

---

SAN JUAN – ALAC & Regional Leaders: Work Session, Part 9  
Sunday, March 11, 2018 – 15:15 to 16:45 AST  
ICANN61 | San Juan, Puerto Rico

ALAN GREENBERG: Welcome to At-Large Leadership Working Session Number Nine. Eight? No, nine. Mine says nine.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Well, this meeting is off to a grand start.

ALAN GREENBERG: What do I know? That's because I numbered the regional leadership meeting.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Okay, let's start over again.

ALAN GREENBERG: Erase that tape. We'll have a two-minute gap and people years from now will wonder why there was a two-minute gap in the tape. A few of you around the table are old enough to know what I'm talking about, not many though.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

We are now on work session number something. The first item on the agenda is effective reporting, ALAC, RALOs working groups.

The substance of this session is we have places on our Wikis for working group reports, RALO reports, liaison reports. Sometimes they get filled in. When they get filled in, I have little confidence that they get read. What do we do in a better way?

We can have a full-time staff member watching it and sending out annoying notices twice a day if you haven't filled in your report. I doubt if that will be really effective. And it certainly doesn't help things be more effective to actually get read and used and so people are aware of what's going on. Yet, we actually do have working groups that are doing things and it would be useful.

We have RALOs that are doing things occasionally, I think. You tell me are. But, RALO reports are almost nonexistent, at least from time to time.

This is an open brainstorming session. Can we do it better? If so, what do we do and how do we do it? I see a number of hands up already. I believe in order they were Satish, Sebastien. I saw Olivier put his up and then down again. And Eduardo. Satish first.

---

**SATISH BABU:** Thank you, Alan. I've been trying to do the RALO monthly reports, but it's overdue now for the last two or three months. I've been also thinking of this question of are people really reading these reports?

I wonder if ... APRALO has just started a newsletter. Would a newsletter make sense in the context of all the five RALOs composed of the reports that they're making on a monthly basis, plus other events and working groups which might want to add on?

If so, there will be pressure on the RALO chairs to submit their report in time. Thank you.

**ALAN GREENBERG:** Before we continue, how are we going to use whatever comes out of this and not just forget that we had the conversation and have it again in six months? We don't have a flipchart here. We can assign it to a working group to review the recordings. Do we have enough people here that someone can take some notes?

**HEIDI ULLRICH:** We are taking notes.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: Okay. So, we'll have notes taken and attributed so that when we don't understand what it was that Satish said in the notes, we can go back and ask Satish. Next we have Sebastien, I believe.

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you very much. I would like to say that there is a place where we have a report, at least from one area of the world. Knowing everything that they do on Skype, we have a Skype list, the At-Large Skype list. We know that everything about NARALO, about Internet governance. We have many messages. This is a joke, but maybe there are other ways than a Wiki on a report. Maybe there are other ways of having some interactions that would be more interesting. To read a report is not very interesting for most of us today, and there's so much to read that you have to choose what you are going to read.

So, if you have a list of everything we have to read in order to prepare, we have already too much to read, so I don't think those reports are useful. We don't need to write so much. We have to sum up what we do, our jobs, our tweets. Maybe a Skype message. A short Skype message would be a good way of transmitting the information.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Eduardo?

---

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you, Mr. Chair. First thing is what we need this report for. We write them, and for what purpose?

ALAN GREENBERG: I guess we write them on the assumption that everyone wants to read them and will read them.

EDUARDO DIAZ: For example – I’m sorry, can I reply to that?

ALAN GREENBERG: Yes, please.

EDUARDO DIAZ: We record all these meetings to get transcribed. People can come in and read them. Writing a report is not easy, especially if you’re not an English speaker and that’s one more thing to do. If there’s no value in it, then why write them?

ALAN GREENBERG: I think we’re having this discussion because there is some perceived value, but as Sebastien pointed out, a lot of them don’t get read. [inaudible] said that. Yet, if they don’t read the

---

brief report, they're not going to read the transcripts, and that's perhaps outrageous to ask. Next we have Cheryl.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you. Thanks, Alan. As someone who was probably one of the earliest writers of far too detailed reports on activities as ccNSO liaison, I doubt any of the words were ever read other than when they're occasionally put on screen and pointed to at the three times a year meeting. So, yeah, I hear what people are saying.

However, I'm also a passionate believer in some sort of demonstrables in terms of metrics, etc., and I think we have come a long way in terms of accuracy in our recordings, the fact that we now capture chat. There's all sorts of things that we can use to say someone is not only present but present and active in an activity.

Newsletters are useful. However, can I ask you, are any of you particularly impressed with the aspects of our work track four in the subsequent procedures for new gTLDs newsletter outline of what was being discussed yesterday? Because you were all sent that newsletter. No? Sorry, maybe you didn't read that part of the two pages that is for a whole PDP process. Newsletters also fall by the wayside.

---

And guess what? Newsletters go to the people who are already in the involved group, not those we often want to get material out to or are able to be resourced later, as archivable material.

This is a really important question and discussion. I am certainly not going to suggest I have any or all of the answers, but I do think we do need forms of records, forms of self-reporting, forms of mechanisms that we know will probably just fall on deaf ears but sit in little more than a library repository, but only put the appropriate amount of effort into those, considering that we are talking about volunteers.

The other thing I guess in terms of the monthly reports, yes we meet monthly at the monthly meetings, as you pointed out. We'll record it. Is there something to be said for quarterly or even three times a year reporting or bi, half-year, reporting? Is there another formal mechanism of reporting for RALO activities and officer activities that might be more able to be worked on? It may be that you can get things out of a newsletter format and put it into a more [inaudible] one. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. You made a comment about ccNSO reports. I used to do GNSO reports for a bunch of years. Some years I didn't bother. Some years, I did it very diligently. I was very tempted a couple of times, but I must admit I didn't have the nerve to put

---

in a report of a Martian landing during a GNSO meeting or something like that, just to see if anyone would comment on it. But, based on the fact that in all the reports I did over the years, I occasionally did reports, I never got a single question about it. Perhaps one despairs. Maureen?

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Yeah. Despair, Maureen. Yeah, okay, I get it. I'd just like to follow on from Satish. I think the monthly RALO reports could be really, really important. [When we] follow the model of NARALO with the newsletter. We've been really thrilled with the way in which one of our ALSes has actually taken that responsibility on to actually [inaudible] a newsletter that encompasses what the formal [inaudible] roles of our RALO, plus the evolvment of ALSes, which is one of the things. It's that whole engagement and encouraging interesting things that are happening at our region.

Also, that they will, at the end of the year, because we've already established an annual ... We had a yearbook at the end for our GA last year. And discussions with our APRALO members are very keen to have a yearbook. It's a culmination of all the newsletters in one book, which they can access and you can give to anybody that actually tells them about what the RALO has achieved during the year.



---

I think it's all to do with communication. If people get to read about what it is that the RALOs are doing, it's something you can take along and demonstrate exactly what it is that the RALOs are doing. Very interesting.

ALAN GREENBERG:                    John?

JOHN LAPRISE:                    As an accomplished long-form writer, it pains me to say that ... I want to go back to what Maureen said and that is we need to think about communication. We also need to think about who our audiences are. For the people in this room who are deeply engaged in policy and for those people who are outside of this room who are deeply engaged in policy, they are probably overloaded with information. And for them, executive summaries, memoranda for the record, are sufficient for many purposes.

For people in the ALSes who are not so perhaps engaged in core ICANN policy, the newsletter may be a better format for them.

So, I think when we're thinking about this issue, we really need to think about who we're speaking with and who's involved in the conversation. Thank you.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: I think we need to merge this discussion with the one on social media and all reports be limited to 140 characters. Olivier?

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Alan. We've already had this discussion on the secretariat call, I think. The monthly reporting. On the idea of a newsletter, it's a great idea. It's great, but I'm not quite sure it's less work than having to produce a monthly report. I have a problem with people saying, "Well, we don't have time to do a monthly report, but we have time to do a newsletter." I'd ask then perhaps how the NARALO newsletter has been happening. My understanding was it's a significant amount of work to put it together, especially you need to have editorial knowledge. Well, of course Eduardo does this in an hour, but that's a different thing. That was the first thing.

The second this is, but does anybody read those? We don't know if anybody reads those because we haven't actually got any way to track readership of these.

What I do know is ... Okay, let me boast. I'm a very busy person. I'm a very, very, very, very busy person. Many times at ICANN meetings or even outside ICANN, people ask me, "So, what's EURALO up to? What do you guys talk about? What is actually

---

happening at EURALO?” I’m so relieved to be able to tell them, “Check out euralo.org. There’s a link to monthly reports.” This is what we’ve done on a monthly basis.

I think I’d have much more of a problem saying, “Oh, go and read the 222-page transcript of the meetings that have taken place at the last ICANN meeting and the 23-page transcript of the last EURALO call.” I think people, as soon as it’s more than one page, will just switch off. Our EURALO reports are always less than one page. They usually take less than an hour to put together and they’re all up to date.

ALAN GREENBERG: Siri, read the transcript to me. Alberto?

ALBERTO SOTO: Thank you. I’m sorry to be late, but I went to get my [inaudible] to get my per diem funds. Aside from unifying the elections, we should have a single format, and perhaps we can even bring together the secretariat report with what should be published.

I believe we are forgetting one important issue. It’s not only us who should read it, but actually our activity needs to be [well-known] outside. The items report would’ve been different if we had published everything our RALOs have done. I repeat what somebody told me. One of the members told me that if all the

---

RALOs had submitted what LACRALO submitted, we would have broke down many of their arguments for one of the [inaudible] not exist anymore.

I think it's an internal and external thinking at the same time. We need to have a single idea. I [commit] to work on that if you want, but that's the work of the secretariat would be a lot better if we support the secretariat, at least some of us. And if we can put this together so that it is like a newsletter. If somebody wants to deep dive on it, then it can go to the report.

But, we can even publish the links to the reports, so that when they tell you go and see that report, you can go and look for it. If there is no reference, nobody is going to read it. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Ricardo?

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: As a complement to what Ricardo was saying, if we are producing a monthly newsletter, then maybe we should add a summary of the first or second line in the Wiki and then add a link to that newsletter.

---

I think just that would provide the information on both sides. The newsletter is precisely for the members of the ALSes of that RALO or for the end users [inaudible] of that RALO.

Now, if you post the information on the Wiki, we already meet with the requirement of providing the information on our side. So, just providing one or two lines as a summary in the Wiki saying what the monthly newsletter is saying, and then adding the link to the monthly newsletter, I think just that would be covering most of it.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. Eduardo and we are now at about seven minutes before the end of the session.

EDUARDO DIAZ:

I wanted to recommend [inaudible] secretariat reports. If you go there, you see reports from some RALOs from 2016. You know how bad that looks? Some people do it. Some people don't do it. So, why have it there?

I like your idea. Put a link and point them somewhere else. Point it to the NARALO or EURALO website where they have all information about how you can join and what they're about and this and that. That's my personal view. Every RALO is different. Thank you.

---

DANIEL NANGHAKA: I've seen something very interesting that Glenn has posted. I'll just simply read that line. The December click rate, the newsletter had 41 open readers with 27 [inaudible] click rate, which is above the average of 2%. This clearly shows us that if we can be able to add metrics to the newsletters, then within a given period of time, we can be able to assess the impact or the readability of the newsletters.

Just to add on, those of us who have so much passion about the different working groups that we're involved in, however long the article is or the page is or the statement is, we [inaudible] to the detail, which I don't think is the case for newsletters.

For people who are very quick and want something very fast, just to be abreast and get a list and knowledge of what is happening, a newsletter will work for them.

To me, I think the newsletters are relevant, but they should be subject to metrics of their ability within a given [inaudible]. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Is that a new card for either Eduardo or Olivier? Olivier, go ahead.

---

OLIVIER CRÉPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you, Alan. I was just doing a search on my favorite search engine. Is there any plugin for page count on confluence? Confluence is the Wiki system that we use. There is a yes. Apparently, it does exist. So, why don't we enable just page counts on our pages with reports and find out which gets read?

ALAN GREENBERG: One of the problems with that is a lot of our reports are consecutive items on a single page, so that may not solve that problem. Heidi?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. I'm just wondering if what I'm hearing is that, for those RALOs – that would be APRALO and NARALO – that currently have a newsletter, would you like you replace those monthly RALO updates with your newsletter? They're much more comprehensive than a monthly report. And for those other regions, EURALO, you do very well with your monthly reports. There are other regions that need to probably work a little bit more on that. Do we have agreement with that from those RALOs?

---

GLENN MCKNIGHT:

Yeah. Well, everybody does their monthly reports differently. When I do the monthly reports, they're pretty dry and boring. Eduardo, I think it was four years you did the newsletter, right? Three years? He consistently did it. It's a lot of work and it's no wonder nobody wants to do it. We had somebody that stepped up and said, "I'll do it," but for four months they didn't do it. I chased her every month and said, "Can you do it now?" I think she is going to do it the next month.

But, the way that Eduardo worked on it is he wanted news from the trenches. It was an incredible amount of work and very, very few ALSes reported. My last four months have been trying to do newsworthy stuff, which is very different than a monthly report. It's dry and boring, like crackers, but I think it's important to put it somewhere. I'd rather see both, my personal. But, since I have the mic, it's like the Wedding Singer. I go the mic.

I think the video content, there's over 220 video clips and when the onboarding stuff was being done with Dev, I said, "Dev, there's a bunch of stuff that needs to be done we need to capture because some of these voices may not be here." It's important to talk to these people and get the history and information. So, if there's any other little video, one, two, or three-minute video clips that we need to do, let me know and I can volunteer for that.



---

GLENN MCKNIGHT: Eduardo and then Heidi.

ALAN GREENBERG: If you're going to run the queue for me, you have to be correct. Satish, Eduardo, and Heidi.

SATISH BABU: Thank you, Alan. APRALO got into it during the discussions in the [inaudible] when we had lunch, the history project. It is in that line of thought, line of thinking, that we decided to have this monthly newsletter.

Now, ideally, it would be nice, as Alberto mentioned, to link with the requirement of reporting to our At-Large constituencies, which means ALSes, ALS members, but also to the public At-Large about the work done by At-Large.

I wonder if it will be possible for us to put together all the one-page monthly summaries from our five regions, plus a page on ALAC itself. [inaudible] six-page newsletter on a monthly basis. It will be pretty good as a kind of reporting mechanism.

The workload is not trivial. I agree.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: I have Eduardo, Heidi, and me.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Okay. By the way, when I started the newsletter, I didn't expect anyone to read it. I'm serious about it. I remembered this meeting that we had with staff. My main purpose was to get a heartbeat from the region, because you do read the subject of your e-mail, even if you don't read it. That was the main purpose. I wasn't expecting anybody to read it. I knew there were a few that would read it. That was the purpose.

In any case, if the secretariat, like in NARALO, wants to write a report, I don't have a problem. Also, when Glenn is not there and the other secretary doesn't know that much, doesn't feel like the time to do it, then we can put the link.

There is a Wiki page where all the newsletters are, one after the other one. If the purpose is to record what we do, then some of it is there. Thank you.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you, Alan. Just to see if I can summarize this here. The newsletters from APRALO and NARALO are outstanding. I am just so astonished. It's a fantastic quality. I'm wondering if we could somehow get those on to the individual RALO websites because I'm suspecting that most people go to the website, the

---

RALO ones versus the Wiki. So, if we can show that beautiful, glossy and informative newsletters there, highlight them, also print them out and make sure we get some printouts for any kind of outreach in your region or any kind of outreach we do at ICANN meetings, that would be really ideal as well.

Then, Satish's idea of having an At-Large community newsletter is also – [inaudible] newsletter. Even on a quarterly basis or right prior to an ICANN meeting would be really useful to see. I can guarantee we could get them distributed to the various board members and other groups as well. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Alright. Thank you. We've been doing this now for 35 minutes or something like that. Tijani, I see you have your card up. I will ask if you have a very short intervention before I make mine – very, very short.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

As for the newsletters, I think that we had better to what we have to do. The newsletter is good, but it needs a lot of bandwidth, and there is very, very few now. Thank you.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: I have to highlight something that's never happened before. Hadja was going to put up her card. I shook her head no and she didn't. It has never happened before. That's something [inaudible] do it anyway. Thank you. I'm honored.

We've been doing this now for 30-odd minutes and I am intrigued that there's one thing that nobody has said. ICANN produces – different parts of ICANN produce lots of newsletters. As far as I know, they are all done by staff with input from the community. Why do we feel that we are the only ones that have to do it ourselves purely as volunteers? I did not consult with Heidi about staff availability or anything else before having this discussion.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Clearly, you didn't.

ALAN GREENBERG: I really didn't. No, no. I'm rather serious. We have, on a regular basis, said how hard it is to get our volunteers to work and that's true of all volunteers in ICANN. None of us have a vested interest other than our own personal passion in seeing it work. Is this something that is viable? I'm not asking staff right now. I'm asking the community. Is this something we should be investigating?

---

Now, how we do that? Is it new staff? We divert things. Staff stops doing some of the things they're doing right now. We're not going to debate. Is this something we should be pursuing? One of the things you expect of a chair is to go fight for you. Is this one of the things I should be fighting for?

We have two other subjects on this agenda. One is Mario is going to talk to us about ALS and individual relations. Keep your mind out of the gutter, Cheryl. And clarifying ALS decertification. That's a two-minute talk so we can go a few minutes under on that. So, let's go another ten minutes on this topic now that I seem to have generated a queue. Pardon me?

HEIDI ULLRICH: Actually, that question is part of the next discussion, so it'll be a good segue.

ALAN GREENBERG: That's really intriguing. We have a queue. And since I didn't see the order they came up, I'm taking them in order. Heidi, Maureen, Javier, Hadja, and Alberto. Go.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Thank you. On the point of the possibility of staff assisting with the development of a newsletter, I think that's something we

---

can definitely think about and that's really the topic of the next presentation or discussion. However, just of note, the APRALO newsletter has had – the first edition had more click rates than the ICANN newsletter. So, just something to keep in mind.

ALAN GREENBERG: You wouldn't believe how busy Satish was that day. No, no, no. [inaudible] again and again.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: [inaudible] real effort, wasn't it, Satish? Thanks for the work.

ALAN GREENBERG: Maureen?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yes, I was just going to endorse John's comment about the fact why we're actually producing these newsletters. Again, who is your audience? We are targeting these newsletters based on the feedback that we're getting from our members. We're actually talking to them, actually. This is what they're asking for and they want to be involved. If they have involvement in it, that's fine.

I just wanted to add something else. I [inaudible] important. One of the things about ... If we're looking at metrics and how we measure whether people are actually clicking into meetings, the

---

recordings of meetings and things like that, we've always asked about how can we find some way in which we can measure whether people are actually getting into those recordings?

I was just wondering if there was some way in which before they get into the recording, they actually have to sign in. Well, there must be some easy way.

ALAN GREENBERG: My understanding, for all of the things that you have to download, PDFs or things, ICANN does track the number of times they're downloaded. That's what I was told at one point.

MAUREEN HILYARD: But, if we're measuring ALS participation and stuff.

ALAN GREENBERG: Javier?

JAVIER RUA: I like the idea of staff-supported newsletter process, [however it's created]. I say it from a very individual perspective knowing how I work, which is something like this. If Heidi asked me, "Hey, would you write something about this?" I would say, "Sure, 100 words on this topic."

---

So, in the sense that I'm less organized than many people, when I'm asked or voluntold to do something, I tend to react. For me, if it work if there's [inaudible] things to fill out every few weeks or months or a trimester, whatever the timeframe of a newsletter is.

Also, let's write something about privacy, that I would feel the urgency to go look. Okay, so what's going on? And then do the latest thing.

I think that would work, just to fill out a skeleton of a newsletter by voluntelling people. It would create itself. I like it.

ALAN GREENBERG: Hadja?

HADIA ELMINIAMI: I just wanted to state that I fully support having a quarterly newsletter. I think it would be very beneficial to the community and it will also ... Even if it's not in the beginning that beneficial to the community, but it will at least show and highlight ALAC's work and show to the other communities, especially if we are able to have this newsletter before the ICANN meetings and distribute them during the meeting. And of course, yes, I do support the staff helping in that. Thank you.



---

ALAN GREENBERG: I like the idea of staff doing it and we help.

HADIA ELMINIAWI: Definitely.

ALAN GREENBERG: Alberto?

ALBERTO SOTO: I think that this idea of a skeleton is really good. What I can add to that is that we should ask perhaps with our experts here or with someone who professionally may help us, perhaps a journalist, who have knowledge about this so that we can know how many words we need to use. He said 100 words, perhaps 50 words. We need to sum up the information.

The other way of access that we need is that in any ICANN webpage and in social media, we need to have the links to the information or to the place where this information will be posted. I mean, we need to have multiple accesses from many places, even from the social media so that we can get to that report.

And perhaps from one link or from one social media, we can go to one other place. We can discuss that, but multiple access is

---

really important because that will guarantee us that many people will be able to read all the information.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Ali?

ALI ALMESHAL: I like the idea of having the staff helping us in generating the newsletter or, let's say, the [inaudible] itself. The point here is about the content. If we have the content, if the RALO is producing or generating this content, then the staff will be able to help us. But, if we are not generating such content, how would the staff do that? Because they are waiting for us to generate, to write. So, if we go into that direction, then again, the RALO can do it themselves because if they generate the content, it's a basic just [inaudible] them in the standard format and that's it.

We are going in the same circle. It's a help from the staff, but if the RALO is not generating it, then it's useless. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. I'd like to respond to that before I go to Tijani. I think he's the last person in the queue and I think we're going to close the queue now.

---

If I said we should have a report from this meeting, ICANN 61, of what the ALAC and regional leaders discussed, I think that could be assigned to staff, period. Yes, we would have to proofread it and verify that we're comfortable.

There are staff involved in most RALO activities. So, I'm not 100% sure that all of the content has to be created by the RALO. It's content about the RALO, but not necessarily written by the RALO. We have to think about this thing. To what extent does this have to be done by volunteers and to what extent can it be our support staff?

Of course, there are limits to what our support staff can do and we may have to have tradeoffs. But, if we don't try to do it that way, then it does come completely on volunteers. As our experience is, one person is in a job, they do a great job, they get replaced by someone else and it stops happening altogether. It's something to consider. Heidi, please, and then Tijani.

HEIDI ULLRICH: Tijani was first.

ALAN GREENBERG: Okay, Tijani and then Heidi.

---

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: I know you are always against me. You always forget about me.

ALAN GREENBERG: Your name was on my list.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: But, you give the floor to Heidi. Okay.

ALAN GREENBERG: I thought she wanted to rebut what I said.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: No problem. I am joking. It's a joke. Taking the risk to disagree with most of you, I don't want to overload our staff. Let our staff do their reports on time. Let our staff do the work that they have to do properly. If we have that, we are well served. I don't want to overload them and to lose the [inaudible] of the work of the staff. This is the work of journalists. They are not journalists. So, if you want to have a newsletter for ALAC, for At-Large, hire a journalist.

ALAN GREENBERG: No one said we're not talking about that. Heidi?

---

HEIDI ULLRICH:

Yes. Thank you, Alan. I've been chatting with my team here behind the scenes and what we can do is we could say, yes, we will help coordinate a quarterly newsletter for At-Large. We would like to see a template, though, that we would use going forward. Again, the keyword here is coordinate. The idea would be we would reach out to you, ask you to do a story on a particular policy or particular topic.

I like the idea of a meeting report. We do two things. Internally, we do just a very dry update on achievements, what each AC/SO/SG group has achieved. We do that. We've done that ever since ... For years. So, we could find those and post those under the chair report that we've been not doing posting for some time. That's one thing.

Then, we could also do a post-meeting report. We could capture some of the photos that we've taken, some of the events, some of the achievements. I think that would be manageable as well.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Thank you. Evin has your card up. I assume something remote.

EVIN ERDOGDU:

Yes. Thank you, Alan. There are a couple of comments in the chat, which I'll read off.

---

The first one is from Dev. “As a former chair of working groups, it’s also disappointing to feel that monthly working group reports are not being read by At-Large, ALAC, and RALOs. So, I think any updates from ALAC, At-Large working groups need to be shared on one core At-Large newsletter to avoid duplication of effort and with a selection for RALO updates.”

Second comment from him is, “Also, the TTF has come up with suggestions for making At-Large meetings and conference calls accessible on YouTube by livestreaming such calls, which make calls more accessible for mobile users, makes them more shareable on social media, when calls take place. A repository of At-Large work cannot be built up. As it is now, it’s all hidden.”  
Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Alright. Thank you for good conversation. The next item, which I’m told is going to fit well with this, is Mario on my left.

MARIO ALEMAN:

Thank you, Alan. This is Mario Aleman, ICANN staff, for the records. I would actually like to present a few slides that we have brainstormed and thought it would be a great idea to have even actually more feedback from you, from the community. It is important to state that we facilitate the work. We’re open to

---

suggestion on how to collaborate better and how to identify actually what are those ALSes and individual activities and principles. Can we move actually to the next slide, please?

The first one is actually how do coordinate on capacity building? Capacity building as well as part of outreach and engagement activities. Do we have to trade a capacity building [inaudible]? This is just an idea. Do we need actually to promote more on the newsletters what's being done in capacity building?

In this regard, we are very open to suggestions and we could actually make it part of a standardized newsletter template, the capacity building section, since more ALSes are doing more activities than others.

The second one is how to better identify and coordinate ALS and individual activities. We have many activities going around. We have many of the ALSes that are also part of an ISOC chapter and they report actually on their behalf and we would like to learn more. We could also use our social media networks to retweet or repost what they share to us if they can just basically use a hashtag of #atlarge or similar ideas.

Some other thoughts as well. The participation in local and international events. Some of you are attending IGF. Some others are attending regional local events that are part or not part of ICANN and it would be very interesting on how to mix and

---

how to match actually those activities as part of the stakeholder model, as well, and how to share best practices.

So, this point is very important. It is not a suggestion from us, but I'm sure we can all learn how to [inaudible] of an ALS that have been basically deactive and they can take a look to many of the activities and the outreach events that another ALS is doing.

And also, how do we approach the communication with RALO leadership and staff and also individuals and ALSes in general?

I know that some RALO leaderships are having better coordination with their ALSes and we would like to encourage that and then establish the proper channels of communication for [inaudible].

I just want to make an echo on this because every time that we meet during an ICANN meeting, we would like to showcase what you have been doing, and in particular, the local RALOs that are having more exposure to the community. It's great that we have everything together and then we can just basically work on something similar, like Maureen was working, for example, which was the history [the yearbook] and ideas like that.

I'm going to stop on this slide. Perhaps, if there is any questions, that would be great and then we move along to the next one.



---

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you, Cheryl. Two questions. The first one, I didn't understand what you are proposing regarding capacity building. Second point, I think that we are not highlighting sufficiently the engagement of our ALSes on the ground in their country, local. This is the main duty of the ALS is to work with their community, so that they can give the information from ICANN and take the information and bring it to us from that community.

This is not done now. Nobody speaks about it. And they think we are all [inaudible] if we only work here. The main work is with our communities on the ground. And we need to have a way to report it, to have a regular report. This will be one of the metrics of the performance of the ALSes. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Ricardo?

RICARDO HOLMQUIST: I had first one question, but I have now after listening to Tijani, I have two comments. First of all, to Mario. In case of LACRALO, last year what we did for the capacity building session was that

---

they created a [draw] and in the end for those people who were able to participate in the capacity building, they have raffled and the winner was able to go to the office in LA. We did this, but we can do other things. But, this is what we did in LACRALO and I think that this was important for the capacity building sessions because there was an increase in participation.

I don't agree with what Tijani said because the ALSes are working on the countries for a long time and [inaudible] ICANN. We have many things to do and we are doing what we have to do. We are doing many things, not only things related to ICANN.

If I am an ALS, I am not only representing ICANN in my country, I am also working as an ISOC in Venezuela. I am also an ALS at ICANN, but that is another thing. Information comes and goes, but I am not an ICANN member – I mean, I am not an annex of ICANN telling people in my country what they should do or what I did. These are two different things.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Just a point of view. Maritza, did you want to speak? You want to be put in the queue. I'll put you in the queue.

HEIDI ULLRICH: [inaudible] respond to these two and then go on.

---

ALAN GREENBERG: If you want to respond, sure.

HEIDI ULLRICH: I'm going to respond to Tijani's question about the capacity building portal and then Silvia is going to take the comments about the person from the LACRALO region who went to LA. That was a different item there.

On the capacity building portal, this is the idea of having something on either the Wiki and/or the At-Large site where there are all the capacity building items put in a nice way, a very clear way, that's a one-stop shop for capacity building. All the webinars, the COP, PowerPoints, all those activities so there's one type of site. That's what we were talking about. Again, this would not just be for the Capacity Building Working Group but the various RALOs that do now have activities as well.

MARITZA AGUERO: To reply to Ricardo, I would like to comment on the trip that was the incentive given [inaudible]. That was the Latin American and Caribbean region GSE project together with our At-Large community. We had three years of webinars, coordination, with Rodrigo de la Parra and his team and this incentive was funded by the GSE department last year.

---

As you said before, there was a raffle based on participation of members. That was a unique opportunity, and since it was funded by the GSE team, I don't know if that incentive will be provided in the future, but we want to continue with the collaboration with our colleagues from GSE in terms of capacity building. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

Maritza wants to reply to what Silvia just said.

MARITZA AGUERO:

Yes. This has to do with what Silvia did and I'm also answering to Ricardo's comment. When it comes to capacity building, LACRALO performed different webinars, but due to the lack of participation and because of the scheduling of these webinars, we decided together with the GSE team in the Marrakech meeting, we decided to add this to our monthly meetings because, during monthly meetings, we have high participation rates for the region.

So, [inaudible] that was devoted to webinars alone was not able to provide this incentive that was carried out last year, and in the end we established the terms and conditions that was something organized. We did this last year. We still don't know if we're going to continue with this, but this is a way of

---

incentivizing the region by giving them this opportunity so that they can participate and [get trained] in the monthly meetings.

So, it was not just a raffle or something like that. It was not out of the blue, but it was something that was created in a coordinated way. There were terms and conditions to be met. We have a period of time to meet and this was organized with a team and with staff who are always supporting us. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:

15 more minutes left in the entire session with one item that we haven't covered. We have a speaker queue of seven. Can we go to one-minute timers, please? What I have on the list right now is Alan, Daniel, Alfredo, I don't know if Maritza is still in the queue or not. No. Sebastien, Alberto, and Seun. Have I missed anyone? Alright.

My comment is a very quick one. I'll remind you when we were working on the ALS Taskforce, which got put in abeyance because of all of the other work, and then by the review, we had already decided at that point that we would start issuing roughly monthly newsletters to every ALS outlining either what the policy issues were or a policy issue of interest in simple words, translated into appropriate languages and sent out to ALSes with a requirement that they forward it to their users.

---

So, let's presume that unless we change that during the ALS, the At-Large implementation, that that is a decision which will stand and it will be done. So, just factor that in. Next we have Daniel.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: When it comes to outreach and engagement, I agree that there is limited or low engagement.

ALAN GREENBERG: Excuse me, could you take off your headset? That's what's causing the feedback. Thank you.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: When it comes to ALS engagement, there is still low participation between the ALSes together with their respective communities because there is no adequate way of which we can be able to track the community, the response for the communities. Besides that, when there is a call for comments with the different working groups. This is the point whereby we need a wider feedback from all the communities, not necessarily those in the room. But, there is no way that we can be able to track that feedback.

I was just simply, historically, there was the ICANN hubs that were taking place which have been funded by staff. But, all of a

---

sudden, the support, I don't know what happened to it because, at that point, the ALSes could conduct, could carry out the .. Point taken, I think.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Alfredo?

ALFREDO CALDERON: I think, in essence, what we need here is to set a marketing strategy with the social media group, with the staff, and if – you can forgive me. I remember from a prior ICANN that you discussed a social media manager precisely to add all the information of the RALOs, of the ALSes, with hashtags and with specific strategies to try and attract more volunteers to the organization. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you very much. Sebastien?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Thank you. I understand that there's a proposal to put on one page everything, but I have trouble to understand how it's matched with the presentation we get about data management system and the future website because we can do [inaudible] something and the rest of ICANN doing something else.

---

When we talk about capacity building, why don't we put all that in ICANNLearn? We want something that could be useful not just for a few people who are going to our website. Therefore, I think we need to not develop something specific, but to go into the wider ICANN to put our staff who could be useful for us, and the reverse, we can benefit from others. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG:                   Alberto?

ALBERTO SOTO:                   Thank you, Alan. I don't know if Alan has some kind of [inaudible] on the right side because I'm the last one, even though I am the one who will first lift up the name card. Sometimes I just forget what I was going to say or has no relation to what is being said. It's the same as Tijani, I believe.

What I said before is I think this work can be simplified. If we work smart and if we develop what we can call an information form that will reach ALSes, the ALSes that participate, it would be difficult to see all the ALSes participating. So, those participating can send it to the secretariats and the secretariats will send it to staff, so all the work will be more simplified. It will not be just having – everybody will have a single spreadsheet to fill in the information with, and then we can just take some work



---

from staff. The only thing they have to do is consolidate the information that comes from down there and we can work with the bottom-up system.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. Seun?

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you. I am a little bit concerned with the amount of time we're trying to spend in getting reports, getting people to do reports or [inaudible] information, etc.

I'd like to remind us that we are currently doing the working group review. We are [inaudible] various policy working groups. The intention was that people, irrespective of their RALO, to be subscribed to those working groups.

So, I think the [inaudible] is how do we get people to participate more in the policy development process of ICANN. I think that working group may help. I think we should just focus on that and see what comes out of that particular effort before we continue on this other aspect of reporting. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Thank you. My understanding of what we've been discussing is how do we reach people to intrigue them to join a working

---

group, that all of this is a precursor to the working group. We'll turn it over to Mario to summarize or make any further comments.

MARIO ALEMAN:

Thank you. Thank you very much for all your comments. I'd just like to point out basically on any of these strategies [inaudible] that you would like to use. I hear that we could also pose some of our news actually on the ICANNLearn, which would be great. It would be nice if we have consensus on this so that everyone can just be comfortable working on the same platform or whatever you want to call it as an inventory or repository as well.

If we move to the next slide, it is just basically summarizing what we have been discussing before and how to get the word out and what kind of format are we using to capture all of these activities and all of the different initiatives.

Some of them are just basically through the RALO leadership. As Alberto was mentioning, some of the ALSes are reporting directly to the NARALO chair or the secretary. However, how many of these RALOs are constantly active and how many of these are reporting? And if they have the proper onboarding process at the beginning and if they are coordinating the work. So, in that way, we can just make sure that the ICANN staff

---

would be basically the last recipient of what they have been doing.

Another of the format that we have or you have been using before has been the newsletter. These newsletters are a balance of figures, which is great. However, [inaudible] again. If we use a standardized template [inaudible] great. And if you could also suggest any other kind of reporting format, we're open to hear that.

With the monthly report and with the individual and ALS activities, we already discussed that perhaps identifying metrics or different impacts on how this is important for different ALSes.

Reporting tools and social media networks. How many of the ALSes are basically reporting to their RALO leadership and using social media accounts as well of their work? Can we move to the next slide, please?

Basically, last but not least, the communication is very important and we need to figure out as well who is touching base with the ALSes as our end users. If the RALO leadership would like to establish that mechanism and we can also facilitate or also help in this case or if you would like the ALSes to communicate directly with ICANN Org, that would also be another strategy.

---

The ALS local members and some of the RALOs as well might report directly to ICANN staff or they can report directly to RALO leadership.

So, perhaps opening the floor here because this is our last slide, the question on feedback. Basically, the two items that I have just mentioned. The number one would be the format on how to capture the ALS activities. If you prefer to keep it and we could just make an action item to work more and produce a standardized newsletter or we can work together on this.

The second one is how to improve communication between the RALO leadership and the ALSes. So, we are opening the floor for the last questions.

ALAN GREENBERG:

I thought I had given it to you for summary and not for the last questions. We have some comments that apparently were put in the chat earlier. We have Tijani with his hand up. Then, we will have to stop because we end in 15 minutes and there's one other issue to be covered. Evin, please, quickly and then Tijani.

EVIN ERDOGDU:

Thank you. We have two more comments from Dev in the chat. The first is, "A challenge I note is that the participation can get

---

politicized by some RALOs. Some ALSes get promoted while other ALSes are ignored.”

The second is, “I think a consolidated social media feed of ALSes and individual social media accounts can be done to highlight what At-Large community is doing. Once set up, it would not require having staff or RALO leadership having to do it manually. This could be punted to the Social Media Working Group or TTF.”

ALAN GREENBERG:

John does not look pleased that it was punted to him. Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you, Alan. Yes, Mario, for you two points. Yes, to get a mean to record and report on what the ALSes are doing. Yes also to improve the communication tools, the communication ways. I am not talking about [inaudible]. I am talking about the communication. We have to improve the communication strategy.

I would like to emphasize on a very important thing. I don't think that we need to have additional tools, additional investment, additional. We have to make use of what we have. For the capacity building portal, we have ICANNLearn. Why not use it? For the newsletter that you want, I am sure that you will overload everyone and you will not have a good result. Let's

---

make use of the simple tools we have now, the electronic tools. Let's make use of them.

And last point. I never said that the ALSes doesn't have activities on the ground. I said there is no consideration of this activity. There is no record of these activities and we have to take it into account and to make it [inaudible], make it one of the criteria of the performance. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: Cheryl apparently wants the last, last, last word.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Thank you. Tijani, your point there. If I understood Ricardo properly – and I hope I did because it resonates with my views. If we have it incorrect [inaudible].

It is not that the activities of an At-Large Structure relating to ICANN shouldn't be reported. It sounded that you were saying the purpose of an At-Large Structure is as an ICANN conduit in what he was saying, and I certainly agree with him and I suspect Holly will as well, is our At-Large Structures are vastly wider in activity and purpose. The main part of the work we do has nothing to do with ICANN in 99.9% of the time. So, it is not our main purpose at all to cater to this aspect, but it's important that we capture what we do.

ALAN GREENBERG:

But, I'll point out what the ALSes do unrelated to ICANN is interesting, but not necessarily something that we're going to be actively reporting on.

I thank you all. We're stopping this a little bit prematurely because we really are running out of time. May I ask staff to try to put together a very brief summary – not a 12-page report that no one will read – and to the extent that you feel that some of this may be implementable by working with one of our working groups or particular people, talk to the appropriate individuals and see if you can get agreement and move forward. Thank you.

The last item on our agenda is I was asked to refresh from people's minds how it is we decertify ALSes. We have talked a fair amount occasionally recently about ALSes which are defunct or not active at all in our environment. I will just remind you because there seems to have been some confusion.

Decertifying ALSes is an ALAC responsibility. It is the RALO responsibility to identify to us an ALS that they believe needs to be certified and to build the case for why. The rules are, to a large extent, dependent on the RALO's rules themselves. I certainly know for NARALO there are certain rules of how you recognize a defunct ALS. If a RALO does not have such rules, the

---

ALAC I think can certainly provide some guidance as to how we recognize it.

But, it is then the responsibility of the RALO leadership to document this, so that when the ALAC comes to vote on it, they're not just saying yes. If NARALO says we should decertify them, sure. We're taking action. The action is appealable to the board. And we have to take responsibility for that action, so the case has to be documented. But, that is essentially the process.

If anyone still needs guidance, and specifically RALO leadership, I'll be happy to talk to you privately. Thank you.

We are now over this session. I do not believe the ALAC meetings again until tomorrow lunchtime, the At-Large Review. Everyone is welcome, I hope.

CHERYL LANGDON-ORR: Please come.

GISELLA GRUBER: Everyone is more than welcome to that session. Lunch will be served for the ALAC members, the liaisons, and the regional leaders. And to the extent that there is any food left, we will open up the buffet, but again, ALAC members, regional leaders, and liaisons. Thank you. And that is at 12:15 in this room, 102,



---

tomorrow at lunch time. But, please don't forget we start the day with opening ceremony at 9:00 AM. I have sent an e-mail out to the travelers list as well as the ALAC Announce list and you have all other meetings there. Tomorrow evening is the gala. You will get in with your badge, so if you don't have a stamp, don't worry. You will still get in. The shuttles are all displayed on the page for the gala tomorrow evening, so please do take a look at the e-mail I sent around. Thank you.

ALAN GREENBERG: I'll note opening ceremonies are on occasion, boring; on occasion, interesting. I have no idea which this will be.

GISELLA GRUBER: Interesting!

ALAN GREENBERG: On the other hand, it is also the first meeting for the new chair of the board. I think his opening remarks will give us some guidance as to where he wants to see the organization going over the next couple of years.

Thank you, all. See you tomorrow at lunch hour.

---

GISELLA GRUBER: The meeting is now adjourned. However, I'd like to just point out that we now have the cross-community committee on accessibility in room 208 A on level two for one hour. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**