you import some equipment outside from many vendor like Nokia, [inaudible] and many others, then do you have problem at the airport? I mean, there are some customs issues or any other legal issues, what kind of issues are there?



[THENA DOUGLAS]:

No, it's not legal because when we request some equipments from mobile operator or for ISP especially... I'm talking about my company [inaudible], actually. We have equipment in the airport from 2005 and it's arrived the last year, and it's end of support and so we throw it away. This is what I'm talking about. Actually, I don't have a clear answer because I don't know but it's a pure – I don't know actually. I haven't answer for this question because we don't know we present something like that but it's only for checking. That's the reason we know.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you.

[THENA DOUGLAS]: Welcome.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Thank you, [Thena], very much.

[THENA DOUGLAS]: Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: Next up, we have Tran Duyen from Vietnam. Tran?

TRAN HOAN MY DUYEN:

Hello, everyone. My name is Tran Hoan My Duyen. You can call me [Duyen]. I'm from Vietnam. I'm four years under [inaudible] at Asian University for Women. I major in politics. We also [inaudible] economies and minoring in psychology.

So, I am a founder of mentorship program for [inaudible] children in Ho Chi Minh City and at the same time, I'm a [inaudible] coordinators of eHomemakers, an NGO in Malaysia.

Today I'm going to present on the [inaudible] in my country. So, anyone in this room that has confident to say you are in good work-life balance?

So, that's why our [inaudible], so the [inaudible] actually has been going on in ten Asian countries namely Myanmar, Laos, Thailand, Cambodia, Vietnam, Indonesia, Singapore, Malaysia, Brunei, Philippines.

And, our [inaudible] is we believe that if the policymakers can understand the importance of work-life balance, then they can come together and develop regional socioeconomic policy with the work-life balance.

So, how do you do that? Firstly, we collect and record the voices of people who are in support of work-life balance. And then, we write up a policy recommendation that's based on real experiences and the expert advice on work-life balance.



And finally, we write a technical report along with the voices of people and then submit to the Asian Foundation.

So, how we're going to do that, specifically? Firstly, we have ten Facebook page in ten Asian countries. And, the target is to reach one million voices of work-life balance. But by now, we have reached nearly three million voices of people from Asia who are in support of work-life balance.

And, as a [inaudible] coordinators of the [inaudible], we try to localize the content but we try to stay in sight with the other Asian countries pages also. And, you can see this actually for my page. We try to write in the Vietnamese so that we can reach wider population and take it to the local population and [widespread] to the Asian population.

And at the same time, we also try to promote unity within ten Asian countries and that's why we have the [high tech] learning Asian. You see one of the posts that actually talking about the food in Malaysia and we try to talk about the cultural unique features of each country.

And the second is we have popular campaigns about work-life balance, and this is really easy. You just need to write [inaudible] on the papers, take the full folder with that and send to the Facebook page in your country and we as the Facebook's



coordinators, you collect it and then post it to [remote] the message.

So I think it's a really bit small to read but it's actually the [inaudible] work-life balance for women are Internets for Asians. And also, we have all those popular campaigns like work-life balance for [teens] and work life balance for –

Luckily, we are supported by many, many, many people that are sending the picture to us. And [inaudible] social media, we also write the message and asking for a friend to try our project.

And, we also conduct the online survey. Last year, we conduct a survey with 1,830 [professionally] working females. And the topic cover was how many working hours they had to take per day, workload and the influence of work into their personal lives was to make them happy, what is the level of [certification] [inaudible] of work, workload, and work-life balance, the annual leave and also the opinion of [inaudible] versus working for others. We try to understand work-life balance issues in each of these countries.

So, what about Internet governance also working and use networking? We are here to in this young generation to share how the young people like us, like I, can make use of the social media to stress our positive social message. And we all need to sit in the same office to build teamwork to efficiently working



with each other and we can sit in different countries but we share the same [message] of transforming our societies for the

betterment.

And for young people like the – most of the Facebook coordinator actually is a very young volunteers from different Asian countries. And we try to connect with other communities that have the same missions and the same message of

promoting work-life balance on happiness in general.

And, we believe the Internet or the ICTs in the vectors for social transformation and the development. And, actually, the Internet has a very powerful influence because they provide a sense of services and provides an enhanced connectivity between the

volunteers from different countries.

And at the same time, it also try to enhance the enlargement opportunities of young people. So, you see the end of my presentation on work-life balance in ten Asian countries. Please feel free to ask a question.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Do we have any questions?



UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

Thank you for sharing, Tran. I have a question. In general, how do you find work-life balance in Asian countries and how does actually Internet – does it makes it more balance or does it makes it less balance because like having Internet access everywhere, you can be access wherever you are, wherever you go? So yeah, can you explain about it?

TRAN HOAN MY DUYEN:

Actually, I think Internet is good in the case that you can send out the positive message to many people no matter where that people are. And, for your questions, I think it depends on the activities that you do using the Internet.

I mean, if you use the Internet to [inaudible] the flow of information for – I mean, like us, we utilize the social media to transform our society and at the same time, we are working and at the same time, we are trying to help the society. And I think that really [inaudible] work-life balance, so you achieve a happiness within whatever you are working on. So, thank you.

[YUSA]:

Thank you for the presentation. This is [Yusa] from Indonesia. I want to ask you about work-life balance like recently in France, they made it illegal for employers to e-mail their employees after

work hours. Do you think such rule is necessary to be implemented in ASEAN?

TRAN HOAN MY DUYEN:

So firstly, I need to know – I guess we have different definition of the regional applicability. I mean, you take that regions different from the ASEAN region, right? May I know the definition? Sorry.

[YUSA]:

Yeah. So, no, because your research is on work-life balance and the rule in France addresses that because they feel like some French politicians think that you can't have work-life balance and your employers can't contact you at night or after work hours. So they made it illegal now in France. You get fined if you e-mail your employee after work hours. So, do you think such rule is needed in ASEAN? Because I understand like for example in Singapore, they have this attitude where you go work 22 hours a day.

TRAN HOAN MY DUYEN:

Is it? Personally, I don't think... I mean, that rule is actually really good I think because of course, I mean, taking as an individual viewpoint, we should really make this between work and our life. I have come to know about the case of Hong Kong also because most of the day, I mean, even during weekends, the



people from Hong Kong, they also are expected to receive e-mail from the boss. And that's also a Hong Kong [inaudible] one of the most on work-life balance.

So, from the perspective of the Facebook coordinator of these projects, I think that rule should be.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

First of all, thank you for sharing. It's a really important topic, work life balance. My question is about your content. So, you have a main Facebook page and does other countries' Facebook pages translate the same content or they create their own content about the issue?

TRAN HOAN MY DUYEN:

So, the thing is, firstly, we need to talk about the standard of the content posted on Facebook page. I have been assigned to training the Malaysian to the Myanmar, Cambodia and Vietnam Team on developing original [inaudible] of content. When we develop the content, we try to talk about any topic that's related to work-life balance like pollution, [inaudible], overwork, stress and how to relax.

So, into the occasions, because we are working for one project, so if we try something and we think that's the other's Facebook page also can share from with that, then we can text them, e-



mail the [inaudible] of Facebook coordinator and ask them to share our boss.

So in that way, we also in [inaudible] the rich view from the – and then we remote our page within the connection of our ten pages. This is also one of the things that we try to stay connected among us. Thank you for your question.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Thank you, Tran, very much.

TRAN HOAN MY DUYEN:

Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Next, we're going to hear from Rohan Wadhwa from India.

ROHAN WADHWA:

Good afternoon, everyone. I'm a fourth year undergrad student at Keio University and an Associate at the Asia-Pacific Institute for the Digital Economy, a regional think tank based in Tokyo.

First of all, it's a pleasure to be here and I would like to personally thank Debra, Kelvin, Adam who's not here for this opportunity and continuing pursuing for youth voice and Internet governance.



I'll be talking about TPP and the digital economy in Asia-Pacific.

So first of all, let's have a show of hands, who here knows what TPP is or has heard of it? Yeah, so that's about 30% of the room and that's exactly why I'm presenting this. And, well, you might ask, "Well, this is not WTO. Why are we talking about trade?" And, that's the idea. That is the title of the presentation, "TPP, A Game Changer," and that's why we all need to be involved.

So, we held an event in April titled the APRU, which is the Association of Pacific Rim Universities Digital Economy Business Offsite, which was focused on TPP. And we asked the participants about 50 people participated from the multistakeholder community from the Asia-Pacific Region. Adam was there representing ICANN.

And then, we ask people TPP, what is the one or two words that come to your mind when you think of TPP and a trade agreement for the 21st century?

So, just let's think of a minute, what are the words which come to our mind? Well, one, it was very secret, wasn't it? And then, you can see that some of these were the words, which came up. Some people have positive outlooks and some people have very negative outlooks. Some people saw opportunity for growth, accountability was important, they need high standards and



some people say it was game changing, some people said it wasn't transparent and there's ambiguity.

So, let's look at some of the key areas where the TPP actually promotes ICT deployment and promotes the use of data in Asia. I'll take you through all these key areas one by one but just to list them down: privacy and cyber security, intellectual property, data localization, tariff and duties.

So, first, let's begin with tariff and duties. Now, TPP is a very big document about 6,000 pages, so I don't expect you to read it but if you get the chance, read chapter 14, which is the E-commerce chapter, which basically details these things.

So, the first part is that TPP basically says there are no custom duties on digital products. And, every digital product will be considered a product same as any other product, no discrimination at all. This could be your products such as videogames, music, video content.

Why should you care? Let's say you want to watch a video on YouTube, which is not available. You want to download DLC for the game is out here. I see a lot of engineers from [inaudible], so a lot of DLC that we download, we don't get it. And this is fair opportunity for international developers to compete in the local market. The biggest impact for this will be on the small businesses because of the opportunity to do fair trade.



Moving on, data localization. Now, as you can see as I was saying, let data flow. You need to let data flow. First of a kind, TPP restricts and prohibits any data localization requirements. This is very important because localization doesn't necessarily help in securing data and protecting privacy. Anyone from the government might disagree with me here. So if anyone is present, I look forward to your questions.

But the idea is that government sometimes tend to enforce this for their own reasons. Now, what this does is it encourages SMEs, Small and Medium Enterprises to conduct and expand businesses in other regions. And these provisions however don't cover financial services though.

Moving on, privacy and cyber security, TPP basically makes it monetary for members to have consumer protection laws. Minimum set of standards are set but no member is required to follow one set of standards, every member can take their own approach and fulfill the minimum standards.

The recommended privacy framework is the APEC Privacy Framework, which is very different from the European standards where it's very strict. They encourage interoperability, compatibility between privacy frameworks and that's the idea of – you need to fulfill the minimum standards and to encourage interoperability and they can come up with their own standards.



The most important issues are the compliance and legitimacy because that's something you can never actually make everyone happy. There will always be critics there.

And they call for cooperation and capacity building on cyber security matters. There's a [Inaudible] calling for people to read if you are not listening to me.

And moving on, intellectual property. So now, what TPP does is it promotes balance between copyright infringements and user interest. It actually has safe [harbor] laws similar to the U.S. laws, which basically mean they actually have less of liability if the participating companies or whatever, the organizations actually show good faith.

And, under TPP, handling of source code, [inaudible], technology and other proprietary items will no longer be a requirement for market entry. So what governments actually used to do was the user demand source code for market entry, now, this could be for several reasons. [inaudible] no longer to make any claims. But what this does, it mandates every member country to actually prohibit from doing so.

So, where does TPP actually stand? If you look at this chart, it actually highlights some of the previous agreements in the region between Singapore or Australia, U.S. or Singapore, all the way from 2003, 2016 between China and Hong Kong.



TPP has been discussed for about seven years. The negotiations have gone for seven years. Now, the digital economy does not [converse] on borders and this the first kind of an agreement which is based on that environment. So TPP actually fulfills a lot of the issues that were required in the digital economy and that's why it matters.

Now, [a verdict]. TPP as I said, it's an innovative agreement bringing together in addressing digital economy issues from a trade perspective. It discusses issues like privacy, cyber security, digital economy, intellectual property and no other trade agreement has done this before. And, secrecy and non-transparency has handed the progress. There's no doubt about that. For the clarification will be needed during implementation and TPP needs to do a lot more for trust and outreach activities. It needs to have an institutional authority.

We do not want TPP 2.0 and another seven years of work without any actual implementation. And all the ratification is key to achieving momentum. So, I just found out that Japan, actually, one of the 12 members has already ratified. So, all the 12 members have signed. Japan ratified yesterday evening. It's the first country to do so.

And, it's very key if the U.S. ratifies or not. This presentation might be useless come next week depending on how the



election goes. But the future roadmap for conducting business in Asia-Pacific will be said by this agreement. Other countries may not sign on but let me just give you a fact. These 12 countries account for the 40% of the GDP of the entire world. Let me remind you, this does not include India, China, Indonesia and some of the other main countries in Asia.

So, if you think about it, other countries will need to customize their own laws and it actually gives them an opportunity. If they do not want to sign to TPP, they can actually come up with their own laws and agreements based on the interoperability framework and of the framework being said by other countries if they want to continue this business.

And, why as I said, why is this important for us? Because this is APAC region, isn't it? This is the Asia-Pacific Region. We're not talking about the U.S. here. There is a lot of arguments that this is a U.S. treaty. This is a work of Barrack Obama and whatever Donald Trump might else tell you. But this does involve the 11 other – except Canada as well – 10 other the countries, which are in the region and I think it's being represented by this region the best.

So, it's important we know what's going on and how will this impact us, and how it will impact the businesses in our countries. Thank you. That's my presentation.



[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Thank you Rohan, very, very interesting. Let's open up the floor for questions.

MARTIN:

Hello, my name is Martin. I did some work related to Free Trade Agreements in Latin America and I understand the argument that Free Trade Agreements like the TPP are really efficient when it comes to take barriers down in the sense of creating better law, more [inaudible], better security standards, better dataflow and everything.

But there's something that I still can get over [with] and that is that we are doing with TPP, we are [dealing] with commoners. We're creating regulations for Internet and we are not doing it in a multistakeholder model way. This is being negotiated behind doors and even if it's open doors. It's being negotiated only by government and commerce.

It maybe has at some point some sort of end user input because you can have public comments, [inaudible] it goes to the legislative chambers of each country. But at the end of the day, we are creating Internet Governance policy, going against everything that we know that we should do in the multistakeholder model.

So, what do you think about that? How do you feel about creating Internet Governance only having the voices of the government and Chambers of Commerce, and not doing what – even those government says, I mean, all of them agree here in ICANN that they have to be here to be multistakeholder. But then they go and they create the TPP that is outside ICANN and they do DNS policy through that.

So, how do you feel about that?

ROHAN WADHWA:

That's a very good question. So, first of all, about the regulation part, I think TPP actually does a really good job bringing down the regulations. A lot of the provisions actually bring down the regulation. You don't have data localization. You don't have to have your source code being given into. So as part of the regulations, I think it's a very good thing to do.

MARTIN:

I think that the [real] part is not the regulations is good or bad but we are creating a relation that is not through their multistakeholder [process], the decision whether that that should be more or less related should be done in a multistakeholder way. That's the point. Notice if having less relations [go] about it.



ROHAN WADHWA:

Yeah, I was actually getting to that. This is the first part. The second part was it also comes down to the fact that how trade agreements are previously concluded and discussed. So we can also argue that the multistakeholder community wasn't consulted in the trade agreements before and we didn't worry about it too much before.

And now, when it comes to the Internet, obviously, they exist in ecosystem, that way we are worried about it. We have these events where we need to discuss these things.

And as you said, there are some issues about DNS as well where they – which actually impact some people that also compare it to with SOPA and PIPA, what they said about in there.

So, the fact is TPP has a lot of criticism and multistakeholder is one of those in the closed doors. But outside the other – for other provisions as well, this criticism was also there. So I think while the governments only took this part and I'm going to comment about the other provisions, I think they did a good job here.

I can't really say anything what we can do as a community right now. But I would be very happy to hear about some particular issues which actually go against the principles of the open



Internet and multistakeholderism or what we believe in as part of the Internet governance community or the Internet ecosystem, which I think they have done a decent job at that even if they didn't consult the other stakeholders.

MARTIN:

I'll just finish my comment saying that I agree with you. The TPP is good for commerce. The question is if it's good for the end users and society, and human rights. And then, on the other side is... Sorry to be harsh but I love the subject. And then, well, we didn't worry because of that because we didn't have this. Like you said, I mean, future agreements has started to create provisions of law in the last 20, 30 years and specifically about Internet in the last decade and a half sort of.

So, we didn't worry before because we didn't have this [inaudible]. But it's an amazing job, so congratulations.

ROHAN WADHWA:

Thank you. Just to add on a little bit more. Impact on end user for – as for now, I haven't seen any negative impacts. And TPP has actually been [poised] to actually have bridge the digital [divide] especially in the Asia-Pacific Region. So, I'm yet to come across anything negative for the end users but I would be very happy if you had any specific concerns to today than later on.



[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Any other question? Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

[inaudible] from India. Thanks, Rohan for that presentation. Aside from the exclusionary nature of the TPP, which I think is also being challenged because China is coming off with its own trade agreement as well. What do you think about the issue of TPP as a standard creation in itself considering that the number of the economies that have joined in the TPP being a vast bulk of the GDP as yourself mentioned the standards for privacy, etc. which I think is certain for the TPP will eventually take all the standard creation.

And then, in the exclusionary nature of the TPP not involving the other sort of half of the world and sort of forcing the standard upon them, do you not think that's an issue specifically which will arise later also in terms of privacy jurisdiction in dealings between the two countries and especially violation which will take place?

ROHAN WADHWA:

That's a very good question and especially with the issue of China having their own trade agreement coming up. So, from what I believe is that in terms of privacy, the framework, they



haven't actually proposed a specific framework. They actually

basically said you can come up with an APAC framework or have

a minimum requirement, which was actually already been

agreed with a lot of countries.

So I think for privacy and jurisdiction, that might actually not be

an issue. For creating standards, I think TPP has agreement is

actually one of those – well, [inaudible] called the gold standard.

At least for the digital economy, it actually creates a pretty good

standards for other countries to actually change their current

trade negotiations.

And, it's actually being also called as the Digital Trade

Agreement. As we heard, that's one of its kind, first of the kind,

we didn't have these problems before. So, it's really hard to

comment about that in the future. But I think as the first step,

it's obviously in the right direction. And it will be interesting to

see how it goes on with the other countries and how they

respond to it.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Any other question? Thank you, Rohan.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:

[Inaudible].



[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: I'm sorry. Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So, I agree with you in terms of TPP. I'm not commenting upon

the ultimate standard, which has been set by the TPP. My

question was more than regards to the process, which led to the

creation of that standard. Do you not think that the exclusionary

nature of the process in itself, which the multistakeholder

community was not in [involved] as a whole is in itself a little

troublesome? Ultimately, the TPP standard is to be adapted.

Well, I think that was my question.

ROHAN WADHWA: Are you referring to privacy or?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Just a standard even in terms of privacy or trade, etc. I'm just

wondering about that.

ROHAN WADHWA: Honestly speaking, personally speaking, if the multistakeholders

and community was even consulted, I think they will like the

results. That's what I honestly say. I mean, people might

disagree.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

[Inaudible] that.

ROHAN WADHWA:

I know. That's what I'm saying. It's my personal opinion and the idea is that the process, whatever, that was taking the exclusionary nature that you said. But then, that's the nature of trade agreements, isn't it? Not all trade agreements actually involve every other country and not every trade agreement can actually have stakeholders being consulted. You can have NAFTA and all the other trade agreements being – in Latin America, in the Africa, all these trade agreements might come in and they don't actually consider other regions.

So, I think it might actually be unfair to actually – because of the TPP's exclusionary nature and the secrecy, it has received that extra criticism. I am by no means an advocate – being sent by Obama here to actually promote TPP. I'm just stating here what I see and observe.

And I think... well, Adam is here. Yeah, that's I think all I want to say about that.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Thank you very much, Rohan. Very good.



UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Everything you said was true.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]:

Our final presenter, Siddharth Gupta from India. Siddharth.

SIDDHARTH GUPTA:

I'm a fourth year law student at National Law University Delhi. So, before I start my presentation, just a little background as to when and how come I ended up doing this research. I was working as a research assistant for one of the think tanks, which operates from our campus, The Centre for Communication Governance. So, I was working at the Internet Governance team particularly on the WHOIS policy.

The presentation is slightly mis-titled talking about the human rights implications with regards – focuses on one single particular human right that is the right to policy.

So, first of all, before I get into the topic itself, I would like to explain, what right to policy is. Basically, any human right for anyone who's not involved with that human right policy work is not from an [inaudible] background.

A human right is basically a right any human being is born with.

This is the right which can already be taken away or



illegitimately intervened with. There are different conceptions, which exists out in the world but the most major one is the universal declaration of the human rights, 10th December 1948 was when it was adapted by the United Nations.

Article 12 clearly lays down that every human being shall enjoy a right to privacy. What does the right to privacy actually mean? It simply means that, well, if you want to be left alone, you would be left alone. No one can intervene with your privacy. No one can come and take your data or your contact or anything from you without any legitimate calls.

Of course, these rights have certain forms of legitimate interventions possibility. Obviously, one might argue what if there's a thief who steal someone's data and someone who wants to break into the – the policeman should break into the house to arrest this person, can the person claim right to privacy? Obviously not, right? So, these are certain legitimate interventions, which you can get with particular rights to privacy.

A more stronger form of the right to privacy was laid down in the European Convention of Human Rights that said only law enforcement agencies can legitimately intervene with this. I will come to that just a little bit more into the presentation as to why that's more important. But before that, yes, so, one of the major



things we also need to keep in mind is the United Nations Human Right Council in July 2012 passed a resolution with a broad consensus where they agreed that the human rights, which are guaranteed to human beings offline should be guaranteed online as well, which pretty much make sense. The rights you have in a non-technological work should [inaudible] this online.

So, I'm pretty sure the first side of that, the word WHOIS is as we discussed yesterday in the Newcomer Session, it is one of the key [review] factors for ICANN. Simply put, it's a function which you can enter to any registrar's website. Say for example, you enter WHOIS www.google.com, you'll get all the data that was – you'll get all the information presented by google.com by registering that particular domain name. So that will include the e-mail ID use, the contact number, contact address, etc.

So, this presentation shall focus on how this current policy, which ICANN has with regards to implementing WHOIS violates the right to privacy and how we need to fix it.

So, the infringement that occurs in two ways. First, that's the public access of data, public access. So, as of now, the policy followed by ICANN is an allocation domain to certain [inaudible] or the regional registrars who further pass on to further sub local registrars. But every registrar has to sign RAA, that's the



Registrar Accreditation Agreement, which was the latest update was in 2013.

According to the 2013, RAA, every registrar supposed to incorporate the WHOIS function, which is publicly available. What does this mean? Simply as I told you earlier, all I need to know is which registrar has Google purchased the domain from, go to that domain name, type WHOIS www.google.com and they'll have certain data.

If the screenshots available – visible to everyone, it's on the WHOIS [inaudible] called [inaudible].com which is the Indian equivalent of Amazon or it has – I mean, it doesn't really matter to huge corporation. So, you can clearly see their address, their telephone number, their e-mail ID used is listed.

So, [primarily] this doesn't really appear to be problematic and fits in with our real requirement of transparency and accountability that yes, we really need to know who buys domains, what's the purpose, how can we access them.

But let me change the scenario a bit for you. Imagine someone like you, me, any common end user of the Internet, say I want to sell – I don't know – t-shirts, which I make at my house. To buy a domain name to sell it online, I need to provide my contact information. I need to provide my address, my telephone



number, which is publicly available. It is available to anyone who just knows the domain name.

I own a blog right now, the [inaudible].com, slight publicity for myself there. But if someone goes on to the registrar's websites, types WHOIS www.[inaudible].com, they will find my name, my e-mail address, my contact details, my address.

I really do not need to explain why it's problematic. Imagine living in a country where there is lack of law enforcement agencies, where there exists mafias but you can be threatened simply on [straight] gunpoint.

And even beyond that, why do we need to even look at extreme situations? We as human beings have a right to privacy. We do not really need to make our data publicly available unless there's a legitimate need that comes up.

So, before I get into why a possible bypass via proxies, I will just explain, an intervention can be of two types: a legitimate intervention, which is say as I explained earlier. Say for example, a police – a law enforcement agency has certain warrant against a particular thief who's hiding inside a building, they can obviously ask for his address and get it, and break it and that would not constitute a violation of the right to privacy. But a police officer just walking randomly up to you and asking you what you're doing might.



So, one might argue that currently, the 2013 RAA gives you a possibility of using proxies. What a proxy is, is basically when you sign up for a domain name, what you can do is pay a certain additional fee and get a proxy. What the proxy will do is enter or sort in particular company's name address, which act as a proxy, and that will be the data – the information available on WHOIS search.

Well, that might appear to be a good worker on the problem but [inaudible] to problem with the human right jurisprudence. Human right is something that's [inevitable]. It's not supposed to cost anything. It is something you're born with. By effectively asking a person to use a proxy to protect his data, what you're doing is you're putting a cost on his right, which is not something that can be done.

The next part of the infringement process is the data retention system. So, again, according to the 2013 RAA, say for example, you buy a website and you decided, "Okay, I'm done. I do not wish to run a website anymore," and you decided not to renew your subscription after a particular date, [inaudible] domain name after a date.

Well, according to the RAA, the registrar is to supposed to retain the data for two years after the last date of renewal. This data goes beyond your basic information that is publicly available



under the WHOIS process but also includes your credit card information, all the data – like other sensitive information that you use while purchasing the particular domain name.

Why is this problematic? Well, if you will look at any right to privacy jurisprudence interpretation across the globe by the UDHR or the stringent measures would forward to the European Court, that is contentious on one thing.

Regardless of what kind of intervention it is, intervention should [inaudible] be legitimate for the right to know will be violated. And second, even if there is a possible violation, if there is a need to carry out even a legitimate violation and intervene with your human right, it should be proportional.

For example, say if I want – let's keep going back to the thief example then. If the police officer really needed to find out that there is this person X and they want to drag this person. No. Sure, they can get his mobile phone number, they can get this address but it's very difficult to argue that, "Well, I want to find out where does great, great grandfather live and I want his details as well." That's what proportionality is. You really need to have a certain safeguard to ensure that this access is proportionate.

This has been criticized very strongly by multiple stakeholder bodies including the Article 29 working party group of the



European Convention and the data protection security in Europe as well.

One place where I can see [inaudible] ICANN has succeeded is providing domestic law available. What this essentially means is say the RAA is in conflict with domestic laws of a particular country, the registrar is not required to implement those particular obligations.

However, the problem arises because of the global nature of the Internet rate. For example, maybe as of now, there is no particular domestic law which governs. There might be certain situations where domestic laws themselves might be a violation of international law and what ICANN looks to protect as a global organization is human rights.

So, before I'm going to how we can fix it, one of the most important things we need to realize is that we need to strike a balance between accountability, transparency on one hand and a person's privacy on the other.

So, what's the way forward? The way forward is to deform the particular system we have in such a way that the principle of proportionality and legitimate intervention is implemented. How could we do that? Say, think of a model where – I mean, this is something, which is up for – which is currently being



debated within the ICANN community [inaudible] process development – policy development process going on about it.

I think the last report, which was submitted was in December 2015 and there have been more discussions happening after it. But certain models, which have been proposed include like a proportionality model. Then, WHOIS data would still be collected by the registrars. However, it won't be publicly available unless you show a legitimate focus behind it.

For example, I want to purchase a domain name abc.com, I can ask WHOIS and the only time or the place when I will get access to that information is if I can prove to the registrar or to ICANN that I have a legitimate purpose behind finding this information. What this does is takes away spam, takes away random access to third parties.

And, another principle is obviously incorporating proportionality into it. So for example, if someone is looking to purchase the domain name, they won't get access to your address. They'll get address access to your e-mail address, they'll get access to your phone number. They can call you up. They can get in contact with you but they can't access your home address.

So, yes, that's one of the [inaudible] forward. That's all for me. Thank you.



[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: Thank you, Siddharth. Are there any questions? Nope. Thank you

very much.

SIDDHARTH GUPTA: Thank you.

[DEBORAH ESCALERA]: That concludes our NextGen presentations for today. I want to

thank our audience members and please invite you to visit us

again tomorrow from 1 to 3. We're in a different room tomorrow.

But we will do our next [six] presentations tomorrow from 1 to 3.

Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: NextGen, let's gather for a group picture. You're welcome to put

your t-shirts on.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

