

---

COPENHAGEN - GAC Underserved Regions Working Group meeting (2)

Monday, March 13, 2017 – 11:00 to 12:00 CET

ICANN58 | Copenhagen, Denmark

PUA HUNTER:

Good morning, everyone. Welcome to the underserved regions session this morning. This is our second session following Saturday's one.

My name is Pua Hunter, co-chair for the Underserved Regions Working Group, and with me on my left is Alice Munyua, co-chair also for the Underserved Regions Working Group, and also our most valued GAC support staff, Julia Charvolen on my right.

Agenda for today is mainly on updates with our capacity-development initiatives, the draft survey, and the information pack for the ccTLD delegation, redelegation, and retirement. And finally, an update on our open session for this afternoon at 3:15 p.m.

In terms of the capacity development initiatives, you heard the updates provided by Alice on Saturday. We want to continue with this initiative in the other underserved regions.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

We have tentatively identified dates for these workshops. The first one is in the Pacific, specifically in Fiji. And the tentative dates are for the 28th and 29th of April, which is next month, so it's not far away. And the next one is planned for Peru in September. Dates are yet to come through. And then in Pakistan. Again, dates are yet to be determined.

So if you're interested to participate in these capacity-development initiative programs, feel free, talk to us, let us know.

And also it would be great to attract as many GAC and law enforcement agencies to participate in these workshops.

The other thing we're requesting is for volunteers from the working group, or from GAC, to assist us with our work. As you know, we have additional responsibilities, and there's only two active members, myself and Alice, with the support of Julia of course. And we would like some more volunteers from the working group to join us, please.

And also, we want assistance. We actually approach one of our working group members from Guyana, and he's gladly accepted to assist us with drafting of the text for the communique. Thank you very much.

---

For now, I want to hand over to Alice to talk about the draft survey and the meeting we had this morning.

Thank you.

ALICE MUNYUA:

Thank you very much, Pua, but before I go to discussing the Underserved Region Working Group survey, I think I'd like to open the floor for any questions you may have regarding the -- the plan for future capacity-development event. As mentioned by Pua, the next one is going to be in April in Fiji, and then for South America, most likely in Peru. And then for Middle East, it's most likely going to be in Pakistan, but with tentative dates being April for Fiji, September for Peru, and November for Pakistan. So we just wanted to hear from you what you think from that.

But before we -- I open the floor, I'd like to say one of the things we learned coming from the Nairobi meeting that I think was very important that we had omitted was to have first conducted a brief survey to just simply understand what the capacity-development session should focus on. So it was a good learning process, when we finally were conducting the evaluation of the workshop, to learn that that's what we should probably have done. And our colleague from Iran, during our first Underserved Regions Working Group, reminded us how important it was to

---

make sure we conduct capacity-development sessions that are needed or, you know, are required by -- by the region.

So during our discussion today, we've decided that one of the things we must do prior to any capacity-development event is to have a quick survey that asks those questions: What do we need -- what area do we need to focus on, and what will be the best approach with that.

But I think open the floor, Pua, so we get any questions or comments.

Pua, back to you.

PUA HUNTER: Nepal. Thank you.

NEPAL: Thank you for the information. I just have a query that how we select these venues for capacity-development program? This is a concern, because -- so the selection of venues for these programs.

And then I want to sow the interest to have that program in Nepal also.

So thank you.

---

ALICE MUNYUA: I'd like to respond to that. It's -- governments and countries just express interest, like you have. For the Africa region, the Kenyan government expressed interest in hosting, and that's why we ended up in Nairobi. And the next sessions for the Africa region are going to be in Nairobi again because we are collocating it to the Africa Internet Summit, and then the next one is going to be in Johannesburg.

So it's countries expressing interest to host these capacity-development sessions. So if Nepal is offering, I'll be pleased to organize one there with you.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Iran. Thank you.

IRAN: Thank you for -- Sorry. Good morning to all of you, those who I have not seen before.

I think most of the problems and difficulties of underserved countries are spread over various regions of the world. My question is that are you using the basis of those workshops, seminar which, for instance, has been held in Africa, for the

---

other parts of the underserved regions? Because some of the problems are similar, if are not identical. In order not to repeat or overlap or so on, perhaps you're using, one, the information that was provided, and, two, the feedback that you have received from that particular region in order to be used in other region.

And the second is that, that perhaps you have done, I don't know, do you have or did you make any feedback questionnaire asking the people not on the same day, because it is difficult with people rushing to go to the airport or pack, so on, so forth, to sometime reflect the views on the seminars. And perhaps that would lead you to select future subjects. Because somebody may say, "Yes, that was very good, but my problem is elsewhere." That may lead you to program more effectively for the next area or for the next seminar or workshop that you have.

So this sort of the interactive or feedback could help.

This is what we do in other governmental sector. For instance, in ITU, and so forth, so on. Perhaps that could be done.

While I have the floor, this workshop and seminar for underserved country is very, very important. And what I said in your working group, I repeat here. We should avoid to overload the workshop and the seminar by providing numerous number of documents and with tens of pages and variety of subject that

---

the participant could not digest that, and could be taking sort of the brainstorming rather than -- and directing to some area. So perhaps that should be avoided. Dedicated subject or particular subject of interest of that regions, while you maintain other subject for further work, but not (indiscernible).

One of the problem, if you want to mislead the people, provide them numerous document and numerous speakers, and do not allow them to have interactive. Just fed by speeches and so on, so forth, sometimes may not be digested by the people.

These were are just improvement. Please do not take it as any criticism. It is just suggestion for improvement.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you very much, Iran. We have taken on board your comments earlier, because we met on this and we looked at the reports or recommendations coming out of the African capacity-development program. And Alice would like to respond in detail to your comments.

Thank you very much.

---

ALICE MUNYUA: Thank you very much, Kavouss. Actually, that we -- we got that same very constructive criticism even -- and it's something that we learned from the Nairobi meeting, the overloading of not just documents and panelists but also of complex terms and complex, you know -- debating complex processes that happen at ICANN that are not understood. So simplifying that.

And that's a reason why we thought it might be useful to have a survey prior to doing any capacity-development session in any other region, just to understand what the region might require. So that then the capacity-development sessions are tailored specifically to, yeah, to that region while learning from the other regions as well.

Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Alice.

Pakistan.

PAKISTAN: Thank you very much. The capacity-building issue always we raised in all the ICANN GAC meetings, particularly in the Marrakech, in Hyderabad meeting with this, because the capacity-building program for the underserved is very



---

important. Without the knowledge, without the awareness about the ICANN GAC matters, the community and the offices who are responsible, like the ISPs, the Internet community, they did not give the -- add some input to the ICANN and the policy development process.

I think it is one of the key initiative, and no doubt it is the initial step. We take some country as an example and repeat the same process in other countries. And thank you very much for offering this capacity-building program in Pakistan. I will appreciate that and fully support this initiative.

Thank you very much.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Pakistan.

Palestine.

PALESTINE: Thank you. About the capacity-building workshop or session, what is the main topic or issue that will be covered in this workshop?

PUA HUNTER: Well, it will be based on the survey that we sent out, like Alice said. It will be tailored to what they want rather than something

---

coming from us. Like Kavouss said, let's not go there and talk, talk, talk. Let's hear first what they want and then we deliver based on their need.

Thank you.

Any other questions or comments before I hand over to Alice?

Okay. Thank you.

Alice.

ALICE MUNYUA:

Okay. I'm going to very briefly talk about one of the work plan activities for the underserved regions conducting the survey to understand the challenges and gaps -- the challenges faced by underserved region GAC members and possible ways of addressing them.

We met -- We've met with the government engagement team, the Government Stakeholder Engagement Team and the DPRP team that is responsible for research in ICANN.

If you recall, during the Hyderabad communique, the GAC did request for the availability of resources for the Underserved Regions Working Group to implement its work plan, and the availability of resources here means working with the already-

---

existing resources within the ICANN ecosystem or ICANN -- and with ICANN staff to help us.

So we met with GE, and that's how we came up with the dates and countries that have offered to host the next capacity-development sessions for the various regions until the end of the year.

We had a very successful meeting today with the DPRP to discuss our survey. And one of the issues that came up was to develop it in a way that takes into consideration that, first, this is a GAC survey, specifically tailored towards understanding the challenges faced by GAC members from underserved regions in participating effectively and meaningfully. And of course we're going to be identifying or defining what "meaningfully" means for us as the GAC and from underserved regions.

They're going to help us develop the survey in a way that asks the right questions, because we need to make sure that we're asking the right questions so that it can inform any other processes. Not just at the GAC level, but at -- you know, at a broader ICANN level. Because I think one of the biggest challenges is, you know, as -- as identified by several of us, is the lack of participation in -- of the GAC in some ICANN processes, especially PDPs and Cross-Community Working Groups. So the

---

survey is going to try to address that more broadly while at the same time being very specific to the GAC.

We're going to make sure that it takes off immediately, and we're going to start administering it before the next ICANN meeting in Johannesburg.

That's the survey on underserved regions.

Then we are going to develop a frequently asked question document in collaboration with IANA and the ccNSO and any other -- all the other stakeholders to respond to several questions that have already been asked by several governments regarding their ccTLDs. This responsibility or this task was allocated to the Underserved Regions Working Group by GAC leadership, and we accepted to take it on, but with the understanding that the GAC doesn't have the mandate to interfere or work with any national government with a ccTLD.

So essentially what the Underserved Regions Working Group is going to be doing is curating information that already exists out there and putting it together in a way that governments can -- are easily found and governments can make use of. And we are going to bring this up during our meeting with the ccNSO -- is it tomorrow? -- so that we have a way forward with them, there's agreement and there's no tension, and there's an agreement on how we take these forward.

---

So those are the two main areas of work. And we're also going to do -- develop our work plan further, and we'll be able to share that with you perhaps on Thursday and share that with the GAC as well.

Thank you.

Any other question? Any question? Iran, please. Kavouss.

IRAN:

Yes. Some of the issue could help or some of the matter could help these seminars is two things. First, kindly provide or collect description of those acronyms. Unfortunately, the culture of people -- in particular, ICANN -- is acronym on acronym, is read two-letter geographic name, so many things somebody came to me and said Mr. Arasteh, or Kavouss, you mentioned PDP. What does PDP stands for? Very basic question, so....

The first thing that when these acronyms appear, like we do in some other governmental sections, the first time it appears, you fully spell it out. However, if the document is ten page, it's difficult to go and find where it has been spelled out first. It could be better if we have some sort of glossary.

They are available, but the only thing need to be picked up, sorted out, those acronym base are necessary.

---

Second, Alice and distinguished lady, you may report that it is not interference to the national issue, but GAC could urge the GAC members when they go back to their country, socialize and publicize those issues which requires national attention.

Stakeholders, registries, registrars, IPCs and so on -- ISPs and so on and so forth.

Because, for instance, there is a question for the PDP policy development process for the new round of gTLD, 20 pages of -- no, 15 pages of questions.

And the first round would be soon made available for public comment.

So there is a need to encourage the people to read the relevant part of this question but not all. Because there are many questions.

And have some feedback. This is very important.

And, second -- I don't know whether you're doing or not. If you provide a long document on several pages, it might be good you have a page or so of executive summary.

A page or so of executive summary to provide some basic information to the readers.

---

Maybe you have done it before. I just wanted to say that that would be very helpful. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER: Thank you, Iran.

Any other comments from the floor? Any questions? Palestine.

PALESTINE: I'd like to stress on the subject that has to do with acronyms and abbreviations as Mr. Kavouss said.

Concerning these abbreviations, I think that some or most of us really suffer from this kind of acronyms that we are at a mess of it.

Most of the documents, as you say, internationally, some of these acronyms are internationally standardized ones.

But it has to do with a certain kind of mood upon interpreting these acronyms.

Actually, for the interpreters, I think there is a kind of data that has to do with the interpretation of all these acronyms. Thank you.

---

PUA HUNTER: We, too, are struggling with acronyms. Thank you very much. Thailand.

THAILAND: Thank you, Chair. Wanawit, for the record.

So I think reference to this keynote by the CEO of ICANN and follow-up from yesterday's UASG discussion, one of the key aspects, when you talk about capacity building, is how the Internet use in the local language. We experience -- I think the gentleman from Cambodia that also in the GAC, we also work together on how we work on language between Laos, Thai, and Cambodia. If I remember right, Africa is on the language only, still 50 something language. Language is a barrier how to use the Internet. We do see that the leading roles need to be -- government need to call upon every stakeholder.

So, if the capacity building will include this work that GNSO might have on the very technical aspects -- and UASG has the others. But I think the government has the role to create awareness in domestic from the stakeholder, especially some interest yesterday from the discussion with UASG coming on software development. What are the benefit to them and several aspects that we need to address. If the underserved region would include that work I do not know. We need to come up with best practice or how we deal with the local language



---

probably from the different experience that some of us might have and then share this.

I think, in that way, I could try to volunteer to work in that aspect because the other issues that might already address maybe you could find some other people that could volunteer. But, if you think that a local language issue would be one of the aspects that eliminates the outreach to the underserved region community. At least I would volunteer to help in that area. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Thailand. Yes, indeed, that's a really important subject to be put out to the community, to the countries at the GAC level, at the government level. Thank you very much. And thank you for volunteering should we proceed with that.

Any other comments? Questions? Indonesia.

INDONESIA:

Yes. Thank you, Pua. Two comments from me. One is in the opening ceremony this morning, what rather worries me is about the technological changes that is going to take place very soon. The CTO didn't give the time schedule, but I hope this -- if I'm not mistaken, today there will be -- what you call it -- an explanation and description about what the technical changes

---

in the DNSSEC in what -- I forget all his notes, you know, DNSSEC and whatever.

I think in this case, I hope that ICANN can facilitate socialization of these technological changes, bearing in mind that in many countries Internet technology is still new. And they need to get more information as soon as possible about all those technical changes. Root server and so on. (Indiscernible) ASCII and so on. That's number one.

I'm talking about not only underserved region but perhaps undertechnological region. Undertechnological region needs to get more technical information about that.

Secondly is about underserved regions, you see. At the moment, if we look what we mention about what we define as underserved regions, an area, perhaps, which is, from the Internet point of view is below average served.

But I recall, when I talked with you yesterday, you talked about Cook Island with 15,000 people or so with 15 islands, something like that. And you say that there is some sort of underserved regions. Indonesia has many islands which has inhabitants 15,000. They do not even have Internet. So your Cook Islands is much better than some of the Indonesian islands. I'm not talking about islands with 100 million people every island. But I'm talking about many thousand islands which has 15,000,

---

20,000, 30,000 people and they also have difficult connection for Internet and so on.

So in one way Indonesia can be called as a country which has good connection with Internet. We have our own satellites, several of them. But within those 13,000 island countries, you have many islands bigger than Cook Island which has no Internet connection, less developed than -- less developed from Internet but Cook Island and many other countries. It also can be considered, perhaps, underserved area of those particular countries. Thank you.

PUA HUNTER:

Thank you, Indonesia. You're right. We each have our own challenges when it comes to underserved regions. And you have your own challenges in your own country where areas are underserved. And you're right. In the Cook Islands, only 15 islands with 14,000 population. We are 100% covered, but the connection is not that great.

Thank you very much.

If there's no other questions, I'll hand over to Julia to update us with the next session that will take place this afternoon. Thank you, Julia.

---

JULIA CHARVOLEN:

Thank you, Pua. Hello, everyone.

I wanted to update you -- or not update you, but talk to you about this open session we're having at 3:15 today. And the title of the session is, "How to Better Engage." We spoke today with one person from the DPRD, which is development and public responsibility department at ICANN.

And we talked about the survey, and we came to a common understanding. And we have the same point of view on -- we know that everybody knows that there's an issue of engagement. And we want to know how we can resolve this. We've spoken to co-chairs of GNSO working groups. We've spoken to the subgroup on diversity as well. And we thought about this questionnaire that they've been creating and the survey that we would like to put in place. And, yet, we still thought that the best thing to do would be to ask questions of the community. Open questions. Very -- I don't want to say basic questions, but asking them what they need. If they need resources, what resources would they need? And how we could coordinate among the regions to try to better answer to those questions they may have.

So I'm asking you, as members of the working group and the community, if you think that specific questions could be asked during that session, that, if you wish to participate with us, that

---

would be very welcome. So I'm open to any suggestions for this session. Seeing none, it's all good.

PUA HUNTER: If there's no other comments or questions from the floor, even from us in the front -- anything? Guyana, thank you.

GUYANA: I'm not sure if this is necessary. But, just based on some of the input a few minutes ago, it might be useful to clarify clearly, there was underserved in terms of physical access; and then there's underserved in terms of ICANN's outreach. While I know that is clear, again, just based on what I'm hearing, it still might be useful to reiterate the fact that there are two separate discussions. One is not the responsibility of ICANN or others or there's a group. If there's a physical disconnect, it has to be addressed. We could encourage. But that has to be addressed separately from here. My understanding has always been this deals specifically with ICANN's outreach and the benefit to people in those areas. Thanks.

PUA HUNTER: Yes. Thank you, Guyana. Any other comments or questions?

---

The other thing I wanted to bring to the GAC members is we understand that a survey has been carried out for the African region, a DNS study.

And we are wanting to request for the same study through the GAC to be done for the other underserved regions like the Pacific and Latin America and the Caribbeans.

So that's something that we will be taking on board to put forth to ICANN.

I think we're finished. This session is finished. Thank you very much, everyone, for your questions and your participation. Thank you.

MARK CARVELL:

That allows me to announce we'll start the commonwealth session at 12:00. So you've got a bit of a break. The commonwealth session is an open one. So it's primarily for colleagues from the commonwealth member states, the 53 commonwealth member states to participate. But it's open. Anyone is actually invited to attend.

And also non-government stakeholders are invited to attend. We will discuss the year ahead for the GAC.

---

And the ICANN community because of the GAC's interaction with all the ICANN initiatives going on. We'll do a quick overview of that.

We'll also pick up on some of the issues you've been talking about in the underserved regions group about the capacity to participate in ICANN and GAC activities.

We'll also have a report on the regional capacity building workshop in Nairobi, which you've also been talking about. And the Commonwealth Telecommunications Organization will be talking about their cybersecurity forum in London on 22nd, 24th of March, so coming up very soon, and also the CTO's program of work on cyberspace issues.

So that's our agenda from 12:00 to 12:45 as a commonwealth session. I hope you'll be able to attend and contribute to our discussions there. Thank you.

Is there a question? Question? If anybody does have a question, happy to handle it. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**