
COPENHAGEN – Joint AFRALO-AfrICANN Meeting
Wednesday, March 15, 2017 – 13:45 to 15:00 CET
ICANN58 | Copenhagen, Denmark

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Good afternoon, ICANN58, March 15th. This is the Joint AFRALO-AfriCANN Meeting.

SILVIA VIVANCO: Ladies and gentlemen, for all those who are attending the Joint AFRALO-AfriCANN Meeting, if you'd be so kind just to take place – have a sit at the table if you'd like. There's lots of space. [Speaking in French].

GORAN MARBY: So we'll start. Please AFRALO-African Meeting, we speak in French, so please take your headphone and the meeting will be in French and English. Gisella.

GISELLA GRUBER: Just before we start the meeting, so that we have no interruption, we have many new person for the AFRALO-AfriCANN meeting. We have interpreters into French and into Arabic. So please give your name every time you speak because they don't know you. And we need to identify you in the

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

transcript. So please state your name every time you speak.
Thank you very much.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Thank you very much, Gisella. We're going to start our meeting. We are 10 minutes late, so welcome. Welcome to this new AFRALO-AfriCANN meeting in our ICANN58 meeting. Our theme will be – this is the 17th AFRALO-AfriCANN meeting. It's a very, very particular topic. This is the At-Large review and this is not only about Africa, but this is also for all regions since ALAC is all over the world. That is why we have, with us, some Presidents of other regions, Satish and Humberto.

ITEMS which is international practice of consultants was hired by ICANN to review At-Large – yes, very well. So what I was saying is that ITEMS is an international consultancy practice that did review At-Large. And we have a report that was published and is available on the website. For all RALOs, Regional At-Large, all those RALOs are going to be able to comment. We wanted to have a meeting about it and we want to take into account the African community, the entire African community.

So Tijani and Seun did comment work on that draft, this draft statement. There's going to be a presentation that's going to sum up this report. And we're going to be able to talk about the impact on the At-Large Community. Sarah is going to read our

statement to be submitted. We're going to be able to have questions and talk about this issue and possibly add to our statement after the different interventions and after our dialogue.

We have to look at the potential that we do have to work together on it. So without further ado, I'm going to give the floor to our guests. We have the ALAC Chair, Mr. Alan Greenberg who was with us with a few opening words.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you very much. I am as usual honored to be here. I'm especially honored that I'm giving the floor before our CEO, which there's probably a message there. I'm not sure it's a good one or a bad one, but I'm pleased to be here. I'm delighted again that the group is getting together and will be issuing a statement which will be a value to our entire community. I'm not sure if I should say I'm delighted or unhappy that AFRALO is still the only RALO that does this regularly. I'm of course delighted that AFRALO is sort of might wish it should be done on a regular basis in other groups. But please don't stop just so you can be equal to them.

I think it's been about nine months since I've been in Africa and I'm getting withdrawal pains, so I'm glad to be here. And I'm delighted that we'll be in Africa in just a few months from now,

so have a good meeting. I'm afraid I have to run out because the North American region is meeting in parallel with this. So I'm going to have to run out and be a good citizen of that group. But have a good meeting and thank you for inviting me again.

SILVIA VIVANCO:

Thank you very much, Alan. I'll give the floor to Goran Marby, ICANN CEO. Thank you for your presence. Thank you for your support. I give you the floor, sir.

GORAN MARBY:

Thank you very much. And of course, Alan is before me, you lead and I follow. Isn't that the way we do things? Honest speech but I'm actually going to divert from that, if I may, and become a little bit more personal.

In my opening speech that I gave, I talked about the IDNs. And so I would like to share a little bit of my thinking about that and that is that, as I said we have 7 point something billion years around the world. And I think they have been the easy ones. We sort of have to figure out a way what's the next billions going to come from. Because I took this job because I happened to think that the Internet is very important. ICANN is not the center of the Internet but we are very important in that concept.

When I was in Nairobi, we started talking about something that made me [pause] a couple of times. And I have no scientific way of describing this. What seems to be happening is that when a country or members of the country starts to have Internet access. It's often the elite inside the cities who got a lot of money, who gets the first access. What happens then is that they often go outside the country for traffic. They use Facebook and YouTube. There's nothing wrong with that. And then it's kind of stops for a while. One of the reasons is of course not everybody can access it and there's no access points. In Africa, we see that many more people coming online through mobile. Not fixed, and that's very natural.

But I think people are smart. There have been studies about how people see the uses of Internet. In very developed countries where they have it for a long time, the Internet becomes like electricity. You're always on. If I look at my own kids or maybe even myself, when I'm disconnected, that becomes – I really feel really bad. But for new people who started using Internet, it seems like they go on for a purpose and then they go off again. They use that as a utility.

One of the learnings I got from going down to Nairobi was that, what is then people looking for? And that is local things, access to municipality, governments, schools, banks, news. And it seems like we sort of that's where it all starts. It has to be local

content for creating that demand for access for Internet. That means that the next billions years that will come, we'll have greater demand for something that I don't yet understand.

I want to make sure and I have spoken to Tarek about this as well, because we sometimes use words where we come and help you. We exactly talked about that after Nairobi then probably we call that "competence building." And I said to Tarek that maybe we should call it information sharing instead.

TAREK KAMEL: Knowledge sharing.

GORAN MARBY: Knowledge sharing, yes. Because I think that I need to be better to get my own team to understand the needs of the users that are not there yet. Because at one point in time, when they come online, if they're really going to start using Internet and creating this, we have to already little bit more understand of their needs. That is a new perspective that we're going to reach people that doesn't automatically use the same language has the same culture bearings, have different keyboards, using other search engines or doing things very, very differently, and ultimately using it for other purposes.

So I'm very happy to be here. I'm very supportive of this but not only because I think you have support, because you are building your own African Internet the way you want it. I'm here to help and serve together with my team. But really to understand how we can be better of what we're doing because a lot of that knowledge, how it's going to be resides with you. This is what I've learned of the two days in Africa one, what's going to happen when I'm going to stay there for two weeks.

But a lot of thoughts come out of those sessions also for us. The words we're using, the difference between different parts of the world. And one other things that we're working on now internally which we will engage more and more view is that to some people disbelief, we are not an American company that sells new [gLTDs]. We are actually providing a service to the world. And we don't have to have a black box of everything that we do that we go around the world.

We use a word for it. We call it "demand-driven engagement." And demand-driven means that we try to put the resources – and now I have to say everybody has limited resources – and try to be better understanding the needs, in different parts of the world, where Africa is one of them. Three years since we did this corporation, we learned a lot but I think that I need to be better – and Tarek and I are talking about it together with [Sally], together with David – how we can do more focus with that.

So what I'm really saying is that I feel humble in this, that I actually understand how much I have to learn to be able to be the next generation Internet users what they need. With that, I open up for any questions. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you very much. When we look at the stats, that's absolutely true. We have a very strong growth in Africa and in the Middle East and some parts of Asia. Thank you.

Do we have any questions for Mr. Marby?

GORAN MARBY: Are you all sleeping after my speech? You're not allowed to. What do you think about the things that we're doing right now to support this? Is this working?

MARY: Can I? Okay. Thank you, President and we're happy that you are attending in person. And that you have taken our much requested or much desire to see ICANN in Africa grew, not only grew that, we'll also grow in our business area. One aspect of the African region that is very low is the business. So outreach to business community of the African region would help our people know that this business apart from the policy, the processes and

the rest of this, they can make money from Internet and from domain name business.

You'll notice that our region also is government dominated. So bringing our government understand what ICANN is doing, the composition between us and our government, between ICANN and government is very, very important, very, very key for us in the region. And also to be able to reach out to get people to know the business in domain name business is also very, very key to us.

So we agree and we are happy that you've started the process and we say thank you to you. Thank you to Tarek and his team. And we are looking forward to going beyond just the GAC side or GAC community to go to our business community. So we're also talking with ccNSO, ccNSO can also come. Also mentor our ccTLDs down there, some don't even have their names delegated. So some have the ccTLD run outside Africa, so want to bring back that home. So we'd also want to see commitments from ICANN in that respect, so that we can reach out to them.

The truth is that we didn't start from private sector, we've started from government. So we are moving from government to private sector. So that's one of the things you should remember about the regions. Pulling resources to that side would actually help us. Thank you. I hope I'm speaking the mind of others.

GORAN MARBY: Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. Thank you very much. Thank you to the President and thank you Mary for the comment. Yeah, the [inaudible] I bring is demand of the end-users, so I will also speak in the side of the end users. I really like to not what – hold on and I hope that’s the right pronunciation. So in terms of the approach to how we refer to level of support, what is it going to be? How do we help you or how do we support you? And I like that. You’ve seen it has both for sharing information together.

We are supporting us for us also to support you, help ICANN in achieving a global goal. So I think I really appreciate that and I like to bring your attention to the fact that our followers will be submitting the statement especially in regards to the review. I’m sure you won’t be here when we start discussing this, but I’m sure you’ll get a copy. We like you to look at the statement in that particular regard. Because we believe that AFRALO has gone far and that we should not bringing something that’s going to affect all the efforts that has been putting in so far in the region. Thank you.

GORAN MARBY: Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Tijani, you have the floor and then Wafa.

I'd like to remind you that we have an agenda. We don't have much time, so we have time for debate on the statement. So please two or three questions and then we go back to our next item in our agenda. [Etienne], Wafa and [Rita].

[ETIENNE TSHISHIMBI]: Thank you. I wanted to speak about the support that ICANN could give us. I'd like to see the importance given to the culture of multi-linguism. It's very important for us that you stress this culture.

GORAN MARBY: I think I've mentioned in one of the calls yesterday to add full support for new language costs approximately \$700,000 per year per language. We estimated a new budget where I recommend anyone to come in and give proposals for additional tasks for us to do. The community especially with the Empowered Community has a large – lot of things to say in the budget process. Being the President and COO, I also have to point out of course that if you put something in, something else has to go

out. Because the only thing that is fixed there is the amount of money we have.

But without that more static answer, these discussions coming up a couple of times that's why we endowed internally and asked how many languages do we speak within the ICANN over the session. I think we turned out with 54 languages. Apparently, only three people speak Swedish and those of course something we have to address. But at least it shows that the commitment we have to diversity and variety that we have been able to attract people with [inaudible] speaks 54 languages. And I wonder how many organizations ever that had so many different language skills.

But there is a finer point to that one and without commitment, without saying anything, there has come up discussions that we can – instead of doing the full blast, [another thing] there's smaller things we can do to be able to be on the regular basis to do translations will be [different] for us. But I'm also, as a person, I don't want to do anything that is one off for show. And therefore, that's something we have to think about deliberately so when we start something we can continue and support.

So there is no disagreement on the importance. There is money factor to it but I also think we have to develop our strategy

overall about it. And of course, I'm looking for support for Swedish-English which is my perfect language. Thank you.

WAFZA ZAAFOURI:

Yes. Thank you, Mr. Goran, for your presentation. I will be brief. To come back to your question about what ICANN is doing. I think the initiative of the GAC, the event in Nairobi was a very good initiative. Because I think we have to make engagement with the governments in Africa because the sector, the communication sector, if government lead in Africa and when you engage the government better result we will have. We have the African study, African DNS study these days. I hope that we will have after the results an action plan.

This action plan is not only a duty of ICANN. We have to engage the registries and the other organization like FTLD because also it's their duty. ICANN can't really do only an action plan. I want to see an action plan after the study. I hope to see an action plan.

GORAN MARBY:

Thank you. I'm very thankful, Wafa, for coming here. I won't disturb you anymore then. As I said, I got excited coming here and wanted to talk to you. It becomes so boring if I only get speeches. So with that, I will leave it over to you so you can

continue your important job instead. Thank you very much for having me.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much. And we want to tell you that our next meeting will be in Africa, so we are preparing a lot of activities as AFRALO and with the African Strategy chaired by Pierre, who is doing a very good work. So we are asking for some support for the activities we are going to organize in Africa as every time we'll work in Africa. Thank you.

We are going to follow up – I'm going to give the floor to Tarek Kamel who I want to thank for being here. He's a Senior Advisor to the President and Senior Vice President Government. He's going to speak about what we are doing in the ALAC reviews. Tarek, you have the floor.

TAREK KAMEL:

Thank you very much, Aziz, for inviting me and I'm always delighted to participate to many friends around the table that we have been working together for a long time. And many new faces as well that I'm encouraged that we see each meeting. It's always providing us positive energy.

I think together with my colleagues, Pierre Danjineau and who is our Vice President for Engagement in Africa as you know and his

team Yaovi and Bob and from my team Anne-Rachel, our Vice President, as well as Baher who's helping us in North Africa in our engagement, and with all of you, we have come a long way.

So I see that the African Strategy has been the first regional strategy that has been paving the way for other regional strategies to evolve. And now we have an update and we look forward to the regional plan. I see also the first GAC workshop that has been done in for capacity building for law enforcement happened in Africa. And we see also that Africa has been witnessing a lot of important event like our meeting back in Marrakech and our plans to have further engagements in Africa was the DNS entrepreneurship center in Cairo. The event recently that is planned – the workshop that is planned very soon in May as far as I understand from [Baher] and Cairo issue.

The question then becomes what's next? What can we do really together in order to ensure that our journey continues to be successful? We take an opportunity of the AFRALO meeting at each ICANN meeting in order to reaffirm the message, continue the dialogue and look forward what we are doing together. On the government side, it is very clearly from the meeting this morning between the GAC and the Board, but as well from other meetings that there is further investment of engagement that is needed in Africa.

We have been successful to bring many African governments to the table and they attend. But we have the duty together to ensure that their attendance and participation is effective and meaningful and that we are addressing their concerns and hearing their concerns and echoing their concerns. And here we need to invest more effort and to do a better job.

The first step has been going positively was the workshop, was bringing the law enforcement agencies. I was very happy to see a general from the police of South Africa attending this meeting for the first time. We had an excellent dialogue and she is promising also to widen the government participation at ICANN from the Southern African countries in Johannesburg by inviting at least 10 African countries and governments specifically from the law enforcement agencies to participate in the Johannesburg meeting.

Why? Because simply the technical agencies and technical ministries, with all due respect, cannot do the job anymore alone that is related to ICANN missions even directly. We have challenges, it was that the DNS [appeals] that we have heard this morning. And therefore, we need broader spectrum from governments to be coming and working with us.

The same message goes when we talk about improvement of Internet governance in Africa. As such, we have been working

very closely with Anne-Rachel and Veni in our outreach. It was the missions in New York and Geneva in order to make sure that specifically the African missions are well-informed about what is happening at ICANN. When they go to international fora at the ITU or at other organizations or the UNCTAD or UNESCO or whatever, they are well-informed.

So that's another avenue of governments where we are focusing our activities and our work, and again outside the technical ministries. We asked them to coordinate back with the capitals and it's happening in several occasions but definitely we need more effort as Mary has indicated.

I'm also happy to see very specifically this time from Nigeria and Cameroon and other countries coming was wide delegations as such. Government is there, senior government officials, but also private sector and technical community. And I just had a meeting with this group from Nigeria, 18 people that had to squeeze unfortunately in my small room upstairs to be sitting together and talking about the way [inaudible].

All these are new indications and interest from the community that are coming to ICANN meetings in a multistakeholder forum that did not exist before as such. So I encourage the AFRALO team to continue its engagement because you are representing the end users as such as we say. The real grassroots community

in Africa, this complements our effort that we do as government as well as business and other players. Please let us know and guide us in our common journey while we go forward with what is needed and we'll try as much as we can, as Goran has mentioned within the existing resources to work was the regional engagement team to fulfill your expectation together as Goran. And Seun has said, it's a two-way communication. It's a two-way learning process. It's not one-way communication and therefore, our colleagues always saying it's a demand-driven engagement, not an engagement that is proposed from our side.

With that, I would like to thank my dear friend, Aziz Hilali and Tijani for inviting me. If there are any comments, please let us know. I look forward to working with you very closely. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

I will have to reduce the time I will give to each speaker because we are little late, so we are going to put the timer in. So now I'm going to give the floor to Baher Esmat, Vice President of Stakeholder Engagement Middle East. And I will ask him to be brief please.

BAHER ESMAT:

Good afternoon, everyone. I'll be very brief. I'm Baher Esmat. I'm with the Global Stakeholder Engagement Team of ICANN responsible for Middle East and North Africa. Just a quick couple of points to highlight. In the recent Regional Engagement Strategy that we worked for what we called the Middle East and Adjoining Countries Region that includes North Africa, several members of the At-Large community as well as ALSes highlighted the importance of doing more engagement and engaging more actively with the At-Large community in the region.

One initiative that we embarked on six, seven months ago was in Tunisia in cooperation with the academic research and academic network in Tunisia, and with also help and support from a member of the ALAC. The initiative basically aims at engaging with the academic community, students, faculty members and the ideas that we work closely with the experts in Tunisia and help them with materials with information in order for them to be able to reach out to different universities across the country providing information about ICANN and ICANN-related topics, technical topics, DNS, DNS Security, IPv6, as well as policy, and other related topics as well.

So this is just an example of how we could work closely with local communities count on their expertise to run activities. ICANN is there to help with information and materials and can

also participate remotely if required. So far in Tunisia we've run three different activities in three different universities and the plan is to have one activity every six weeks or couple of months.

I just wanted to highlight this example as it also involves the – be in participation and support of [Wafa] and we're happy, of course, to see this initiative also takes place elsewhere. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much. Now, we are going to give the floor to Pierre Danjineau, Vice President of the African Region. And he works with the Stakeholders.

PIERRE DANJINEAU:

Thank you, Tijani. Thank you, Aziz. I think we don't have much time, so I don't have much to add to what has been said and what he heard. We have heard Goran direct, so I just need to thank At-Large for the work you are making and for your help. The assistance you give us, it's very important for our engagement in Africa. You are everywhere. It's very interesting. I think that we would like to go on working like that with you.

I think we don't have much time and I know you are interested by the At-Large review. So don't wait for me to comment on that. As staff, I can't do it, but I think it's very interesting to see this

kind of review. We will see how things are going to [evolute]. I've been working in At-Large and I think it's very good to see what you have done during all those years. And now you have to look toward the future and I think these recommendations are here for that. I think it's very important.

Now, I will meet you in Nairobi in our African meetings. In Tanzania, we will have the DNS forum that will be very important, a very important meeting and you are all welcome there. So thank you for inviting me.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Pierre. Now, I'm going to give the floor to our friend and young member of ICANN Board. We are very proud of him and proud of the fact that he is here. He is from Africa, so you have the floor, [Khaled].

[KHALED KOUBAA]:

Well, I have taken some notes in English but as we don't have much time, I'm going to speak in French. And remind you some basic notions on the importance of common responsibility we all have. We need to share the work to keep stability and security. And growth of the domain name system. It's very important to recall that and as a member of the Board – Goran

said it – we need to facilitate that. It's very important element. We need to remind that.

I encourage you to come and see me. I'm available for you and especially for the African community, you can contact me or any Board members if you have comments, questions, we are welcoming you. And we are encouraging you work in all ICANN areas, in all constituencies and working groups, so please don't hesitate to work more and participate more.

The second part of my presentation as Vice Chair of [AEC]. It is a committee in charge of the reviews that are taking place today in ICANN, the review of At-Large, the At-Large review is among the most important today for us. I have read your statement, it's all the opinions we have received in the past from other people from the At-Large community or so.

So, you have the attention of our committee. We are conscious of this statement, of the content of this statement. We have discussed in our committee about the way to solve the process for the reviews to improve better the work and not to be an obstacle, not to be a hurdle that will give more work, more weight of work and that will grow processes that they are working well.

So, you have all our attention and all the Board attention, the committee attention too, and you will certainly be informed

about the decision that our committee is going to take about that.

Good work. Thank you very much for the work you make. It's very important for us and as Pierre said, we will see you soon. We will meet in the Africa Internet Summit. And, there will be the Johannesburg meeting that will be a very important meeting, a very familiar meeting. We have a lot of activity for the African Community, so we will meet there.

AIZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, [Khaled].

Now, we are going to speak about the key subject for us and we are going to give the floor to Tijani, who is going to show you the potential or the importance of the changing, and he will speak about the structures of our community, he will speak about the At-Large Structure statute.

So, Tijani, you have the floor. You have three minutes.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Aziz, for giving me the floor. First, I want to receive among us our new member, León Sanchez, who was selected by At-Large as the new Board member. And about our statement, as Aziz said, we have a review of our community taking place now in the group. In charge of this review, the external group ITEMS, has presented his report to public

comment and I urge you to contribute and make comment on this report. It's very, very important. Each comment will help us to have the best solution for this review and its results.

So, what is there in this report? What do we have in this report? First, there is a changing in the general structure of At-Large. The current structure is based on ALS, RALO, and ALAC, and it will become members RALO, ALAC. First change, very important. And this model includes other things very important also WHOIS members, who are these members, the person who will participate into an ICANN Working Group will become a member automatically and you will have voting vote, voting right if he's active in this working group, in this working group.

And now, the important change, before we had liaison with other constituencies of ICANN who were elected or chosen because of the tasks in collaboration with the part in which they were going to represent us, according to this report, this liaison will be ALAC member chosen by NomCom. So, if NomCom chooses people who has no idea of what the government is or what the gTLD is, we will have to work with them as At-Large liaison into the GAC or in the GNSO.

And, there are other problems. They want also to eliminate all the working group of At-Large. According to them, they don't work and they want us to change the way to elect our Board

member in the future. According to them, they all will be chosen in that way. Everybody can be self-nominated and then we will take the list of the people self-nominated, and the NomCom will make a selection and will give us a vote for the competent candidates and then we will have an automatic system to find the best Board member. But how can we do that?

They also want to stop organizing the At-Large Summit, which are the only opportunity for the At-Large community to meet. Personally, they want to replace that with regional meeting, so the At-Large member will meet only in their region. We, as African, we will meet only the African community, so we will increase the silo problem and there are other recommendations of this kind.

There are some recommendation that we agree with. For example, they are asking to limit the mandate of the ALAC responsibilities. I agree with that. You see that we need to limit the mandate. I agree with that. These are logical recommendations. We approve them. But there are some recommendations that are recommending us to do things that we are already doing, that we have already done. So, all this recommendation we have accepted them but the structure of our community is key and the changes they want to do in the structures are very important for us.

So, we drafted this statement to answer to this report. We are not the only one. All the community has worked to give an answer to this report. ALAC has an answer, the RALOs also drafted an answer and if you want also to answer, you can do it. It's a big support for us. Give us your opinion. It's good for us, so we will have the best At-Large possible in the future.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah. So, [inaudible] in relation to what Tijani said.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Yeah. Thank you. This is Seun for the record. I think Tijani have said largely everything, so in order to not to waste the time because we already lost most of the time, I will just say and encourage all the RALOs, ALSes within the RALO who are probably online right now to also consider writing in something independently. It's not just what AFRALO is going to solve it.

Anybody can also write something even if you are not an ALS member but it would be fair that you'd be an ALS member. You are welcome to contribute to that public comment and please make your voice heard. It is important that we share our opinions in this particular process for the future of AFRALO and At-Large as a whole. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you, Seun. Sarah, you have the floor and we're going to ask her to read the statement, so that we can talk about it later.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Read very fast because we're translating into Arabic. They do have the French and English but we do need to translate into Arabic. Thank you. Reasonable speed.

SARAH KIDEN: Good afternoon, everyone. I'm going to read the statement in English.

We, African ICANN Community members, participating in the ICANN 58th International Public meeting in Copenhagen and attending the joint AFRALO/AfrICANN meeting on Wednesday 15th March 2017, discussed the At-Large review report issued by the external reviewer ITEMS for public comment.

While we support some recommendations in the report, such as the limitation of the number of terms of the At-Large Advisory Committee members, the definition of metrics of participation, the improvement of outreach efforts, and so on, we have a major concern with other recommendations.

In the report, reviewers talk about reforming At-Large rather than reviewing it, which is largely reflected in the various recommendations.

The report proposes a significant change in the structure of At-Large, suggesting the replacement of the current At-Large Structures, Regional At-Large Organization, At-Large Advisory Committee structure by a new one called the Empowered Membership Model and based mainly on individual members, RALOs, and ALAC populated by the RALO leaders.

Any individual from any region becomes an At-Large Member as soon as he or she signs up to an ICANN Working Group.

Voting rights are given to ALMs after several months of active working group participation.

The five ALAC members appointed by NomCom will be the liaisons of ALAC to other ICANN constituencies.

The removal of all At-Large Working Groups.

The modification of the Board member seat number five selection process in the following way: candidates to self-nominate, Nominating Committee vets nominees to produce a slate of qualified candidates, random selection from the slate produced by the NomCom.

And, the replacement of the five-year global ATLAS meetings with an alternative model of annual regional At-Large Meetings and so on.

We believe that the proposed reform will cause a serious damage to the At-Large concept that was introduced in ICANN to balance the political and commercial interests by a community that defends public interest only.

At-Large is supposed to express the interests of end users as per the ICANN Bylaws, and was designed so that ICANN has a presence on the ground in each country of the world representing the interests of end users there. The At-Large Structures ensure such presence.

While we fully agree that individual members should be encouraged together with At-Large structures, we think that well established At-Large structures with legal status in their country, I guarantee that At-Large reflects the interests of end users.

Turning At-Large into an individual member only organization may convert it into an organization whose members use the At-Large to campaign for anti-user issues instead of supporting end users within the principles of At-Large.

We could not understand the rationale behind removing At-Large Working Groups. Working groups constitute the base

forum for end-users to voice their thoughts, discuss their concerns in relation to any given policy being discussed at ICANN, and frame agreements and strategies on how to positively impact the policy development process to benefit Internet end users.

We strongly disagree with the recommendation to make the NomCom involved in the selection of the Board member selected by At-Large that's seat number 15. The NomCom already appoints two out of three ICANN Board voting members, which is half of the total number of directors, and should not be given any role in the seat 15 selection process.

Moreover, we cannot accept that a Board member be selected systematically by a random draw. For the record, other Supporting Organizations and Advisory Committees appoint their board members as per their process. At-large should not be any different.

The recommendation of replacing the ATLAS summits by regional meetings is not logical since it will prevent the At-Large community from meeting face to face. Only members of the same region can meet face to face in the so-called Empowered Membership Model. We prefer the status quo that allows periodic regional meetings and ATLAS global summits.

Finally, we would like to express our deep concern about the future of At-Large community if this report is accepted and implemented. At-Large should remain the home of real and verifiable end users defending no other interest than the public interest.

We regret that the At-Large community is now pushed to spend their volunteer time and energy in defending their existence rather than accomplishing their mission as stipulated by the ICANN Bylaws.

Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Sarah. We're going to now open our list for interventions. We have 15 minutes for doing so. And then, we can have a five extra minutes if needed. So, I noted some names [inaudible], Satish, [Ada]. Ada has the floor. Only two minutes.

[ADA]:

Thank you. I was look enough to read the report quickly. But if that the reserves of the community are well understood and clearly established in that statement, and Tijani was very clear about it but I would like to say that I'm not totally satisfied about the statement. The issue is that we don't have analysis of the situation. Why do you want to change? Tell us why.

What we will change will be just like it was said by the Board member, it will be to improve, not just for the pressure of changing things, so there's no justification. I wish we knew more about that when reading the statements. It's not a different point of view. The issue is that their proposals have nothing to do with what preoccupies us.

So, what I would like to say in our statement, we should have this idea, this request to rebuild the study, to redo the study on the basis of a good analysis so that we identify the weaknesses of ALAC.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

The analysis was done, the problem is that there's no relationship between the analysis and the remedy. They did identify problems and we agree with most of those problems. They did some interviews. We told them about those problems or the issues that we do have. The issue is that they give solutions that have nothing to do with the problems and the good remedies.

[Barrack], you have the floor.

[BARRACK OTIENO]:

Thank you. I'm going to speak in English. Four points that I want to raise. First, I disagree largely with the majority of the

recommendations. I think I've followed the process from the beginning and I could see a disconnect between the reviewers and At-Large. Well, they seem to be opinionated in my opinion, which I didn't find to be a healthy approach to conducting a review process. Because in my opinion, they are supposed to do a holistic analysis of At-Large and then point out areas where At-Large is doing well and areas where At-Large is coming short, and not necessarily recommending radical changes on the institution.

The other point that I want to make is I'm a believer in the institutions and it is only through institutions that we will be able to sustain our outreach efforts especially speaking from an African perspective. Because when you say you are representing Internet users, the government will always ask you, "Who gave you the mandate?" So, if you're within an institutional framework, then it makes sense and then that supports the ALSes.

I think our At-Large Structures have been doing their best and doing quite some good work. I think there are a number of At-Large Structures across the African continent that I can see are getting stronger by that they're doing well and passing this message about ICANN and other initiatives to their communities.

So, I don't agree that we should do away with At-Large Structures because individuals are driven by motives. What if they wake up tomorrow and they see another source of money? We have no business with ICANN at all. So, I think we need to strengthen the At-Large Structures and support them and I don't agree with doing away with them and replacing them with the EMM.

So, that's what I will raise for now. Let me stop there. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, [Barrack]. Yes, what you said is the opinion not only AFRALO but all regions to agree. We talked about it yesterday. We see the other RALOs. Emmanuel has the floor.

EMMANUEL:

Thank you. Hello. I would like to speak more but I'm going to limit myself to those two minutes to say that this type of reform is going to make the situation worse. We made up a few issues but we're going to make it worse. We should say that in our statement to say that today, the problem that we do have at ICANN is legitimacy. We had reform about accountability and so on. ICANN must be strongly legitimated and be represented, and it's going to be less represented and representative if we have those reform.

What it legitimate? The members are going to be persons. What's going to be the result of that? People that are more active than others are going to capture and take hostage ALAC and RALOs, and it's going to create an unbalance. It's going to make it worst and we have to say no to this type of reform, and NomCom cannot have this type of power. I have many issues with that.

I saw it when I was requested to sponsor some candidates and it was not a serious work that was done later on, no explanations were given and this was an arbitrary decisions done by the NomCom that's why we have to work more on diversity in ICANN and make sure that we have diversity in ICANN. If you want to have legitimacy and diversity, we need more of it, we need those representatives, we need those ALSes, we need to be balanced, we need to be a legitimate organization. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Thank you, Emmanuel. Yes, thank you, Emmanuel. What you said is extremely important and I would like to add to that that I'm going to ask everybody, just like Tijani said, not stop there. We have to intervene. We have websites. We have these reports on the websites. We did many comments, many public comments and we want people to comment. We cannot stay silent. If we stay silent, the situation can be very serious.

We were very surprised when we first learned about what was going on. We saw them yesterday and among those consultants, they said those points of views were coming from you. During those interviews, we were wondering who said that.

No, what you say is to invite people to contribute on the list because when you do not speak, when you do not intervene, you do not exist and the one who speaks the loudest does exist. In the public comment's platform, that's where you should write comment and intervene. I'm going to ask the staff to put it on the chat and I'm going to give the floor to Satish.

SATISH BABU:

Inviting me, Aziz and Tijani, for inviting me to this meeting. I think there's a lot of things to learn from each other between the RALOs. I will make just two quick points.

The first is that the current system as proposed equates one individual with one At-Large Structure in terms of voting. Now, this is a big problem because I know that AFRALO has a very large ALSes with 5,000, 6,000 people [inaudible]. And that it's their combined output is being equated by one person's vote.

So, this is a very, very serious issue that I think that the statement that reads very well actually – congratulations to the

people who prepared it, the suggestions for addition. That's my first point.

The second point is also relating to the At-Large Summit being discontinued. Now, the net effect of this combined meeting not being there is the loss of the At-Large identity. You have silos, silozation. We have fragmentation of At-Large and we have loss of diversity.

So this is the consequence of that particular thing. I will stop here. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you, Satish. I would like to say that Satish is the Chair of APRALO, Asia Pacific. Thank you for being here.

Two other Chairs wanted to come but they are very busy. [NARALO] is meeting as well and [NARALO] is aware of it, and we are going to put the statement in the documents we are preparing as ALAC and we're going to put it in the public comments as well.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Can you hear some statement from some colleague about the review? In fact, I don't think that we are searching for our legitimacy, the legitimacy of ICANN come from its capacity to

have you as community to agree on different policy and to develop these policies and implement it later on at different ways, technical ways, business ways. So the legitimacy exists already.

The reviews in fact are mandated by the Bylaws, the Bylaws that were created by the community. So, it's not about legitimacy. It's about we are implementing our Bylaws that was required by you, the community in general. There is already nine or eight running reviews now and next year, we will have almost 11 reviews. It's not our choice. It's not the Board's choice or the ICANN Org choice. It's the community who developed the new Bylaws, which allow us in fact to ensure that we are transparent, accountable to our community.

So, it's a good way. I hope that we will not see the output of any of the reviews as something that will endanger the positive side of reviewing to our self and be accountable to our community and our mission in fact. So, let's look at the review as a positive thing and discuss the output of this specific one, which is the At-Large one as a very specific one, and I support – I mean, the fact that everyone is giving his voice and make comment and make feedback, this is a good sign for us. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you. Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Nobody here is saying that the review is not good and we don't need the review. We know that it is mandated by the Bylaws and the review is something very good that we need, every constituency need to have the external review. The issue is that the recommendations, the finding of this review is perhaps damaging the community of At-Large. This is the question that was raised.

And, for your information, I would like to tell you that the Board told us and [inaudible]. I speak under the control of [Khaled], that in the future, the review will be split in two parts. The first part is evaluation and this is done by external reviewers. And the second part is recommendations and this is made by the community, which is very good I think.

So, I am happy that our review made things go forward and improve. This is very good if in the future, the reviewers will not make recommendation. They only enumerate the problems. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Yeah. Thank you, Tijani. In fact, that was proposed by the committee but it's still not yet confirmed at the Board level, so I

will be going to that proposal as a draft one and still not yet confirmed by the Board. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI:

Very well. Thank you. Before closing this meeting, I'm going to give the floor to the new, a youngest member of the Board, elected by ALAC, Mr. León Sanchez.

LEÓN SANCHEZ:

I'm going to speak in English. Well, for your support doing the electoral process, the support of the African region was key for me getting here. Unless I committed when I did my campaigning, I will remain a person close to the regions. I mean, all regions of course.

So, please feel free to reach out to me whenever you do have the needs or you want to express anything that you want to be heard at the Board level. We all come from the South. We all come from developing regions. I know what kind of challenges we face. So, I have common circumstances to you. So, I hereby assure my commitment to you to stay close and to remain open whenever you need to reach out for me.

So, [speaking in French]. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you very much, León. We cannot end this meeting without giving the floor to one of the pioneer of the Internet in Africa, the CEO Sunday. Yes, the Chairman of the Board of AfriNIC has the floor.

SUNDAY FOLAYAN: Tijani and Aziz, and everybody from Africa, it's a pleasure to be here with you this afternoon. It's also fun listening to how things are evolving. I felt very much like a fish out of water because I'm sure many of you would not know I was on the Interim ALAC between 1995 and '97 I believe. So, it's already 10 years and it's good to be back here. Sorry, did I say 19... 2005. Sorry, time passes when you are growing older.

I also recognize the fact that we need to push the African agenda strongly and AfriNIC is very committed as an institution to make sure – because you see, Africa will always arrive at the party list. The next one billion users of the Internet would definitely come from Africa. And if we do not position ourselves very well, we may not be able to serve the interests of our people. So these engagements are very, very good and we should continue in the spirit.

Let us always remember that we serve the interests of those who are born now and even those who are not yet born in Africa. So

congratulations on the good work you're all doing and it's a pleasure to be here with you this afternoon. Thank you.

AZIZ HILALI: Thank you. One minute, Seun, and then Mary, one minute only.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much. Thank you for all the comments so far. I just want to note that I think one of the things that is a review [inaudible] to do is to activate some of our ALSes to get them to jump off again. So, I think we should recognize that and I hope that we also use that opportunity to also continue engagement.

The issues are there, what we disagree, which is some of the recommendations. We need to go forward. We need to continue to see how we can walk together in finding solutions to the problems that have been identified, some of them which we actually know existed.

I want to also note that in other regions, this is the same feeling, so it's not just AFRALO. In other RALOs, they also are similar reports and similar response to the particular reports. So, I don't think this is just a region that is going against the reports. It is a global thing and I'm sure you will see some of the solution in the public comments. Thank you very much.

AZIZ HILALI:

Thank you very much, Seun. I have to close but before closing I would like to thank the staff for an excellent work, support work. Thank you so much. And, our interpreters, we had the French interpretation, no Spanish but we had Arabic. So, we do thank our interpreters for their work. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]