
KOBE – Joint AFRALO AfrICANN Meeting
Wednesday, March 13, 2019 – 13:30 to 15:00 JST
ICANN64 | Kobe, Japan

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. We are going to start soon. We're already six minutes into the start time. But Gisella, you have some [inaudible].

GISELLA GRUBER: Yes. Thank you very much. I'll speak in French. Seun, we have interpretation today in French, in Arabic, and in English. Do not hesitate to speak three languages. You can take some headsets so you can participate completely. Every time you start speaking, please clearly state your name for the transcript and for the interpreters so they do know who you are. If you need to ask a question and you have this little card on your table, please lift it or lift your hand and speak clearly and slowly so the interpreters can do their job correctly. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thanks, Gisella. Welcome, everyone, to the AfrICANN-AFRALO session. My name is Seun Ojedeji and I am not the Chair of AFRALO, as you all know. I'm just standing in for Mohamed. Myself and Tijani actually are having a temporary title called Co-Chairs

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

for this particular session. So we are going to be co-chairing starting [in a moment] for this session.

Who has to rush to the airport?

[I haven't said that.] This is to ... Do we have ... I think we have Maureen and we have Leon as well. We are also expecting some other guest speakers to join us.

Daniel, it seems you have your card up.

DANIEL NANGHAKA:

Thank you very much for the ... I appreciate the fact that you're acting as Co-Chairs. I see this is the first extraordinary situation that is happening almost for the first time. In the regional leadership, we have mainly the top three, which is the Chair, the Vice-Chair, and the Secretariat. There's also the ALAC that comes in.

With the fact that probably it [could] have been delegated, could the third leadership possibly be able to take up such a critical position since it's also key in the process?

But I appreciate the fact that it has been delegated to the key representatives of the ALAC. Thank you.

SEUN OJDEJI: Okay. Thank you, Daniel. What you're basically saying is that, since the Secretariats are [inaudible] the rule, you're absolutely correct. But, as you see, she's actually going to be performing the secretarial role by typing. It should not be feasible to actually chair and still do the [inaudible] at the same time. So that's why we will volunteer to actually change this session.

If you're fine with that and if the other members or colleagues who are on the floor, please, I would suggest that you move on.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: It's okay with me. I have no problem with it. Please, go ahead.

SEUN OJDEJI: All right. Thank you, Daniel. I'd like to welcome Goran.

[GORAN MARBY]: Hey.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Yeah. So we'll quickly try to run through the speeches from Maureen. You have the floor, please.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

MAUREEN HILYARD:

Yes. Correct. Thank you very much for inviting me. I know that I'm just going to have my little five minutes of fame here. I really would like to welcome everyone here into our Asia-Pacific region. It's a pleasure to have you – yeah. On behalf of APRALO, I'd like to welcome you all here. It is a pleasure to have you here anyway.

But I think that, from my perspective, I just wanted to raise with you how much we appreciate the work that actually is being done by AFRALO. There's some really interesting documents that have been – the hot topics, of course, was something that really took off as a result of the work that you were doing in your region. I think that's fabulous.

I also think that it's really important that your contributions to any discussions and the sorts of things that you are involved in really does add value to what we are doing in At-Large.

Just to highlight for you – and I'm sure that you are aware that, for At-Large, there's key things that we are going to be working on during this year. Where we would like to see more engagement is, of course, the At-Large Review implementation work that is being done. There'll be more, no doubt. You will told more about those. We'd like to have more participation in the – well, there's six – oh, there's eight. There's eight items that are part of that plan, and we'd like to you have engaged in as many of them as possible.

Of course, looking down the track, we've also got ATLAS III, and there will be a lot of engagement, I'm sure, from you in that activity as well.

As we're always pushing policy, policy, policy, any engagement that we can get from AFRALO and the CPWG is always welcomed, as well as [from] my great leader from the outreach and engagement from the AFRALO region. I'm hoping you will all support him in his work that he's doing. And he's doing a great job. He's a [credit to use], so I really hope that you can actually support his work as well.

So if there are any questions or something—

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Thank you, Maureen, for [that].

MAUREEN HILYARD: If there are any questions or queries, I'm sure that you can direct them to my Vice-Chair, John Laprise, who's going to be staying with you anyway while I dash off to the APRALO meeting. And I probably won't be able to be here, too. Is that okay?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I will never forgive you. Never.

MAUREEN HILYARD: Thank you very much for having me anyway. I'll keep in touch.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you, Maureen. Thank you for also the support that we normally receive from you. And thank you for always making an effort to join our monthly calls occasionally to actually interact with us and observe what we do during our monthly calls.

If there are – okay, I'm not seeing any cards up and I'm not hearing any voice from the remote participants. I think we'll move on to Goran.

GORAN MARBY: First of all, I'm really sorry that I was late. I'm Swedish, and in Swedish culture – and as I learn, Japanese – you're never late. You're not supposed to be. So deep regrets for that. The true story is I went to the wrong room and the wrong meeting with the same speech.

First of all, my team tells me I should congratulate you because the development of this group since 2010 has been very positive. You are an important part of ICANN, and you also have a very cooperative and cooperation approach to anything, and that's really ICANN and that's really the multi-stakeholder model.

What you're discussing now is really important. It's not the org. it's not the Board who makes the decision about future policy. It's really you. Your input in this is valuable.

The next round of identifiers has an ability to change how we interact with the Internet. I said in another setting today we should not only talk about it as a domain name commercial market but we should really think about it as identifiers. The more secure identifiers, the more we can change the interaction on the Internet between people. So I'm happy about your careful approach.

I took the opportunity to read through you document, and of course I'm not allowed to have any opinion.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: No, you are. Please.

GORAN MARBY: No, I'm not.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Please.

GORAN MARBY: But it looks good.

[TIJANI BEN JEMAA]: That's the opinion.

GORAN MARBY: The problem – we all know this organization and many of its [sums] come from a West-oriented word with English as its native language; people reading from left to right, people who understand what a dot is. [inaudible] – well, let me say it like this. The fantastic thing with the Internet is it's two things at the same time. It's a global interconnected network, but it's also many interconnected networks. But it's also a village. Most of the information on the Internet is local. You want to be able to address – you go to your local bank, your school, your [municipality] and exchange information with your friends who are local. So that's the thing. It's local and global at the same time.

When it was built, the globality or the English version of it was important. To be able to attract the next billion users onto the Internet, it has to be an Internet that's built on their expectations. It will not look the same as the one we're using, and it shouldn't be.

In the next round and in any following rounds or whatever we do, your view on that can help to connect the next billion users, who

are not the elite of the world. They're not the people that live in the cities and have a lot of money to be able to connect. We need your input. Your epicenter region that I think is a success in that [inaudible] comes from almost, I think, zero – very close to only a few percent – in Internet connections ten to 15 years ago. I think it's now up to between 25 and 30%. I think that's a major success: to achieve that in a couple of years. Every country or continent has its own disadvantages and problems. But with the help of you, I think your part is going to be [striving very well].

So thank you very much for inviting me. I will leave you to it so you can do your important work. I'm looking forward to the outcome. Thank you.

SARAH KIDEN:

I've just given the CEO our AFRALO policy hot topics. These will be the topics that we'll discuss this week. We want to create awareness and train our ALSes about the hot topics. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Okay. Thank you. Thank you very much, Goran. I guess some of us may have – okay, I'm not seeing any of the tent cards up, so it means that there are no questions or comments for you.

GORAN MARBY: Don't tell [Cassia]. If anyone has any questions, I take them.

DANIEL NANGHAKA: Thank you very much for your great, insightful remarks with the Africa region. This question may not be direct to you but you could probably have an idea towards resource allocation for the Africa region. We still have quite some tremendous challenges that affect us in our participation. We know that there are webinars. We can be able to [inaudible] for respective policy meetings. But still, there are quite some [caps], especially in regional [development] of the domain industry.

What are your suggestions or recommendations that you think ICANN could be able to put into consideration, especially to enhance African participation in the policy development process and also to contribute towards the ATLAS III that will be coming up? I think your views may not come in as the respective President or CEO, but let's assume that you're in our position as Africa, since you're in an AfrICANN meeting. Thank you.

GORAN MARBY: I definitely think you should ask Cherine that question. I mean ...

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

GORAN MARBY:

In a way, this is my tenth meeting in ICANN. Our next meeting is in Africa, and that's the third meeting in three years that we come to Africa: Marrakech, Johannesburg, and now Marrakech again. I think that shows our commitment to come back so often to the region. I also like the places we're going to, so that helps.

I can turn this into a budget question, and then I will say we have no more money. Cherine is here. I have to say that. But I spoke to Maureen a couple of days ago, and tomorrow there's going to be discussion, which is not really your answer about resourcing. But tomorrow, Cherine is hosting a discussion – sorry. Brian Cote is hosting a discussion which I think Cherine will talk about, which is talk about the governance model of ICANN. We also have the five-year strategic plan, which is now in its final stages.

It might sound that I'm not answering your question, but some of those things that we talk about are actually strategic. We do we pool our resources? Where do we do our outreach? Which underserved regions? I don't like that name, by the way. Do we bring and how do we create diversity within ICANN?

So I don't have the answers to them and maybe I shouldn't have. But we were trying to provide this meeting, for the strategic discussions, and the governance discussion, as a place for you have that discussion.

But one thing that I think that makes ICANN unique – I call this one of the largest peace projects ever – is that you are here. We bring in people here. We don't ask you who you are. We don't ask you who do you represent. We bring in people. We have 2,000-something people from ICANN, and anyone can just walk in. We provide travel support. We provide the Fellowship Program, the NextGen programs. We travel the world. We do as much as I think we, in a way, can. I think we have to continue that discussion.

There is a great respect, there is a great understanding, within ICANN, in all the different houses and all the different parts, about the importance of diversity.

So engage in those discussions. That's where you change your strategies. Thank – our strategies. Sorry. Thank you. Thank you, [George].

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you. Abdulkarim?

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much. Just a follow-up question from Daniel's question. You mentioned that Marrakech is going to be ICANN65. It's going to be the third meeting that's going to happen in Africa within the last two years. The third what? Yes, within the last two years.

You also mentioned that Marrakech and South Africa are places where you like going or people like going. But there are places—

GORAN MARBY: I was referencing actually to go to Africa.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Oh, okay. Problem understood. But there are places that people don't like going, like sub-Saharan Africa. What is ICANN doing?

GORAN MARBY: We have a small problem. It's not a small problem. It's actually that, to some extent, we are a victim to our own success. There are fewer and fewer places around the world that actually can contain an ICANN meeting. I have one of the most talented and gifted and passionate teams in the world, my Meetings Team, who constantly travel the world – and it's not as fun as you might think – to see if we can find places for venues because most venues don't have – this meeting we have 308 sessions or something, many of them happening at the same time. That's why people like me become late: we end up in the wrong room.

And we need to have bandwidth. The average participant here is has three devices connected. We have restrictions. We have to make sure that, when you're in here, you're in a safe environment

because we take the safety of the people in the ICANN community very, very, very seriously. We have to make sure that you can connect to an open and the interconnected Internet, as we do it. And it actually cannot cost too much.

So when you come all together, if you look at all the hotels and venues around the world, we're down to a couple of percent of them where we actually today can physically do a meeting.

We don't take into account the political side. We go to places where – we are not a political organization. We're a technical organization. But believe me, it's a lot of logistics.

If you ever have the time, there is a guy called Nick Tomasso. You spoke to him. Tell him that I asked him to take you into our NOC, our Network Operating Center, so you can see all the behind-the-scenes work we do with all the technicians and everything. It's an amazing thing. I didn't know the scale of this meeting [inaudible] runs flawlessly. I sometimes said to people, "When you leave a room, don't just say goodbye to each other. The people behind here? Give them a round of applause."

So that is actually the answer to your question. Because of the size we have, it's harder for us now to do meetings in many places. I convinced my team to go Sweden for a long time.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

GORAN MARBY: [Nope]. Thank you, my friends. Now, you've been very nice to me. [Marissa] said Cherine there, the Chairman of the Board, is really ready for all the tough questions.

Unfortunately, I have to leave. Thank you very much, and thank you for inviting me.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much, Goran. Yes, indeed, we'll pass it onto Cherine to take all the tough questions.

Welcome, Cherine. Oh, let's see ...

CHERINE CHALABY: Thank you, Goran, for your parting gift.

GORAN MARBY: I'm here to serve.

CHERINE CHALABY: I know, I know. It's called upward delegation, right?

I know that Mohamed El Bashir and Fatimata Seye Sylla are not here, but I want to thank them for the leadership. I also want to thank the current Co-Chairs, who are here.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Temporary Co-Chairs.

CHERINE CHALABY: Temporary Co-Chairs. Right. And I do want to thank Sarah as well, who's here. She's your acting ...

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Secretariat.

CHERINE CHALABY: Secretariat. So I really appreciate your effort. Also, you probably know this is my last year on the Board because the bylaws mandate that, after nine years, I can't serve anymore on the Board. So in saying thank you, I need to mention two more people who have been very close friends and close to me, Tijani and Aziz, for all their work in supporting the AfrICANN community and AFRALO. So for everyone, I say thank you, but particularly these two people who have been here since I joined the Board almost from the beginning. I want to give my deep gratitude. Thank you very much.

So I have prepared some remarks, but I think, as I know from last year, the best thing is really to engage in a dialogue. But I'd like to say a couple of things, particularly in relation to the direction going with ICANN. That is that we are truly, in my view – this is my view – at a major decision point in our history.

Why? Because we are going to face in ICANN in the next five years new forces, external forces, like we've never seen before in their intensity, right? Previously, in the past, things were, in a way, in our hands, whether it was the transition or new gTLDs or even working on GDPR. We knew that, if we worked hard at it, we could find an internal solution.

Here we have an external force: the rise of what is now called the cyber sovereignty, which is the intervention of legislation and government – it's something we're not used to – and the exponential increase in security threats. You've seen the recent attacks on the DNS. All of these security threats are something that, yes, have been coming, but the rapid intensity of these security threats is frightening in a way. There's also disruptive technologies that are now coming through. How will those affect the unique identifiers and their evolution? And there is an increasing risk of Internet fragmentation.

So these are four or five major forces that are increasing in intensity, and we cannot, as an organization, just continue as we

have in the past: “Hopefully everything will be okay on the day ...”
So we need to respond to those, and we need to respond with our collective strength and our collective will as a community.

Your role in that is going to be also very, very important. The AfrICANN community has a voice, has a voice on all the issues that are of concern to us. I’ve just looked at your document here, your policy hot topics. There are seven or eight policies – eight policies here – that you’re looking at. They’re all the issues that are really of prime importance to ICANN.

So I do encourage you to please make this group grow and be stronger and express your views and make your statement known.

One area really this week, and tomorrow in particular, will be very helpful. One of the things we’re looking at is how to increase the efficiency of our governance model. We’re looking for a lot of ideas. There’s been a number of years where community members are expressing issues and frustration, but we never had the courage to say, “Okay. Let’s address them.” Right? So this is the first we say, “We need a plan to fix them.”

In order for us to fix those plans, we need to know what the issues are that have broad community support, right? I really stress the words “broad community support.” What we cannot do is have everyone standing up and saying, “This is an issue and we’re

addressing this issue,” because, as you know, the biggest problem we have as a community now is prioritization – prioritizing our work, focusing on what matters.

But we know there are things we need to do with our governance model in terms of efficiency and effectiveness, not in terms of structure. We’re not looking at restructuring because that’s the job of the bylaws which mandate certain restructuring reviews? But what can we do so that we can improve the effectiveness of our decision making and the speed with which we make decisions?

So please participate tomorrow if you can, if you have time. If you have time to organize your thoughts here and submit a group thinking rather than individual thinking, it’s always better because it stands to be much stronger when you say, “This has the broad AfrICANN support for it.” Right? Then people will take that more into account than one individual saying, “Well, this thing bothers me.” So it’s the collective and the broad community support. So, please, I encourage you to do that.

I’m going to stop here. I know you’re discussing new gTLDs, and I know that you have concerns about how considerations should be taken into account before any new round is launched. The Board is appreciative of that input.

So I’m going to stop. I’m happy to take questions as you wish.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much, and thank you for coming to see us once again. My question – let me start with the difficult questions. Just like you mentioned, one of the hot topics we have has to do with Internet governance. To us as a community, we've been having the discussion about the multi-stakeholder structure. Yes, we have the multi-stakeholder structure, but we feel, even within the multi-stakeholder structure, there is still grumbling by some parts of this community regarding the fact that their voice is not been heard within the multi-stakeholder structure.

If you look at the [states] [inaudible] representing on the [new gTLDs], those are part of the issue. This is the same issue we raised at the last ICANN meeting. We decided to raise it again at this ICANN meeting because we felt it is important to us and we need to push it further.

So you mentioned that the Board is not looking at structural changes. Well, how do you attend to address the issues within our community? I was talking about how our voice has not been heard within this multi-stakeholder structure. Thank you.

CHERINE CHALABY:

I want to separate in your mind working methods from structure. Structure – I mean, we’re not going to reorganize the At-Large or reorganize the GNSO. That’s what I mean. Okay?

But how you get your voice heard? That is a very legitimate issue that needs to be put on the table. And you need to put that on the table tomorrow, right? Because if you feel that you’re repeating the message again and again and again and nobody is listening to you, we have a problem. We have a challenge and we need to address it. I don’t have the answer ready for you, but I know that the way to bring that point to the top of the agenda is to keep on making the point. But there’s an opportunity tomorrow which is different from anything else that’s happened before. There’s an opportunity for the whole community to go and raise it.

But there’s no point [to] going tomorrow and saying on your own, “My voice is not heard.” But if collectively you come and say, “Africa’s voice is not heard. Here is evidence. What is the community going to do to help us fix that?” now you’re beginning to get at the top of the agenda, right? So it’s the way you put your voice that will make a difference than just individually struggling on your own.

So I encourage you to speak on behalf of – and maybe you want to, if that’s your statement, add something to the statement about the multi-stakeholder model and say, “We want this new

initiative to take into account ...” something. I’m just thinking out loud. But there’s an opportunity tomorrow which hasn’t happened before. It hasn’t happened since I joined the Board nine years ago. So that opportunity is for the community to speak about the changes it wants in terms of getting things like your voices being heard. So please do.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much. Our time is actually moving fast. If I’m not seeing any other hands up, we’ll take some pictures and then ...

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yeah. If we can have a photo with you, Cherine. Sorry to [inaudible].

CHERINE CHALABY: I’m happy ... I’d like to stay another few minutes and take more questions if it’s possible.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Okay. A few more questions.

SEUN OJEDEJI: So Cherine is available for ... any more questions?

CHERINE CHALABY: I am part of this community after all, so don't [inaudible].

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: It seems that you were are very clear and everything is very – you said everything in your opening ceremony. Now you explained it again. So it seems that our community is convinced by what you said, so I think—

CHERINE CHALABY: Photo time!

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yeah. Exactly.

SEUN OJDEDI: Okay. While the formality things are happening, I think we can continue to maximize the time.

Also, we're luck to have Leon Sanchez. Leon is the At-Large Board representative on the ICANN Board. Leon has actually – I don't know how he does it. He tries as much as possible to attend our meetings, our online calls, and we all understand the fact that we have five regions and each of your regions actually hold monthly meetings. So how he does it to make sure that he tries to attend our meetings remains a puzzle to me. But I guess he's Superman.

So, Leon, welcome. And thank you for your support and continued efforts in making sure that our voice is heard. Welcome, Leon.

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much, Seun. As my father used to tell me when I was a student, the night is long and the coffee is cheap. So that's how I manage to join that many calls throughout the different regions.

So thank you for having me here. It's always great—

CHERINE CHALABY: You're pretending to be from Africa now?

LEON SANCHEZ: Absolutely.

CHERINE CHALABY: One of my best friends – I like him as very much as well – on the Board.

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you very much, Cherine. So it's great to be here again. As Seun has said, [as well] as Aziz, Tijani, Mohamed – all those who attend regularly AFRALO meetings – you know that I am a big fan

of AFRALO and I follow your calls and I try to be involved and to keep in touch and to be up-to-date with all the different topics that you are discussing. I think it's great that you have synthesized those hot topics in this brochure. I think it's great to see that, contrary to what many would say, the RALOs, especially AFRALO in this case, are not about raising issues that are not important for some, but instead you are centering your work on very important issues for the end-user community.

I had the opportunity to read though the proposed joint AFRALO-AfrICANN statement. I think it's very well-crafted. I think that states appoint is really important and that has been raised during our meeting with the ALAC. I think that this is a fight worth fighting for. I think that the fact that there is a proposal from a certain company to proceed with a brand before any other subsequent rounds of new gTLDs takes place is something that is just out there as a proposal.

What I mean by that is this doesn't pose any pressure, either on the Board nor in the organization nor in the Subsequent Procedures Working Group. We need to understand that, in our multi-stakeholder model, everyone is allowed to speak and to put forward ideas. So this proposal made by Neustar is just another proposal. It doesn't add to the fact that it comes from a company to say that it has more weight than any other of the ideas or the proposals that have been put on the table for discussion.

So it is up to the working group on subsequent procedures to decide when, how, and if there is going to be a future round. Remember that this is a bottom-up, multi-stakeholder process, consensus-driven. The Board and the organization will implement the outcome of this policy development process. So please be assured that we will not be subject to any kind of pressure, either internal or external. And these will not influence the decisions that we may take going forward.

We are cognizant and we are aware of the challenge that communities and that underserved regions face in these types of processes. We learned from the first round the difficulties and the different challenges that these two groups faced when applying for a certain string. We are confident that the working group of subsequent procedures will be able to address these concerns and to propose mechanisms that safeguard the interests of these two groups, both communities and underserved regions.

I like the statement that you have drafted because it is not only spot-on on the problems, but it also proposed some solutions. I think that that is the most valuable part of it all because it's not only a criticism to what has been proposed but it also is kind enough to provide feedback and useful alternatives to try to address this challenge.

So I congratulate you for this work. I commend you and I just want to remind you that I want to remain in touch with you very closely. I am very grateful for your feedback, your ideas, and the interaction that you've given me the opportunity to have here with you. And, as I usually say, I'm just click away from any of you that wants to reach me. I would like to also thank all of those AFRALO members that are part of the different working groups for their time, their hard work, and their useful input to the multi-stakeholder process that we have in ICANN.

So thank you very much. I will need to excuse myself because I need to be at another meeting, Tijani, Seun, and Sarah, and Aziz. But I am always grateful for you having me here in AFRALO. Thank you very much.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you. Thank you very much, Leon. As you're leaving now, if there are – of course there are questions. We can always follow up with you on the questions.

LEON SANCHEZ:

Of course. If you have any questions, please feel free to raise them. I will stay and answer them. When we are done with any questions, I will leave.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. Thank you. Any questions?

Abdulkarim?

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Thank you very much. Leon, I'm one of your friends because I know you're doing a great job. I've been following you closely without you noticing me behind you for some time now. So I want to commend you for the good job you're doing.

My question to you is on the interface between At-Large and the Board. You're supposed to be the listening ears. One of the things that has been going on around, around, and around is the issue of this multi-stakeholder structure, which I mentioned earlier. How do you, as our representative on the ICANN Board – can you just answer the same question?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Yes.

LEON SANCHEZ: Thank you. So, as Cherine said, this is not about modifying the structure of any of the SOs or ACs that live within ICANN. I think

it's more of way to try to think of tools to address the challenges that the multi-stakeholder model faces. We have seen that the multi-stakeholder process within ICANN has sometimes grown too complex, and that may have led to some inefficiencies, "inefficient" meaning in that some discussions take a very long time to come to any given outcome.

There have also been some issues when you have groups of people discussing a certain topic and they are not able to reach consensus. This produces a gridlock that we need to break.

So what we are trying to ask from you is feedback as to which would be the ways in which we could more efficiently work and by which we could better provide this space and this channel for exchanging ideas, discussing issues and topics, reaching consensus, and producing outcomes that can actually be implemented by the Board and the organization.

So what the strategic plan that we are designing and to which you are invited to comment upon says is that we are trying to evolve this multi-stakeholder model of governance. We referred to just what I said. We want to find ways to better address the issues that we are discussing to find better ways to reach consensus and to try to make it more efficient in terms of the time we are all spending in these discussions because we are also worried that there is a huge amount of work being done by all volunteers

within the community and this, of course, leads to exhaustion. So we know that there is volunteer burnout, as we call it, within ICANN. We want everyone within ICANN to continue to work but in a way that doesn't affect other parts of their environment. So this is what we mean by calling for ideas to evolve this multi-stakeholder model. Thank you.

ADBULKARIM OLOYEDE: Sorry. A follow-up. Just totally—

SEUN OJDEJI: Sorry. Our time is really, really far spent. We still have a long – I can tell you're a fan of Leon, I guess, so you can always track him down and then ask the questions. Thank you very much.

LEON SANCHEZ: Yes, and I am very happy to follow up either via e-mail or once you are finished with your meeting. Please come forward and I will be happy to continue this discussion.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Yes, indeed. Thank you very much, Leon.

Okay. So we have two more speakers. I would like to ask that they keep it short, as much as they can. We have Pierre. Pierre Dandjinou is the V.P. for the GSE for the Africa region. We all know

Pierre. Pierre has been of great support to us at AFRALO and even within the entire AfrICANN as it concerns ICANN.

Pierre, you have the floor.

PIERRE DANDJINO:

Thank you very much, and a very good morning to everyone. Yeah, as you said, I'll just keep it short. I will be quite brief.

As far [I'm] concerned, I would really like to again say how happy I am when I have to meet you guys and be at these sort of meetings.

Of course, what I might be saying here is about what I said last year or, I don't know, the last meeting when we meet, which is how best to spread the word within Africa, how, using this sort of [inaudible] with you guys, how do we really spread the word, meaning for me, it's not just about the AFRALO, about RALOs. It's exactly how do you make sure that, whatever you are doing – for instance, I would like to really congratulate you for these hot topics that you lined up here. I think this is quite important. So that [proposition] just go through and really understand what is happening here.

You are actual are serving one of the issues that we as ICANN staff in Africa have been facing, which is how do you prepare Africans for the ICANN meetings and what are the mechanisms you put in

place so that Africans don't just come to those meetings as tourists but at least as pure contributors to whatever we are doing here? I think it's important.

So this document you developed I would like clearly to thank you for. It's quite important because, in Africa, it's not just simply to tell people to go to the website and everything is there. Sometimes some of them need these hard copies and I like it.

Another thing I noticed. I went through your website and then your space, and I saw something quite interesting. I see this has been the 20th statement that you are going to produce. I think it's quite interesting. I don't think we have this one in other regions. This is quite important. I really think that you really deserve our congratulations for that because for you to take your time to think about those issues and to decide to make sure that these statements are sent to the Board? I think they are useful.

And, definitely, this echoes what Cherine was saying earlier on, that he needs your voice to be heard. But not your voice in the kind of disorder or individual coming up there; a quite organized voice, which really stems from Africa and explains, "Okay. This is the situation. This is the way. This is our vision about issues that we are actually highlighting." I think it's quite important.

So what I'm trying and I'm begging you here to do is not just about you as At-Large. It's about the whole of our stakeholders in Africa.

Last year, I was seeing how much do you spread the word in the countries. How much government, for instance, actually knows about what you're doing? How much of the private sector? This multi-stakeholder mechanism or model we are talking about within ICANN – how are we reflecting this one on the country level, for instance? I think this is quite important for Africa.

So these are things I would like you to consider. Finally, of course, ICANN staff stands ready in any way to facilitate what you can do with the means and resources that we have. We are ready for that. Again, thank you very much for the collaboration that we do have. This is going to be a continuous one.

So thanks for having me here. Of course, if there are any questions, I'd be happy to respond. Thanks.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Pierre, for all the words that you said about AFRALO, about our work.

You said that we have about 20 statements already developed and already passed to the Board. It began in Brussels. And you must remember, Pierre, that it was about the fees of the new gTLDs.

Since then, we always address the very hot topics and we give a precise and common position of Africa about it. This is something

that no other region did. All the regions now are trying to have their own spaces – all the regions – and they are trying to do the same. We have to be proud of us because we did this since 2010.

We are not addressing any kind of topic. We are addressing the real hot topics and the [work] in ICANN because we want to impact the decision. That’s why we sent out statement to the Board and to the concerned parties, such as the working group who is working on etc.

So I think you very much for highlighting this, and I think that we should continue. If we don’t continue, we will be in another situation. I hope that our region will be always on the top, always making the right initiatives and be really contributing to the work of ICANN and to the activities of ICANN. Thank you.

SEUN OJDEJI:

Okay. Thank you very much. I think I’m going to set a requester to put up a one-minute timer. No longer two minutes, please. One-minute timer, and, please, let us be brief and concise.

John Laprise?

JOHN LAPRISE:

I’d like to put on my hat as Vice-Chair for Policy of ALAC and really strongly encourage all of you to get more involved in the

Consolidated Policy Working Group and making policy and feeding into the policy that we are trying to have an impact here at ICANN. Your voices are important and we need to hear them in the working groups, participating in the mailing lists, participating in the calls. We need to hear your voices.

If you don't speak, Africa will be silent, and that's not what we want. That's not who we are. So I implore all of you to get involved. Talk to your ALSes. Talk to your individual members, and get involved in the Consolidated Policy Working Group. Thank you.

SEUN OJDEJI:

Thank you, John. Any questions for Pierre? Questions, comments?

Okay. Thank you very much, Pierre. I hope you still stay with us through the meeting.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

I'll be around. Maybe just once again to say that, after Tijani, as I always said, there is always something new out of Africa. You remember the regional strategy we are talking about. Africa was the first region to develop such a document, such a contract, [with] regions. It's important to say this.

You also remember the DNS Forums that everyone is now doing. The first one ICANN organized was in Durban. We started this as well.

I would really like to also insist on what my good friend over there had just said. Your participation in working groups, your participation in really helping developing those policies, I think is important. And, yes, it's not just about participation. We as ICANN staff really want to have now what you call unimproved participation within ICANN. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you very much. Now we'll move to the last speaker, which is Laurent Ferrali. I think that is French. Perhaps Tijani should do – maybe Tijani can do it better.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much. I would like to present Laurent. She is here to represent Ms. Kamel who is the Senior – oh, he – is the Senior [Advisor to the President, Government Engagement]. Thank you for being here. I'll give you the floor.

LAURENT FERRALI:

First, I would like to convey Tarek Kamel’s apologies and thanks. He was not able to attend this meeting since he didn’t travel to Kobe this time. So thank you very much for the invitation.

I’m working with the Governmental Engagement Team. My work is mostly focused on governments who are in ICANN. I was a GAC rep a few years ago, and I was involved in the discussion within ICANN related to the first round.

I want to stress that the role of government was not and is not only to provide safeguards. The role of governments is to help the local applicants from the countries to better understand the environment and to work with them in order to promote local applications. So there is a very positive role of governments beside the safeguards role they have.

Everyone here knows about the Beijing GAC advice, which was fully of safeguards. But it’s not the only role of government in ICANN. They are key to promote the local DNS industry in their country and to help the applications.

But the situation we are facing now in the GAC is that many governments from the global south – I will not use “underserved region”; I prefer “the global south” – are not ready. I think they are not ready and they think they are not ready to support their [inaudible] local applicants because there is still a lack of DNS/ICANN knowledge.

The Government Engagement Team is coordinating ICANN org's effort to help these governments to take a more active part in a discussion within ICANN and understand better the ICANN environment [and that] of the GAC, etc., etc.

We have organized eight capacity-building workshops between January 2017 and June 2018, three in Africa; the first one in Nairobi, Kenya the second one in Johannesburg, and the third on in Dakar. [inaudible] ICANN org's efforts, but the ICANN community has provided a lot of help to us as well as the ICANN Board, the ICANN community and AFRALO especially. We have strong support from Aziz and Tijani for the GAC capacity-building workshops in Africa, especially in Nairobi, Kenya and in Dakar.

I would like to thank you, AFRALO, and especially Tijani and Aziz for this very friendly and very valuable support during this pilot phase of the GAC capacity-building workshop initiative.

Now the GAC Underserved Regions Working Group – I cannot change the name of the working group, so we're not using Global South Working Group – is planning to continue this GAC capacity-building initiative. We will have a new workshop in Marrakech in June.

But the problem we were facing is that the GAC itself is—

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

LAURENT FERRALI: Hmm?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]?

LAURENT FERRALI: Yeah. The GAC will benefit from better coordination with the ALAC on this capacity-building initiative. I was very happy to hear that the GAC and ALAC are planning to establish a joint focus group on capacity-building. That's very, very good news, and I would like to thank you for that because I'm quite sure that you will bring a lot of expertise and lot of energy to this GAC capacity-building workshop initiative.

Thank you very much.

SEUN OJDEJI: Thank you very much. If there are comments – but I recall one of the capacity-building workshops held in Nairobi, which I also attended. I think Tijani was also that particular one. I think it was a very successful one, and I'm happy to hear that you've actually taken this forward and are continuing that effort.

Any comments, questions, to Laurent?

All right. So thank you, Laurent.

Now we'll move to the next item on the agenda, which is the introduction to the [thematic] topics. I will call on – but before I do that, I would ask Aziz – Aziz is a NomCom representative from AFRALO – that he tell us what he wants to tell us about the NomCom.

Aziz, you have two minutes. Alan should also get ready for a two-minute speech as well after Aziz. Aziz, you have the floor.

AZIZI HILALI: I'll agree to have three minutes. Please—

SEUN OJEDEJI: I know you can't do it in two, so please go ahead.

AZIZ HILALI: Okay. As long as we have good interpreters, I will speak in French. Thank you very much for giving me the floor. I'm going to speak in French and I will tell you more about the leadership at the ICANN level through NomCom 2019.

We have a presentation that was already done, and I want to do it again with AFRALO-AfrICANN because some people were not

present during the first time around. So we have three seats for a three-year term at the ICANN Board level.

I'm going to let you know about diversity at that level. We have two seats for the GNSO Council, three seats for the At-Large Advisory Committee: Asia, Africa, and Europe – no, not Europe. Oh, I forgot the third region, but I think it's Latin America. And one seat for the ccNSO Council for a three-year term. For the PTI Board of Directors – this is new – one seat. For the first time, there's going to be a selection of leader[s] for the PTI Board of Directors.

So this is a call to ALSes, to everybody from the AfrICANN community. Last year, as you know about the NomCom process – next slide – the NomCom process there is the pre-selection in April.

Next slide, please. The next one. Next slide, then we'll go back to that slide. Next slide, please. Yes, that's right. You see the important faces and you see the selection process. We are doing outreach. In April, we're going to meet face-to-face, and we're going to pre-select and eliminate several candidates. We're going to have a list with interviews for candidates notably at the Board level. [That's] new information I want to give to you today. The deadline is all the way to March. So if you're interested, you have until March 22nd to apply for about ten leadership positions.

In April, we're going to have an idea of the pre-selection, and the final selection will be done in Marrakech in June. The interviews will happen for people that would like to become ICANN Board members.

Next slide. Very good. So you see the distribution of those Board members. North America already has six seats. For Africa, we have two seats. We have Cherine, and Cherine is going to leave. [Aziz] [inaudible]. So for Africa, you have two seats.

For sure, according to our rules, NomCom rules and regulations, we to have one or two Board members from Africa. In ALAC, there will be a seat for an African person.

And I'm hear to answer your questions as well. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you very much. There you have it. I guess the most important is that people, please, if you know anyone who is interested in serving on the Board or serving any of these positions, please get them to apply for the application closes.

Any question for Aziz?

No questions. Thank you. Now, Alan, quickly. We invite Alan, the CEO of AFRINIC. He has something to tell us.

ALAN BARRETT:

Thank you very much for the opportunity. Hello, everybody. I'm Alan Barrett from AFRINIC. I'm here to tell you that the Africa Internet Summit will be held in Kampala, Uganda from the 9th to the 21st of June. That's a two-week period. The first week is training workshops, and the second week is more like a conference. It will include the AFRINIC policy discussions and the AFRINIC annual general meeting. That will include elections for the AFRINIC Board.

I would like to ask you, if you know good people who would be good candidates to sit on the AFRINIC, please, would you encourage them to apply, to put their names forward to the AFRINIC NomCom?

The AFRINIC NomCom has not yet made an announcement, but I expect that to be coming very soon. So when you see the announcement from the AFRINIC NomCom, encourage the good people who live in Africa to put their names forward or to be nominated to sit on the AFRINIC Board.

Okay. I think I've taken less than two minutes. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you for saving some time. So that's it. The other thing about that is that there is a number of seats that are actually open this time around for the AFRINIC Board. We encourage people to

apply. I think it's about five or six seats that are open at the time. That has never happened before. So, please, if you know anybody that is interested, [do share that].

No I wonder why I am talking about AFRNIC this much. Okay. All right. Thank you very much, and we will now go to Tijani. Two minutes please, Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much. French or English? How many French speakers in the room? I am – okay. I am proud to be between my two very young colleagues, Seun and Sarah. Mohamed said that we co-chair, but I told him I am assisting you. And I am assisting him because this is a kind of handover that needs to be done. I hope that those young people will make AFRALO has strong and as visible and as – how to say? – contributive as we, the older people, did.

So the subject of this statement is about the new gTLD subsequent procedure. You know that there is a working group working on that. The working group is still working. There is no final recommendation. The recommendation didn't go through the public comments – the final recommendation – and then the Board didn't approve those recommendations.

Yet, there is a company who issued a proposal for the upcoming round of new gTLDs. We think, our community thinks, that is premature because of all of what I said now and also because there is still very important issues about the new gTLDs because we don't know if the 2012 round really contributed in giving the end users an added value, and, second, if this round contributed to the security and stability of the DNS, etc.

These issues are studied, if you want, are looked at now, and we don't have yet the result of this study. So we cannot go for a new round while we don't have what the affect of the previous one was.

So that's why we try to make this point and bring the point of our community about it. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI:

Thank you, Tijani. We actually have spent so much time, and we have a very hard stop at the end. So I would just quickly – I'm on the agenda to actually read the statement, so I'll just quickly go through the statement. Then, please, we will take comments once I go through the statement because we need to read it, I am told, for transcript purposes.

The topic is the new gTLD subsequent procedures, a proposal of Neustar regarding the upcoming round of new gTLDs. We the

AfrICANN community members participating in the ICANN64 community forum and attending the joint AFRALO-AfrICANN meeting on Wednesday, the 13th of March, 2019, discussed the proposal of Neustar regarding the upcoming round of the new generic top-level domains (gTLDs).

I would like to make the following comments. We believe that, to be seriously considered by the community, the Neustar proposal must go through the new gTLD subsequent procedure policy development process (PDP), the working group process. It should be subject to a deep and effective discussion at the [preliminary] level of the work group, be formalized in a recommendation in the working group reports, and go through an official public comment process.

We find the Neustar proposal premature since it's not yet decided [when the] application round or window would be open, nor what kind of round or window, successive round or single round, would be appropriate. Their proposal of a [phased] round followed immediately by an open round gives us the impression that a decision is already made.

They are no definite data or studies of solution details to establish whether the 2012 round of the new gTLDs actually resulted in improving consumer choice, competition, and trust, fostering

innovation in the DNS industry, or reducing domain name confusion, DNS abuses, etc.

We believe that the new gTLD Program still has many issues that need to be addressed before considering opening new application rounds. The definition of the community and the evaluation system of a community application is simply an example of such issues.

The new gTLD Subsequent Procedures PDP Work Track 5 (WT5) is still debating the treatment of geographic names that can be reserved or at least subject to preventive measures.

On the other hand, there is no determination as to what constitutes a generic string, and not the geographic name [according to] what is in the 2012 Applicant Guide Book (AGB).

All these make difficulties in demarcation between .brands, geographic, and generic names. In the event the next application rounds were contemplated and effective demarcations between TLD categories was adopted, [inaudible] there is community consensus and ICANN Board approval. If a phased approach is considered, we think that applications of the first phases could undergo initial evaluation but should not be delegated or contracted for until all the applications for all categories have been evaluated initially, undergone comments, [shook] all

objection, and for which contentions have been identified are resolved.

The community-based applications should not be combined together with generic TLD applications, although brand strings are typically used as closed TLDs and therefore carry little or no domain abuse. .brand applications should not be privatized. [inaudible] brand owners or trademark owners already enjoy the presumption of a strong claim to a string matching their brand name under trademark laws.

Community TLDs and applications supported by the Applicant Support Program (ASP) should have the priority in case of string contention.

The precise dates for each phase in the Neustar proposal [inaudible] as [inaudible] only gives the feeling of pressure on the community and the Board of Directors pushing them to override the prescribed PDP process and timeline.

We strongly oppose any attempt to go beyond the working group charter to engage in an activity that interferes with or impedes an objective concentration by the ICANN Board of the final report of the new gTLD Subsequent Procedures PDP Working Group.

And that ends the draft statement. As you may recall, [this] was discussed on the list, and this is what we have produced as our

draft statement. If there are modifications, comments, or reactions to this, I will ask staff to put up a one-minute timer and we'll take that.

The floor is open.

Is that plus-one from everybody?

Abdulkarim, you have the floor.

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: No, no, no. I'm just giving a plus-one, commending those that drafted the document.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Okay. No comments?

All right. So, as you all know, what normally happens after this is that we'll actually then submit this to the ICANN Board and also to other working groups that are actually concerned, perhaps, such as the group working on this particular policy.

So if there are no further comments on that, I think we can then – we have five minutes left, so we have five minutes to play around with – are there any other comments or any other discussion that you would like to discuss or you'd like to raise?

Tijani, you have the floor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay. I'm going to speak in French. Hello. So, for that job to be done, we needed the support of the ALAC staff from the start. We needed their support as ALAC staff. Without them, we would not have been able to do it and to make it; the support from as well the ICANN staff. We invite Johan and Cherine at the head of the Board. Pierre Dandjinou is our Vice-President for Africa. He is always here and present. So we have a lot of support. That is great. That is why we're able to do our work.

We have to keep going. For AFRALO, we need new initiatives. You'll remember, Heidi, when we meet in Africa, I tell her, "We're going to work differently, but you know, there is always a budget and financial impact." But we need to meet innovative. We have to have new initiatives to build upon and to improve the visibility of AFRALO and the credibility of AFRALO. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much. John, you have the floor.

JOHN LAPRISE: I would also ask that staff – my understanding is this is going to, as Seun said, the Board and to a different group. But this document should also be circulated on the ALAC. So it should be posted to ALAC. I find myself – again, as Vice-Chair of Policy – very

supportive of this document. I think it's just a lot of good things and really important things. Some of the things that are in this document were expressed this morning at the ALAC Board meeting. So well-done. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much, John. I think we will in fact do that. Perhaps we will also cc the CCWG as well, just for completeness.

All right. Any other comments?

Abdulkarim?

ABDULKARIM OLOYEDE: Sorry. Since we have some minutes to play with, I just want to comment—

SEUN OJEDEJI: Actually, we don't have minutes to play with the game. We only have one.

ADBULKARIM OLOYEDE: No, I just want to commend you guys for doing a great job. Thank you.

SEUN OJEDEJI: Thank you very much. And that's finally [inaudible], actually, and we'd just like to thank that we normally forget to thank, which is the interpreters. They are doing a very good job. Thank you very much for helping us and supporting us.

And also thanks to the staff as well, and also the technical team for making sure that the technical side of this remains up and running.

See you guys online.

[GISELLA GRUBER]: Thank you, everyone, for your information. Our next session is the At-Large Leadership Wrap-Up.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]