

---

COPENHAGEN - Open Q&A with ICANN Organization Executive Team

Thursday, March 16, 2017 - 12:00 to 13:00 CET

ICANN58 | Copenhagen, Denmark

DUNCAN BURNS:

Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, we're going to get going on the session. I know we were kind of close to the previous session.

So welcome. This is the question-and-answer session with the ICANN organization executive team.

My name is Duncan Burns. I'm the head of communications for ICANN, and I'm going to be moderating this session but I'll also answer questions if any come my way.

Before we start, I'd just like to go over how we're going to run the session and the rules for the road.

Firstly, the expected standards of behavior. You all remember them all. Please have a look. Just bear those in mind as you ask questions and as we interact with each other, please.

This is going to be an entirely open question-and-answer session. We have two microphones at the front. We'll alternate. And each of the executives will answer any questions that come their way. Depending on the question, we may ask a subject matter expert from our team to answer, if it's particular

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

expertise. At the same time, there may be questions that we can't answer fully in this room, so we will follow up and post answers on the ICANN Web site on the President's Corner page as soon as feasible.

The other thing to bear in mind is that for privacy reasons, we may not be able to answer some questions. We'll try and answer them if we can, but as appropriate, and we'll follow up as appropriate as well.

This is a pilot session. This is the first time we've run this, so bear with us.

If you have feedback, please use the meeting app. There's a feedback form at each session, which hopefully you've been using all week, that you can use as well, or come and talk to us afterwards.

We're aiming to wrap up at 1:00 so that everyone can go have some lunch before the public forum starts at 1:45.

We're going to try and keep this session a little more informal. When you come to the mic, please bear in mind that for those who are participating remotely and for the interpreters, please speak slowly and clearly, give your name and who you're representing, if anyone.

---

We do have full remote participation so we may get some remote questions, and my colleague, James, here will read them out.

If you are remote, please send an email to [engagement@icann.org](mailto:engagement@icann.org), and we will put you in the queue.

So I may have to interrupt occasionally if there are questions from remote people.

So before we get started, I'd like to introduce -- the executive team, rather, to introduce themselves so you know who they all are. We forgot to do tent cards so you'll just have to memorize their faces and we'll have their names up on the screen.

Goran, would you like to start, please.

GORAN MARBY: I think that's excellent. Let's start by introducing my team, and I will ask Tarek to state your name and what you do.

TAREK KAMEL: Yeah. My name is Tarek Kamel. I'm the senior vice president for government and IGO engagement and I'm located in Geneva.

---

SALLY COSTERTON: My name is Sally Costerton. I'm the global head of stakeholder engagement and I'm based in the U.K.

ASHWIN RANGAN: My name is Ashwin Rangan. I'm located in Los Angeles. I head up engineering and serve as the CIO for ICANN.

DAVID CONRAD: I'm David Conrad, chief technology officer based in Los Angeles.

JAMIE HEDLUND: Jamie Hedlund, contractual compliance and consumer safeguards based in Washington.

JOHN JEFFREY: John Jeffrey, general counsel and secretary based in Los Angeles.

AKRAM ATALLAH: Akram Atallah I'm the president of the global domains division and I'm Goran's deputy, which he keeps reminding me if the bullet comes at him it shoots into me, so...

---

XAVIER CALVEZ: Xavier Calvez, CFO and based in Los Angeles.

SUSANNA BENNETT: Susanna Bennett, chief operating officer based in Los Angeles.

DIANE SCHROEDER: Diane Schroeder, HR, based in Los Angeles.

DAVID OLIVE: David Olive, head of the policy development support team and also head of the Istanbul office, I'm based in Istanbul, Turkey.

MARGIE MILAM: Margie Milam. I'm in the multistakeholder strategy and strategic initiatives department and I'm standing in for Theresa and I'm based in Carlsbad, California.

DUNCAN BURNS: Duncan Burns. I run -- SVP of communications and language services and U.S. government relations based in Washington, D.C.

Goran?

GORAN MARBY:

And I'm Goran Marby, based in L.A., born in Sweden.

I'm very pleased to have you all, and I'm amazed about the interest of this. This is not a high-interest session formally. I'm very grateful for the community and the SO/AC leaders and the others who actually made it possible to squeeze this in, with all the other sessions going around.

This started as an idea or a thought experiment, and because you've now read -- all read the CEO report that I sent to the board, when we did that the first time after Hyderabad, I started receiving questions.

So we talked about the format how to answer questions about the report and we came up -- and I just realized we never do these kind of sessions. And to be honest, this is the first time since I joined ICANN at any ICANN meeting to have sat down together with my whole executive team in front of you, because we are actually a team and we work together, so I thought this is a good idea.

What we're doing now is an experiment, and if you like it and if you think it's a good idea, we're going to do it at every ICANN meeting. They all look happy now. Because we're actually here for you.

---

As you've seen, we often -- we talk about transparency and accountability all the time. At least I do it in every second sentence. But what we've done really over the last couple of months is try just to what I call add steps, and the CEO report is one of them, this session is another one, Krista becoming the complaint officer is another one. We're going to continue to work and increase the narrative on how we do things.

With that, we are -- instead of me giving a long speech which you heard me say all the time all this week, I would like to open up the floor, if there's anyone who have any questions to my executive team. And I'm looking forward to someone running up to the --

Oh, Becky is coming up to the microphone.

[ Laughter ]

>> (Off microphone.)

DUNCAN BURNS: So please line up at the two microphones and we'll alternate turns.

Who wants to go first?

---

>> That was me.

DUNCAN BURNS: Who would like to go first?

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Okay. Thank you for the opportunity. I appreciate. This is my 51 meeting and the first time I'm seeing here with the CEO and the staff. I know everyone, but that is a very interesting opportunity for all members, especially for newcomers.

And my point goes to the newcomers. One -- I had the opportunity this time to join the -- this pilot onboard community program and I really appreciate that.

It's -- in my point of view, we need to look to the future from now on because we have spent all the time trying to organize how we're going to survive this after-IANA period, so now we need to look to the -- forward. And to do so, I need -- I believe that we need to focus on not only onboards but onboarding and retain, how we maintain the interest of the participants in ICANN. It's important to have new people refresh our minds. But we also need to keep them continually participating and sharing their capacity, their knowledge.



---

And so my point is, we need to focus more on these kind of things. And that's probably for Sally, a question, if this onboard community is also focused more on these -- on how to retain, how to guarantee people this environment is continually attracting to people to maintain their interest. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Sally, over to you.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, Vanda. Very, very important question. It's a very strategic question, and it goes to the heart of making sure that we are living up to our mission, which is partly to ensure that we have people at ICANN who not only represent a great -- a very diverse group but are really capable of engaging meaningfully in our policymaking process. From my point of view, from our point of view, we are spending increasing amounts of time in our engagements around both our onboarding programs, our training and development programs, which is important, such as the ICANN Academy, for example, and the recent leadership program that happened just before this meeting, and also increasing our time and effort on joining together some of these initiatives in our conversations with the community, to make

---

sure that we are seeing a journey, that we're supporting a journey, not just a series of events.

And the final point I would make is that our measurement tools are -- we are increasingly focusing on how we do exactly that. How do we capture and then measure participation, so that we can see where we may be losing people, and then really find out why that might be -- and share that data so that we can, as a community, make those things -- improve those things. So I hope that's helpful. So it's a very important issue for me and for us as an organization. Thank you for raising it.

VANDA SCARTEZINI: Thank you. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you. Next question.

ABDULAWAL HAOLADER: Thank you so much. I'm Abdulawal. I came from Bangladesh and I'm a fellow and I thank you, ICANN, for giving me the opportunity to be here.

I would like to say that youth are a considerably large number of users in the Internet. It's very difficult for youth to understand

---

and participate in ICANN meeting and IG discussions, but thanks to ICANN and ICANN APNIC have to take the initiative to organize Asia-Pacific Internet Governance Academy 2016 in Seoul, Korea, and I was one of the fellows there. That give me a great chance to get a comprehensive idea about IG and ICANN. Otherwise, it would be very difficult for me, somebody like me from -- coming from a country like Bangladesh where IG doesn't have much attention.

I request ICANN to consider organizing such type of outreach and capacity-building programs for youth so that the next generation of Internet users and policymakers can actively participate from now on.

Thank you so much.

[ Applause ]

DUNCAN BURNS: Sally, anything you'd want to say on that? You're the early leader in the --

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you. Excellent point. So glad you were able to participate in that event. And it was a very successful event and it's one of

---

the first times that we've started to implement this more joined-up approach, actually, that I just mentioned that Vanda raised.

In that case, there were -- there was a lot of participation from our ecosystem partners, the ISTARs. So ISOC and the regional RIR were very involved in planning the sessions and helping us to decide who to put through to the program, and also putting some pre-education, some learning materials, together about IG, Internet governance. A primer. In fact, we used the ISOC Internet governance training program for this event. So I feel -- thank you for raising it. My team -- not just my engagement team, but the whole teams, all the staff that take care of community-facing work at ICANN -- so Tarek on the content side of Internet governance, right through the learning teams, David's policy support team -- we are spending a lot of time thinking about how to expand this approach.

So it's a timely comment and we will take it into consideration and it's much appreciated. Thank you.

ABDULAWAL HAOLADER: Thank you.

---

DUNCAN BURNS: Okay. Mathieu, let's go to you and then we'll have one remote question.

MATHIEU WEILL: Thank you, Duncan, and thank you, Goran and the leadership team, for being here. I just want to start by congratulating you on setting up this session. It's a significant improvement because now ICANN has 400-something staff, and, I mean, the leadership team has a crucial role to play in achieving all the goals that ICANN are -- is facing, and the challenges, so it's really good that you are facing the community and exchanging with us in this dialogue.

So I hope this experiment will continue and that it helps the community understand the respective roles of the board, on the one side, the management, on the other side, and the community as well.

My intervention is actually a request. It's related to continuous improvement, and I noted in the excellent document on the operating plan and budget that the current status is labeled as, "ICANN has completed a total organization continuous improvement internal assessment based on the EFQM excellence model." And I commend you for that. I think it's a

---

great step. I'm confident it's going to provide a foundation for further improvements.

But I think our community would really be interested in knowing what you've learned through this internal assessment and what are the strengths of ICANN's organizations, what are the priority areas for improvement that you've identified.

And my request would be for you to publish a summary of this assessment as soon as practical and a statement about what your intended priorities and goals in that regard are for the upcoming months. And I hope you could at least agree to that commitment now. And I think that would be very helpful for everyone to understand the direction you as the management team are leading ICANN towards. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you, Mathieu.

Susanna.

SUSANNA BENNETT: Hi, Mathieu. Thank you very much for bringing up the focus.

Yes, we have started the organization-wide internal assessment for continuous improvement two years ago. And we started

---

small and gradually getting deeper and wider. And this year definitely we advanced to another level to focus very much on from a strategic point of view and to derive organization-wide improvement initiatives that will -- that align with the strategy and also optimize the utilization of our resources organization-wide cross-functionally.

And we are working on -- towards an assessment done by an external party and also really seeing information to the community when appropriate. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thanks, Susanna.

Just before we go to the next question, we are going to go to one remote question, if that's okay.

REMOTE INTERVENTION: This question comes from the Kiev remote hub. We would like to ask a question regarding future ways of formalizing relationships between post-IANA transition ICANN and countries on a multistakeholder basis.

DUNCAN BURNS: Who would like to take that one? Tarek.

TAREK KAMEL:

Thank you for this question. Indeed, we consider that we are now in a post-IANA transition phase and we are working very close with the GAC leadership and the GAC chair in order to make sure that we attract further membership in the GAC. We are now at 171 members at the GAC, which is definitely a number that we are very proud of. But we are also looking forward to increase the active participation from governments in ICANN processes and other GAC.

And very specifically for that, we have started together with the different departments, with the CTO office as well as with the global stakeholder engagement and the team of Theresa, a set of workshops for engagement with government and for capacity-building for GAC members as well as law enforcement agencies in different countries with the focus on the developing countries.

We did that last month -- or two months ago in Nairobi where Goran and the GAC chair has been with us, and we had very good feedback. And we are planning as reflected in today's GAC communique to go forward to repeat this in other regions, focus on capacity-building demand, driven engagement as we say in Asia-Pacific and in Latin America as well as in the Middle East and eastern Europe.



---

So we are shaping our new relations now with the government through the GAC membership as well as with a very focused plan on engagement with IGOs in the existing IG global ecosystem. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you, Tarek.

Please, next question.

ALAMIN HUSSEIN: Hello. I'm Alamin Hussein from Sudan, ICANN Fellow. I'm a newcomer.

My question is around the data. All the organizations around the world, they move to be a more data-driven organization. Till now there's no clear study or vision in ICANN to be a more data-driven organization, to use data to make more evidence-based policy and good organization development. And I would like to ask when we can see a data officer between you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Excellent. Goran, you are keen to answer that one.

---

GORAN MARBY: You will probably see that half of the executive team will want to answer this question. I'm the CEO, so I will start.

There is no disagreement that we are not very good when it comes to bringing more data out, and I agree. You deserve to have more data out. We have several problems. We are running 35 different websites. We have never built a documentation management system. We have no way of actually starting to dwell all that data. We don't have -- as a strategy, the way we do things is what we have, you should have because the information we have is something you can be able to use. But that's something we have to work on. And unfortunately we start, like, 18 years too late.

With that, I would like to lean over to David to talk about the Open Data Initiative.

DAVID CONRAD: Yes, thank you for the question. And thank you, Goran, for leading into it.

The Office of the CTO has initiated an Open Data Initiative pilot. It's scheduled to begin looking at the various data sources that we have internally, cataloging those data sources and providing that catalog to the community to help the community decide

---

the prioritization on those -- which data sources should be put into an open data framework first. We're also looking at platforms upon which we can build an Open Data Initiative and are looking to the community to help us prioritize based on the sort of cost-benefit analysis because we do have, as Goran mentioned, quite a bit of data sort of archived in various places on a number of websites. And we're looking to make that data available to the community in a more usable form and one that can help drive policy decisions.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thanks, David.

Jordan.

JORDAN CARTER: Thanks, Duncan. I've got two thanks, a question, and a suggestion. Jordan Carter from .NZ here. The thanks is, firstly, for this forum. As far as I'm aware, it is the first time the executive team has been doing this. And I think it's a great innovation because having a good, open dialogue between the community and the staff is an important part of making ICANN work better.

---

So the second thanks is with the publication of the chief executive report that you did with quite a lot of information about the various parts of the business. That was an interesting read. It leads to my question and suggestion.

The question is: What would you say are the top sort of two or three priorities for the organization in the next year or so? And why are they?

And then the suggestion is: It would be great if the next issue of that report, that CEO's report, had maybe a summary page on the front that just gave an update on what those priorities are.

GORAN MARBY:

Thank you. I can take the last one. It's actually my report to the board, which combines all of those reports. So -- and I know that the board is not -- it's not intentionally done for public consultation or anything. It's done for -- I just think it's proper and the board thought it was proper to share exactly the same information which I actually share with the board. So it's not a marketing material in that sense. As you know, we're not a business.

So what are the priorities? You can divide them into three different parts. And, first of all, there is a strategic plan which

---

the community has decided, and that is the overall thing we do because we are bound to follow that strategic plan. And as you know, we, for instance, follow up our quarterly stakeholder calls. We have different ways of benchmarking and telling what we do. So that is the -- that is the basis. We are driven by the strategy handed to us by the community.

So leave that aside for a second, I see three areas. And thank you for the question. The first of them, I would call financial planning. We have expanded the organization. The meetings are getting bigger. There are more people getting involved in it, and we do several things. I think that we have to start talking to each other about how are we going to see this going forward. We have to have discussion about how do we do prioritization, what is the most important thing for ICANN to do -- when I say "ICANN," I mean the ICANN community, the ICANN board, and the ICANN org.

So already now in Geneva we are starting engagement with the board how they are going to have that discussion and how are we going to do that together with the community because, ultimately, it's your decision. I also want to do some marketing here to say that we now published a version -- the first version of the budget to the vote for comments.

---

If you are interested in changing what we do, even if it feels tedious and boring to go in and look at the budget, you will find all the projects, everything we do there. And you are entitled to go in and say that you think this is right or wrong or add something. So any idea that will cost us money, you have to put in there because otherwise it won't happen because it's important for the community to have that oversight.

I can also add if you want to put in something, you have to take something out because there is a limited amount of money.

The second thing we are actually looking into a little bit is more of the structural things, the structure or the backbones of the multistakeholder model. And you are starting to see -- and I talked about it during this -- we talked about, for instance, the flowcharts that we're doing that we have shown in my room. And many of you have come up and seen them, just to get a little bit more input.

It is work in progress. But the intention of that is to make it more transparency, how the different processes work, and for you to discuss if there's any improvements that has to be made. So there are structural things in involvement of this model I think we need to discuss together. And we also found maybe there are things that you don't agree upon.

---

With that, one of the things that we talked about structurally as well is the -- what we refer to as the data management system, where we have to look into how to be able to increase transparency. Transparency is not only disclosure. You can find many minutes of discussions during the -- on our website. But where is the narrative?

And I think tentatively we spend a lot of extra time because we have to find information, we don't find information.

The third layer I think going forward actually happens to be technology. The next billion users will come from different places than we are today. They will be primarily mobile. They will not come up from the surroundings maybe we have where English is a language everybody understands. That's why we talk so much about IDNs. But it's also mentality.

Maybe we have to look into the technology part of that as well. I was so happy that the SSAC session that happened before here now so many people attended. And we have to -- during this meeting here, we kind of tried different things. We had sessions on other things. People have ideas about alternative systems. And I think we need to figure out a way together to have those discussions going forward.

---

So these are the three sort of main things that we are now looking into, together with organization effectiveness and everything we do. But that is kind of the themes we're looking into it.

And to summarize this, when I made my budget presentation to the board, I had -- the first slide was really this isn't the right time, not now. It's business as usual but planning for the future. Thank you.

JORDAN CARTER: Thanks.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thanks, Goran.  
Next question, please.

AMADEU ABRIL i ABRIL: Good morning. My name is Amadeu Abril from CORE. I'm first-time attender of ICANN58 in Copenhagen.

And I have two short organizational questions, one suggestion, and one request. Let's see if I have time for all of them.



---

The short organizational questions, first: This new complaints office headed by Krista Papac is a sort of second-level complaints management office for things that are handled by ombudsman, reconsideration, compliance, et cetera only, or has a direct competence of some kind of complaints that will go directly there? Sorry, I have not understood the press communique so I have to ask.

The second short organizational question -- this is for J.J., I guess -- is there anybody who owns the interpretation of the agreements here? That is, is ICANN legal, for instance, the one that can say was it the interpretation of the RAA or the Registry Agreement? Because sometimes we have as registries and our subsidiary registrars, discussions with compliance, with GDD, about what's this. And they say, Oh, our company is telling you that you should do this. But say, Well, we don't read contract in that way. Can we go to legal directly to ask for interpretation or only compliance, GDD, et cetera, can do this internal work?

Now, the suggestion. David Conrad and John Crain gathered very useful data about the behavior in certain TLDs. And you can read them. There are patterns of abuse in TLDs and registry operators.

---

Maguy Serad's compliance team has very good data about which registries have more compliance, even more compliance per domain names, and which one go more often to second and third parties. So the people that are creating more trouble, why don't we use the basic principle of environmental law that you pay as you pollute and remodel the registry fees, and perhaps the registrars, according to this very clear that we have. We have already that for the registrar forgiveness of the annual fee. That is something that was a problem 15 years ago with the domain name testing, or 12 years ago, but doesn't play much role today. We had some rules on that. So probably it would be an idea to think about that and to use that very good data that apparently remains in one team but doesn't escalate to anything that's useful.

And, finally, the request. Could you please tell your staff not to be so defensive? I had the impression since the last round of new TLDs that this has been the word of advice to new staff. First sentence say that you want to take a look. Second, never answer a question. Third, "Oh, please come to me after the meeting, we'll deal with that individually." This behavior creates more tension of the issues that we are discussing in many open and even closed sessions in the last years.

---

We like most of the staff we have here, but this concrete trend seems to be advice, a corporate policy. And I think that at least we all smell that. I think you should check whether this is the case and you should advise your staff to be more open, not in just saying they want to dialogue. But if you want to raise a question and I raise a question myself and I disclose my problem, well, I am allowing that discussion in public and it should be taken there. And they're always saying, "We'll see later, not here, too many people, this is dangerous, I don't want to provide answers." This seems to be a policy and a destroying one. Thanks.

DUNCAN BURNS: Great, thank you.

John? Goran, do you want to start?

Okay. John, do you want to start on the complaints --

JOHN JEFFREY: We're doing them in reverse order.

DUNCAN BURNS: Excellent.

GORAN MARBY: We're ICANN. We do everything in reverse order.

---

AKRAM ATALLAH: Thank you, Amadeu, for your questions. That was a loaded question.

The concern about staff being open, you're right, we do have -- try to protect certain names and applicants so we don't like to talk about a particular application or a particular registry or applicant because we want to protect that information. But in general, we are very open to talk in general issues. And if you watch me in the meetings, I'm very open and I'm very willing to discuss any of the concerns. And I hope that this sets an example.

But there is no policy for staff to avoid answering questions. It's just that sometimes it's -- the question is not -- the answer is not ready and it's important for staff to go back and get you the right answer instead of just, you know, making up -- making one up.

So -- but I agree with you, we should be -- we are very willing to discuss things, and we want to actually be very open during these discussions. Thank you.

GORAN MARBY: But you're pointing at something that is very important, that is the role of us. Our role is to facilitate the discussion within the community. And then the board directs us to do something.

---

And that is the way you want it, and I think that's fair. It can't be any other way.

But -- so we have this line in the sand, that I think we always have to kind of work with that, is that how well are we being supportive without taking sides. And I think together with the community, together right now, we are -- because we're putting -- there we're actually saying internally, it's so important, we are trialing those borders right now.

I want everybody -- we want to be able to support you without -- and making sure that we don't influence the discussion. I don't think we will ever come up with a straightforward answer how that's going to work. The only thing we can do is evolve together.

And I will ask J.J. to answer the most factual questions.

JOHN JEFFREY:

And I'll continue the going backwards part because I think it's a useful tie-in into your question about contract interpretation.

I think that your question of whether the legal team is available to answer questions on contract interpretation, absolutely. We do that on a regular basis. We do that in calls with the

---

community and in consultations on a regular basis almost at every meeting.

I think that there was a question when we had the question in Hyderabad one-on-one with me and community members about how to access that, and I think there's a number of different ways to access that. Primarily it's through the policy discussion or wherever it's coming in. If it's coming into compliance, coming into policy, or coming into a discussion, they typically will bring one of my team members in to help on the interpretation, if it's useful.

And often we're providing the advice that goes into those discussions from other staff members. But if you feel like there's something that's truly ambiguous on contract interpretation or other things, we're happy to engage on that.

And I want to go to the complaints officer then. And I would ask Krista to stand up who's sitting in the second row. This is our new complaints officer, and you should know who she is. The funny thing about saying that is Krista is a long-term community member in various roles, both inside and outside ICANN, so many of you know her already. But if you don't, come by and introduce yourself to her. She's not fully in the job yet as she's transitioning out of another team within ICANN. But she's

---

available to talk to you at any point, and I hope that you'll find her to be as productive inside as we already have in her other roles. We look forward to having her as the complaints officer because what Goran's vision of this role was is to be a conduit into the organization improving itself, an opportunity for you to bring complaints to the complaints officer that might not have another way for you to bring a complaint in. So very different, in a way, than the ombudsman, which is where you would bring a formal complaint under our accountability mechanism, and that would be -- as you all know, the ombudsman reports directly to the board, writes reports to the board, and submits recommendations to the board. The complaints officer is to bring those to this group, to bring them to Goran, to work with this team to help you improve ICANN organization in the best way possible.

DUNCAN BURNS:

Thank you, John. So I just want to let everyone know, we've had to cut the queue. We've got about 20 minutes left, but hopefully we can get through all your questions. So please, next question.

SHIVA UPADHYAY:

Okay. My name is Shiva Upadhyay, and I'm first-time ICANN fellow submitting my comments in my personal capacity. Last

day we met business constituency of GNSO during the fellowship session, and I mention that I really appreciate the business constituency provides 70% discounts in member -- of membership fee to the underserved regions and developing nations. But I think it is not enough. We need to give discounts on the new gTLD programming to the underserved/underdeveloped region. As the registry grows, ICANN -- it's my solution, like as registry grows, ICANN can collect the money back or recover from the registries in future. It would really help to young entrepreneurs from the developing and underdeveloped regions to join the domain name world. As we all -- all aware of the fact the new gTLD is in direct competition with the big registries, and it will also help keeping young entrepreneurs motivated. And I think ICANN can play a major role in this.

DUNCAN BURNS:

Thank you. Akram, would you like to answer that?

AKRAM ATALLAH:

Thank you. If I understood the question, it's more about memberships, and that's not part of ICANN. ICANN actually welcomes everybody without any fees. Our ICANN meetings are open. Regarding the fees of the registries and registrars, these



---

are contractual obligations that are between us and the registries and registrars and they are negotiated with them. So I don't believe that we can actually change these things.

SHIVA UPADHYAY: I'm asking about the new gTLD price.

AKRAM ATALLAH: New gTLD pricing.

SHIVA UPADHYAY: Yes, yes.

AKRAM ATALLAH: So this is the next -- your question is more about when we open up the application window again, what would be the price of the new gTLD. Thank you for clarifying.

We have not actually decided yet when the window is going to be open, how the window will be open, which means whether it's going to be a continuous window -- continually accepting applications or we're going to have a set window, and we have not decided on the elements of evaluating these applications for us to actually assess the cost of the application.

---

Last round there was a program to assist applicants that are from the developing countries and that need help in applying. I agree we did not get a lot of applications in that -- in that round. Hopefully this will be addressed in the coming round earlier on so we can put in a program that's more robust so that we can get more -- more support done. Thank you.

SHIVA UPADHYAY: Thank you very much.

GORAN MARBY: And while we say "we" in this one, it's actually the community that makes the decision. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you. Next question, please.

ALASTAIR STRACHAN: Hi. My name is Alastair Strachan. I'm a first-time fellow, first ICANN meeting. My query is in regards to engagement, specifically youth engagement. I've heard many mention about youth engagement and it's an important thing, but from what I have seen or interpreted, it's aimed -- the youth is university students and above. Do you think there should be more focus

---

on getting school-aged children educated about the fact the Internet doesn't just work and what the ICANN community does and maybe even consider providing education materials to the governmental bodies so they can distribute that on a national level?

DUNCAN BURNS: Sally, would you like to answer that one?

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you for the question, suggestion. And you're right, it's an increasing topic in our community is, how young should we go. You know, and one of the questions that you will ask when this topic comes up, and it's a tricky one to answer is, how do we strike the balance between educating, if that's the correct word, a very broad base of very young people about what we do? Where's the points alignment, if you will, between broader understanding of how the Internet works, which is, I think, probably many people would say yes, you know, there -- there is a real need for school children, younger people, to understand how it all fits together, balanced against ICANN's quite narrow scope. And you're nodding because you've obviously had some of these conversations. And you know, it's a tricky one. It's very subjective so far would be my observation in the conversations.

And my suggestion, and my interest, if you like, would be that we -- we really keep this dialogue going and we focus in on it in the many different outreach groups that the different community groups have. It will be much more relevant for some than for others. But I would certainly welcome that dialogue and some brainstorming about kind of how we strike that balance, and then if we can get some sort of -- settle on some kind of agreement that the community feels is -- is a good use of resources, how do we then make sure that we, from a content perspective, you know, we work with our Internet partners as well as we possibly can to balance out who does what. And with that in mind, I just thought it might be interesting for the group to know that at every ICANN meeting, certainly since I've been at ICANN which is about four and a half years, we have a meeting -- a face-to-face meeting of engagement and communication staff between ICANN, ISOC, and the RIR community. So the -- the part -- all from around the world. So anyone who's here face-to-face meets, and we remote -- bring in remotely anyone that's not here. And this has been a very productive place to start having some of these discussions because some of that -- they will have different remits, so we're sort of hoping that between all of us we can, you know, try to start resolving this problem. But please

---

do help us to stay in this discussion and shape how we do that moving forward. And thank you for bringing it up.

ALASTAIR STRACHAN: Thank you so much.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you. Next question. And actually, just before you start, I know a couple of people have questions. You can still submit them through the email address, and we'll reply on the President's Corner Web page after the meetings. Next question, please.

CLAUDIO DE LUCENA: Thank you very much. Good morning, everyone. I'm Claudio De Lucena, Paraiba State University in Brazil and currently working as a researcher for the Portuguese Foundation for Science and Technology. A first-time fellow and also my first on-site iCANN meeting. I'd like to leave, first thing, a word of appreciation for the Fellowship Program in itself. It has -- not only has it worked very well in the sense that it's structured in a way that shows as - - starts showing as how the organization works but also with a new idea of having someone coach as before we start which

---

softens a lot what is already an already tough week of knowledge here.

I would like to elaborate a little bit on the point that my friend Alastair touched here. Goran has been very vocal in all the moments that he has devoted was that he understands that the first and it's a -- it's a common understanding that the people that we have connected so far were the easy ones. That we have -- we probably are going to have much more difficulty -- difficulty connecting the next generation and have them access to products and services and the opportunities that this environment provides.

Now, I have been in touch with a couple of outreach and engagement officials on the team with incredibly interesting and promising initiatives, and when we -- we expect to develop a long time, but this -- there's still a very high cost involved in that. And I -- in that sense, I would invite the team to pay special attention to universities, public universities in underserved communities and then underdeveloped countries. Whether it is because they have a very particular institutional role in their regions, whether it is because they address exactly that public which we're willing to connect to offer those opportunities and digital products and services. So I would appreciate to know if this is a view that is somewhat debated or shared by the public

---

and by the team, and if those are initiatives that we would be willing somehow to promote and enhance. Thank you very much for the opportunity.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you. Sally.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you. Yes.

[ Laughter ]

CLAUDIO DE LUCENA: And thank you.

SALLY COSTERTON: Yes, we have some efforts in two areas, specifically. One is through our regional engagement programs that are done with our regional team, vice president, our head of engagement, and our community members. They're very participative, collaborative programs of engagement. Each region has different priorities of outreach and growth. And in each region we -- the staff as a role is to facilitate implementing those priorities. So that's a regional approach. And I'm sure -- I hope

---

you know Rodrigo de la Parra. Where's Rodrigo? Is he -- there he is waving his arm. He really does exist.

CLAUDIO DE LUCENA: We have just had a meeting minutes before the session, in fact.

SALLY COSTERTON: Okay. So I know that Rodrigo will be reaching out to you, if he hasn't already, to invite you to participate with your fellow community members on an ongoing basis from -- from Brazil with Daniel, who we also have Daniel, I think, here as well. So there's that.

Globally, we -- we have coordination from one of my Senior Vice Presidents who looks after academic outreach and civil society engagement. Where's Jean-Jacques? Is he here? I don't know if he's here. Okay, maybe he's not here. So we have participation -- we have a regular slot on our sort of strategy discussions about how are we doing in a more joined-up way about reaching out to universities, talking to university students. And finally, I would say that we have our next-generation program. Now that does focus specifically at reaching out to university students and people in full-time education. That is -- the entry criteria is from 18 to 30, and they come from the region in which the ICANN



---

meeting is being held. The staff lead in charge of that is Deborah, over here. Where's Deborah? She's not here either. We're doing well here. And so I want to just make sure really that you all know that we have point people in the teams who -- who are day to day looking after this access and participation, but that we're also continuing the discussion more, if you will, strategically saying how do we do more? How do we make more of the resources that we have to further that engagement. Because you're quite right. You know, there is a lot of potential inside universities with students studying business studies, engineers, and so forth, that we can tap. Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you. So we've got seven minutes left. So please, next question.

DAVID MORAR: Thank you very much. I'll try to be brief, since Claudio stole half of my question. But my name is David Morar. I'm a first-time fellow, first-time attendee, and while I speak in my personal capacity, I'm sure that my fellow fellows will agree with me. I wanted to make sure that the executive staff knows that the Fellowship Program has been a tremendous success. And I -- I can speak from, you know, ICANN 58 as a fellow. And I wanted

---

to -- I wanted to thank our -- our supervisor, who has done a tremendous job for us. I think that, you know, maybe you won't see me as a future leader, but I'm sure you'll see a lot of the other fellows. And I just wanted to sort of not necessarily ask but I wanted to make sure that you know that the fellowship is in -- is a crucial part of bringing in newcomers and, you know, not just young people but newcomers of all ages. And I think that it's important and, you know, maybe even expanding it at some point. So thank you.

[ Applause ]

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you.

GORAN MARBY: Thank you. Thank you very much. I just want to give you a short con -- first of all, I'm so happy that so many newcomers of fellowship has come up to the microphone during so many sessions.

[ Applause ]

And I can also, on a personal note, say that when I have the honor to meet those different groups during this week, their

---

questions has been much tougher to me than the nice questions we had so far, which I really appreciate. You're bringing in a new perspective. And I know that everybody -- you ask questions that sometimes challenges our beliefs, and this is exactly what you need to do. So thank you, and keep on.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thank you. Last question, please.

EVELYN NAMARA: All right. Hi, everyone, my name is Evelyn Namara from Uganda. This is my first ICANN meeting, and I am also part of the Fellowship Program.

So my company was ranked number one most entrepreneurial country in the world. And in Uganda, and many other regions in Africa, there's a growing ecosystem of tech start-ups and innovations. So I wanted to know, is there space within ICANN for technology start-ups and innovation space that is widely growing within Africa and the next billion? We keep talking about connecting the next billion. I know that most of those will be from Africa. So is there space for this ecosystem within the ICANN community? Thank you.

GORAN MARBY:

Thank you. Your challenge you're giving us is not easy. We have a strategy for underserved -- to be honest, in this private setting, I don't always like the word "underserved" because there's a great potential. Yes, I've said many times that the next billion users will be different than we have today and they're going to be tougher and harder. We do actually now spend more resources in Africa. We opened our office in Nairobi. Tarek has talked about the things that we are doing to try to train, to train, to train, and to train trainers. We're trying to be -- we're trying to understand the demand a little bit differently going forward so we can -- so we always can try to figure out how we can do that to serve and have a good engagement based on the needs. I happen to think that the things that's happening in Africa right now is quite amazing. You're doing a lot of things in a completely new way, which I think it's to your benefit as well. But we -- I know Tarek, Sally, and David and my other David over there, we're spending a lot of time to understand the exact needs because it's so apparent in -- we often talk of Africa as one entity, but it's many different countries with -- who are different stages and have different demands. But it's also -- and that culture of differences is a positive thing. So for us, we need to be able to understand how to go down in the weeds, so to speak, how to deal with it. We look at things of traffic flows. We look at,

you know, the IDNs is very important. And I have meetings in Africa when I speak to people the importance of being extremely more local.

I don't think we'll ever be able to say that we've done this in a good way. We just hope -- we are here to help people to connect through something we call Internet. And you will be the judge if we actually do the right thing. Thank you.

EVELYN NAMARA: Thank you.

DUNCAN BURNS: Thanks. And thank you. So that brings us to the end of this session. I hope it's been worthwhile. Please leave your feedback on the session in the meeting app. Let us know what you liked, didn't like, what we should think about if we do this again. And with that, thank you, everyone.

[ Applause ]

[ END OF TRANSCRIPT ]

