

---

COPENHAGEN – GAC discussion on the IANA Customer Standing Committee

Tuesday, March 14, 2017 – 18:00 to 18:30 CET

ICANN58 | Copenhagen, Denmark

CHAIR SCHNEIDER: Yes, thank you, all. We will immediately proceed with the next session, which is number 30. So we will get a briefing from the IANA Customer Standing Committee. So please come to -- to the -- to this long table here. Yes, I see we're already filling up.

Let me give the floor to Elise because she's our liaison, I think is the name, to the CSC. So Elise, please introduce the people that have come on stage, in case for those who do not know them.

ELISE LINDEBERG: Hello. Thank you. It's the last session today, I think, so I'm happy to see there's still people here. It's been a long day. So I think this will be fairly quick and open for question, if you have any.

We will give you an update and a look ahead at the CSC, the Customer Standing Committee. I don't know if you remember, many of you, but we had a discussion about being part of the CSC, of having a liaison to this Customer Standing Committee in the first place. Then we decided that we wanted to keep an eye

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

on how the PTI, the post-transition IANA -- post-IANA transition, that is it, of the IANA is behaving toward its direct customer after the IANA transition.

This is actually one of the -- one of the topics that we can say for this agenda, we can actually say that everything is going okay. We will go through the representation -- the presentation, but I can still say up front that we are very happy with the performance of the PTI.

So it's a positive thing.

Next -- or first slide, maybe. The next slide.

The mission of the CSC is to ensure that the PTI performs well towards the direct customer. That is -- in this, we have some representative for the direct customer here. Maybe you would like to introduce yourself? Everyone knows who you are.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Sure. My name is Byron Holland, and I'm the president and CEO CIRA, the .CA registry operator, but I'm also the chair of the CSC committee, one of the four members of it.

JAY DALEY:

Hi, and I'm Jay Daley from New Zealand. I'm the head of the .NZ registry there.

---

ELISE LINDEBERG: So what we are doing in the CSC. Mostly, of course, the members.

You can put up the next slide, I think.

Okay. So I'll keep on talking until the next slide appeared.

The direct customer of the -- of the PTI are the one who are monitoring this, let's say. On a monthly basis we have meetings where we discuss and we get the insight of how the direct customer, what they think about the performance of the PTI.

And the reports that are sent from the PTI to show how they perform are, I think, quite technical. I gave some -- I forwarded some to the GAC. I think one of my missions as a liaison to the Customer Standing Committee has been to explain that we need to find a way to tell all of you or to tell our community how the PTI performs in the language that we all can understand and that we can relate to and so we can have a discussion in the GAC.

And I think that we will give reports coming up now soon that will also be not so technical but more overviewing overall how the PTI is doing.

There are two gTLD members appointed by RCIG. And there's two ccTLDs members appointed by ccNSO. One member non-

---

ccTLD or gTLD member and one liaisons appointed by PTI. And then we have all the other liaisons where GAC is one of them, as you can see from the slides.

So what we're doing then is monitoring the PTI performance. That is changing to the root zone. Can you explain a bit more about what we actually are monitoring? Can I give just a short --

JAY DALEY:

Sure. IANA or post-transition IANA, or PTI, receives regular change requests for the root zone. And, if they are set particular targets on how quickly those must be processed. And it's a measurement of those targets that we largely carry out.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Just for the record, it was Jay Daley who said that, not Byron Holland.

ELISE LINDEBERG:

So, when they formed the Customer Standing Committee, it was, of course, because up until now there have not been any big problems with how IANA was performed. So, after the transition, they wanted to make sure that someone was monitoring, that that was still the situation and will still keep on being the situation after the IANA transition.

---

And the reports that we have seen and the topics we have discussed shows overall that the PTI delivers on -- I think it was 99%, isn't it, of the merits we are supposed to deliver on. So it's very good. I gave a report to you in the GAC explaining that. So it is reassuring to see that the customers, direct customers, which we care about in the GAC. Even if it's not our daily business, of course we care about how our CCs and gTLDs, how they -- how they feel the PTI is performing and if they're happy with the service they're getting.

So there's one meeting each month. PTI delivers a report telling how they're doing, and it's measured towards all these metrics. I think it is -- how many is it? 63 metrics that they are measured against. And they deliver a report on that one. And we look through this one and we see that the numbers are good.

If there's any question, we will ask in our monthly meeting the representative of the PTI in the meeting why the numbers are how they are. And, if they can do any better, if they can change it. And, if they can't change it, what's the reason for that and so forth.

And then we also then deliver a report on the PTI reports. And this is something that everyone can look into. It's open. The meetings are also open, aren't they? Yeah. So everything can be

---

looked at. I posted everything on the GAC list, so you can follow the meetings and the results and the reports and us on the PTI.

I had some questions about the delegation, redelegation time for the IDN ccTLDs.

I don't know, Wanawit, you were here. Thailand, you asked some questions about that.

And if we were happy about the timing and how much time it took. You got an answer from IANA on this one. Were you happy with that answer?

THAILAND: Yes. As the answer I get, it's okay.

ELISE LINDEBERG: It's okay. Yeah. This is one other thing, of course, the GAC is discussing, the IDNs and how they're doing.

Yes, I don't know. If there are any questions, comments, anything you would like to put forward also for Byron, who is leading this group. We will -- if you go to the next one, we have reviewed four PTI reports up to now. And we will, I think in -- deliver more from us. Yeah.

The first CSE chapter review will start by October 2017.

---

And then we will also look at the SLAs, the performance metrics for PTI and look if there's any changes that need to be done to these SLAs, yes. If the demands that we're putting up on them are too strong or too high or if it's -- should still be there. We're looking into it now, but that's a process that we just started. So we will need to see if it probably could take some time. And we will also need to see if we need something in the bylaw changes combining with that. But I think overall things are going good ahead, and the direct customers are on top of this. They have everything. Yeah. Any questions? Pakistan.

PAKISTAN:

Thank you very much for the brief. You mentioned one of the functions is monitoring. Can you elaborate this? In what terms are you monitoring? Online monitoring of the TLDs? What is the main objective of this monitoring, how you monitor?

ELISE LINDEBERG:

As I said, we are getting reports about how they're answering to certain demands that are in service level expectation agreements that are put into -- that are put forward by the -- is it the ICANN board who has created them? So the ICANN board, as part of the transition, had set some merits they have to meet. And PTI is then reporting on how they meet these merits. You wanted to -- we get these reports by email. And we then have a

---

meeting and discuss the results and then have a report of our own. We also discuss how should we put this in writing. Are we happy? Are we not happy? And what should we change, if anything?

So that's how the work is done. But, if you want more detail on how we're monitoring the details, maybe you could tell a bit more.

JAY DALEY:

Sure. So the Customer Standing Committee doesn't operate any infrastructure, doesn't do anything technical in that way. The data collection is done entirely by PTI. And it's not audited. It's taken on trust in that way. And what we do is we look at the results that they come from -- that they provide to us. And we ask questions about those. And then from the questions we're able to make a recommendation either to change the targets, if we believe the targets have been set wrong -- because this is a very early stage -- or we can have a remedial procedure to go through, which is still to be defined if we believe there's a problem there that needs to be tackled.

ELISE LINDEBERG:

There has been presentations. I don't know if it's been in the ccNSO yet. That's tomorrow. But it has been in the GNSO. The



---

GNSO members reported that they're very happy and satisfied with how the committee works and also about the reporting, about the performance of PTI. So, in that sense, the direct customers are also, as we have seen up to now, happy with the reporting and how they can follow how PTI performs on the metrics. So this is one area that shouldn't have any problems. If we meet any big problems in the CSE, something is really wrong. It could be one or two cases, right, that doesn't need to be dramatic in itself. But, if it is a pattern of a bad performance or performance going down, that will be one critical issue after the IANA transition. So that's something we do not want to see. And that's why CSE is there.

Any more comments, questions? Byron said it's the good thing of being last of the day. But it also shows quite a substantial report from me saying that everything is okay. So then I guess many of you don't -- you're not worried in any way. Okay. That's it then. If you want to join for the meeting CSE has for the board, that will be tomorrow. They can join us in our discussions with the Board. Otherwise, you're, of course, welcome to follow the activity both the meetings, read the report, if you like to, or just wait for me to report that everything is okay again, which I think I will do at the next meeting. Or you can then, of course, also join the meeting as such. It's open. Thank you.

---

BYRON HOLLAND: I'll make one comment. We are meeting with the Board tomorrow at 11:00 a.m. That will be more discussion about how it's working and whether it's working well or not. The answer to that is yes. But there will be a more detailed discussion with the Board and CSE.

And I would also just say, if you want to keep on top of it in a very lightweight way, there are two key reports. The PTI is the detailed 63-metric report that we receive on a monthly basis. You're certainly free to look at that, especially just before bedtime if you need to fall asleep.

But, if you want to understand how we're really doing, the CSE actually issues a report about the status of PTI metrics. And it is literally one to two pages long and provides you what you need to know about how PTI is doing. So, if you want to keep on top of it, that's the one to read. That's the CSE report. It's available on the web. It's available through lists that I know Elise is posting to. So push and pull. Our meetings are open. They are Webcast when we have them once a month. And at ICANN meetings we have a face-to-face meeting, which is also open. There are many different ways to get at this information. And it's very transparent. But I say the easiest point of entry is just the CSE report, which is published once a month. Thanks.

---

ELISE LINDEBERG: Also a short comment at the end. If any of you have anything you want to put forward on behalf of your CC, for example, which often has a good connection with the government in each and every country, on performance, something they wonder about, something they're not happy about, I guess they will have their own channels, of course, but they can also go through the CSE. So then, of course, you can also, as a GAC member, forward it to me and I will put it forward also to the CSE. Or you can go to the CSE directly.

Thank you.

CHAIR SCHNEIDER: If there are no more questions, comments, ideas, then I think this is the end of today's GAC meeting. So thank you very much for having come at this late hour. We would probably have had 15,000 more questions if you had come at 11:00. But we will send them to you in writing as soon as they come back to it.

Thank you very much. And before the GAC people leave, Olof would like to make a very important announcement. It's extremely important.

OLOF NORDLING: Utterly important. Thank you, chair. And thank you for giving me the opportunity to remind you all, like Julia did by email,

---

you're all invited to the commercial stakeholders group cocktail reception to take place at 7:00 p.m. until 8:00 p.m. And the location for that -- and that's really important -- is the terrace. Now that's here in the building. Close to room 18/19. You need to pass through those, and that's where the terrace is.

So it's a little bit of an IQ test. But, if nothing else helps, well, just follow the signs. Okay? See you tomorrow.

CHAIR SCHNEIDER: Olga has another IQ test for you.

OLGA CAVALLI: Yeah. It's not so fancy as the announcement by Olof. But at 6:30 Asha Hemrajani from ICANN board and myself is organizing here to discuss and debate about the role of women in leadership positions in ICANN. We have done this since the meeting in Dublin. So, if you want to join and you want to skip the wine in the terrace, you can stay with us or not. Or you can go there. Thank you very much.

CHAIR SCHNEIDER: Since the reception starts at 7:00, I think there's a reason to stay. And, if I get this right, even if it's called the terrace, it's not really outside, right? So we are not having to have our winter coat.

OLGA CAVALLI: Stay here. It's warmer.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**