
SINGAPORE – ICANN Engagement Strategy for Africa

Wednesday, March 26th 2014 – 17:30 to 19:00

ICANN – Singapore, Singapore

TARIK KAMEL:

...At the last moment when Pierre asked me to participate in this session, and I told him I could not leave our African friends without being with them. We started the African strategy two years ago in Prague, with a meeting with Fadi, as we all know, when he had just recently been appointed as a CEO. This was the first regional strategy that ICANN has actually started with the current management for the implementation in Africa.

In 2012 a Steering Committee of 12 Members, representing the multistakeholder civil society and private sector, as well as governments, we met in Mauritius, hosted by AFRNIC, and we put the Terms of Reference for the African strategy, and it has been presented in Toronto and adopted in the ICANN meeting in Toronto in October 2012. Indeed, ICANN management and Fadi delivered on their promise and provided some staffing for Africa.

As such we have three staff members now, and they're providing some funding also for DNS Forum and for DNSSEC roadshows and some activities on that. It was clear that one of the priorities of the African strategy is that we need to be the industry and empower the industry in Africa. Not only Africa though, but in Latin America, when we develop the Latin American strategy and the Middle East strategy, in order to have participation from the community in ICANN in the gNSO and in the different SOs.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

We need to really empower the DNS industry on a regional level. Today I'm glad to see that we're doing a further step – not only discussing as usual among ourselves in Africa our problems, but inviting distinguished panelists from the registrars and registries, operators and companies all over the world – how they're going to be supportive and helpful to us. Not only in Africa but also in Latin America and in the developing world. Because this partnership is needed.

This is now the time of business partnership and collaborative working together with players from other parts of the world, to transfer know-how and to help us in the implementation of the African strategy. By that we will end the marginalization of the developing countries, we'll improve and empower the inclusiveness of the developing countries in the ICANN processes, and in the overall processes that we see. So I'm happy to be with you today, and we'll start first by having a brief by Pierre Dandjinou, who's our Vice President for Africa. He's in charge of overlooking the implementation of the African strategy.

Then our colleague, Rodrigo, the VP for Latin America, will moderate the session together and introduce our panelists. We hope we'll have an interactive session that will come up with a roadmap for partnership in order to empower the DNS industry in the developing countries, in a one-to-one relationship for the global community. Pierre, the floor is yours.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you very much Tarik. Thanks to all for coming. Sorry for the delay we've had, because we were actually having the last session, and we certainly couldn't manage this time properly. I'm sorry for that. At the



same time I welcome our panelists here. Some of them decided at the last minute that they should be with us, which is wonderful. As Tarik said, we want to see concrete things. That's why we're here today. Maybe a briefing on this Engagement Strategy for Africa, that ICANN is really pushing.

It came as a bottom-up procedure, and then what we have there is definitely what the Committee would like to have. What we have in just a few words is about transforming Africa into a market, because we have so many reasons that really show that the market is not yet there and the industry is not yet there, so we're in the process of doing this, and the strategy is about this. The strategy has eight objectives, but most of the objectives are about capacity building in different areas, and also better participation of Africans to ICANN and the global discussions.

Maybe I'll highlight a few of the flagship projects that we really want to pursue during FY 15. One of them is to secure the DNS in Africa, and [inaudible 00:05:13] DNSSEC Roadshow, which is now becoming popular because more and more countries are requesting that we send the experts to help the capacity and also to have a mentoring until countries have been in the situation to actually sign its zone file. So it is quite important.

We're also working towards facilitating life to the registrar. We do have seven registrars accredited today in Africa. Like I said, none of them are really making any money out of this business today, because of so many barriers. The last session discussed some of the issues and I'm not going to, but there are a few solutions as well for them. We will take this forward and see what we could collectively propose. Eventually ICANN



could take a decision to see how we could lower the entry barrier for those African registrars.

Also, we do have the sponsorship where we could sponsor very strategic meetings in Africa. We're also thinking of the whole area of digital entrepreneurship. In Durban we had young people that came, and the idea was to see how we could organize them. That could be through the incubators or accelerators that we are thinking of, but also we already have a map out with different lhubs that are in Africa.

We're in touch with most of them now and we know exactly what they are doing, and we want to really make a difference by seeing how we could launch a specific project with them so that the younger generation can pick up this business. Of course, there are many other projects, and I could always point you to the website. The most important thing is that we need to forge a strategy partnership, if you really want to have any impact out of this project.

We had a very interesting meeting in Durban, which was the DNS Forum, and we had a few recommendations that came up of how we could actually partner. So what we're seeing here today is a result of this exchange in Durban. A few of the registrars that accepted to come and tell us how they think we should be collaborating, and we may have specifics on how we are going to engage with them. So this is really in terms of when we're in a situation for them.

Also, my colleague from Latin America is going to facilitate this, because this is not just about Africa, it's also about what we're calling "underserved regions". So I won't take much time because we do have many things ahead of us. We have this Panel. We will give you an opportunity



to interact as well, and then we are having this signing ceremony, so we need to really make sure that we're on time. With that I'd like to pass it over to Rodrigo to give time to our Panelists. You can ask some questions to them so they can tell us exactly what they are offering.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Thank you Pierre. Just to be clear on the time, what time do you need us to stop this Panel? It's ten minutes to six. 18:30? Okay, so we have 40 minutes. All right. I received some of the bias of our Panelists, but they are in many different formats. What I'm going to mention is only the organizations, and then we're going to have a brief round so that each one of you can present yourself as you want to present yourself.

So we have long-time members from this community – organizations like Afiliias, AFNIC, CentralNIC, IP Mirror and [Frenum? 00:09:34]. Now I'm going to hand over the mic to you so that you can make a very brief presentation. After a brief presentation of all of you, we'll start with the discussion and presentation. Please go ahead.

JANNA LAM: I'm Janna. I'm the CEO of IP Mirror. I'm a registrar based here in Singapore.

JEREMY [GOLDRUSH?]: Hi everyone, I'm Jeremy [Goldrush? 00:10:19]. I'm the Chief Operating Officer of [Frenum] and we're a ccTLD back-end operator, and we're based in Amsterdam in the Netherlands.



JAMES GALVIN: I'm James Galvin from Afilias. Afilias is a global registry service provider and we have a long history of commitment and engagement in the African region, so I'm just here to talk about the next level of commitment that we're going to make to engaging in the region. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINO: Thank you James.

BEN CRAWFORD: Hi, I'm Ben Crawford. I'm the CEO of CentralNIC. We're a London stock exchange listed company. We're a registry service provider for ccTLDs and gTLDs and SLDs, and also a registrar operator and a financier that helps ccTLDs and others financially as well.

PIERRE DANDJINO: Thank you. Welcome.

PIERRE BONIS: Thank you. I'm Pierre Bonis. I'm Deputy CEO to AFNIC. AFNIC is a not-for-profit organization that is the registry for .fr, and also a back-end provider for various new gTLDs. As a not-for-profit organization, AFNIC has some members that are from African ccTLDs and we have had a cooperation with them for now about ten years.

PIERRE DANDJINO: Thank you very much. Really we appreciate your time to be here, spending time and most of all your commitment – your commitment to



be engaged with this project. Welcome. Let's start. Janna, sorry to have interrupted you. You have the floor.

JANNA LAM:

Hi. Well, I was invited to this Panel after one session on Saturday. I'm probably sharing something that some of you already knew, but I'm going to quickly go through. Just a brief introduction of IP Mirror. We formed in the year 2000 and we have 14 years of experience in this industry. We are an ICANN-accredited registrar and also a ccTLD registrar in over 120 countries. We're still adding on. We offer over 1,000 domain extensions. We have ten offices globally. We're also the very first registrar in the world to be ISO-certified.

That's just a brief picture of some of the extensive accreditations that we have. I'm explaining the ccTLD Box because it's one of the things that we could offer in terms of collaboration with Africa. We actually have an in-house system that we call ccTLD Box. We provide domain registration for both ASCII and IDN. All the functions of domain registrations are there.

We have this service called Online Security, which comprises of what we call SafestWHOIS, which you probably know as WHOIS Privacy. The Safest Domain Lock is to prevent domain hijacking, Safest DNS, to prevent D-DOS attack, and of course the usual and common DNS management services. On top of that, we also provide web and email hosting, SSL certification and mobile web builder. Some of the very brief support and services would be... We have a very extensive library of our rules for all the different countries.



Now with the launch of the new gTLD we also have all the information on each new gTLD that's being launched. [inaudible 00:14:13] use your phone, chat-line, email. IP Mirror is a little different from a lot of registrars, and that's because we have one part of our business, which is on the brand protection side. Because of the domain name portfolio that we manage all over the world, we've become a one-stop-shop for brand protection; infringement.

So we have a system that actually helps to do infringement monitoring, and also we do recovery work. So the recovery work is a system that we call IPQuotient. In short we call it IPQ. We do domain name monitoring using a system that we wrote, and from all the infringement we help our customers to do recovery using all the different means of dispute resolution. Being a so-called "hub" in Asia, we overcome a lot of language barriers; like Chinese, Japanese and Korean.

We also have social media monitoring, phishing monitoring, and ND counterfeiting monitoring. What can IP Mirror offer to this collaboration with Africa? The ccTLD Box is something that we have. We have a system called Partner Advance. When we were going through the needs of entrepreneurs or businesses in Africa who were interesting in being a registrar, we think this is a very good system to be an incubator for potential registrars, or the development for DNS business.

So what we have is a white label system. You can offer any domain name registration through this system. Now, as we all know, it's a very high cost to be a registrar. The application with ICANN or even any other ccTLD is actually expensive. You can test it out using this system. Sell your domain names in your region and then you can see whether



you have a demand. I guess by the time that you know you have a very good business model you can actually start getting your own accreditation without changing the system.

What we have is a very flexible system for you to be a non-registrar in the beginning, and when you're ready to be a registrar you can still connect through this system if you want to. Now, the reason we built this model is because we understand that start-ups have very little resources on the technical side, which is very necessary in this business. So when we offer this on a subscription basis, for a very small fee per month, it helps businesses to get started.

So I understand that there is this exchange program with the sponsorship for ICANN for interested potential applicants, to learn about this industry. So IP Mirror is willing to participate in this mentorship and exchange program, where we can actually let you learn about the business. On top of that, I think we're also in business of brand protection; the IP protection part of things. So we thought this would actually be a very good knowledge transfer to the Africa companies. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINO:

Janna, thank you very much indeed. Mentorship and knowledge sharing are a great component and can be quite useful for these purposes. I'm going to turn now [inaudible 00:17:57] presentation so that you can make your intervention. I'll ask you to be as brief as possible so that we can allow some time for interaction – just five minutes.



JEREMY [GOLDRUSH]:

Thank you. I'm Jeremy and I'm with [Freenum?]. As I said earlier, we're a back-end provider for ccTLDs, and we try to be more than just a technical partner. For us, we're all about DNS technology and we currently support four ccTLDs totaling a little over 22 million domain names. But we're really a practical and action-focused team, and we want to go further because we realize that having a stable and secure DNS is not always enough to make your ccTLD competitive.

The market is very rich. There are a lot of options out there, a lot of TLDs. Hundreds of new gTLDs are just about to be launched on the market, and a lot of countries that are re-launching their ccTLD today are facing this hugely competitive environment. On top of this we realize that domain names are just a very small piece of the equation. The end result is not just to have lots of domain names. The end result is to have users who are involved on the Internet, who are creating websites, creating local content and developing businesses.

So domain names are of course one of the important pieces of the puzzle, but it's very important to create an entire industry around this. We are here to advise our partners and support as much as possible. Of course we're not going to come up with all the solutions. It's a very complex equation, but we try to be very close to our partners, and we do comprehensive competency transfer; not just on the technical DNS aspects, but also on all the business aspects of running a TLD.

Of course, what's made our success is something very unique. We're actually the only company in the world doing this, and it's to offer free domain names. We've developed a free domain model. We started in 2001 with a very small TLD, .tk, and we started giving away domain



names for free because we realized .tk was not maybe the most attractive extension – it was hard to compete against .com – and we wanted to see what would happen.

We saw at the time that free emails were booming. There was Hotmail and Yahoo was launching. Now, .tk is the largest ccTLD in the world. It has over 22 million domain names. It's by far the fastest-growing TLD in the world, and we see a lot of incredible businesses and websites being built on it. So for us this is very important. It's bringing technology, infrastructure and knowledge, but also it's this business model and overall business support.

Our goal of course is to get more people online, encourage local content creation and help people build their identity on the Internet. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINO:

Thank you very much Jeremy. Very interesting concept of competency transfer thing, that's also very much needed. We may continue with the next intervention please?

JAMES GALVIN:

Thank you. I'm James Galvin from Afilias. For those who were in Durban at the ICANN meeting, and sitting on a Panel much like this one, I talked about a partnership program that Afilias is implementing and moving forward with for the African region. Let me take a moment though and step back and tell you that Afilias is one of the largest service providers. We host more TLDs than any other service provider. We have more domains under management in total, save for one – it's hard to compete with .com.



Of course, as a side effect of that we also have one of the largest DNS infrastructures in the world to support all of this activity. Having been around we're looking for opportunities to share and engage, and we're looking to create programs in the African region to support executive mentorship of ccTLDs and the registries. In addition, as part of that we would offer a level of secondary DNS services to those registries and country codes to get involved in the mentorship program.

Now, we had announced this in Durban and we're now just beginning the process of organizing exactly what that means, what we're going to offer, and how we're going to create a program to invite people to get involved, and then select countries and registries to be involved. But with the executive mentorship we're talking about discussions about governance operations, technical details, DNSSEC, IPv6 – any kind of advice that would help facilitate a registry being successful in its country.

Then of course, offering DNS services ensures that you have visibility throughout the world for your activities, and whatever programs that you have going on in your country. I think that's about as short as I can make it. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINO:

Thank you James for the short presentation. Very interesting though. Yet again, another mentorship program right? Very interesting, and in very key issues like DNSSEC, IPv6 and other operational issues I think that would be quite useful. We may continue please?



BEN CRAWFORD: Hi, I'm Ben Crawford from CentralNIC. We're also a registry back-end service provider for ccTLDs and gTLDs and so on, as well as a registrar service provider. One of the reasons that we do both is that we've found, quite obviously, that in African countries and other developing countries around the world, that having a world-class registry service is not enough in order to ensure a healthy DNS industry. You also require registrar services in country. So we actually offer both.

We listed on the London stock exchange in September, and when we listed one of the things that we raised money for – and we raised \$7.5 million for this – was to assist developing countries with their registries. We're a business. We're obviously looking at this as an investment in order to make a return. But at the moment what we're doing is offering training, software, hardware, global marketing and so on for ccTLDs, to assist them both in their domestic markets and internationally.

So essentially that's our approach. Mohammed AL-Ammouri, who's sitting over there and works with me, is I think a very regular attendee at every meeting around here. Obviously you guys should feel free after this to approach me or him at any time to learn more about how we can help you with your country codes. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much indeed Ben. Last but not least, Pierre, please?

PIERRE BONIS: Thank you. James recalled that that was a very important session in Durban, about the ICANN African strategy. A little bit before that, one year ago or so, there was an even maybe more important session that



was in Addis Ababa. That was the first time ICANN convened all stakeholders together to build an African strategy. When we wrapped up the discussion we had in Addis Ababa and then in Durban, there were several actions to be taken.

We talked about we needed some data on the African market first. You cannot ask a ccTLD manager to try to market his own extension if he knows nothing about the market. So it was decided to create an African domain name observatory, and I'm happy to see that this thing has been settled between ISOC, AFTLD, ICANN and AFNIC. The funds are available and I think the study is about to start. So this is checked for now.

We talked about the necessity of working together on marketing and communication for ccTLDs, not only technical operations and how you brand your cc – but this is something that in AFNIC [inaudible 00:28:25] we have taken care of. There will be an almost one-week training in Dakar before the beginning of May on this topic. We also talked about the necessity of offering some [automization? 00:28:50] solution for the cc's manager, and I'm happy to see that it's not only for the registries but also for the registrar, with the iP Mirror presentation.

We have worked on that also. I think we're not the only one. You have several solutions, but today you can find on the market more and more solutions to automate your cc, which will hopefully help you in having a possibility to decrease the price of the domain name. Most of the African cc's are still expensive, except for those that are totally free, but it's a different business model.

So there are solutions, and AFNIC is eager to propose to you new solutions for cc's – not only in a partnership manner, as we have done



for ten years now, but also in a commercial manner if it's [inaudible 00:29:59]. Last but not least, I don't know if Pierre is going to present the internship program? There is a very nice proposal from Pierre and from ICANN to select some people from registrars or registries in Africa, to go on an internship in partner organizations.

So we're very happy to participate to this program. What we'd like to do in AFNIC – because we're an organization, and within the organization we have representatives from the registrars – would be to propose an internship that would be half in a registry and half in a registrar, to make sure that when the people come back home they've seen both sides, which I think is interesting for them. With that, I'm done.

PIERRE DANDJINO:

Thank you Pierre, very much. Very interesting programs and initiatives. Let's think how we can try to implement or promote them. This last one is very innovative as well. We've heard pretty much what's on the table and being offered. It would be very interesting to hear in this case from Africa. I've been asked to put on the spot Mr. [Jimsum? 00:31:35] from [Aficta?]. Maybe you can share with us, from your point of view, what you think about these programs?

[MR. JIMSUM]:

Thank you very much Chair, and the distinguished Panelists. We really have a very robust Panel, and I want to appreciate Pierre for bringing this quality Panel together. It's a very good initiative. There's good progress, and again I commend Pierre. In the previous session we were addressing a number of these challenges – awareness, capacity, know-



how. Not just technical capacity, but capacity with regard to a business model; making money from DNS.

So I think by and large this has been quite well addressed. It's now left up to the stakeholders to use this opportunity. Since we've discussed this in previous sessions too, I think we need to do more with the engagement with the people that really invest in this. The willingness is there, but people need to be directed that, "This is where we have the opportunities." Well, I don't want to take time, but I want to ask this question with regards to cross-border data protection issues.

Since they'll be offering maybe off coast or offshore, so how do you address the issue of cross-border data protection for those ccTLDs that will be hosted overseas? Thank you again Pierre for bringing this Panel together. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINO:

Thank you Jim for your intervention. I also want you to know we've been kindly allowed ten more minutes for this interaction, or even 15 minutes since we started late. Please feel free to take the floor, and you may ask things or explore into more detail one of the problems, or how this could be useful to your region. Please go ahead. Line up if you wish?

[GRACE VEGA]:

My name is [Grace Vega 00:34:07] from the Kenya ICT Action Network. I'm kind of disappointed with the Panel. Just listening to you I thought you were pitching for your organizations in Africa, and I wondered whether among all these Africans, don't we have a strategy on how to



engage ICANN? I don't know whether the Africans do not have ideas on how to do that, but I must say I'm very disappointed.

I have one question to the lady of IP Mirror. I listened to your presentation very carefully, and excuse me, but at some point I wondered whether you are already in Africa, or whether it's a plan that you have for Africa? If you're already in Africa, it would be interesting to hear what has been your impact. Would you mind sharing some of the trends that are coming out? Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you for your intervention. Since no one else is lining up, would any one of you like to make a comment or response please?

JANNA LAM:

Thank you for the question. We are a ccTLD registrar in some African countries, not all. If there is a possibility for us to provide the service, we are doing that. I don't have the full list with me, but off the top of my head I can remember places like Namibia, where we're actually accredited. Well, if we're not accredited... I don't have a presence in Africa. That's why it makes it so important for us to look at what is needed in Africa.

Probably, maybe some of my perspective may be wrong. But I've run this business for the past 14 years. I've been met with problems that are quite similar, when I hear from other Panels in other sessions – that there seems to be a problem that we experienced here in Singapore when we were developing. We were trying to create demand. We were



trying to get people to go onto the Internet, to understand what domain names are.

To be very honest, when our Minister was talking at the welcome speech at this ICANN, we are still struggling with trying to help the SMEs to understand what the Internet can do for them. So while we can call ourselves “developed” I feel that in the industry of the Internet we are still developing. So I wouldn’t say that Singapore is really that good. Our infrastructure is there, but there are a lot of education that still needs to be done for the SMEs in Singapore.

I’d be very happy to see how we can contribute to the African businesses, and probably some kind of partnership to help.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you Janna. I have Pierre, then a reply, and then James.

PIERRE BONIS:

Let me just clarify this, because I think we should understand that this is a new program that we want to launch. What would be a realization for us is that this strategy, the way that it’s led, is not just about ICANN providing some resources for that. We really need to mobilize more resources. One of the ways we do this, and if you want to transform the African market and you’re talking about the registries and registrars, we say it’s about capacity building.

It’s important that they be able to actually interact with what we’re calling the global DNS industry leaders. That’s a way for them to actually expose the issues and also the options. When you listen to some of the



presentation here, you can see that there are some services anyway. So at some point we also see this as a kind of win-win situation, because I don't believe that the point here is about asking for people to donate whatever. I don't believe in the donations.

I believe that we need to build capacity in Africa, because some people said in the earlier session that things are there to develop in Africa, but the point is, you have to do it for yourself. We are having registrars that are not really making any money, because they are suffering so many issues, because maybe they don't know how to develop the market. If some of them should be having partnerships with [inaudible 39:10] spoke about the internship.

But the whole issue of the business development, the business model for instance. We think that by actually interacting with those global registrars and registries, certainly we'll be contributing to building capacity. So this is about exchanging those things, and also seeing concretely how we can engage with the international business. So that's what it's about. It's not about them coming here and saying, "We're donating these things to you," it's about them saying, "Okay, we can beef up capacity, we can contribute to this."

It's up to the African businesses to say, "Okay, we're happy with that," or, "We're not happy." I just wanted to put this forward. That's the objective of this session.

[GRACE VEGA]:

Pierre, I did not intend for you to go on the defensive. I actually did expect us to discuss real strategies. Why is Africa not participating? I



know that has been the debate through this whole ICANN meeting – the whole issue of participation, the whole issue of multistakeholderism. The fact that no stakeholder should be superior to another. The fact that no stakeholder should determine the role of another stakeholder, and that this must be done in agreement and in discussion. I did not intend for you to defend yourself, but it also would have been useful to hear what Africa is doing. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINO: Thank you. James?

JAMES GALVIN: Yes, I'll try and be quick. Thank you for commenting. In response to your disappointment about what you're hearing from the Panel, I'd like to turn that around to something a bit more constructive I think; so a request from me to the group and to you, specifically, but really to anyone in here. Our offer is one of sharing. One of being available to answer questions and offer to you opinions based on our experience, as a way or assisting and raising the level of activity in registries within the African region.

It would be helpful to us actually to hear from you as to what you would like to get from a mentorship program. What do you think, at a high-level, if you had two or three questions that you think would be most helpful to you, that you'd like to see answer to? That would help me as we begin to shape the program that we want to offer to you, to be helpful and to have a collaborative partnership. Thank you.



PIERRE DANDJNOU: Thank you James. I have Marilyn Cade and then Pierre.

MARILYN CADE: Thank you. My name is Marilyn Cade, and I'm going to say two things about saying your name clearly at every meeting. I keep thinking that that means that we're all going to begin to identify each other and understand each other. But I want to join with the comment that Grace made and tell everyone from the ICANN staff who is here that I'm disappointed as well. I'd like to explain why.

I think this is a fantastic session, but it's about business matching, and the recruitment and development of the suppliers into a part of the ICANN community. It is a valuable thing, and I value it. I am particularly pleased to see those of you who are not providing services in the African region here, and looking very positively about how to begin to develop those business relationships. I've had very positive conversations with you, Jim, about the need to invest in terms of the intellectual investment in knowledge sharing and cyber security, etcetera.

So I'm happy about that. But I'm here to say, from the business constituency perspective, we'd really like more. I think that's what Grace was saying. The business matching part – great. But actually, we really need to look differently at this. We need to think that from the... I see Sally here, and Nigel, and others from staff. We need to be looking at our engagement and involvement as investing locally and nationally, so that businesses, civil society and academics are just as aware of ICANN as the contracted party [side? 00:44:01].



That's how we're going to succeed. Right now it's very difficult for us to bring business people from the developing regions into ICANN, and anywhere else where ICANN is being discussed. If you're a small business from Africa, Latin America, Asia, Caribbean, you're not eligible for funding from a UN agency to go to the IGF or to come and participate. If you're civil society, you're eligible. If you're an academic, you're eligible. If you're government, you're eligible. But if you're a business you're not.

When we look at the Fellowship Program at ICANN – and this is no secret; everybody here involved with the Fellowship Program has heard me 783 gazillion times on this. It's a fantastic program, but it doesn't work to bring businesses in from the developing regions. That's not a criticism. It's in fact a call for improved action. It's a bequest that the Vice-Chairs of the regions and the staff work with the constituencies and the stakeholder groups, civil society and others, to help us do local leaders initiatives.

Then we can build and strengthen the participation on ground and each of the regions. When a national IGF is held, or a regional IGF is held, in which ICANN is participating, it's more than our new contracted parties that are going to come to that. So I'm here to say thank you, and I like business matching – but I want more.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you Marilyn for sharing your point of view. Now I have Pierre?



PIERRE BONIS:

Thank you. I'll be very short. There's been one question since the floor was opened, and one comment. I will answer because it's always a pleasure to answer, and important to answer the disappointment expressed by Grace. I will just say that I'm not here to preach, nor to pitch. I'm just here because my organization has committed to ICANN the African strategy, one year ago.

I come back one year later and I give you the result of "did we do what we were asked and committed to do?" I'm just giving you the information, no more, no less. I'm not pitching my organization. I didn't even tell you how much you have to pay to register to AFNIC. It's very cheap. 70 Euro. You're welcome. [laughter] This is for the first point. The second point. That was a very interesting question about the cross-border data protection. I just want to point out that this is a question that goes with a set of questions: how do you see the philosophy behind, or is there a philosophy behind, the running of a ccTLD?

Do you want the local law to apply to your ccTLD? Do you want the technical skills to be developed within your country? Do you want the money that the ccTLD can make being invested within your country or not? If you want that, your country will be the first beneficiary of your ccTLD, and your local law applies. You should consider solutions – this is what I think, but some people may disagree – that you run yourself, even if the automation makes it easier.

If you think that the first step is to make a lot of domain names to make money, then to have the money to invest and to bring it back to your country, because this is another solution, then you can accept that most of the technical skills are abroad. But this is a real choice, and this is not



just something where you can say, “Okay, there is a good solution abroad, I’m going to take it and it’s going to be quick.” This is a real choice with real consequences, especially on the application of your local law. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Thank you very much Pierre. We have George Sadowsky. We do have a signing ceremony after this, so I think it’s a good idea to continue with this dialogue, but I would suggest to leave five minutes to wrap up and see how we’re going to continue with the dialogue. Please, George?

GEORGE SADOWSKY:

Thank you very much. I’m George Sadowsky. I’m a Member of the ICANN Board, but I speak completely for myself here. I’m not disappointed but I’m slightly perplexed. Maybe it’s because I came in a little late. I came in halfway through Jim Galvin’s presentation. I’m perplexed because I didn’t expect to see what I guess I’d describe as a set of suppliers of assistance at the table. I expected to see a set of people making demands of us, of us who have the resources and the knowledge to help.

In any market there’s a demand side and a supply side, and what I’m seeing at the table is the supply side. Some of the offers that were made and some of the statements that were made are really helpful. I think in particular Pierre Bonis’s program, when he describes the ability to bring someone as an [inaudible 00:50:16] and to help them understand the business, I think that’s very useful.



Now, forget names and numbers. The history of development in ICT is just full of projects that people in developed countries think people in developing countries would like, and it failed. I don't think we have a very good track record in this respect. We tried this even in ICANN, in 2011 when the new gTLD program was introduced. There was a component called JAS. I don't remember what it stood for, but its purpose was to give discounts to people in developing countries who wanted to get new strings and establish registries in those countries.

The discounts were small and they ignored totally all of the costs that went along with that, and the human skills that would be required, etcetera, and it failed miserably, as it should have, and as it was predicted to do. Now, the development of the African strategy, started by Tarik Kamel and Pierre Dandjinou, at the meeting in Addis about a year ago, I think, was the beginning, I thought, of a new turn. That is, we need to have this kind of development of, in this case, the names and numbers registries/registrar, the industry that deals with the identifiers of the Internet.

I thought we had a plan that would make the people who demanded, who needed the services, to put them in the driver's seat and essentially say, "What is the program that Africans can define for Africans, in which we can assist?" If that's the case, I think we need to be listening to the people who are on the ground and need help. I'm not denying the importance of having the suppliers of that help be available and tell us what they want, but I think it's more important that the people who need the help can understand what help they need.



They can then take advantage of it when it's offered, can choose between different sources of help, and can essentially be well on the road to helping themselves in propagating this industry in Africa. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much George. I will suggest to take the comments online and then go back to the table. Please go ahead.

DANIEL GREENBERG: Thank you. I'll try to be quick on this point. My name is Daniel Greenberg. I'm a Director and Lexsynergy. We're an ICANN-accredited registrar. We accredited with most of the Panel over there, as well as having an African presence. We're accredited in Kenya, Tanzania, South Africa, DRC and many other African countries. I think the conversation that needs to be had in a strategy session like this is to see how we can mobilize most of the African countries to at least have a registry that works.

A good example is we have a lot of clients who want to register in Niger, .ne. Impossible. There's a local presence requirement. Can't do that. It's bad for investment and it's difficult to invest people. Swaziland. Impossible. You need to be a local ISP. You have to fill out a form. It's the same as a few other African countries. I think we need to engage and see how we can make it work. These new gTLDs have launched, so we're advising clients to go and protect themselves in .restaurant, .club, whatever's out there.



But then again, they don't use their own ccTLD. It's not working. It's not operational. I've told many people over here that Africa has Internet penetration of about 10%, while mobile penetration of over 100%. What are we doing to take advantage of that? If Africa grows by at least 2-3%, that's greater growth than in other regions, and there's a lot of potential there but not much is being done.

I think we should at least get them up to a stage where things are working and people are engaging and investing, because the way the online market is working is you don't want Africa to be left out. We need to support them. I think the strategy, in my understanding, is coming up with ideas to make sure that we can make things work in the region. That's my point. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much. [Adielle?]?

[ADIELLE]: [00:54:54]. Yes, thank you. I will not go the way of the disappointment or negativity here, but I'll try to see things from the positive angle. I think a lot of time has been spend to define a strategy for the region, and that I think has been the first example of a bottom-up process, where people from the region rally around an idea of building something that can work for us. So that strategy is there. But there are several elements of that strategy that need attention.

What I understand for this session specifically is one element that isn't in the strategy. It's not something new. It was written in that strategy clearly, that one of the things that is missing in Africa is the link between



the business – a very win-win partnership between businesses – and the region, in this specific area of domain names, because that was one of the [things? 00:55:57]. So I guess this Panel is to show that something is being cooked in that area to strengthen that partnership.

Maybe what we need to provide to the Panel is how we see that partnership going forward. How can we build that partnership? What is the need that we're expecting for these people, and beyond people around the table, to strengthen the economical and business area. Because I fundamentally believe that we cannot increase capacity. We cannot increase participation. We cannot increase the visibility of Africa without the business aspect. That's a fact.

It's not only government that's going to do that. It's not only civil society. If we don't create the value for people to participate, that's not going to happen. We will be able to do that if we bring this aspect into this. I think let's look at how we can take this forward – how we can build around it and express our needs, and see how we can make it horizontal; not just providing the service but saying how we can make this and replicate it in a way that everybody benefits from that.

On the evolution and the progress made over one year I have one suggestion as well, and it's to probably find a way of giving regular feedback on the progress of the strategy to the community; to maybe a monthly or quarterly newsletter or update on the strategy. So when we gather here for 1.5 hours we don't spend the whole time reviewing the whole strategy, but focus on the very specific points and try to advance them and review them. That would make more progress. Thank you.



PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you very much [Adielle]. We have one last comment and then we'll go back to the table for wrapping up in five more minutes.

[MOKTAR]: Okay, my name is [Moktar 00:57:56]. I am from the African [Union? 00:57:59] Commission. The purpose of coming here is just to set the record straight. The Africa strategy is not an ICANN initiative. It's an African initiative. We started in Dakar. We Africans drafted a document of 125 points, and they had the honor and the privilege to present that to the Board of ICANN at that time.

In Prague we decided, as Africans, to build our own strategy, and we appointed and elected some of us here to draft that, among them, Tarik and Pierre Dandjinou. So this is an African process. Yes, presented to ICANN, but it is our initiative. This is all I wanted to say. Now, I am not disappointed nor perplexed, but I'm impatient to sign the .africa things in a few minutes. Thank you very much. [applause]

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you. I think we're all excited about that. If you want to wrap up and make some final conclusions? James?

SPEAKER: Final comment from each panelist in a telegraphic way and then I'll wrap up the session because we have a signing ceremony that's already being delayed by 15 minutes, but the previous session ate up 20 minutes of our session, so...



JANNA LAM:

Hi. It's very enlightening to hear from everybody. I just want to share a very typical experience that we have here, by running this business. We have a lot of initiatives also in Singapore, and for us to make use of those initiatives we have to fill out papers, we have to... In order to get some kind of sponsorship... Now, eventually, when we ran this business we decided we'd do it ourselves. We'd help ourselves.

For myself, I've been doing some mentoring to local businesses, to help them with some of the business ideas, or even to not let them make certain mistakes that we've made in the past. So I'm not sure if we're going to be of very good assistance to this program, but if there is a way to share the knowledge, we're definitely very willing to do that. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU:

Excellent, now, in 140 characters can you continue with...?

SPEAKER:

I would like to say that I salute the African strategy. I think I've also followed the development since the Addis Ababa session. I think there is still some work to be done to bring it down to the business level. I think, as Sir [James? 01:01:01] maybe suggested, sometimes it is important to know very precisely what countries and what ccTLDs registries really want to get out of the business sector.

As we said, this is a business Panel, and we're looking for private/public partnerships, or public/private partnerships. In our vision, this is the



way forward, this is the way of development. I see a lot of proposals to ask ICANN for subsidies and more development and more actions, and I think it is important, but it's never going to be the solution. I really hope that the dialogue between the private sector and the registries, and the public sector in Africa, can continue so that we become more and more aligned on what we want from each other.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you. James?

JAMES GALVIN: Thank you. As a closing comment I want to re-affirm our desire to create a collaborative partnership with the African region. I'll just acknowledge that I heard very clearly in the discussions, from several people, that the way to ensure value to you is to make sure that whatever program we offer meets the needs that you have. I wanted to reiterate my question to the crowd, at one point, that please do convey back to me. Reach out.

Let me know if you have a particular need, or a question or something that you'd like to see in our program. I'd like to know about that. Then I can figure out how to incorporate that into what we offer. Thank you.

PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you James. Ben?



BEN CRAWFORD: Perhaps just to follow up on that – our perspective on our participation on this Panel is not that this is a definitive statement of anything, but rather a brief introduction for conversations that we’re going to be having one-on-one, and have continued to have for years now. Essentially we’re offering technology and expertise, and sales and marketing services, and indeed cash investment in ccTLD operators.

I guess for us the main thing is what we discuss one-on-one with each of you after this – and not really so much is what we’re presenting here, which is only the tip of the iceberg. Thank you.

SPEAKER: Thank you Ben. Pierre?

PIERRE BONIS: Thank you. I’m very happy to be part of this Panel, because this Panel itself is the realization of one of the commitments of the African strategy, which was to expose and showcase one of the solutions – technical and economic solutions – that exist in the market for ccTLDs, so I understand that there can be disappointment, but this is something that comes from the African strategy, done by the Africans.

I really think that we should not reinvent the wheel every year. There is a plan. We are committed to the plan, AFNIC is committed to the plan. As long as people ask us to partner and to help on programs that have been designed by Africans – not AFNIC – we will help. Thank you.

SPEAKER: Thank you Pierre. Finally, Pierre Dandjinou?



PIERRE DANDJINOU: Thank you. I'd like to thank all of you, for your very interesting questions and suggestions. I would just like to say that we also need to put those things into a kind of context. We've invited the Panelists here. We know what we're doing, because we're having in mind some of the [inaudible 01:05:27] African strategy. We chose those who can offer, and we can tell you we're receiving comments online, and people are really interested to know who's there and what we can do together.

That's what we're here for, you see? For me, that was the objective of course. As we also said, we definitely wanted to have [inaudible 01:5:52] on this Panel, and then he couldn't make it. We also wanted some of the registrars from Africa to tell us about how they feel about the offer here. But I'd like to thank you all, because it's important that we move forward. I'm going to say something that's quite interested. We started the newsletter because we also have a website.

The idea is to provide information to you on a regular basis. From now on it's going to be regular, and then you'll be hearing from us. That's what I'll say. Thank you for coming.

SPEAKER: Thank you, and finally Tarik please?

TARIK KAMEL: I would like to start by thanking the moderator, Rodrigo, for all your efforts, as such. I think the message that this Panel is giving today is a message of partnership. This is what we really need to take out of this



Panel. The international community of the registrars and registries is now being mobilized in order to partner with the African business community. It's a long journey, and this was one of the main facts, as [Adil? 01:07:02] has said, that we've found out of the African strategy.

We, as ICANN, are doing this in order to increase participation, to end marginalization, to increase participation in the gNSO, to make sure that we mobilize the African business community, we mobilize small and medium enterprises. I think we have several examples of success. We've seen that in the [GSM? 01:07:26] business, and [GSMA?] has been doing the association a great role in that direction.

We have seen that once again, with the revolution of AFRINIC ten years ago, when we found that AFRINIC together with an African initiative was the support of African ISPs. African ISPs today are very active and are being supported by AFRINIC and supplied by addresses by AFRINIC. Why not to repeat this success in the domain industry, with the support of the global and international players? This is how AFRINIC has evolved. It has been incubated by RIPE and support by ARAN ten years ago.

We hope that we'd make this story of success again, but in the DNS industry. It's a long journey, it will take time and effort. This is just the beginning, and I'm very glad and thankful to the international players that they are sending a clear signal of partnership to the African community. Our role is to make this, as a mentorship program, an incubator program and really bring it to the success stories we all want to see. I would like to thank the Panelists and the audience, and thank the moderator and Pierre, everybody.



We're sorry for the people that are waiting for the signature of .africa. We kept you waiting 20 minutes longer, but I think the discussion was worth it. Thank you everybody, and we'll definitely continue to make value of all of the valuable comments that have been said. Thank you and good evening. [applause]

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]

