

---

LONDON – Exploring ICANN's Development and Public Responsibility Programs

Wednesday, June 25, 2014 – 13:00 to 14:30

ICANN – London, England

NORA ABUSITTA:

Good afternoon everybody. My name is Nora Abusitta. I'm Vice President for Development and Public Responsibility Programs at ICANN. To start with, I'd like to thank you all for coming today. I think this topic is of great importance to you as it is to ICANN. And I thought we would use the great opportunity of London 50 to update the community on the latest developments and efforts that ICANN has embarked on in order to better define its public responsibility remit, as well as to move forward in a much more robust and organized manner with the programs that it has already doing in that respect.

Before we start, of course, I would like to introduce you all to great participants whom I'm sure you all know. Dr. Tarek Kamel, who is the Senior Advisor to the President on Government Affairs, and my boss. And Nii Quaynor, who I'm sure you all know, but who was also the chair of the panel of public responsibility framework that kicked off in Buenos Aires at the end of 2013.

I'm going to give you an overview of the panel itself. Last year, we put together a great panel to discuss public responsibility within the context of ICANN. On the panel, we had Tim Berners-Lee, Soumitra Dutta, Bob Hinden, Blake Irving, Nevine Tewfik, Raúl Zambrano, and of course, Nii Quaynor. Very diverse, very representative experts in the field of development or public responsibility, and all very aware of ICANN and its realities.

---

*Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.*

We had our first public meeting... First of all, I would like to talk to you about the process that we took. We put together the strategy panel on the framework of public responsibility. We produced a report in May. And we are currently establishing a department that will focus on the four areas that were concluded by the panelists and by the report of the panel.

In order to come up with our final conclusions, we made sure that we involved the community as often and as much as possible. We had a couple of webinars. We had meetings. And we took into account a lot of the feedback that was given to us. And as I told you before, there was a lot of interest.

Sorry the screen is not very, very clear, but in the screen you can see here, we identified the requests that we got from the community. How the panel addressed the requests, and how the department for development for public responsibility is now operationalizing these requests or an answer to these requests. The biggest ask was to define what is ICANN's public responsibility?

And of course, that is a very, very tricky area, because unless you define it, it could range from anything that you can think of. But obviously we can't be responsible for everything in the world. So we looked at the ICANN bylaws, and we looked at the community asks, and from that, we deduced or we defined public responsibility within the ICANN remit.

Another important ask, and of course, I'm not going to go through all of them, but another important ask that came from the Buenos Aires meeting was an emphasis on how ICANN should always partner with other organizations or entities in order to fulfill its public responsibility.

This is something that ICANN has done since the beginning, but it was never really clarified until now.

So ICANN does a lot of work with external organizations, and also within its departments. And the last ask I'm going to talk about very, very briefly because later on Tarek will touch on it in more depth, is we had many recommendations and asks to focus on the regional strategies. And in addition to that, and in reference to the regions to focus on localizing the experience for the different regions.

So in a nutshell, and I'm going to finish on this and pass the mic to Nii, the asks that came from Buenos Aires, and all of the asks that came from the public comments, formed the definition and the focus areas on the report. Now, I'd like to introduce Nii who will talk to you in more detail about the findings of the report and the discussions that took place within the panel.

NII QUAYNOR:

Thank you very much. Perhaps I'll start from the goals that we set for ourselves. The first was to, you know, develop objectives and milestones that promotes global public's interest, and participation in the work of ICANN. And also propose a framework for implementation of ICANN's role that involved the global public interest; build capacity within the ICANN community; increase the base of diverse, and knowledgeable and engaged ICANN stakeholders, and that's a very important part that relates very strongly with the regional activity that will be discussed later.

And to also provide advice on programs and initiatives that help achieve the above objectives. Of interest is the definition. You will notice that there are two parts there. The first part builds a context in which we're going to define our work, and the second part is the real definition.

The first part, the context is, as one of the stewards, meaning referring to the ecosystem environment, as one of the stewards of the Internet, ICANN recognizes it has a responsibility to protect and promote the global public interest, both throughout its work and in collaboration with other entities. ICANN's public responsibility permeates all areas of its work and is at the core of its operations.

And the definition that we want to narrowly address is ICANN defines the global public interest in relation to the Internet as ensuring the Internet becomes, and continues to be, stable, inclusive, and accessible across the globe so that all may enjoy the benefits of a single and open Internet. In addressing this public responsibility, ICANN must build trust in the Internet, and its governance ecosystem.

To address this, naturally we had to look around what's been going on. And the panel therefore exam through an inventory, all the work that was going on in ICANN. And we're proud to discover that right from the beginning, ICANN was paying attention to public interest activities. And also we took a good look at the regional strategies and the efforts already going on to build out closer to where the users were.

And also, the various kinds of public responsibility work that was going on in the departments were also, you might say, examined. At the end of our effort, we came out with the following recommendations. And the recommendation was to review, and where appropriate, formalize

the approaches, programming and projects already ongoing, that are serving the public interest that are being undertaken throughout ICANN departments.

Seek out partnerships in the Internet ecosystem that will strengthen and support ICANN's work in serving the global public interest. And of course, to create specific public responsibility programs, which fall within the scope of focused areas outlined in the framework report. In other words, we're not going to try to do everything, but we'll focus on some specific areas that I'm sure will be discussed in due course.

And continually review how best ICANN can engage and communicate with the public in relation to serving the public interest. And some of the specific recommendations include that we should establish a focus department that would address the following things, review and where appropriate formalize the approaches, programming, and projects serving the public interest undertaken throughout ICANN's departments.

And to seek out partnerships in the Internet ecosystem that will strengthen and support ICANN's work in serving the global public interest that provides funding and expertise assistance to qualified partners. And create specific public responsibility programs that fall within the scope of focus areas outlined in their report.

And this department will continually review how best ICANN can engage and communicate with the public in relation to serving the public interest. I think that concludes the summary of our work.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you very much Nii. I'm going to talk a little bit about the four areas of focus that Nii has mentioned earlier. So we identified, I think you need to go to the next slide. We identified that there are four tracks that a lot of ICANN's public responsibility work falls under.

The first one is education. We have done a lot of work on education, but more recently, we have developed an online learning platform, that is free is charge, that hosts not only courses that we curate but also hosts courses that are for the community and by the community. The other area of focus is localization and language services. I think you are all aware of the great efforts our language services team has put into all of the ICANN meetings, as well as all of the English content that is produced by ICANN.

For us, it's very important for us to reach our stakeholders in as many languages as possible, so that we can ensure, if not only their participation, at least their awareness of what's going on. The third area is next generation projects, and they're really projects that focus on bringing the new generations of ICANNers. We've defined those very well in the panel's report as youth with ages from 18 to 30.

I don't know if you've seen a young group of people going around in blue t-shirts, they're right here. They're not wearing the blue t-shirts. I think we only gave them one, and they've been here three days. I'm glad they're not wearing the blue t-shirts. And finally, ICANN has a responsibility and a role in participating in global Internet corporation and development.

A quick example of this and I'm not going to spend too much time on it, are things like the panels that we worked on that looked at IG issues

specifically. So without further ado, I'm going to pass the mic to Dr. Tarek Kamel, who will talk to us a little bit about the regional strategies and how they link to the work of the department.

TAREK KAMEL:

Thank you very much, Nora. Good afternoon everybody. I'm glad to be a part of this panel about ICANN's public responsibility, and some people might ask, why ICANN is suddenly interested in public responsibility. Is this just a new idea? Or is this an additional mandate that we have got from our Board? From our President? Or whatever.

And I think the answer is that as ICANN is used in a bottom up process, we realize that there is a need for public interest activities. Where did this come from? From the regional strategies that Fadi has asked us to work on from the day one, even before he officially took his position as a CEO and the president of ICANN.

He mandated us in Prague together, Nii and myself, to work with a work group on the building of the African strategy. And we started in a bottom up process that was very interesting, that was inclusive, and the time pressure. We met in [inaudible] with the support of AfriNIC, and with representatives from the different community members, stakeholders from Civil Society as well as private sector and governments.

And with the support of some experts as Ray [inaudible] and others and George Sadowsky who came up until the Toronto meeting in October 2012, this was in 2005, with the African strategy. And we announce the African strategy that includes several components of development of

the infrastructure, the DNS industry, as well as the DNS security in Africa and several other components.

And during this process, it was very clear that the community is asking us that ICANN should be up to its responsibility in public, responsibility programs. And that the history of, we're only doing some technical work and managing the root server, coordinating the management of the root servers, and coordinating the technical identifier, and that's it, is not acceptable anymore to the global community.

And with the new gTLD program, this message has been confirmed that the gap is widening, concerning ICANN's mission and ICANN's work, I'm not talking about ICT At Large, I'm not talking about Internet governance At Large, but within our mandate of technical identifying [inaudible], is widening the number of participants was in the new gTLD program from Africa, unfortunately has been very little.

As well as from the Middle East, as well as from several other locations. So this was an eye opener, that something must done. And as this organization is becoming more and more empowered through the multistakeholder process and through the community, has the resources gains knowhow, and gains legitimacy, it is part of the ecosystem and it has been up to its responsibility within the other programs.

And Pierre Dandjinou took over the, as a vice president for Africa, the implementation of the oversight of the implementation of the African strategy, together with Stephan [inaudible]. Latin America then followed up very soon. Rodrigo de la Parra, the vice president for Latin



America, has led a group that took a different approach for developing the regional strategies according to their needs.

And the group came back in Beijing with the same message. Where there is need, ICANN has to be up to its responsibility. ICANN has to play its role. The gap is widening in the knowledge and knowhow, and to avoid the marginalize and to ensure that we are part of the constituencies, not only the GAC, but also the GNSO, and the ccNSO, and so on, and the other ICANN specific constituencies.

We need to work on capacity building. We need to work on education. We need to work on closing the gap. We need to work on different programs to make this happen, with the way the Latin America model, the [inaudible], the vice president for the Middle East, led a similar work also in the Middle East, with a Middle Eastern approach, it's not an easy area these days, but they agreed at the end to, on the strategy and have announced it in Durban, and are working on it.

And the lesson learned from these three regional strategies for developing countries, that there are commonalities as such, and there is a need, a severe need for public responsibility programs of ICANN and others. There has been previous work that has been done by ISOC and other players, great work in capacity building and different areas in these regions and in other parts of the world, but the answer is this is not enough for ICANN's work, for ICANN's technical [inaudible].

And we cannot have a world that is running very fast, while we have this kind of knowhow and knowledge. The implementation is moving forward, and ICANN committed the budget for the regional strategy and implementation the discussion, and I would invite [inaudible] to say if

you would, what the implementation is. But ICANN committed, in each case, three years of implementation budget through the GSE and with the support of Sally Costerton as well and myself, we are looking after the implementation of the original strategies.

And we start to see the impact on the roadshows. We start to see the impact on the DNS forums, together with ISOC, we start to see the impact on DNSSEC roadshows and capacity building program incubators, [inaudible] incubators for building the industry, and taking a different approach really, with the implementation of the regional strategy.

And each region took its own approach, building a steering committee, building [inaudible] committee, and having focus areas, having the working space like [inaudible] explain later on in Latin America. And that's the beauty about the whole thing because it was really bottom up. And it showed there is a need and in order to work with the comment.

Where does all of this fit to where we are doing today? ICANN has committed resources for three years for this program as such. People are starting to ask specifically in Africa, the day before yesterday, when we were in the meeting, one and a half years since Toronto have passed what we will do in the three years are over, fine, might renew for a year or something like that.

But by that time, definitely will not have complimented all the ambitious plans that are within the regional strategy. So the answer is the public responsibility programs department, the public responsibility programs within ICANN, because this is the shift that needs to be done.

And this will not be alone, in this case, ICANN resources but as Nii and Nora have mentioned, through partnerships.

So we have to build the foundations now, partnerships within the next year or so, and identify the right partners that we're going to work with, so when the regional strategy really start to come over with their needs, full of continuity and sustainability in order to fulfill their goals, we already then as a department, and as a supporting community, with our partnerships relations that are global, maybe with the World Bank, with the African Development, other developing agencies, private development agency, agency from the private sector.

Then we have really programs that are solid on a regional basis, and are being asked by the community, and can be really financed and funded and supported within the four focus area that Nora has been mentioned. So I'm here to carry the message that the need is there on the ground. We have people in the field that are really in contact with the community, as such, and realized this need, they are working already on the implementation as far as ICANN resources allow.

But we also need the next step of sustainability that can only happen through partnerships. And in this case, is the partnerships has to be coordinated as I have mentioned, by the new department and the new team [inaudible]. So thank you Nora for this opportunity, and we look forward to a fruitful discussion. I just wanted to bring the pieces together and connect the dots, so that it is clear what we are doing. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you very much Tarek. It is very important to know that we are not reinventing the wheel. As Tarek stated, we are connecting the dots. We are making sure that the projects that we're investing time and resources in are long term, sustainable. That we're not working in areas that are not our area of expertise, but collaborating with partners to fulfill a certain goal or role.

Before I open it up for discussion, I would love to hear from our regional vice presidents about their experience in their region. Perhaps, Rodrigo, you can start by telling us a little bit where you are in Latin America.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Thank you Nora. I'm just happy to share. I just want to highlight what Tarek has said. That this was really a community engagement strategy. It was, it came from the community only help to facilitate the gathering of various stakeholders represented here in ICANN, that they came together to build this strategy. And also, I wanted to say that, yes it's quite ambitious. We have more than 40 projects. We have implemented the first five already, and now we are focusing our efforts in having a more, let's say, a systematic implementation, on the rest of them.

So we can fulfill them within the target of the three years. However, we are looking forward to link our strategy with this program. It's definitely needed. So one of the highlights of this project is, there was the, besides all of the capacity building initiatives that are included in this project. The community, Latin America and the Caribbean, they were really concerned about the full participation of stakeholders from the region in ICANN.

So what they put as a project, and it has been implemented, is to have in every ICANN meeting, what they call the Latin American and the Caribbean space in ICANN meetings. And this has been happening since the meeting in Buenos Aires, which of course, was in the region. At that time, we had more than 10 or 12 sessions that were only, had a Latin American and Caribbean topics.

But since then, in Singapore and now in London, we have had a dedicated space for Latin American Caribbean stakeholders, that they can share their own views and their concerns, in relevant topics. So for example, in this opportunity they chose the subject of FTAs and the Internet, and they had a very lively discussion. There was also the sharing of regional experiences of IGFs.

We had the head of the Caribbean telecommunications union, secretary general, she was here, and she explained and invited the stakeholders to participate in that forum, and the same for the Latin American beat. Other interesting projects are in the way of roadshow to raise awareness of sensitive issues, or relevant issues regarding ICANN's remit. For example, IPv6 or the new gTLD program, security, stability, and resiliency, and we have chosen four sub-regional venues per year.

So we're having one in South America, then Central America, Mexico, the Caribbean, and the Andes region. We already had one in [inaudible], quite successful, and now we're heading to the rest of the sub-regions. The idea is to have local regional champions in each of the topics, they can talk about. It's not about taking experts from ICANN, or experts from all in the community, travel around the region.

It's about finding the local champions to deliver on these topics and also to engage others on this. So it's going very well. And finally, the Star project is the communications plan. So another of the concerns of the community was that the material that ICANN, not ICANN staff, but in general, the community produces, it's not in the languages of the region.

So, it's mainly focused in English. So now we have created a process by which we will translate, not only language wise, but a more simple way of saying, or explaining the things, of the material relevant of information that's been produced in ICANN and its community. We also have a newsletter that has been published twice. We are publishing this twice, every two months. And it has a two way, it shows what is happening in the region but also shows stakeholders in the region what's happening in ICANN globally, so they can stay connected.

We have hired a full time communications manager in our engagement center in Montevideo, and she's having a strong presence in social media. We have an account in Spanish, an account in Portuguese. Twitter and the Facebook account is really active as well. So I will leave it at that. These are the highlights, but as I said, we have 35 more projects to go, and this is more or less how they go. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you Rodrigo. Perhaps Baher, give us also an overview of where things stand in the Middle East?

BAHER ESMAT:

Thank you Nora. Good afternoon everyone. Baher Esmat. I do stakeholder engagement at ICANN in the Middle East, and I work out of [Cairo] Egypt, and like in Latin America and the Caribbean, the Middle East strategy working group was a community driven effort. The group was established more than a year ago, almost 18 months ago, with 20 plus members from community members in the Middle East.

The strategy was designed around three focus areas. One is DNS security and stability, the second one is developing the domain name industry. And the third one was the, promoting multistakeholder Internet governance approach. Just key highlights on where we are today. Today, after one year of implementing the strategy, we have two new annual events, Internet related events, in the Middle East.

One is the Middle East DNS forum, and the other one is the School on Internet Governance. We have more and more highlights. We have two taskforces working on specific projects in relation to IDNs and capacity building. We have in the area of Internet governance, recently a new multistakeholder national organization was announced in Lebanon to oversee Internet policy issues at the country level.

We have more than 20 different projects and initiatives underway. I won't go through them. We have all the materials posted on the ICANN community website. If you go to the London's calendar meeting, we had a session update on Middle East strategy too. It was one day. If you click on the link, you will go to the page where all of the documents are posted, including our emails, in case you have any questions. Thank you.

---

NORA ABUSITTA: Thank you very much Baher. And last but not least, of course, I would love to hear from Pierre Dandjinou, our vice president for Africa.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much Nora. Good afternoon to all. Brief on what we have been doing in Africa. So maybe put the stress on the lesson learned and the way forward for us. Of course, as Tarek already pointed, we actually open the bar with the African strategy. It was bottom up, the working group really work with the community to highlight the needs and the expectations from that community.

And that translated into this strategy which actually brought down to two things, as far as Africa is concerned. It was about capacity building in Africa, in different domains, be it technical or business like. But also is about a kind of participation of Africa through the whole ICANN process. So on the capacity development, we actually came up with a few set of projects.

And those projects were also derived from the objectives. We did have a few of, kind of eight objectives there. I will say what we did once we started implementation was to actually select a few kind of dozen projects that we felt that might make an impact, and definitely that would lead us to, to make sure that something is happening.

No detail per se, but one of the flagship program today for the DNSSEC roadshow, that's quite popular. Many countries now are asking for it. We also having this working with Isaac, for instance, the DNS forum that we started in Durban. We are glad to see that has been copied



everywhere, and that has been happening as a pre-conference event for ICANN, which is good.

We are still doing this, and during two weeks' time, we are going to have DNS forum in [inaudible]. And as ICANN, we are pushing to very concrete, you know, topics on that. For instance, we will talk about monetization of ccTLDs in Africa. So our goal, of course, is to support the development of DNS market in Africa.

So most of our flagship projects, you know, evolve around that one. We launching now a study on ccTLDs in Africa to know more about this. You know, one of our program in Africa is there is no statistic per se. You know, meaning you don't know where to go when you need some information. And we believe that the study now is going to tell us exactly where our 54 ccTLDs actually fitting.

What are they doing exactly? You know, what are, are they getting any impact in Africa?

And we would like to derive a kind of byproduct on that which is going to be the African Observatory for the Domain Name. We started, for instance the domain name award. It was the first time this was happening in Africa, and as ICANN we provided these things. Other projects, of course, include the whole engagement strategy. We do have two [inaudible] now, there have been going to different countries. At least they already covered, I don't know, close to 20 countries out of the 54, where they specifically engage with the different sector.

And we found out that government, for instance, you know, are quite keen on a few things. For instance, the importance of managing ccTLDs.

And we are now being asked to actually support them in solving issues, [inaudible] the irrigation process, for instance. This is quite high on the agenda. This was something we are not really thinking about when we started engaging with them.

But that's quite important. The other thing that we did that we think is important, and might have also something to do with this ICANN public social responsibility, it is the registrars environment in Africa. We do have seven registrar, ICANN accredited registrar. But as of today, I don't think any of them is making any money, because of some hurdle, because of some issues they are facing.

So we initiated a kind of reflection, and the registrars from Africa started the process. So we actually have a document that really highlights what are the issues and what could be the possible responses to that one.

And that document we send to our colleague from GDD. And the document has now evolved into a kind of global sort of document that can be now discussed and see exactly how ICANN could best serve in what you are calling the underserved region. So this is something we really started here in Africa. And the idea here is to see how best to support, is it through policy, whatever, or are we going to have any special, you know, project or fun for them? At some point, ICANN will have to decide.

But the expectation agreed on that. Maybe quickly lessons learned. I think so far we've started something of course, we do have, I mean, we do have three staff members. But I have to thank Tarek, [inaudible], and even Fadi who are ready to support, but I keep on saying that well,

it's not just about ICANN, it's about, as you know, forging strategic partnership so that we really have a substantive sort of implementation of the...

So yesterday what we did was we, of course, we presented the updates on what we're doing, but we are calling upon the African environment to see how best to partner with us that we achieve something which is for the country. Of course, the other thing for us is participation.

Like I said, it's a pillar of the African strategy. We are seeing more and more participation of Africans to ICANN meetings. What we are expecting is much more, what I'm calling, informed participation, meaning that participating but also contributing to working group, NSO, having some of the leadership position.

There are a few things that we should be doing in Africa to prepare for people coming to ICANN and participating really positively into ICANN. So this is what I would report. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Many thanks to Pierre for this update. I would like you all to look at the screen a little bit. One of the requests that came to us was that people were tired of seeing the reports and reading bullet points. If you could go up to the title of the infographic, it would be good.

We, of course with the help of our friends at explain, we took the report and tried to illustrate it in a more dynamic manner, and we called it, "What's In It For Me?" And it really covers all of the different stakeholder groups and how public responsibility has been engaged with them already, or can engage with them in the future.

We will make this available on the website very soon, but it's a very, kind of easy and quick way to look and see what we're doing in every sector. I think we are ready now to open for discussion or questions.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Can I please remind you to say your name before you ask a question please? Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: My name is [inaudible], I'm from Tunisia. I have a question to Dr. Tarek. I was pleased to hear this strategy for engaging the public in Africa. When it comes to capacity building education, incubators, entrepreneurs, it is a very exciting program in our region, based on the fact that we have very educated youth population that can handle this kind of capacity building.

My question is, when it comes to the key performance indicators, how do you follow all the folks you are doing in Africa? Do you have setup indicators that give you insights about how the program is running? How many university you wish today? How many people you have trained today?

How the things are going? Or, everything is based in the government, which I don't think plays the role in the stakeholders. This is my question. Thank you.

TAREK KAMEL: Let me answer. I mean, we cannot neglect, whether we like it or not, in Africa and in the developing world, governments still play a major role

in development. And if we are talking about setting incubators, we cannot do that in complete isolation from working from governments, because we need them for the laws, we need them for taxation issues, we need them for supporting starter programs.

But they don't definitely have the knowhow that we transfer to the young community in Africa. The most important asset to have in Africa, in the Middle East, as well as in Latin America and all of these region's strategies, are the people, the young people that's the most important asset.

The next billion users of the Internet are coming from there. So we have an opportunity to include them. We will then, in the DNS industry as such, and so we need to be working with governments, but as well with startups. Identify startups from the private sector, and also academia in order to make this happen. Our biggest challenge is to motivate the international companies, and international player to help us in this process, because we need to know how to transfer, we need an honest transfer.

ICANN necessarily doesn't have the business knowhow transfer into details in order to help this startups all over the world. So this has to happen via partnerships with other players. Some of them respond positively, and participate in the region, in DNS forum. Some of them less. We try to use pressure from our GDD department that is in contact with the registers and registries, in the international one, in order to make it happen.

It's not an easy process, but we need to continue. Conviction takes time, in the end, [inaudible] or in other ICT related industry. I know that

from previous experiences, but we need really to follow up. And this is one of the programs that will take years, six, seven years, until it really pays off and pays back.

You asked about keep [inaudible], we just recently, we're discussing that with Sally and Fadi, and we're starting to determine very clear, keep it four months indicators on dashboards in order to report back how the progress is. At the beginning, in the first year, it's still a learning phase. It's still an awareness phase, but we are working, definitely, on the keep it four months indicators in order to reflect that...

NORA ALOUSITTA:

To add to Tarek's point, we are trying to help our regions with tools. For example, the online learning platform. That within it, we can really measure the key performance indicators. And so we can see how many people from a region used online learning tool in a certain language, for example. Of course, this is very narrow and very small, but it is one way to get more insight about interest and what more needs to be done in order to reach people that are harder to reach.

[YANNIS LEE]:

This is [Yannis Lee] speaking, Net Mission. This is actually a comment which, I would just say, I had really a great experience working with, Nora with your team, for the Singapore pilot next gen at ICANN initiatives. And now working with Ricardo and [Jav], and also the APPAC hub from the GSE team.

I think we all agree that it was a great success in Singapore meeting. That the next gen bond really makes some good noise, and also have

some fruitful discussions about all the IDN topics. And so I'm really glad that this next gen initiatives has become part of the public responsibility strategy and becomes a recurring program to continue this engagement, and you to the ICANN forum.

So I want to say, as Dr. Tarek has mentioned quite a few times about the importance of partnership. And Net Mission is the organization, we'll be very happy to continue to supply the knowledge and work with your team on new engagement, and bring more new [inaudible] to ICANN forum. So we'll be really happy to contribute and see how we can further develop the strategy, and how like we can go forward, engage more universities to, I mean, to ICANN. Thanks.

NORA ALOUSITTA:

Thank you. And by the way, this project was one of the success stories of a partnership that initially started, as was mentioned by Net Mission in Singapore, we gave them some support in Singapore, and then it had so much success that we thought it's worthwhile duplicating everywhere we go.

Again, bringing more youth. We have the privilege of going to different regions three times a year, why not invite the youth of that region every time where there and introduce them to our system? And to our Board? And they're over here, I would love to hear from them in a minute. Thank you.

MONA:

Mona [inaudible]. Thank you. I'm the French speaking group in the ICANN. I'm very happy to hear you speak about the responsibility, the

public responsibility of ICANN, because ICANN managing the international infrastructure for the whole world, is playing a very important role, and the same kind of role as the state, the government.

Because the question of the public responsibility, the public interest, or what is public is, has to do with the responsibility of the citizen and of the states. So, in this frame, I want to add that the multistakeholder system, this system has to do, must imply the governments who are the more interested parties here. When we speak about stability, security, development, I think the governments will be the more efficient at this level, because they can show us the way.

It's true, the system is working very well. We have to help everybody to participate, citizens, business, etc. But it could be also interesting now, in this transition phase, maybe we could change something that will take into account that something that will convince the governments to accept the ICANN, to the accept the ICANN as a player, as a participant to create legislation that will help, that will be useful for all the development, whole which has to do with stability development and security too.

And which will also convince those governments to participate efficiently in ICANN. I'm not against the participation or the involvement of policy people, but I think that the discussions that take place in the GAC, for example, are sometimes too political. I don't discuss the reasons, but maybe this transition should have a goal, and that is that those governments send some experts that can really discuss the technical aspects.



And also, the low aspects. Maybe they can send some political people, but maybe through some committees, I don't know, but we need some experts I think, because ICANN with its activity is working for all the world, and we all interested with prosperity and development of ICANN.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you very much for your question or for your comment. I'm going to try to answer your comment, say Nora Abusitta. All of our projects will be made with partners. The kind of partners is going to change from region to region, and some regions work with the governments because the governments manage all of the projects, all of the development projects.

And in other countries, it's the private sector. So, of course, in our programs, we want to invite the participants to work with the ICANN system to assist to the GAC session, but also to other groups session, which are also very active groups. So in our goals, we have the project to communicate and work with all the entities, not only governmental entities, but also in the different countries, the most powerful entities, or the most influential entities, to invite more and more people to participate with ICANN.

If that means that we have to send some experts, well if it also means that we have to work with some capacity building programs, okay we can do it. No problem. So all what you said is really something that we take into account. Thank you very much.

JULIETTE:

Hi. My name is Juliette [inaudible], and I work for the Web Foundation. I'm pretty new to the whole ICANN process, but you might have seen in the papers that Tim Burns-Lee called for a digital wide bill of rights for the Internet, for the world. And I'm responsible for trying to help deliver that. We're actually looking for resources immediately to help achieve some of those goals of outreach.

And the world is a big place in terms of getting engaged with ordinary people and explaining to them why a digital bill of rights is so important. What's the best process for me to perhaps engage with ICANN on a regional level or on a country level, in terms of getting resources and partnership?

NORA ALOUSITTA:

There is several ways. But to start with, we have a great relationship with Tim Burns-Lee. He was actually on the panel, and he was one of the people that contributed to it. We also have a very active presence in all of the regions, including Europe. Our VP for Europe is based here in England.

And so, I think after the session, I'm happy to put you in touch with him, and of course you can reach me directly. But the process usually is, you reach out to the local representative of ICANN, and it then comes to us as a request. But in your case, there is already a channel of communication.

There is a question at the front.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

[Inaudible] from Cameroon. I'm also new, and I follow very closely, and since I come from the consumer sector, and little by little as consumers begin to realize that the Internet is a basic service that regards us all. So I would like to say that I think we should not have governments as an opposite notion, even though governments have, attempt actually to try to control the rest.

But at the regional level I think, we'd rather say we have responsible people who have to deal with regional dynamics, and we see that ICANN through much reflection can actually understand the importance of Internet, and the impact it has on our populations. In eastern African, for instance, with all of this financial inclusion phenomenon, and the mobile phenomenon as well.

Even at first, it wasn't so much about Internet, but we try to include people through telephone first. But there are dynamics which have an impact in security, in access, in the different social dynamics. So I think in that respect, I think we are creating riches and wealth, and we allow people to create their own companies to setup their own projects.

So it's important for the entire population. And I think regional matters such as this one are very important. Another comment I have, which could also be related to academia and to young people, is something that's missing here to my mind. I see that it should be something, ICANN should be considering. And there are many people who are very smart and who reflect upon many of the current issues, is that we can have better relationships between poor and rich countries.

And I realize that with the expansion of domain names, we have capabilities for big companies who want sometimes domains, which

may be opposed to the identity of a community, or a culture, or planned, or a knowhow. So maybe, even if it isn't one of our key concerns at the time, it should be considered so that sometime, and at some point we could avoid demonstrations when there is a crisis with opposition, because we'll no longer know how to deal with that because it will have a greater impact on population, once we begin to realize they exist.

So this matters, it's important to me.

TAREK KAMEL:

Actually, I touched on that when I was talking, and I said that the eye-opener for us was the new gTLD program. We have, or ICANN at that time, management designed the program, and announced even the joint application, the application support program for the developing countries.

And I was following up the ICANN Board discussion at the time, are two million US dollars, and now for sure make it five million US dollars for the applicant support so that they are not in need to pay 170,000 US dollars for the application, but pay much, much less. And the support program will subsidize the rest.

And the big surprise, the biggest surprise for all of us, and to the ICANN Board that only three worldwide has applied for applications. So the two million were not used, only 20% out of the two million US dollars have been used, and the rest of the resources has not been utilized. So this was really an eye-opener for us.

That there has not been enough communication. There is no awareness. And nobody can say that the market is there, because let's look at the mobile industry, it's booming in Africa. And including smart phones. And mobile smart phones means Internet. So there is need, and we have, as I said, a young population in the developing countries, in Africa and Latin America, and the Middle East.

So but the market needs stimulation. It needs to be stimulated, in order to really make it go. And this is actually what the mobile industry have been doing in Africa, 50 years ago. Hand held by the GMSA, and we had the CO of the GMSA industry this morning speaking as such. So this success story could be repeated on a much different, smaller scale, as such.

This is the only way to have participation in the GNSO. But shipping people from the developing countries, even if we invite, they come to one meeting, they will not come to the other because there is nothing in it for them. This discussion does not reflect their interest. There is no mark. And we need to also make sure that the international and global players of the registries and the registrars help us in that process, because unfortunately, in some countries, in the developing countries, they're working illegal, without authorization.

And just collecting money online from the people that want to register, and top level domain. This could be tolerated at the beginning, but could not be tolerated anyhow. We don't need also to underestimate the issues related to online payment, and the necessity to develop the online payment system including the credit cards.

And unfortunately the penetration in the developing world of credit cards is still large effects definitely the evolution of this industry. This is a little bit different than the mobile industry. So all this has been taken into consideration within our DNS forum, within our program, to help startups. This is the only way to close the gaps.

But I have to be frank with you, this will take time. And will take years, yeah.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Yeah, if I could add quickly to what Tarek has just said. [French] I think we should consider this matters you mentioned which are specifically important, particularly as we think of consumer's rights. I think we should also discuss the issues in some developing countries as regards to developed countries, as they're compared.

There is a problem of knowledge of stakes in many countries. So I think we should perhaps consider having a number of workshops at the local level, on different subjects so that we can build capacities. We had a recent experience in the case of our strategy, for instance, which was convening a workshop on domain names for trademarks and for dispute resolution.

And we invited experts on intellectual property. So intellectual property for domain names was the first workshop we had. Intellectual property for trademarks. Many people knew nothing about such matters and so we realized that indeed there is a problem for openness, for people to those stakes and to those organizations that dealt with those matters.

And so there maybe regulations agencies in those countries who are currently the ones who sort of managed that, could contribute in different countries, and could contribute to going beyond licenses, and to start building capacities as well. Not only trying to enforce the existing regulation, but building capacities so that people understand that. That's at the local level and we should support our stakeholders in that regard. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

I would like to thank first of all, our chief security and stability and resiliency officer, John Crane, and link it with a lot of the work that we do in on the ground training. He spends a lot of his time either on a plane or not home, doing exactly that. So John.

JOHN CRANE:

Good afternoon everybody. John Crane, ICANN's chief SSR officer. I have an acronym in my title, how excellent. We love acronyms here. Yeah, so my department deals a lot with issues around the identifiers, that are about making sure people can use them, that they stay secure, that they stay stable that basically the Internet keeps working.

We really look at the plumbing of the Internet, if you like, especially in the naming system. As part of that, over the last 10 years or so, ICANN has been working with many organizations. Specifically the University of Oregon, Networks [inaudible] Resource Center out of there. Basically around the globe doing capability building, as we like to call it. Capacity building, for those of you who are old network people, gets mixed up

with laying fiber and getting bandwidth to people, and what we try to do is increase that capability.

And we've done hundreds of trainings all over the globe and continue to do so. Those trainings can range from very basic, how does the system work, what is ICANN, what is the DNS, one of the identifier systems, how does it work. To basic security awareness. You know what are the kind of things we should be looking out for? Through the very technical and in depth studies aimed at the industry around disaster recovery, disaster repair, preparedness, securing networks.

We have a vast array of training material at our disposal. We have many trainers. I'm a fairly ignorant English person, so I only speak two languages, English and Dutch, but we can train in Spanish, French, most of the languages, if not then we will find people.

So if you're thinking about how we can help increase knowledge, which is a thing that obviously users need, talk to your regional liaisons. A few of them are here. Work very closely with the regional liaisons. They have regional strategies, we try and stick within those regional strategies. And they can reach out to us, and we can even help train or help build training as is needed.

We try to be very flexible and try and serve the community. I think I'll leave it at that.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you. Are there any more questions from the table in the back?



UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Yes hello. Thank you. I am [inaudible]. I'm a member of the regulations of telecommunications in Senegal. I'm very glad to hear that the strategies that are underway, and the ongoing efforts that have been employed for having increased participation exists. And we have very ambitious programs which range from awareness to education and other aspects.

But I wanted to say, as a whole, that my main question firstly is how to know what the relationship is between the need for education, for capacity building, for populations, who are not yet up to date, who have not yet experienced firsthand these technologies? And then, the need for leadership as we see it here. We want to participate, but at the same time I think we should try these things.

We should take control as we decide we have a transition. We speak of scaling, of gTLDs, of evolution, of NetMundial, where there is expertise. So how can we, as Africans, reach that high level? And how can we compare that and at the same time reach those communities who consume the Internet in small villages where Internet is advancing very quickly with this high penetration rate we have in our country?

That's a question I have, because I'm not clear about it. This is the first time I've come to ICANN, but I see that we are in a globalized world, and we all speak of the same matters. But we are at different speeds, or at least we have between three and five different speeds. There is still people who have not yet realized this is an existing problem, and that we need to take measures.

And then secondly, I wanted to say I support what you say and I commend you for the capacity building efforts you made. And I think

we could not reach universities and the academic sector which are very known in our regions. When we consider our regional vice presidents, I know that if there is the necessary human resources, and the necessary means, we should know which are the schools which exist in each country.

For instance, in Senegal we have a huge telecommunications schools. We have universities, we have other systems of education. So at the sub-regional level we could focus on those entities, which are [inaudible]. So we could try and include certain information modules in their programs as it regards ICANN, or as regards different matters which ICANN deals with. So maybe we could speak of domain names, and we could have the modules which are targeted, and those schools so that those entities would indeed get educated on those matters.

Then on the other hand we could also approach states on a case by case basis, as our colleagues said, knowing that only states, and according to which states it is, the ministry which is the strongest will vary. Sometimes there is different agencies, which have more funds in other states, it's the trade department because they have more funds. We should target our efforts to the one that's strongest, the one that deals with this.

We could not expect them to wake up for themselves and start dealing with this. If I hadn't been here, no one would have mentioned this. So, we have to let them understand that it's their responsibility to deal with this at the local level. So this time with sub-regional organizations, try to target your efforts at people that have been appointed and identify who that is so that you can reach the regulatory agency, or the ministry,

or the consumer association in the different countries, so it's the targeted elements, with the elements we have at the official level.

If I go to [inaudible], I have to reach the regulations agency, or the ministry, and I have huge consumer associations. That way I will, indeed we will be able to raise awareness. Our main purpose is to communicate, to convey the message here. There is a lot of work underway here, but it will be of no use if we don't know who to reach out to. Then we need to have more participation, more engagement at ICANN.

So people stakes and interests have to be known, people have to come to ICANN because they know that their interest is represented there. So I'm going to interpret this, it's about communication, it's about raising awareness. Once people are aware, I think they will willingly come and participate. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Nora Abusitta takes the floor. Thank you very much for your intervention, which was greatly important. I have three answers to give you. We know very well that there are huge obstacles, mainly the huge gap between knowledge in the different levels. And we have very specific programs at that, which deal with local needs, as my colleague already explained.

Secondly, we're already working in collaboration with different universities, and we're going to do this more and more. We're going to reach out to targeted communities and we're going to find schools or

universities who are specifically ready to work with us. For instance, here in England, were working with the Greenwich University.

They came up to us, they called us, there were four students who were writing their thesis for MBA on ICANN subjects. We worked with them for one year, they came to present their reports. And maybe it might not be a huge advance, but it's a beginning, it's a start. We have new participants at the ICANN level, and we have an university which is now calling for engagement at ICANN.

So we expect to be able to replicate that experience in other fields and in other countries. Thirdly, a couple of years ago ICANN finally understood that it's not one size fits all. And for that we have appointed regional representatives who bring back very different recommendations according to what's going on in each country.

I imagine we'll have more in time, more recommendations. It takes time, unfortunately. But you know, it's an ongoing initiative. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you. This is Pierre Dandjinou speaking. Thank you for your recommendations. Certainly when you were speaking, you made me sweat but you were right about what you were saying. I think we should definitely have local relays, and you maybe think the mission that we had in Senegal, specifically, and we approach the regulatory agency, and we thought of creating a partnership with different universities.

It was, I think, the same university you mentioned with the African management institute, which dealt with a number of different subjects, and there was an option which was Internet governance. So we discussed that possibility with them. But I think we should definitely focus on local relays. And then as regards, strategic partnerships, it is also a very important matter, as I said, ICANN can only be understood as the support of those effort. But if we want this action to last in time, we will have to establish local partnership for our strategy to work.

So what you have just stated is an example to be followed. But you've only just got here, so you might not know that I ask your regulatory agency to send people to ICANN, to participate, and I'm very glad you're here. This is what we think, we share your views we think regulatory agencies are of great importance. Specifically in Africa. And that would allow us to do a number of things because they have resources that we can count on.

So I think we're on the same page. African engagement, you mentioned, but we can already celebrate where we are. Almost 15 years ago, Africa only had five or 10 people here. And you see that today, we're working and we've come a long way. There is still a lot to be done certainly. And we'll need more volunteers definitely.

But we have to follow up on this conversation to find specific ways to establish partnerships.

JOHN CRANE:

Yes, sorry I don't speak French. Thank you translators for doing a wonderful job. They never get enough credit. So one of the aspects of

our training program is very much the concept of train the trainer. And specifically in Africa, we've been doing a lot of train the trainer exercises, mainly around technology, not so much around regulation. And I'm glad to say it's bearing fruit. There are some excellent trainers and engineers in Africa.

And I do mean absolutely stellar. And the last training that we participated in Africa, we didn't have to participate. It was all trained by Africans, local. The only thing we did was send them a machine, and they did everything else themselves. So things are improving and that's good. We've got a long way to go. So we also operate in many realms. For example, one of my colleagues in my group is on, sits on an organization called the Commonwealth Cybercrime Initiative, which is about teaching, in this case commonwealth country regulators about things like, the best convention and how to do regulation.

And we also, our role there is teaching them about what is ICANN, etc. We can definitely do a lot more. We have limited resources like everybody else, and it's a very big world. But thank you for your input, because these are things that are very close to my heart, especially the, getting the training out into the regions and getting their expertise into the regions so that they could actually help themselves rather than looking at organizations like ours. Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Yes. I think a lot of things have been said here. First of all, I think from our side, we shouldn't see ICANN as a future United Nations and the World Bank. I mean, there is some kind of inventory that has to be done in the regions so that ICANN can help [inaudible], you know. That

will help us with the lack of expertise to begin, maybe, identifying our needs because thus also it would be easier to find financing from other sources, which is something important.

And the second thing I wanted to say, this is very specific because I intend to, when I go back to [inaudible] to write to the regional office to the consumer international in Johannesburg to come closer to ICANN. As I said, I think the next two years in Africa, something important is a financial inclusion, and that means, you know, quite a lot in terms of security, stability of the Internet.

And this has to be started, but this means also from ICANN's side, I don't know how you function, but I think that you have to think of a way of strengthening those vice president or the regional observers, so that they can be closer to us. They have the means and ways, you know, to listen to us and to interact very quickly.

I mean, in fact, how much can we do with active resources, because if every time, you know, we come here and we want from the top of the ICANN staff, and they need to become a [inaudible] organization which is exactly the opposite of what we do in the Internet. I mean, it's a force of the thing. So I'm quite happy to be here, but it's really to say what we can do with what we have, you know? And not dream, you know?

And this kind of [inventory] would be important to do in east Africa, what kind of university, what kind of, in the industry. I think there are some differences obviously between we French speaking in that we have learned to one, regulate everything, the rules. You know, I have been a parliamentarian, in English speaking countries they can be more [mobile], I mean...

And in this case, it's not just a matter of law, because law anyway, they tend to be, Fadi is, you know, a [inaudible]. So okay. Thank you for what I have learned, you know. I think I can go back with some ideas on how to go in the villages and prepare them for this revolution. Thank you.

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

Thank you very much. I just wanted to comment on a few things. Much of what you are asking is actually what is being rolled out. So, I would like to kind of invite you to tune in very closely, because the regional strategies is getting people close to you. The train the trainer that John referred to, is groups like [AF-NOG], AfriNIC, AFTLD, that is getting things close to you.

So in essence, that is exactly what we are trying to accomplish through this particular program. It's also interesting to note that Senegal has one of the strongest participation in ICANN, either from the technical side, from the business side, or from the At Large side. So we are not really denied. It's just that maybe, you are discovering this at the global level. And you wish you had discovered it at the national level.

But the objective is, we would like to solve the problem at the right level. So for example, the issue that was raised about GAC, and expertise, I like to invite GAC members to do the multistakeholder thing in their countries. In so doing, they can [inaudible] and bring together the right expertise that could support them at the global level.

So it's those sort of issues that have been debated. And although I welcome these observations, I just want you to bear in mind that we



should solve the problem at the right level. If we try to solve the local problem at a global level, it's not going to work. And at a local level, you should be solving local issues, not regional global issues. I thought I would just make that comment. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Do we have any questions from the side?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

I'm going to speak in French. [French] This is an unidentified person. It's just a comment to add to what our colleague from Senegal was saying, and to what Dr. Nii was saying as well. There is many projects that have begun to be implemented, so maybe we should take some time.

If we take the case of [AF Knock], which is one of the cases of workshops we organized in Africa, we realize that the mobile market was very important, and [AF Knock] immediately introduced a workshop which allowed young people to develop applications. So if we take the case of universities, for instance, when the university association of central Africa organized a workshop recently, the vice president went there to take part in that workshop in order to address university students.

Not the At Large or AFRALO workshop level. They have their own workshops. They have organized an ATLAS summit, it's about capacity building for At Large summit, that's what they were doing so they could really help by adding those people. When those people joined ICANN

and became engaged, they would have something special and important to contribute.

So we spoke of repeating and replicating those sort of experiences, so that we would have knowledge and expertise at the local level. We used to have four, five people from Africa in capacity building sessions, but now we have about 10. And so, the goal we have is that when all of those people go back home, at the national level, they will be able to convey our message, to relay it, so that we would have a more immediate result.

Certainly we've made progress, which is important, but I think we all have this work to be done at the local level. Thank you.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Nora Abusitta takes the floor. Your name for the record?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER:

I'm sorry, I'm [inaudible]. Says the person who spoke previously. I used to belong to At Large, now I've been a member of staff for a while already.

NORA ABUSITTA:

Thank you very much. I think, to close this session, I would like to touch on a few points. When we started the work of the panel, we were surprised that we didn't even know how much ICANN was doing. That qualified under public responsibility. And we took about a month and a half to just do the inventory of what's being done.

We had no intention of inventing a new field for ICANN. We had no intention of starting programs that were not within our remit. All we wanted to do was to streamline or organize and focus our efforts. All of the focus areas that we decided on, for now, came from the regions, from the stakeholders and from the strategies.

We want you to participate. We want to hear from you. This is not set in stone. It's a project that's going to evolve. It's a department that's open to the stakeholders. And I hope to hear from you, either through the website or directly to me or to my staff, very often. And of course, through our regional representatives. Thank you for joining us today.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]