KOBE – At-Large Regional At-Large Organizations (RALO), Global Stakeholder Engagement (GSE) and

Regional Partners Workshop

ΕN

KOBE – At-Large Regional At-Large Organizations (RALO), Global Stakeholder Engagement (GSE) and Regional Partners Workshop Tuesday, March 12, 2019 – 10:30 to 12:00 JST ICANN64 | Kobe, Japan

MAUREEN HILYARD: ... ALAC members and At-Large leadership team. I'd like everyone to be seated at the table if at all possible. Okay, while people are getting themselves organized, I'll get Yesim, somebody, to do some housekeeping, thank you.

GISELLA GRUBER: Good morning and welcome to the session. Just as a kind reminder, we have English, Spanish and French interpretation for this session. We will no doubt have questions in those languages, so if you do not speak all three languages, please do take a headset and prepare yourself for that. In that view, would you please kindly state your names when speaking to allow the interpreters to identify you on the other language channel as well as for the transcription purposes, and also to speak at a clear and reasonable speed to allow for accurate interpretation. If you do wish to ask any questions, please do use your tent cards. Raise them and you will be put in the queue. Thank you very much, and over to you, Maureen.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

ΕN

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you. Thank you, Gisella, and welcome, welcome everyone to this is, which is a first for us. We felt it was a opportunity for everyone in our regions to get an introduction to both partners we have within the regions who are valuable to us for helping us to undertake our outreach and engagement within the regions, and we do have some important partners who many of us have already had MOUs with, and these have been, as I said before, invaluable for supporting the work that we do four outreach and engagement within At-Large.

> The plan is we will have an introduction from Sally Costerton who is charge of the Global Stakeholder Engagement, as well as other things, and then I am going to ask the regional leaders to introduce any partners that they have, who are here, or if they are unable to attend, because I know there are lots of things happening within the ICANN schedule this week, but if they could actually introduce or relay to us who their partners are, within their regions, and then we wanted to break out into the regional groups so that regional teams could work together on and prepare some sort of face-to-face planning on what might be possible for the RALOs with their regional partners. And then we'll have some feedback, and then a wrap-up.

> So, first of all, I would like to introduce Sally, who I'm sure is not unknown to a lot of you, but perhaps, especially as we do have



ΕN

some newcomers, then you might need to introduce yourself. Thank you.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you, Maureen. Thank you and good morning everybody. It's a real pleasure to be here, and to start this new phase, I would say, of the ICANN engagement functions, working with the At-Large group as a whole under Maureen's leadership, and I wanted to put on the record my appreciation for Maureen's partnership with me, directly, since the Barcelona meeting. We've had a whole series of meetings initiated by Maureen to really work on how we can broaden and deepen the quality of the working partnership, not just between ALAC and GSE globally, but more really in the regions.

> I think it is a strong relationship, but it can always be stronger, and I welcome the expansion of that to include the regional partners and not just the ICANN structure. So, thank you for that, I think this will be a very interesting session.

> The first thing, I just want to introduce you to my engagement team, who are, this is like the band behind me. Would you like to stand up, everybody, please? So, this wonderful group of people are, and thank you very much, that's lovely, are representing all our regions, and most of you will know that we actually have



ΕN

more than five engagement leads, and this goes right back to my first year at ICANN which is six years ago now. I can hardly believe it. It became obvious to us, extremely early on that limiting our engagement resources to simply five parts of the world was not going to do you justice, and that we needed to deepen our resources and that's why we have eight engagement heads to map over to the five ALAC regions, but the coordination I think with your model works well, and we can perhaps explore that in the breakout sessions.

What I wanted to do, very quickly, is update you on something quite specific, actually, which is a Capacity Development Survey we've done very recently with the community and it came out of the meeting that we had here, with this group, in Barcelona. And you made a couple of comments which resonated with me, very strongly, and I took them back to my team after the Barcelona meeting, and the first one was about prioritization. I said to you in Barcelona, guys, we are going to have to look at prioritizing, which I think is the word at ICANN this week, the work we're doing with capacity development.

You need to help us understand where should we put our resources? Are there things that we should stop doing? Because, actually, we've not sorted out are there things that we can put



online, and are there things we need to do more of? And, if so, how do blend that?

And the second thing you raised was proactively from this group, what about skill building? That may not have been, and I'm looking at John here because I remember John very clearly raising this, the exact term John used, but he was talking about not knowledge building, which is the type of capacity building we mostly do today, but personal skill building. He made a very powerful comment, saying, look, people come into the At-Large and they don't necessarily come from a corporate background or a government background. They may simply not have acquired core personal skills, such as leading meetings, facilitating consensus, writing policy documents and what can you do, Sally, to help us to acquire those skills?

So, I'm going to take you through the results of our survey very quickly in a minute, and it's very fresh. This is the first time it's been out in public, actually, and there will be a lot more communication about this survey in the next few weeks.

Could I go to the next slide, please? Just very briefly, and I think you all know this, but ICANN has engagement in its mission, and it's part of the core value and commitment, as part of the mission, that we should be able to bring up the world's Internet users to ICANN, and it's very important that we should be able to equip



ΕN

them with the skills that allow them to participate in our policymaking process. And that's where the mandate for capacity development and capacity building for us as a community comes from, straight from the mission.

Next slide, please? So, as I said, we have a global presence and you have my colleagues here with you in the room, and I thought, next slide, please, you might like to know that we have former fellows, six former fellows, and we borrowed Siranush from the Public Responsibility Services team as an extras one, and we have a former GAC member on our team, and we are physically located, the team as a whole, we have feet on the ground in 21 countries. So, it's quite a diverse team.

I don't know how many languages this team speaks. I should probably find out, but it is many, many languages, and some of them, there are two or three members of this team who speak four or five languages, each. So, it is as very diverse group.

Next slide, please? This is where people are based. You can see the map. There is a very close linkage between our engagement team, who are dedicated full-time engagement staff, and our regional offices. It's not an exact map over and it's not intended to be, but I just wanted to mention that to you because I know we've talked about our regional office structure, and of course the role of those offices is to provide ICANN resources closer to you in



regions so that everyone isn't having to liaison with ICANN through Los Angeles.

Next slide, please? You will all know because all of you have been involved in this one way or another, that the content of much of the engagement work comes from you. Each region has been working with a relevant stakeholder engagement lead pretty much since the beginning, so 2013, and so when I say the beginning this is Sally's beginning, 2012 or 2013, on producing a bottom-up engagement strategy which has been contributed to by the multi-stakeholder community in the region.

All of you do this slightly differently. Some have quite formal structures and steering groups and committees, and it's very closely involved with the At-Large structures in the region, as you would expect. Others are more informal and it's more of a consultation process between the org team and the stakeholders in the region, and it's varied over time, but all regions now have strategies where there's been a lot of participation and contribution from the community and that helps us to understand collectively how best to deploy resources, be they people or be they dollars.

Next slide, please? So, here comes the survey. So, I explained what we were doing. It was a very simple online survey. We had an excellent participation rate, actually. I was happy to see that.



ΕN

Could I go to the next slide, please? So, you can see here we can break out, and so this is what you'll see later. You won't see this from me now, but you will see it as we share the results. We can cut the data, not just by region, but also by stakeholder group and also, which is the first time we've done this that I know of, certainly that my team has done this, by whether or not you are already an active member of this community. And what you can see from this slide here on the left is that there are a lot of people who have contributed to this survey who are not currently active in the community.

As we get, and not today, but as we get the analysis more deeply this is going to be a fascinating set of data for all of us, for you, as well as the staff because we will share this with you, and you can use this, as to what is the difference between people's opinions about this before they come to ICANN. So, in a way, it's rather a theoretical question, if you like. And once they're here, once they are participating in the community, what do they want to do differently. This will help us to do that narrowing, that prioritization, of the kind of activities that we're doing.

Next slide, please? So, you can see here, by our traditional breakdown that we had a great contribution from At-Large and I'm sure that doesn't surprise you and thank you very much for everybody that has done that. You can also see here, which I'm



ΕN

happy about, that we have had a contribution to this survey from the whole community, from different stakeholder groups, some that we don't often hear from, and it's really pleasing to see that. It's not huge in some cases, but they are there, and nice even contribution across the regions, as well.

So, I feel, you know, one shouldn't over-claim. One could always have more contribution, you can always have a better dataset, but this is quite a robust set of information, I think.

Next slide, please? We've moved to the right screen, is that correct? Okay, thank you. So, within the At-Large, there, you can see a more detailed breakdown of your own community and who has contributed. I'm happy to see the technical community is pretty active there, as well as the civil society group which perhaps would have been more predictable.

Next slide, please? Right, so what do you want? What does everybody want? Well, specifically, no, this is what At-Large wants, I apologize, and there it is, John, you're absolutely right. Yay! But really interesting because what I haven't done yet, because this is hot off the press, a key thing for me to do is going to be to go through the different communities and say does everybody want this?



ΕN

I mean, I'm not expecting to see such a large demand from other communities, for obvious reasons, but there is demand. It's not just a civil society At-Large kind of a thing. This has uncovered for us something we probably intuited, we probably knew, and one of the actions that I'm taking, and I've been doing it at this meeting, is working with one of our learning and training providers.

I think you know David Kolb, from the Leadership Academy? You know David, we like David, okay, that's good, that's a good start, and David is one of those rare creatures who is both a learning professional and understands the ICANN community. So, he's a statistically tiny person, and we don't have many of those, and my team and I have had quite lengthy discussions with him.

So, basically, he said, okay, what can we take out of the leadership academy in this area and put into an online platform because if we are going to do training around the personal skill building, we can always do this first, face to face, and indeed the Leadership Academy is a very good example of that, but these are not scalable, and this is not going to address the need that you've identified and that comes up very clearly in this survey, and so we have to crack that challenge. Some of that we can build, some of it we can probably bring in from third parties.



ΕN

So, as we move into the next stage of this, please do keep me posted, and my team in the regions, if you see courses, if you see activities that you think, gosh, that organization does this great course online on this issue, do let us know, you know, because we are keen to go and see what's out there and to find and to experiment with this aspect of online learning.

Next slide, please. Now, we also looked, okay, well, what are your second priorities? And you can see here because asked people to do two things. We asked them to prioritize it within the knowledge building tier. So, is it more important to have Internet governance knowledge, or SSR skills? That's the resource prioritization question. That's the nub, that's where we started from. But, also, is it more important to have personal skill building resources or knowledge building resources?

And, I've got to tell you, most people, as you saw in that slide, still want knowledge more than skill building, which doesn't surprise me, and you see that much more dramatically here, and I know I'm running out of time.

MAUREEN HILYARD:

No, Jonathan wants to speak.



ΕN

SALLY COSTERTON: Oh, Jonathan wanted to speak. Oh, I do apologize, Jonathan.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, I'm sorry that you're running out of time. I don't want to take up too much time, but your previous discussion about faceto-face learning not being scalable and trying to put things online, I just wanted to suggest some pause on that notion because I believe that the increase in actual engagement at ICANN is going to be incredibly incremental and won't happen in large numbers, right?

> And so, a lot of the problem that we have is actually a percentage of participation among people that are already regulars within the ICANN community, and so when we talk about skills building and confidence building for engagement we might be better served going after some select motivated few with face-to-face learning rather than doing skills building across a mass of people.

> Because, I think to actually increase our – when you consider the percentage of participation, the number of new people we need to bring into our sphere to increase the participation level would be in the millions, right? And so, the issue is how do we grab the two people that are really going to become engaged, etcetera, and I think those people need a level of focus that's very different than what you're going to get from an online course.



ΕN

- SALLY COSTERTON: Jonathan, thank you for the intervention, it's a really important point. I completely agree with you. So we are not at the stage, and that's a slightly sweeping comment, and I apologize in advance, but from the focus of the engagement team at ICANN, we are not at the stage of looking for the millions. This is not where we are in the lifecycle of ICANN. From a participation standpoint, we are looking at meaningful participation, exactly what you're saying. How do we make sure that pull through, if that's the right word, through our various outreach, all of us collectively, the outreach activities and newcomer programs, that we don't lose people, that we convert them, for the want of a better word, to have the skills that they need? And some of that can be done online, but not all of it. You're quite right, and we have to be quite targeted about how we're supporting people with the right kind of skills and development as we go through that process of mentoring and working in the community.
- JONATHAN ZUCK: I think, if I can follow up just briefly. I think the best use of the online resources, in our context, is probably as a filtering mechanism, and not as a true skills-building mechanism. So having the taste of things, etcetera, that give people a sense of what will confront them and the processes involved, the



ΕN

engagement that's necessary, etcetera, I think will help filter people down to the people that we then need to really put some focused effort into, to get the confidence that they need, etcetera, to participate.

SALLY COSTERTON: I agree, and those of you who were involved in the fellowship program review, again, many of you were, and thank you for that, and that's now done and up and running, but we've switched the use of ICANN then for exactly that purpose, for the introduction and filtering so that we don't bring people in, even to a fellowship program, who in reality don't really understand what we do. They may think that they're applying to be a fellow for something that is not really going to deliver for them, and that is a sure-fire way for to have attrition, once people come through the fellowship program. They get here and they go, I don't, I'm not interested in this stuff, I thought they did something else. So, you're absolutely right, it plays an important role.

Shall I go to the next slide? I think we're nearly there.

MAUREEN HILYARD: You have some people in the queue.



ΕN

SALLY COSTERTON: Oh, there are people in the queue. I'm, apologies. Tijani?

- TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much, and good morning. My name is Tijani, speaking. You are right, we would not spend our time and our money in doing capacity building for people who will not be efficient in the future. I think we have distinguished between two kinds of capacity building, one for people who may become leaders and may become really engaged, and for those people it is a special kind of capacity building. We need the other capacity building for our community members, who don't have the knowledge, who don't have even the time because they have a "day job," so they are not very, very committed, but they need this capacity building to be engaged with us. So, we need to have two tracks, two different tracks. Thank you.
- SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio Salinas Porto speaking. I'm going to speak in Spanish. Sally, it's pleasure to have you here. My name is Sergio Salinas Porto, and I am a member of LACRALO, the Latin American and the Caribbean region. I would like to make a brief point of concern for us when it comes to ICANN Learn, and this is that there are few courses in Spanish, very few courses. So, it is impossible for our community to access those courses. If we take into account the



ΕN

communication, the particular community in LACRALO, only 15 percent do speak English. So, we have a deficiency there because we cannot train our members and leverage knowledge. That's my comment. Thank you.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you. Incredibly important point. So, we are very aware of this. We are very committed to translating courses into our key languages, as fast as we can. It is simply a question of priority – it's just as resource question. It is not a design question. I absolutely understand that if you can't follow a course in your native language, you can't use it. The only thing I would say is that—and which you may not be aware of—when you are in ICANN Learn, there is a little globe at the bottom of the screen, which allows you to, and if you click it, you can pick one of many languages. I forget how many, but tens of different languages, and that will give you instructions.

So, if you are, and this is not saying that we shouldn't have the courses in Spanish, I'm not saying that, but we chose this particular platform because it would help people to navigate courses if they had some English, but preferred to get instructions, receive instructions in their native language, if that makes sense, but this is not a substitute for fully translated courses, and your point is very well taken. Thank you.



ΕN

So, what At-Large is telling us, and indeed the survey as a whole is telling us, is that security, stability and resilience is still the number one priority for capacity development activities at ICANN. Internet governance is the number two, and you can it here, for At-Large. That probably doesn't surprise you, any of you. It would probably slightly worry me if security, stability and resilience was not the number one priority, given that is ICANN's core mission. I'm not being facetious, but you know I think that's good, that's reaffirming, that actually we should stick to our priorities and it does mean when we think about prioritizing resources that we must focus on keeping on, on digging in that area of our training.

The other thing that I can tell you about the choice of the platform we made is that we particularly chose a platform that is suitable for technical training, and it was approved by our technical team, ICANN'S OCTO team, and even David himself was involved in the selection of the platform, David Conrad. Ultimately it has the capability for us to do remote labs. So, some of the capacity development work we do in this area is with, for example, law enforcement authorities, and giving them bespoke face-to-face training about putting in DNSSEC or domain abuse, this kind of an issue, and that has only ever been possible to do, face to face,



up until now. But, in the future, we should be able to use this platform to do that remotely.

And I'm not, again, this is not saying we'll never do face-to-face capacity development. Sometimes it's the only way, but it extends our reach, and it makes it possible for us to, with you and with partnerships with our regional teams, you know, where should we be going? Who needs that input? And these guys behind me, Rodrigos' team in the LAC region, Pierre's team in Africa in particular have been doing an enormous amount of work with this and mixing the face-to-face training with the online materials to make sure that we're reinforcing the knowledge as we go. For the law enforcement and the police departments, this is often new, and they need a combination of hand-holding and follow-up materials.

Next slide, please? We talked about ICANN Learn. I'm a bit ahead of myself, but just to flag the advertisement here, that we've got new courses coming. What I will do, based on the question you made about the Spanish language, I'll come back to Maureen with a note from the ICANN Learn team to just update on the rollout of translated content, as well as the courses, just so that we're up to date with that; we'll give you an update.

So, I hope that, and I think that most of you have used the platform, the new platform is very user-friendly. It's almost like



ΕN

being on a social media site. It's very intuitive. You can collect badges. That might seem like something you're not very interested in, but our research showed us that, especially for younger participants, that it's very motivational. People actually want to feel that they also, if they are students, for example, then have evidence that they are learning, and they can prove that they've taken a course. They can go back to their teachers and they can share that.

Next slide, please? Yes, we talked about that. Now, on of the, just a tiny touch on it, but we might go into it in the breakout groups. We've talked for many years with you about how do we, and I'm going to use the words "train the trainer," and that's a rather formal expression, but there is a lot of potential for us to – and Jonathan I think you were alluding to this earlier in your comments, how do we structure outreach in a sort of a cascade process, that we empower you and the community, and you know we're all doing the same kind of outreach. We use all of the resources that we have available to us.

So, I do want us to keep that issue on our agenda because as we bring more people into our stakeholder groups, then obviously we need to help people to bring a friend and make sure that – not literally, that sounds facetious, but you are equipped with what



ΕN

we're equipped with and that we can all participate in this process together and maximize our access, maximize our time.

Next slide, please? I think most of you are aware of this, but we are – I've got a question, I'm so sorry. Humberto?

HUMBERTO CARRASCO: I am going to speak in Spanish, sorry. Humberto Carrasco speaking. This is something that I wanted to mention before. It is related to Sergio's comment. The thing is that, for ATLAS III, we are [staving] or analyzing different criteria and one of the criteria is course. The courses are in English. So, that means that 75%, at least, we have 75% possibilities less for our people to participate. So, you spoke about giving priority to the topics, and you were talking about priorities. In this case, we need to prioritize in our region, different things.

> I am an ALAC member and I represent the Latin American and the Caribbean region, and this is a relevant topic in our region because it means that many people in our region will not be able to participate because they are not going to be able to participate and attend the meetings. Thank you.

SALLY COSTERTON: Thank you. Now, some of the courses are in Spanish – not just Spanish – and we prioritize the Introduction to ICANN, two courses. So, I'm not being defensive about it. I take your point. As



ΕN

I say, I will come back to you with an updated timetable—I think this is really what you want to know—as to when these courses, which courses will translate, and in what order, and when you're likely to see that. Hi, Jonathan.

JONATHAN ZUCK: I'm going to speak English, sorry. No, I'm embarrassed by my lack of linguistic skills, frankly, so it's all I've got. But speaking of languages, we are in the At-Large just beginning to scratch the surface of trying to understand the barriers that language represents to participation, in policy discussions, because it's not just the skills that John brought up, but you know it's the confidence to communicate ideas and things on calls, to be part of a drafting process, a work group, or something like that. And I was wondering whether your survey had any results that were related to a perception that all of this stuff is happening in English and therefore it would be too difficult for me to participate, or something like that, because I think that's something that we're grappling with, in particular, in At-Large, and I'd be curious if you had some results about that.

SALLY COSTERTON: Now, let me just, I've got Ginny in the room with me, Ginny, are you here? Oh, there you are. So, Ginny is the survey guru, that's



ΕN

why I'm asking Ginny. I don't think we did ask a question about language, but I'm just going to double check with Ginny.

[GINNY JOY-LANDI]: We didn't ask on this particular survey. We kept it just to capacity development, but we did also, in previous surveys have asked what barriers to participation may still exist for some of our communities. The Fellowship Survey did it and Next-Gen has done it as well.

SALLY COSTERTON: So, what was the answer.

GINNY: Oh, so with Fellowship, a lot of that survey came back, and a lot of the answers were regarding language was that it wasn't a large barrier, but the largest barrier was cost.

SALLY COSTERTON: Okay, and of course that's talking to a very specific group, but I think that I view this as an ongoing process. I mean, not literally, but this is such an important part of what we do, our outreach and capacity development, collectively, as a community, it's such an important part of our future, and the efficacy, the discussion



ΕN

we've been having this week about the strategic plan, the hot topic session around the future of the Internet and ICANN's governance, for example. You can't ignore the fact that if you don't have a well-equipped, well-trained, motivated volunteer community, you have a massive problem. So, this is going to continue to be a big priority for us, and the more, as we go through time, we'll drill down.

We won't just update the data, we'll start to add questions. That's a great one to ask, I think language is, and if others think in the sessions, or later, or at any point, we'd really love to know about this in the context of what we do about capacity development, please let us know, and we'll incorporate that. Thank you.

I just wanted to touch very quickly, just to make sure you're all aware, and I think you all are because you get involved in this in your regions, but at ICANN meetings we always create, and we have done it for some time now, create what we call a "space" and APAC space, a Middle East space, and so this is, I was going to say "birds of as feather," but someone in the IETF will tell me it's not at all the same, but a mechanism for regional communities to come together at an ICANN meeting which may not be in their region, to give you a facilitation process, a place where you can pick subjects that matter specifically to your region and it's



ΕN

obviously a multi-stakeholder, it's not done by a stakeholder group, it's done by regional focus.

Next slide, please? So, that was all I had to say on that, so the next steps on the survey, we will be doing some communications, really sharing in more detail some of the subsets of the data and Ginny is working with each of the regional heads to give them what they ask, whatever they think is important. So, if you believe that there are specific aspects of this data that you would like to see, again, have a chat with your regional VP about that because we will provide that. We will do that analysis and share and then Rodrigo or Baher or whoever will be able to come and use that in discussions with you as you're working together on the regional engagement strategies and I really hope, I'd love to get your feedback as you do that, and then we can improve that in the future. Thank you very much.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Sally. We've just got one more question.

Two more.

[YESMIN NAZLAR]:

ICANN 64 COMMUNITY FORUM 64 KOBE 9-14 March 2019

ΕN

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay, well, it's like really, really short please because I'd like to move on.

- [LIANA GUYLSTON]: Thank you, I've [Liana Guylston] from Armenia. This is not a question, just a quick feedback of the ICANN learning that we do use these courses for different schools on Internet governance that we're providing in different countries and regions and this is coming as a selection criteria for those people who are students to come in for this. So this is a really great platform, as you said, for the youngsters. This is very attractive. So, I'm just confirming that this, that we use this. Thank you very much for that.
- MAUREEN HILYARD: I hope you don't mind that I've actually allowed Sally this extra time, but I think in relation to the sorts of discussions that I'd like you to have within your regional breakout sessions, which is going to be a little bit shorter, but I really think it's important that you can, that we look at, within our regions, some sort of feedback to Sally on some of the issues that she's raised.

But what I would like now is for the RALO leaders to, if you have got, I mean apart from the GSE team that's here, if you can just let us know who your regional partners are that you would normally



ΕN

work with, within your regions and introduce anyone that's actually here at the moment. So, if we could start with LACRALO.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Sergio Salinas Porto, speaking for the record. We do work with LACNIC and with some other members such as LACTLD, and we have here Olga Cavalli. She's a GAC representative. She represents Argentina at the GAC. We also have Nacho Estrada. He comes on behalf of LACTLD. There he is. And Olga Cavalli. They are here. Oscars Robles. As you know, he's in charge of LACNIC. He was not able to attend the meeting, but we have a long history when it comes to collaboration. So, it is great to keep on working together.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Satish?

SATISH BABU: Satish Babu, for the record, from APRALO. Apart from the fact that we've been sharing an extremely positive and constructive engagement with the GSE under Jia Rong, and I'd like to thank Jia Rong and his entire team for this. This has been a remarkable change over the last two years, I think, and in fact in APRALO we



ΕN

think we are the best in terms of working with our partners. It's a boast, but –

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: It's a good one.

SATISH BABU: Yeah, and our partners, we have again, with all our partners we share a very good relationship, and here we have Paul, from APNIC. We had Pablo just coming in and going out, so I don't think he's around. Leonardo is going to come for APTLD, and our other partner is .asia. Edmon is also around. He promised he would come, but I don't see him in the room right now. So thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: May I?

SATISH BABU: Yes, please.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Since APRALO is covering, it's a very big region, we do have -

SATISH BABU: Overlap.



EN

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yeah, the overlapping of the regions, except for working with Jia Rong, we also closely work with Baher and now Natalia is coming back to cover Central Asia and Eastern Europe. So, we closely work with them, Save also for the Oceania [and the ASO, see Jia Rong is like] –

MAUREEN HILYARD: Olivier?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Yeah, thank you very much, Maureen. Olivier Crepin-Leblond speaking. So in EURALO, well, we first have that partnership with EuroDIG. We are a EuroDIG partner, the European IGF, and we mentioned that in an earlier meeting today, and that of course puts us in touch with other institutional partners of EuroDIG including the European Broadcasting Union, the Council of Europe, Switch, which is a – what is it? Sorry, BAKOM, which is the Swiss administration, and many others, that you can all find on the site. It also puts us, or rather me, on the EuroDIG board, and I'm glad to also say that another institutional partner, RIPE NCC, is one of the partners that we've actually done a bilateral agreement with an MOU that we signed with them at the meeting in, it was the ICANN meeting in November last year or the year before last year in Abu Dhabi, right? And I could ask Chris



ΕN

Buckridge, who is in the room, to put his hand up. Chris is hiding, right behind me, exactly the opposite. Thank you, Chris. Oh, I can see you in the mirror now, that's good, I can keep a track, a track on you.

We also have signed an MOU with CENTR which is the European ccTLD organization and, in fact, other ccTLDs outside of Europe as well now, as well, with [Paulina Malia], sitting right behind you, so you've got to look at the mirrors over there to see her. See, it's all strategic in Europe, and so she's also here which is really great to see her, and we signed that MOU in November, as well. So, every November we look at doing something and doing nothing for the rest of the year. Sorry, no, doing something, no. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, Olivier. Quite a busy RALO, I do realize. Mohamed?

MOHAMED EL BASHIR: Thank you very much, Maureen. Mohamed El Bashir, AFRALO. We have a very good working relationship with AfriNIC. Alan Barrett is here, a good partner, and we always have a booth at AfriNIC events, and at the African Internet Summit, as well, and we have a signed MOU with AfriNIC. That's very useful, and fTLD, as well, we have a very good working relationship. Barak, who is the ALAC liaison, ccNSO, actually, he is the manager of fTLD, the



ΕN

secretariat, yes. And through Africa we have AFRALO represented in the Steering Committee of .africa, by myself and Tijani, and lastly, yes, we have a very good working relationship with the Africa Engagement team, Pierre and his team, and they are very helpful and supportive, and I think we need more support, and that's what we all push for, and we read that message multiple times, even to the [CEO]. Yes, so in a nutshell, we have a very good working relationship at the regional level. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: NARALO.

ALFREDO CALDERON: Thank you. A few years ago we also wrote an MOU with ARIN, and that we have had general assemblies connected to ARIN meetings, and we're planning to do something like that going in the future because it helps in that relationship between ARIN and the NARALO, which it was very, very – the results from [inaudible] and on, at the same time the ARIN was happening was very effective. Also, with Chris Mondini and the GAC, we have, and he comes every month, on our monthly call, he or [Joe], to tell us what's happening in the region, just because we don't know, from that perspective, and he has been very fruitful. In fact, we have one member that participated in a meeting that was in D.C. that



KOBE – At-Large Regional At-Large Organizations (RALO), Global Stakeholder Engagement (GSE) and

Regional Partners Workshop

ΕN

we didn't know about, and it was very interesting indeed in what was being presented there.

So, we are building that relationship, and I think that it's going very well. Unfortunately, today, we don't have anyone from ARIN here, and this quality that we have in Puerto Rico is kind of interesting because we get numbers from ARIN, but the ccTLD belongs to LACTLD, you know, it's just to let you know. Thank you.

- MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much. Because we're running a little bit short of time, I think what we're going to do is we'll go – oh, sorry, Sergio, first. Sergio, first, Sergio, first.
- SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Thank you, Sergio Salinas Porto. Rodrigo De La Parra. I had forgotten about him and Adrian Carballo, also there from the Southern Governance School, which is the associative part of the LACRALO, so I wanted to leave that on record because, if not, they would have been left out.
- SATISH BABU: Thanks, Maureen, sorry to repeat this round. I'm Satish Babu from APRALO and just to set the record straight, I'd like to mention that we have a very large region, so we do work with, apart from Jia Rong, two others directly, two other vice-presidents, Baher and



ΕN

Save, and also Natalia for the first time, although she covers Russia, because we are going to have the regional IGF in Vladivostok. That's the regional event being held in Russia, so we will also be working with you. So, thanks for all of the support.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you. What we wanted to do with the workshop breakout session was to get the regional teams working together with their regional partners, to start looking at what potentials would be available for partnerships in select running events for the upcoming year. But one of the things that we have also looking at and discussing is general assemblies. We want to start looking at that issue within over the next five years but following Montreal. We haven't even had the summit yet, but we are looking beyond that.

> Following Montreal, we'll be looking at a five-year program, and general assemblies will be run within the regions. So, it would be a good time to be talking to your partners to see when would be an opportune time for, over the next five years, to be looking at when you might be able to run your General Assembly within the region. We do have to stagger them because I'm sure that everyone wanting to run their General Assembly in 2021 is probably not going to go down well with ICANN, so we do have to look a little bit in advance.



ΕN

So, it's something that you can talk to your partners about, if the partners are here, but definitely with your GSE team, anyway, because that would be the best people to help you to coordinate when you actually hold these. But something to think about, and we thought that this would be a good time to be thinking about it now, and if your partners are here, the key partners are here, this is an opportune time to be talking to them, face to face.

YESMIN NAZLAR: You have Olivier and then I think [off mic].

MAUREEN HILYARD: Okay Olivier?

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Maureen. Olivier Crepin-Leblond for the transcript just mentioning, quickly, you might wish to explain what a General Assembly is in the context of a RALO because the majority of the people that are here do not know what is a General Assembly. Is it just a one-hour meeting, a two-hour meeting, what is a General Assembly? Or is that a set of things?



ΕN

- MAUREEN HILYARD: That would be a really a good idea. Seen as you've been involved in very many general assemblies, I think that you would be an ideal person to tell everyone about what a General Assembly is. Thank you!
- OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: Thank you very much, Maureen. So, touché on this one. I'll have to get you back at some point. Thank you, I should have shut my mouth. No, and I'm absolutely glad to share what a General Assembly is. So, it's not just a meeting of all of the At-Large Structures and some individual members of the local RALO (Regional At-Large Organization). It actually is a set of meetings. So, there's the actual General Assembly itself, in the sense of the word, that you have all the administrivia that takes place, and the reviewing of the minutes, and the annual reports, etcetera, etcetera, and then there are a number of other activities for the At-Large Structures and members to effectively learn things about ICANN and about their involvement in the At-Large community.

So, we ship everyone, and so ICANN basically pays for people to be into one location. In the past, these general assemblies have taken place during an ICANN meeting, which meant that it was travel for the whole ICANN week, and we're not looking at perhaps going further than that, but that's of course something



ΕN

the RALOs will have to talk about with their respective regional partners. But that's what a General Assembly is, effectively. Thank you.

- MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you, and I'd like, Eduardo, if you don't mind, and because you have recently had one with one of your partners.
- EDUARDO DIAZ: Do you mean what we did there? Basically, we got together as a group and we did some working and getting some ideas on hot topics for the region. At that point there were times that we're off for people to go to the ARIN meeting and participate in the ARIN meeting, and there were activities where both groups mingled together. So, it was very effective in that way, so effective that later on we invited ARIN to Puerto Rico to do one of the ARIN on the Road shows which brought students and it was one of the biggest ARIN on the Road shows they'd ever had. So, that was a result of that General Assembly. So, it was very effective.
- MAUREEN HILYARD: Alright, okay, so I'd like us to get, you might have to pick up your chairs and take them, but I'd like – the LACRALO team seems to be sort of centered around there, so that's the LAC. We could have



ΕN

APRALO over here. Yeah, APRALO around that lady, AFRALO, EURALO, NARALO. Okay, so if you would like to pick up your chairs and go and/or stand around, it will be about eight minutes. Eight minutes of each of the groups to give as little two-minute summary on – excuse me, excuse me, excuse me – on what you've been discussing. One of the things that we want to do is to get a plan, a proposed plan, of when the GA, isn't that to do with the GA? When the GA might be held by Marrakesh and a confirmed plan by Montreal. That's going to be really important because ICANN has to plan when they're going to hold these general assemblies.

I am going to ask everyone to be quiet while the leaders actually do their presentations.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: QUIET DOWN!

MAUREEN HILYARD: While the leaders do their presentations, and we're going to start with, we're going to start with this group.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Eduardo, our fearless leader.



ΕN

MAUREEN HILYARD: Eduardo.

EDUARDO DIAZ: We're talking about what are we planning to do going forward. In other words, a GA with the GSA, yes,? And one of the things that we talked about here, also, is bringing issue-based ideas for the region so we can coordinate with GSA and us in supporting getting those issues and getting people that know about those issues. I don't know if that's capacity-building, yes, and knowing people that know about that and engage them into ICANN and LACRALO.

CHRIS BUCKRIDGE: Hi, this is Chris, from GSE, can I chime in?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Sorry, just one second while the Spanish interpreter sits down because otherwise there is on Spanish interpretation. Thank you very much.

CHRIS BUCKRIDGE: So, our group very kindly helped brainstorm how to do more issue-based engagement and outreach so that we can partner on



ΕN

doing programming on issue-based—and by issues, it's anything from SSR to consumer protection to multi-stakeholder governance. The data from the survey that we looked at is once source of where the demand is. We'd like to know what the other demand is, and also, we talked about aligning it with the ICANN strategic plan of what the ICANN priorities are because if the At-Large channel can produce more volunteers and participants that are supporting work in these areas, it will strengthen all of ICANN. Thanks.

OLIVIER CREPIN-LEBLOND: It's a good thing it was off, you would not have wanted to hear the expletives. Olivier Crepin-Leblond for the transcript. So, we had a fairly interesting discussion in this part of the world, Europe. We, of course, are two subregions, the Eastern Europe and Western Europe and with a different level of engagement when it comes to our At-Large Structures and the number of members that we have. We have a representative from RIPE and from CENTR. We discussed part of it as being the goal of what we wanted to achieve, but there still needs to be more discussion on that because we are not exactly 100-percent clear of what our end goal is.

Of course, involvement of the Internet end-users in this process is one thing, but that's still a little bit wooly so we're going to follow



ΕN

up on this after this meeting. The thing that we've found, the difficulty we've found with having the GA at a RIPE meeting or a CENTR meeting is that at the RIPE meeting there is an actual fee for attending the meeting, and so whilst waiving the fee for one or two people is okay, more than that starts becoming a little more politically different, and so that's one thing. At CENTR it's a members-only meeting, so then you can't suddenly have a horde of people turning up, irate, not dressed properly and whatever else, not washed, going to these meetings.

So, we'll have to, so what we did find is that EuroDIG and CDIG. EuroDIG is the Western European IGF, or usually sort of based in Western Europe and CDIG is Central European Dialogue on Internet Governance. These are meetings that both organizations are very much involved with as partners and as sponsors, and many of our At-Large Structures also go there, and so these are neutral venues that are also free of charge to attend.

So, we are considering doing this during a EuroDIG, or even better as CDIG. There was some push toward Central and Eastern Europe and it actually came up twice, so maybe a Southeastern European meeting will be the way to go, which will be interesting because that will also synch with some At-Large Structures and members in the APRALO region, and so I can see them being very delighted about this, so there you go. So, that's where we are at



ΕN

the moment and then we'll follow up afterwards. I'm open if any of my colleagues want to add any words to this. They're all behaving, so that's really good, and no I'm not giving you the mic, Joanna, because I know you don't give it back afterwards. No, just kidding. You said so. It's true, okay.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you.

JOANNA KULESZA: Okay, so for the African region we discussed the upcoming events and we talked about the African Internet Summit which is going to be in Kampala, Uganda in June 2019 and we've discussed and we've agreed that we shall have a booth as well as a speaking slot for someone from AFRALO and probably we could talk about our hot topics, and then at the ICANN there we shall also have another speaking slot, the GSE team usually organizes ICANN Day, so we'll also use that opportunity to talk to people, and then there's going to be as YouthCom just before the African Internet to target young people into policy development. So, they'll be trained, and we hope that they will also join the African Internet Summit of Tibet.

So, the other thing we talked about is the ICANN Africa Strategy. I think members requested that we should get an update from the



GSE team, but it's worth noting that a lot of the AFRALO members are part of drafting this strategy.

So, the other thing is ICANN65, we haven't really agreed, but we are thinking maybe we can have a social event, as was said by one of our partners, maybe AfriNIC, and then of course we will have the joint AFRALO African session that we always have at almost every ICANN session and we'll use also that to discuss some few issues of interest.

So, there is also the Africa space which discusses the strategy but also some other topics that may be of interest. And finally, the General Assembly, we think we should plan for the African Internet Summit in 2020. And is there anyone who wants to add anything?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [He will need the headphones, please.] As you know, we are Latin people and we talk a lot and meetings are always so short for us, but what we did was, in a great brainstorming and exchange of proposals, we had some interesting ideas, interaction with governments, which blesses us in the stage of power, working



ΕN

with the ALAC group which is in the framework of the [CPAL] which could introduce us into things associated to webinars for almost all our regional partners who are participating.

On the other hand, with LACTLD we may be working on some webinars and some subjects.

SERGIO SALINAS PORTO: Am I okay?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Also with training subjects, we also intend to have our own assembly in 2020 because we have not had the one since 2014 and it is very important for us to have a face-to-face meeting of all of the regions, so we are trying to see where we can do that, perhaps Cancun, Panama, maybe, as the first attempt on a blank sheet of paper, but this is what came out in this 15 minutes of discussion.

SATISH BABU: Thank you very much, Maureen. This is the Asia-Pacific group. We had about 15 departments here, including GSE, APNIC, APTLD and the community members, and Cheryl kindly chaired the session and here are the findings, or rather the recommendations. There are two options that have emerged as



ΕN

possibilities for the regional meeting of GA. One is the APNIC meeting and the other is the Asia-Pacific Regional IGF, the APrIGF. Both are viable options although they are somewhat different. The APNIC meeting is somewhat more technical. It attracts, apart from the members, a technical kind of community. The regional idea of us can be expected as a very broad kind of audience, so we are still undecided about what would be the best, but currently it is pointing a little towards the regional IGF.

There are some challenges in scheduling such a meeting, partly because we have three or four different regional GSE people involved, vice presidents, and also the calendaring process itself is complex because as Cheryl points out, it may take some time for the ICANN processes of budgeting, etcetera, to kind of bear the fruit, or rather the money. Or we will be raising funds from other sources as well, but this is a factor. So, we think that the least that we can do is around 2022, if not further down.

So, that's it. So in conclusion, most likely the regional, collocated with that, and 2022 seems to be a target date. Thank you.

MAUREEN HILYARD: I think that it's already given Sally and her team something to be looking forward to planning with you and I think that's excellent. The timing is going well. We are going to give Daniel a couple of



ΕN

minutes just to sum everything up, remembering that this is all a part of outreach and engagement, of which he has responsibility. So, he will do a brief wrap-up, and then after that, then we will move the chairs back because there is another group coming in, directly, and it's their lunch that we'll be holding up. So, Daniel?

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Thank you so much. I would like to appreciate our respective regional partners, the GSE staff and all our leaders for coming to this short engagement. I believe, if we had more time, we'd still have to engage more and share more cooperative ideas. And one key thing when to outreach and engagement is that I'm very happy to share that just one of our key strategic objectives of the new outreach and engagement is being affected, which is collaboration with our respective leaders, the GSE staff to mention.

> One of the action points, and so this fits in to my respective cochairs who at least have the information that's been shared is that they'll be required to share at least as one paragraph or one page towards their respective strategies, and this also gives us a very good way of how we are going to be able to dive into the next FY regarding the outreach and engagement activities.



ΕN

And also, I'll just simply reference to the meeting that was held this morning with an update from our liaison to the GSE who we very much appreciate. That is the sharing of calendars and also in this engagement sessions we've seen or partners or our GSE at their respective events that they are going to be involved in with our respective RALOS. I'll just simply highlight a little because I was in the AFRALO group, and they're preparing at ICANN at the African Internet Summit, and they will be sharing at least a session, or a speaking spot whereby they're going to [to a meeting]. This is one of the key examples that shows collaborative engagement.

I wouldn't want to jump so much into the next time, and I'd like to say that thank you once again for this short engagement session. I think other follow-ups will be updated respectively. Back to you, Maureen.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you Daniel and thank you everyone for coming and for participating, and if you wouldn't mind putting the chairs back where you got them from, and make it look a little bit more respectable, I think that Siranush's group would really appreciate that. Thank you.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

