
ABU DHABI – ccNSO Members Meeting Day 2 (pt 3)
Wednesday, November 1, 2017 – 14:30 to 15:00 GST
ICANN60 | Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Welcome back, everybody. When we said this was a two-part, if you like, question and answers for nominees, I don't think that anybody expected that we'd start by finishing off the first one which we hadn't finished. But there were a number of very good questions.

Now what I'd like to do as part of planning this particular half hour is can I have a show of cards of how many people have a question that they would like to put to Nigel and Pierre? [Yes], Young-Eum.

[Rolof] is not here. So Rolof has got until Young-Eum finishes her question then. Before she does it, what we'll do then is that I will get the question from Young-Eum, they'll have a minute to answer each question, and then what I'm going to do is invite each of them to make a final statement, and who goes first for that. The trustee quarter will be employed for that as well. So, Young-Eum, go [for it].

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

YOUNG-EUM LEE: Thank you, Debbie. This is Young-Eum. I'm very interested in the concept of diversity but I'm also aware that even though both of you have been a member of this very diverse community, every one of us is very limited in our experience and our frame of mind. But when you're going up to the Board, we're expecting you to represent all of us, so all of the ccs and I am wondering how you are planning or how you believe you can try to address all the... maybe not all but most of the very important issues that the diverse group of the ccs may have, of the issues that this diversity group of ccs may have.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Thank you. Pierre is first up.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Thank you for the questions. I think that for this aspect, the most important thing will be dialog and experience of dialog to achieve all the objectives we have in the diversity sector. And we need to be speaking to all of the parties and taking into account all the differences because we have... in order to reach diversity we need to go through geographic. This is a principle of [inaudible] in the ICANN Board and doing so we reach the –

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Sorry, there's a [inaudible].

NIGEL ROBERTS: Thank you. What I heard from the question is if you're representing all of us, what will you do to actually be able to do so. I use the word listening this morning, listening to everybody, all communities of the community, open to all points of view.

And somebody, again and I won't name drop but it's from this community not anywhere apart, said to me if I was to be successful I should speak less and listen more and I think that is something I should really try to do and that's my aim in fulfilling that question. Thank you.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: The next question is actually [Ross].

[ROSS]: Thank you. Sorry for being late. To both candidates again, what do you think is the most valuable asset that you're bringing personally that is not yet represented in the Board?

NIGEL ROBERTS: I think the answer is the most valuable asset, it's not currently represented on the Board – I know that's the question but it's not currently represented in the Board. There will be a vacancy

and we will be losing something so the most valuable asset is my experience of the ccTLD community.

It's no good taking somebody away who has got experience of the ccTLD community because you need to feel fill that hole and I hope I'll be suitable to fill Mike Silber's shoes.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Okay, thank you. I think that I will be bring 20 years of experience from many sides – from cc, from ccNSO, from GAC, from international organizations, from many places. And this is something that is valuable, I think, for the Board to have somebody who can have different... the capacity to fill and to bring to them that variety of views, and this is something very important and it comes from my rich experience of being in many organizations and stakeholders.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Thank you. Byron.

BYRON HOLLAND: Thank you. As you may have heard, screening of Board members has become something of an issue during this meeting and I have to admit actually unbeknownst to me we were one of the two communities that do not do screening for the Board

members. The vast majority of them are. In fact, the current four Board members who weren't our two and the two from the GNSO just put out a blog that they are going to undergo basic screening like all other Board members.

My question is two-part. Do you agree that that should be the case for our community? And second part of the question, will you be willing to do that even though it's not a requirement as of yet?

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Pierre, do you want to answer both? Thank you.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: I think that we need to go soft because sometimes you don't need to absolutely to scream or things like that to have your point of view to be taken into account and this should be adapted according to the circumstances.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Screen. Screening.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Ah, screening, okay.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: So basically, are you fit for purpose?

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Yeah.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: A warrant to fitness, kind of check of your credibility and honesty?

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: I am okay with that. I am open, totally open—

BYRON HOLLAND: Sorry. To be clear it's the general background checks that all other ICANN Board members must go through and is relatively common on Boards elsewhere as well. So it's a general background check and screening.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Do you want to start again? Do you agree and would you be [here to do it] yourself?

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Yes, I agree completely because we should be transparent. We should be because we serve the community. We cannot be

hiding some parts and serving the community. Everything should be clear, transparent, and there is no problem for me for that.

NIGEL ROBERTS: Byron, I hope you don't mind if I answer it in reverse order. The voluntary background check screening, absolutely no problem, and I'll make that as a commitment now to undergo that myself.

As to do it as a general matter, there are some procedural... I'm also in favor. There are some procedural matters that as we elect our Board members that we need to work out in the order in which you do it because we don't want to have a repeat of the situation whereby somebody wins an election and then Council fails to confirm them and the reputation damage that we get as a result. So it's a question of how do you do it but in both cases, yes.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: It's Pierre and then Jay.

PIERRE: Thank you. I think it has been illustrated just minutes ago just to point where there are two people and one of the people who is talking is not a native English. I think that would be fair to give

him maybe 30 seconds more to speak instead of saying, “You have two minutes,” and you cannot finish your sentence.

I think that diversity starts with that, otherwise I’m going to speak French and the Spanish are going to speak Spanish and the Portuguese are going to speak Portuguese. That was just my point. Thank you.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: I accept that that’s a valid point. I’m not convinced 50% more is justified but I do agree perhaps a little bit of leeway.

Okay, given that Jay’s question was asked by Byron, I’m going flip this coin again and ask Nigel to call this time.

NIGEL ROBERTS: Heads.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: It is heads. Do you want to go first or second?

NIGEL ROBERTS: I’ll go second.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Which means Pierre, would you like to make a statement for the people here as to why you believe you would like them to give you their vote. And to take Pierre's point into account whereas Nigel can have two minutes and [inaudible] two minutes you can have... Oh, two minutes 20 seconds. Now how about that? Just a little bit more. Go for it.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: Thank you very much. I think that here we are at a time where ICANN faces challenges due to the transition with PTI and overcoming issues, and for that it is important that in the ICANN Board, all the diversity of the world should be represented and this could help increase ICANN credibility around the world and it will also help ICANN reach its objective of one world, one Internet. Because if you have this objective and most of the people don't feel that they are represented in the Board, this can lead to some people not to be confident in everything that comes out from that Board.

And it is important also to have people like me that have been through many experiences, not only one. I have been in many activities, many domains, and this is something that makes that I can be useful for the ICANN Board and I can use my talents to represent better your interest inside ICANN Board. Thank you.

NIGEL ROBERTS:

Thank you. Obviously I'm going to say the next thing. I want your vote, please, in this ccNSO election for the Board so that I can keep working to ensure the Board has the necessary knowledge and information to protect the interest of all Internet users including ccTLDs.

Apart from ex-officio directors such your end, the Board members are selected in two ways: NomCom brings in skilled people from outside whilst our ccNSO, the GNSO, the ASO and the ACs, including the [inaudible], each have their own Board members and liaisons.

We need to ensure the ICANN Board has the technical knowledge and experience as well as the knowledge of and connection to the community that is necessary for the Board to be able to do its job effectively and deliberately.

My own story with ICANN started exactly 20 years ago with various international meetings that created ICANN. I've been at the heart of important policy-related and other work, including the FOI that we've done over a number of years to ensure the stable environment that we have today in which ccTLDs can work together.

I was part of each of the ICANN reforms in 2003, 2015 that shaped the ICANN that we have today and our ccNSO.

The thing that resonated at yesterday’s evening’s farewell, and was mentioned by Pierre this morning, is that ICANN is a family. It’s in the nature of families that family members must be ready to take up their responsibilities when the time comes for them to do so.

I’d just like to close these remarks by giving personal thanks for the service of every Board member who has served from the ccNSO, including Chris who starts his final term and Mike who will be leaving the Board though not, I hope, our community on the completion of his term.

Thank you for giving me your support and for casting your vote for me, Nigel Roberts.

DEBBIE MONAHAN:

Thanks Nigel. Well, I’d like to thank both Nigel and Pierre for being prepared to stand themselves on the line to go from [servers] and I appreciate the responses to the many questions that they’ve put and I thank you for putting them to them and so I’d just like to thank them both.

Which leaves us with a little bit of time for five more wonderful people who are to my right here, the Council nominees. As you’re aware, there was one nomination per region so all have been reelected unopposed, which I think is a measure as well is

to the skills and experience and what they're already contributing to Council.

Now I did pose a question to each of them to want to answer, but I've decided instead, given the shortness of time that I would like to offer it straight open to you to ask either... Sorry, I should have actually introduced them all. I know they probably are all familiar to you but Margarita, .cl, Young-Eum from .kr, Katrina Sataki .lv, then you've got Abdalla, .ke, and you've Byron Holland in the .ca.

So does anybody have any questions for any of our Council nominees up here? If not, they don't get away with it because I've got the one that I did actually already send and what I actually asked them to consider. Given you are all existing Councilors prepared to serve another term, what would you say is the value you see the ccNSO Council provides, and how are you going to continue to contribute to it? Margarita, you're the first victim.

MARGARITA VALDES:

Value, right? Okay, perfect. I think diversity is a core value in ccNSO. It's this kind of contribution, the environment that we build every time by mailer list, by the meetings, and normally this organization has a particular characteristic that is very stable in terms of people that are participating in ccNSO.

So normally we are more than colleagues, we are friends. So this is a very good value especially in order to – we can share experiences, way of work, business models or whatever that we need. We are normally able as always to help our colleagues in between or among our community so I think that's the core value.

The ccNSO is a very diverse group of people and the ccNSO Council and the role of the ccNSO Council is to represent the region that the councilor is representing and so I think the very important role of the ccNSO Council is to make sure that the voices within our regions are represented in the ccNSO and within the ICANN community and in general. That is a value that I think is very important and based on my long years within the ICANN and the ccNSO or the ccTLD community, I hope to be able to perform that job to the satisfaction of the members of the AP region.

And just one comment, after having witnessed almost the audit of the two nominees for the Board, I think that it would be better next time if we could have multiple candidates for each region so that we could also go through that very excruciating process. Thank you.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much. Yes, Debbie informed us about this questions she was going to ask and initially I wanted to respond differently but now sitting here with everyone being so serious, I just remembered what Homer Simpson said. He said, “The reason we have elected officials is that we don’t have to think.”

I think that is not the case in our community because no matter what Council does, the community is still thinks and follows the process and always provides feedback. And I think the most important value that Council brings is that we can encourage people to provide this feedback and gather this feedback and implement things to make decisions more efficient and, yes, a better place to be to share. One of the things that we heard during our interaction with the Board is that we are willing to share and I think that is the best value of the community. That is something that I like and I would like to contribute to this sharing and caring culture that we have.

ABDALLA OMARI:

Thank you. At least today I’m with the Chair on the same. Okay, on a serious note, the ccNSO and the Council is a home for ccTLDs. It creates a certain belonging for ccTLDs across the globe and I believe most of you share the same experience in various countries.

When people talk of ICANN in countries, they will look at the ccTLD basically as the representative de facto in various countries and activities will run round the ccTLDs.

Now the importance of the Council is to facilitate policy formulation and our work basically is to ensure that the various managers are involved in the various working groups and ensuring that we have policies which will benefit primarily the ccTLD community and the ICT community at large.

My facilitation into or the reason why I want to get on the Council is to work with my fellow Councilors, especially from my region, to ensure that our ccTLDs within the region participate actively in ccNSO and benefit from the policies and the dynamic activities which go in and also the technical training which is very key. So basically that's my aim on the Council and many others. Thank you.

BYRON HOLLAND:

Thanks. Being at the end of the line, much has been said all of which I would agree with and take not exception to, except maybe the reference to family because we all know we have a crazy uncle somewhere you don't want to invite for dinner so who does that make me, right?

I think what value does the Council provide? I believe it really does provide an important value and that's certainly why I've elected to participate on it or ask to be elected to participate on it over the years.

I think that given we are a policy body, however we often do share expertise and knowledge as well but being that body that occasionally has to vote or determine things, this Council provides a really, I think, representative flavor of the many different cultures, linguistic backgrounds, regional backgrounds, business models of various ccTLDs, scale. Just right here with the five of us you can see the variety across the board, not to mention actual specific expertise, be it technical policy, legal, or otherwise. And I think that the Council as that group is a really good mix of folks that can provide debate on discussions to the issues that we have to face. And I think that is why the Council as it's formulated can offer value to the ccNSO community because no matter what corner you come from, somebody can bring that perspective to the debate and discussion that Council has.

In terms of what I will bring to it, I've been the Chair of a number of groups over the years. As many of you know, I'm past Chair of ccNSO. I believe I've worked hard over the years and contributed in a meaningful way and bring a certain perspective based on my background and based on the organization that I run, and I think that brings value in many of the discussions and debates.

So both between the work that I'm willing to do and the perspective that I can bring, I hope to be able to continue to add value to the Council. Thank you.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Thank you all for that. Given you've heard those comments, does anybody now have a question for any of the five standing for Council. Nigel.

NIGEL ROBERTS: Actually it's not a question. I'd just like to say thank you to all five of you.

PIERRE OUEDRAOGO: I want to congratulate you both and I'm sure that as you seem to have adopted the name of family – I think I have heard it many times – how are you going to increase the bilateral cooperation between the regions.

First of all, what do you think of that? Second, in case you agree, how will you contribute to the growth of the cooperation between regional organizations? Because I think this is very important to help a lot of small registries to cut the gap. They need knowledge. They don't need every time money because sometimes money is available but they need to share experience

and you need to treat some regions specifically. This is the question.

DEBBIE MONAHAN: Thank you. I'm well aware that a number of people need coffee this morning and we're getting very close to the timeframe, so I'm going to ask [Yike] again to actually do a one-minute timeframe and hold up the red card and for everyone to try and think of an answer in one minute, and Byron this time will start them with [inaudible].

BYRON HOLLAND: That's an interesting question. A number of years ago we actually surfaced that question in this group saying should we have a more formalized kind of process to allow that kind of collaboration and cooperation. Actually as a room we elected not to pursue that kind of activity on a formal basis.

That said, I think there's a lot of opportunity on a more individual basis to do that kind of thing and I know for a fact that it does happen across many registries here. I think we can continue to encourage that, I would continue to encourage it, and as far as the registry I work for goes, we do do that. But it is on an ad hoc basis and it's more relationship-based but we as CA absolutely do work with smaller registries, to use your phrase,

and provide input and feedback. Usually technical help is where it happens most often. Sometimes it's marketing and communications but it is ad hoc and one-off and often it's relationship based.

ABDALLA OMARI:

Thank you. I think Byron has explained it. The cooperation I'm looking at is utilizing the regional organization like fTLD, [LAC] fTLD, [CENTR], APTLD. And these meetings usually provide a very good opportunity for that cooperation to happen. So formally and informally usually they happen, like the second week of January .eu will be offering some training for .ke on marketing.

On a registry level like the registry I work for, .ke, the latest project is we are assisting the latest country, South Sudan, to get their delegation of .ss. We have trained their technical team and as we're talking, their servers are now hosted at our place. We are just waiting – oh, thank you. I've seen the red card.

KATRINA SATAKI:

Thank you very much. Thank you for the question. It's really difficult to answer because I think we need to set clear demarcation points where our regional organizations as ccNSO and what each of these organization does.

Regional organizations are [associations] of ccTLDs in that particular region. They come together, they share information, if they wish, they collaborate with other regional organizations and as far as I know, that is the case.

ccNSO on the other hand is an organization within a body within the ICANN structure and it is created by ccTLDs and many ccTLDs are also members of ccNSO and members of regional organizations. But then at the same time there are members who are members of regional organizations not members of ccNSO. They've been of ccNSO and not members of regional organizations.

Regional organizations have observers on the Council but ccNSO cannot tell them what to do. It's up to them.

YOUNG-EUM LEE:

Thank you. Given the limitations that Katrina has just outlined, I think the ccNSO community is a forum where all these regional organizations within the general ccTLD actually come together to try to cooperate and I think that is going on and that has been going on ever since the beginning and that is the reason why we are all here together.

I think one of the words that I heard very frequently within the ccNSO is the word “family” and I think that reflects the

atmosphere under which all of us as the ccTLDs and members of the ccNSO try to get together and cooperate. Thank you.

MARGARITA VALDES:

I could say that collaboration is very important. We currently have collaboration between regional organizations and not necessarily through the Council. As ccTLDs we collaborate with even services between the two organizations, secondary services or things like that that are voluntary, are free paid, for example.

So one thing is that. Secondly, I could say that there is a kind of consortium built by the regional organization so normally they can [inaudible] the information and share all the things that are built or design activities that we can collaborate or we can share information and things like that, normally.

DEBBIE MONAHAN:

Well, I'd like to thank you all for your comments and I'd like to thank everybody out there. I think it's great that people want to put their hand up to be on Council. It is in equal measure a very rewarding and sometimes very frustrating exercise but thank you for doing that.

Now it's a tea break. Back here at 3:15.

[BREAK]

ALIREZA SALEH: So we are about to start the session, the ccTLD new session in 15 minutes. Or now. 15 minutes, sorry, 15 seconds. But now.

Good afternoon, everyone, and thank you, ccNSO, for letting me chair this session. I think that people are still getting the coffee, but we are starting, so I think that because we are running out of time and we don't want to actually keep you more than the expected time, so thank you so much for everyone. My name is Alireza, I am the director of .ir, the IRNIC, ccTLD of Iran. And actually, we have mainly presenter from the regional. So I'm from .fr and .de.

First of all, I hand the microphone to Ahlam to talk about .jo and Ordon, and their experience about what they're doing on the ccTLD. So please, Ahlam.

AHLAM ABU-JADALLAH: This is Ahlam Abu-Jadallah from Jordan, ccTLD manager of .jo and al-Ordon which is the IDN of .jo, Jordan. I'm sorry, I'm a little confused because this is my first ccNSO meeting and my first ICANN meeting also. I will tell a little bit about our ccTLD domain

names. We started the .jo since 1994, and we started with two levels of the .jo. We have the parent level which is .jo, and the other is hierarchy of the .jo, .com.jo, .net.jo, .gov.jo, etc.

We started the IDN of our ccTLD in 2010, and we started accepting requests from clients in order to register their Arabic domain names. The first one was for our king Abdullah [Nactal Ordon] which is for our king Abdullah II, and you can use it and you can browse it over the Internet. We are working in the National Information Technology Center which is the backend registry for our ccTLD for our country, and the NITC is [termed in] 1993 as a center recording every IT information and every IT services in the government of Jordan. We are working there using our basic environment.

That environment consists of six DNS servers. We have one caching server which is used for the public inquiries, and we have another two, primary and secondary DNS services which we're using as forwarder servers. Also, we have another two servers for the authoritative servers, one is a primary and the other is a secondary. The sixth server is the [inaudible] records. We use it for the [BTR] records which is [reverse] records. I'm going to go ahead with the presentation. It's not working.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Can we go to the next slide? The clicker is not working.

AHLAM ABU-JADALLAH: It's not working.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [inaudible]

AHLAM ABU-JADALLAH: Yes.

ALIREZA SALEH: [inaudible] four.

AHLAM ABU-JADALLAH: Yes, it's four. We are trying now in order to manage our domain names, we are trying to promote our Arabic IDN domain names, because still, it's not aware enough in our country and there aren't a lot of people who know about that. So we have a small number of registrations for Arabic domain names which are registered until now. So we talked about that, we still have six domain name servers, one for caching and one primary and one secondary forwarding servers, another two servers for authoritative servers, for domain names which are hosted in our DNS servers.

This is the hierarchy of .jo that we have, the family of our .jo. We have .jo, and it's another second level of domain names. We have some registration policy that we are following in order to register any domain name under the .jo, and we [inaudible] registration for people from Jordan, outside Jordan, which comply with our registration, we'll see. It's not that hard, and it required some [waivers] but it's not hard to fulfill that [waivers.]

These are some statistics about the .jo, about the number of domain names which are registered until now. Unfortunately, we don't have a huge number of domain names, we're sticking with around 4600 domain names, plus minus every year. Meanwhile, the IDN or other big domain names is around 300 domain names. This is because we don't have a lot of awareness, a lot of people who know about Arabic domain names and how they can use it. We are trying our exercise in order to promote these domain names and to make some policies in order to make it easy for people to register it, even for free. For those people who have [inaudible] domain name under .jo, they can have a free domain name under .al-Ordon. These statistics are not the latest information, but you can find more information about .jo on our website which is domain.jo.

Our working environment, we are working using [duo] model to our model, which is registry, registrar. Unfortunately, we don't have registry, registrar models. We don't have registrars, we

directly work with registrants. There is a mistake in that slide. Anyway, now we are using DNS and IDN system which is in-house built. Unfortunately, the frontend and backend are separated, so the end user or the registrant using the application in order to register his domain name and make any modification, but he cannot do that over the backend servers. We used to do that manually because of security, and even to make sure that everything is going in the right way because of lack of the awareness of some of the users who are using the domain names until now.

We are using [inaudible] version nine command line, but it's safe enough, and since we haven't a lot of domain names, it's not a lot of headache for me and my team in order to manage those domain names. For our DNS, Arabic DNS or Latin DNS, we have a lot of plans and we are working on them. The first plan that we are trying to move to registry-registrar model. We are starting to get some proof of concept from big companies from Jordan and outside Jordan in order to find the best solution, the best practice solution in order to apply it in Jordan. At the same time, we are having our RFP document which will have a lot of features and a lot of specifications that we need in order to apply it in Jordan.

Still now we're in the [inaudible] version, and we are trying to [inaudible] the RFP document by end of November. So by the

beginning of the new year, we will apply a new model which is registry-registrar model, Insha’Allah. That’s it, this is a very brief about .jo and .al-Ordon, and this is our website, domain.jo which is in English and [inaudible] or IDN.jo which is for our Arabic domain names. Any questions?

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you, Ahlam, for the updates regarding the .jo registration. So while I’m having [inaudible] M&Ms, is there any question from the –

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [Yes.]

ALIREZA SALEH: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I noticed in your presentation that the renewal rate for the IDN domain names is much lower than the other renewals which are very high. Do you have any explanation for that?

AHLAM ABU-JADALLAH: Yes. The IDN is still very new in Jordan, even we launched it in 2010, but there’s no promotion about it among the community,

technical community or even the business community, so a lot of people didn't know anything about IDN or our Arabic domain names. Once I came to the team, me and my team started working on that, and now we are working with some entities which have a lot of partners and a lot of clients who started to register Arabic domain names.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you. And I have also one question regarding the IDN. I would like to know, do you support any kind of variance mechanism to actually protecting the [inaudible] IDN domain names?

AHLAM ABU-JADALLAH:

Yes. Until now, no. We don't have any variance mechanism that we are using because we are working manually, so we're trying to do that with a customer. He has to determine which variant of the word that he wants. Otherwise, no. We didn't have any variant mechanism.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Okay. Thank you so much, Ahlam, for the presentation. Is there any other question for Ahlam?

Okay, so we are now moving to the next presenter, who is Raed from SaudiNIC and he's going to give us some updates regarding the .sa registry.

RAED ALFAYEZ:

Thanks, Ali. Hello, everyone. My name is Raed Alfayez, I'm Director of SaudiNIC which is the registry for .sa and .saudia, we call them the Saudi TLDs. Okay, thank you.

So this is the agenda. I'll give a brief introduction about SaudiNIC and benefits of Saudi domain names and some statistics, then I will go over some of the new developments that we have achieved in the last year, and also what's coming for us, what are the new things or new big steps that we are going to introduce.

So SaudiNIC, as I told, is administrating the domain name space under .sa since 1995, and .saudia since 2010. We are operated by semi-government organization which is Communication and Information Technology Commission. We coordinate with the regional international bodies to protect and communicate our local community needs. We are leading and supporting Arabic domain names and we have 15 years of experience.

What are the benefits of Saudi domain names? Well, we try to make the Saudi domain names as trusted as possible, so we

want the Saudi domain names to be the best choice for our customers. We have done that by – we check the identity for the registrant, and we have restricted rules for that, and we make sure that the rules are matched. And also, we check that there should be a relationship between the domain name and the registrant. And we verify the local admin presence by his local address, and we send an SMS for his local mobile phone for registering a domain name or modifying, or even creating an account on our website.

So we try to make it durable by making the registration so fast, it's semi-instant registration. We have it up to ten minutes, so you can register a domain name with us within 10 minutes if your request comes within the business hours, and our domains don't have any phishing, so we verify that, and because we check the relation and the papers, we check everything. And of course, still now, it is free.

We have more than 50,000 domain names registered up to the end of September, and mostly, it is under .com.sa. .sa is growing gradually, and we have the IDN comes at the third level. We have 2361 Arabic domain names and 416 variants enabled. One of the important latest achievements was enabling DNSSEC at operational level in our registry, so we enabled it under .sa and .saudia this year on 22 June this year, and we have done many awareness sessions starting October 2015 we have three-day

training course attended by 25 participants. And in May this year, we have done a training course and a public event. The training course was attended by 41 participants from government agencies and from ICT telecom providers and ISPs. And we have a one-day public event after the training course immediately. There were 120 participants from all over the country.

This is the ISOC DNS deployment map. It shows that Saudi Arabia is one of the first in the region to be fully operational. These are images from the key generation ceremony. We have a room dedicated for that, and procedures, and they already presented the two presentations: one in the Tech Day about the DNSSEC achievement, and one in the DNSSEC event in the room next to us. This is from the training session. The one to the right was the first one from 2015, the one to the left with more attendees was this year.

This is the public event images from the public event. The second achievements that we have related to Arabic internationalized domain names is we were the first to publish a language table in the region in the new IANA format, RFC7940, which is an xml that describes what are the codepoints in the registry. And we also publish the report that captures all of our experience for the past 15 years, and we give it like a gift for any registry who wants to start to have a TLD in Arabic domain

name, and what they should consider, what are the principles. We put it like a principle. It's a very good document, I encourage everyone to take a look at it and share it with other participants and registries.

We are participating heavily in the taskforce of Arabic script IDNs, and we have participated also before in [inaudible]. Anything related to Arabic language or Arabic script, we try to participate with our experience.

This is the first page of the report, and the left side is the IANA xml format that describes what are the codepoints of the Arabic language. We have expanded our Anycast footprint, and we now have seven secondaries: five in Saudi Arabia distributed in three cities, and two outside Saudi Arabia with around 150 Anycast through two different Anycast providers. All of them support IPv4, IPv6 and DNSSEC. And here is the footprint for our nameservers around the world. The red ones are the secondaries, and the green are the Anycast nodes.

We have developed an EPP in-house solution. It's one of its kind, it fully supports Arabic domain names and Arabic requirements, Arabic variants. It's compatible with EPP RFCs. It's open source, so we use an open source tool for that, and it is built by Saudi engineers. All of the code was written by Saudi engineers, and each server can handle up to 100 transactions per second. And

when I say 100 transactions, it's registration transactions. It's [every] transaction. Also, it's easy to add a new extension and a new business need, and it has a web interface for the registry and for the registrant. It's ready to be bundled with any registrar system, and there are so many other features, it's difficult to list. But this is just a summary of them.

So what's next for SaudiNIC? Actually, we are waiting for the telecom law to be updated to give us the right to introduce fees and introduce registrars, and of course the most important thing, we can [rely] on alternative dispute resolution process. Because we believe that we cannot stop the manual process unless we have a very solid and fast dispute resolution. Once that is done and the authority is given to us, we will start hopefully implementing it.

That's it from me, and thank you very much.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you, Raed, for the presentation. Is there any question for Raed? Okay, so I have one myself, actually. You talked about the book that you published about the Arabic domain names. Does this book only talk about the Arabic language using the Arabic script, or are you just covering all the languages that [inaudible]. Because Arabic script, actually there are many languages that are using Arabic script, and Arabic language is one of those

languages. So sometimes for the users who are not very familiar with this term, maybe they have this issue to actually understand that the Arabic language is part of the Arabic script, so there are also other languages speaking Arabic.

RAED ALFAYEZ:

Yes, in the IANA, it's only the Arabic language, but in the report that I have pointed to, there are languages for the well-known Arabic language script like Arabic of course, Urdu, Farsi, Pashto and other, maybe six seven languages that are available online, and we can communicate with the language experts and try to define what are the codepoints, what are the variants from their point of view, and we are still waiting for the Arabic taskforce to finalize the work, then we can integrate it with them.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you so much, Raed. You actually said that 15 years, I clearly remember that 15 years ago, we were talking about the Arabic [inaudible]. The technology hasn't been changed since then, but actually, we cannot see [inaudible]. And every time that we have a session, we are just expecting that something happens. First ASRWG, then Arabic [inaudible] then after that, now we're waiting for the [TFIDN] [inaudible] to happen. So I hope that the IDNs happen soon and we can have some real IDN into the DNS.

RAED ALFAYEZ:

That’s why we published the report. We believe if something is wrong, at least the knowledge is captured, and someone can benefit from it. Especially for new gTLDs. If they want to register a TLD in Arabic, they can benefit, it’s a free consultation for them. They can benefit from the material that we have collected in the report. It will tell them if they support this language, what shall they do. Even if they want to support for example the [inaudible] we put how they can do it in a safe way, and even with the hyphen as a word separator. So there are some things very deep technical and some things very high level. We really tried to put all of our expertise in one document and share it with the community.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you, Raed. I think that [inaudible] registry very advanced into the IDN, because I think that the application providers really need to do something. I think that recently, DENIC did some work to actually migrate from IDNA 2003 to [inaudible] and put the code into that that actually supports the [inaudible] some transition characters including the [inaudible] and I think that Safari also supports that, but still, I think that we are missing at least some major browsers to support the IDNs and IDN 2008. But I think that this is mandatory according to the ICANN that

actually all registries support IDN 2008. So I think that one of the characters that actually affect Arabic script which is the [ZWNJ,] it's zero-width non-joiner space. [inaudible] search it on Google if you don't know it already and see that, but it's the same character like hyphen in English world or in Arabic.

Now we are moving to the next presenter, Emilie from .fr, and she will talk about helping small enterprises to evaluate and improve their online presence.

EMILIE TURBAT:

Thank you. My name is Emilie Turbat from AFNIC, the .fr registry, and I'm going to share some marketing experience with you today. I'm going to talk to you about the new step of our marketing campaign. We are having a marketing campaign called Succeed With .fr. That is running since 2014. This campaign is targeting small businesses – very small businesses, actually – and with this campaign, we stopped talking about domain names only.

We now give advice to small businesses to help them go online and improve their online presence. For example, we give them tips regarding SEO and we give even more tips than ones about online presence. We can give tips regarding the legal framework changes and compliance, for example. We give advice regarding the customer advice tools and rules on the Internet. Of course,

we give advice about GDPR, also regarding invoice rules, for example, and also regarding digital transformation in general.

And within this campaign, we just launched a new initiative which is called Succeed With The Web. So what is Succeed With The Web? Basically, it is a survey that was inspired by the New Zealand Digital Journey. We have a dedicated website that was launched at the end of September and which is linked to the Succeed With .fr campaign, and it is for us a new service that is a new step in our online presence campaign in France. So this is a free and simple online diagnosis tool, and it helps small businesses to evaluate the maturity of their online presence.

So Succeed With The Web is, as I said, one survey that has three themes. The first one is online presence. The second, online visibility and reputation, and the third one is business development. It takes only ten minutes to do the survey for small businesses. With this survey we do not address the digital transformation topic in its globality, we just focus on some aspect of digital transformation. We are focused on online presence, so we ask questions such as, “Do you have a website? Do you use a domain name? Do you buy adverts to promote your websites? Do you do ecommerce and so on?”

So what are the benefits of this survey for the recipients? At the end of the survey, they get a personal score, so the maturity

score, and with this score they get a comparison with the average score of their business sector, because at the beginning of the survey, we asked them to let us know in which business sector we belong. Then we give them tips and advice, and we direct them to our general campaign. The first feedback we have from respondents is that it is very simple, and that they understand all the questions and it makes sense for them.

What are the benefits for us, AFNIC? Of course, it helps us boost a three-year-old marketing campaign, and we get closer to our targets. We reinforce our expertise, and thanks to that, we got contacted by specialist press that addresses specific business sectors such as construction, for example, and we will collect a lot of relevant data for us that we will analyze, and we will provide a first analysis of the survey results to our members in the first quarter of next year.

With this initiative, with this survey, we are looking for partners. One of the goals of the survey for us is to have new partners, and we are looking especially for business sectors association to help us get relevant data from specific business sectors, for example, like taxis association or bakeries association, small businesses association so we get to know them better. So we offer those partners a free service and help them to understand better their own targets. So far, we got many contacts from potential partners, and at the time when there is a realization in

France that small businesses really need to go online to grow, our initiative is really interesting many business associations.

We launched the survey on September 22nd. We already have two signed partnerships, and we have many more that are in discussions right now. At the time when I prepared the presentation, we had about 500 respondents, and we are close to 1000 now, so we get a great amount of relevant respondents every day. Also thanks to the survey, last week we received an invitation to speak at a very important SME conference in Paris, a conference that even our new French prime minister attended, so we had the occasion to speak directly to small businesses and get their live feedback regarding our survey. Thanks to that initiative, we will be able to be part of many conferences and really to get a better understanding of what small businesses are looking for to go online. Also, we have been quoted in many publications, and we are even used as far as in French Polynesia, so we are really proud of this.

Do you have questions?

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you, Emilie, for the presentation. Is there any question for Emilie? Do we have a question or a departure? Yes, we have a question.

NKEM NWEKE: I want to understand something. What was the key reason for this survey? I understood that by saying that you no longer campaign only on domain names. Was it to achieve growth in the domain name industry, or what was the key reason for the survey?

EMILIE TURBAT: Of course, our main goal as a registry is to have more and more .fr names that are registered, but not only registered but also used by the registrants. And in trying to achieve that main objective as a registry, we tried to understand why people, why entrepreneurs will buy a domain name. And we realized that what was really interesting to them was just learning how to go online, and their main preoccupation was first to go online, and then that's why we realized that the domain name is a key topic when you go online, but it's not the first one to the small businesses. They first want to know how to go online and what the best practices are. And within those best practices, then of course we speak about having a domain name and how to choose the correct extension, the relevant extension for your business and everything. Did I answer your question?

NKEM NWEKE: Yes, but are you beginning to achieve that?

EMILIE TURBAT: Sorry?

NKEM NWEKE: Are you beginning to achieve letting them embrace your domain names?

EMILIE TURBAT: We have a very nice growth this year for .fr. I think it's the result of many things, and for sure, it's also the result of our marketing campaign because we are analyzing all the registrations, and we saw that we have an increasing number of small business registrants, which to us means that we successfully targeted small businesses.

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you. Is there any other question? We still have time, if there is any. No?

Okay, so now we are moving to our next presenter, Jörg, and he will give us a presentation about the authentication and single sign-on based on domain names. I think it's called SSO sometimes in the ICANN world. Okay, go ahead, Jörg.

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: Hello, everyone. Actually, I do not want to talk too much about SSO and all that kind of stuff, so not from typically from the technical side, but basically why we are undertaking that project is because we do want to boost domain name registration. So that is something that could be of interest for all of us.

Well, first, a disclaimer: the ones from you who attended the CENTR meeting – [inaudible] is laughing already.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: I certainly changed the slides so there's something new to discover, and whoever figured out what it is, it gets a domain ID for free for trial. Alright.

Well, so how can we help this guy to remember his password? Ariel? No, obviously, we can't. And remember his password even if he hasn't been visiting his website for quite some time. So probably one solution could be, and that is depicted that you use a password manager. What we've shown here is [inaudible] you manage a number of Post-Its and you put them on your vest, and this is the way how you remember passwords.

Well, probably not the very smartest solution you can think of. A maybe even smarter solution could be that you're using the same password for every web service you are going to attend. Good idea? Well, we know better. But then even if we choose to do so, it could be problematic, because different web services do require different passwords, so even if you want to do that, you just simply can't.

So for sure, a single sign-on solution would be the one you would favor to have that problem solved. So basically, a single set of credentials, usernames and passwords you use for all the web services you do want to attend, and for that, for sure you would need an authority, someone you can trust and who's providing the credentials to all the web services you do want to access.

Well, single sign-on services and solutions, we're not the first ones to provide one. And to be more precise, there are already existing single sign-on solutions for the web available. One, for example, is officially government-provided so-called IEDS which even provides a guarantee, a strong identity, a legal grounding for e-identification. But then it happens to be that it's very hard to obtain. There's a lot of bureaucracy involved, and most of the time, that is just overkill to get it, and for sure you can't be [anonym]. So that identity really provides your real-life identity. It resembles it.

So there are other single sign-on solutions, and most of you are really familiar with those single sign-on solutions. Facebook for one, and Google providing solutions like that, but I think it's very clear where the obstacles over here lie. First of all, those services are branded by the top service provider. Then you are subject to change of terms and conditions, and for sure you are paying with your data. Each time you log in, your data has been analyzed and it's been used by Facebook, Google and the like.

Very interesting picture. So there is obviously “the” solution, what I call “the” solution, and “the” solution is open, free and private. And sometimes, it appears it's almost a half solution, but it's supposed to be the real solution that is called domain name as of now. So now you can even see it.

So this real solution, what do I mean with that, and why are we providing it? We're providing it because it's just in line with the DENIC strategy. We do want to be committed intrinsically to an open, secure and stable Internet, and this is what we feel we would provide with the solution of domain ID.

So more into the details, how does it work? Basically, we have four different actors, and on my way, I'm already introducing the formal technology, because this is all based on open standards. As I said, it's an open solution, and we are basing it on open standards. These open standards use a different terminology.

Basically, what we are having is we are having the user, we are having a so-called relying party which is the web service you do want to log on to, then we have the identity authority that's the one identity that keeps your credentials, keeps your password, and then we have something that seems to be a little bit more artificial, and that is called an identity agent that is typically a registrar, and that is for sure somebody who's a face to the customer, or is supposed to be the fact to the customer, and that's the identity that is really managing data that you are providing and you do want to provide to a web service.

Okay, I think I kind of got stuck, because this was supposed to be animated. As it is not, I'll try to just guide you through. Basically, on your left hand side what the user does is he provides an identifier, so that is the domain ID which is typically a hostname, and that has been transported to a webshop, the webshop you do want to log in. The next thing that is – do we have a pointer or something? Oh, there we go.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I'll use the other one. I'll turn this one off.

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: Alright. This is going to get an impromptu show here. Well, no. Yes. There we go. So the only thing you see right now is my head, right?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: Okay. I'll do it that way. Okay. So user provides the domain ID that has been received – no, I don't want to try it again. Thanks. That is received by the webshop, and then something specific happens, and that is deviating from the standard. And that is that by evaluating the domain ID, there's a call been made to the DNS. And within the DNS, the address of the identity authority has been discovered, and the identity of the identity agent has been discovered. Once we know that, for example, DENIC is the identity authority, then the request to log in has been relayed to the identity authority, and what happens over there is that if you already logged into this webshop, nothing really happens and your credentials that you gave are being evaluated, and the process is going on.

If you are recognized by a cookie because you've already been to that web service, there's not even a need to enter a password or any other credentials, even though by the way that could not

only be a password but it could be a two-factor authentication as well. So if you provide a password and the password is okay, then what happens is you get an okay, and then there's something else happening that's a little bit diverting from the standard. Because what the webshop then can do is he refers to the identity agent. And remember that is the one – the registrar for example who is really holding data values that you provide to the agent and that you can consent to relay to the webshop or that you can not consent to relay to the webshop.

So you not only get a login, but what you do get as well is a number of additional data where you can explicitly say, “Yes, I do want to transfer them to the webshop” or “I do not want to transfer them to the webshop.” So the webshop gets the okay, the webshop gets the additional data, and then for sure, login is completed and you're online.

So how does that work on a screenshot level? Last time on the CENTR meeting I tried to give a live demo. It didn't really work out, so this time I've got screenshots for you. Back? Yes, okay.

So first, before we go to the screenshots, let me just once again iterate what the intrinsic basic features of a domain ID really are. For sure it's based on open standards like, for example, DNS, DNSSEC. We do use ACME as a protocol, and we do use DANE as a protocol as well. Then it's federated in a way that is a real

distributed solution where not only, for example, DENIC can be an identity or authority providing the look of credentials, but it could be as .uk registry, .sa, you name it. Every registry, for example, could easily implement such an identity authority. For sure it's free, because even you yourself – and we will provide code repositories, you will be able to host and to implement service as well, and for sure it's owned and completely controlled by you. You've got privacy, you've got the right to handle your data.

So now, let's move on to this demo set of screen shots. There's a shop that has been set up, and this is the relying party we want to access. And if I would keyed that into the browser, the next thing that would happen is that I do get a login screen from that web service, and over there you see that you could log in with a traditional username and password, but what you could do as well is just key in your domain ID, and that's typically something that resembles a hostname. My domain ID is schweiger.denic.de. Then I would click "Sign in with domain ID," and then I would end in a web interface of the identity authority.

And here, I would have to key in my secret, my password for this domain ID if not recognized by a cookie for that web service. Otherwise, there wouldn't be a need of keying in that password once again.

And then as I've been trying to show you before, there's a data management component associated to it as well. Over here, you see the data management component of the identity authority. And I hope you can read that, because maybe kind of small. But basically, what you could do is you could click on certain what they call claims, so there are data fields you do want to provide your web service with, like name, subject, and even further than that, you can also relay a reason why you would relay that data from the data agent to the webshop.

You can do all other stuff like the next time you log in to the same client, you could easily just click on "Remember my logins," and then all these data lists will not be showing up again, you do not have to click them again, they will just be relayed to the service. And then this is just the application I just logged into, and over here you would see that all the data that you clicked on, that you wanted to be transferred from the identity agent to the webshop would be available over here, and nothing more and nothing less.

I hope that this looked quite easy, because it actually is, and what this slide is supposed to do, it's clearly [inaudible] and we're not going to it arrow by arrow, but what it does intend to show really is that behind the scenes, domain ID is really a lot more complex than just keying in a domain ID and getting to the

web service to see what you do want to log in. So there's loads of stuff going on behind the scenes.

So to wrap it up, what are the advantages, what is in for domain ID? I think for registries, it could mean domain name registration grows, because you do need a domain name to get a domain ID, right? You remember that there was a call to the DNS to your domain name to figure out what the identity authority was and what the identity agent was, so clearly, there are domains involved. No e-mail addresses, even though we could cater for them as well. But the real intent is your customer for login purposes do get a domain.

Then for registrars, there could surely be yet another revenue stream. So what the registrars could do, they could offer a domain ID as part of a bundle, for example a hosting service combined with logon service, and for sure you would provide your customers with a value proposition, because as said under registrant and user, the user does have data control anytime, anywhere, just like that, out of the box.

And for the future to come, we could more or less easily enhance the solution to become something that could really legally verify your identity so that further on, payment functions or signing function could be possible as well.

So, how do you get your domain ID? Well, register a domain name, configure it for domain ID, set up the resource records that are needed, manage your domain ID portal, and there's a lot of papers you can refer to, a whitepaper giving all the technical details and some URLs that you could use just to play around with the shop. That's more or less it.

And there's just one thing I do want to mention, and that is, well, where's the problem? And the problem really is that it's a model that as it is federated needs people who are really participating in it. And for us, it's really easy to set up an identity authority, but then we would need a lot of agents, a lot of registrars who want to sell that product, and for sure we need a lot of relying parties, webshops who want to engage in the same mechanisms as well. And that is kind of the problem, and that is actually the next step we are trying to perform. We want to set up a foundation that gathers parties who want to be part of domain ID, who want to be providing domain ID as a relying party or as an agent, say, as a registrar. With that, I'm done.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you, Jörg, for the presentation, and also working on all the exercises that you did. So, is there any question from Jörg?
[inaudible]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Hello, my name is [inaudible] from SaudiNIC. My questions is, is there a standard to be an authentication authority? I forgot what's the name. Instead of – I want to be the authentication authority, not agent.

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: If you want to be the identification authority, you can do so. You can go ahead and become one, just like DENIC is. We are on our way to provide a repository with code, and as I said, it's all going to be open. It's not completely implemented yet, we are working on that, but once we've done all the work and once we set up a jurisdictional framework around that so that we can share code that we are not in any legal liability and all that stuff you need to build around, but after that, you can use it and you can become an identity authority as well.

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you. We have also other question. Please.

IRINA DANIELIA: Hi. Thank you for the presentation. I think I recall a presentation from a product which sounds to be quite similar from .cz. Kind of MojeID probably the name is. So I wonder if you have looked at similar projects, products, and what are the similarities and

differences from what you are introducing comparing to the other?

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: Yes, I do know there had been what I would call as well a similar initiative, but I think they do slightly differ. I'm not in a position right now to enumerate the differences, but we can do that afterwards.

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you, and I think that this is the last question, because we are running out of time. Please.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I have a question too.

JAROMIR TALIR: Hello. Jaromir Talir from CZ.NIC. We are doing that. I actually like the project very much. [inaudible] I've created domain ID, so it works. I suggest to anybody to test it. I feel that it's a great opportunity for collaboration even between registries and registrars across the countries, for example. We've already talked with [Marcos] from DENIC that there are some ways we can collaborate together between DENIC and CZ.NIC in this way. So I like it. My question is, do you plan to use it for your own

services as well? I guess that the DENIC will have some registry portal or registrar portal and things like this. So will you allow authenticate via domain ID in your services?

That's one question, and second, how about your registrars? Do you already have some promise that they will use it?

JÖRG SCHWEIGER:

To address the second question first because I got that one right – I'm not sure that I got the first one right – we did for sure inform our registrars, and most of our registrars by the way are our members as we are organized and constituted as a cooperative. So we invited them to join the show, and we do have at least one partner right now who already implemented with us the first steps of the solution. We are heavily looking for other ones. As I said, that exactly is part of the problem, and I think we haven't sufficiently addressed the problem yet, because we are not in the current phase of providing easy access to code repositories. We are not in the phase of the project where we can easily point out what the benefits really are. We are not in a part of the project where we can just drop a 95% solution to one of our members and say, "Okay, use it that way." But this is what we intend to do, and I'm pretty sure that our registrars are going to like it.

JAROMIR TALIR: The first question was that you as DENIC definitely have some online services towards registrars, maybe registrants. If you will allow authentication via domain ID in these services.

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: That would truly make sense, won't it?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Excuse me, I have a question too. Hello, I'm here. [inaudible]

ALIREZA SALEH: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Okay. I would like to know the challenges in bringing online service providers, and whether you have got financial institutions signed up to this kind of thing. I'm saying my worry is how to explain to online service providers, the stores, to come and sign up. Because this is like a multi-stakeholder engagement. From your experience so far, have you got financial institutions like banks signing up? Apart from merchant stores to buy goods and services.

JÖRG SCHWEIGER: Well, for sure we wish that we would not only have each and every web service you can think of, but banks and others as well. As I said, there are two steps in the project: one is providing domain ID as an identity that is anonymous. The second step would be to have something that is validated and verifiable. We're not in that phase now, and we're not even as far as that we could hand over a list of relying parties, say, webshops that are currently offering or supporting domain ID. That is something on the to-do list. Outreach is the key task that we need to perform from now onwards.

[JAROMIR TALIR]: We do use standard protocols, like I said. OpenID Connect, we use DANE, we use DNSSEC, we use ACME, and we divert from the protocols a bit, and this is why [Marcos] already provided a draft to the IETF to come up with a formal standard that perfects the one that we've been implementing.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I asked the question because if a webshop would use domain ID, it's quite likely that they will use or would accept other IDs as well, for instance Facebook, Google, or your German formal government ID if that is possible to use it in the private sector, and it would mean that the webshop would need an identity broker. So kind of a portal where all different kinds of IDs can be

used, which at the other end gives access to your services, and such brokers only work with standard EID protocols like [inaudible] So if you would use another protocol than that, this would mean that it would be expensive for the party that makes the broker – we own one, as you know – to adapt the system to your identity. So if you use different protocols, this might be a threshold for a webshop, because the broker would probably not quickly be adapted to work with you or EID. Am I making myself clear? Okay.

JÖRG SCHWEIGER:

You made yourself clear. I do have to admit that we haven't thought about brokers yet. So in an ideal world – yes, we can talk between the two of us, but in an ideal world, there would be just a couple of solutions, and I think that is probably the most likely outcome on the market anyhow. But there could be the need of a broker, I just do not know by now.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you so much, and since we are running out of time, I'm just moving to [Olusegun Akano] and he's talking about the panacea of the growing strength.ng ccTLD.

[OLUSEGUN AKANO]: Okay. The PowerPoint. Yes, good afternoon. My name is [Olusegun Akano]. I'm representing NiRA, the Nigeria Internet Registration Association. We're looking at the stakeholder engagement, the panacea to growing a strong .ng ccTLD brand. The .ng Internet registry was founded in 2005, so we're about 12 years old now. We operate 3-R model and we follow multi-stakeholder model.

NiRA stakeholder engagement entails strategic and structured approach, identification of stakeholders, target their communication for effective stakeholder engagement, and consensus-based decision making, openness, inclusiveness, transparency, accountability and diversity. The stakeholder engagement is essential to the growth of the .ng ccTLD brand [has been.]

NiRA has integrated stakeholder engagement as an institutional priority within the operations, policy and branding of the .ng ccTLD. Embedding stakeholder engagement, NiRA as first step joined the development of sustainable solution.

This diagram shows the parties involved. In terms of governance and policy development, awareness and marketing, corporate social responsibility, technical advancement and targeted communication. These are all the people that are very important to the growth of .ng.

So governance and policy development. This is the chart. Policy formulation. Stakeholders are concerted in the development in NiRA's policy. NiRA policy development process, we call it PDP. NiRA Dispute Resolution Policy and Cybercrime Act of 2015. That's the diagram that shows how decision-making process flows depending on whether it's urgent or not.

And governance and policy, major decision-making process involves stakeholders in the activities and processes. Relations in particular, constitution development and review registry policies. Building and maintaining constructive relationship with stakeholders over time. Government Nigeria Internet Policy Development, and then NiRA general assembly and committees. We always hold a general assembly once a year, and we have committees responsible for different tasks which I showed earlier as per social responsibility, advocacy and targeted communication.

So improving the process of obtaining quality stakeholder engagement. We have a membership Board, and every member pays a token annually, just to prove that you are committed to the affairs of NiRA. And then we do road shows and synthetization. Of recent, we did change to .gov.ng, and in that campaign, we made it mandatory that every government staff must have an e-mail address in the name of .gov.ng routed through [inaudible]. So this really gave us a lot of mileage as per

every officer of government now using the [inaudible] e-mails again. And by this, we are getting a lot of enhancement in terms of brand for .ng.

Targeted communication strategy, communication policy document. The Secretariat engages with the stakeholders. The 3-R model of operation is enforced, and then assessments of the effectiveness of communication and adjust accordingly.

So awareness and marketing. NiRA stakeholder engagement comprises many activities, including formation dissemination education, consultation and panel discussions. Active participation at seminars, exhibitions, conferences, engagement and collaboration. Effective stakeholder engagement ensures that stakeholders are properly engaged concerning the .ng brand.

NIRA promotes development of stakeholder through training and synthetization program. We have a media college, promotes awareness and meaningful participation. Encourage engagement through transparent and efficient consultation of process, contribute to national acceptance, usage and stability of the .ng domain name.

And then we develop the Internet community through continuous engagement, collaboration. For instance, AFRINIC is held in Lagos this November, towards the end of November, and

we are inviting all of you to come and join us in AFRINIC in Lagos. Signed MoU with AFRINIC in January 2017 to develop and certify skills in INRM and IPv6 in Nigeria. Signed MoU with KeNIC on registry operations. Partnership for AFRINIC IPv6 and by now, we are also talking to South Africa so that we can have a lot of expansion in collaboration with the African countries.

Previous other activities, participation at ICANN, IGF. IGF is Internet Governance Forum which is very active in Nigeria. Technical advancement, technical committee representing the view of stakeholders. We have technology advancement in terms of registrar forum, registry and reseller training, research and development activity, plans for DNSSEC implementation and IPv6 development.

Promote competition and choice for registrants and other users. Bottom-up technical policy-making and decision-making. Forum for multi-stakeholder, bottom-up development, participation open to all. Legitimacy determined by open participation and the value of the contribution. Consensus-based decision-making. Corporation coordination.

Corporate social responsibility. These are the three arms we have. We have NiRA academy, we have Ndukwe Kalu Foundation. Kalu used to be our [inaudible] president. He's late now, but in his memory, we've instituted the foundation. This

foundation is [carrying] our CSR activities. And then we have NiRA e-library.

NiRA successes so far include creating, maintaining business values, strong institution, efficient and efficient registry, robust policies, acceptance of the .ng brand, resulting growth of strong .ng ccTLD. Growth in number of domains. Now we do double what we used to do last year, so it's like every year we are doubling. Active engagement the DNS and ICT ecosystem in Nigeria, government participation, point of reference for Africa ccTLDs. Now we've been having some requests from our brothers in Africa to come and show and share our ideas on how we have done so far with .ng.

In conclusion, effective stakeholder engagement has been instrumental in the completion of important initiatives designed to achieve NIRA's organizational mission. NiRA benefits from enhanced stakeholder engagement. With every decision, we take into account the needs and expectations of our stakeholders. We thank you very much for listening. Good evening.

ALIREZA SALEH:

Thank you for the presentation. Do we have any question? Okay, thank you.

So the next presenter is myself. I'm going to talk about – I'm [inaudible] announcing the news that actually, we are approaching the one million domain names at the .ir registry, so actually, as the moderator of this session, I'm just taking advantage of that and actually squeezed myself in for ten minutes. I thought that I have lots of time to do that, but now because you were diverting from the protocols, actually I just have five minutes, but it's okay.

My name is Alireza, I am the Director of .ir ccTLD. And if I can have the – actually, it's just a bit of the history about the .ir. We started in 1994, the IRNIC is part of the academic network and still we are part of the Institute for Research in Fundamental Sciences.

Okay. We are the academic, and we are part of the Institute for Research in Fundamental Sciences. So basically, we are the academic and we started in 1994. Actually, in April 1994, we start .ir. At that time, the registration was only accepted under [ac.ircoor and net]. And then in I guess 2001, we actually have some very restricted registration under .ir directly. In December 2003, we actually adopted the UDRP, and then we just opened the .ir registration. At that time, we just have 2000 domain names on the .ir.

In July 2004, we involved the private sector, A.K.A. resellers, and then they started promoting .ir. In September 2008, we reached 100,000 domain names under .ir, and now, just two, three days ago when I was preparing this presentation, it was not very [inaudible]. I think that I was the last person [inaudible] presentation. We had about 900,000 domain names.

Actually, currently the registration on .ir is open, and everyone can register a .ir domain name, and there is a UDRP in place, and WIPO is one of the resolution providers. Local court is another one. So we're also providing services under these eight third-level registrations, and for these registrations, basically you need to prove the positive ID. So you have to send a positive ID if you want to get one of these domain names.

The main growth factors for achieving this milestone is the [liberalization] of the domain name registry [root corporation,] the private sector, government, telecom support, because they are supporting .ir domain names, we are mainly using the .ir domain names. Increase the ecommerce and Internet penetration in a country, and finally the end user trust in both legal and technical. Actually, we adopted different kinds of tools to actually prove that they can trust .ir in both terms, technically and legally.

The thing that we need to do – and actually, we are planning for that – is signing .ir zone. We’re still working on that. One of the reasons that we haven’t done it yet is because we thought that probably the amount of effort that we should put is relatively high, and actually the benefit is relatively low. But it’s now in a high priority, and we’re going to sign it. Currently, we only have the resellers, although we have the EPP system, it’s compliance with the RFC. But we are actually thinking about migrating from registry reseller to the registry, registrar model.

And finally, the IDN. Actually, we have IDN since 2010, and we are in the root and you can actually access. We have about 4000 IDN domain names registered, but we haven’t yet publicized it. So basically, we are now waiting for some developments, because at that time we were operating under IDNA 2003, but now we have IDNA 2008, and we have some domains registered based on the IDNA 2003. And also, we need some migration program or migration schema that actually we can move from IDNA 2003 to IDNA 2008.

That’s supposed to be our website address in IDN, but it’s just domainregistration.iran, and thank you so much for listening. And if there’s any question, please. It seems that there is no question. Actually, you have? Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I have a question. I saw from your figures September 2008, you had 100,000, and now you have 925,000. How did you get the magic?

ALIREZA SALEH: Actually, we didn't get the magic. We thought that for the last recent years, the penetration of the IDN also – globally, everything under [IT] is growing rapidly fast, and because we are about 8 million people, I think still the ratio is low, but I mean that we actually accelerated, and I think that that was one of the reasons.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's massive.

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you. I think that for the last recent years, we were one of the fastest-growing ccTLDs according to the CENTR and APTLD reports. Actually, we are in the middle, so we are a member of both parties.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Great.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: I have [question.] ac.ir stands for what?

ALIREZA SALEH: It's for academics, so that the universities basically can get the ac.ir.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Academics, universities and schools?

ALIREZA SALEH: No, the school is sch. The school itself, they have the sch. So actually, sch for the schools, id for individuals and ac for academics. And just we're migrating .or to .org to be more meaningful.

No other question? Actually, I have a question to myself because actually I introduced myself, so I think I just failed to ask a question myself, why I give the presentation before we are reaching 1 million domain names? Because the next meeting happens in Puerto Rico, and I think that me and my other Iranian friends may not be able to get there, so we thought we take a chance. And if we wait for the meeting after that, I think that the news will be expired. So we thought that this is the last chance that we can actually announce that we are reaching the 1 million domain names.

So before I wrap up and actually finish the session, since we are in the region, again we take the advantage. My friend Bashar from .kw, he actually wanted to announce that they have some – that they’re just reorganizing the .kw for Kuwait. So I just invite Bashar to give us something, just talk two, three minutes regarding these changes. Thank you.

[BASHAR AL-ABDULHADI]: Thank you, Ali. As-salāmu ‘alaykum. I would like to thank the organizers for allowing me to introduce this announcement. We didn’t prepare any presentation, and this was actually prepared – [inaudible] thank you very much. I just wanted to let you know that we moved from the .kw legacy system to the automated system early this year, and we have officially launched the .kw automation online early October. And when we started this process, it was all challenges to transfer it from the IANA perspective, because both entities were actually taking care of the IT sector. Last week we have finalized IANA, and today we are officially listed. I’m the technical contact on CITRA. The Communication and Information Technology Regulatory Authority is the actual sponsoring organization.

A few bullet points. We completed the transfer of the legacy system as I said early this year, and we have beta launch in March for public, so the automation system [launched] in March.

On October 18th, we have completed the IANA transfer. We introduced the second level for individuals as a new third level domain name registration. We have something similar to DENIC. We have an authentication for individuals to register domain names, authenticating using their national ID. So they have a public – as they call it a digital signature. So whenever somebody registers a [.ind,] .kw, he’s actually authenticated. So we actually care about security.

We have increased the domain names - .kw was delegated in 1992, and all the way until the beginning of the year, there were 4000 domain names registered. Within the past six months, we increased that by 445 domain names, which is almost 10%. In the near future, we’re planning to introduce DNSSEC and signed .kw zone, and lastly, we’re going to introduce the Arabic IDN. We haven’t yet applied for .alkuwait. We’re planning in the near future to offer the .alkuwait, and the second level .kw to be open for not only Kuwait registrants.

So just a few bullet points. I’m available around for any questions. I don’t want to take more time from the session, so if there’s any question regarding how we migrated or how we are integrated using our public authentication ID, you’re more than welcome to approach me. Thank you very much.

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you, Bashar. So before I wrap up the session, I saw Katrina’s name on the [inaudible] to wrap up the session. Because we are now on exactly 4:45, so just I would be more than happy.

KATRINA SATAKI: Thank you very much, Alireza. Thank you very much for interesting presentations to our panelists. And thank you very much to the audience who was here, who listened, who actively participated in discussions. Thanks a lot to our support staff. Please note that very soon – at 5:00 actually in 15 minutes – we will hold a public council face-to-face meeting, so you may stay here and listen what’s hot in our agenda, what we’re going to discuss.

And with that, if you are not interested in council matters, then thank you again for coming here, and see you very soon in Puerto Rico. Our friends from the .pr registry are really waiting for us, and they need our support, so please come to Puerto Rico and show that we are strong when we are all together.

Thank you very much. With that, I will close the meeting and wish you all a safe trip back home. Thank you.

ALIREZA SALEH: Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]