

---

HYDERABAD – Fellowship Daily Sessions  
Monday, November 07, 2016 – 11:00 to 12:45 IST  
ICANN57 | Hyderabad, India

KLAUS STOLL:

We have the situation that you can do with the Internet some things we really shouldn't do. And there are these operational concerns and there are these problems. And what we trying in [NPOC] to do is nothing else but looking at these concerns, learning about these concerns, addressing these concerns. Because what value has a free speech in the world. What about us as ICANN or as a community securing free speech over the whole Internet, if the Internet does not work?

And the other point which I would like to mention in that connection is quite simply that we also should be a little bit about aware about the value, the DNS itself gives us. Because a lot of people nowadays have problems with the Internet, with having a domain, running a domain name-based site.

If you believe it or not, two years ago we did a survey in – with 4200 and something NGOs in Europe and asked them, “You had a website, what happened with your website?” And 60% we are talking about Europe, lost their website in a period of three years. For simple reasons like for example, the Wealthbank gave

---

***Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It's posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.***

---

them a grant or gave a block grant for so many thousands NGOs to register the webpage of course.

Some technician registered the webpage, what did he do? He registered it in his name and nobody in the organization even knew that you have to register the domain, that you have to pay to every two years, that you have to verify your information and that's what it's all about.

So NPOC is quite simply operational concerns making that thing work. Background information – at the moment, you can only become an NPOC member if you are not for profit organization, not as a individual. You have to register first as a NCSG member and then you can have a choice if you want to become NPOC member or if you want to become a NCUC member or if you want to become both. Of course we hope that you decide to become NPOC member and then there's a lovely ladies –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah.

KLAUS STOLL: Not beside me but sideways from me, Joan Kerr, who is our membership officer. Who will be more than happy to answer all your questions about –

JOAN KERR: Come see me after.

KLAUS STOLL: How to become a member. So I talked enough and before I completely lose my voice, I'm happy to answer some questions.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you very much, Klaus. Any questions? We will be having several – probably similar to each other by their names but completely different by their content – constituency representatives today. So it will be good for you to listen to all of them and find out the differences, the major differences and then try to get involved by going and sitting in their discussions to see what kind of topics they are discussing. And I have a couple of hands raised now, yes please? Can you come closer to the mic please? And identify yourself.

SATYA VADDI: Yeah. Good morning, everybody. I'm Satya. I'm from India in Hyderabad. Actually, I was referring to NCSG and some other website in which we can join as member. I didn't get you.

---

KLAUS STOLL: Look, how we organized as – that’s a non-commercials is we have NCUC.

SATYA VADDI: NCUC?

KLAUS STOLL: And NPOC. But we are both together as the umbrella for both organization is what Tapani does the NCSG, Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. There are two constituencies –

SATYA VADDI: Yeah.

KLAUS STOLL: And one stakeholder group. Two constituency in one stakeholder group.

SATYA VADDI: OK. I got it.

KLAUS STOLL: Does that answer your question?

---

SATYA VADDI: Yeah. I just want to – I’m not clear about the second one. NCUC and the other one?

KLAUS STOLL: NPOC.

SATYA VADDI: NPOC?

KLAUS STOLL: Not-for-Profit Operational Concerns. I’m sorry.

SATYA VADDI: OK. I got it. Thank you.

KLAUS STOLL: We get creative with acronyms in ICANN. I mean nobody understand them.

BARTLETT MORGAN: My question is, what work if any is NPOC doing to sort of actively, I guess, engaged not-for-profits wherever. Just kind of bring them into the fold.

---

KLAUS STOLL:

Actually quite a lot and tomorrow 5:00, we have hopefully more than 50 Indian NGOs invited. We are doing just that outreach and capacity building. You have to think about that we are as a constituency not able to do a lot of work ourselves but we are very good – very able to cooperate with other organizations to do the outreach and capacity building.

So for example, we had events last year in Washington, three outreach events where – and it’s not about having the event. It’s about creating the tape on YouTube and for example, last year, Jim Galvin from Afiliis did a 15-minute speech only on staying safe on the Internet for NGOs. One of the best – really [bomb] but we have to do that? Let me do that, let me do that, let me do that, and by the way, at the end it works. And these are another activities.

We are planning events next year events at United Nations, we are planning events in the context of the business. We are planning events in the context of the [Eurotech]. I’m telling you right from the start, some of these events might not happen because it all depends on partner, partnering and doing things. It looks very, very likely or Africa – we are looking at Africa for January and that’s one of the jobs now for why we are here. We are going around talking to other constituencies, talking to our stakeholder group and saying, “Hey, come along.”

---

And by the way, there's a very interesting synergy. If you look at operation concern making it work, you not only have to talk to the NGOs or the not-for-profit. You also have to talk to the registrars because the registrars, the people you buy the domain name from, often don't know the needs of the NGOs and doing things which are really not good for you. So for example, one of the things we are just starting to do now is to talk to the registrars through the registries and saying, "Hey, come on."

THATO MFIKWE:

Thank you. My name is Thato Mfikwe from South Africa ISOC Gauteng Chapter. My question it's around non-government organization, the NGOs because they represent various players in communities from your individual organizations including entrepreneurs and businesses themselves, although they not necessarily making profit but there's that element of sustainability.

So my question is around when you are discussing policy as NPOC, do you also take into consideration that businesses will also be represented at certain times by the non-profit organizations or the NGOs? Thanks.

---

KLAUS STOLL:

This is an extremely good question and the answer is we have no choice but it's not in the charter. So what do you do? You change the charter and that's what we are doing here at the moment. The reality is that B2 Corps, B Corps and all that stuff is – that's the need of the day. I cannot keep young entrepreneurs away from these things just because they happened to want to make the money.

And by the way, a lot of NGOs are better [business] than a lot of businesses. So we need to find a level but you also have to understand that – and that's what I love on ICANN. With a lot of things – we need a long time to discuss it and that everybody understands that we all get a consensus and send the implements and consensus.

To be absolutely honest on your question, we are about 20% there discussing it. It will take at least another year or two and there are people like [inaudible] really as economist and an expert in that field. And his input, other people's input and you will have people who say, "No, we cannot do that. If they make one penny here, they cannot be." And others say, "Okay. They have to be the Bank of England."

So that dialogue is still going on but that's what ICANN is for. That's what policy making is for. That's what it's called, policy making. And I think it's fascinating.



SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: We have Jason and then Rim.

JASON HEINZ: Hi. Jason Heinz and I'm from Barbados and the Caribbean region. I think you do great outreach within the ICANN meeting. However, it's my personal observation that when I leave the ICANN meeting, I don't actually hear a lot about NPOC outside. So their global stakeholder engagement people, they go over the Caribbean and I'm talking about ICANN and so on. But I don't hear a lot of – I find speaking directly to the non-profit and NGO community directly within my region. I don't know if it's because I'm missing the events where it happens. And I think maybe there is a need to partner more in having the right material specific to that community within the existing events. I'm willing to assist where I can but this is just my observation.

KLAUS STOLL: You are absolutely 100% right. The reason why we are not there is because we did not find the contact yet. If we find the contact, it's actually – in fact it's quite easy. Though of course it's not easy, but the process start and we can be represented and we can make something happen. If we don't have the partner, we can't do it. Because you have to think about that we don't have

---

our own budget. We don't have staff and you need to have partners to go out and fund raise. You have to go out and do things professionally. So you are more than welcome.

Unfortunately, it's one of these injustices that they have more already, get more because when I say events in Washington D.C., do you know why they're in Washington D.C.? Why their law firms and organizations are happy to pay for it. Yup, If I say, "Okay, let us do the Caribbean." They are saying, "Hmm."

But it's something to work on but other steps, for example, that we go to [Eurotech] and go to Africa and get these things slowly but steadily done. Believe me or not, NPOC is really a team and a space where you can say, "Okay, I want to do something in here." And you don't have to be a paid up member in brackets for years and years and years to be able to move something, no. Come in, talk. Let us do it.

JASON HEINZ:

So to follow up. So like for instance, I find like at large, another community might be stronger in this space and there are quite a few non-profits who are participating as the individual Internet user. Is there no collaboration between the other communities to help channel like the non-profits a bit more towards you were saying?

KLAUS STOLL:

We are trying to do our best but in reality that's one of the things which we have not sourced out in ICANN too well at the moment is to really to do that cross work across communities. And it's all based on win-win situations. So what I described for the registries and the registrars and what we are doing. That's a pure win-win basis.

If I want to partner with somebody, the other one can do it anyway. So getting me in does not mean it's a win. So we might not do it. But having to work on it, it takes a long, long time. But you are absolutely right. I mean – but my invitation stands, come on.

RIM HAYAT CHAIF:

Rim from Algeria for the record. As I understood, you are working with the Human Rights Organization. And I was now reading the website, I saw that you are doing some empowerment and capacity building for Human Rights Organization. What I want to know is which are the criteria for this organization to be a member of this constituency?

---

KLAUS STOLL: Are you asking in general what the criteria for a member to become part of the constituency?

RIM HAYAT CHAIF: Yes.

KLAUS STOLL: That you are not-for-profit organization. We can talk about that. That you are an organization and that you have a web page or domain name registered.

RIM HAYAT CHAIF: Yeah. And is this an organization that are already working? And it's not government things or any –

KLAUS STOLL: Anybody.

RIM HAYAT CHAIF: Anybody.

KLAUS STOLL: And to be absolutely honest, I give you an example out of a completely different space. There's a huge not-for-profit

---

organizations in the U.S. which really takes care of the Hispanic migrants and the last business they have in mind is Internet Governance. But they know that Internet Governance is important for their constituency. So they bring people like us in to tell their constituency why it's important.

And this is how it works. So for example, if you are a Human Rights Organization, you should not only think about free speech. But as I have said before, you have to explain to your members that you need to ensure that you actually can access Internet, that you save on it, that you are secure. The whole WHOIS situation, that's the core for it all.

And to be absolutely honest, I think a lot of organizations – if they are engaged with an Internet governance, learn a lot and actually gain a lot because they get an angle they really did not see before. Suddenly they realized, “Oh, I live in a country and we have a government and by the way, I can participate,” and that's the point. And if we achieve that, that's fine.

RIM HAYAT CHAIF:

And do you organize workshops for human right defenders or how do work – like if this organization is already part of this, what do –

---

**KLAUS STOLL:** Again, sorry I have to give you the same answer to him. No, we don't but if you come to us and say, "Let's do it." We will try to do everything to make it happen. We can't do anything without partnership. That you have to understand. We cannot be the biggest charter with everything without partnering, it doesn't work.

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** Thank you, and we'll take the last question, Fadi?

**FADI SALIM:** Thank you, Fadi Salim, I'm from Syria. One of the issues maybe that has touched a point in an earlier question. One of the issues for NGOs in certain countries around the world that they cannot legally be registered as an entity in their country under their jurisdiction. Because some countries don't accept – don't have Civil Society Organizations or NGOs or it does not exist as a category of registration legally. If an organization that exists and functions and some of these countries comes to you and wants to register, would you accept it even though it doesn't – it's not recognized legally?

---

**KLAUS STOLL:** I give you very disappointing answer but I think I'm obliged to you, to tell you the truth. The truth is that yes, we should register them and our charter basically would allow that. But as the approval goes through the NCSG, and all have to approve for that organizations, often there are people who say, "Oh, they are not officially registered as an NGO so we don't want them." They are a stooge from the government or something like that. We have not sorted that out, it's extremely unsatisfactory. That's what I mean for the B Corps and with the young entrepreneurs, a similar situation. We have to convince our fellow travelers that how we move forward in our definition what is an NGO, what is not an NGO.

**FADIH SALIM:** And a quick follow up, how do you describe the description – difference in your work and NCUC or other organizations?

**KLAUS STOLL:** NCUC is issues based and that's very, very important. We are operational-based. It's simple like that. And the two don't bite each other whatsoever.

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** Thank you very much. Yes?

KLAUS STOLL: If I can beg you for – Joan wants to say something. Here is the microphone.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Okay.

KLAUS STOLL: Joan wants to say something. Here's the microphone. Joan is a membership secretary – Chair Membership for NPOC.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Joan, you have only one minute please.

JOAN KERR: That's all I need. Thank you. Joan Kerr for the record. I'm the Membership Chair for NPOC and by raise of hand, how many NGOs are in the room? Organizations? Okay. May I request something from you? I have a goal to reach another 62 – we have 62 members – in the next three months. May I invite you to join us so I can reach my goal please? Thank you.



---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: You can send any information to me and we will try to share this with Fellows. Thank you very much. Thank you, Klaus, for taking your time. I know you just arrived and you don't feel good, but thanks for coming here. Thanks.

And we have heard about the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group from NCSG. We heard from Non-for-Profit Operational Concerns Constituency (NPOC) and we now have the pleasure to hear Non-Commercial Users Constituency Chair, Rafik Dammak and with great pleasure I would like to let you know that he is also from ICANN Fellowship family. So he is a fellow alumni and always a Fellow as we say, and now he is chairing this NCUC constituency. Rafik, the floor is yours.

RAFIK DAMMAK: Okay. Thanks Siranush, and okay – wow. Thanks for allowing me to speak with you guys today. It's always a pleasure to talk with the Fellows. So my name is Rafik Dammak. I come from Tunisia, so a developing country like many of you here. And I also see many of our members here, which is always a pleasure.

So you heard that there are so many constituencies, the way how ICANN structured it makes it a little bit confusing. Complicated for any newcomer, but there is a reason for that's how you can represent different interest in this multistakeholder

---

model. And so you create this complex construct. However, as you could hear from Tapani in the beginning, we have this, the NCSG which is the umbrella. And within, you can have a different constituency that can represent different interest or maybe they focus on different topic and so on.

It's not mutually exclusive. For you, you can join and select to join one or two. It's up to you and how much time you can allocate, what to participate in the space. Let's say, it's kind of we are one of the space for civil society within ICANN and representing NGO not-for-profit, but also individual registered end user. Those who have non-commercial interest – and we really insist on that, the non-commercial interest – because in the other constituency or other groups within ICANN, most of them, except the ALAC, have financial interest on the domain name, space or industry.

NCUC predates the formation of NCSG so we were formed in the 1999, in the beginning of ICANN. And since then, we were advocating for freedom of expression, for human rights in general and privacy within the context of domain name. Even if the domain name looks like kind of narrow topic but it's important because ICANN as the organization can set a global policy that apply everywhere.

---

And so this policy can be a precedent for maybe other legislation or other policy area within Internet. And so it's quite important to get involved and to avoid that sometimes some policy that can be harmful for user, to be made within ICANN.

In term of representation, it's not just about activist or civil society per se like Internet governance space but really all interest within civil society. For example, we can take the development issue. We are not going to fix here development regarding for example, economic development and so on.

But really to take that dimension and focus in what ICANN can do. We talked a lot about access. Access to domain name, it's a part of that access and NCUC in a few years ago, took the lead to push for supporting applicant from developing countries. So you can have all more top-level domain name in developing region, so they can serve their communities and so build more DNS industry in those areas. So there are different interest. And we try to represent at the global level and in that matter, for example myself, I'm coming from developing country. And how our Executive Committee is made, is we have representation from each region and this is by design. So we have from Latin America, we have from Africa, we from Asia Pacific, we have from Europe and North America. So the goal was really to – it's hard

---

to say that we can represent all the non-commercial and civil society. But trying to build mechanism that to bring more voices.

And in our constituency, we can have really the diversity of opinions between sometimes what those in the south or the north, they can think about the same topic. But that really help us to build more consensus on policy and we focus a lot all policy around domain name.

Just to summarize here. As a constituency, we accept both individuals and organization. We try to represent civil society at large so we can have activist, we can have NGOs, we can have not-for-profit but also we have academics and just any individual who may have interest on the domain name.

Myself, I'm not a member of any organization. I'm just participating as individual. I'm Computer Engineer and just participating in my free time on the debate about domain name policy. And also, as a group, we try to be vocal in different issues that our members think they can bring. And we try to represent them.

So I don't want to speak more and try to present. I would be happy more to respond further questions and to clarify. Because I guess we heard a lot of acronyms, many different constituency and sometimes it's not clear where you should be. It's not

---

necessarily [inaudible]. It can be in different places if you have the time to do so. Yes?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Good morning. Am I audible? Okay.

Like first time I have attended the Helsinki – for ICANN 56. I was really confused with the acronyms and it was really, really obscure for me this whole place and the ICANN. Now after reading the online things and all, I got a bit of clarity. Now, since I deal mostly with nutrition, public health and environment and education, how do I get a separate DNS or can I take as an individual, I can apply for the DNS or I have to join some organization for that apart from ICANN?

RAFIK DAMMAK: Okay. I'm trying to clarify –

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: How do I connect or fit myself into ICANN for social issues? Just like she spoke about the human rights.

RAFIK DAMMAK: So you are saying how you want to bring the issue that you are working on in the DNS discussion.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yeah. Exactly.

RAFIK DAMMAK: Okay. That's a really good question because maybe there are people think that in some issue it's quite narrow. But for example, let's take that, we say domain name when in the introduction of new domain names. There was several kind of type like there was community based or maybe representing a new business and so on. So when we introduce those new domain name, they also introduce the new issues that we didn't think about, is for example, how you can define a community.

For example, what is the impact of creating this top-level domain at economic or social aspects? So those kind of thing that created – and for that, we need people like you and your organization to join the discussion. Because, myself, I cannot or others maybe, we are not aware about the issues you are facing. So when you join the discussion process, you can bring your viewpoint and share with us your experience.

So we encourage you to join. There are so many discussion in ICANN but they are not necessarily impacting everyone or interesting for everyone but that's okay. That's usually my advice to Fellows or any new member is try to find the area

---

where you want to spend your time. You don't have to try to cover everything, it's impossible. I mean, myself, I don't do that. I just focus on the area of interest. So if you have like you said, you think that maybe TLD domain name, they can have some impact in your country or the area you are working on, you can bring those issues and share with us.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible] spreading everywhere and the social issues ultimately the human aspect actually, the technology I think it should completely relate with the human aspect. That's why I want to connect myself and if I start at all an organization, I should connect it with ICANN so that everybody is end-user ultimately. And everybody should get the accessibility of all the human things like the social issues, they should be covered. Thank you.

RAFIK DAMMAK: Yes. I mean when we talked about human rights, it's not just freedom of expression or the political – yeah, not just political rights but also economic and social and so on. All those kind of human rights. And for example, we are also supporting cross-community working party on human rights within ICANN and we try to see what kind of human rights dimension that are

---

impacted by ICANN policies. So one of them can be the social and economic rights, yeah.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: To be a member in NCSG you must be a domain name registrant, right?

RAFIK DAMMAK: No.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: But I think, in the website, to be a member, you must be a registrant?

RAFIK DAMMAK: There are several.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: And Tapani has said that to be member in NCUC or in NPOC, you have to be a member first in NCSG, then to join one of the – under constituencies.



---

RAFIK DAMMAK:

Okay, you have two question different questions. As individual, there are I think three possibilities. One of them in just you have interest, non-commercial interest on the domain name but it's not mandatory to have your own domain. What Tapani I think tried to explain is first, you need to join NCSG as a member and then after, you can apply to join NCUC or NPOC or both. But as far as I recall the charter, it's not mandatory to have a domain name. So if you don't, you can join because this was, I think introduced in 2009, it's really to open the space as much as possible and particular from developing country.

And in one of question I heard about like to be registered, organizations will not – when we open to the individuals, it was one of the by design, a possibility to really to be inclusive even if there are some constraint or barrier. But having more individual to participate can fill the gap at some level. Maybe it's not enough but at least can be a good workaround. Yes, Rim?

RIM HAYAT CHAIF:

Rim Hayat from Algeria for the record. Thank you, Rafik. By the way, Rafik was my mentor several years ago for the online course. I have a question actually about the difference between NPOC and NCUC because I see lots of similarities and NPOC is limited to the NGOs but the NCUC, you can – for individuals and NGOs. So what are the differences between those two?

RAFIK DAMMAK:

Okay. I think I cannot speak for NPOC. So the name is the operation, that's the interest of the domain name, operation impact on the NGO, the organization. We try to find out what are the issues as by topic. More kind of issue based constituency, so there are so many that can rise. We can, focus like human rights in general.

And when we talk about human rights it's not just because – I mean freedom of expression is that – but freedom of expression because it's enable for other rights. And we see in many cases that how some policies apply to domain name that can [be] really [hard]. It's not just about a freedom of expression or putting in danger activists but really can have a lot of consequences.

So there's a difference. It's not mutually exclusive. Our organization can have some operational concerns but at the same time, they want to work on specific issues that relate to the domain name policy. And that's why we try to bring more and more because by the diversity of the membership, you can find other issue that maybe you did not think about before.

So for example, you talked about human rights defender, we have several organization, our member, that are working on

---

those matter. Like we have the Electric Frontier Foundation, we have like Center for Democracy and Technology and so on. Association for progressive communication that several organizations that are working in those area for many years. And so, as constituency, we can focus on the domain name space, while they are working on other issues too.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: So we have the space for the last question because we have the next presenter joining us. Three minutes. We are keeping the time. More questions for Rafik? James? Jason?

JASON HYNDS: This two-level application is very interesting and I respectfully mean that it strikes me as bureaucratic and I'm amused there's no effort to simplify the application into one where you just choose the branch within one application.

RAFIK DAMMAK: Okay. The construction, it does not really come from us. I mean this stakeholder group and constituency, it was – it's long history, we can talk later about [inaudible]. It's coming 2009, it was imposed by the Board. Because in the time of the GNSO they're restructuring, and this is the funny thing, in ICANN, we

---

like all these procedures and stuff. In that time we suggested that we ride over the constituency because it create that certain complexity and to have interest group. That topic now is quite old. We have to live with the constituency and we try to improve things.

In term of why we have the NCSG because it set the eligibility rules for the constituency too. If you apply in the same – in fact, it just won one application now. You fill the information for NCSG and you can select to join NCUC, NPOC or both or none. So for most of the members, they are doing only one application. So you don't really have to go through two applications. So it's quite seamless so you don't see that. So the construction – let's talk about this kind of really long, long, long history. Yes?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Any last question? No, I don't see any questions, so I think you got the good understanding of all three constituencies working in which way, who can go there. Again, Rafik, also for your information, we will be sharing your contacts, your e-mail addresses, your websites with Fellows. Yes, of course.

RAFIK DAMMAK: One of your coach I think, she is running for the executive committee election in NCUC.

---

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** Great. So we can ask [Ines] if there's anything needed about NCUC. Thank you, Rafik. Thank you for taking your time coming here. And we have the last presenter for today's daily session, Katrina Sataki. Country Code Names Supporting Organization Chair, ccNSO Chair. So we have the pleasure having Katrina with us. Thank you for coming, Katrina, and the floor is yours.

**KATRINA SATAKI:** Thank you very much, Siranush. So good afternoon, Fellows. As you just heard, I really am Katrina Sataki and I'm the Chair of the Country Code Names Supporting Organization. And this is a body within the ICANN structure created specifically for and by Country Code Top-level Domains or ccTLD. So two acronyms we have to operate with during our Q&A session. So one is ccNSO and other is ccTLD.

I don't know what exactly would you like to hear so maybe if there are any questions I'll start –

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** Katrina, probably if you start with the way – how fellows can be involved or how to become a member of ccNSO. That would give the floor for the more questions to come?

KATRINA SATAKI:

Yes. Thank you for this idea. So you have to be a ccTLD to become a member of ccNSO; ccTLD operator according to IANA database. As you know, IANA has a database with all top-level domains listed there. Including country code top-level domain so if you are an operator of two letter country code or an IDN country code. Usually it's a usual two-letter country code. So then you can become a member but if you want to participate in the work of the ccNSO, you don't have to be a member of the ccNSO.

This is a very important distinction here. We do not view ccTLDs as members or non-members. Of course there are certain things that only a member can do. Only a member can vote on Council elections for example. Only a member can vote on during the Policy Development Process. Some certain things that only members can do. But we have many working groups. We have other activities, you can present for example, give a presentation during ccNSO meeting days. You don't have to be a member. This is something that really we always stress even to our members and our non-members.

There are approximately – there are 249 Latin ccTLDs out there and more than 30 IDN ccTLDs and out those 249 Latin ccTLDs, 161 is a member of ccNSO. So yes? I see a question here.

---

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Good morning. [inaudible] from Venezuela. I have two questions. I understand the ccTLDs also don't have any contract with ICANN, so what happen when your country code is not working or it's working [bad]? Who do you claim?

KATRINA SATAKI: Yes. Thank you for this question. Yes, you are right. If you talk about the contract with ICANN in terms that there are contracts between ICANN and a gTLD operators, no, we don't have contracts like that. Well some have exchange to let us some have more formalized contracts but yes, in general, ccTLDs are like countries.

Each ccTLD normally is supposed to work for their local Internet community. This is for the benefit of the local Internet community. And of course, if the ccTLD operator does not perform or constantly misbehaves or does not deliver the service and ignores local Internet community, it is the local Internet community that has to step in together with the government. Probably together with the existing ccTLD operator discuss things and there should be a dialogue because I understand that's not always possible. I agree it's not always

---

possible even though that majority of ccTLDs do excellent work and really on behalf of their Internet communities.

Because all ccTLDs, it's identity for your country. When you register domain name under ccTLD, you kind of show your identity. You identify with your country which is your ccTLD. And that's why ccTLD, these are very proud of what they are doing and it's just normal for us to work for local Internet community. Yes, please?

[PETTINAN]: Thank you. I'm [Pettinan] from Thailand. I have two questions. First is, you said you don't have to be ccTLD to be the member right?

KATRINA SATAKI: Sorry. I did not say that. You have to be a ccTLD.

[PETTINAN]: Obviously I was wrong, okay.

KATRINA SATAKI: I said you don't have to be a ccNSO member to participate in the work.



---

[PETTINAN]: All right.

KATRINA SATAKI: But we are a body for ccTLDs.

[PETTINAN]: Sorry. I must be mistaken. And if there's any working group happened? The member of that working group has to be ccTLD or any interest can join the working group?

KATRINA SATAKI: Well, you have to be ccTLD. Of course there are working groups. We can invite other communities participate as well. Especially when there's a working group that tries to address some issues of interest for other communities as well. For example, one of the groups that has currently published their final report is – and I will use another acronym here because it really – the name is not so important here, EPSRP Working Group.

In that working group there were active members from GAC, active members from other – yeah, from ALAC, ALAC participated in that work. And this is a collaboration. Of course it depends on the scope and charter of working group. Because if you deal

---

specifically with issues important for ccTLDs, it's good to be a ccTLD so that you understand what it's all about. But if there are lots of topics or issues of common interest, of course some representatives from other communities are always welcome. You have a follow up?

[PETTINAN]:

Sorry, can I just have one more question. This one is, I understand that if ccTLD treated as the server entity of the country so there's no contract. But I'm just wondering, is it possible to have kind of guideline or best practice that the ccTLD should follow? I have some example, like in Thailand, .th is quite strict. So you have to provide a lot of documents to prove that you are actually in Thailand to get the domains. So what happens is some of the bank name, they cannot do the fraud in Thailand but then they register in other ccTLDs. So people thought is the bank in the branch in that country, so this is quite a problem for us. So if there's a guideline, that would be nice.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you for this question. If you talk about guidelines or some standards, we have to look at this question from two perspective. One is, and the most important thing for the ccTLD is to ensure that the ccTLD works so that it does not disappear

---

from the Internet at some point. So this is technical thing. And of course, there are technical standards that have to be observed.

And there are also – well I’m trying not to get overly complicated here. Yeah, so there are standards but those are mostly related to some technical things. There are ccTLDs also – ccNSO is not the only organization where ccTLDs can come together. ccTLDs work very actively on the regional level. For example, in your region, there’s APTLD. That is regional organization for Asian Pacific region – ccTLDs in that region, they are members.

I think probably but more than a month ago there was an APTLD meeting in Thailand and I had the pleasure to participate there. So I have seen APTLD in action and during these meetings, ccTLDs exchange their experience, there – because – well, you cannot go to bookstore and buy a book, “How to run a ccTLD.” There’s no such a book.

So two ways to learn, from your own mistakes and from mistakes of your fellow ccTLDs. And when ccTLDs come together, this is one of the ways they share, “We did this mistake,” or, “We did this right.” And this is the way how we try to promote best practice.

And of course, we talk about policy and your question is actually about the policy. Policy, it’s not the way it operates, it’s the way

---

this domain is open for registration, so how these domains are registered. And yes, for ccTLDs, each ccTLD develops its own policy.

The way this policy is developed may differ. Some develop it themselves, some develop in consultation with the government. Some develop in consultations with local Internet communities. So it's a process and it depends on the ccTLD and it also depends on local culture, local customs and all involvement of your local Internet community and government.

For example, if I asked you – in my country, there's a law that... I don't know – that you can just take this nice speaker and take it with you. Why there's no such a law in your country. You would understand that they are two different countries. You cannot expect same laws be enforced in all parts of the world.

And with ccTLDs that's exactly the same because each ccTLD operates in their environment, in their jurisdiction. So they have to follow local laws and no one from the outside can tell them that, "You, now you just forget about this law and follow my ideas, my perception of how your ccTLD must be run." So this is a really significant difference from gTLDs and ccTLDs. ccTLDs work in their country, according to their laws. Have I answered your question? Yes, to some extent. First there was –

GZ KABIR:

Hi. This is GZ Kabir from Bangladesh. I belong to technical community. So I'd like to give you a compliment first of all, the best session that we normally have at ICANN meetings [inaudible], thank you very much. My question is almost answered but I want to go a bit further. Like all the ccTLDs, operations are maintained by the local rules and the local government.

But is there any mandate or any jurisdiction that you can set about their operation? Like for an example, one ccTLD is offline very often, so is the users, they are – that the users are suffering a lot because the operational or technical way they are not online always. So do you have any supervision from the top or any way of managing this thing?

KATRINA SATAKI:

We, as the ccNSO, no. No. This is, again, something that you locally have to address. In some cases, ICANN has reacted in the past but I think ICANN also tries not to interfere so this is something that has to be solved for the top-level domain whether ccTLD or gTLD, to be offline for any amount of time. And if I say, that ccTLDs offline, I mean that one cannot resolve names in that top-level domain, so this is not acceptable. But

---

again, I say it not as Chair of ccNSO because ccNSO has no authority over ccTLDs. I say it as a member of local Internet community and as a manager of a ccTLD. Well, for us, we have to be 100%, It's not even 99.99, no. It's 100%.

But at the ccNSO, we have no – we cannot go and tell them, “Now, it's not good,” no. No one can tell the ccTLD that they are not doing proper work, the only that can do that's local Internet community. And well, it can be government as well.

ALBERT DANIELS:

For the record, Albert Daniels, ICANN GSE Senior Manager for Stakeholder Engagement in the Caribbean. Katrina is absolutely right. There are few instances when ICANN will step in. One relates to situations where the operations of a ccTLD will have a security impact on the global Internet. That is one of the few situations where you would find ICANN stepping in. Apart from that, when it comes to the technical operations of the ccTLD in a sovereign country, ICANN would not get involved because as Katrina said, this is sovereign matter left to the local community to deal with.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Yeah. Thank you for this addition. Yeah, you had a question.

---

VALARIE FAST HORSE

Good afternoon. I'm Valarie Fast Horse and I'm a member of the Coeur d'Alene tribe in North Idaho in the United States. And the Coeur d'Alene reservation in the tribal government is registered under -nsn.gov under the United States government. And when we first registered our name, there was not a place to fit. We could not at the time become a ccTLD just due to the lack of the technical capabilities.

But we have built up our capacity now that we could probably do the technical part and function on the Internet but now it's the paperwork part going in and filling it out and then putting in our supporting documents I imagine. What would be the recommended path to navigate and to have the Coeur d'Alene tribe become its own ccTLD?

KATRINA SATAKI:

Well first of all – are you on the ISO 3166 list? Your two-letter code?

VALARIE FAST HORSE:

I don't believe so. How do I get on that?

---

KATRINA SATAKI: Well you have to talk to – I don't know, United Nations perhaps.

VALARIE FAST HORSE: Okay.

KATRINA SATAKI: I really don't know how to get on that list but there's ISO 3166 list.

VALARIE FAST HORSE: Are there any waivers to being on ISO list?

KATRINA SATAKI: Sorry?

VALARIE FAST HORSE: Are there any waivers to being on that list?

KATARINA SATAKI: It's just the list of all, two-letter, three-letter country codes. I don't know what the requirements are to be on the list. Probably you have to be a country or territory that's sovereign territory. So ccTLD means that this is a country code and ICANN does not decide whether this is a country, not a country.



---

VALARIE FAST HORSE: Right.

KATRINA SATAKI: They just look at ISO 3166 and if there is this two-letter code assigned to the particular territory, then yes, they can implement and well delegate this country code to an entity that meets the requirements.

VALARIE FAST HORSE: Mm-hmm.

KATRINA SATAKI: Again technically and otherwise operate the TLD.

VALARIE FAST HORSE: Mm-hmm. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. You wanted – yes, please. Yes.

JASON HEINZ: Hi. I think that there's some difficulties in the recommendation that ccTLDs that have operational issues and technical issues it's

---

left to the community. Sometimes the community is not here at ICANN or not in any other I-star spaces and are pretty uninformed about good procedures to follow. And the government may own it, for example, and may not take any input from the community.

And I am personally, as a domain reseller, very concerned about a few that I have noticed. Poorly performing ccTLDs, both operationally in terms of non-responses and reaching the people, some of the contacts in the IANA database, and some with very poor technical infrastructure.

I think it needs to be someone's duty whether it's IANA or more active outreach to the non-performing people from the ccNSO-related stuff to help remedy this situation. I'm a big fan of your tech there and the whole best practice that explicitly and implicitly would give people who would attend. But those people that are not performing, they are probably not here. They are probably not at your tech data, they are probably not following it online. So what is the solution? I don't think it's appropriate to just say, "Oh, let the local community deal with it." There needs to be more active action.

---

KATRINA SATAKI: Yes, thank you for your question and I really understand and I share your concerns but let's look from another example. For example – I don't know, your Ministry of Foreign Affairs does not perform – for example, does not respond to any – I don't know what the Ministry of Foreign Affairs usually does but it does not do things. So you are not happy about that. Oh, what would you do? Would you want somebody from the outside to come and fix your Ministry of foreign Affairs?

JASON HEINZ: If there's a root that that person from outside operates maybe.

KATRINA SATAKI: Well in that case, I think we have a disagree here because this is a country and that's the country's... It has to be solved by the country. You cannot expect somebody from the outside to come with probably with tanks or machine guns and solve issues in the country with the Ministry, for example. I'm trying to say here, all the thought, it's sovereignty of a county.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: The Soviet.

---

KATRINA SATAKI: Exactly. So no one can say you – what to do, how to do.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Katrina, thank you very much. I need to cut this session for now. We need to take the lunches and make it done by 1:30 because this room should be ready for 1:45 for another meeting. But I would like to mention specifically that even you are not a ccTLD, it's very interesting to participate ccNSO meeting. You get to learn a lot out just listening what is going on there. So if you have time, just take it to visit and participate and listen what is being discussed in ccNSO. And I would like to thank Katrina to take her time coming here and thanking her for being with us.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you. Thank you very much and [inaudible].

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you very much and looking forward seeing you again with us. Now it's time for lunch. Lunch is served in this room. Thank you very much and this meeting is adjourned.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**