

---

KOBE – Fellowship Daily Session  
Tuesday, March 12, 2019 – 12:00 to 13:30 JST  
ICANN64 | Kobe, Japan

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** Ladies and gentlemen, our tech team, can we start recording and video? Thank you very much. I hope you enjoyed your lunch and still continue enjoying it. I would like to introduce our guest today. Today we'll have the pleasure, Senior Advisory to CEO, ICANN CEO and also Senior Vice President of ICANN, Sally Costerton who is also leading GSC Team, Communications Team, PRS, Public Responsibility Team, and we have also our Asia Pacific Team here who is hosting ICANN 64. Jia-Rong is Vice President for the region. Hopefully, you had the chance already to meet with him and we have the team here who we'll introduce later. But first, let's go to Sally. Sally, the floor is yours.

**SALLY COSTERTON:** Siranush, thank you. And thank you all for seeing us today. You are such an important part of ICANN. And so that you know what our role is, which is the main goal of this session or this day for you, ICANN has engagement in its mission. You may not realize this, but it's quite helpful to know this.

People look at engagement and outreach and they tend to think, "Oh, it's a kind of good thing to do. We should just do it because

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

---

it’s a good thing to do.” But actually, we have to do it in order to fulfill our mission. So it is a very central part of ICANN itself and particularly, the focus for the work that we do, and the reason why we have a fellowship program, is to ... a major focus is to bring new participants to ICANN. This is in our values. If you read our mission with the bylaws, you will see that in the core values and commitments, the mission asks ICANN to bring the Internet users of the world to ICANN. Not every single one of them, but a representative group, and very importantly, having brought them to ICANN, equip them with the skills to participate in our policymaking and technical coordination practices.

So as a fellow, this is what you are starting your journey on, is learning about, first of all, we brought you, literally in this case, to an ICANN meeting. Although the values and commitments don’t require us to bring all the Internet users of the world to an ICANN meeting, just to be clear. But you are very fortunate, I think in some ways, because these are very competitive programs so very many congratulations on being selected for the Fellowship Program. It is not easy and I hope that you will benefit enormously from this experience.

So my team and I are here to explain to you today what we do and how we want to work with you, and hopefully, it will spark some thinking in your mind about things that might interest you and ways that you might want to participate with us, particularly

---

in the regions after this meeting. And it will, as a minimum, introduce you to your contact person in your region and if you want to know more, and I hope that you will, you will be able to know exactly who you are talking to and who is there to help you to become more deeply engaged in ICANN on an ongoing basis. So that's the purpose of being here.

Also for the record, I don't actually run communications. It is confusing because the person that does run communications is also called Sally. So I just feel that this might go down badly if she thinks I've annexed her department over lunch.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: My apologies.

SALLY COSTERTON: Don't worry, Siranush. I just thought I'd better put it right.

So that's what I do. I also sit on the Executive Team in the ICANN Org, which is the, I'm sure you know the Org and how it fits in by now. So this is the staff part of the ICANN community and I work with my colleagues who run different functions and departments in the ICANN Org, so legal, the CIO, on the technical side, the CTO of technical strategy, our Head of Strategy, Theresa Swinehart, who's leading the strategic plan, and so forth. So that's quite an important part and the reason I mention

---

that is because the Fellowship Program, which falls under my responsibilities, it's a high profile program inside the ICANN community with the Board and with the organization. It's one we're very proud of and it's one that's grown a lot over the years.

And I wanted you to know that the program, and therefore, you have representation at the senior management level of ICANN through me and through the team that work with me which Siranush leads so ably on the Fellowship Program, and she's wonderful, as you all know, very experienced, literally fellow herself and community member. So just something to bear in mind for now and potentially for the future, that that's how seriously we take the program.

So what I'm going to do now is hand it over to Jia-Rong who is my esteemed colleague who leads this region's engagement and is our main contact person or our senior contact person for this very large region, the APAC region. Jia-Rong?

JIA-RONG LOW:

Thank you, Sally. So some of you have met me on Saturday morning. My name is Jia-Rong. I am the Vice President for Engagement for Asia and also the Managing Director for the ICANN APAC Office that is based in Singapore. [It covers] the region.

---

For the record, I was not hired by a talent agency just to host opening ceremony yesterday morning. So I know some people were surprised when I went to introduce, “Hi, I’m so-and-so from ICANN,” and they were like, “Oh, you’re actually not just the host for yesterday morning’s opening ceremony?” Yeah.

SALLY COSTERTON: They just thought you were a professional host.

JIA-RONG LOW: Yeah, they thought I was a professional host.

SALLY COSTERTON: That’s great.

JIA-RONG LOW: I don’t know whether it’s a compliment or not, actually.

SALLY COSTERTON: I think it’s [inaudible].

JIA-RONG LOW: So anyway, coming back to this, in a bit, I will hand over the time to my colleague, Joyce, who is sitting next to me. I did mention to you that the region is very large. The APAC region actually

---

starts from Armenia all the way to the Pacific islands. It's very, very large and we have different staff who cover the sub-regions looking after you in terms of direct relationships.

So let's say if you are from Armenia, our colleague, Natalia, is looking after you based on the relationship basis. If you are from, let's say, the Middle East, then my colleague, Baher, is looking after you from a relationship perspective.

There are regional programs like, for example, the Asia Pacific Regional IGF. For those events, it definitely covers a much broader base and everyone here is welcome if you are from the region, and from my office, we will work very closely with you based on that.

So again, don't need to have an identity crisis like, "Oh, I'm from Pakistan. Is it that I'm now in the Middle East?" The answer is no. You are still with the APAC region. It's just that the colleagues, Baher, Fahd, they will look after you more directly so that you get that focus, the attention because the region is really very, very vast and broad.

The second thing I wanted to talk about, really, is working with you, the fellows. The Internet, as we all know it, is a network of networks. That is technically a network of networks, right? But it works for us people. The people are the ones who use the Internet and the same network of networks is required for us to

make sure that there is participation to continue to evolve the Internet’s unique identifier system as we go along. People are using the Internet differently. You are using the Internet very differently from how I’m using it and I know I’m actually starting to lag behind the times. I have a couple of younger colleagues. They will sometimes snicker quietly because I’m not up to date with the newest applications. I’m still using a very old application.

So it moves very quickly and there will be issues. The issues are evolving as we go along. You notice that the past couple of ICANN meetings, the discussions revolve around the European GDPR which has, the legislation in itself has unintended consequences to the WHOIS system in ICANN.

The issues will keep evolving and they will touch you in different ways, and it is when you know what the issues are happening, what’s on the table, what are the issues that are evolving and that they impact you and your community. It is through that network we have with you that we can bring the right people to the table.

So your role is extremely important within the region, and later on, my colleague, Joyce and the team, will share with you a lot more about how you can make a huge impact. Having been a fellow, having understood some of the issues, having

---

understood how the model works, that you can actually be leading conversations in your own communities and we have seen success cases of these before, fellows who have gone onto actually all of the nice national IGF, fellows who have gone onto be drafting the Internet engineering task force drafts, fellows who go onto the Internet regional registries like the APNIC within the region, contributing. And these are just some very small examples. We are hoping to hear from you what are some of the things you are interested in, what are things you like to do, and we share with you some examples of fellows who were before you who have gone on to do more and hope that we can work with you more closely and help you reach out to your communities. So you are our leaders.

Our job as staff, our job from the regional office, our job is to help you. But you are really our leaders who will bring the right people to the table to contribute. So keep that in mind. Sometimes you think, “Oh yeah, I’m just a fellow. I’m just here to learn.” But it always has to start somewhere and I hope that you keep this in mind, that you are our future leaders.

So with that, I will ... Should I hand the [time] back to Siranush first before we go further?



---

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I think we have a couple of minutes if there are any questions for Sally and Jia-Rong because they need to leave us and head to another meeting. But I would like to take this opportunity for asking questions directly to them before going to our regional team. Any questions?

Yes, please. Claire?

CLAIRE CRAIG: Hi, I'm [inaudible] being with us and sharing. I have heard several times that as a fellow, there is a lot of resources that are available to us but the whole idea is that after we leave here, we are supposed to be able to go back to our communities and become productive. This is my fourth time here and I'm still finding it really very difficult. I sit in on meetings and part of the NCUC. I sit in on NCUC meetings. I sit in on NCSG meetings, on ALAC, and it still seems as if everything is just going over my head and I still cannot find, determine how to get involved in a working group or what should I do.

One of the things you spoke about this morning, Sally, was the ICANN Learn and I really find that that's a very good resource. But still, it doesn't help you to move off of the learning curve and really get involved in the community. And part of why we're here is so that we could be involved and I just wanted to know if you could share some idea as to how do you take that leap, because

---

a lot of the times, also – and now I’m going on a little bit – people tell you, “Oh, just listen for a while, just listen for a while because you may not be ready to be in the whole policy development process.” But you could listen and listen and listen until it becomes analysis paralysis.

SALLY COSTERTON:

Claire, thank you for your comment. I think that there are many people in the ICANN community, including many people outside this room who would, I was going to say secretly agree with you. Maybe they would openly agree with you and I think you raise an incredibly important point.

It is an issue that we have struggled with as a community, certainly in my six years at ICANN, and we have made progress but this is the trick. This is the point. How do you go from learning to participation is what I’m hearing you say, and how do you have the confidence is probably the biggest issue, to feel like you can contribute to a working group that you know enough, if that’s the right word.

And there isn’t an easy answer. These groups are all very different. The topics are very different from each other and we’re all different people. Some people don’t feel they need to know very much at all to contribute and they’re fine to just show up at a meeting and say, “Well, this is what I think,” whether they

---

know enough or not is a totally separate issue and because this is a volunteer community and a bottom-up process, you will find – and this was raised this morning in one of the board meetings actually with the community – there is not a culture not just at ICANN but in the Internet space as a whole, at criticizing other people. We let each other talk. That, by the way, contributes to the analysis paralysis as well because it's quite a slow process. But it's not like being in a company where people say you can't get this job until you know how to do these things. We are, in that sense, relying on the individual competence of you, of each of us, and also the will and the support on the mentoring, particularly, of more experienced community members.

Now, you asked me to make a practical suggestion which I will do. Firstly, you become an alumni, you become part of a network and you've, obviously, already done that. Where do you live, Claire?

CLAIRE CRAIG:                      Trinidad.

SALLY COSTERTON:                  Trinidad.

---

CLAIRE CRAIG: Trinidad and Tobago.

SALLY COSTERTON: Trinidad and Tobago, so you are in our LAC region and that means you fall under the auspices of my colleague who is not here, Rodrigo. You know Rodrigo.

CLAIRE CRAIG: Yes.

SALLY COSTERTON: So Rodrigo is ... I was going to say Rodrigo is Jia-Rong, but they're not exactly the same. They've never been mistaken for each other as far as I know, but they have the same role and they both work together with me in our GSC team. And Rodrigo is responsible for the regional community of ICANN. That's what the VPs are doing. They are ICANN's institutional face for ... not quite the right word ... organizational resource in the region.

And in Rodrigo's particular case, he is also the managing director of our Latin America and Caribbean regional office, which is, as you probably know, is in Montevideo. And you might say, "Well, that's a long way from Trinidad and Tobago," and you would be right.

But seriously, I personally think based on what I've seen in the community and in my time at ICANN, that once you've been through the learning stage, and you do need to do that a bit – we all need to go, “I need to understand this whole sentence” – we've all been there. Then the participation works best initially in the regions.

I really believe that because they are face-to-face events. You build networks, as Jia-Rong was saying, networks of people. Often, people make friends, friendships. They set up informal mentorships. They work with other partners in the region that they may not previously have known but that are part of the Internet infrastructure in that region.

And this allows them to move a little more at their own pace, plus you will find, perhaps not so much in your region, but in many other regions, you are working in your own language. This is another big barrier to moving out of that learning trough and into the participation. So for all of you in the Fellowship Program, I would passionately encourage you as Jia-Rong has said, to join with those regional teams, and these guys are here to help that to happen – that's their primary role – and to speak to you regularly.

So in your case, it's Albert actually because Rodrigo has a number two in the Caribbean. Albert Daniels has the best job in

---

ICANN. He gets to be the Head of Engagement for the Caribbean. He lives in Saint Lucia. I mean, cool job.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: We work closely with Albert.

SALLY COSTERTON: We do everything we can – obviously, we can’t do it for you – but we do everything we can to try and creatively find you opportunities and people to work with. And it’s not perfect. I wouldn’t pretend it’s perfect, but I think what we try to do is bring the infrastructure, so the programs, the websites, the learning platforms, together with the people and help you to build relationships and build your careers as well. And for many of you, this is a reason why you’ve come to ICANN. It’s either part of your career already or you want to utilize your time at ICANN to build your CV and build your career.

So I hope that we can discuss this more, but you’ve hit a really key issue and for everybody in the room that’s a fellow for the first time, what Claire is saying is something that not everybody experiences but it’s not uncommon and so when you feel, “How do I move to the next stage?” this is a great time to reach out to the team and ask that question and say, “How do I move to the next stage? I feel like I’m stuck. I feel like I know enough. My

---

brain is full of facts. Now I need to go and do something active. What do you recommend?”

Sorry, Siranush. That was a very long answer but I feel like a lot of people might ask the same question. Thank you, Claire.

**SIRANUSH VARDANYAN:** I think that Claire is one of those who already very active on regional level, engaged in, like Melissa from Guyana, they are leading the national IGFs in their countries and this is the challenge overall we are facing in every community that here, the engagement here on the community level here, it’s not only being in-person at the meeting. Following remotely and working remotely between the meetings is also one of the keys that we should take advantage of.

So together with the suggestions coming, so these are also something that you can keep on doing, which I know you are already doing. But thank you for your question. Any other questions? Yes, Cláudio, please.

**CLÁUDIO LUCENA:** If I may, I’ve also been a fellow and I’m contributing as a coach. I would like If you have one more minute to build on what Claire has said because it’s not only complex to Board and to start working. It’s getting more and more complex each time. Take us

---

back to three years ago where GDPR was there, but not with a network of intricate connections on jurisdiction and all the other issues that are on the table now.

So I sent that to Siranush already, but I wanted to take the opportunity to share with you guys, I'm a professor so my job is capacity building. That's my day job. And I do acknowledge that all the time, that you're running here the largest and the most diverse and the most democratic fellowship program in the Internet governance scenario in our world. And I'm very proud to be part of that.

I have faced the time when we had to go through changes in the program, even a threat of a great reduction in the funds because of budget constraints that were common to all the community. And I'm glad that those constraints didn't bring the program even less than what it is because of my first statement, because it's not only complex, it's getting more and more complex. So if the community needs to build new talents and find new leadership, this program has to be treated with extreme care because that's the way we bring on new people to the board. Thanks for the moment.

SALLY COSTERTON:

Thank you, Cláudio. Yes, and I think the discussion that you're referring to, which was, I think, last summer around the public



---

comment questions around the budget. This is what you're talking about.

Well, I can tell you you're quite right. Although going through this process was a little bit painful – yes, it was – but what it did quite unintentionally just in my personal opinion, was it dramatically raised awareness of the fellowship program with the Board, with the wider leadership community within ICANN and other communities who may not be very familiar with the Fellowship Program because I think there was this outcry that came from the fellows, and in fact, literally, as I recall in the public forum, and it hit home.

Now I'm not suggesting that we should encourage everybody to shout loudly and argue with each other about priorities, but what it did, I think, was once and for all, really make the point powerfully to the community as a whole who have to approve the budget now. So it's not just the Board, it's everybody – that this program needed to be protected and if it lost critical mass, the consequences for the ICANN community in the longer term would be quite serious and this is what you're saying.

So I am very grateful to the fellows for taking the opportunity to stand up for the program and to help the rest of the community understand what an important role it plays. I'm not saying there will never be any discussions in the future about it. That would

---

be I don't know. But it made a difference. It really made a difference.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: I think Cláudio was one of the contributors and taking it very personally, and there were a lot of fellows making the personal contribution to what we have now and the fact that the program is evolving with the support of fellows like you coming and providing your support during the process and then suggesting improvements for us makes it even better, so I will be looking for continued support for improvement and suggestions from you coming. Jia-Rong, please? Okay, with that, I just would like to thank you and I know you have to leave. But thank you for your time being with us.

SALLY COSTERTON: I'm sorry we have to leave early but I know our colleagues will report back to us on the rest of the conversation. Have a great afternoon.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Paola, we'll use your chance to ask question to Joyce. Thank you very much, Jia-Rong and Sally. Thank you. And Joyce, if I can give the floor to you. Paola?

PAOLA PÉREZ:

Thank you. I am a fellow from Venezuela and I have not been very active in the ICANN community but I have been very active in ISOC. Sorry. Actually, I am the advisor person of ISOC Venezuela and I have been leading many projects related to connectivity in Venezuela.

So I don't know. I mean, a part of the work that I know that ICANN is doing and you have very many working groups like the IETF. I'm also there because I'm technical and also in the LACNIC, I am the Chair of the Policy Forum, of Policy Development in LACNIC. So I don't know how can I contribute, for example, in projects in Venezuela that I can show they were in ICANN, in Venezuela specifically.

JOYCE CHEN:

Thanks very much for the question. So before I answer you, I should introduce myself first. I am Joyce Chen from the ICANN APAC Regional Office and I'm also based in Singapore so I'm also Singaporean. And a lot of the examples that I will be bringing out to you would be, unfortunately, more for the APAC region but I see a lot of similarities in our regions as well, just from some of the things that you mentioned, ISOC, the chapters, you're also involved in LACNIC, so I will cover these things also from the APAC point of view.

---

So just to answer your question, one thing I would like you to consider is in the first place, when you're involved in the societies, in the communities that you are already in currently, do you bring in ICANN issues to those meetings and those events?

PAOLA PÉREZ:

Well, we organize the [MAC] in Venezuela last year. We celebrated first IGF starting by ISOC which showed the ICANN work in the IGF, for example, and also, I train people in the ISOC learnings in Latin America, so the ICANN content, what ICANN do on the job is in the ISOC learnings too.

But I would like to know, I know many young leaders, for example, that are working hard technically and also in the governance because I am [inaudible], and they are working hard and they have many ideas, many projects. So I don't know if ICANN can support this kind of project, for example.

JOYCE CHEN:

So we definitely do in terms of contributing support. So it could be in terms of knowledge support. For example, when we are at a certain national IGF or at regional IGFs, we would do some capacity training to just help people to understand how the Internet works from a technical perspective in the first place, but

---

at a very basic level. So it may be a bit too basic for technical people already, but for the rest of the community who are not quite there yet. So we do a lot of that to prepare people for the discussions that come next.

And then my question about whether you bring in the ICANN issues is how do you draw the parallels between what is happening in the ICANN world? So for example, the WHOIS discussions, how would that impact the different communities that you're already in and finding that link? So in our work, and we will go into that later on talking a bit more about our involvement in some of these events as well, how we try to bring in ICANN issues and get them discussed with communities that may not even know about ICANN to begin with. And for us, that's the hardest, hardest thing that we need to deal with.

So I'll leave this here for now because I don't want to neglect everybody else, and at the same time, I want to introduce the team who have not been introduced to you yet. Although, the first day, you already kind of saw us. But let me do it again.

So I have – and make sure I want to get it right – Savenaca Vocea who is our Vice President for Oceania. Do you want to say a few words? Just say hello?

---

SAVENACA VOCEA:

Thank you, Joyce, and thank you all for being in this session. I am the Regional Vice President for the Oceania region. There are 27 ccTLDs, like the country code Top-Level Domain registries in the Oceania region which includes Australia, New Zealand and all the other Pacific Island countries.

So in terms of my engagement, I really see that these under-served regions for a long time, mostly from the Pacific. We have had Australia and New Zealand for a long time participate in ICANN.

One of the things that I was looking for to do in the region was to get more participation from the Pacific and get their voices heard. So we will try to do that through identifying where the gaps were, and also, most importantly, seeing which of the players that could participate in ICANN. We've managed to get that through the participation of all the governments from the Pacific now who are in the GAC.

Most of the Country Code Top-Level Domain registries are also in the ccNSO and also, I think from a fellowship perspective, we do get a lot of fellows that are applying to come to ICANN, not only through the public fellowship but also through the GAC, ccNSO travels, so they're being supportive that way and I'm seeing that there is a lot of engagement now. So I'll stop there and let the other team speak.

---

JOYCE CHEN: Thanks, Save. Also next to me is Samiran Gupta here of India. Do you want to say hello?

SAMIRAN GUPTA: I think we met a couple of days ago and I had a pop quiz. One person remembered the answer. I don't know if you guys still remember what I had asked, so I'm not going to ask you. But anyway, joke's apart, I am Samiran Gupta. I work out of New Delhi, India. Some people know me across the borders, Afifa being one of them and, of course, right here from Nepal. Yes.

So we do a fair bit of engagement in India and think very similar to what Save just mentioned. The focus has been to get more active participation of the community in broader Internet governance issue and in specific ICANN-related issues. So I'll stop here.

JOYCE CHEN: And then next to Samiran, is Jian-Chuan Zhang who is our head of China.

JIAN-CHUAN ZHANG: Yeah, as the title would suggest, I am basically in Beijing, China. Before joining ICANN, I have 12 or 10 years of involvement in

---

ICANN. So like you, I used to be community member although I actually work for the TLD or domain name industry.

So anyway, when I was in [community], someone also asked me whether I'm Japanese. To be clear, I'm not. I'm Chinese. Thank you.

JOYCE CHEN:

Thanks. Yes, I get asked if I'm X nationality a lot. Okay, and then last, but of course, not the least, we have Kenn who is our GSE Analyst.

KENN YEE:

Hi, everybody. I usually introduce myself as Kenn from ICANN so it may help you to remember.

So I am the GSE Analyst. I'm also one of the newer members of the GSE team. I'm based in Singapore and this is my first time – I mentioned it on Friday I think – yeah, this is the first time at ICANN meeting so if you have any questions that you think you need a so-called loops analysis for or loops understanding of, then please come to me because I may be able to help you with that. I do have a very basic understanding of things but yeah, maybe it's good practice for me. So yeah, please feel free to ask me any questions. Thank you very much.



JOYCE CHEN:

Thanks, Kenn. So he's as much a newcomer as many of us here.

Okay, moving on, I want to quickly ask who here is first time to ICANN or to know about ICANN in this meeting? Anybody?

Okay. A couple of hands. Right. Okay. And of course, Kenn has to raise his hand. It's his first ICANN meeting. Okay, so a handful of you which means to me that this is quite a diverse group. There are some of you who are actually really, really involved, not just in your own local communities and regional communities, but also in ICANN itself, but you've come back and you want to contribute your knowledge in the fellowship. So thank you very much for those who are coming back again many, many times. You still love us. I'm glad to hear that.

So we had that discussion a bit earlier about, from Claire, contributing more and participating more in the working groups. And I want to share a few ideas so I don't know if this is practiced in your regions and I'd love for you to come and tell me and to share with this group. So this is a discussion. This isn't a presentation. I've got no slides. I want to hear from you.

So one of the things that we do in our APAC region is something called ICANN read-outs. So you're probably familiar with that. Okay, good. And so for those who are new in this room, an

---

ICANN read-out is basically a community-led event that after the ICANN meeting, community will gather and then they will talk about what was discussed at the ICANN meeting itself. So if a community member is not able to attend an ICANN meeting in-person or maybe they attended online but it's very hard to follow online. Let's be real. Remote participation is actually very difficult and we know that.

The ICANN read-outs do help to keep people engaged on what was discussed at ICANN meetings.

So in this room, who has been involved in an ICANN read-out in your own country, either organizing one, participated in one? Okay, got a couple of hands, couple of hands. So of the hands that are up, anybody wants to share your experience in an ICANN read-out? What is that like? Oh, all hands down again. Okay, go. Let's go. Just a few minutes because I've still got a whole list of things to go through with you.

MANMEET PAL SINGH: I represent the GNSO and ICANN, as well as a working group member. So we've had a couple of read-outs that I've been part of. I've actually gone back and shared my experience about the ICANN Fellowship part and also the GNSO working group meetings that I've attended. And of course, we've had a diverse group of people participating and sharing their experiences. So

---

it's all about going back to the community and making sure to let them know that what we've been working as a community together and they can also be part of it, even if they're not actually present physically in the community. Sorry, at the ICANN meeting.

JOYCE CHEN: Thank you very much, Manmeet, right? Samiran and then after that, Claudio. Was it? Yes.

SAMIRAN GUPTA: Thanks, Manmeet. In fact, I'd like to make a small point over here. The way we run the ICANN read-out, meetings in India, in fact, slightly different from some other regions, although I'm ICANN Org, I do not create the agenda for the meeting. I actually let the community create the agenda and particularly those who have attended either online or in-person present.

So I'm actually invited to the meeting to listen in and I provide support if required or I chip in when there's a conversation and somebody has a question and maybe I can help with an answer. But other than that, it's really fully community-led.

And I'd like to leave you with one other thought. The community in India now is doing a pre-ICANN meeting. As a matter of fact, we had one two days before this meeting, and now when we go

---

back, we're going to have an output meeting. So this is just to give you an idea of how possibly you could do one in your region or in your area if there isn't one in area.

CLAUDIO NETO:

Thanks. It's just quickly two points that I would like to raise, the idea of a pre-ICANN meeting. I would love to hear a bit more about that because, again, it's breaking down the complexity that is going to be here in a national level.

So I think two things from what Sally and Jia-Rong mentioned here. One is the ability to reach out to step further. Sometimes the people who are in touch for the regional webinars or read-outs, whatever you call them, they are not people that are directly in touch with ICANN profiles and staff, but they are connected to the people who are. So we go one step further in outreach.

And the second thing is the language, so they usually participate in their own regional language and it allows them to participate with a little bit more of comfort and ease.

JOYCE CHEN:

Exactly. Thank you for your excellent point that I didn't say, which is that in the read-outs, it's always in that local language and that really makes a difference because it helps the

---

community to understand so much better what ICANN is doing and what we're discussing and not having to then translate that from English and all that. So that really, really does help and it helps the community to feel connected.

So in terms of the next step, how do we get the read-out community involved? That's a difficult question, even from the GSE team, we are struggling to help them. So for example, let me give an example for the Japanese read-out for example. It's always the same people and the same faces attending the read-out but they will never come for an ICANN meeting. Except when it's in Kobe, now they're here because they see the people who have gone on to the ICANN meetings as people who represent them. They're very comfortable that these are the representatives of them and their voices are being heard.

So there is a different relationship in the different communities and I would encourage, when you go out and if you either attend or you're organizing a read-out, hopefully for those people who have not had a read-out in your own country, this is my challenge to you after ICANN 64, start organizing your read-outs and to have an understanding of what your own community is like. What are they interested in? That will help you to develop your understanding of the countries' needs in terms of ICANN's issues. So I think that's a very useful platform.

---

Pass the hand to Samiran. You wanted to say something. And later on, I'd like to also invite Jian-Chuan to say a little bit about the Chinese read-out. Then we should really, really move on. Thanks.

SAMIRAN GUPTA:

Two very quick points to your question about the pre-ICANN meeting. Number one is the way that agenda is set, one part of it is about those issues which are important to India and Indian stakeholders, so whatever that might be. It could be the new [inaudible] generation panel. It could be something happening in ccNSO, so on and so forth.

The second part is a recap of the policy document that comes out before the meeting. So that is shared. So this is to answer your first question.

And to answer your second question, we tried something different in India over two years ago, which is to create a Whatsapp group and bring more participants into this conversation. Many of them actually have never been to an ICANN meeting. In India right now and thanks to the contributions from community members, we have a group that has about 172 people and right now, while I'm sitting here, there is actually a conversation trending on route servers and there is a debate going on in the community about the recent RSSAC

---

recommendations of how a Root Server Organization can give up a root server and how someone can apply for one.

There is a conversation going on, and again, I'd like to stress that I am not an admin on that group either so if they'd like to, they can tell me to leave.

JOYCE CHEN: So something for all of us to aspire to. Jian-Chuan?

JIAN-CHUAN ZHANG: I just want to respond to one comment you just raised that how we can go farther to a wider group. One point I got from the Chinese read-out is that the read-out is not only about the information sharing. It's also about a [inaudible] story.

So for example, we used to have a read-out participant discuss the GDPR or this kind of thing, and at the end, what the participant decided, they need a further, another one specifically on this topic. That's their decision. It's not my decision. And later on, they really organized one far beyond the ICANN participant, including many Internet company, lawyers, even a university professor. They worked together and I supported. That's one thing I think we can just spread. Thank you.

JOYCE CHEN:

Thanks very much, Jian-Chuan. So moving on from read-outs, something else that the GSE Team supports the community in doing outreach and knowledge building is also something called an ICANN Day or an ICANN Engagement Forum sort of thing, so it's a one-day or it could even be a two-day type program where the GSE Team and also our team members who are in the region will go down to whichever country it is to raise awareness of ICANN issues.

It could be with the contracted parties, with the non-contracted parties, or just really any audience that location, that they feel that they have a need to raise awareness on. It could be on specific ICANN issues or it could just be on one single ICANN issue and we will provide that kind of capacity development and knowledge building for them. So that's another type of activity that we do and that also explains why we are hardly ever at home.

Another thing that I want to raise is you probably are aware and a lot of you were there as well, there are the different spaces, the regional spaces, so APAC space, the [inaudible] space, the [inaudible] space. You've probably heard of that. You've probably participated in it. If you've not, I highly encourage you to do so because those spaces are where your own regional



---

communities gather from within ICANN to talk about what your priorities are, what's important to you and then from there, you can use those issues to then go out into your communities as well. So that's another area where you can connect with us. I'm just powering through because I want to get to another section where I think it would be more interesting for you guys, which is on the IGFs.

So who has national IGFs in this room? Okay. Who participates in these IGFs? Very good. I was expecting some hands might go down like, "There's a national IGF but I'm not there."

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Ask who is organizing it?

JOYCE CHEN: So who is organizing these IGFs? Wonderful. Oh my gosh. Okay, we're done.

So one question I have back to you which I asked earlier and which I opened the floor to everyone is when you're organizing your IGFs or when you are participating in your IGFs, so maybe you're submitting workshop proposals, that sort of stuff, do you raise ICANN issues in your proposals, in your sessions or do you tend not to? Please, I'm sorry I don't have your name but you first and then the lady next to you.

---

ROXANNE JOHN: We had our first IGF last year and Mr. Albert Daniels himself was in country and he would have participated in any program. So he was on the agenda.

[RICHARD]: Before we actually organize, what we do with the Internet Society, majority of the times when we meet, we incorporate a capacity building aspect to allow our members to be knowledgeable about ICANN from a very basic perspective. The second thing we have also done is engage the clubs at the University of Guyana so they also incorporate many aspects of ICANN issues into their clubs.

The third thing we have also done is the public service college. That deals with youth between the ages of 17-18 to about 25 and at the end of their one-year stint, they would usually host a youth IGF. That is at the college level. So those issues, they're usually forwarded to us.

The other thing is that from the ISOC perspective, we have engaged with [Digger] and we incorporate their training and we basically touch the three main [inaudible] in Guyana, and in that training as well, we incorporate not only ISOC, but we also incorporate ICANN.

---

Now the issues coming out of those is what we usually forward to the ministry and so on because it's a ministry which we work in collaboration with. So that is how we actually promote ICANN in Guyana.

Additionally to that, within ISOC, we have a mentor program where we set aside some persons and we actually mentor them once a quarter and they would meet and discuss different issues they're not clear about as it relates to ICANN, so that is how we more or less attack that aspect of it. Thank you.

JOYCE CHEN:

My experience in the national IGFs, so as an ICANN Org staff, I do go out to my countries to participate in their local IGFs. So what I like most is that, first of all, it's usually in the local language very much like the read-outs. Sometimes there is interpretation involved. Sometimes there is just a lot of heavy guessing involved. That's one.

Another thing is local IGFs tend to also, because by nature, they are more focused on national Internet governance issues, it can be a little bit difficult to draw that link with ICANN. So I do see that there's some gap when it's at that national IGF level. I don't have any answers, but I would encourage you to work closely with your GSE counterpart to try and see how you can draw that link better. We, ourselves, are also doing that same thing.

---

So one thing that I want to bring up, there's one more higher level which is the regional IGFs. So who is in the regional IGFs or have regional IGFs? Okay. I want to pass the time to Save because the Asia Pacific Regional Internet Governance Forum, the APRIGF, was held in Vanuatu last year and Save was here to lead our delegation. And so could you just say a few words about the experience and what it was like to be with the community talking about ICANN issues.

SAVENACA VOCEA:

Thank you, Joyce. The Pacific have had not only at the regional level, but sub-regional so in the Pacific, we call it as a sub-regional and so there were some fellows from ICANN who were in that committee to run the pacific IGF as well. And some of them also in the Vanuatu government that contributed towards putting a proposal to the APRIGF folks to host the APRIGF in Vanuatu.

So from the participation in Vanuatu, I'd say it was very well-received by most of the community. We have the father of the Internet, Dr. Vint Cerf who was there. He came all the way from ... He has a busy schedule but he made specific time to be here and to participate in that forum.

I think because it was all bottom-up driven and driven by the [MAC] of the committee, it took proposals from all over the

---

community to make sure that we had a very good set of agenda items and topics to talk about. And for us, as ICANN, we found it very valuable. It was another opportunity for us to engage that community in the Pacific with our Asia friends as well. And even for the ISOCs, for the RIRs, for many of the other regional organizations that all came together to support it, that's been a great move.

An offshoot of that, one of the very successful things that happened out of that was that Vanuatu decided that they were going to hold their own national IGF, and even to date, they have made an appointment through government that they have a person appointed to be the National IGF Manager, so he will have to run a national IGF [family] for them, which is great. Thanks.

JOYCE CHEN: Thanks so much, Save. Who in this room doesn't have a national IGF?

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: India doesn't have a national IGF?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No, we have a youth IGF.

---

JOYCE CHEN: Ah, so some have Youth IGF but no national IGF. Right. Okay, please go ahead.

MANMEET PAL SINGH: I also, fortunately, been elected as the Vice President of Internet Society later this year. We did organize the first YIGF last year, which was along the lines of India School of Internet Governance, of course. But we are, of course, discussing it this year to see if something pans out for the IGF course.

JOYCE CHEN: thank you very much and very encouraging to hear. Even though the ICANN office is in Singapore, Singapore doesn't have an IGF. I don't know. I've always thought about it, why is that the case? But I think it's really to do with how the community organizes themselves so you are really not alone for the countries that don't have a national IGF. It's a slow-growing process because it means bringing your community together and getting to know your own community and then finding the common issues that you want to discuss at that IGF level.

I need to move on because I know we only have a few minutes left.

---

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Yeah, a few minutes left because we need to stop sharp. The next group is here already to start their session.

JOYCE CHEN: Okay. So just let me very quickly move on from the IGF. So from the technical point of view, the GSE Team is also very involved in [NOCS]. We provide a lot of support and assistance to [NOCS], so we provide training in the [NOCS]. And not just in [NOCS], but even certs, some of your own country certs, national certs, sometimes they need training, capacity development. We provide a lot of assistance in that area and in engaging your technical communities.

And we also are involved in Apricot which is kind of like APRIGF but this is the technical forum for all the network operators and operators who are in the technological development. So I don't know if, in your regions, you have something like an Apricot, maybe, maybe not. But that would be another area that you can consider joining. But in my experience, I find Apricot very, very technical. It's practically like being in the IETF. Yes, Claire?

CLAIRE CRAIG: That's actually the area that I'm involved in. We have CaribNOG which is the Caribbean Network Operators Group which is really

---

very technical, but that is where ICANN has a rule. We have a meeting twice a year and it's throughout the Caribbean. Our next meeting is in April and ICANN has a day at that meeting. We have another meeting normally in October and the interesting thing is it's not just ICANN.

We also meet with the RIRs so we have ARIN and LACNIC at some of those meetings. So everybody comes together and we get to share. The problem, though that what I wasn't understanding is how do we move from there into our policy development because we're okay in terms of having these meetings and engaging people. But then we're not really involved in the policy process.

JOYCE CHEN:

Thanks very much and that's an interesting observation because I do agree with you. The [NOCS] tend to be very technical in nature, very interested in capacity development but a lot less interested in policy. So usually for the [NOCS] when we get involved in the program, we try and have elements within the program itself, or like, for example on the [NOC] day, where it's not jus capacity development and discussing the technical issues but we try and bring in some ICANN issues but putting it at the technical level, so speaking to the audience.



---

So that's one way that we do it and we kind of use that to sort of see policy but from a technical perspective to the audience. So that's one [inaudible].

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: And just to let you know how to engage in policy work in ICANN, we'll be having tomorrow the meeting our fellowship daily session will be meeting with our policy team and you will ask directly them how to get engaged.

With that, I would like to thank our regional team for being here with us and one thing for sure for everyone to follow-up, is to get connect with your regional representatives if you are not yet. We have their names and their e-mail contacts on ICANN webpage so you can do search, find them, and send them an e-mail saying, "I am a fellow. I want to be connected," and they will take from there.

Thank you very much, and Joyce, you have one last word.

JOYCE CHEN: Sorry, just one last thing, one last thing I need to plug and I'm really sorry for the next session. We have a few alumni or one alumni from APIGA, Asia Pacific Internet Governance Academy, and this is something that the GSC team, we're very proud of because from the ICANN point of view, we partner with the

---

regional Internet organization, so like APNIC with ISOC with APTLD and we come together and we do this Internet Governance Academy for youths or professionals in our region.

And if you don't have something like this in your region or maybe you have your own school of Internet governance or six, you might have that as well. But if you don't, this is something you can consider reaching out to your GSE rep and asking, "He, he, he, where's my IG Academy? I need it."

Yeah, so that's it. Thank you. Just wanted to [inaudible] like that.

SIRANUSH VARDANYAN: Thank you very much and applauds to your team. And thank you for the wonderful job. With that, our meeting is adjourned. See you around. And tomorrow at our fellowship session. Thank you.

By the way, today, there is an APAC APRALO networking event at 6:30 so it will be in [inaudible] 1, in the room where we had our fellowship gathering. So if you want to know APAC region and APRALO members more, learn more from them, you are more than welcome to be there.

---

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Next ALAC session begins in five minutes, so please, if you're around a table, please make space for the ALAC members. Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**