KOBE – At-Large Leadership Policy Workshop 3: Challenges and possible At-Large opportunities regarding Universal Acceptance
Wednesday, March 13, 2019 – 17:00 to 18:30 JST
ICANN64 | Kobe, Japan

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	Are you sure you really want to do this live? Because the people who object are the ones who are going to speak on and on.
UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	No, we just want to call for a consensus to move forward.
MAUREEN HILYARD:	Yeah.
UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	Pardon me?
MAUREEN HILYARD:	We're just going to call for consensus.
UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	So, everyone – oh, wow, that's loud. Everyone, please take your seats around the table.

MAUREEN HILYARD: You're using up Jonathan's time.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We are using up a short amount of Jonathan's time to come back to the issue that we did not finish in the previous session, calling for a sense of the ALAC on a statement as suggested by Hadia and Alan to the Board on the EPDP.

MAUREEN HILYARD: And still to be written.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: And still to be written. This is not a final. This is just a straight vote. This is just a call for a vote. There is not going to be discussion on this. We were just asking whether or not we want them to move forward or not They're going to write a draft, and then we will, at a future point when the draft is done, we will discuss the content, and we'll do the wordsmithing at that point. This is just to get the work started, to be clear, as outlined in the presentation. This is essential. Okay, go ahead Marita.

MARITA MOLL: It's not essential if we're going to discuss it all over again.

EN

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah, we're going to have a wordsmithing talk later. This is just to get the work started on the statements.

MARITA MOLL: Because I was just going to suggest that we left this off by saying Alan said we're reversing a position here, but that's not how I understood that we're reversing a position. We're just not talking about that position.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So, we're going to leave their proposal as is and we'll wordsmith later. So, what I'm asking for, and so first of all, I guess I need – do I have a consensus, or do I need to call a quorum and call for a vote? Consensus on this for Hadia and Alan to move forward on the drafting of a statement to the board, or advice. Thank you Jonathan.

RICARDO DIAZ: Are we going to see this?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: The draft, yes. Ricardo, the draft will be –

RICARDO DIAZ: After –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes, after Hadia and Alan draft the statements, it will be made available to the ALAC for discussion before and will have to go up for a vote by the ALAC before it goes to the board. So, we will have a wordsmithing and discussion of the draft after it's done. So, what we saw before was the rough outline and not the draft. So, they will put together a formal draft, we will then all read it, we will discuss it, and then we will vote on it. So, this is just –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [off mic].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Right, this is, because it's ALAC advice. So, this is just for asking them to move forward on this, to begin the draft.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Eduardo, are you putting your hand up or not?

EDUARDO DIAZ: I'm just curious, why are we reaching consensus on this. I mean, why don't they just go ahead and write it?

EN

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: It's because –

ALAN GREENBERG: Can I answer?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes, please, Alan?

ALAN GREENBERG: Okay, so I'm going to be doing this on my vacation where I'm not supposed to be doing any work. If I'm going to do this, I'd like to have some chance that it's going to go forward and I'm not wasting my time because, yeah, I have better things to do with my life.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: He's taking a sense of the ALAC, that's all. Sebastien?

SEBASTIEN BACHOLLET: Yeah, I think I'd agree with Eduardo, like I'm totally fine with people starting work. Anyone can draft a statement. I appreciate where Alan is coming from, but if we're not talking content, then I don't see why we should vote on this.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Alright.

EDUARDO DIAZ: Yeah, I made a point with regard to part of this, that I do not agree with.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I'm not hearing an opposition here. So, yeah, so I'm calling consensus on this. So, yes, Alan, go ahead. Hadia go ahead on the draft. I'll return it to Maureen and then she can further …

MAUREEN HILYARD: And I'll return it to Jonathan. Would you like to come up here, Jonathan?

JONATHAN ZUCK: I don't know. Thanks everyone. This is the third of our experimental discussions that we started this meeting and have had largely positive feedback about, and we had two different kinds of meetings, previously. One was about an internal discussion that was about trying to reach consensus on a particular topic and one was about sort of brainstorming with help, etcetera, and so Sebastien at one point mentioned that he

EN

liked one better than the other because one felt more interactive and the other felt more like we had people here to lecture to us, right?

So, I welcome that feedback because I want these to be as productive as possible. My conception of that had been let's just get information about people and we'll follow up with the interactive discussion to reach consensus on some of those issues going forward, and I just wanted to put facts in the room instead of what is perpetually a lot of assertions, rhetoric and things like that. But, anyway, so I welcome feedback on those other two meetings we had and how you'd like to improve them, etcetera.

This meeting is meant to be kind of a brainstorm, and it almost doesn't fit exactly under policy either, and so I'm stretching my remit a little bit by scheduling this particular meeting, right? But the idea that has come up a couple of times, it came up with the GAC, etcetera, is it's is there a role as part of our outreach function to make, take advantage of our size and our numbers to help bring about change out there in the world of the Internet. And one area in which that might be possible is in the world of universal acceptance, right?

And just so that we have the vocabulary correct, what we mean by universal acceptance is the idea that if you go out and buy a .photography second-level domain – so, I'm a photographer, I go

get jonathan.photography, and then I decide to go on to the American Airlines site to book a ticket to go take pictures, and the have a field that asks for my email, and I type it in there and they say it's an invalid email, and that's because of the JavaScript that got written in the '90s that never got updated, right?

And so, there are a number of different software apps, the Internet, etcetera, and Don is going to go into more detail on this, that still haven't kind of woken up to the fact that there's now 1200 new domain names, and that has hampered their effectiveness, right? We've created all this choice, but is that choice a legitimate choice if the world of the Internet itself is not actually accepting them, right?

And so that feels like something that's got a real end-user perspective to it. It also feels like a very big problem in that a lot of entities need to hear from a lot of people, perhaps to bring about change, and that's why I thought of the At-Large. So, I'm going to let Don talk to us a little bit about the scope of the problem, and then his thoughts on how we might be helpful, and then I wanted to have a brainstorm about it and see if you guys agree that this is something we might want to take on, or even ask for some money to help take on, etcetera, because it is an important issue to the overall sort of DNS, and it might be

something that we could really showcase something that's special about At-Large which his our numbers.

So, without that, unless you've got any questions, I'm going to hand it over to Don to give us a little bit of an intro. Okay, thank you.

DON HOLLANDER: Gracias. I'm going to speak today in English. It is better and easier for me. My colleague Dennis is recently elected vice-chair of the Universal Acceptance Steering Group. My name is Don Hollander. I'm the secretary general of the Universal Acceptance Steering Group.

Next slide, please? Thanks. So, UA in a nutshell is, this is sort of a more formal statement that you can read. Jonathan's was a better example. So, our goal is that everybody can use whatever email address or a domain name that best identifies their identity in an instant, wherever they might normally use any other.

Next slide, please? So, this is sort of old hat for you. We've gone from a few names to a lot of names including names that aren't in ASCII.

Next slide, please? So, there's lot's more choices. There are no longer two or three characters, they're a little bit longer ASCII, and

they are also no longer static. The list of names in the root are no longer static. They were coming in fast and furious starting in 2010. They slowed down now a little bit and some of them are now actually beginning to fall out, and that's an assumption that developers never considered before. They thought that there was just a fixed list and it wouldn't change.

The other change happened in about 2010 and it's that mailboxes, mailbox names, are no longer just in ASCII.

Next slide, please? So, as Jonathan pointed out with his American Airlines and .photography, they don't always work. So, they don't always work in browsers, so that's improved markedly since we started the project. They don't always, and so it used to be, early on, that the browsers would treat a domain name as a search term because it didn't recognize the top-level domain as being a top-level domain. The display is not always consistent, particularly for IDNs and when people try to enter their email address, which many systems use as unique identifiers, they are often rejected.

We did a study in 2017, only 8% of the top websites, we looked at the top 1,000 websites at the time. We had a sample of about 8 different email addresses and only 8% accepted all of our email addresses as identifiers. We also in that same timeframe looked at the top browsers. Only one of the top browsers accepted all our

use cases, and there's no prizes for guessing which one but it was Internet Explorer.

So, our goal is to make sure that these things do get fixed. So, for those of you that have a computer, or a telephone, or something that has an email client on them, could you send me an email to this address, and we're a couple of slides in, thank.

New slide, and new slide again, and again? Thanks. So, if you've got an email client, just so that you know, this is kōrero which has a macron over the "o" and so for those of you who are using a Mac or an iPhone, you just hold the "o" down a little bit longer and it gives you some choices that a PC is just a little bit different. So, kōrero@ngāpukapuka.nz and while your working to type that in, I'll give you a little bit of a lesson in Māori, the work puka, and I think, is Maureen still here? If she is not, then I can make up whatever story I want. So puka is paper or sheet, puka puka is books, "ngā" with the bar, makes it plural, so this is books.nz, and kōrero is a speaker or a singer, or a storyteller. So, kōrero@ngāpukapuka.nz, and for those of you who don't know, I have a secondhand bookshop in Wellington. So, try and go ahead and send that.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Can you make that bigger?

DON HOLLANDER: I can't make it bigger from here. Yeah, korero, k-o-with a bar over it-re-ro, then an "at" sign and then ngapukapuka, n-g-a with a bar over it, "a" with a bar over it, and then pukapuka, p-u-k-a-p-u-k-a-dot-n-zed. Now, we also have another facility, if you want to see if your email is EAI ready, you can go to uasg.tech/eaicheck.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [off mic].

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [off mic].

DON HOLLANDER: We'll come back, we'll provide lessons in keyboard usage after the break. This is another universal acceptance problem, exactly.

Next slide, please? Next slide, please? Next slide, please? So, besides just doing the right thing because it's the right thing to do, in terms of accepting all domain names and all email addresses, we did a study in 2016 that showed there was $9.8 billion, so nearly $10 billion of additional economic activity that would stem from all domain names and all email addresses, and

we also identified that there would be another few million Internet users that came on just for that.

Next slide, please? So, these are some of the benefits that connecting the next billion Internet users, and better experiences with universal acceptance will result with better experiences for the end-user and reduce support costs and all of those sorts of things. There's better engagement with your cultural community and you will be practicing better computer hygiene by keeping up with standards.

Jonathan, I think that this is a good place to stop. We can talk about some of the things that USG is doing, or we can talk about the USG generally?

JONATHAN ZUCK: Yeah. No, I mean those were good points that talk about the scale of the problem and I guess the other thing that I want to do is put this is a little bit different terminology. Don has mentioned non-ASCII, which is this very sort of scientific way of talking about things like that email address, but in our world, we're often talking about IDNs right, and it's very important to this group that IDNs are successful, and this is one of the barriers to the success of IDNs and that includes their economic success because if I create a new IDN TLD and everybody that signs up for it can't

KOBE – At-Large Leadership Policy Workshop 3: Challenges and possible At-Large opportunities regarding Universal Acceptance

EN

really use it, I probably won't renew it. So, my attempt at making a business out of creating an IDN will fail as a result. So, that's another, and I wanted to just sort of draw a bright line to that particular part of the problem that is of concern, a great concern to this community, as it continues to say.

So, then I guess, in terms of context, what are you doing about it, or what's being done about it now, and then I guess in terms of context, what are you doing about it? Or, what's being done about it now? And then is there something that the At-Large, in particular, could do to help.

DON HOLLANDER: So, we're taking a multi-pronged approach. So, the USG is an Internet Community Initiative that's independent. It is well supported by ICANN, and ICANN provides funding. They provide administrative support, they provide moral support, we're seeing strong support from their GSE team, from the GDD team, particularly the GDD Comm team, the Government Engagement team, and so we're getting very nice support from ICANN.

The USG is working on a number of areas. Our core audience is CIOs, senior technical IT people and their staff and developers. That's who we want to get the message too. We want them to know that the issue exists and start getting their systems ready

KOBE – At-Large Leadership Policy Workshop 3: Challenges and possible At-Large opportunities regarding Universal Acceptance

EN

before they get complaints. So, you go and talk to a CIO about the issue, and this is an elevator pitch issue. They get, they hear the story, there are these new domain names, there are these new email addresses, address structures, and your systems don't accept them, and people are going to start registering these in volume and you're going to be stuck behind the eight ball. We're trying to get them ahead of the curve so that they can get their systems ready.

Their response is, Don, I get that, totally understand it, nobody has ever complained about this issue, ever, before. And that's a bit of a challenge. So, it's a "chicken and egg." We are not focused on reaching out to registrants and the consumers. We're trying to get, raise the issue, with the IT professionals so that they can get their systems UA-ready. And so, we have communication outreach efforts. We have documentation. So, we have quite a plethora of documentation on our website. The website is uasg.tech, and there's a series of options.

So, we have some introductory material for mere mortals, we have some guideline material for CIOs who may have once been technical but aren't anymore. We have technical material for their systems architects and developers. We have some studies, we have case studies, we have lecture notes that people who are teaching first-year introductory computer classes can use for

one-day lectures in universal acceptance and another day a lecture in email address internationalization.

Where ALAC might be –

JONATHAN ZUCK: I'm going to stop you just for a second because I was talking to him. We have a few questions on the floor here, Satish is first.

SATISH BABU: Thank you very much, this is Satish Babu for the record. I co-chaired, together with Edmon the ALAC Working Group on IDNs and we had a fairly interesting session and discussion in the previous session, and I'd like to bring out a couple of points here, although I'm not really sure whether this is the right time in the session to bring this up.

First, it's that I note that there is a little bit of a disconnect when you consider the fact that the USG does not have the end-user, the end-user communities or the end-user community organizations in its list of priorities. You are targeting the technical communities, the companies and so on. That is your primary responsibility if I got you right.

DON HOLLANDER:	So, we are targeting end-user organizations that have IT departments that are providing IT services at a retail level.
SATISH BABU:	Some examples?
JONATHAN ZUCK:	Some examples, like eBay, my local bank, my bookshop who uses an e-commerce platform to sell. So, we're not looking at mass media. So, we're not looking to be in *The New York Times* on the leisure page or the consumer electronics page. Does that, is that clearer.
SATISH BABU:	Alright, so thanks Jonathan for that clarification. So, the point that I was trying to bring out was that we at At-Large, we have a presence with the end-users of all kinds, not just the ones we mentioned, but also an ordinary user on the street. There is potential, I feel, for us to help you, especially since the Kobe meeting is focused on IDNs and USG, and what Jonathan was trying to bring out is exactly this, that what is the role of such organizations like ALAC in promoting because we all now share the common concern that this is important for us, particularly for the Asia-Pacific region, but not only, because we have a friend

from Europe who is actually kind of raising this issue as well, and what can At-Large do for the USG?

So, I would like to flag this is a very cold outcome of this session, if we can get to some concrete actionable items. And, secondly, I just will very quickly point out that some of the languages like tonal languages like Tai or Chinese have difficulty in expressing their words in any other language but their own. It's impossible for them to have any representation in English, and sometimes the meanings are totally kind of off. You write something and it will turn out with something else.

So, IDNs are actually very essential for those language where they can't, where there is no equal representation in English that we can use. So, I would again repeat that, for our region, and the country that I'm coming from, India, which has got about 15 scripts, this is an extremely important area where we can contribute. Thank you very much.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Ricardo?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Holly –

ICANN 64
COMMUNITY FORUM
KOBE
9–14 March 2019

JONATHAN ZUCK:	Oh, she put her card down, it looked like.

HOLLY RAICHE:	I'll ask the same question as Satish. Is this aimed at end-users because I'm sure plenty of people have their own experiences of having their address not backed in various circumstances. So, I think it's a very wide problem, and how do you want to help?

JONATHAN ZUCK:	Yeah, so when you say is this aimed at end-users, I guess the issue is the people that need to be convinced to change their practices are the people that Don is talking about, software developers, basically. So, the people that might help to convince them to do that might be the end users and that's why we're here, okay? Ricardo, go ahead.

RICARDO HOLMQUIST:	In this direction, one of the members of the business community is an association called WITSA (World Information Technology and Service Alliance), W-I-T-S-A. That's kind of the world chamber of international – of IT associations, around the world. I know because I was the head of the chamber of IT companies in my country, and we belong to this.

KOBE – At-Large Leadership Policy Workshop 3: Challenges and possible At-Large opportunities regarding Universal Acceptance

EN

So, if this engaged in this, if WITSA is engaged, or one of the regional associations, and we have one for [[inaudible]] America, you can go down to all, or most of the software developers in some regions. For example, in my country it goes up to 90% of the people that develop software. In Brazil it might be 50% with the association that's there, but it's a way to spread it, and it's just going to one association, and it's pretty easy, because the other way that – yesterday, I was talking to some students here that are fellows, or something like that, and these students, they're the people in the universities right now. If they know that they have to change the things, when they work, when they start their company, that's the first thing they will have in mind.

So, that's the other way, and we have in the community a pretty large number of professors and mostly in this area. So, that's the other way we can help.

If you need any contact with WITSA, I'm offering to do so.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Excellent. Two more, what have we got now? Hadia, oh, Greg and then Hadia. Greg, go ahead.

KOBE – At-Large Leadership Policy Workshop 3: Challenges and possible At-Large opportunities regarding Universal Acceptance

EN

GREG SHATAN: Thanks, Greg Shatan, for the record. I've heard a closely-aligned term discussed, universal awareness, and it seems like perhaps some of the discussion of what the actual end-user needs is awareness, whereas the equipment needs acceptance. So, I don't know if you can touch on that, or if I've kind of just got it all wrong. Thanks.

JONATHAN ZUCK: We're talking about universal acceptance, just to –

GREG SHATAN: I understand that, I'm just trying to understand how this relates to universal awareness and if universal awareness is more for end-users, really the issue in many ways is awareness of the issue. Acceptance is really a technical problem that needs to be dealt with one step away, unless people are writing their own code.

HADIA EL MINIAWI: Jonathan, that was actually my comment. So, universal acceptance actually has two aspects to it, the technical aspect and the human aspect. So, the technical aspect is the one that actually Don has been presenting now, and that technical aspect speaks to the readiness of the equipment and the readiness of the software, but the other aspect to universal acceptance is actually

the human aspect which is the users' awareness. An example for that is that many users don't know that you can actually register domain names in your own language.

So, they are not aware, and when you speak to users, they don't know that, for example, that .[inaudible] exists or .[inaudible]. They don't know that they actually, that there is something called .weather or . – and so, user awareness is part of the universal acceptance because, well, if you say that there are two aspects, the technical aspect and the human aspect, then this is the technical aspect, but then remains the human aspect which is the awareness of the users themselves.

JONATHAN ZUCK: So, yes, that's true. I consider them actually to be different problems, though. It's not technical versus humans as much as it is supply versus demand, or something, because there's a human side to universal acceptance, as well, which is people being sufficiently motivated to make changes to their systems, right? And so, it becomes a "chicken and egg" problem whereby, if they haven't gotten enough complaints about the fact that they're not accepting the new TLDs, and then they're not going to bother changing their systems, and so there's a human element which is, this isn't my problem because I've got other things to focus on.

The idea of people being aware of things is a little bit of a trap because the more we oversell the fact that hey, you can go get a .photography domain name when in fact 2% of the software out there will accept it is almost like scamming them. So, I consider these two different paths and two different discussions and they're both worth having, but what I wanted to do just for this one is focus on universal acceptance and the role that we can play in helping to make progress in that regard.

HADIA EL MINIAWI: Actually, that would be a discussion with Don that who says that – well, we can go back to the definition of universal acceptance, itself, and if we define universal acceptance as only relating to a technical aspect, that's one thing, but one could argue that I could define the universal acceptance term as both the technical acceptance and actually the users' acceptance. So, this goes back to the definition that actually we want to all agree on.

JONATHAN ZUCK: I guess, and I don't mean to leave you out of this discussion, I could also decide to define a banana as a telephone too, but the thing is that this is something that's been agreed on for a very long time, this idea of universal acceptance. I mean and so –

HADIA EL MINIAWI: Yes, and you can find many articles online referring to universal acceptance as both the readiness of the machines and the readiness of the people. So, yeah, it's not something that has been widely agreed on and adopted that it only refers to machines.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Okay. Go ahead.

DENNIS: Dennis, for the record. So, I think both of you are correct, but there is, as we approach and try to solve the issue, we need to see what is the natural order, if you will, we cannot tell people, yeah, go use it, go register this domain names because when they experience it, they go into the applications which did not accept these domain names, and there is going to be a bad user experience, and with that bad user experience, they're just going to walk away.

So, we thought about that at the UASG, okay, what the "chicken and egg" situation that Jonathan said, correct, that is the issue. So, we need to fix first the supply, if you will, the applications that have they process it, how they evaluate the domain names and email addresses, and when there is enough of those issues fixed, then we can start the path of the human aspect of it. And, as we

go and work through the technical issues – I mean, these people are people, so they are also the end-users, and so they will go, oh, yeah, I didn't know about these domain names, now I know and I will use it, and that word will spread out, but I think the way that we are trying to do this is first the applications that are ready to use and then there's going to be another phase when you say, okay, technical issues? Check! Let's work on the second phase in a broader, a broader way.

HADIA EL MINIAWI: Makes sense.

WALE BAKARE: Wale Bakare, for the record. My first question is can we first issue when I first type that email address on our keyboard, if we can get the results faster? To start with this.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [off mic].

WALE BAKARE: Just to be able to identify the issue correctly too and where the problem is, whether it's the user or the software or hardware. So, if we can type that email address, right now, and get that, correct

us, right, on the keyboard, then we will be able to identify whether ICANN will need to do more collaboration with OEMs. Then, from there, software developers and the adware where they just correct us on the keyboard will be known ASCII characters which will identify how we are able to be able to incorporate this. Then ICANN will need to do more collaborations with the technical companies and all that. So, from there, that we can now go into the issue of end-users. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: So, thanks, Wale. Everyone here is capable of typing that email address into their, on their keyboard. That's not an issue. You might not all know how to do it, but you are all capable of doing it. The question is whether or not your system will, in fact, recognize that as a valid email and send it. That was the test, right? And that becomes a software issue. You all have the capability to type that email address in, and we can spend more time on that, or we can send that around, and you can cut and paste it in, but that's not the issue either. The key is how is it then interpreted by the software, and that's what we're trying to talk about from the standpoint of universal acceptance. Okay, are you going to be talking about the Dynamic Coalition?

ROBERTO GAETANO: No.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Oh, okay, not yet, okay, good. Alright, I'm trying to keep on a path here if I can, that's all.

ROBERTO GAETANO: Yeah, Roberto Gaetano, using Sebastian's placeholder. Yeah, two quick comments. One was related to the role of the users, and I fully agree with Satish. I think that if I may say, put things in this way, there's a lot – the basic thing is to have the technical solution that works, and for this there has been a lot of effort, and the UASG has been great for this. I think that we have the technical solutions, but they are not deployed enough. As we have seen, I tried typing. I managed typing the address, but it doesn't go through. I tried two different email systems and it doesn't go through.

So, the problem that I see is that there are certain systems and infrastructure that has to be made UA-compatible, and of course this will, the people who have to do this will have to bear some costs, and they are not going to bear those costs unless there is market pressure. So, that's the first role of the users, is to go intensively and push and ask, so for these solutions to be put in place.

And the second comment was referring to Hadia's example of the human aspect. There's one thing. I was thinking about universal acceptance in trying to think in different terms, and one example that comes to my mind, we have wonderful, here, translator, interpretation services. Now, we are all able to in some way speak in English, even if English is not our mother tongue, but it is without question, translation services will help people to express themselves better, using their mother tongue, or a language that they are more familiar.

So, by twisting things and by doing things in a certain way, we are able to express ourselves without interpretation. Interpretation is not 100% needed, and so in some way we can live with ASCII addresses, but the quality of our integration in the Internet is going to be so much better if we could use our own script and communicate in our own script and let the system do the mechanics, in order to ensure that our messages go to through.

And I think that I see a lot of similarities in this, and it has to do with bringing more people to be able to communicate. Unfortunately, almost all, or I would say all people who attend ICANN meetings have their basic English, and so this is – but, obviously, if English was not a requirement, we could bring more people in. And it's the same thing with the universal acceptance and the IDN addresses. There are lots of people outside who will

be unable to send an email message because they are unable to type in ASCII. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks for restating the problem statement. So, that's where we are, right, and so that's the problem. So, why don't we at this point start a conversation about what we might do as a group to improve the situation? So, that, I'll pass it back to you to, with your suggestions, and then let's open it up for discussion, such as Ricardo already made, but the ideas that we might have that this group might be helpful.

DENNIS: Again, Dennis, for the record. I want to throw another example. So, now [inaudible] from USG to Dynamic Coalition and DNS issues. So, we were inspired. I mean a group of companies, affiliates, Verisign and NTIA, we got inspired by the UASG mission and we have this – under the umbrella of the IGF we formed a Dynamic Coalition to look at issues in and around DNS and the focus in the first years is going to be universal acceptance. The reason we want to go to the IGF is to leverage the connections or the community of the IGF policymakers which are users, at the end of the day, of technology, a big user with the power to change supply, if you will, by for example including in their recruitment

requirements features of you need to support domain names or email addresses in my script, my language.

So, going back to the user question and going back to the how can we leverage, or what is the outcome we are expecting for ALAC, it's yes we need the user input, but let's be as strategic about it, who do we tackle first, and at least a the Dynamic Coalition we think policymakers make sense, they are our proxy to the public sector and raise awareness and educate policymakers as to these, how universal acceptance helps advance the multilingualism of the Internet and the inclusion of their communities, and help them navigate the roadmap, right, navigate this path as to, okay, so they get interested in UA, but they don't know where to start.

So, the Dynamic Coalition's mission is basically to raise awareness to support that development process. So, in that way we are engaged with end-users, but again we are very strategic as to how we approach this large group because we do not want to boil the ocean, we cannot target everyone, but very specifically achieving one step at a time.

DON HOLLANDER: So, I've taken some notes. In terms of WITSA, very keen to get an introduction. We have a program where we're reaching out to

trade associations and professional associations around the world. We have a series of editorials, guest blog posts and that sort of stuff that we've been putting in various journals and publications, and Satish has actually, he and I co-wrote one for the Indian Computer Society. So, WITSA, I don't think is on our radar, but it will be now. We have done our best in Brazil and so forth. So, that's that answer.

The question about universal awareness versus universal acceptance versus universal access versus universal accessibility, they all sound sort of similar, and they're all very important, and they're all very different.

So, universal acceptance, this is this project, and it's focused to make sure that the software accepts all domain names and all email addresses. Universal awareness is something that perhaps the registries and registrars might be very keen on so they can sell some more.

We are not terribly worried, one way or the other, whether anybody sells another domain name, or not. We think it's just people need to get their software ready. However, the more demand there is, the more responsive people will be, but I don't use the word scamming, I use the word teasing, and so that's, it is a "chicken and egg" issue.

Just a reminder, it's not just IDNs. So, these, the ASCII names are also challenged. So, some people say, oh, we spend all this time on IDNs, and we do, and it's relatively easy to explain, but long ASCII names are also not working, though, anecdotally, we haven't finished the study yet. We've got about 20% to go, but we're seeing an improvement from the study we did in 2017, in 2019, of the acceptance of ASCII domain names.

Universities, we're keen to do that. We've developed two courses. I talked about that. TWNIC, in Taiwan, they have, they support IDNs. They also ran a trial with an EAI address facility. So, they found that people who had an email address that worked with their IDN had a higher renewal rate than people who just got the name and didn't get an email associated.

So, this is your issue that if you buy a name, and you haven't figured out how to use it, then when it comes time to renew it, you won't.

On our website we also have some videos. They're a bit hidden. I'll send Jonathan a link and hopefully he can share that, but there's a video that THNIC in Thailand did called [Kai Kai, Kai Kai] which is about an egg farmer, and when you transliterate it to English it just doesn't work, but in Thai it is very good, and it's very funny.

Noted about keyboards, most of the keyboards do work with whatever language. I gave you an easy one in Māori which uses the English alphabet. I could have given you one in Chinese, or Thai or Arabic, which is much harder to use, but you just install a soft keyboard, so that's not an issue.

We also have an issues logging facility on our website. So, if you do have a new, one of these new top-level domains and you do encounter a problem, log it with UASG on our website, and we will, we've got a team of people who will follow that up.

Now, Jonathan, you asked what can ALAC do, and we have thought about this for some time. What we'd like to do is use your distribution network to reach out to the professionals, the IT societies, the CIOs, to programming to opensource software communities around the world. That's what we would like. We have material that we either have, or we can prepare, or we can customize, but that would be a place to start, Jonathan, thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Okay, so I mean, that's sort of the basic idea is how can we reach out, and so as Ricardo mentioned, it could be out to a trade association or something that we've got some connection to. It could be trying to ask people to attempt to use a domain and a

number of websites and filing a complaint with them. These are the kinds of things that I think that we should think about, seeing if we can do a call to action, because I think a call to action is also another way to have people more fully engaged in the At-Large, as well, and so this might be one that's worthy of attempting, and so that's why I wanted to bring it up. Joanna is first.

JOANNA KULESZA: Thank you. First, I wanted to thank you guys for coming and for making this all so clear. It builds our capacity and I'm going to get back to capacity building. You asked about solutions and I wanted to share a personal experience that I think shows good practice. So, in short, my suggestion would be to just use your addresses for writing to those who don't know about the challenge. I wanted to share a personal experience. Ajay and myself, we just met a few days ago. We exchanged emails, and he was kind enough to indicate his personal email which included scripts which I was not aware of that my service would not recognize.

So, Ajay sent me an email saying, Joanna, look, this is my wonderful universal address, please click it, and I clicked it, and I got an error message, instantly. Everything you guys explained was wonderful, but the lesson that Ajay gave me a few days ago was very efficient. I was made bluntly aware of the challenges

we're facing. So, maybe not instead of an elevator pitch, but next to one, just use your wonderful universally-accepted emails to write to bosses, CEOs, etcetera, etcetera. The good point is, if they don't reach them, you don't have to do the work that was reiterated in that email.

So, that was a very pragmatic experience. So, I encourage everyone who has scripts that might be challenging for certain services to just use them because that was a very prompt exercise. I think you might have done it on purpose, Ajay, but that was very, very effective. So, I was very quickly made aware of the problem. Fortunately, he also gave me another address that worked, and I could report back.

I've been just appointed co-chair of the Capacity Building Working Group. If there is anything, we can do in terms of building capacity, please feel tor each out. You might want to use two email addresses just in case, but we're happy to work with you on that. So, thank you for coming over and telling us that. And, thank you, Ajay, for that very quick lesson. That made this meeting today much more comprehensible to me. So, thank you very much.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Yeah, one question that I would have for you, at some point, to think about is do you have some way of arming us with email addresses, for example, that are unusual? And that's just something to think about. If we decided to mobilize in this way, could we end up with one of those .nz emails that we could use to write to people that create the same kind of situation Joanna has described?

DON HOLLANDER: So, the short answer is yes. The USG has, we have, we work with a number of email service providers. As a policy, we can't endorse anyone in particular, but we have two email providers who offer, where you can sign up for an address in Chinese, or Ajay's business offers addresses in most languages that he's traveled too. So, and he's a worldwide traveler. So, I think last week, or the week before, they launched their Japanese, so you can get a Japanese address. I don't think he does Māori yet, but that's because he hasn't been to New Zealand.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Hadia?

KOBE – At-Large Leadership Policy Workshop 3: Challenges and possible At-Large opportunities regarding Universal Acceptance

EN

HADIA EL MINIAWI: Hadia El Miniawi, for the record. So, I have to two points. So, first I totally agree that it does make sense to update the software or develop the software before you ask the people to use something that does not work. However, in order to get the businesses to work on that, they need to see the need coming so that they can put their money in and start doing that, or even the time or effort.

My other point is that I lead the center called The Domain Name System Entrepreneurship Center and [inaudible], the Universal Acceptance Ambassador, works with the center and so I want to share with you all our activities in this regard, and I think that we actually make a good model in this regard.

So, we actually started our Universal Acceptance program about a year ago, or maybe a little bit more, and we started by approaching universities. So, actually, [inaudible] goes to the universities' networks and he gives them presentations, the ones actually funded by Don about the universal, about the topic itself, universal acceptance, and sometimes I help in the beginning and say something about the DNS, so, at the center, and also points out to them how they can actually start allocating the software that actually is not universal acceptance within their networks and how to start working on updating this software or developing the software.

So, one approach is actually the universities, and the other approach is actually the governments. So, we made awareness sessions at the Ministry of the Communication and Information Technology at the National Telecommunication Regulatory Authority at the Information Technology Institute, which is actually an institute that gives training programs to graduates in order to meet the job market requirements.

So, we've been active in those areas. We are yet to target the private sector, though we think that it is important to start with governments and educational institutes. And, again, the problem with the private sector would remain that they need to see the urgent need from their customers. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, Hadia. And, again, I guess to reiterate, the question I have for the group is, is it worth us taking on an experiment to try and help create that sense of urgency because we have so many people? That's the overall question I'm trying to ask, and how we might go about doing that. Next, on the list is Wale, or did you put your card down? I didn't know if it was a new card. I signaled you and it sounded like you still had a question.

WALE BAKARE: Yes, I wanted to just respond to when I mentioned about typing. Basically, my objective was not about typing, anyway, but the point I was trying to drive at was the ICANN, as the core, and the structuring of messaging to the Internet ecosystem, should be able to do more in terms of adopting innovations or collaborating with innovations or collaborating with innovative companies, in terms of being more dynamic. That's exactly what I'm driving at. So, if you could remember Roberto mentioned finding it difficult, not about typing. You could take three, four, five minutes for someone to type a particular address, but what I'm trying to say, my point basically is about ICANN to be more dynamic and to be more collaborative with most of the individual companies. Yes, that is it. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, John Laprise is next.

JOHN LAPRISE: Thank you. I guess I wanted to suggest that, with respect to outreach and engagement, just within the previous meeting we had the communications team in for a brief introduction and this would be something to bring to their attention if we wanted to go forward because they could develop a full communications plan around this and that's part of the point of interacting with them.

It's helping us develop a broad communication strategy in the body of outreach and engagement that Daniel is leading. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Satish?

SATISH BABU: Thanks, Jonathan. Satish, for the record. I'd like to highlight a possible issue which we've often seen conflicted with IDNs. This is the issue of security and user confusability and related like phishing and so on. I'm just flagging it so that the experts here can advise on, as we're about to kind of embark on a journey with ALAC and At-Large, we have to be aware of the pitfalls. So, if there are any such issues, maybe you should update so that we are clear about this.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: So, my experts on security have just left about five minutes ago.

SATISH BABU: Or you can get back –

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:	So, it's, I don't, I'm not hearing that it's a particular issue, one way or the other. It's, and I'm not, my focus is empowering everyone to use their sense of identity, their identity the way that they want to use it.
AJAY DATA:	So, Ajay Data, here for the record. I think this is all music to my ears because I just took over as a chair for the USG. I think it is a no-brainer to have the need of the USG and universal acceptance. Why? Well, almost 1200 long gTLD strings are in the [inaudible], so there are almost 1200 long ASCII domains that are available in the world. We need not to worry about somebody is going to buy them or not, that these registries are going to promote them through their registrars, and people are going to register domain names, and that's going to create further universal acceptance issues, and we are going to buy them. So, I have a .accountant ID. I don't know at that time when I buy a domain name that it's going to work or not. Once I have invested in that domain name, I have created my portal and then I see people can't send me an email, then I realize this, it is not before.

So, we as a community, have to ensure that all of the systems work throughout. This is about long top-level domain. Now, what about the IDNs? The same thing with the IDNs. More than 58 countries have adopted their country's code top-level domain

IDNs and 44 are live. Forty-four countries have a registry who is selling a domain name in their own script, and they are selling 8, and by May we will sell in 15 scripts, domain names.

Users are there or not. To our knowledge, there are millions of users that are already there on IDNs and on long top-level domain names as the email address. They're going to use your services, my services, somebody else's services. This issue is there. Why doesn't this affect us to get you to send an email. We are converted into a user immediately, and that [inaudible] email, if you use an iPhone and try to send it to your email client off iPhone you will get an error, and that's the universal acceptance issue.

Buying an IDN or buying a top-level domain is not a UA issue. Please buy it or don't buy it, that's not what the UA promotes. The UA only talks about very specific things. Can you use that without any error on all enterprises? And so, we have to approach Apple. So, Apple is part of our group. We approach Apple and say can you fix it please, so the users don't face it? That's the nutshell story, and this is where, this is a very limited focus area, but very big area.

We are not at all promoting, at all, that you buy a .professional or a .content or .anything else. We don't talk about that. You buy their service, you buy their service, we are not interested in that either. What we are talking about is all that bug, and like users,

like Don said that type an email address and if you send that right out, we just want to tell you that it's a UA issue, please raise that flag, and on uasg.tech we have an issue logging, just note that down please. The issue logging is there. So, if you face an issue, log that issue there, we will take it to the vendor. We have that system in place. We will take it to the vendor and tell them your users are facing this issue, please deal with that.

That's how we generalize those issue also, and please subscribe. I will just advocate to you at uasg.tech/subscribe. It's a simple URL, uasg.tech/subscribe and you all can be part of the mailing list. We have the expert of IDNs and [inaudible], Dennis here. He is kind of the person within the world to understand that kind of subject. Dušan is sitting in front of you and behind you. He is the vice-chair of UASG. Don is there. We have the ambassador here, Ashish. He's here, I just saw him. So, I think we are all here if you would like to talk, even after the session and see how we are going to take it further. It's a no-brainer. We have to just take it further.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Jonathan Zuck, for the record. I feel as though I've failed you here, and I apologize. I had an agenda, and maybe I wasn't clear enough about my agenda, my secret agenda.

ICANN 64
COMMUNITY FORUM
KOBE
9–14 March 2019

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Oh, it's a secret.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Maybe that's why. The At-Large constantly talks about how big it is, how many people are involved, etcetera, and yet we have a reputation of driving policy, of doing everything from a few voices, okay? Secondly, we are also looking for ways to get people more engaged. There's a little story that gets told about Jimmy Carter when he was running for president. When he would come to a state to campaign for the presidency he would ask if he could sleep on the couch at somebody's house, and Jimmy Carter was a millionaire peanut farmer. He didn't need to sleep on anybody's couch, but the act of asking to sleep on the couch made those people feel like he was their guy, right?

So, asking people to do something has that effect of getting them more engaged. So, those are both goals that we have to demonstrate just how big we are to the Internet community and the ICANN community and to do a better job of, in fact, engaging the very people that we claim to have within our ranks.

So, the question I'm asking you is not to provide advice to these guys who are already working, but are we interested in using this as a possible way of trying to test our outreach and try and reach

ICANN 64
COMMUNITY FORUM
KOBE
9–14 March 2019

out, and if that one person reaches out to five, and each of those five people reach out to five more, is that a possibility on an issue that's very real, and see if we can actually have, move the needle even a tiny little bit, and in the meantime have a real actionable reason to be communicating with the people that are part of At-Large?

That was my agenda, that's really the question that I'm asking, not what they can do to do their job better, right? It's really about us, and is this a good issue, a good opportunity for us to see if we can test what we're capable of doing? That, that was my secret agenda. So, I don't know who to go to next. Is anybody keeping track of the order? Okay, come on up to the microphone.

[SILVA SUBRANIM]   [Silva Subranim] from India [inaudible] ISOC and ALS. 80% or 70% of the universal acceptance problem will be solved if ICANN, as an organization, works with the major browser companies, the major operating system companies and –

JONATHAN ZUCK: I feel like again you're missing my point. Sorry, I don't mean to cut you off. I'm not asking for a better solution to the universal acceptance problem. I'm asking does this represent an opportunity for the At-Large to demonstrate our capacity and is it

a reasonable way to engage our members. That's the question I'm asking, not is there a better way to solve the problem.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yeah, I was not reacting to your immediate question. I was talking about the universal acceptance work that is being done by the working group about this meeting in general.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Which wasn't the meeting. That wasn't the meeting. I guess that's the point I'm trying to make.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Alright, then.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Okay, I'm not trying to be mean. I don't, do you have a list here? Edmon go ahead.

EDMON CHUNG: Edmund Chung, here and with my capacity as ISOC Hong Kong and in ALS, I think that's great, a great cause. I love that idea. I think, as a long participating ALS and in this community, this is an opportunity for the At-Large to kind of show our strength, alright?

I mean show our colors and it's going to be a tall order, or else why would it be a show of strength, right? And I think it will require a little bit of coordination within the At-Large and think that's something that hopefully other ALSes would agree to put some efforts behind this because it needs some coordination outside of the UASG. Of course, I also participate in the UASG, but I totally understand what your call Jonathan is, and I very much support it.

Earlier, at the APRALO meeting, we touched on the subject a little bit as well and wanted to get the At-Large in general, as a whole, to kind of lean-in to the issue. Of course we can take the materials that UASG has already created, but it is the At-Large going out and using our channels, our own network, to make people hear this UA issue, so I guess seconding your secret agenda.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, Edmon. Next, is Roberto.

ROBERTO GAETANO: Yeah, thank you. Roberto, for the record. I think that there are several ways in which we can contribute. The first I hinted at already and is by putting pressure on whoever is providing a service that is not UA compliant and complain—sorry, for the words—and raise the issue. The second thing is that we have

ALSes that live in a local situation and they have connections and I think that a lot can be done in terms of exploiting the connections that we have on the ground.

There is one other thing that I feel that we should do, and that is in building awareness. I think that we need also ourselves to learn more, and also to participate and discuss with other people. We have, this year, several forums in which to debate the issue. This is on the agenda. There are sessions on EuroDIG this year. There are sessions on [CaDiG]. We are building a proposal for the IGF 2019 in Berlin. Those are all places where we are going to have it. The Dynamic Coalition, we could join the Dynamic Coalition in discussing the issues and make it broad.

The last way just also to be inventive in the way we relate to people, as having and experimenting – I think that this has been hinted at already by Joanna. I mean, experimenting with unusual email addresses and names and provoke. This is more raising the awareness than finding a solution, but I think that, little by little, if we don't go and we plant seeds, we will never be able to harvest. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thank you. Hadia?

HADIA EL MINIAWI: Hadia El Miniawi, for the record. So, definitely, Jonathan, this topic is of great interest to, or it should be of great interest to At-Large. So, as the representatives of the interest of the end-users, this is something that directly relates to them. Universal acceptance promotes inclusion and allows users to express themselves online, using their own identities. So, surely, it's not only the language, it's the culture. It includes their local, their identity, itself. And so, definitely, yes, this is something that is in the best interest of the users and trying to go forward and trying to look for means of how to solve this problem, directly serves them. So, yeah, thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thank you, Holly?

HOLLY RAICHE: Holly Raiche, for the transcript records. I'd like to say I've actually done my bit as a board member, and I've already with Bruce Tonkin to say why aren't we doing this because, for example, there's a very large Chinese community in major cities who probably would love the possibility of Chinese script.

JONATHAN ZUCK: So, you are done and won't do anymore? Is that what you're saying?

HOLLY RAICHE: I said I started.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Okay, alright, thank you. You said you'd done your bit, so I just was trying to –

HOLLY RAICHE: That was, that was amended!

JONATHAN ZUCK: Alright, Ricardo?

RICARDO HOLMQIST: Thank you. I don't know, do you guys have some bullets or something that we can share among the community? If you have something, not only in English, but maybe in French and Spanish, such that we can begin to spread. Our communities, maybe sometimes it's 10 people, but sometimes it's 700, 7,000. So, it's a lot of people to spread the word to. If we have the bullets and we

have something that we can send to our regular emails from our ALSes, it's, that's important.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Yeah, they do have that. That's why they're here, right? And so, I guess what I'm inclined to do is add a little formality to this where we might start tracking the outreach that we did and be able to report the outreach we did, and things like that. That's, again, the secret part of the agenda, right?

The other part of the agenda is that I talked my wife into a registering a .gallery domain and she can't use the Internet anymore, so I have a very personal interest in solving this problem, but in this meeting, right, I'm really trying to figure out about the opportunity it represents to us, and how to maximize that opportunity for the At-Large. Joanna?

JOANNA KULESZA: Thank you, this is Joanna Kulesza, for the record. I hope I'm understanding your question correctly, but I would give the lawyer's answer to that question on what we can do. I would say that depends, right? Because if you were to ask me what we could do in Europe, and I'm happy to reach to the expertise of more experienced EURALO members, I've been involved with Internet governance issues for a while. I'm Polish. We have specific

elements, specific elements of our script. I don't think this proves to be a challenge in the country. I don't think it is.

Okay, right, so I was just looking for stats. I was trying to look into the European region and IDN stats. I'm happy to, again, build my capacity up from that. I would see this, and we have seen the comments coming from the members here, as an issue that might be more pertinent in certain At-Large regions. If we decide that that is a theme that the entire community needs to pick up, I'm happy to support that, I'm happy to try and explore avenues in which we can do that, in my region, where I'm on the ground, and I can actually reach out to Polish ALSes.

I know it's Belarus. I know that it is Georgia where the script is a little bit different and we don't have Olivier in the room who probably has the stats for more expertise on this. So, I would say that the awareness and the capacity for our awareness-raising might depend on the region. We've been talking about hot topics. If hot topics is universal acceptance, that we adopt globally, we might want to try to take that back to our regions. If it's a regional hot topic, then I think that is also an issue to be considered.

So, in that sense, my answer would be that depends. If we decide that this is something that the community feels strongly about, I would be happy to take that back into my regional community

EN

and try to figure out how to support the issue that you're discussing here. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Great, we'll talk about it more. I guarantee you it's an enormous problem in Poland, I guarantee you.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: We have a remote question.

JONATHAN ZUCK: We have a remote question. Alright, go ahead.

YESIM NAZLAR: Thank you, Jonathan, this is Yesim Nazlar from At-Large staff, ICANN staff. We have a remote question from Alberto Soto. He says don't ask us for collaboration. For example, in LACRALO we have around 55 ALSes in some 22 countries. Not all are active in LACRALO or in ALAC or in ICANN, but they are very active locally. They can reach ISPs, universities, companies, etcetera. It would enough to add the ones we want with universal acceptance to achieve this collaboration. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK:	Thanks, Alberto. Excellent, where am I now?
UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE:	Satish.
JONATHAN ZUCK:	Satish? Then I guess we're closing the queue.
SATISH BABU:	Thanks very much, Jonathan. Quick observations. One is that one of the proposals in the pipeline for additional budget requests for APRALO for this year is a workshop on universal acceptance. It is actually being proposed for Armenia. This is another country which requires it very much. So, secondly, the APRALO hot topics already includes IDNs. So, we've already identified this as a priority for us, and that presumes, and presumably that means that we will be taking on some outreach activities with this. Third, is that there are things that all of us can do.
	For example, if you have newsletters, Don has written some excellent articles, which are simple for the layman, the lay person. We can start distributing those and provoke our ALSes to ask questions on this. Maybe ATLAS III can have a session for the larger group on universal acceptance. These are some of the concrete things that we can try out. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thanks, Satish. Greg.

GREG SHATAN: Thanks, Greg Shatan, for the record, and I'm here in my capacity as an ALS representative from ISOC New York, and as a New Yorker, I was sitting here thinking I don't have this problem, and then I remembered, Holly kind of reminded me, you know, New York has nearly one million Spanish speakers. It's one of the largest Spanish-speaking cities in the world. We, of course, also have many other people using many other languages and scripts, like Chinese and various South Indian and Arabic, and you name it. So, it's a great cosmopolitan city and there are many of them, and we'll have that problem as well.

So, I think this is a universal problem, and I think that, concretely, the idea of setting up, getting the toolkit, setting up a Wiki page within the At-Large constellation where this, where there can be tracking and discussion, and kind of a full featured kind of homepage, a home for this as a project, will, I think – it's a great idea. I think when people ask what makes At-Large special within the ICANN ecosystem, this is part of it, and this is—in essence—a proof of concept of that, and this is particularly important, and it's one that does go to our end-user community. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: And, dude, it's not just about IDNs, it's a problem for .nyc as well. So, I mean, that's the thing. It is, in fact, a universal problem.

MAUREEN HILYARD: [off mic].

JONATHAN ZUCK: Oh, that's the name of the guy from the audience?

MAUREEN HILYARD: Yeah, [mic].

JONATHAN ZUCK: Oh, guy from the audience, come in and introduce yourself.

SAVYO VINICIUS DE MORAIS: Okay, hello, I'm Savyo from NextGen and, well, I'm working on it. I'm doing own research on universal acceptance. So, in short word, in short words, how can we help you to get this situation changed? We have some, in HTML5, we have one, the full [inaudible] to email validations that is not fully complaint with universal acceptance. We can try keep touch with WC3 to change it faster. If you know, if people from university, if you know, if you

have some community working in some opensource community like Wordpress, [inaudible], or something like that, that is widely used on the Internet, you can try to make some full request. If you meet somebody in Google, in Microsoft, in some big company that has a lot of content in that – okay, thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thank you. Bartlett?

BARTLETT MORGAN: I was really just chiming in because I got a sense that you wanted a temperature of the room, just to support the whole thing. I mean, it's sufficiently, oh, God, it's [inaudible] logistic, but sufficiently universal for us to want to get behind, and I'd go a bit further to say, if this isn't the kind of thing we'd want to get behind, then we should probably just kind of pack up the At-Large right now.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thank you, Bartlett. Eduardo?

EDUARDO DIAZ: Thank you. I think it's a good idea, or you know we ask users with compromised ISP, and things like that, that we proposed, but

there is a basic problem. If I cannot get the email out of my, let's say, Gmail, it doesn't matter if the ISP works out.

JONATHAN ZUCK: So, let's, I think there's a lot of work to do to figure out what the best mechanisms and tools are, and things, and I think that we can work with these guys to come up with them, and maybe even work with ICANN for funds, if necessary, to get secondary, to get email addresses. I mean, let's solve that problem later. This really is, are people excited about the idea of – you know, when you say that it's the thing that most unique about At-Large, it's that we're large, right? I mean, that's the thing, and I think that we have the opportunity to demonstrate that, and then that's crossed out.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Hadia.

HADIA ELMINIAWI: Hadia Elminiawi for the record. So, definitely approaching decisionmakers in governments, chief technology officers and educational institutes, approaching the technical community, the private sector. This is all important and crucial, but I think also approaching the young generation is also important. So, we've been doing, we've been approaching educational institutes,

governments and sort of some of the private sector, but again I think approaching the young generation is crucial because they want, and again you want them to want it, to need it, and usually the young generation are the ones that push for new things to happen, and usually it picks up when you have the young generation wanting this.

And that was my point, actually, when I was talking about the user awareness, not for them to buy actually domains, no, and that even young generation that I'm talking about, it could be the technical young generation that could actually contribute to the development of the software. So, that's the point that I wanted to make. Thank you.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Okay, thank you very much, Hadia. I think we have an effort in front of us in figuring out what our best strategy is, what our ask should be. With a show of hands, are you excited about the possibility that we might take this on as a challenge for the At-Large to do this outreach, using our network to try and increase awareness about this? Okay, that's the question. We'll go from there to figure out the best way to do it.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [off mic].

JONATHAN ZUCK: It is, and I don't know what it is yet. It's probably something John is going to manage so. You're welcome.

JOHN LAPRISE: Yeah, or I'll give it to Daniel.

JONATHAN ZUCK: Thank you very much for your patience and your willingness to participate in something new. So, thanks a lot, alright. Am I closing the meeting too? Oh, sorry, thank you very much for the tech support that we've had, all day today, the translators that we've had that make all this possible, and thanks to all of you for keeping it ornery.

SATISH BABU: And thank you, Jonathan, for your hidden agenda.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]