

---

COPENHAGEN – Underserved Regions in the ICANN Community - How to Better Engage?

Monday, March 13, 2017 – 15:15 to 16:45 CET

ICANN58 | Copenhagen, Denmark

PUA HUNTER: Good afternoon, everyone. We're going to start with the session for -- the open session, the GAC Underserved Regions Working Group open session, how to better engage. My name is Pua Hunter, co-chair for the Underserved Regions Working Group.

May I ask everyone to please move up. Move up to the table.

Okay. Thank you.

You can see the questions -- Sorry. Before we carry on, I want my colleagues in the front to introduce themselves, please.

FIONA ASONGA: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Fiona Asonga, the chief executive officer of the Technology Service Providers Association of Kenya. And within ICANN, I'm a member of the Address Supporting Organization.

Thank you.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Fiona.

SYED IFTIKHAR HUSSAIN: I'm Syed Iftikhar, director I.T., Ministry of Information Technology, government of Pakistan. Basically from two to three last meetings we are engaged with the ICANN and the GAC that there should be a capacity building, particularly in the underserved countries, to promote and outreach the ICANN initiatives. One of the main critical advantage of this capacity-building program is to increase the participation in the ICANN meetings. Definitely the number of increase participant, it will increase the input in the policy development process. And more the communities, more the better input and better the policies for the operations of a safe and secure and managed domain name systems.

So we know this working group is to work with the GAC and other relevant stakeholders to juggle the scope of the trainings, the barriers to the participant, what are the critical barriers, and what are the expectation from the ICANN, ICANN bodies, like GNSO, ccNSO, IANA. So we need your support and -- and your encouragement that this work should be completed in successful manner.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you.

Well, you can see our question up on the screen, how to better engage. As you all know, that we have little engagement from the underserved regions, and we want to understand what the barriers are and how we can help, how we can coordinate our efforts to make sure that support is -- is provided so there's better engagement.

So without further ado, I would like to ask people to come up to the mic. I don't think there's anything further I need to talk about now except to hear from you.

And we have experts in the room that can also provide some responses to your questions.

Thank you.

Before you speak, please introduce yourself for the record.

Thank you, Don.

DON HOLLANDER:

Thank you. My name is Don Hollander, and in this context I have a book shop in New Zealand. But I'd like -- I spent quite a lot of time in the Pacific and working in the Pacific and trying to get engagement with people in the Pacific to address Internet

---

governance issues, ccTLD management issues, and ICT for development issues. And one of the challenges that exists in the Pacific, where there are mostly small island states with very small populations, is the people who will have a responsibility for the space that ICANN works tend to have 15 to 20 other key areas of responsibility on their plate. And while ICANN is very generous and supportive with travel and accommodation support, the issue is not so much the travel or -- not so much the cost, but those are, I think, always appreciated. It's the time. So it's the time, the travel time, the time to be away from their day jobs when they're dealing with other issues. So the people who are responsible for the Internet sort of stuff are also responsible often for transportation issues in the country, for I.T., for telecommunications, sometimes for sports, culture.

So I think that's one of the -- one of the challenges. And I would suggest that one of the opportunities is to engage locally so when there are either local meetings or regional meetings, to try and bring more of the ICANN discussions in.

Now, I know in the Pacific, Save, who is the vice president, is president -- present is virtually every local gathering. But just try to -- but he usually does presentations as opposed to engagements. And I think, at least from the Pacific, you have the issue of time more than just costs, and then how do you engage locally.

---

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Don.

Well, for me, I actually have a big ask. I want to understand the ICANN processes, and maybe someone is saying, yeah, good luck.

Almost everyone I have spoken to acknowledged that the ICANN ecosystem is complex: its systems, its processes, the SOs, ACs, the PDPs which are the processes, new gTLDs, et cetera. Whatever they are. And there are many levels and scopes that constitute the ICANN space.

I want to understand these processes so I can identify areas that I can effectively be involved in. And I think I'm speaking for a lot of my colleagues from the underserved regions. Those of you seasoned ICANN experts don't even realize you're speaking a foreign language, a language that needs to be simplified into everyday English language or any of the other U.N. recognized languages.

Many times suggestions for remote participation keep coming up, but you need to realize that for me and my family from the underserved regions, the connectivity, the cost and time zone is a big challenge, in addition to what Don has said.

---

I suggest you look at ongoing and relevant outreach and capacity development in our regions. Look at possible one-on-one training programs or pairing of new participants to seasoned participants in ICANN. Sort of like a mentoring program.

And when we start to engage, it is important, ICANN, important not to abandon us. Think sustainable engagement. Think diverse and global engagement.

Thank you.

Yes.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Michael O., and I really appreciate you giving me the opportunity to be here and speak. I'm a first-time fellow and this is my first ICANN meeting as well. However, I'm currently based in Belgrade, Serbia, but as I've lived and worked and am Lebanese and have worked extensively in the Middle East, I can give perspective on both southeast Europe as well as, at least in ICANN language, the Middle East and Adjoining Countries. The MEAC region. So I actually have -- as I was thinking about this, I made a list of seven points that I think would hopefully expand some of the more commonly understood barriers to access: time, cost. All

---

these are definitely relevant, and they're also ones that are the most kind of obvious. That doesn't make them any less important. It's just the ones -- So the ones that I wanted to focus on, for instance, I'll start with the first one. I've experienced this in southeastern Europe specifically, and there seems to be, for instance, a lack of will by either operators or registrars -- or, sorry, in this case, I think it's operators, to complete some of the more small but meaningful tasks, such as sub IP allocation registration, that might seem very tedious, but the idea is that, for instance, in Serbia, bloggers and other entrepreneurs around the country have a lot of problems with Google AdWords. One of those problems stems from the fact that they can't use it because simply by pointing an IP address to somewhere in -- the way that it's currently generally managed, if someone were to use an -- current try to use AdWords, it points someone to the country, not to a specific locality within that country, which means -- which renders AdWords basically useless.

And so this actually is hurting the digital economy, for instance, because -- and we've done -- we being some of my colleagues and I have done some analysis and realized that it has to do with IP allocation. It's just not happening.

Number two, and this -- now I'm going more into some of my experience with the Middle East. It seems that there's definitely -- one thing that could help a lot is more pointed engagement,

---

specifically with local ISPs. The thing about, for instance, the Middle East that we have to take into account is that the political situation in almost every country is different, which means that whenever -- right now I'm, for instance, working with the Middle East and Adjoining Countries Strategy Working Group, our working group has about, I think, 55 members and observers. And one thing that we definitely -- struggle is a tough word, but one challenge that's persistent is, you know, the way that we want to engage in one country is necessarily different from how we should engage in another. So when I was talking about pointed engagement, basically looking at the needs of an ISP or a group of ISPs in one place and trying to understand what are their needs, how can we actually spur kind of a certain sense of action among them relevant to their needs and to their customers' needs and to the point -- to the location itself.

Number three is staff support. And this is specifically dealing with ICANN staff support. And that's not in any way meant to be a negative comment. It's actually a positive one.

I find that especially, for instance, in the Middle East, the staff in the Middle East work incredibly hard to support policy-making in the region. However, often it's -- they're often overworked.

And so trying to -- to mitigate that in some way would be very helpful.

---

Number four, this might seem also self-evident which is the expansion of IDNs, specifically related to different scripts. And the thing about internationalized domain names, one of the reasons why it's so important is because IDNs is what helps to fuel local content, and without local content, we -- there's very little incentive to help -- to get people wanting to engage in the region or wanting to even go beyond some of the more -- the more commercial aspects of the Internet.

Number five, another way to better engage is to somehow focus more on creating affordable service, affordable service in a way that helps spur innovation but also spurs take-up by the local population.

The last two includes releasing the ecosystem as being holistic. So, for instance, like I said, the more that we can spur local content and -- and focus on affordable services, the more people -- the more users will get involved, and hopefully the more that they would be interested in knowing more about our work.

And then lastly, it's really supporting network operator groups, both, for instance, in the Middle East there's the Middle East operators group, MEOG, but then also NGOs around the world that are doing really good work to help support technical development and build technical capacity.

Forgive me if I spoke too much.

---

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

No. Thank you very much, Michael. That was very, very useful. And you just outlined that it's not just from an ICANN perspective to -- to promote engagement but also from the national level.

Thank you very much.

SYED IFTIKHAR HUSSAIN:

Thank you for highlighting these issues.

In addition to these issues in the underserved areas, this is one of the challenge, that there is a lack of trained (indiscernible) who has the technical skill set and who knows about the ICANN GAC matters, the particular Internet governance matters. Basically I am asking about the lack of trainers who will train the community experts and then the community expert will train further.

So one of the challenges to build the capacity building program in these underserved area, to create a workforce, ICT workforce, who will train the communities.

Because this is one of the major issue that in (indiscernible) in underserved, due to the lack of such subjects, even at the

---

master and graduate levels there is no such subjects on the domain name systems.

So the only one source of learning in the underserved regions in the program is the capacity building. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Pakistan. Any other comments from the floor? Come on. Surely you have -- thank you. Thank you, U.K.

UNITED KINGDOM:

Yes, thank you. Mark Carvell, U.K. government. Representative on the GAC and advisor to the commonwealth institutions on Internet governance matters including ICANN-related issues.

First of all, I very much welcome this session as an open community session which hits on an important issue which hits on the sustainability of the ICANN multistakeholder model as truly global and inclusive and provides opportunities on an equal basis for stakeholders from all communities in all regions, developing countries, small island states, and so on.

It's a very important objective for ICANN to ensure that it fulfills that obligation to be as inclusive and to facilitate participation from all regions, as I've described.

And I wonder, first of all, for the purposes of this session, whether the global stakeholder engagement team of ICANN had been invited to present on this. I mean, that is one of the -- well, that is their primary objective, really, is to ensure that the commitment to international participation and the inclusiveness of the bottom-up policy development processes and interaction across all stakeholder constituencies is maximized.

This session I would have expected would provide a valuable input into their strategic thinking, as, indeed, the GAC's working group on underserved regions. The work of that has a direct input potential into enhancing and refining the strategy on international participation.

So was the team -- they do a lot of valuable work, we know from the GAC from their reports to us. They reach out to communities to -- they participate in Internet-related fora worldwide. They talk to governments. They talk to local Internet entities. So they do a lot of valuable work. I'm not intending to criticize that in any way.

But this session reveals that there is still an important challenge in terms of constraints and barriers to participation.

---

And the outcome of these discussions would, I'm sure, provide a valuable input into the global stakeholder engagement team's work and forward planning.

And I presume that was one of the aims of this session. It would have been valuable, I think, to have had a presentation here from the GSE on its strategy and work program. Were they invited? Or maybe there was somebody here. Forgive me, if I'm not aware of that. Just an opening comment. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, U.K.

They weren't actually invited to be part of the panel. But I'm not sure whether any of them is in the room. However, any questions that needs to be related to them, we will pass those on. Thank you.

Alice.

ALICE MUNYUA:

Thank you, Pua. Thank you very much, Mark. I just wanted to respond to your questions regarding the global stakeholder engagement and government engagement.

One of -- we wanted to have a different approach to this session. Because in Hyderabad we had a session where we had a huge

---

number of panelists and really didn't get time, that much time to have a discussion amongst the participants. And I think for this session, our aim and hope was that we'd be able to start responding to some of the questions that are up there.

And we've had various engagements with global stakeholder engagement and government engagement and already have had clear what plan drawn together in collaboration with both teams including the SSR team and others within ICANN.

So this session was looking at a different approach but to begin to respond to some of those questions.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you. Thank you, Alice. And also, to add on to what Alice said, at the Hyderabad session we wanted engagement with the community. But the whole time was taken up with the panel presentations. So we decided to have a different approach. Thank you.

Yes, sir. Sorry. I saw this hand first.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Thank you. I just wanted to add these things. I wanted to relate this matter to the ITU. If we go through the approach that ITU

---

uses, it conducts regional levels preparatory meetings before the global meetings.

So that will better give the chances for the many countries and each stakeholder to contribute on the ITU-related issues.

So my concern here is shall we think on that structure also so that we have local level or regional level preparatory meetings before the global meetings? Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you. I think it is, yes. But we are -- I'm not sure whether you know that the Underserved Regions Working Group is growing a capacity development program outreach into the regions, the underserved regions. And that has started in Nairobi beginning of this year. And it's continuing on to the Pacific and to Peru and Pakistan. Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

So I want to make this point more clear. I'm quite aware of that capacity building program. But my point here is to discuss the specific issues that are going to be discussed in the upcoming meetings. So it is more than the capacity building. One is the capacity building. So thank you.

---

**SYED IFTIKHAR HUSSAIN:** Thank you very much. Actually, I think we adopted a phased approach. In phase one we build the capacity building. The community in the underserved areas know about the ICANN terminologies that things which are raised under these ICANN forums. When they have some capacity buildings, they have some skill set. Then we may take regional meetings, as you propose like ITU model, after preparation for the capacity building. And then we engage in the real matters. But, before the real matters, they know what are these things, how we accommodate these issues.

**PUA HUNTER:** Thank you. And, Fiona, did you want to say something?

**FIONA ASONGA:** I was just going to help clarify. I think what he's trying to say is it's an issue of being able to understand the context of what is being discussed. And that is also a challenge in itself in terms of being able to ensure that you're engaged in the meetings. Because you can -- it's possible for you to be able to have the connectivity or you're able to get on. But you realize that the topic and the details of the topic is not your cup of tea in the sense that you're not comfortable and you don't understand it appropriately to be able to discuss.

---

So the topic may have looked interesting. You get on to a conference call or you walk into a meeting room like we are here right now in the ICANN. And there are so many topics being covered. And you realize it's been approached from probably a very technical level. And you are, say, a lawyer or a business person, because you've got a diversity of skills within our community or you have political sense. So then you are really lost. And so for you to be able to then participate, you need to have had a debrief at some point to enable you to understand the particular topic. So maybe the idea of the information being shared on this is a good idea. But I think it's already happening. The biggest challenge is that the ICANN Web site has so much information that you do not know -- there is no guide. So you don't know where to start getting the information. But everything is there. You can get all the information there. Only that, you need to be guided to know where the starting of this information is. Because it's just so much.

So, if you're new and you're trying to get involved in an area, you find that you are sort of like get an information overload. And then now you don't know what to do. It leaves you sort of trying to figure out so in what direction are we headed. And that also paralyzes some participants from being able to participate appropriately.

---

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Fiona. Iran.

IRAN: Thank you. I don't know how we reach the recipient of these questions. If we send it as "I heard" to the ICANN Web site. So I heard the difficulties, unless you have a dedicated area.

But there's still some of the questions, the answer is quite clear.

First of all, we should distinguish between participation and attendance. Two different things.

For the attendance, you don't need to ask questions. The answer is quite clear. Resources. No money to participate even in regional.

Sometimes I have heard and I have witnessed to travel from one African country to the other African country, you have to go to Europe and come back. So very costly. So you have to distinguish attendance with participation.

When you talk about participation, perhaps participation to the, I would say Adobe and conference call and so on and so forth. Then you have to see whether there is any network that supports that participation. And, if the network is there, whether there is sufficient quality that participation could be useful or the person after several tries was disappointed. Either

---

he or she does not heard or other things. So there are many, many of these problems and difficulties.

Then participation when we say which area and so on. So I think there is a need to -- situation to be worked out. If you expect that the participation engagement will be to a particular sector, the answer would be disappointing because that sector or that entity usually would not distribute that to the concerned people.

They receive it, and that's all. So the recipient does not receive that.

So we have to find how we socialize that, how we make use of that effectively, and how this participation -- and the participation people participate in some meeting.

And the first moment of participation, there are so many complex issues that he or she will be totally lost. People talking of telegraphic acronyms, people talking of something that we have been discussing for years. And the newcomer doesn't know where it goes. I was contacted by some GAC people saying can you please let us know where we can have more benefit. We are totally lost of some of these discussions. This is continuation of earlier years of discussion, and we don't know where we are. So, if really want to go from theory to practical issues, we have to see whether we need to change the way that we are doing things.

---

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Iran. Sir.

GUYANA: Chair, I'd like to walk us back a bit. Because I think we've gotten kind of ahead of what we were trying to do.

I don't expect ICANN in its current format to be easy for a beginner, because it was never beginner centric in the first instance. I can generally assume the level of capacity that in many of those areas you simply don't have.

So the question is how ICANN reorganizes itself to go back to basics and brass tacks, if ICANN is committed to finding the next three billion. So, therefore, the way the content is presented, the way the content is being delivered, the way the training is being done has to make less assumptions than it does at the moment.

So, therefore, the orientation in the instance of how do you connect the work of ICANN to -- even down to individual growth and advancement, national growth and advancement. That's where you're going to have to make the connection.

So the issues of -- so before we even get to -- before we even get to engagement and participation, orientation and education in the first instance has to be done.

So, therefore, what is ICANN, what it does. You know, you -- make the connection between how I access the Internet on a daily basis and what ICANN does to make sure that I could do that on a daily basis and the work that supports those efforts. And that is the connection that we have to make.

You may get to the point where you have an average user who goes online, but they don't understand. If I buy a domain, some of that money goes to the registrar. Some of the money goes to ICANN. Some of the money goes to a series of bodies. And we just register the domain. And, apart from paying the \$9 a year or whatever it is we pay, we make no other connection. It is at that level that you have to break it down in order to get -- that is the basic kind of education that you're going to have to do. What you're going to have to work on is the logistics to do that. Whether you're partnering with government or you're partnering with local NGOs, those are the logistics you have to work out on the cost of doing that. What is critical is how you transfer what ICANN does down to those simple levels. Because, certainly in our experience, what you find is that people don't make the connection. They don't see how ICANN affects their daily lives.

---

And at a level of what and so on fine. You don't expect that. But, certainly, from those who have an interest in ICT and moving this process forward, that is where you have to make the connection. So I think we have to dial it back a little bit and get to brass tacks and so forth and see how we deliver that kind of education before we go forward. Thank you, Chair.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Guyana. We have a gentleman at the back. Remind say your name before you talk. Thank you.

SUDAN:

I'm Nadir Ahmed Gaylani from Sudan. For better engagement I think ICANN has to reach the decision-makers of the different communities and countries. Because there are the ones who facilitate the participation of the common users. For example, ITU has a good habit that the top officials of ITU used to visit countries just to increase awareness of ITU.

ICANN now has representatives in three regions. It can be a mandate of these regions just to reach these regions and to target the decision-makers as the top level officials to increase awareness. Thank you.

---

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Sudan. I saw a hand at the back. Indonesia.

INDONESIA: Thank you, Pua. I think now we are talking about the underserved regions, you see. The problem is how to put -- to show the importance of the underserved regions.

And there are so many countries or so many areas which we call underserved. What I would like to know -- and perhaps you also because you are from Cook Island and also the others from under area. Those countries named as underserved regions, you're also member of ITU. And, if it is, then the underserved regions will be very important, too, in the U.N. ITU meetings. This will also put the importance of those underserved regions in the ICANN area.

For example, in the last WCIT meeting in Dubai, there were two points of view as to how Internet should be taken into account in the governments.

As you might be aware, countries in the WCIT actually some signed the treaty; some have not signed the treaty.

And, in the ITU meeting, every country is counted as one voice. Now, I think, if the underserved regions can also talk not only in the ICANN GAC meetings but also in the ITU meetings and even sit in the ITU consult meeting. The next ITU consult meeting will

---

be in a few months' time -- then it will be important to put -- it will be the underserved regions will have a very high level of importance, not only because the area needs to have an Internet connection and so on and so on, but because it also has a voice, a heard voice in the ITU level. This will also give every organization to improve the underserved -- to improve the telecoms and Internet activities in the underserved regions.

So this just a few in my mind, you see, to put how the importance. It's not only, I think, to put the importance of those region. To push the importance of those region. Is not only the fact that we have to improve the Internet, but we have also to improve the bargain of the -- of those regions.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Indonesia.

Fiona would like to respond to that.

FIONA ASONGA:

Fiona Asonga, for the record.

You'll allow me to speak as a private sector entity from the underserved regions. The ITU does not deal with us and, for us that becomes a challenge. It is good that our governments are

---

able to engage and make decisions within the ITU, but I think we have sort of been, in that discussion, get cut out. And what we're trying to discuss here, see how we can improve that engagement in ICANN, but because ICANN gives us an opportunity where all the stakeholders can come in and participate.

So then my question is what would we be borrowing that we can from the ITU to bring into ICANN to improve on engagement within our regions? Because I think it's very important, or at least -- at least in my country, the constitution requires that my government representative must get my viewpoints. So then I'm sure that by that -- That is not the same for all countries.

And so as we get platforms to engage, we find it's more comfortable to participate where your view is welcome. And ICANN has given us a platform to be able to do that.

So then the question is we have and the discussion for this afternoon is pretty much to help ICANN improve on how to engage as better, because, still, from the underserved regions, we still don't have enough government representation. And in those regions, you find the private sector is also weak. And if they are not, like, encour- -- something that Mr. Kavouss mentioned, and which is very important, he said that there needs to be a way to encourage, to facilitate. And that means

---

there has to be a budgetary consideration to facilitate participation. Which I think is very important. Whether it's going to be for whichever the stakeholder will be when it comes to the ICANN environment. And that helps to make sure that we are able to be visible in the GAC, in the GNSO, in the ccNSO, in the ASO, in the ALAC, in the RSSAC, in the SSAC, you know?

Being able to be visible, that gives us a balanced -- this balance in terms of our participation. There's diversity in those groups in terms of addressing the needs of the global public interest that's ICANN's new mission is trying to work towards.

So how do we -- how do we get ICANN to facilitate some of these? There have been a few good ideas that have come in, but I'm feeling like we're almost going to lose it because we need to also be listing clearly what are expectations, then, of ICANN.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Fiona. I see a hand at the back.

Maria.

NIGERIA:

Thank you. Thank you. My name is Mary, and I'm from Nigeria, and I want to say that we have really progressed in ICANN that

---

we can, you know, engage in such conversation as we are doing today is a quantum leap from what I had known to be happening in ICANN.

My first touch with ICANN was 2004, and nobody was talking about this engagement. Nobody had talked about underserved or underserved. And ICANN is a technical -- Kavouss put it correctly, is a complex process. And we've used from (indiscernible) acronyms we don't even understand; right?

So the fact is that ICANN was not set up to be the way we are -- the way the ITU is set up. So I worked with the ITU for a very long time before I started with ICANN, and it took me some time to understand.

But one thing is certain; that if you go back to your national, to your local, and you that have attended, have been here, you'll be able to organize at local level what ICANN does, then you get followers.

My children started in the U.K., and they didn't know about ICANN. So it's not just only in the underserved region. Even the served regions, it's not everybody that knows what ICANN does, what ICANN stands for. So sometime when I'm -- when I tell them that I'm going for ICANN meeting, they're like lost. They doesn't know what it is.

---

Do you know what they studied? Computer science, and nobody told them about this.

So it's a new process. It's a new phenomenon. And it's open. It's an open process and you can come and contribute. So ICANN has started doing good jobs by being the capacity building, thanks to Alice and her group, her team who have started. So it's just to strengthen that process that has started.

So we need ICANN to be able to put in more resources and get into that and making sure that there's no drawback on the process that has started.

And if anybody is doing at the local level, please let ICANN support the process at the local level. For instance, you want to talk to -- there's a program that is going to happen and you want to collocate an introduction of ICANN to the people. So when we are organizing like the IGF meetings at the national level or at the regional or subregional level, why not ICANN support that platform and bring capacity and develop capacity just as we have been saying. So we use that as a platform.

The diversity issue is also the thing that we could, because it's only when we work at the local level that it comes up to the -- to the global level.

---

So get -- recruit more members. Talk to your government. Talk to your business constituency. Talk to your civil society. Talk to the academia. Talk to the technical community. And let there be a platform where, at national level, you that have been attending, you make it happen. And then you -- ICANN will support such process, such endeavor, such initiative.

So that's what I want to say. And it's already been said that we have problem of the time zone, we have a problem of infrastructure, because there are some countries where you can't connect when there's a program in ICANN. We manage a hub, and it happen that we can only do two hours in a day to follow what ICANN was doing because of where the program was -- was happening.

And again, the weak infrastructure we have, probably what ICANN should look at, is there any way that the boundary will be at the lower -- I don't know, I'm not a technical person so I won't be able to explain it well, but to make sure that the weak infrastructure, we can follow even with our weak infrastructure as the underserved region.

Finally, I want to say that education, education, education sensitization is very, very key. And it's only when ICANN puts in its resources. And again, this is a business. This is a business. The people that run ICANN are business people. They want

---

money. And anything you do that is just -- it might not impress so much to them if they are not getting money. So we will have to communicate that there is money in our region. So let them come. They will see money in our region.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Mary.

Yes.

ADERONKE ADENIYI:

Thank you. For the record, my name is Aderonke Adeniyi. I'm an alumni of the ICANN Fellowship, and I also represent Nigeria at the GAC.

A lot of suggestions have been brought up, but I'd like to pitch my tent with Guyana.

I think it is essential for us to look at the simple things that can make a huge efforts or make a huge impact in this approach.

You did make a statement, you said what is the connection between how I access the Internet every and the work of ICANN. Fiona also did say when she was responding earlier that what can we borrow from ITU to address this issue of the underserved region?

---

From my little experience with ITU, they've been able to define whatever it is they want to do. Take, for instance, teledensity. Everybody has an idea of what teledensity is. And when we moved from fixed telephony to mobile telephony, the definition kept changing or kept adapting so the technology could change.

If ICANN needs to reach out to the underserved, a lot of discussion has also gone out about diversity. You need to define what you want to do. If there's a global definition of what you want to do, I believe everybody can go back home with it and say, you know what? ICANN wants to reach XYZ number of people or this is what we want to do, and we can break it down.

Someone also did say about regional meetings. Yes, when your representative go to attend meetings at the ITU, not necessarily one person all the time but there are different working groups in ITU, you come back home and you engage all your stakeholders, whether they're busy, the techie. You bring it back home. You cascade it downwards.

So I will end by saying that let's have definition of what ICANN wants to do. Simplify it. And I believe we will achieve more.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you very much.

---

Yes.

MICHAEL OGHIA:

Thank you. For the record, my name is Michael Oghia, and I'm an independent consultant currently based in Belgrade.

I want to, first of all, address multiple points. So first of all, I really appreciated what our colleague from Iran said. I also really appreciated what our colleague from Guyana said.

I think there's two things that we have to take into account. The first is who exactly are we trying to engage with? Who is our audience? Are we talking about end users in a specific region or a specific country or are we talking about operators? Are we talking about registrars, et cetera?

I think, for instance, going back to your point, to the gentleman from Guyana, I think by kind of specifying who that audience is might actually help us in discerning who -- how we should reach out to that specific audience, is one.

Two, I want to greatly echo our colleague from Nigeria who was speaking about the -- specifically about the emphasis on local. So I was -- When I was hearing our colleague from Iran and Guyana and Nigeria, it made me start thinking and it also -- I was thinking about what our colleague from the U.K. said about really focusing on multistakeholder solutions. And what I was

---

thinking was is that perhaps one way that we can do this is by emphasizing more local roundtables where people within -- within a specific topic or within, let's say, local ISPs or local community members from across civil society, private sector, and of course being driven by ICANN staff, if possible, and also governments, local governments or national governments, getting people together, not necessarily just educating them about what ICANN is but also asking them what are your needs? What do you want us to communicate? You know, how -- how can we -- we take what you want and instead of flying all 50 of you or 20 of you or ten of you out to a different city, how can we be a conduit for the needs you need the rest of the community to know about?

I think doing -- emphasizing more local roundtables or local engagement in that sense in a multistakeholder fashion, I think that could be a really effective mechanism to bridge the global ICANN meetings with local needs and local -- local challenges faced.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Michael.

---

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Just to complement that last remark, I want to add that we need to focus on developing our local champions who can tell you what these issues or discuss these issues in local languages in the local communities.

So in this roundtable, so normally we do have several different activities in the Internet communities. So if we have our local champions there, then they will have these sessions under one.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you.

Iran.

IRAN: Yes.

There are many things to do. In my personal view, the first thing that we have to do, to establish the trust between the people that we inviting them to engage and ICANN. The people will ask that why I should be engaged? To do what? To go and make something, facilitate the work and to do some business activities? What I get from that?

So we should explain clearly, irrespective how ICANN is managed, multistakeholder approach or multistakeholder

---

model or anything, it is just to increase your ability and knowledge to use these things for yourself.

So we are not -- This should be explained to the people clearly.

Then we have to look which category of society we are looking for. I think one of the important category is high schools and universities. There are a good outreach provided that what my colleague mentioned, some of them may not be aware or may not be able to properly understand the things in other languages. To the extent possible, to prepare something in their own local language. Not five or six, but at least one national language.

I read the output of a court in one country with respect to the litigation, and in that court the judge or the defendant refer to a simple pamphlet written by somebody, I don't want to name any people, saying that understanding of Internet for nonexpert people. That is a 20-page document written in English language. In a very simple way, understand what is it. Because when you talk ICANN, says Internet incorporation of assigned name and numbers. People ask what is name? Why name is there? Numbers. Why numbers is there?

So that gentleman describe in a very simple manner what the issue is about. So to make it familiar with the people.

---

So we have to push through the -- increase awareness of the people of the subject we are discussing in their local language. Then we have to see the obstacles, and so on, so forth. The obstacles I have mentioned, but there are many way to override those obstacles. There are sufficient now income in some part of ICANN from the auctions. It could be discussed now in working group. Cross-Community Working Group has established how to deal with the auctions. That would be a sort topic that part of that should be put for increase of awareness of the people.

Registries and registrars collecting considerable amounts of money. They should also help. Help to increase either on voluntary basis or on some other basis. Because I see that they sell these strings or the DNS for considerable amount of money. 10,000, 15,000, hundred thousand, and so on, so forth. It should help also the people how to do that.

Then we have to identify ways and means that whom are looking for. I understand we are looking the underserved countries, and we say which category of those country are now looking for. Some people, they may not be interested. Their situation does not permit. They say I am struggling and fighting for bread to eat. So it probably doesn't matter what the ICANN is. So we have to say whom you are looking for.

---

So these are the things that I think we need to look at the situations from a relatively fresh way and to engage ourselves in something. But what I something, please kindly avoid to bring more politic than exist today in ICANN. Some other entities outside the ICANN are too political, and it is dangerous to put that. At least in ICANN, everyone who comes, if he wants to talk, he'll be given the opportunity to talk. Some other area is not like this. You need to have accreditations to talk. And if you talk something, you will be questioned and interrogated why you have said that. But here you could say, "I am speaking on my own personal capacity, on behalf of myself, on behalf of nobody." So nobody will criticize you. But you convey your message.

If other entities does not have this possibility, please kindly avoid to bring those elements into ICANN.

Because that is a very risky situation. It's hard to improve situation here, but not take those things here. Because that may not work here. Here is good. That is why you see so many developments have been made in this area, in ICANN since last 17 or 19 years and so on and so forth.

And we have to push for that. Anything -- I will tell you in a bigger forum.

---

Anything that prevents this organization to improve or put something that this organization puts is in a stagnation improved is dangerous. We have to push it to improve and improve. That is why we have distractions. And Internet become our daily lives really, everybody in the street so on and so forth with the mobile phone and tablet. And so we have to look at that one and not bring new political issue to see who we have to touch, how we have to reach them.

Talking of the bosses on the top level doesn't help. I have that experience. Really doesn't help. You have to find other way to reach the people in more direct manner and bring up the awareness of the people. Because some people in some countries, some level say why I need to go to the ICANN? ICANN does not bring me anything. But there are some other things.

ICANN should remove the discriminative treatment of some countries or some nations. There are some discriminations. Access to the network, access to the DNS, access to this, access to visa, access to traveling, and so on and so forth. These are also obstacles. If you want to do something, we have to remove this discriminatory approach. It is not voluntarily maybe, but it is there. We have to remove that. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you very much, Iran.

---

Alice?

Sorry, yeah. Go ahead.

SYED IFTIKHAR HUSSAIN: Very fruitful discussions and input and particularly the input regarding the various participation in ICANN forums.

Ultimate goal is to increase the participation in ICANN forums for the -- from the communities -- particularly from the community of the underserved areas. I mean, more participation, more input, and the more active policies and development. We will work on the operations of the challenges. And then we prepare a document, and then we'll share with you. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you.

Alice.

ALICE MUNYUA: I think I agree with a lot of what Kavouss has said going forward in terms of just, I think, looking at the broad -- perhaps making cultural changes within ICANN itself to take into consideration -- to really -- and I don't know like using this word "mainstream."

---

But, you know, to have a completely different approach towards how to engage with the underserved regions, especially taking into consideration the various challenges that -- and gaps that have been identified so far.

And I think I truly believe that the survey or research that we're going to be conducting as the underserved regions in collaboration with the ICANN team is going to really help us in terms of providing really empirical evidence as to some of the challenges that the underserved regions are facing.

For me, it's even more significant because I co-chair the Public Safety Working Group where you have quite a number of law enforcement agencies. And it's really dominated by North America and European law enforcement and with really struggling to ensure that other law enforcement agencies also participate. And also, from the other side, for example, from now the private sector side -- and my colleague, Fiona, I think, has mentioned this several times in several spaces -- the lack of a private sector or business community from underserved regions is also something that we really need to take, you know, quite seriously. And perhaps that also needs a different approach when it comes to, for example, subsequent -- the next round of new gTLDs and how we approach that and applicant support and issues to do with outreach and awareness. And I think somebody mentioned yesterday that the last attempts

---

were failures. So we may need to look quite closely at what were the failures and how do we improve going forward.

I don't know whether, Pua, we have responded to the questions that you put up there. But I think -- I believe we've got some interesting and important contributions that we can take forward in terms of formulating the next steps.

And they'll be extremely important in responding to -- not in responding but in developing questions for our survey. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Alice. Mary.

NIGERIA: Thank you. I'm going to be very, very brief. The business -- there's a slogan I developed for Nigeria. I said there's business in domain name business. Our business constituency, our private sector people need to know that there's business in domain name business. Because, if you are in business -- if you make business, you don't need ICANN to sponsor you to come to ICANN meeting. You use your money to sponsor yourself to come.

---

So, in terms of government, government reaching out to government, I think the GSE has been trying.

But, just like Fiona said, the private sector, we need to see what to do. We have about 200 million people in Nigeria. And the domain name -- registered domain name is not 200,000. So the gap is there. The outreach to business constituency, the business sector is very, very necessary. Whatever we can do at the local level to bring you the fact that they can do business and earn money, good money, make good money in domain name business, I think that will help also.

And ICANN -- the DNS forum that we'll organize is very, very good. So, with ICANN supporting the DNS forum, then it would probably bring the business together. The business people in the underserved regions need to wake up.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Mary. Michael.

MICHAEL OGHIA: Thank you, Chair. Michael Oghia, ICANN fellow.

I just wanted to very quickly respond to -- or actually, if anything, complement some of what our colleague from Iran was actually saying. I think he made a very good point about trust.

---

For me, especially at the local level, a really good way to build trust is to actually work with the existing ICANN community. What I mean by that is that, from all over the world, people are already engaged in the ICANN process, whether it's in various at-large organizations or supporting organizations -- I'm sorry, advisory committees, et cetera.

So, in other words, I think it's really a kind of a call for us to also work with our community members that are already existing and that do know about ICANN processes that can help to engage this kind of engagement and that trust building. Another thing, especially as a youth member, seeing youth as a stakeholder group in and of itself, youth have a lot of energy. Youth have also a lot of good ideas. And seeing how they can participate in this process, I think, is a very good way that we can help to facilitate that such engagement.

But, ultimately, what it amounts to is that I think emphasizing collaboration above everything else -- and this definitely is going back to his point about politics. I'm not going to comment about politics, but I will comment on collaboration.

And that is that collaboration is really, I think, is what's going to drive the future forward and is also going to help to ensure that anybody that is being touched by the Internet will be able to have a better one if we're working together. So thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you very much, Michael.

Any other comments? We're, actually -- our time is almost up. I just want to thank, first of all, my support chairs -- Fiona and my dear colleague from Pakistan.

And I want to thank each and every one of you for your very, very useful interventions. This will help to facilitate our survey and also for us to put this to ICANN. Hopefully, it won't re-form ICANN into something that will attract more work and more levels as it is. But thank you so much for your participation, your engagement. And we'll finish here. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**