JOHANNESBURG – Fellowship Program Daily Session
Wednesday, June 28, 2017 – 12:00 to 13:30 JNB
ICANN59 | Johannesburg, South Africa

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: ICANN59 Johannesburg. Fellowship Program Daily Session. 28th of June, 2017 in the Bill Gallagher Room.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen, take your seats, please. Take your seats. We are going to start. Today, we have guests from our regional team, Global Stakeholder Engagement Team from Africa. And we invited them specifically for this session to have face-to-face meeting with all of you to talk about the African strategy.

For those who are not from Africa, this is an interesting way of learning how our Global Stakeholder Engagement Team works. What are the main priorities for this region? Some of the priorities may work for your region, own region, but some of them not. But I hope and I have seen already that many of you have chance to meet with your own regional people, Global Stakeholder Engagement Team.

I would like to invite to this table the Vice President for Global Engagement Stakeholder Team for Africa, Pierre. Please come

here. And our two gangs working here, our two friends, colleagues and bright people from this region, Yaovi, please come here.

Yaovi was one of the Fellows, so he's always a Fellow. So this is another example of a Fellow becoming a staff, and Bob. Please come here. I want everybody to see your faces. Thank you for coming. Thank you for taking this time.

Those who are from Africa had chance to participate in pre-webinar. And I think these guys presented a lot of important stuff during that webinar. But this is one thing, when you still are not aware of the actual ICANN and you are Newcomers, this is – you haven't been at ICANN meeting before, and now when this is almost the end of the ICANN meeting, so you learn more. This is another opportunity to come back to the topic and to discuss with the team.

Without further ado, the slides are up. So Yaovi, Pierre, maybe a couple of words, introductory words and then –

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you. Thank you very much, Siranush. Welcome to everyone and I'm Pierre Dandjinou, Resident VP, Africa. Of course, always a pleasure to be engaging with Newcomers as we say, meaning probably people that come into first ICANN

meeting. I want to make sure that – is it your first participation to ICANN or who has come here for the first time?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Raise your hand who are first time here?

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Wonderful. Wonderful.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Adam, you are first time here, yes. The others are alumni of the program.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Definitely. Okay. Wonderful. And actually we are now going through – this is already the third day of our meeting. One of the thing I would love to do with you as well, what do you think about ICANN? Some of those Newcomers that I have had to discuss with, and also too many acronyms. You don't really know exactly what the thing is all about.

And one day, some of them even told me, "What the hell are you doing here? All of you guys with your computers, you are online, but yet you are still talking." Also telling me – "Why don't you just stay at home and then do your own social networking and

finish. Why should you come here face-to-face meeting?" And you are traveling, you know, those miles to do these things.

I mean, he could not understand it. But I also told him that, "Well, you know, the people who has been coming here since the beginning of ICANN." And you see people now – now it's ICANN 59. You see people that have been coming here since the beginning. Meaning they participated to all ICANN meetings. See?

So there might be something you need for them, for them to be coming, to be traveling. I don't think it's just about tourism. Certainly it's about some other thing. Maybe my message quickly before I just let Yaovi and Bob take you through the few slides. Because one of the thing I really wanted to do is kind of conversation with you actually. These are just about us coming and popping those things on you.

By the way, if you go on the website, you'll know everything about ICANN. I hope you understand that ICANN is quite transparent on those things. You know exactly, you know the way we are. But nevertheless, we are going to put the focus on the Africa strategy, what we've been doing, how we've been engaging in Africa, and also how best to involve you. That's what it was done too. Maybe one or two words quickly before I do this.

I was saying there must be something in it for people to be coming here. And one of the thing I'm seeing from someone who's been here… By the way, I'm one of those who's been coming to ICANN meeting for so many years. I'm also one of those who actually participated in what we call the process of even developing what you call the White Paper of ICANN. Meaning that back there, we didn't know exactly what kind of animal we are going to craft to really respond to the U.S. government, willing to let this Internet kind of ratify the system, managed by what we call the business and the race. The idea was to see exactly, how do we do this?

So I was happy to be one of the very few Africans to be there. Those heated meetings. Everywhere, Geneva, U.S.A. But nevertheless, it was about how we do engage people, how we do engage technical people. But as they say, ICANN was down to policy development. And policy development as the concern, the unique identifier system without which there won't be any interoperable Internet. There won't be any secure Internet. So that's what we do at ICANN. And we develop the policies around these. And we are structured in such a way that they will be telling you quickly.

With those few words, let me just turn to Yaovi and Bob and quickly take you through those slides and then we have our conversations. Thank you.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Thank you, Pierre. We are not going to go through most of the slides because the objective of this session was to give you the opportunity to ask more questions. For those who are able, we had a webinar on this topic. We had a webinar but the time was not enough for you to ask questions. And some of you were only on audio, and so you were not able to see the slides.

So we'll be very brief so that we have time to answer your questions. So we are not going to talk about ICANN in brief because since you have been here, there is a lot been said about ICANN. So we'll not talk about ICANN.

The multistakeholder community also our colleagues have also covered this one. And we just move to the Africa strategy. This one came from a meeting like the way in this meeting where we were in Prague in 2012. So the community, you see yesterday, they were African community, they're before who you are meeting. The same situation in Prague in 2012. Because before that, Africa people from Africa were going to meetings but not in concrete.

So at that time, we had opportunity to sit down in a room with the former CEO Fadi and the Chairman of the Board. And then as in this room, the opportunity was given to the community to exchange of the Board and the CEO. So the idea came out to

have a group, a group of people to propose a document. And this group is called the Africa Strategy Working Group.

The document we produced was posted on mailing list. So I'm sure that most of us – all of us, you are now on the African mailing list. So if there is someone not on the African mailing list yet, you'll see the link at the end of the presentation.

So after that, the strategy was posted for comments from the community and then also was presented in Toronto meeting, ICANN meeting in Toronto, face-to-face meeting. And after that, have been implemented since 2012.

We being here today is also a result of this strategy. So mainly two things – the community wanted to have from this strategy is that the domain name markets of business development and also the participation. So there are two key objectives in this Africa strategy.

So what we want to also mention is the various line you have in this light to talk about the key project in this strategy. So one of them is the DNS Award and we did that one. But we didn't have the [inaudible] after Durban. We had the [inaudible] in Durban – DNS Award. So now we are more focused on the DNS Forum. So the 5th edition is happening next month in Tanzania, Dar es Salaam. So this is one of the key project and this is part of the strategy. The DNS Forum. So one key component of the Africa

strategy. So it will be happening every year. So you are all invited for this one.

We have also tried to improve communication. To improve that one, we have a mailing list. We are communicating most by mailing list. We had the websites especially from the community but that one handles the updated – we are more focused on the mailing list. In the community wiki, there is a space there also. So the channel of communication, the webinars also are what we are focusing on for the community.

Also one key component of the strategy is what we call the Topical Workshop. So every year also as part of this strategy, we are having what we call Topical Workshop. The first one was in Cotonou, Benin 2014. Then we went to Harare, and last year it was focused on government participation. So it was held in Nairobi, the Topical Workshop in January in Nairobi. So this is also part of this strategy.

What we are trying to do also is to help countries, institutions in Africa to have copies of the L-Root server. So ICANN is managing one of the root servers. So helping African institutions to host copies of the L-Root is also part of the strategy. So anytime anyone is ready to host one of the servers, a copy of the L-Root, you just reach out to the [Chief]. And now are helping to have one.

So some countries have already installed. And we have currently request from Burkina Faso, from Congo, and from Gabon. So we hope that in a few weeks at most, we have more copies in these countries. We have the DNSSEC also [inaudible] which is a program, part of the strategy. So through this program, we have been able to have some countries to implement the DNSSEC protocol to more secure the ccTLDs. And also the outreach is also a key component, how to be sure that all the countries in Africa have joined the GAC. Because before the implementation of this strategy, we had many, many countries, many government, they didn't really know about the GAC. But I can assure you that we still have countries with no official representative in the GAC. So this is part of the strategy and the team is working on that.

The DNS sessions program is one of them, so we are able to send some African registrars to Afilias. And also we send in Canada and [IPMIRO]. And we hope to also this year maybe send to AFNIC. It's not only to Europe or Asia or America. We had intra-Africa SM program so this year from Tunisia hosted also five African ccTLD registry in this program.

We are expecting to have one for the English-speaking country with [Z Asia] this year and this fiscal year starting from July. And then we do also the capacity building the training on the domain

name business. We are partnering with the DNS-EC, Bob will mention more about that in the few slides.

And then what we are also doing is focusing on use from some of the outreach. So we have special workshops we call it Youth Camp but just special focus on youth on this capacity building. So I can let Bob continue the rest of these slides so that you have also time to ask questions. Bob?

BOB OCHIENG: Thank you, Yaovi. I think mine would also be quite brief. And really the intention of this session was first of all to put I think a face to some of our names. You communicate and we communicate as well mostly via e-mail. So sometimes you really don't know who you are talking to.

I think it is usually refreshing to finally put a face to a name so that if you have noted [inaudible] in some list and then you finally receive them and see them, I think next time the interaction is better.

So this was important for us to also get to meet you and know the team. I remember during the webinar, one of the questions was – so we have this number of countries and you are only this number of staff. And then how is this possible? I think it is possible because of you.

The reason that this program exists is for you then to help us and really be those who suggest on the ground that reach out on the national levels and really liaise with us in cases where you need a specific input in terms of presentations and content. But really it's you guys who know and understand better what is happening at the local scenario in your countries and can very easily help us reach out. Indeed, we are not able to be in all the African countries even if we wanted to. I think it would be quite a challenge.

Secondly, is to also note that today, we have an office in Africa that is also really supposed to help us also with our engagement. So you are welcome to reach out. We have a contact to that office. Just to let you know that this is part of the commitment and the establishments that were envisioned in the African strategy. But going ahead, three areas still remain as areas of focus.

Outreach and in talking about outreach, it's really to all stakeholders. You can imagine civil society for example, will only be one stakeholder group in any country. If I went to, for example, Malawi today and talk to a civil society group, the government will not be aware. The academia will not be aware. The business sector will not be aware. And the next day, they will still ask, "We've never seen ICANN in this place."

So you could imagine. So when you talk about outreach, you have to open it up and actually look at all those stakeholders in that country because ultimately, in one way or the other, they have a very important stake within this ecosystem. And until – and unless they're actually empowered to understand their role, they become impediments. They make your work difficult.

It's much better when both of them understand. Then you can have a well-concerted argument really. So this is now interest of course with your support to ensure that all those stakeholders get the proper information that they need so that they can make informed decisions.

If you look at the overall objectives of our strategy, the other part of it is to encourage African community to effectively participate in the ICANN ecosystem. So two things – this participation and then there is effective participation. The challenge in expected – I mean with the effective participation is that it puts a requirement on you. And unfortunately, this requirement is volunteer requirement. Meaning you will have to take a bit of your time apart from your normal job to really read and get to understand whatever it is that you're interested in that is happening within ICANN.

It is also not possible to follow everything. But whatever it is that you feel is interesting for you, there is a responsibility on you to

read fast so that we don't end up with a scenario where if something is to be hidden from us, then it is hidden in a book. So there's that reading requirement. I think this is one of the most challenging parts. Some of the questions that we ask are readily available in the content that are circulated, and in the mailing list. So that requirement is key. It helps you actually be empowered before you go out and ask other questions.

I will skip this. Actually, I just wanted to finish on the previous slide with the previous one. Yeah, this one.

Then the last one is on capacity building. And this is also various categories. So from DNS industry, players to governments to civil society. All of them require specific trainings that are tailored towards of their needs. So the kind of capacity developments that we are doing is different from stakeholder grouping to stakeholder grouping.

Lastly, it's not possible with us alone. So we really need your support and let really reach out. We are there to help as much as we can. And as the VP says, anytime please send out, reach out to us and whenever possible, we'll be able to do support. Thank you.

YAOVI ATOHOUN:	Just to mention, that slide is – people are still asking question about the DNS training. The DNS-EC is based in Egypt so if you go to the website, you will see that is possible to have training, all-around training on DNS matters.
	So our team is also working closely with this center based in Egypt. So we have also on this slide that will be available. Anytime you want to reach out to the team, we have a general team e-mail address and you can also write directly to the VP. So I'll hand you over to Pierre for the DNS thing.
SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:	Thank you. Pierre, Yaovi, and Bob. Thank you for this presentation and the information. And now we'll go – we have about one hour for discussion. So we'll go for questions and answers. Yes, the first question is Priscilla, please. Raise your hands and I will be putting your names down. Okay?
PRISCILLA KEVIN:	Thank you. I'm Priscilla from Papua New Guinea in the Pacific. I think on Slide 8, you have several projects that you worked on. I wanted to ask, what would be the two success factors that helped you to achieve some of these things? What were the two things that helped you do – achieve some of these things?

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you for that question. [It's about] our success factor definitely. Of course, the reference is what you call the Africa strategy, where the community actually suggested a few projects that we might be concentrating on.

Say for instance the – take the one on the DNSSEC Roadshow which is about us going from country to country, working with the registries, and making sure that they really understand, you know, how the DNSSEC functions, and they are in the position to sign the zone file.

For us, of course we are able to conduct close to 20 of those. It's quite interesting to say because when we go into a country, it's about three days sort of workshop. We do awareness raising and then we meet with policymakers. But then we have two heavy days technical sort of hands-on with registries and it's always good to see how they are. And then they study their own action plan.

The end result for us is how many of them have signed the zone file. I know when we started to talking about maybe two of them today in Africa, we [inaudible] six to seven of them but I don't have those figures that are able now to sign the zone file. For us, this is quite important.

The GAC, for instance, today you'll be seeing more and more people come in to the GAC. But four to five years ago, maybe you

had six to seven people coming in. Today, at least 20 African countries are representing in the GAC meaning, well we are getting there. We want to have most of them. But definitely, we now have numbers over there.

I think we also train people. We have figures about how many people come from registrar, registries who have been trained in terms of marketing, in terms of the whole package. But I think for us, I think the IDN. I'm always happy when I see someone like mine, my good friend from Ethiopia here. IDN is the Internationalized Domain Name. So for instance, we really wanted to make sure that African language is also come up with specific script so that they are part of the whole thing.

And when we took note I think about two years ago with our friend here, they stress for us, the focus was about personal involvement in those things. And we are proud today to say that well, Ethiopia script is fine. I mean, it's already in the system. And we'd like to be doing more. So for us, for that, the KPI here will be well, how many languages now we were able to put on the web for instance. So these are some of the KPIs we use to kind of gauge or measure our progress, actually. Thanks.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. Etuate?

ETUATE COCKER: Yeah. I'm Etuate from Tonga. It's good to see a lot of work that have been done over the years. My question is, what is your major concern in terms of engaging the community? What are the issues, major issues, that you have? We have a lot of issues in the Pacific region, but I don't think it is the same issue that you face in your region.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you. We do have Indian Ocean countries, you know. And they also have kind of your issues. But let me just tell you, Africa is about 54 countries, different countries. So question for us always is how do you really engage with 24 countries and with so many stakeholders? So this is a challenge for us and with our limited resources. I must say that we try to mitigate these sort of issues by kind of reaching out to the stakeholders.

I have to say that today, one of those – AFRALO for instance. The AFRALO, they are there to kind of assist us to spread the message, our message. But yet we need to do more on that. We are still kind of [in] need [of] more volunteers. You see, I don't know whether you got it but there's something we called today Empowered Community in Africa. I hope you heard about that one. At least that is not an acronym, okay? That's why it's not an acronym.

So the Empowered Community. Meaning our community now in ICANN had a say in terms of accountability, so many things are there. And we do have new structures that are there. So it's important that you guys be part of this.

I think one of my managers said, it's about volunteering. We know that you have your day job. But at some point, if you like to be engaged with this ICANN community, you should also be prepared to volunteer your time, you see, and also to volunteer your experience. And sometime be ready to pick up a phone call at 2:00 in the morning.

So this is part of the way – I mean what you get when you're involved in. So, yes. That's what I said. These are our issues and I discuss with [Savi] from your region and I know that yeah, we are having some sort of similar, similar issues to deal with. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Ines then Said.

INES HFAIEDH: Thank you very much, Mr. Pierre, for this presentation. My name is Ines Hfaiedh. I'm a Fellow and NTC representative, Executive Committee representative for Africa. So I had a look – I scanned the African DNS market study. And I do have an issue with the

methodology actually, a big issue actually with the methodology. So those who answered the DNS –

PIERRE DANDJINOU: You are frightening me.

INES HFAIEDH: Yes.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Big issues, okay.

INES HFAIEDH: Those who answered this DNS study are 1,400 potential participants in the study were identified through reviewing membership of AFRINIC, IANA, country code top-level, etc. And the response rate is kind of disappointing. It's 22%, which means that less than 250 people answered the review. And we built a whole DNS market study of Africa over the answer of 250 people who answered only. And not only the number is too small, but the way those people were chosen and identified. So I think that we should review the methodology of making DNS study. This is number one.

And number two, how can we incite and encourage our African community to participate more on those studies so that we have relevant, more relevant studies? Thank you very much.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much. Are you a Newcomer? Because that question – we never – I mean, talked about this DNS study but that's a good question actually. It's good that we could respond to questions. That's a very good question, what you just said. But I have to mention that this IDN – this domain names market study in Africa is the first, is the first time that we are having a document that really says – I mean, try to say, "Okay, here's a picture of a domain name in Africa. Here is what Africa looks like in terms of this industry." Okay?

But then we need to come back on the objective of this thing when we started off three years ago, I believe. We really wanted to make sure that we support this industry in Africa. But the best way of doing this of course was to know exactly, what does this look like? We are starting with a CIS ICANN-accredited registrar in Africa. I mean, if theirs was something like 1,000 plus globally. A few of them actually.

So one idea was, how do you grow? What does that mean? In fact, I remember the [Devensio] was saying, "Well, I would like you guys to be about 25 registrar in three years' time." Well,

today only nine of them I think from six to nine. None of them really is making any good business only with the domain name, selling domain names. It's an issue.

Back to your question. Of course, of course your question was not just about the users or the 400-something that consider – they really considered a whole spectrum of people. They even went to investigate on some of the zone file on the people. But nevertheless, what you said is quite wonderful because it boils down to another issue in Africa, at least in Africa which I know and because I've been a consultant for many years in Africa, is the difficulty in getting to the data in Africa. And that everyone, every consultant will tell you, is an issue in Africa.

Those consultant, I have to tell you, they have a host of programs. And even those who are the first to be interested – the registries for instance – will not respond, and that's an issue. So your question really boils down to what do we do, actually. Because this report at least is a starting point. This response is full of statistic there. And that tells you, "Okay, here is what is happening. Here are the conditions under which this business is being developed in Africa." And they were suggesting what to do. Okay? That one, that for us is quite positive. That's what we are looking for.

And don't forget that one of the byproducts for us is what we are calling the Observatory for the Domain Name System in Africa. It's also going to be a first thing I mean in Africa. It's never existed this observatory.

And then, we are going to work on how to create condition for easier collection of data. So it's a good point that you are raising and definitely, we heard it yesterday as well, and when we are presenting the report, we'll make sure that we consider those. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. I have the list. Those who would like to ask a question. Said, Chancelle is the next. Then I have Tola and Judith.

SAID MARJAN ZAZAI: Thank you, Siranush. My name is Said from Afghanistan. And my question is regarding the L-Root deployment that you talked about. And as far as I know, there is some cost related to that. There's like $2,500 to $10,000. So in terms of the underserved countries or the smaller nation in terms of their GDP, how do you address that challenge particularly that comes from research center or university or telecom provider?

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Good. Bob will take that one quickly.

BOB OCHIENG: Thank you. Maybe also just to say something on the previous question. It's really a challenge to us and not really to the consultants because like Pierre says, getting data even from our ccTLDs, even after several iterations or calls, e-mails, reminders, was not coming through.

                      And I can tell you, out of the 54 countries, only 22 countries literally responded to this study. Unless you give me letter as a consultant really my report is only as good as the letter that I have, so I think it's a challenge. And one of the proposals we got yesterday was probably to look at the possibility of doing an update to this report maybe after one or two years. It will take the goodwill of the community because if you don't give us data, then we really have nothing to analyze and to report, so yeah, it's two-way.

                      To the L-Root, currently all you need to host an L-Root if you operate a network is to be able to acquire the hardware. And the minimum to get the hardware is $2,500 USD. That is all the cost. That's the official cost for the hardware. And I think the running cost for connectivity is there are no more running cost. I'm not aware of any other cost to the L-Root.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Maybe it's not related to L-Root, because it's the answer. The L-Root, there's no – this requirement to pay something apart acquiring the equipment. First, what we do is if you're interested, you send the request and there is a check that you have a minimum. And then you buy the hardware. So but there's no recurring cost, which is the – the L-Root. Yes?

SAID MARJAN ZAZAI: The other L-Root servers that I know about like the F and I think another that AP-NIC handles, they don't charge anything. In fact, they have program where they encourage these institutions to host them. I'm saying, is there any program, any accommodation where an underserved country cannot – any institution cannot pay that amount? For example, that $10,000.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Bob said you have two type of equipment, which one is around $2,000 US dollars. That is the only one cost. So there is no other cost associated with that for the L-Root. For the L-Root, that is all.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Well, there might be some sort of arrangements. Your [RIM] might want to sponsor this thing, this different issue. But as far as we are concerned, ICANN there is not much fees attached to it, but I know they are. Even for instance, for the African region, AFRINIC at some point has a mechanism whereby they could sponsor those fees. That's quite different issue. Thanks.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I will request to limit yourself with one question only because we have many people who would like to ask questions. So one question per person. Chancelle? Next one is Tola.

CHANCELLE NKOISSOU: Thank you. Bonjour. Hi. It's my first meeting, my first ICANN meeting. I'm very glad to be here. I'd like to first tell you something because after all the webinars, after all what I read on the ICANN website, I thought I had understood but I realized that I was lost and I didn't understood anything here. After participating into several sessions, I have understood importance of ICANN.

My concern is about Africa because I am from Africa and this is here. This is about that that I want to speak. I want to know what is the problem about Africa. Because when I participate, when I attend other meetings for the other continents, it's okay. But

here in Africa, we have a lot of work to do. When you tell us those numbers, people participating to the poll, it make me afraid. People needs to understand because people are using Internet but they don't know at all how it works, who is responsible, and I would like to know if our first policy beyond what is related to policy. I like to know if our first fight shouldn't be about making people understand how it works.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you for this comment. It's very interesting to listen to you and you are answering the question I was asking at the beginning. Why people still are coming to these meetings, you know? Even though it's a lot of work but you're right. It's a question of organizing and here in Africa, I can't solve our problems. I can't help us but you are right.

We need to circulate information about African structure and there is a lot of work to do. It's what American people call homework. You need to do this homework. Speaking about ICANN, speaking about our work. So thank you for your comment, it's very useful.

MAURICE TOLA: Okay, thank you. I got two comments and one question. One comment to my colleagues there and one comment to you and

question. The comment to you is when Pierre mentioned when [we get engaged] with African activities. My recommendation to you before you leave here today, ensure you attend one – minimum of one or two constituency meetings. I'm sure [inaudible] attended one meeting and the head of the IP told me there's a Fellow [that attended] the meeting. And that's the beginning. We attend the meetings, you start engaging, and that helps. You learn a lot of things, and from there, you are part of the community.

The comment to the African team as regards research is of course I've had this issue of data being difficult. But we do across Africa there are [inaudible] students and they are conducting researches and they are getting data. So how do they get their data? It may be difficult for consultants. Most of data using SoVi. They are getting data. So what do we do? We can take advantage of Fellowship across Africa to ask them to support in these researches.

After all, Fellows apply online. Okay? No matter how difficult it is, African Fellowship candidates are always applying. So that means they are looking forward to when Fellowship is open, and they want to respond. It means the same set of people that are applying for Fellowship can as well attempt to respond to researches.

So we can take advantage of that when this kind of thing is coming up, let's [inaudible] the Fellows. Fellows across Africa are many. Let's send them to document and let them respond. If users and the committees don't respond, let Fellows respond. Let us send to Fellowship team.

My question, I saw a couple of partnership. I saw one for Cairo, one for is it Tunisia or something? So I want to know what is that relationship with ICANN and those countries in Africa. What is the responsibility of those partnership? And how can those countries join in such partnership? Thank you very much.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: I will just address the one for Egypt. The DNS Entrepreneurship Center in Cairo. That came out after a consultation with my colleague with [Sibaya]. [Sibaya] is the one taking care of enough African countries and the Middle East. We understood that one of the way to really impact the DNS environment in our distinct areas were to develop a mechanism whereby you have standing cost or [lectures] whatever on the DNS environment. You build capacity out of there.

And then we manage to have this partnership with the NTRA from Egypt. They were happy to really acknowledge what we could be doing together. And then we came up with a MoU

whereby well we could be sending people there and also we make sure that they do a few things that we agreed on.

We really want to be able to provide these keys that are necessary to run a registrar business. But also if it's possible we also sort of go into incubation for those startups eventually that might be coming. So that's the way we hold. Of course, question I keep on receiving is why Cairo? You know, it's always simple. And I know Africa. When we wanted to establish AFRINIC, it took us 10 years to decide which country are going to host headquarters. Okay.

Then they came forward, they said, "Okay, we would like to be part of this. The center is yours, you can use it." But I think we are open to any country that would like to kind of host such a mechanism. So that's the way it is.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Yes. I just want to add, considering that data collection in the case of the study for example, the process before starting the study, ICANN publicly sent a request for proposals. So it was really open. Then one company was selected for this study, so it was very open.

Now, the company selected has methodology even if we have a permanent contract with ICANN for some requirements. So this

EN

special study has, as the VP said, require some special information. So people – even some registries had a country level who are not very open to give.

This is what makes this study very difficult and in the conclusion, as he said also, the observatory will help to improve this study. But again, it's a problem of volunteering as you said. Because it is true that many people are not ready to also contribute. That is the real issue we are having. And this is why I ask if everybody on the ICANN mailing list, African mailing list. Because we think that if people don't have time to go to websites, at least they receive the message.

So for this study, I think even if we did webinar, public webinar, so I can tell you I'm not sure, we have less than 50 people for this study for comments, so no comment. We did a presentation in Copenhagen, no comment. So if you go to ICANN website, it's open. You see how many comment we have less than 20 comments. Public comments. Less than 20. So I think the problem is also from us. We are not really contributing. And we are not sharing information that we said. So anytime the information out, we are not sharing the information.

So the companies was ready to get feedback from the community. It was very difficult for this company to get information though. So it's clear we are repeating. But I think we

are moving. We need to do more. We need to volunteer as you said. So if nobody is ready to read the document to contribute, I think we cannot move. So this is what I want to add to the response. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. The next one is Raihanth. First Raihanth, and then you. You, you, Judith. Okay. Judith and Raihanth. Sorry.

JUDITH SAMANTHA FEZEU: Thank you. Judith Samantha Fezeu, [inaudible] staff from Cameroon. First of all, I want to know how will the Observatory of the Domain Name work concretely? And secondly, as a Newcomer, I would like to have some concrete types as to – in French – to take advantage of this, of the participation of this meeting going back to the country. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you for your question. The observatory – to be frank with you, we don't exactly know how it's going to shape up. There is a recommendation by the consultant. But the only one thing we know is that that artifact is going to actually provide updated information on domain names in Africa.

The consultants are suggesting that these be hosted by AFRINIC or whatever. These are things that we need to really think about. We take it further. And we are having the African Domain Name Forum. It's going to be next month in Tanzania. That's where we are going to really open the discussion about the observatory and we'll know exactly what to do.

But like we are saying, isn't just about ICANN. It has to be through partnership definitely, and partnership in local levels in Africa. It's about data collection, we definitely need to make sure that everyone is involved. So no concrete answer for that but it's a work in progress.

Now, as a Newcomer, your question was, how do you get more involved? That's your question. I think as human being, you certainly agree with me, you only invest in things that really have an interest to you or even to your community. But first of all, I think it's always about: what is in it for me? What am I getting from it? You may disagree. But I do believe that it always depends on what you are getting from something.

When you come to ICANN, when you come to know ICANN, you see that there are so many structures in place. So there you need to be focused if you are a lawyer for instance. Most of the people come into ICANN meeting, I don't have statistics so don't quote me. But I'm certain that we are approaching something like 50%

to 55% of people who are lawyers. You may be thinking that ICANN is just a technical thing. But you are seeing 60 to 65 lawyers come into ICANN. What does it tell you? It tells you that Africa isn't just about technical aspect of things. We are talking about policy development. We are talking about dispute resolutions, for instance. So it's important that people like you be involved.

We had a meeting workshop in Africa. One of the places that we were discussing, trademarks and domain name and the whole issue about dispute resolution. And we have lawyers there and they were saying, what is this? We never knew those things. I mean, domain name. So they decided to form an inter-Africa network.

So I think each of us, when you come to ICANN, I believe, make sure that you focus on – it's about intellectual property, we have it here. It's about At-Large. Then you want to be considering it from the users' perspective. Go to ALS or whatever, AFRALO, and At-Large. If it's about the registry, I mean the IP allocation, go to ASO. So we do have plenty of them, get to know them, and make sure that you make your choice.

And then follow-up. And then try to read. One of the thing I noticed in ICANN that you have to read. I mean the policy proposal. And then you start now engaging with the discussion

list. And then you start making also your own proposal in terms of issue.

For instance, we are discussing the two or three-letter code for instance. And it's a huge discussion because it's about using a ccTLD for instance as second or third domain name. It's quite important. And this discussion be taken place but how do you take this discussion if you don't know about the issue? So get focused and go to whatever committee or whatever support organization that are there in ICANN. I will say that's my advice. Thanks.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. Raihanath, and then Muriel. Then we'll go back to you.

RAIHANATH GBADAMASSI: Yes, I would like to first do a contribution. You talked about the fact that the strategy is not much known at the African level. I would like to talk about the issue of stats for the implementation of this strategy at the African level and instead of ICANN to have countries to come see ICANN to deal with technical issues.

I think it would be better for ICANN to work directly with countries that have registries to train the different people that work in national registries. My question would be: does ICANN

have a strategy, an African strategy to work with ccTLDs that are going to re-delegate and have re-delegation issues with the old technical people. I would like to know if ICANN works in coordination with AFRINIC regarding the implementation of root servers because most of the registries require an IP network, IPv6, and is there a help to acquire the equipments necessary for the IPv6? AFRINIC requires a very strict –

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much. Yes, I would like to say first, we cannot always bring support and help. ICANN cannot do much, cannot support you a lot. Only on specific issue is it possible for ICANN to help you out. And, maybe you're not going to be happy with my answer but ICANN are not the United Nations. We do not work at the United Nations. We do not provide help.

ICANN isn't an industry, represents an industry and when you work in that industry, you cannot ask this type of question. When you have a ccTLD in a country, the issue is how come that we have in South Africa one million of ccTLD registrations and we only have funneled 500 in from francophone countries, French-speaking countries? This is not an ICANN issue. In Southern African countries, we do not use domain names the right way.

So, what ICANN does and this is what I'm trying to say, is to provide support. We have a ccTLD association that is being helped with programs. We worked with the ccTLD with the DNS Forum. We look at the regional level to try to help and they're reaching all level where you can find a lot of information.

And, regarding the allocations, we do work on that with AFRINIC. AFRINIC is in touch, it's very close touch with ICANN and this is part of the ICANN agreement. We do have Memorandum of Understanding with AFRINIC with the L-Root server for the L-Root servers and those copies of the root server, and we did a little of progress in Africa.

I think you'd understand this concept of copies of the root server. When we talk about the server for Internet, we are 13 of then basic root servers, 11 in the U.S., one in Europe, one in Asia. But we do have the opportunity to duplicate, the duplicate enough copies and we have those copies in more than 150 countries. So, you can get a copy of the root server.

And this is very interesting, there's about 15 countries with copies of the root server. We have some agreements with AFRINIC and in your countries, you can ask for a copy of the root server. And like you said, you need a network. At the national level, you have to exchange points and this could be the national level and ICANN cannot do everything and tell you do this, do

that. We are not part of that business. At the national and regional level, things must be done.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Well, to add to what was said by Pierre, we have a clear strategy to accompany countries having issues with re-delegation. It's important during this meeting to say that we have no real issues. The only problem is that the information doesn't circulate well or people think there is an issue.

We do have a lot of meetings like in Congo. We met with the IANA Department people and we met with this exchange point. We explained everything and we said, "What is the next step?" And, the Congo is going to be responsible for the next step. That's how we work with countries.

We went to [inaudible] and for three years, we worked with [inaudible] that tried to do something but they're not moving very fast, in Cameroon went several times. There are no real issues. When there are re-delegation issues in very few countries and it's up to the country to come up with the initiatives, the necessary initiatives to move forward. When the country is not proactive and doesn't do much, it's going to become an issue.

I think ICANN is here to accompany those countries. This is a myth that you have those issues. You just do a request to

AFRINIC. AFRINIC is going to make sure you have a minimum amount of equipment and AFRINIC is going to make you able to do IPv6 really. There's nothing complicated to have IPv6 addresses.

We have policies that were being debated saying that addresses were being reserved for universities. This is wrong information. Nothing is that complex. We have strategies that enables you to get those addresses, IPv6 and there's no reallocation issues really.

MURIEL ALAPINI: Yeah. Hello, Muriel speaking.

I hear that you talked about the DNS Award. I would like to know more about the DNS Award and its objectives and what it's all about. And, I also wanted to talk about ICANN bringing a lot of awareness. Is it possible to convince countries because we absolutely – even if the community does a lot, we need the countries to do their part if countries and states do not do what is required, they have to understand that it is their own interest to know about the standards, the international standards and help out their citizens and know about what ICANN is doing. Because very often, we have no concrete results on location, we need awareness but ICANN also needs to work with the African states to make sure they understand that they need to do better.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you for this question. Now, I think that you are speaking about the commitment with the states. It's a good question. It's a big problem. We have a department in ICANN taking care of that aspect, it's called government engagement and they try to organize that but they work many with the GAC because as you know, the GAC (Government Advisory Committee) work about ICANN committee, ICANN policies.

These are little difficult because the way ICANN is functioning is a problem for them because ICANN – it doesn't send any invitation, so you don't send an invitation to a ministry or to a secretary to come to an ICANN meeting. If you are interested and you want to come to an ICANN meeting, you can register.

So, we have a problem. They are used to other kind of systems where normally they receive a letter and they are invited. So, this is the first problem we have. This is a way of addressing the ICANN meeting.

And ICANN is not United Nations. It's important to remind that. And, the states, they have different kind of structures. Then, we have the business part and there's civil society also. So, the states are negotiating and making policy for their populations, for their people. It's normal.

In the ICANN case, it doesn't work that way. It's not delegation. In Africa, we have 8, 10 countries who have problem with re-delegation. For example, a country is not going to solve this problem asking their president to take a decision about that. It won't work because there are some standards, some rules that you need to respect. Internet must work and so you are not going to put Internet in the hand of anyone. Internet is going to work, needs to work 24 hour all the time and there are some rules to apply.

So, about government, what you are saying is very important because if government understand, things may change. It won't be a question of a team of 30 persons. It's a question of the community, the whole community. In some country, it works.

I want to speak about something that we call multistakeholder system. We show people that what is happening now is a kind of model and this kind of ICANN model is something new with civil society, working with civil society. So, how can we do in those countries to understand this new model?

Because ICANN, okay, sometimes we invite the African ministers to our meeting and they come. Sometimes they come and meet us, and tell us, "Mr. Dandjinou, I want to have my ccTLD. My President is asking for a ccTLD." And I tell them, "No, it doesn't

ICANN 59
POLICY FORUM
JOHANNESBURG
26–29 June 2017

work that way. You have to come to the GAC, speak about that, understand how it works and it's going to be okay."

So we are in a new kind of model and countries need to understand that it is different model. ICANN is just a player in this Internet ecosystem. You know IETF for protocols. You know ISOC. There are a lot of entities who are working in specified sectors, areas. ICANN is coordinating the unique identifiers. This is the only part of ICANN. So, it's not only ICANN. We need to find some local partner to build this model and it's a work that we all have to do together.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Next, but please, be very brief. We have only 15 minutes and I have more than 10 people waiting [inaudible].

ADAM: Thank you very much. My name is Adam and I come from Senegal – ISOC Senegal Chapter. Thank you very much for this opportunity. Also, I'm reaching out a new kind of fellowship pilot part of that program. Is there Pamela in this… Pamela is here. Please, can you stand up?

Okay. This lady yesterday during a friendly discussion came out with a very great idea. She said, "Why can't we use TV, television to broadcast ICANN activities starting from South Africa?" We are

Internet industry but I think we know how much we don't have access to Internet in Africa. And if I ask this question to all of us, how many people in this auditorium have Internet accessibility, affordability to 24/7 in our homes. Maybe Senegal might have a very good broadband but maybe another country might not have that broadband for people to be connected. We have 75% of the African states, which are not connected.

I think this lady idea needs to be supported. I don't know how we're going to make it but I think we have spot TVs but we can also create ICANN TV where everything that we are doing today will be recorded and then will be shown to the whole world. Therefore, we can be able to generate contents in local languages people that will be translating and taking scripts in people's local languages, and then we can make these things available to them.

Low participation in global community discussions – this is where I want to come. As a Fellow, I really struggle to be on time and participating. Sometimes when I see the number of participation online, why are we – excuse me the terms – why are we so stubborn to open webinars and mailing list? Before I came here, I was 600 kilometers somewhere in Senegal. Three days that I spend, I have no access to Internet, not even a telephone network. FCM who were organizing our trips had to call me and I told him, "Please, I have eight hours to drive back

to the car before I can have Internet access or telephone network."

We have realities and sometimes, I think that we are too far from African realities. I'm coming now to the community that we are, the thing that I see that is that we are so selfish. What I'm saying that we are so selfish? The thing is –

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Adam?

ADAM: Yes?

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: We need to have your question, please?

ADAM: The thing is when there is a global discussion, as a representative of a community, why can't we with our Internet at home allow others to participate in the same room, in our living room, give them access, then we have like 10 people participating and debating at the same time? Why can't we do that?

These are some of my solutions. I like to do a critical analysis to push people to help them to think to change their mentality. Thank you very much.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you, Adam. Any response?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: That was a NextGen [inaudible]. Thank you very much but [inaudible]. You come from Dakar, why don't you speak in French?

PIERRE DANDJINOU: We receive actually a proposal three years ago on using TV to [respond] in order to be doing – and it's still there. And funny enough, the proposal was coming from Senegal.

Again, so, I think one we are responding is that we will consider this thing definitely. As you said, because especially when you say in Africa… By the way, radio is even much more spread over Africa, the radio. If you really want to touch – if it's about African audience, it's going to be radio first, actually. But we note those comments or those suggestions that you are making fully and we are very supportive and we'll make sure that this be known [inaudible] exactly how we should do that.

So, thanks. I think these are some good comments and the suggestions that we're taking to consideration anyway. So, thanks for that.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. We'll take one question from remote. There is a question from Christian: "How does the stakeholder engagement evaluate itself since its inception? And do you think that you are achieving your goal and if not, what in their own perspective should be done to help them and as Africans At-Large?"

So, if you can briefly explain, how does the stakeholder engagement evaluate itself since inception? So, how your group evaluate your activities?

Just to combine with the previous questions asked by Anderson, "It seems getting governments in the GAC community is a challenge but you seem to have had some successes." This is connected with your activities in the region. "What are the key messages or activities that you have bound to work with the latest countries that have joined?" And probably this also will explain the activities in the region to answer the question asked by Christian.

EN

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Okay. This is a good question because what we are seeing now is yes, ICANN is being known in countries, activities [inaudible] on that. We can support them. And, of course, we are now having more and more requests for support.

In fact, four days ago, we had this law enforcement emergency meeting here where we actually take people for how to secure the DNS and then when they are fighting cyber criminality. And of course, the next thing we had was a host of requests on [coming] now and then to support in the real countries in order to do things, workshops and things that.

So, yes, now, the request are increasing and then one of the strategies that we are trying to put to place is to measure that we build some sort of partnership on different levels. For instance, we are now working with the African regulators to establish an ongoing program with them so that we do outreaching for those, so we do some sort of new capacity development things.

I believe that it's going to be [throughout], I mean kind of partnership so that we mobilize people on both national and regional level to do what we have to do. We cannot deliver I will say at least the way it is to staff members. We cannot deliver effectively to the whole of Africa but we also know that there are

ICANN 59
POLICY FORUM
JOHANNESBURG
26–29 June 2017

partners there that can really help us through what we really want to achieve.

We do have challenges I know. But if we work collectively, we can find a way in which we collaborate in order to solve those issues. But as I always say, as far as Internet governance is concerned and if it's about Africa, 90% of the job needs to be done home. It's not about coming to global meetings and seeking for resolution of your issues. I'm certain that is about Africans considering those. It's about 90% to do at home.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you. 30-second questions from Sarata and Koliwe, and the last one, [Navit] will come back to if there is time.

SARATA OMANE: Thank you. For the record, this is Sarata Omane from Ghana.

I think my question was partly answered. I read the reports in the wiki. That states that the government of the African countries are not so much interested in there and it says it's due to lack of human and economic resources. But I wanted to know whether it's actually due to human and economic resources or is rather lack of interests.

And then, based on the research you have done, what are some of the main causes that we are not getting the government in there? Because I realize that the ALSes increasing from Africa and even are there AFRALO assembly they've put forward, there was a recommendation that individuals should be accepted in there.

So, what's actually causing that division where individuals ALSes are coming in but we are not getting so much no from the government? Because when we also know the causes, maybe we can also do our own [inaudible]. Thank you.

KOLIWE MAJAMA: Thank you. Koliwe Majama from Zimbabwe.

I think my question is similar that I would have phrased it as would you be able to evaluate the effectiveness of the existing structure now of the especially At-Large and at community outreach level to say the extent to which it has been effective in reaching out even I think what Adam was trying to say section of the community, which would likely be on the Internet but is currently facing challenges of access to actually get them to be part of a process or contribute at policymaking level.

Then my second question relates to broadly –

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: One question, please. We have limited time.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Sorry about that but we can always take your question offline or after this. Sorry. We can always do that. And I think having this AFRALO showcase and cocktail whatever, I mean, over a drink, we can always talk again. We are still here until tomorrow anyway.

So, to your question, it has different dimensions actually. Whatever conclusion the [consultants] reached [inaudible] work all boils down to what I might call a national policy on the Internet. Meaning, what is a specific country want to achieve, want to get from the Internet? Is it just about your people going to Facebook or to Google? Or is it about you using that tool to faster development? Since we know that all of that are possible with Internet and I do believe that if countries are able to kind of apprehend that issue, they should be able to come up with the proper policies.

For instance, there are so many issues, you are talking about cost. Well, the very first issue that consultant pointed out was accessibility. Meaning, what are the infrastructure that had been put to place?

So, if those infrastructure are not there or they are costly, what are the strategies you are putting together? I was just waiting for the World Bank or any operator to come or immobilizing the resources from your own country. Meaning, there might be innovative ways in which a country, a government, they'll try to kind of facilitate accessibility. We know countries that have done it. So, I think it boils down to the policies, the way they understand.

I will not say it's about ignorance or whatever. But then it also show that you are so as – I'm not going to get into the debates of ALS individual participation which is… But I think it boils down to what you are doing in a country level to really approach the government and discuss about these issues. In such a way that – I will just mention in the multistakeholder approach model in the countries, countries might have been reacting because of the old model. If it's about telecommunication, we know those who do it. Let's leave it to them.

But the whole Internet is rather disruptive. Meaning, it's actually just changing the models. And so, for instance your regulators, regulators used to regulate what? Telecoms. Some of them today, now, they will say, "Okay, we want to regulate domain names. We want to regulate mobile money." So meaning, there are so many things that are coming and sometimes, they don't know exactly what to do. So that's where I see your role as

people who can't actually engage locally and discuss those issues, so that they really understand these are old model they are following and it will take ages for Africa to be connected actually.

This is about accessibility, the whole issue of content development or application in the countries. There are countries where this is happening. We do have 300 plus IHOP today in Africa in 42 countries. Meaning, okay, they are developing IHOPs but what strategies are they putting together to really fasten those startup that are there, those host of developers that we have we are seeing in Africa has good ideas. How are we really measuring those to make sure that they are sustainable and daily contributes to your GDP? That boils down to your policy you are putting to place.

It's not just about, you know, the UN, [inaudible], wherever ICANN coming and put some money here and there. It's about the holistic strategy that you do have to address those issues regularly, monitor those issues and make sure that it's a [inaudible] and benefit a country.

I mean, it's maybe a general answer I'm giving you but I still believe that this is the way to go. Thank you.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you very much. Unfortunately, we are not able to take more questions and I will request you to have opportunity today for evening AFRALO, African Regional At-Large Organization Showcase communicate with these three amazing guys.

And with that, I also would like to thank you all for being here for – there is a huge interest you see and there are a lot of questions which are urgent which are needed to be clarified. So, thank you for taking this time in coming here.

And, with that, I also to let you know that Chris Mondini, Vice President of ICANN for North American and also leading the business development component is now in the information booth. So, those who are interested to talk about business development can go to information booth and chat with him.

All the others, I'm looking forward seeing tonight for the AFRALO Showcase. Thank you very much. The meeting is adjourned. One second, one comment from Pierre, please.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: I'm sorry to be talking but I will shut up after this one.

One thing I observe is that many of our Newcomers, even those who [inaudible] to whatever, coaches, they don't report back on national level. Most of the time, they don't. Even one of the members of government was telling me, "Well, we keep on

sending this guy to GAC. We don't know what he's doing out there."

So, at some point, maybe we need to get organized so that you spread the word when you are at home. Organize a meeting and tell people what has been happening and how can we get involved, you see, on national level. I think that's something that we should be doing. Maybe that's one of the criteria for us, you know.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I completely agree. And one of the criteria for fellows is to submit their post reports, so we are good on that but we'll keep that more structured to be shared with you as well. And, thank you very much once again. That's all for today.

Just to let you know, I will share with you the PowerPoint presentation you have seen today.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]