

---

ICANN72 | Virtual Annual General Meeting - Middle East Space - Open Data  
Monday, October 25, 2021 – 10:30 to 11:30 PDT

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Good afternoon and good evening for our Middle East community, and for Maarten too. And good morning, Göran. It's too early for you, I know.

GÖRAN MARBY: It's 10:30. With sufficient amount of coffee, I have now been able to survive the morning, but thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Welcome. So, I'd like to welcome our guests, starting by Maarten Botterman who is the ICANN Board Chair, and our CEO and President, Göran Marby, my friend. Also, I'd like to welcome Baher Esmat who is the ICANN Vice President for the Middle East and the Managing Director of the Istanbul office. Baher has always been very helpful. He is not alone. He is with his colleague, Fahd Batayneh, who always do everything for us so that this session is successful. So thank you very much, Fahd.

Now, we will start to the serious things. And I will like to give the floor to Baher Esmat to make the opening address. I would like to remind you that Baher is the Vice President for the Middle East and the Managing Director of the Istanbul office. Baher, you have the floor.

---

**Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.**

BAHER ESMAT:

Thank you. Thank you, Tijani. And good morning, good afternoon, everyone. I'd like to welcome you to ICANN72. It's always my pleasure to join you at this session. In fact, this meeting, the ICANN72 meeting, marks the fourth anniversary of the Middle East space. Some of you will remember that the space was first held at ICANN60 Abu Dhabi in 2017, exactly four years ago. So time flies. However, with or without the pandemic, the Middle East space continues to evolve, continues to do its work, and to realize the goals for which it was created.

When we first thought about this space with the Middle East community, the idea and the goal was to provide an open space for the community to come together and discuss topics that are hot on the ICANN agenda and develop some sort of a point of view about those topics. The outcome of the space's deliberations would normally come in the form of a statement that is submitted either directly to the ICANN Org and/or the ICANN Board or sometimes through a public comments process. And for those who are not aware, the most recent Middle East space statement was on DNS abuse and you can find it on the ICANN website together with the Board response on the statement. They both have been published on the ICANN website.

So as we gather here today, I'd also like to give a big shout out to the co-chairs of the space, Tijani and his co-chairs, as well as everyone from the drafting team who facilitated the prep work for this session that will hopefully lead to a fruitful discussion and outcome. So

---

without further ado, thank you again for the opportunity. I'll turn it back to Tijani. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Baher, for these kind words. The floor is now to Maarten Botterman who is the ICANN Chair of the Board. Maarten has always accepted to come and to support us. Maarten, thank you very much, and the floor is yours.

MAARTEN BOTTERMAN:

Thank you very much for having us, Tijani. And it's a pleasure as always because what you do with your group that matters. It helps to get a regional perspective on matters that are important for the entire world when it comes to the Internet.

So last time the session was very informative and indeed your texts are very comprehensive. You give it to us in a way where we can really consider the input in the most effective way. So the Open Data Platform that you were talking about today is the result of a lot of collaborative work within the community and ICANN Org, and it aims truly to increase the transparency and accessibility of data managed by the ICANN Org. The platform provides several benefits for the community. It includes free access to ICANN related data and an opportunity to steer prioritization of data release, which has been presented to the community during the development phase as well as retrieving and using the data for multiple purposes. With the ODP, the community will have data that are accessible and usable, timely,

---

comprehensive, and registered users would be able to access the use of data available on the platform free of charge. And consequently, the platform will enhance the community's ability to understand and use the data published. As the framework is developed, there will be opportunities to communicate this amongst the community and build capacity about it. So it's important to us, it's important to ICANN, and it's great to see you Middle East space focused on this subject. Well, back to you, Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Maarten. Thank you for this introduction. Now, unfortunately, as I said in the beginning, Ihab couldn't make it because of the Sudan situation. So we have enough of you here, fortunately. Before we go to the topic, I'd like to also welcome our community that are present today here and those who participated in the discussion on the mailing list. This work was done because the community is engaged, because the community is contributing. So welcome to our community. And now I give the floor to Chokri to introduce the topic. Chokri?

MAARTEN BOTTERMAN:

Would you like Göran to say a few words, Tijani?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Sorry. My friend, my friend, I am sorry. Göran, you have the floor. I am sorry. The floor is yours.

---

GÖRAN MARBY: No, no, no, no, no, no, no. I get it. You get the most important people to talk. First Baher, who is the most important person in this, and then Maarten.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: You are one of the most important persons. I am getting old. This is the problem.

GÖRAN MARBY: You're calling yourself old? My friend, it's no problem at all. I can keep it short. First of all, thank you. I think I'm now a fairly regular guest of this event. I think I've had the opportunity to participate in all of them. It's already four years since we have the Abu Dhabi maybe, time flies when you have fun. I was thinking about some of the comments. One of the reasons why I decided to change how we did—I was actually reminded about this by an earlier meeting today that why we did this change from having this what we call the hubs into doing regions, and also having the pleasure of having Baher to be the regional director and head of the Istanbul office, and really clear out, make regions more important in ICANN. In a way, you are a good evidence of that because this is a very important discussion and you can also do this from your particular standpoint with your beliefs and your views. Because the diversity on the Internet and the inclusivity of ICANN is actually one of the most important parts of this, and I believe that doing what you're doing enhances both. So we made sure that all

---

voices could be heard and also the context of the voices could be heard.

I really liked the fact that you also are going into our how we do things. I think I said last year is that we are right now is an institution as an Org and a Board, exactly where we anticipated to be. The community has done a lot of good work coming out with a lot of policies. I just learned, by the way, that we supported more than 4000 calls for the community this last year. That shows the dedication from the community also during COVID. That's an amazing number. We are in a place where—when the community has done all the work, [inaudible] the Board, the Org to just [inaudible]. As you know, we have a lot of things on the plate. And that's why we also have to address this from a procedural and sort of process standpoint, because now and then you can just throw things over to me and I can go and make decisions, which is not the ICANN way and not my way. So we create systems and processes to make sure that when we do decisions to proceed, we are as open and transparent as possible. That's why we, for instance, has come up with things like the Operational Design Phase or doing the investments in the Open Data Initiative. It's very much about transparency and giving the opportunity for the ICANN community and community members in different parts of the ICANN community to have more insight in how we do things.

When it comes to data, one of the reasons why we do the Open Data Initiative is because we think that the data we have can be used by others. We are a not-for-profit organization. We don't have a commercial value in having the data. This is really one of those things

---

that we think that you can eat the cake and still have it by sharing data and having other people to have opportunity to have that data. We can create business models or interesting new developments, which we never thought about or is not in our mission to go to.

You know that I often use Arabic script, by the way, in my speeches as an evidence that we're not done when we talk about initiatives like Universal Acceptance of IDNs. I think that this group has actually helped us to formulate better the future what we need to do to enhance the ability for people to use the Internet in their own language with their own narrative, their own keyboard, etc, etc., and I would like to really thank you for that. But I want to give time for you to discuss the subject with people who actually more than I understand the subject on.

One of the reasons I'm here, I really want to thank you for engagement in ICANN. I really want to thank you for doing the work you do. Every time you do something with ICANN, you actually do something that will affect all the Internet users in the world. Every time anyone goes on Internet, you hit about something that actually did start with ICANN. And that is how the identifier system actually works. So thank you, my friends. I'm hoping that you will have a good conversation. And I feel very welcome to come here. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you so much. Thank you so much, Göran. I am so sorry again for this small problem. Perhaps because I am exhausted in preparing two very important events.

---

GÖRAN MARBY: It's okay. Among friends, I also know that I'm a very small person and therefore very easy to oversee. Okay. I didn't take any offense at all. We are friends.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you very much. Thank you. Thank you for always accepting to come to our Middle East space. This is really a support that we appreciate. Now, I give the floor to Chokri Ben Romdhane who is the pen holder for the statement to introduce the topic. Chokri, please.

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Okay. Thank you, Tijani, for giving me this opportunity. Thank you to our Middle East community for this report. It's really so hard to speak after these great persons that you have, Göran, Baher, and Maarten. So it's really a pleasure for me to be with you today. I will try to answer the question about why the Middle East community have to [inaudible]. So in order to answer this question, I will speak about my personal experience with contribution at the ICANN activities.

As a community member, I've participated to several public comment opportunities. I also participated to some working group activities. To contribute to such activity, I need to be prepared. Prepared means I have to do some research, searching resources, data, contribution, metric, study inside the huge ICANN website. I also need to look into the contribution in the community mailing list in order to understand the view of other community members about the topic and the

---

[inaudible]. When needed, I have to look to the registry, registrar, or ccTLD data. And if it's not sufficient, I have to learn some courses from ICANN Learn courses.

When I finished this painful search process, I have to move to next step, which is to evaluate founded resource based on my subject, [inaudible] criteria. Personally, to achieve these two steps, I need one to two weeks.

The ICANN Open Data Platform is supposed to do these two painful steps for me by [inaudible] the ICANN data and documented resources and providing objective metrics and data about DNS market, registry and registrar activity, ICANN [inaudible] engagement, community contribution, etc. Such objective metrics and data will give me great support, to evaluate the [inaudible] which will impact the quality and the efficiency of my contributions.

This statement is the contributions from the Middle East community to promote and support this platform, looking to the useful service that it will provide to the community members. I hope that this argument convinced the [inaudible] this topic. Thank you, Tijani.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Yes, thank you very much, Chokri, for this introduction. Now the floor will be given to Maha Jouini who is member of the drafting team and will read the statement. Maha, please.

---

MAHA JOUINI:

Thank you, Chokri. Thank you very much to my fellow colleagues who helped us to make this happen. Thank you. The Middle East space virtual meeting, Monday, 25 October 2021. The Open Data draft statements. We, the Middle East community members, participating in the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN72) Middle East space, addressed the issue of Open Data Platform (ODP) to provide the community access to specific datasets that has been raised in previous discussions several times in ICANN meeting and other gatherings, and came up with this statement.

I think you confused me with the screenshot. Okay, I'm sorry. Let's move to the next one. I'm sorry.

An analysis of the current version. Datasets. The current version of the Open Data Platform includes 31 datasets. After analyzing these datasets, we note the following issues. First, the Identifier Technologies Health Indicator (ITHI) provides one dataset about the DNS Root Traffic Analysis. However, there are no datasets for the remaining seven metrics. Is there a plan to add a dataset for each metric? That's the first question.

The Registry Functions Activity Report provides one dataset with data starting from 2013 only. However, a concern remains as to the absence of data on previous years, specifically as to whether the migration activities take into account reports of the other years.

Third, Per-Registrar Transactions Report per year provides ten datasets. The choice to aggregate each year's transactions in dataset

---

will provide more visibility for the data per year, but it will become complicated to combine global data to have a summary view.

Search engine. Both advanced search and simple search are provided by the platform but only the start page includes the advanced search function. In order to use the simple research function, the user has to choose to filter by a term or by clicking on the Search button. This functionality is very useful for advanced users. But for the new user, it likely appears complicated to make use of. We suggest that the simple research be provided in the start page where it is the most accessible rather than the advanced search. The search engine did not provide some advanced search functionality such as research within full text, PDF, etc., which could be particularly significant for academic users.

APIs. The APIs provided by the Open Data Platform should ensure the interoperability of datasets. And unfortunately, these APIs are not documented for external use. The secure access protocol is notified and provided documentation refer to the open-data soft API documentation. Additionally, there is no information provided about the new V2.0 of the API.

Recommendations. The platform and the search engine are only available in English. To ensure good progress towards enhancing the community's ability to understand and utilize the data published, we recommend to enable the multilingual capacity of the platform and the search engine, particularly Arabic language. In order to enrich provided datasets, the Middle East community considers that the following datasets are very useful for community members.

---

Such ccTLD Activities report the dataset per year is to be provided by each ccTLD registry. It will be very useful for community members to track the DNS markets activities for each country. Therefore, it's crucial to make these reports available to the public as quickly as possible so that the value of the data can be preserved and insights gleaned can be as close to real-time as possible.

ICANN Financial report per year based on ICANN Financial and Planning Information. Such datasets will reinforce the openness and the transparency of the ICANN financial activities.

Community members' activity including SO/AC report per country/region/year. Such dataset will track the activities of community members, will be shared widely, and will also provide some indicators about the evolution of community activities.

ICANN could develop separate dataset into the following types: policy data, strategy data, global stakeholder engagement data, and ICANN meeting data.

Design ICANN's database in user-friendly and accessible format to allow the public to use and share ICANN data to help generate new insights and inspire creation of new apps and services.

The Middle East community also recommends that an initiative may be started with the community in order to develop some Software Development Kits (SDK), using most used programming languages (Python, Java, and so on), for community members to start coding using ICANN open data API.

---

We also propose the following topics for potential outreaching and capacity building activities in order to give the opportunity to the community to know more about the valuable services of the platform, such as Domain Name Marketplace Indicators datasets in the ICANN Open Data Platform, using ICANN open data search engine, using ICANN open APIs vs. Export Data.

Finally, the Middle East space community believes that with such a specific capacity building activities, the community will require sufficient skill to use and to contribute to the evolution of the ICANN Open Data Platform. Hence, we urge the open data teams to initiate and organize such activities. We also call on the community for the massive use of metrics and indicators provided by the platform in their contribution such as studies, survey, reports, comments, and so on. Since these indicators and metrics bring more credibility and objectivity to this contribution while simultaneously contextualizing the datasets for every user. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you so much, Maha, for reading this statement. Now the floor is yours for the community to discuss this statement. And the moderator will be Dima Samaro who is also a co-chair of this Middle East space. Dima, the floor is yours.

DIMA SAMARO:

Thank you so much, Tijani. Hi, everyone. I hope you're all doing well. So moving on to this important part of our session, which is basically

---

to discuss together the statement and hopefully to listen to your suggestions and recommendations that we can translate into the statement. But before opening the floor to everyone to share their point of view, I just wanted again to thank the drafting team for their time, energy, collaboration, and invaluable contribution toward this statement together. And we are very delighted and thrilled to see this community growing and having more active members to volunteer and help shaping this space, and to hopefully understand what needs to be improved in this space according to their needs. So thank you again.

So in terms of the discussion, your suggestions could address different issues that Chokri mentioned when he introduced the topic of Open Data Platform of ICANN, and now also that you have here the statement from Maha when she read it. So if you can focus your suggestions and recommendations on some points, including designing a user-friendly platform, enabling the multilingual capacity of the platform, especially for the Arabic language, or either it could be towards addressing organizing more capacity building and trainings to contribute to the evolution of ICANN's Open Data Platform, etc.

I also see a question in the chat box. But maybe we can open the floor first to any members in this session who would like to speak first, and then we can also address other questions in the chat box. So feel free to leave any questions in the chat box if you don't want to speak but we would love to hear your voice. So please raise your hand and use any functionality in Zoom. So if you press on Reactions, you will be

---

able to raise your hand and speak as well. So the floor is yours. Who'd like to speak first?

ABDALMONEM GALILA: Dima, excuse me. There is a question inside the chat box. Could you take it?

DIMA SAMARO: Yeah. Sure, we can start with a question. Absolutely. Okay. So we received the question and it says, "While Europe came with GDPR which, by a gross description, is restrictive on data, one of the Middle Eastern countries, specifically United Arab Emirates, became the first to adopt blockchain technologies, which is abstractly about creating relatively open chains of data. Would the Middle East also be the first among nations to embrace the notions of Open Data, and be the first to create an open environment for Data for Good, to inspire Europe and America?"

So if anyone would like also to answer this question and we can take the discussion from here. Anyone? Don't be shy. Okay. So Chokri raised his hand. Chokri, the floor is yours.

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Okay. Just to mention that we are here just discussing the ICANN Open Data Platform. We are not discussing the use of open data technology in the region. So, we are discussing a specific implementation of open data which is used by ICANN in order to publish data relative to ICANN

---

activity, not the use of open data globally. So thank you for the question. But our purpose is more specific than is mentioned in the question.

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you, Chokri, for comment. We have Ashwin next.

ASHWIN RANGAN: Thank you so much. Can you hear me? Quick sound check, please?

DIMA SAMARO: Yes. We can hear you.

ASHWIN RANGAN: Thank you. This is Ash Rangan. I'm the head of Technology and Engineering for ICANN Org. I, first of all, wanted to thank you for organizing the session. This is the first public session that we are invited to where usage of this data is being discussed. And I welcome this opportunity to understand how you all are engaging with the datasets that we provided. This is very helpful for us to hear from you directly with a voice as opposed to written comments perhaps that may be contextual when you use the data. This is more engaging, and I thank you for that.

Having said that, I wanted to answer a couple of comments that have been posted previously in the chat boxes, particularly as it pertains to data that precedes 2014. We have looked at the data right from when

---

it was being collected. And looking at the data formats, they only started to converge from the providers of data which is the registries and registry operators in the 2014 timeframe. Until then, the formats were not fully converged. In other words, we would get datasets that were different from one another. And therefore, it proved impossible. Not just difficult but impossible for us to aggregate that and make heads and tails so that it would get downloaded and analyzed by you all. Therefore, we decided to use the 2014 starting point, as opposed to anything prior to make data available. That way, there is less confusion. And in fact, prior to 2014, as John, I think, from the audience observed in the chat, many datasets arrived in formats that were document-based or PDF-based so that we could not even extract the data to make it available even if we tried to do that. And therefore, we abandon that effort because the cost of doing that and the effort were really not panning out to anything meaningful.

Now, that said, looking forward, some of these suggestions are excellent. And indeed, we want to be respectful of the use of multiple languages and the IDN and the UA considerations that we have been talking about. So I welcome this as an opportunity to hear you with your feedback, and we will take it back into consideration as we figure out what's the next leg in this journey. I'm pretty sure, I'm confident that this open data is a journey that will take a while because many different parts of the community will be asking for and have been requesting different kinds of data. So this is good for us to consider as we figure out where to go next. Thank you.

---

DIMA SAMARO:

Thank you so much, Ashwin, for highlighting these important points and comments from other communities as well. So I think now we'll give the floor to Abdalmonem, but also it would be great to hear from the rest of the members regarding what Ashwin has just highlighted, and if you have an answer or if you would like to participate, please do. Abdalmonem?

ABDALMONEM GALILA:

Thank you, Dima. Thank you all. Actually, I would like to highlight that we are now in the revolution of artificial intelligence. I believe that and all of us believe that no artificial intelligence without data. So data means money. Data means [inaudible] decision. Data is everything in our life, especially with this breed of social media applications. This is my comment.

I have two questions maybe somehow considered as a modification from my point of view. The first one, what are the most visited datasets? What are the most used APIs? If we could have such statistics at the homepage of open data, it will be good idea for the users who are trying to access the application of open data.

Another question is the same question. As I know, ICANN controls domain names, IP addresses through our RIRs, protocols through IETF. So, why not having all the details related to domain names, protocols, IP addresses at one location? So, the time I am looking for—having some details about IPs so I will go to one application related to ICANN. For example, for domain names, I will go to ICANN. This is my say. Thank you.

---

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you, Abdalmonem, for your intervention. I think it's also important to consider this, even for future members who would like to join ICANN or join the Middle East space, for example. So it would be great to have this information maybe in one place, along with the outcomes of the regional meetings and other information that Abdalmonem has just mentioned as well. Thank you, Abdalmonem, for this comment. Would anyone else would like to take the floor? I see Sally. Sally, please go ahead.

SALLY NEWELL COHEN: Thank you so much. I just wanted to note on the question about the latest updates in the most downloaded. If you are logged in to open data, then you can see on the homepage that information. We have latest updates most downloaded data and most API calls. That was all I wanted to share with you.

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you, Sally. This is very helpful. And I hope it answers the questions, Abdalmonem. All right, I'm just checking the chat box in case we have any other questions. So again, if you would like just to ask a question and instead of speaking, please post that in the chat box and we can address it.

Okay. It seems that we don't have anyone. Abdalmonem, do you have any additional comments to Sally's response? Or do you think that

---

there should be more information available or in one place so we can extract it easily and have access to this information?

ABDALMONEM GALILA:

Actually, I think all of us interested in such key topics of ICANN. So for example, let me start one by one. For IPs, I want to know what are the status of the exhaustion of IPv4. So should I go for every RIRs to check or I should go to my RIR to check or go to one place that have all the specifics for RIR at one location? For domain names, for example, for gTLDs I want to know what are the most wanted to have registration as gTLD. What are the IDN TLDs are the most beneficial one? Maybe this data will help me to have a decision for the different factors. The same for protocol. For example, for protocol, something related to [numbering portability.] How could I go to IETF and search for that? So is there one place I could find data at ICANN? This is my question. Thank you.

DIMA SAMARO:

Thank you, Abdalmonem. I hope it makes sense. I mean your comment is very helpful and I hope that this could be addressed also, even if not in this session but in the future as well.

I see a question in the chat box. “Could the CSVs continue to be published in conjunction with the ODP data?” So if anyone would like to answer this question, I think it might be from a technical point of view. Chokri, I see you’re raising your hand. Please take the floor.

---

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Yes. I think it's possible to export data, both in different format like CSV and other formats. And if the use of API, it will be [opened,] it will be very excellent data since you will be able to transform the data in all the formats that you wish, for example, XML or Excel or any format. So currently, yes, I think that the CSV format is also there. Thank you.

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you so much, Chokri. If anyone would like to ask any follow-up questions, please feel free to do so. I wanted also to ask, especially for the Middle East community, if they think that having this platform available, especially for the data available in Arabic, do you think that this is crucial for the region for the researchers, for others who seek to get and collect this sort of information? So I'm interested also to learn from others what they think about having this Open Data Platform available in other languages, especially in Arabic. Anyone? Okay, Sally.

SALLY NEWELL COHEN: Thanks very much. I think it's a good question of how useful the data can be in Arabic. One thing to consider is that the intention of open data is raw data. And so to create multiple languages, if the data in multiple languages takes some level of interpretation and some level of potential risk of changing the data, so I would ask if anything to specifically think about what is the type of data or information you're wanting to see in Arabic, knowing that we want to be cautious not to change the raw data in any way? Just something to consider as you're working through the statement.

---

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you so much, Sally. That makes sense. Yeah. Since we have actually included that in the statements especially, I mean the drafting team, it's important for us to reconsider this point. Tijani, do you want to take the floor now?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes. Thank you very much, Dima. I'd like to ask you about what kind of multilingual use of the platform? Do you mean that we have to translate the data into other languages? This is very dangerous and I don't agree to do it because data is data. We don't have touch it. It must be as it is, original. But if you mean by a multilingual platform, the tool for extracting data, etc., for searching data should be multilingual, yes. This is something that I think can be done. But changing the data and translating them into other languages, no. I don't agree. Thank you.

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you, Tijani. So I think the idea is not about translating the raw data, in this case, to other languages but to have an open data also that includes data in Arabic. I think that's what also the statement referred to. But maybe someone from the drafting team can even add more to this bit. I see Chokri raising his hand, and then, Ashwin, I'll give you the floor after Chokri. Chokri, please go ahead.

---

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Just to mention that we are speaking about data. So for example, if we are speaking of the Registry or Registrar report, this data could not be translated. So what we are speaking about is how to present this data in Arabic. So, we have to focus on data. So data are not subject for this. Thank you.

DIMA SAMARO: Wonderful. Thank you, Chokri. Ashwin?

ASHWIN RANGAN: Thank you, Dima. I wanted to say exactly what Chokri said. The data itself, we do not want anything to be done to it. It's an authoritative source. And as such, the data should not be touched. But the labeling of the tool can be translated to different languages, which is something that we have on our roadmap. That's what we will be doing so that the handling and the handlers of the data that make it accessible and available, those are the things that will be translated. So, the labels for easier navigation of the tool, not the data itself. That's one point.

The second one I wanted to clarify is with regard to the Registry reports. The authoritative source for Registry reports continues to be icann.org. We haven't fully transitioned that to the Open Data Platform. In fact, that is a message in the Open Data Platform that tells you that we're in beta testing mode, in other words, with Registry reports. And until such time as we transition that to general

---

availability, the authoritative source for that will continue to be ICANN.org. Thank you.

DIMA SAMARO:

Thank you so much. Ashwin. It's really great to hear that [inaudible] also will be translated into Arabic. That's great news, even for us in the community. So thanks for these efforts.

Okay. So I hope we addressed many of the issues, but we have a few minutes before we move to the conclusion. So if you would like to add any other points that we have missed, some things specifically you would like to modify or suggest on the statement, if you want to even take another look and see what changes we can translate to the statement, we would really appreciate this. Tijani, I see you're raising your hand, and then I see Maarten.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA:

Thank you very much, Dima. Abdalmonem made some requests. Abdalmonem, do want them to be included in the statement? I mean, finding things in the same place, not being obliged to go from a place to another?

ABDALMONEM GALILA:

Yeah. It will be a good idea, dr. Maybe it will be published. For example, for IPs published at every RIR. But I could go for ICANN Org site and have all the data statistics from RIRs the exhaustion for IPv4. I

---

will see that some region is exhausted, some region sell something like this. It's just an example.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Okay, Abdalmonem. So this is an update of the statement that you are proposing, isn't it?

ABDALMONEM GALILA: Yes, doctor.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you. Dima?

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you, Tijani, and thank you, Abdalmonem. We'll make sure to make these changes after the session. Mr. Maarten, please, the floor is yours.

MAARTEN BOTTERMAN: Thanks, Dima. Just from perspective of a user of data in general and also from work perspective from what we can do/can't do, just to consider clearly that there's different reasons why not all the data for the whole world are in here. Partly it's also contractual limitations. Partly that was explained by Ashwin, the practical limitations such as different formats or really costly to bring historic data back in. And partly for legal reasons and these are data I saw, for instance, a fault on participation. Of course, we cannot provide that on an individual

---

level. And then other ways are attempted such as the ICANN by numbers reports from the meetings. So, to take that into account. Otherwise, it's really good to hear the discussion and your eagerness to get going with this data.

DIMA SAMARO:

Thank you, Mr. Maarten. We are again very glad to have you with us and having you listening to all these comments and feedback from our community.

All right, so if there is anything else, I'm now reading again the statement and trying to find if there is a specific issue we would also want to modify hopefully after this session.

Another issue that was raised is about designing a database that is user-friendly and in accessible format. I think we have addressed this issue briefly in terms of extracting the data in PDF format or in other formats. But it would be really great even to see this developing more into a user-friendly platform that is accessible for everyone and that we can use easily, basically. But I'm not sure if there is anyone who would like to emphasize or say something about this point. Okay. It seems like everyone's silent.

Okay. So we have almost five minutes. I don't know, Abdalmonem, if you would like to take it from now and conclude. Okay. I see Chokri now raising his hand. Chokri, please take the floor.

---

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Okay. Thank you, Dima. I would like just to focus on the proposed or the recommended outreaching and capacity building activity. So we tried at the draft team to [inaudible] from capacity building activity for our community. I don't know if there is anyone present who would like to suggest other capacity building activity or to add any activity related to outreaching ICANN data platform. If there is anyone who would like to suggest or propose new capacity building activities is welcome. Thank you, Dima.

ABDALMONEM GALILA: Dima, can I jump in?

DIMA SAMARO: Yes, of course, Abdalmonem.

ABDALMONEM GALILA: I am wondering, I don't have an idea about that. If there is a tutorial or, for example, a training course for just one tutorial as learn.icann that demonstrate how to use the environment and the best use of this data. I think it will be a good idea at this time. You could have a translation from one language to another language. And at this time, we'll keep what was said Dr. Tijani and confirmed by our colleague Ashwin that the data would not be touched. But the keyword, it's still be used for searching and getting data, this is what will be translated. Thank you.

---

DIMA SAMARO: I totally agree. That's a great idea. Focusing more specifically on capacity building trainings to also increase knowledge about how to navigate the platform and how to use the data and the platform. Okay. So, I see three—sorry I cannot really spell the name. Sivasubramanian?

SIVASUBRAMANIAN MUTHUSAMY: Siva. Siva.

DIMA SAMARO: Sorry for that.

SIVASUBRAMANIAN MUTHUSAMY: No problem. In matters related to registration data, especially when we have IDNs, which is important to Middle East, is there a possibility that even at the stage of collecting registrant data, there could be translation? Usually what we do is we collect data in the local script, and after a while it becomes difficult to integrate it on a base which is predominantly English. And there are some translation difficulties and limitations and integrating data. So while collecting data, is there a possibility that IDN data that is collected in local script can also be translated by way of some interface and character both by the registrant and by the reseller or registrar? I mean, the system could be anything. I'm just thinking aloud. The point is that there could be translation even at the stage of collecting registrant data. Is there such a possibility? Thank you.

---

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you so much for your question. Tijani, do you want to answer that question?

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Yes. I will not answer the question. I will comment on it. Even if it is possible to translate the registrant data from the original script to an ASCII script, I don't agree to translate them. The data are something not to be changed, not to be translated at all. If you are speaking about the platform supports IDN, yes, this is a very good question and I support it. But if you are asking about translating the registrant data from the original script to the ASCII script, no, I don't agree. Thank you.

SIVASUBRAMANIAN MUTHUSAMY: Sorry. Let me clarify that. By translation, I didn't exactly mean translation like translating a local name into an English name or completely converting data into a new language, giving room to translation errors. That's not what I meant. I was talking more about making data readable when it's collected in a script like Urdu. So maybe translation is not the right word. Thank you.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: You mean that the platform should support IDN scripts?

SIVASUBRAMANIAN MUTHUSAMY: Yes. Something like that. Thank you.

---

DIMA SAMARO: I also see Chokri, he wants to speak as well. Chokri.

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Yes. I would like to thank you, Siva. Thanks, Siva, for the great idea and for the great suggestion. My friend, it's really great suggestion for the Open Data team. Noted. And if you would like to add this recommendation in the statement, you are welcome.

SIVASUBRAMANIAN MUTHUSAMY: I'll do that. Thank you.

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Thank you.

DIMA SAMARO: Thank you, Chokri. Siva, please get in touch with us and we will make sure to also incorporate these comments into the updated statement. Also, if you want—this is for everyone—if you want also to check the chat box, there is an interesting discussion between team members. So make sure also to check the links that they have shared or the discussions that is happening in the chat box.

So I think with that, we have received many of your feedback and suggestions. And I would like to thank you for also your contribution and all this feedback. We truly appreciate it. We hopefully will circulate the statement again with the team members, make the modifications

---

and finalize it. So now I'll hand it over to my colleague, Abdalmonem, for the conclusion. Thank you.

ABDALMONEM GALILA: Thank you, Dima. I think Maarten is looking for another screen for another meeting at the same time. So now we're out of time. Thank you for the draft team who did this amazing job. Thank you for our guests, Maarten, Göran, and Baher. Also it's bedtime in Sudan. So we'll keep you updated. We'll try to modify the statement using our pen holder and draft team. Of course, after finishing, we'll send this to the Board with our colleague to talk again. Thank you all. Bye-bye.

MAARTEN BOTTERMAN: Thank you very much.

TIJANI BEN JEMAA: Thank you all.

CHOKRI BEN ROMDHANE: Thank you.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**