ABU DHABI – At-Large Technology Taskforce Working Group
Tuesday, October 31, 2017 – 17:00 to 18:00 GST
ICANN60 | Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's Tuesday, October.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, so I think we're about ready to start. Everything is ready to go. Recording is on and all that. Okay, thank you, everyone, and good afternoon, everyone. My name is Dev Anand Teelucksingh, Chair of the Technology Task Force. We have a packed session and we're happy to see so many persons in the room.

We have a packed agenda where we'll just do a brief introduction for newcomers as to who we are, and we'll then have updates on some selected TTF projects. We also have a Technology Issues page where we also track technology issues and work around solutions. So we have about three different technology issues and then hopefully we'll have the time to ask what are your technology issues in ICANN.

So we have a packed agenda, so let's go right ahead to the next slide, and the next slide.

EN

Okay, so the introduction to the Technology Task Force. Next slide. So the Technology Task Force, we review and evaluate various technologies and tools that could help the At-Large community better accomplish their goals – I see, thanks, Sebastien, I will slow down – to help better communicate, collaborate, and accomplish their goals while in pursuit of ICANN's activities.

So we look at various technologies, web conferencing tools, captioning, anything that helps us, the At-Large community, become active within ICANN. Next slide.

It's open to anyone in ICANN community, anyone interested in ICT and how they could be applied to solve the challenges that the communities face in dealing with ICANN activities. We have, typically one or two conference calls a month and the links there will take you to our work and our wiki page. And it's very easy to join. Just talk to us or send an e-mail to the At-Large staff. So that's just a brief summary of what the Technology Task Force does.

Next slide.

Okay, and an update on the selected projects. Judith, do you want to take this part?

ICANN 60
ANNUAL GENERAL
ABU DHABI
28 October–3 November 2017

EN

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Sure. We have a couple of selected policy projects that we're working on. This one is the policy tracking proposal. So the idea behind here is it has been very difficult to try to track these different policies that are created, whether it's by an At-Large group or whether it's individual, whether it's one of the [comments] that the Board is doing. It's all been a very manual process, and so our idea is to try to get to automate this way of doing the policy tracking so that you can easily find who submitted policy advice, a comment or a question, or any type. It works by keyword, so this is a summary page of what it looks like now. And then, next slide.

Right now, we can only track the ALAC statements, and so the statement's here and then the little [insert] of a document is there. But there's no really follow-up on this, like what happens when a statement is submitted? How is it [later] [tracked]? It's very difficult. It's all a manual process and so we want, as you said, to automate it. Next slide.

This slide talks about the recommendations to the Board. And this is one type of policy advice. The Board takes the actions, but the responses that the Board has made to advice that ALAC submitted, right now they're not linked in the database. So they exist on one part of the wiki or the website, but we can't find the staff responses to the input that ALAC has done because they're not linked and neither is the text or the PDFs. They are indexed,

ICANN 60
ANNUAL GENERAL
ABU DHABI
28 October–3 November 2017

but they're not indexed and so it's very difficult to do a search and find, okay, well, when did we talk about comments on the public meetings? When did we talk about this? Without indexing, it is very difficult to track. And so, next slide, please.

So we had put in a request on the special budget to have ICANN allocate resources to design and build a better system that will make it easier to track different policy proposals and adding, like so you can then track on what were comments to the Board, what were their responses, and this whole thing can be tracked and it will be much easier to be searched when we're looking for in the future. And it also will pave the way for wider, more ranging Phase 2, which was a whole new policy management process system that will align database to common standards. So that's our idea, have this, and having the PDFs be able to be indexed and fully searchable. Next slide, please.

This just goes over what we discussed a few minutes ago, the coordination of the database and everything. To do this, what staff have done is they manually write down the names of the people who may have submitted comments, write down responses, and create a database. And that seems to be such a hard task to do, and it's especially harder for individual comments because the fields that are necessary to have the system track it are not there. So if an individual submits a comment, without knowing the person, you don't know who has

EN

written it, what constituency they're from. And so that's an idea that we were trying to find out is, okay, well, if we put fields in these things that make them mandatory, we can later then track these and later, when the system is built, have an easier way of identifying who submitted comments and who didn't submit comments and what they did. And so this was our last year's special budget request and that's the link to it. Next page.

So this year, we started to work on this and we've met with Liane Champagne who is working on what ICANN is calling the Action Request Registry, which is a project that ICANN is working on to improve policy tracking. They're first doing the work for the Board and they'll be able to track it and have these things more aligned.

So this is sort of a summary here, what she's done. They were looking at tracking Board and GAC advice and putting all these documents into a single document and processing of advice and making sure they're more complete. It's basically a five-step process. They have a document, an acknowledgment, the understanding and the request to evaluate and consider, the implementation, and then the closing.

That's their five steps that they're going to do in diagramming where it comes when the Board advice is given, when it's requested, all the comments and all the features and everything

on it. So that should be a first step in the process and we look forward to having more completion of this. Right now, it's in a very preliminary stage.

But we may want to ask Chris where this process is now and how you have advanced on it. It's fine because the next slide is [inaudible].

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So let Chris give a further update and then we'll see a queue. I see Sebastien and Eduardo.

CHRIS GIFT: Thank you. It's not much of an update. I will actually have a quick correction, though. It's not a policy tracking tool. It is called the ARR, which is Action Request Registry, so we do love our acronyms at ICANN. And the purpose of that tool or what we've built is so that we can track requests both to the Board because the Board needs to track them, and to staff. So it's for looking at correspondence, so correspondence to the Board, correspondence to Göran or the organization, and things of that nature which we could then further break down and track so that we can respond to those requests and then track that we've responded and so on, so you can query everybody.

So it is not envisioned in the past or in the future to be extended to track policy per se across the length of a PDP or something of that nature. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks, Chris. Okay, so the queue was Sebastien and Eduardo.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you. Technology is so beautiful. We need to use it, otherwise one day, we'll all get fired here.

Thank you for that introduction. I have a question for Chris, I think. What is the link between what you are presenting here and the Document Tracking System project to search documents on the site and on everything that done? That's the Document Management System, I think it's called? Thank you.

CHRIS GIFT: Thank you, Sebastien. There is no link between both systems for the time being. It's two completely different systems. It's true that both documents have document references, but there is no relationship between the two at the time. The document system, DMS, is under the ITI project that Göran – I think you've discussed this already. And it will be launched in January. Mark?

MARK SEGALL: Yes, in January.

CHRIS GIFT: So it starts in January, but there is no relationship between the two at the time being.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Eduardo?

EDUARDO MENDEZ: So, Chris, this is a question. The document system that you're referring to, is it one that was mentioned by Göran that will look at the whole thing?

CHRIS GIFT: Thank you. That's correct. ITI, which stands for the – now I'm having – Transparency Initiative?

MARK SEGALL: Information Transparency Initiative.

CHRIS GIFT: Thank you, and Mark is heavily engaged in that so he can talk quite a bit about it. But it is that. It is a very foundational where they're looking at all the documentation, taxonomies around

the documentation, meta data around that, and then a new website will then be built on top of that so that it can solve problems like this and like the policy tracking problem.

EDUARDO MENDEZ: I'm sorry. So it will contain the documents that we are talking about then. Thank you.

CHRIS GIFT: I'd recommend that you invite Mark and others at some point who are really leading that initiative to come and present to you about it.

MARK SEGALL: We actually have a session tomorrow on Information Transparency Initiative. Actually, today is Tuesday. Thursday, excuse me, I'll have to look at my calendar and see exactly what time. I think it was 1:30, but everybody is welcome to attend that.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks. So perhaps you can then move on to the next TTF sub-project, which is the conferencing solutions.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Next slide, please.

CHRIS GIFT: Sorry, one more comment. I know you're seeking additional budget to keep thinking about this project, but there are just a couple of recommendations along those lines or guidance. One is, there's going to be a lot of interest, actually to fold it, I would guess. And I'm speaking on Mark's behalf and others, but there would be a lot of interest to fold it into ITI, to fold something like this, concepts and work that you guys have been doing, fold it into ITI. Given that it's very document-centric and so on, it's a natural home for it. So that's one thing.

The other thing is around prioritization. If you want the project prioritized, there are really two avenues. The external, the supplemental budget request, community budget request, will only get you so far because you still need internal resources that need help and we need prioritization from our SVPs and execs to then work on it.

So you either go through your Board member and go through Göran and then the SVPs that way, or you work through Heidi and David Olive for internal prioritization. That will probably help a little bit. Thank you.

EN

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thank you, Chris. Thanks so much. Yes, it's going to need more money and this is one of our projects that we put in last year for special budget and we weren't as successful. But we [aren't] really interested in doing that because, for us, it seems very difficult. We are asked all the time, what policies have you written? What work have you done in policy tracking? But we can't get that work because of our huge manual process because there's no way of tracking, and then also, after two years, things disappear. They're not on the site anyway, so it makes it extremely difficult to track these items, and this is why we can't really respond well to what policies have you done when we can't track it.

Yeah, so thanks so much for [inaudible] and I guess we'll keep working on this area.

The next topic is the sub-project that we're doing on conferencing solutions. Next slide, please.

So this project was headed up by Justine Chew and Satish Babu. Justine is here. It was a review. Several years ago, we had done a review of conferencing solutions that were alternatives to Adobe Connect. So much has changed in those times that we did more of a summary of what we looked at recently and what could be the future. One of the reasons why we put more of an emphasis this year is there have been so many issues of connectivity

ICANN 60
ANNUAL GENERAL
ABU DHABI
28 October–3 November 2017

challenges on Adobe Connect from going from one vendor to another and how ICANN has changed its path of working with Adobe Connect. And so with the huge additional connectivity challenges, we were looking again at what can we have? How can we solve this issue?

And so this is a continuation of our work that we did in early 2013 where we've been documenting all the Adobe Connect challenges. We've been identifying alternatives. We've been looking to create a list of features in our discussions that we had last meeting with Mark and with Sarah who asked us, create a listing of what desired features you want in a conferencing solution because if and when ICANN will move, it will be easier if we have a list of features so that way they can know which are priority features, which are must-have, which are preferred, and that when they're shopping for one, it will be easier to figure out what we want so [that's why] we're worked on this list of features.

And that's [where] we're continuing to look at some of them. We're still going to review these constraints and what we could use and what alternative solutions we have. Next slide, please.

So we explored a variety of conferencing solutions. Earlier, when we first started in 2013, when we were going to switch to Lucid Meetings, then they decided not to do that and after

experimenting with different Working Group calls, they returned to Adobe Connect. And then we've been looking at the continued [research on] plugins for Adobe Connect to improve and enhance the benefits of it. And also, problems of using a mobile device, problems of using different platforms, problems of using Flash versus a plugin. So there's a whole range of different issues. Next slide, please.

As I mentioned before, since ICANN switched to the new vendor, we've had a lot more connectivity issues ranging from inability to connect to poor audio quality to constant dropping to crashing to problems when screen sharing, problems of disappearance of tool bars, disappearance of chats, problems with Flash, problems with mobile users, people who, if someone has shared a screen, they cannot see it, polls, and a range of different other things. Next slide, please.

So this slide lists the key desired features. We're looking at accessibility, [inaudible], functionality, user experience, administrative ease, and vendor reliability. So these are some of the key features that we're looking at and that we think are ones that we want, and the bolded ones are more preferred, are more priority-based ones.

EN

But in At-Large, we're one of the heavy users of Adigo and so we require that as well as captioning as well as certain other types of features that we [rely] on.

Another big issue, which we talk about in a few moments, is how the recordings are made so that they can be viewed on a mobile device. Many of our users are using exclusively mobile or tablets and they have different connectivity challenges than others. Next slide, please.

So in our review, we've looked at the factors and the challenges and some solutions. And we also looked at which solutions are open-sourced or open standards, how these tested, [range of] different trials, what has been our response to it. We had, in the past, a large comparison table but now we're just looking at what features, our featured list and what the trials have done. Next slide, please.

So we haven't made any suggestions in terms of a viable alternative conference solution. We're still looking out for them. Last year, we tested Meetecho was what the IETF uses and while they were great and could possibly do all of what we needed, it wasn't there yet. So this year, we're going to probably test Zoom which has been used by a lot of the Internet Society chapters and has been easy to use in countries where bandwidth is low, so it works well with limited bandwidth. And they've now

upgraded a whole lot of new features on there, so that's going to be something that we're going to be testing this year on that.

And when we do the tests, we work with the vendor to do a test on the full feature set. Then we test how it is in Zoom and how moving from one to the other. So if we could post, maybe Dev can post in chat, the meeting we had with the Meetecho to show people who want to look afterwards, what kind of items that we tested. Next slide, please.

So that's, I can pause for a few minutes if anyone has questions on the conferencing solutions. Do we have any questions on conferencing solutions? Yes?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: There's a question in the back. Mic?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yes, do we have a roving mic, please?

DINA SOLVEIG JALKANEN: Hi, everyone. I am Dina Solveig Jalkanen, NCUC and the new addition to your Working Group, and having spent a lot of time remotely with Adobe Connect which is a priority piece of software and from the perspective of a Linux user, I see a lot of issues there, and I thank you for [looking] at different solutions.

I would like to see the free and open solution for this one, but I see that at the moment, there is nothing which corresponds to ICANN's needs. But I hope that maybe, if not with this program, but with other more global things ICANN uses, we will continue to push for that. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: I just want to thank Justine who has been putting together the report and has done a good job, and finally, we're moving towards a final product or a final report towards this. So thanks, Justine, for taking this on, and of course, anybody else wishing to help can, of course, join the Technology Task Force and assist with completing this report. So that's it.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Yesim?

YESIM NAZLAR: Thank you, Judith. We have a question in the AC chat in French from Anne-Marie Joly. Maybe I can ask Sebastien's help to read it for me, please, since I don't know French.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: With pleasure.

YESIM NAZLAR: Thank you.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Hello, I am Anne-Marie Joly from the Senior Association which is an EURALO ALS. Is there a short document that explains how to connect and use Adobe Connect for new users? I have a lot of issues with Adobe Connect and I don't exactly know what to do. Thank you very much.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes, we have and the TTF has put together a one-page on this. There have been several new developments regarding Adobe Connect in that there are now standalone applications for Windows and Macintosh. I'll post a link in the chat to show you how to download those apps. And if you are using Linux, we also discuss how to use Adobe Connect in Linux. So I'll post it in the chat. Thanks for the question.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Thanks so much. The next sub-project is one that Dustin Phillips and Sarah Kiden were doing, and that was a redesign of the TTF wiki page. And I'll turn it over to Dustin to talk about it.

ICANN 60
ANNUAL GENERAL
ABU DHABI
28 October–3 November 2017

DUSTIN PHILLIPS: Thanks, Judith. So basically, what we tried to do is clean up the homepage of the wiki, and we started by trying to identify who we're trying to reach with this. So that would be existing TTF members as well as people who might be interested in the work.

As you can see on the slide, we determined that the real estate up at the top is much more valuable, so we then moved into prioritizing what information we should have placed in a prominent location. Then from there, we just tried to clean the rest of it up, including making minor changes to things like the table of contents, which you may have noticed across a lot of the wiki pages is a cascading vertical list, so just moving it into a horizontal list does a lot to clean up the look.

And it's worth noting that this is running in parallel to a track by staff to just generally standardize the Working Groups' wiki pages, so we've spoken with them and we had a call with staff to discuss how we should move forward so as to not step on anyone's toes and not to undo any work. And after that call, we determined that the staff would take the work we've done on this prototype page here and merge it into what they have been working on. And I haven't seen that be merged yet, but I look forward to seeing that progress.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Dustin, thanks so much. If someone could advance the next slide, you'll see a summary of what Dustin just talked about. Right, thanks. So as you see, that's what he was talking about.

So then our next sub-project is something that we have been working on for a long time. It's about how At-Large could use group chat, and Dev is going to give that talk.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Just wanted to check if there were any questions. Okay, so group chat can be very confusing and I [inaudible] this comic from XKCD, which really illustrates the challenge with various group chat solutions and instant messaging systems and so forth. Next slide.

So currently, we're using Skype for instant messaging, and one of the challenges we've noticed with using Skype, the chat history is not very preserved and we've actually lost over the few years, as persons upgraded machines, we have lost the chat history of discussions and so forth.

The conversations are happening on various [topics] which happens at the same time on one particular Skype chat, and therefore, potentially conversations on a particular issue is lost in the stream. And there's no reliability to search Skype

messages. You have to remember the Skype group you were in, in order to try to do a search. So next slide.

Okay, so group chat and the most popular being Slack, but there are other types of group chat solutions. It shares several common features. You can create public rooms or channels for groups and/or topics. There are mobile apps to send push notifications to mobile devices. You can search across your channels or rooms, and staff or the admins have more control to add or remove and invite persons. And a lot of the group chat solutions also have integrations that could be added for more functionality. Next slide.

So because of that, they have significant benefits and we think that the benefits are that we can offer the At-Large community, there is potential for discussions on topics they are interested in. So if they're not interested in a particular topic like IDNs, they can choose not to be in that conversation whereas those who are interested in IDNs can focus on that topic. Next slide.

So we have done a lot of testing, and in fact, we actually used Slack in the very first year, I believe it was first introduced in the ICANN 50 meeting in the At-Large summit. But since then, we have looked at various other solutions and within the past year, we have tested several such chat solutions. Next slide.

Now, what approach should be done? Now ideally, ICANN itself should try to deploy its own chat solution that can be controlled and supported internally by ICANN. And having that deployed solution by ICANN means ICANN itself can customize it to suit the various ACs and SOs which have their own needs. And obviously, that will require some planning and investment and testing by ICANN before it's deployed. So that might take some time.

Therefore, in the meantime this is the proposal we want to put to the At-Large community, next slide. One approach is that we should use the free tier Slack version, and we have the link there for those who want to click in to connect to it. Next slide.

And the reason why is for several reasons. It's very hard to try to deploy any free and open source solution. Not that the open source solution wasn't good. It's just a challenge to deploy it online and using their own resources without payment is very challenging. With Slack, even if ICANN chooses another system, any chats that we use can be exported to the new future chat platform, and from an end user perspective, Slack just works as any popular cloud service and has all the key features that we want. Next slide.

Also, the free tier offers several integrations, so you can integrate things such as Google Calendar integrations so that

when notice for a meeting comes up, you'll automatically be sent to the Slack channel. We have Twitter notifications and so forth, and you can also use translation so you can translate one message from one language to the next. Okay, next slide.

And one of the concerns this raises is that Slack does not really have a public-facing archive and we've managed to come up with a public-facing website that allows you to mirror or archive the chats from a Slack channel on a public website. So persons from the outside can still see it and then decide to join the Slack channel.

So that's the approach we are thinking or suggesting to the ALAC and for the At-Large community to use. So are there any thoughts or comments on this approach? Evan?

EVAN LEIBOVITCH: Thanks, Dev. I've done a little bit of testing with Slack also and there's a couple of things that could be done to deal with the things you've said. First of all, I noticed that all the testing has been done with the free account. I've actually posted in the Skype chat, Slack allows for non-profits to have their paid account for free for up to 250 users. I put the link into the Skype chat to indicate the page where that's talked about.

And in terms of having a publicly-facing document store, Slack has a very big app, Ecosystem, and one of those apps is actually a link into Google Documents. And so it's possible, for instance, to have a link to a public file store in Google Docs so you can have some things that are private but you can also designate something in Google Documents where you just give a link and it allows it to be downloaded.

So if those are the big obstacles, those are circumventable using this app, Ecosystem, and that's another strength of Slack. Thanks.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks for that, Evan, and it's good to know that. I didn't really know that the free tier could be upgraded for non-profits so that's good for that. Thank you. Renata? Mic?

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: One minute, Renata. Mario, could you notate that as an action item to follow-up on the non-profit version of Slack and the integration of the Google Doc that Evan mentioned? Thank you.

RENATA AQUINO RIBEIRO: About the Slack, I find it very interesting not only for At-Large use, but really this role that Slack is taking with Internet

organizations, so it should definitely be something that At-Large members would want to know more.

But I ask for some information and advice because, also, as far as I know, I am [inaudible] free [inaudible] communities that use Slack? So one big use of Slack is also via mobile. It can be a messaging app for mobile, very interesting. So what happens when someone is in more than one community? Is there any way to put a multipurpose Slack app? Because, for instance, Whatsapp, you can only use Whatsapp with one number. If you have two numbers, you have to have two mobiles. So yeah, just asking for that.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks, Renata. John and then I'll answer the question.

JOHN LAPRISE: Actually, I can answer that question because I use Slack a lot. Slack allows for being part of multiple work groups, so I've got it open here. I've got four different work groups that I'm part of, so yeah, it's not an issue.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, person. Can I get a mic to that person?

KEMEL ZAIDAN:	Kemel Zaidan from the ICANN Fellowship Program. Have you tried taking a look at an application called Rocket.Chat? Because that's an open source version of Slack, which offers all the possibilities that Slack do, but you can have the data on your own control so I think it makes a good choice.
DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH:	Thanks for that. Yes, we did. In fact, we did evaluate Rocket.Chat and the challenge is not that the open source solutions didn't solve the problem or didn't have the good features. The challenge is for volunteers to maintain it reliably without payment. That is really the true challenge.
	So ICANN could choose to deploy it and we would then just go along with that. But if we want the At-Large community to do it on a volunteer basis, it would prove, I think, too challenging to maintain, especially when you've got to worry about updating the server resources and keeping it up to date.
[KEMEL ZAIDAN]:	Because the problem that Slack has is a matter of [inaudible] for each user that you add to the account. So the amount of money that you will end up spending for that may pay you someone to do that. So if you have 2,000 people from around the world that

wants to get into this conversation, you have to subscribe all of them, so I think it's a tough decision.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. I guess that would be a great problem to have when we have thousands of people. I think that would be a great problem for us to have, so I take your point but we're not there yet to worry about it at this point. John, and we'll need to move on to the next topic.

JOHN LAPRISE: If we're concerned about scaling, we can also just start groups based on RALO affiliations and if we get to a certain point, then we can worry about that as well.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks for that. Okay, so let's move on to the next topic quickly. So selected technology issues. So next slide.

So the selected technology issues, so the Technology Task Force, what we have done, we have a Technology Issues page to track possible technology-related issues noted by the community and the Technology Task Force, and for reason, with ICANN staff to develop other solutions and workarounds.

So we have several issues that we have noted and we have noted several progress in three of them, and so we'll just take an opportunity to present them to you. Next slide.

So the three things we're going to try to do an update on: the LACRALO mailing list translation, making Adobe Connect recordings accessible to mobile devices, and Adobe Connect issues. Next slide.

Okay, so the LACRALO mailing list translation, I'm going to move through this quickly because there is a long history. But basically, the LACRALO, for many years, suffered from a translation tool that often left a lot of messages in gibberish. So what we did, the Technology Task Force, said that ICANN really needs to fix this because it's created a lot of misunderstandings in LACRALO. And so that was approved and the ICANN staff started to work on this tool and developing an improved version. Next slide.

Okay, so what ICANN staff did is they created two new mailing lists so that staff and volunteers on the Technology Task Force can test and report bugs. And you can go to that link to see the bug testing that we did and so forth. And several updates to this tool was done over time and, in fact, in May, we actually redirected the existing e-mails from the LACRALO to these new translation mailing lists to see how it will work. Next slide.

And what we have, some of the key features with the new tool is that the subject line of e-mails isn't translated and that preserves the e-mail thread when people start replying. The tool will also notify the sender if the e-mail couldn't be translated, and translated e-mails also include the attachments from the original e-mail which was not possible with the old system. And if there was text that you didn't want to be translated, you can enclose text with a DNT tag. And we noted several challenges that e-mails sent to both lists causes problems and the notification when the translation didn't work was somewhat generic. So it became a challenge to identify why the translation failed. Next slide.

So since ICANN 59 Johannesburg, we started working closely with ICANN staff and with At-Large staff as well to figure out how to deploy this. We had a conference call with LACRALO and the tool was deployed to the main LACRALO list on October 6 this month. So [inaudible], I'll turn it over to Corinna Ace who has been working with us on this and just to say that it's good to finally meet you after a year and a half on conference calls and so forth. So, Corinna?

CORINNA ACE: Thanks, Dev. It's great to be at a TTF call in-person for the first time.

So that's a great history and summary. I will just add that, yes, our deployment definitely marked a milestone in improvement with the experience using the lists, but still, obviously, there are other small ways we could continue improving and we will keep monitoring and supporting fixes on the lists as needed. I'm glad we've gotten to this point and we will keep improving as needed. And Mark, do you want to add anything?

MARK SEGALL: Just one feature that was missed is if you actually type in Dev's name, it stays capitalized.

CORINNA ACE: Custom fix, yes.

SYLVIA VIVANCO: Hello, I just want to thank Corinna, Mark, and the team for putting so much effort on fixing the tool. It's much, much better. The quality of the Spanish translation has improved significantly. There are still some glitches, but we are monitoring every e-mail and I am in constant communication with Corinna, always giving her the heads up to see how we can improve it. So we are on it every day. Very soon, it will be perfect, so thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Ricardo?

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: Yes. Not only that the tool is working fine and in LACRALO and I use it but also that it was not only the translation tool, it is the rules that you put to use the tool that was very nice because it sets the kind of rules for replying this in other RALOs that is very useful. So it's not only the technology but also what the rules are to use in the technology.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Yes. Thanks, and I know there are other RALOs that are considering this. I believe AFRALO, being one, for French and English. So again, I think it's great progress that has been made on this tool. So kudos to the ICANN staff for making it happen after so long.

I'm not seeing any questions and we are coming very close to the top of the hour, so let's move on to the next slide.

Making Adobe Connect recordings accessible, right now, we use Adobe Connect, and the recordings from Adobe Connect are in Flash. And that means that we cannot play these recordings on mobile and tablet devices, and it's very cumbersome even on desktops because you have to have it Flash-enabled and so forth. So next slide.

So we've noted that with Adobe Connect 9.5, ICANN now had the ability to save it in MP4 files and we have done some testing and uploaded those files to YouTube, which showed that it could work. Next slide.

Since ICANN 59, instead of trying to do the conversion to MP4, somebody on the TTF noted that YouTube supports Flash video so we could have simply just downloaded the Flash video and then uploaded to YouTube. And this was done and it worked flawlessly. And you can see the link of that in the presentation. Next slide.

Okay, the challenge is this, though. In order to download the file, you have to basically play back the file in real-time. So that means you have to spend an hour downloading a one-hour recording, whether it's an MP4 or FLV file. So that means that if staff were to do this, they're going to have to have that downloading in the background while potentially joining other conference calls in their other business. So we were trying to figure out a way to get around this. So next slide.

So one other approach that we tried, and it seems to have worked well, was that we could livestream the actual conference calls directly to YouTube. So what I did was I used something called Open Broadcasting Software, a free, open-sourced solution. What I did, I streamed my desktop to YouTube while

attending the NARALO call earlier this month, and it worked well. And the advantages of doing it in livestream is that we can post to social media to simply just watch the livestream while the session is happening. It eliminates the need to manually download the recording and upload the recording afterwards. And there's a link there that takes you to the NARALO call. Next slide.

So the only challenge, obviously, with livestreaming is that you've got to have bandwidth to both listen in on the call and also upload it at the same time. And the test indicated that you have to mute system sounds in your desktop because you don't want anything popping up over the Adobe Connect sessions. So next slide.

So then we have two possible approaches for ICANN to consider. Use a dedicated computer to do the downloading of the recording after the meeting and upload it. And we are suggesting that it should be a dedicated computer at the ICANN office where either somebody in-person there can do it, or if the At-Large staff has to do it, let them do it remotely so they don't tie up the computer waiting an hour and then to upload. Or have the person at the ICANN office attend, livestream their desktop by entering the meeting room, and then ending the livestream when the meeting ends.

And I think this is really critically important because a lot of the work that we're doing, and I guess what ICANN itself is doing, isn't really accessible on mobile devices. I just want to, if there are any questions, open the floor for questions, and particularly getting input from ICANN staff. I see a queue, hand from Olivier first.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Dev. And I just wanted, to upload to YouTube, are you just uploading directly on the website or do you use a bulk uploader for YouTube?

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. So while one could use the bulk uploader, I just simply downloaded the FLV file and just uploaded it manually. But the livestream itself, you don't have to worry about that at all. You just set up the encoding software and just start, and that's it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thanks, Dev. So I think that the livestream might require more resources. Have you conferred with Joly MacFie from ISOC New York, one of the At-Large structures? He constantly uploads things on all sorts of sites and I think, if you haven't checked with him, he might have tools for bulk loading and so on.

ICANN 60
ANNUAL GENERAL
ABU DHABI
28 October–3 November 2017

I'm just wondering if one needs to have the video directly on YouTube immediately after the session has taken place or whether there could be some kind of a batch process over a weekend where you just press a button and you download about 20 different videos for the week's activities, in which case, that, I'm just looking at staff time, basically, reducing staff work.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thanks. Okay, so to answer the question quickly, I'm sure you can probably customize a solution where you can download the program and upload it and so forth. The challenge, as I said, is that you have to download it in real-time, so 20 hours of calls, you have to get 20 hours to download it and then to upload those, so a significant time to do that. So it is possible, but that's why I'm thinking the livestream option works better. But I would like to get us some input from staff on that as to if they have any thoughts on this.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: As we have less than five minutes but you still have one more topic, so send us your questions. Our last one, next slide please, is we mentioned earlier about the Adobe Connect connectivity challenges and we talked about the problems we had with Adobe Connect. We mentioned some of these earlier.

What we want – next slide, please – we were looking at an effort to make Adobe work better on a Mac, PC, and the Mac platforms. We've looked at what Adobe has been using and the efforts and trying to make it a better experience in a mobile market. Some of these changes have improved as Adobe recently has come out with a desktop version of Adobe Connect, which seems to erase some of the connectivity issues, some of the lost audio, some of the problems where the mic doesn't work or you can't hear anyone or it's garbled and we haven't tested these on different platforms. But that could work in helping alleviate some of the Adobe issues, such as screen sharing and other issues.

We're also looking at a fairly easier way of communicating for staff. So many people have Adobe Connect issues and they mention it to the person chairing the meeting, and then it gets sent to the IT department and then they have no idea what the issue was, how to respond back, how to do that, and so we talked about creating a separate form to track these issues that have all these things listed that IT would need to follow-up on that request and try to solve that request.

And staff was going to say they were going to do the form, maybe not do the form and were thinking also of adding another sub-project onto the Technology Task Force in helping create some type of forms, work with the IT department and create some type of form that could then feed into either a Confluence

account, a Google Doc, or something like that, so that IT would then have the information immediately after the form was filed and they will have all the necessary information to get back to the people with the issue or file with additional questions because, oftentimes, they can't and then we can't work with the vendor because if they can't give the vendor what was wrong, why it was wrong, how to fix it. So we're working on those and maybe [inaudible], we have Mark and Sarah here and I'll ask them what work has been done on that issue and do they need us to start creating the form or are they going to be doing it themselves, or how is this process going to work?

MARK SEGALL: We were actually chatting about this earlier today and I think the question we're having is what kind of information. If we can get a little bit more detail about what kind of information is being missed or not captured because I know that working with other groups, typically, the request can go through the policy support team member. They file a ticket in with the [end user] support team and then the [end user] support team follows up as necessary. So just we're curious to see the detail of that so that if there is a problem, we can look into that a little bit further.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Mark, thanks so much. I think, also, the issue is that a lot of people who are on the calls, users, do not know how to file a complaint. And if there was an easy form that we can direct them to that says, "Oh yes, click here," they can file the [there]. And some people, and a lot of the information, I know anecdotally, people have told me, "Oh, the Adobe is not working," and they don't necessarily know how to do the process. And I think an easy form where we could tell them, "Oh yes."

Or maybe we want to put it on the call, on the agenda, if you're having a problem with Adobe, click here, fill out the form because it's often a problem of communication. Well, how do they know how to do this, why to do this, and so many of these issues are they just don't know what to do. They say, "Oh, I've had a problem," and they don't even tell the leader and then you don't know anything. You just hear, "Oh, I've had tons of problems."

MARK SEGALL: Thanks. I see Sarah diligently taking some notes here. So yeah, let us maybe reconvene one that one, especially since we're short on time.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: Hi, thanks so much. We look forward to hearing that back. Last slide.

So this is also, we want to know from you want technology issues you have. Do you have other ones than the ones we talked about? Do you want to work on any of these sub-projects? Do you have any additional ones? This is the chance that we want to work from you.

Also, while we've been only recently been At-Large, but we've been going to other, we were invited today, we spoke at NPOC's Constituency Day. We're looking at expanding and trying to get people from other different constituencies to come and also tell us what their technology issues are and work with them because many of them have the same technology issues or they have a slightly different twist on it, and it would be great.

I know the IT staff would love it if we could help them work on what are the technology issues and have everyone together, come together and decide on what the problems are so that they can get a better understanding of not just one constituency but all constituencies.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, so does anybody have a quick technology issue they just want to raise right now, so just capture it for the record very

quickly? So we won't answer them, but we just want to just quickly do it. Daniel?

DANIEL KHAUKA NANGHAKA: I think the Adigo platform also has issues because, when I'm on a call, the phone keeps on jumping off and on, off and on, off and on, which is not very good. And so in an hour, they can call me five times, which is really not very fair. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Renata?

RENATA AQUINO RIBEIRO: Yes, a very quick suggestion. I was in a conference with a very large – can I be heard? – okay, a very large conference space, like normally, I can conference César, and it had also an event app and one, something that really helped conference [inaudible] and that I think is quite an interesting addition and I'm not sure if the TTF is the place where this can be, but at least, I think suggested to maybe ICANN meeting [app team] is an internal GPS because, for instance, this morning I had a meeting at Capital Suite, I think it was 17 or something. It took me like 15 minutes to get to the place and I made three mistakes, so that was like half of my morning. So an internal GPS for places like this would be quite nice.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: We had some discussions on this, but we just want to capture the questions since we're out of time. There was a next person?

BARTLETT MORGAN: But just quickly, I'm not sure if this is the appropriate venue to raise it, but with Adigo, the list of countries that you can properly call in from, [203], that seems to be an issue because, for example, in the context of the Caribbean, there are quite a few countries that are not listed. Some are, but others aren't and there doesn't seem to be a rational reason why some are and some aren't. So I'm not sure who we could raise that with to take it up with them perhaps.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Sarah, want to answer quickly? Okay, go ahead.

SARAH KIDEN: So for ICANN, I essentially cover all telephone providers. We have three that we are contracted with right now. One is Verizon, one is PGI Global Meet, and the third is Adigo. It's hard to say why they will or won't have a proper dial-in or dial-out for each one, but there is a project underway to identify which one has the most global coverage. So essentially, each group can decide

based on who will be on their call, what the most appropriate bridge to use for that meeting would be so that the most people can participate.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks for this. Okay, seeing no further hands raised.

SARAH KIDEN: Oh, wait. We have a hand.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: We do? All right.

SARAH KIDEN: In the back.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Very short intervention.

DINA SOLVEIG JALKANEN: Oh, this one is working as well. Cool. Just a short remark. Following ICANN's use of tools over the last half-year, I see we have capacity, we have an awesome IT department, a lot of different groups supporting us, and I would be very careful from going to, for instance, Facebook or Google and we do not have

the need to do that but sometimes, it's the most convenient decision, yes, I can see that. And I hope that the Technology Task Force may take into account that, in my opinion, the Fellowship Program can benefit from our recommendation to establish a proper mailing list and to not use Facebook as a primary channel for communication. Thank you.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay, thanks for that. Okay, I would just like to thank everyone for attending this session. We're just running a little bit slightly over time, and I just want to thank and applaud the interpreters for their diligence, for this long day.

Sorry, I'm seeing Sebastien. So sorry, what is it?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Please thank the people who are online in their time zone participating to your meeting. I think it's also important.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Indeed. I'd like to thank also the technical staff for making this session possible and to thank also the remote participants. Greatly appreciated. I have an intervention from Yesim.

ICANN 60
ANNUAL GENERAL
ABU DHABI
28 October–3 November 2017

YESIM NAZLAR: Thank you, Dev. I have an important announcement. So all the concourse level doors to the Aloft, [Rotunda], and Premiere Inn have now been locked. There are golf cart shuttles running between Hole 4 and Aloft Hotel. Thank you.

JUDITH HELLERSTEIN: What about the other hotels? We can walk from Aloft to the other thing? I thought it was closed.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Sleep in the streets.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: On the card, it's written that you can go to the three hotels. They deliver to the three hotels, depending on the cart.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: So let's continue the session after the TTF session. So okay, Olivier, I see a hand raised so this better be important on this.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Dev. I don't think it's an important item, but I wanted to waste a little bit more of your time since we're late. No, I actually wanted to mention one thing. Earlier, I believe it was yesterday when we went through working groups, we

learned from Dev Anand Teelucksingh that he was going to step down from chairing the Technology Task Force.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Okay. So I have been stepping down from various working groups, but I have chatted with Judith and she assures me that she is well capable in stepping up to do the main chairing activities, so while Judith steps up, while I become busy otherwise, so she will be taking the main chairing duties from TTF and I will still remain as a Co-Chair behind the scenes, so to speak, for a short while. That's it.

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: But I wanted to take the opportunity of you fading slowly becoming busy with another member of the family, "busy," to thank you on behalf of the community for all of the amazing work you've done.

DEV ANAND TEELUCKSINGH: Thank you so very much, and this is a wonderful community. And so now, it's time to relieve the interpreters. This call is now adjourned. Thank you all.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]